University of Alberta

Educational Policy and INGOs in Ethiopia: Contestations and Prospects for Decolonization

by

Thashika Pillay

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Education

in

Theoretical, Cultural and International Studies in Education

Department of Educational Policy Studies

©Thashika Pillay
Fall 2011
Edmonton, Alberta

Abstract

Educational policymaking in Ethiopia is considered to be the designation of the Federal and regional governments. However, numerous stakeholders (the majority of which are international) play a role in the process; among the most prominent of these are international non-governmental organizations (INGOs). This research attempts to develop a critical understanding of the role of INGOs in the policymaking process. The research findings suggest that within the development context 1) Ethiopia continues to be seen as in need of development; 2) Ethiopian knowledge systems continue to be marginalized as emphasis is placed on Euro-American knowledges; 3) the role of local communities in the decision-making process continues to be a source of conflict; 4) concerns regarding the perceived equality between North and South persist; and 5) colonization – both historical and recolonization – has inculcated among Ethiopians a disassociation from traditional ways of living and knowledges. The findings are integral to understanding the role of INGOs in the policymaking space as they demonstrate that while INGOs are given space at the policymaking table as the voices of the grassroots, the research findings suggest that INGOs working in Ethiopia speak not for the grassroots but for a privileged few who constitute the Ethiopian elite.

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Origins of the Study

From September 2007 until June 2009, I was employed in the education sector in northern Ethiopia through an international non-governmental organization (INGO). Prior to starting my position in Ethiopia, I attended numerous training sessions in Ottawa given to Canadians and others working in international development throughout the "developing world". At these training sessions, development is taught as a grassroots, bottom up approach that occurs as a result of local peoples' needs. Therefore, I was surprised to discover that the organization I was affiliated with as well as countless others in Ethiopia place "foreign experts" throughout the education sector, working in the Ministry of Education, regional education bureaus, zonal or city education bureaus, local woreda or district offices, universities, and teacher training colleges. There are no "foreign experts" working directly in schools or local communities. This essentially top down approach to development left me with many questions, of which one became the topic for my thesis: What is the role of international non-governmental organizations (INGOs) in the educational policymaking process?

Background

The realm of education is a highly politicized space in which the provision of education is contested on the basis of ideological differences. Gardner (2004) asserts that education systems must promote a democratic society, a society in which individuals have a say in "where they live", "how they live"; and "in which

1

all able-bodied individuals are expected to contribute not only to the security and well-being of their families but also to the health of the broader communities in which they live" (p. 250). Stromquist (2002) views education as moving in the opposite direction, arguing that national educational systems are changing, "becoming less a public good and more the manifestation of an economic sector that happens to be concerned with knowledge" (p. 37), a view in line with the objectives of the World Bank with regards to education policy. According to Spring (2009), the World Bank uses the concept of the knowledge economy directly and indirectly through international organizations to shape school systems in 'developing' nations (p. xiii). Bloom (2004) contends that education (education geared towards the knowledge economy – as espoused by the World Bank) leads to economic development and those countries which take advantage of the opportunities offered by globalization and education – such as the use of English – are more likely to succeed (p. 71). However, these advantages discussed by Bloom are countered by Aikman (1999) for whom education has become a weapon of oppression against Indigenous people due to educational policies "aimed at their cultural and linguistic eradication" (p. 79). Abdi (2005) concurs and in response calls for the urgent revival of African and other Indigenous educational and philosophical systems in order to ensure social development can occur. Educational policies in the global South are driven by the aims of International Financial Institutions (IFIs) such as the World Bank and donors countries such as Great Britain and the United States (Gondolfo, 2009). It is within this context in which IFIs, donor organizations and intergovernmental

2

organizations propel a neo-liberal ideology of the purposes of education (which while opposed by many as seen above) that INGOs become involved in the educational policymaking process as the conduits through which development aid is funnelled into the global South.

INGOs are involved in the development process of African countries at various levels and in various sectors through their relationship with IFIs, donor organizations and donor countries. INGOs, mainly due to their first world status and control of development aid, hold an extremely privileged position and have the ability to influence other organizations and agencies to change their policies and approaches (Riddell, 2008, p. 297). Furthermore, INGOs "are frequently portrayed as the building blocks of a prototypical 'global civil society', with the power to influence, and perhaps democratize, the structure of world politics, both through increasing influence within existing international institutions and their capacity to use this influence to leverage change in individual nation states" (Mundy & Murphy, 2007, p. 92). Therefore, it is integral to consider the role being played by INGOs in the development process. Many INGOs advertise themselves as the voices of civil society and local populations, thereby permitting themselves to become policy- and decision- makers.

In 2009, the Ethiopian Parliament passed the 'Charities and Societies Proclamation', restricting the activities of INGOs. Opponents of the proclamation argue that the new law will present severe obstacles to the provision of much needed aid. Proponents respond that while it will limit the ability of foreign funding agencies to influence policy, there is no restriction to the continued

provision of much needed funding for programs such as those aimed at improving quality education. My research will consider the role of INGOs in determining the educational policy of Ethiopia while examining the relationship between INGOs and recolonization within the Ethiopian context. In order to better understand the climate in which INGOs operate, I will examine and analyze literature which discusses the role of INGOs in policymaking as well as the reasons INGOs become involved in policymaking, an act some believe should be left to governments and which others believe INGOs have the duty to be a part of as the voices of local peoples who will be impacted by these policies.

Purpose and Objectives of the Research

My research will consider the role of INGOs in determining the educational policy of Ethiopia. In order to better understand the climate in which INGOs operate, I will examine and analyze literature which discusses the role of INGOs in policymaking as well as the reasons INGOs become involved in policymaking, an act some believe should be left to governments and which others believe INGOs have the duty to be a part of as the voices of local peoples who will be impacted by these policies. The literature examined for this study is not confined to the realm of educational policymaking, mainly due to the limited availability of research in this field in the Ethiopian context. It is imperative that the role of INGOs be better understood as they play a significant role in educational development in "developing" societies. This study falls within the general area of examining organizations created and funded in the global North and their role in educational policymaking in the global South. The data collected

4

will be analysed utilizing a postcolonial theoretical lens in order to examine the role being played by INGOs in the recolonization of Ethiopia.

Problem

Ethiopia has a long history of INGOs involvement, particularly during the famine of the 1980s. However, with the end of the famine, many INGOs already in Ethiopia took up education as their raison d'être. According to Mundy & Murphy (2001), INGOs, "venue shopping" in the mid 1990s, "chose education precisely because it was an issue already adopted by government and inter-governmental organizations and, thus, capable of providing them increased legitimacy and leverage" (p. 124). INGOs presented themselves and de facto became educational service providers. However, the question now becomes whether INGOs have limited themselves to the role of service provision for the last 20 years, or have they actually started exerting undue influence on educational policymaking. Grosfoguel (2005) contends that the idea that the overthrow of colonial administrations lead to decolonization is a myth which is still being perpetrated and that those in the "peripheral zones" still live within a "colonial power matrix" imposed by development organizations (p. 287). Postcolonial theory will allow for this research to examine whose voices are being heard within the Ethiopian educational system. As a nation which proudly exclaims that it has never been colonized, the changes to the Ethiopian education system over the past 20 years would argue that while a military force did not colonize Ethiopia to the extent that other African nations had been colonized (Ethiopia was briefly occupied by the Italians from 1935-1941), the nation's

education system, in design and objectives, has steadily changed to look much like the education systems of countries in the global North.

Research Questions

Local NGOs and INGOs are commonly viewed as the voice of the people; however, democratically elected officials are also the voice of the people. This research will ask various stakeholders – government and non-government – their views on the role of INGOs in education in order to assess the multiple converging and/or diverging understandings of this complex issue.

The guiding question of this research is: What is the role of INGOs in educational policymaking process in Ethiopia? In order to assist me in answering this main question, I have identified sub-questions which will direct my research and analysis.

1. What is the work of INGOs in the education sector in Ethiopia, and what is the perception of the various stakeholders in such situations?

2. What is/should be the role of INGOs in educational policymaking and whose mandate are INGOs fulfilling in such a role?

3. What changes are needed so that the role of INGOs constructively contributes to inclusive educational development in Ethiopia?

<div align="center">

Definition of Terms

</div>

Civil Society: As illustrated by Monga (1996), there is no single definition of "civil society". Within the realm of this study, civil society refers to non-governmental organizations and social movements – registered charities, development non-governmental organizations, community groups, grassroots

<div align="center">6</div>

movements, women's organizations, faith-based organizations, professional associations, trade unions, self-help groups, business associations, coalitions and advocacy groups— which engage in collective action (Chambers & Kymlicka, 2002; Seligman, 2002).

Colonization: Colonization is a practice of domination, which involves the subjugation of a group of people to another group. Historically, colonization referred to the physical takeover of lands by foreign nations (Peet & Hartwick, 2009). However, colonization can also be psychological as the attitudes, thoughts and beliefs of the subjugated are altered to resemble that that of dominant society (Fanon, 2006). Currently, theorists discuss the concept of re-colonization, a contemporary colonization of nations and peoples that is not related to a military occupation but through the concept of developing the global South (Leys, 1996).

Development: It encompasses the modernization of the global South by focusing on foreign aid, governance, healthcare, education, poverty reduction, gender equality, disaster preparedness, infrastructure, economics, human rights, environment and issues associated with these (Peet & Hartwick, 2009). Development is based on the belief of changing nations in the global South to be more like those in the North. With regards to education, development has meant a commitment to achieving the United Nations Millennium Development Goals and Education for All through a process of westernizing the education systems of the global South (Robertson, Novelli, Dale, Tikly, Dachi, & Alphonce, 2007).

Development Partners: The term refers to those organizations involved in

development work: NGOs, donor organizations, civil society organizations, IFIs and others.

Donor Organizations: The term refers to organizations which provide funding for development projects in the Global South. Examples of donors would be CIDA (Canadian International Development Agency) and DFID (UK Department for International Development), both of whom receive funding from their governments and in turn fund NGOs working in the global South as well as governments.

Grassroots Movements: These movements often originate at the local, community level and are driven by politics and beliefs important to specific communities.

International Financial Institutions (IFIs): IFIs are financial organizations in which members are nation states. This would include the following: The World Bank (WB), International Monetary Fund (IMF), International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD), International Finance Corporation (IFC), International Development Association (IDA), World Trade Organization (WTO), African Development Bank (AFDB), European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD)

Modernization: Modernization refers to the belief that nations in the global South are in need of becoming modern, of traversing the gap between traditional society and modern society, as exemplified by the United States, for example (Peet & Hartwick, 2009).

Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and International non-governmental organizations (INGOs): NGOs are organizations which are expected to operate independently of governments with regards to development. Often, however, NGOs are funded by governments. Funds are also received from donor organizations and IFIs. NGOs have historically been engaged in service delivery. Within the Ethiopian education system, this has meant providing support in terms of manpower to work at the different levels of educational administration. However, in recent year NGOs have moved beyond service delivery. NGOs can be national organizations in which all employees are local and to a degree funding comes from local sources.

This research will focus on International NGOs (INGOs). INGOs are international organizations which originate in the North and which are funded by Northern governments, international donor organizations and IFIs as well as private Northern donors. Furthermore, their scope is international as they operate in numerous nations in the global South and tend to hire employees from the North and to a lesser extent from the beneficiary country.

Educational policymaking: This is about the process of engaging in decision-making with regards to the Ethiopian education system. This would include working in advocacy and in influencing policy throughout the process, beginning with policy initiation and continuing into the implementation and follow up of new policies. This also involves the eventual management and distribution of educational resources.

Postcolonialism: This is an intellectual discourse which consists of an analysis of the legacy of colonization (historical, contemporary and recolonization) in the hopes of recognizing multiple voices, depicting the continued subjugation of various peoples and exposing the inherent and unequal power struggles between dominant groups and the colonized peoples of the world.

Limitations and Delimitations

Limitations

This study is limited in its scope; due to time and space limitations, I was unable to utilize various methods to ensure a more extensive response to the research question. Furthermore, a study encompassing the views of several grassroots organizations would have illustrated the points of divergence and/or convergence among grassroots organizations and INGOs. The study was also limited to six participants, whose views may not be representative of peers in similar professional positions. Furthermore, this study is limited in that five of the six participants were responding in English, a language not their mother tongue. It is, therefore, possible that miscommunication may have occurred during the interviews due to my inability to speak in Amharic and ensure a complete understanding of all questions.

My decision to utilize critical discourse analysis also impacted the manner in which I analysed participant responses. In analysing power relations and the construction of knowledge within the Ethiopian context, my own position of researcher places me in a position of power as ultimately this study is my analysis of the words of others. In addition, my own position, regardless of the

time I spent in Ethiopia, is of an outsider. This begets me to question my own role in conducting research regarding Ethiopian education policy given that my understanding of Ethiopian education has been influenced by my own educational experiences elsewhere.

Delimitations

My decision to utilize a postcolonial theoretical framework while focusing on the works of African scholars – Chinua Achebe, Claude Ake and Julius Nyerere – limited the scope and defined the theoretical and related practical boundaries of the research. Postcolonial theory provided me with the framework with which I could analyse participant responses regarding the role of INGOs in educational policymaking in Ethiopia. Postcolonial theory was employed in order to better understand whether Ethiopia, a nation which was not colonized by European powers in the 1800 – 1900s (with the exception of a brief occupation by the Italians from 1935-1941) is undergoing a contemporary colonization or recolonization through the influence of INGOs in the educational policymaking process. Furthermore, predominantly focusing on the works of Achebe, Ake and Nyerere, delimits the postcolonial theoretical framework I am engaging with to understand and analyse participant responses. The choices I have made with regards to my theoretical framework have defined the boundaries of the research and delimited the analysis of the research to one framework.

<center>**Significance of the Study**</center>

The literature examined in the following chapters is not confined to the realm of educational policymaking because there is a lack of research in this field.

<center>11</center>

It is imperative that the role of INGOs be better understood as they play a significant role in educational development in the global South. Are INGOs merely providing services which governments cannot afford to? Are INGOs or national governments deciding what educational services should be provided and/or the goals of education in "developing" societies?

Amutabi (2006) laments the lack of research into the activities of NGOs and INGOs in Kenya (p. 47). This lamentation can be extended into the Ethiopian context. Much of the research which has been conducted in Ethiopia by Ethiopians has not been taken up in nations from which INGOs originate. Furthermore, the research which has been employed to support local NGO and INGO activities in Ethiopia has often been produced by INGOs, donor organizations and International Financial Institutions.

Through this study, I hope to examine the role of INGOs in the policymaking process in order to determine whether a recolonization is influencing Ethiopian education. Furthermore, this study will illuminate on the role of various stakeholders in the policymaking process – INGOs, local NGOs, governments and the grassroots, whom INGOs and NGOs claim to speak for – in order to examine how colonization has impacted on the ability of these stakeholders to influence policy.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

Understanding Education and Development in the Global South

Berthoud (1992) claims that development means integration into the world capitalist market system. According to Guttal (2006), development is about the contestation of ideas where quality is not usually the demarcation point between the ideas that win and gain dominance and the ideas that lose. The ideas that win are those supported by "the power of finance and politics, and specific class and institutional interests" (Guttal, 2006, p. 39). King (2006) argues that knowledge and, thereby, education are the key drivers of development and that knowledge is central to the continued livelihood of the aid industry. According to the World Bank (2007), "Education is central to development... It is one of the most powerful instruments for reducing poverty and inequality and lays a foundation for sustained economic growth" (cited in Spring, 2009, p. 30).

The relationship between INGOs and international donor organizations

Shivji (2007) argues that the imperial relationship continues today, and in order to maintain legitimacy after independence, "new regimes had to deliver on both developmental and social fronts" while IFIs, the donor community and multinational corporations used the African state to serve their own interests, turning a blind eye to mismanagement and corruption (p. 14). It is within this context identified by Shivji that Brown (2004) contends that World Bank guidelines, sell "participation" as one of the key elements of the Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs) (p. 238). Chapter seven of the World Bank's

PRSP Sourcebook – aptly titled "Participation" – considers the following questions: "What is participation and what role can it play in the PRSPs?" (Brown, 2004, p. 239). According to Brown (2004), participation supposedly involves a wide range of stakeholders, including the "poor", the vulnerable and women who can "influence and share control" as individuals or through institutions such as NGOS and INGOs (p. 239). According to Schech and vas Dev (2007), *The World Development Report 2000/01: Attacking Poverty* marks a turning point in development as it encourages participation by seeking to include the "poor" in policymaking (p. 171). Schech and vas Dev (2007) disagree that the World Bank's interest in participation is being fuelled by a genuine desire for the "poor" to empower themselves, arguing that by promoting empowerment as the answer to the problems facing the world's "poor", the World Bank is simply attempting to increase its legitimacy as a global governance institution, "particularly in the eyes of international NGOs and the Bank's southern based target populations" (p. 176), as perplexingly, it is the World Bank which on the one hand recommends the withdrawal of state support from the social sector which funds many INGOs and NGOs engaged in those same services (Kamat, 2004). Fisher (1993) contends that this rise in INGOs in the global South will prove to parallel the rise of the nation state in the 1900s.

Cooke (2004) suggests that the intrinsic, defining, feature of development is its provision of its "own self-legitimising meta-narrative which gives meaning to the experiences and actions of those it would develop, its subjects and objects'' (cited in Kothari, 2005, p. 442). Rahnema (1992) argues that NGOs and INGOs

and their false assertions on the promises of participation is due to the fact that even though development projects serve the interests of the few, they continue to be widely supported, because INGOs and other development agencies, such as the World Bank, perpetuate an illusion that, one day, similar advantages will be extended to all (p. 118). Utting (2006) claims that the link between participation and the creation of a knowledge economy is due to international development agencies which position themselves as "knowledge agencies" while also marketing their role as being more responsive to "local knowledge" and the "voices of the poor" (p. 1). According to Amutabi (2006), INGOs are extolled by donor organizations as being "more accountable, more efficient, more innovative, more democratic, participatory, and empowering than their governmental, bureaucratic counterparts" (p. 45). Therefore, INGOs which are actively involved in development activities in "developing" countries have become the face of aid.

Demars (2005) argues that donors find INGOs useful, thereby funding their activities because INGOs act as a surrogate or middleman to help donors "empower" the grassroots (p. 25). According to Edwards and Hulme (1996) and Kamat (2004), INGOs are praised for being what governments cannot be and as more attentive to the needs of the grassroots. Rahnema (1992) asserts that "participation" is a new form on investment, as "grassroots organizations are becoming the infrastructure through which investment is made" (p. 119). INGOs and donor organizations promote civil society as one single homogenous group who unilaterally agree on development issues.

Shivji (2007) claims that according to the World Bank, "the villain of the

declining economic performance of Africa was the state: it was corrupt and dictatorial with no capacity to manage the economy and allocate resources rationally" (p. 20), thereby leading to a situation in which "decision-making and policy-making slipped out of the hands of African states as the West financed policy and governance consultants in their thousands to produce policy blue prints, poverty reduction strategies and manuals on good governance" (p. 21). Thus, states need foreign non-political development practitioners, such as INGOs to mentor, monitor, and oversee them (p. 25). Michael (2004) illustrates this through the example of one donor agency working in a Southern African country; the donor decided to maximize the impact of its "investment" by funding INGOs that could provide maximum coverage of the work throughout the country. This is problematic, according to Michael (2004), because local NGOs which have the ability to provide "national coverage with an in-depth knowledge and experience of each different region" are disadvantaged as INGOs have greater funds, the financing and the personnel to be active throughout the country; furthermore, overseeing one organization is much easier for donors than several (p. 227). According to Amutabi (2006), neoliberalism placed new emphasis on capitalism and micro-financing, two areas that dominated public policy on development, and which INGOs presented themselves as best suited to implement (p. 45). However, this engagement in advocacy by INGOs has undermined the sovereignty of state (Kamat, 2004).

The Role of INGOs in the Development Paradigm

INGOs have become major players in the development industry. The

continuing dominance of INGOs in development requires an understanding of how this came to be as well as the perceptions held of INGOs. Choudry (2010) contends that during the 1990s, the number of INGOs and NGOs grew exponentially worldwide, as governments, intergovernmental organizations and international financial institutions promoted the strengthening of civil society and good governance. Mundy and Murphy (2001) argue that NGOs and INGOs act as the voices of civil society to governments and safeguard the public by "limiting the government's ability to impose arbitrary rule by force" (p. 92). According to Amutabi (2006), INGOs have become such significant actors in development that little development occurs without INGO input (p. 46). Much of INGO influence lies in their ability to transmit global cultural norms embodied in themes like development, education, and universal human rights (Schafer 1999, p. 70). INGOs and "NGOs foster reliability, responsibility, respect for the law, and continuity. At the same time they are autonomous, politically competent, publicly respected, knowledgeable, and possess local knowledge and contacts" (Demirovic, 2003, p. 227). Dibie and Kawewe (2008) found that with regards to education, 70% of Botswanians and 80% of Nigerians saw NGOs and INGOs as contributing in this area (p. 112) and conclude that joint ventures between government, INGOs, NGOs, civil society and the private sector are crucial to achieving sustainable development and increase standard of living (p. 117). These findings illustrate the excellent public relations image of NGOs and INGOs, one which is slowly being dismantled by grassroots organizations, intellectuals, researchers and academics. The above may be problematic to those

17

local NGOs which view themselves as grassroots organizations; however, I would contend that NGOs which professionalize the concept of development must reconsider their identity as grassroots organizations.

There is growing literature which depicts NGOs and INGOs as organizations with problematic goals and strategies. Edwards (2008) sees INGOs and NGOs as a conduit through which donor organizations can channel aid and their view of development into the global South (p. 50). INGOs and NGOs are a consequence of the development of various interest groups, not only representing particular interests, but also contributing to their formation as they train people in new roles and create new relationships between the state and the population (Demirovic, 2003, p. 232). In this sense, INGOs have hegemonic control over populations in developing societies. INGOs have the ability to inculcate in "people an entire system of values, beliefs, and morality" that support the established order and its dominating classes (Peet & Hartwick, 2009, p. 176). INGOs and, thereby, the aid industry have "become institutionalized and professionalized"; aid "is neither an event nor an act; it is a strategy" (Gronemeyer, 1992, p. 54). Utting (2006) argues that development agencies, such as INGOs, are "positioning themselves as 'knowledge agencies', attempting to enhance their role as intellectual actors and to be more responsive to 'local knowledge', the 'voices of the poor', and the needs and realities of developing countries" (p. 1). According to Petras and Veltmeyer (2001), however, non-governmental organisations are "not accountable to local people, but to overseas donors" who use their own criteria and goals to determine the performance of

NGOs.

There is much debate among theorists as to the effects felt by governments as a result of an increased INGO role in development. Amutabi (2006) argues the INGOs represent a new third sector initiative in the globalization process in which governments are being removed from certain spheres of involvement while at the same time allowing people freedom to initiate and choose what they want; this privileging of INGOs allows them to fill in the gaps left by governments in the development process, a process Amutabi refers to as 'philanthrocracy' (p. 40). According to Schafer (1999), however, INGOs are problematic in that they often challenge particular state policies and actions while also legitimating the existence of states, helping to shape state authority and often at the expense of local and traditional collectives (p. 72). INGOs are not "non-governmental" organizations as that they "receive funds from overseas governments, work as private subcontractors for local governments and/or are subsidized by corporate-funded private foundations with close working relations with the state"; furthermore, INGO programs are accountable not to local people but to overseas donors (Petras & Veltmeyer, 2001, p. 132). According to Amutabi (2006), INGOs have become such significant actors in development that little development occurs without their input (p. 46). The Kenyan government, for example, includes INGOs and NGOs in their development plans, an acknowledgement of their status (Amutabi, 2006). Kamat (2004) argues that INGOs are now the primary catalysts of change rather than government experts and have been "identified as the preeminent, if not sole, organizational forms that can implement the global commitment to 'bottom up'

development" (p. 155). Schafer (1999) contends that NGOs and INGOs "help maintain the illusion of progress, legitimating corrupt and abusive states and transnational corporations in the eyes of the global citizens, but bring about little improvement in the lives" of the majority of people in developing societies (p. 73).

Amutabi's concept of philanthrocracy and Choudry's arguments against the NGOization and professionalization of the development industry further highlight the growing problems associated with INGOs. Kamat (2004) contends that the globalization of INGOs reflects a new policy consensus in which INGOs are "de facto agents of democracy rather than products of a thriving democratic culture" (p. 156). Schafer (1999) argues that many developing states cannot afford to fail at the development process as this leads to their de-legitimization when attempting subsequent developmental efforts; therefore, many fragile states seek partnerships with INGOs (p. 72). Amutabi (2006) extensively cites what he sees as problematic:

> NGOs create images outside of history, and they do this by doctoring and manipulating local scenes, images, pictures and annual reports, that often exaggerate poverty and helplessness in order to draw donor attention and to justify their continued presence in Africa. ... therefore, NGOs strategically situate themselves at the door of knowledge in Africa, managing information, releasing and 'unveiling' what they want and keeping out what is not useful to their course. They are gate-keepers, situating themselves between Africans and donors, exercising so-called

20

benevolent hegemony. They are used for the purpose of maintaining and extending Northern material, political, social and cultural influence while promoting a local comprador bourgeoisie, and yet there is no serious critique of these misrepresentations. (p. xxvi)

Through these techniques and strategies, as described by Amutabi, INGOs can influence other organizations and agencies to change their policies and approaches (Riddell, 2008, p. 297).

In 2005, a World Bank study found that 75% of Africans are uncomfortable with wealth disparities and are strongly committed to equality within the society (Bond, 2006, p. 104). Choudry (2010) argues that the professionalization and institutionalization of INGOs has resulted in a process of NGOization in which governments, intergovernmental organizations and IFIs promote the strengthening of civil society and good governance, and this "dominant notion of "civil society" emphasizes the rights of individuals to pursue their self-interest rather than collective rights, and simultaneously upholds and obscures the interests of state and capital" (p. 18), a process which Kamat (2004) maintains promotes the individual "as both the problem and the solution to poverty" (p. 169) rather than national or international policies.

The number of NGOs and INGOs grew astronomically in the 1990s, and education became one agenda for NGOs and INGOs in the 1990s. Mundy and Murphy (2001) claim that NGOs and INGOs "venue shopping in the mid 1990s chose education precisely because it was an issue already adopted by government and intergovernmental organizations and, thus, capable of providing them

increased legitimacy and leverage" (p. 124). It was at the Jomtien Conference of 1990, that "Education For All" became a mantra of the development industry. According to Schafer (1999), INGOs contribute substantially to education in "developing" societies, supporting the argument that a "global polity or international civil society is continuously evolving, and as it does, it persuades its member states and societies to adhere to world cultural institutions and norms" (p. 81). Schafer (1999) asserts that this study clearly illustrates the dependency between improved education in "developing" societies and international cooperation. INGO involvement in education can be seen in two ways: 1) INGOs become service providers, providing services national governments do not have the capacity to provide and 2) INGOs join the decision making hierarchy, engaging in advocacy and policymaking.

INGOs as service providers

Dibie and Kawewe (2008) contend that the explosion in the number of INGOs in Africa is due to the inability of African states to handle public welfare issues; without the support of INGOs, sustainable development would not be possible. This perception held by Dibie and Kawewe mirrors that held of many foreigners engaged in development work in the global South. Furthermore, due to lack of capital, states are incapable of providing education to all citizens; therefore, INGOs, local community groups and grassroots organisations working in conjunction with one another to provide educational services may be one solution for the provision of basic education in Africa (Buchmann, 1999). Buchmann (1999) supports INGOs provision of educational services, arguing that

lack of capital means states are incapable of providing education for all, and, therefore, INGO provision of education is one solution for achieving Education For All goals as IFIs and donor organization give capital not to the state, but to INGOs. Riddell (2008) maintains that it has "become increasingly common for INGOs to be the only agencies, governmental or non-governmental, responsible for providing services for entire population groups ... [and] INGOs in effect, assume the role of overall provider of services – a role usually reserved for governments" (p. 161). According to Robinson (1997), "given expanding market economies, and shrinking states, [I]NGOs are stepping in to respond to the needs and demands of the poor and marginalized sections of society" (Cited in Kamat, 2004, p. 156).

INGO involvement in the provision of education displaces the state from its role as the provider of education and other social services, implying that non-state provision of education is acceptable. Malhotra (2000) refers to this as a "surrogate service provision" for the State and equates their role to a "global soup kitchen," in which all involved must ensure that the lid be kept on the "simmering public discontent and social explosion" that would follow from the delegitimization of the state if INGOs were unable to perform this role (p. 659; quoted in Klees, 2008, p. 24). Manji and O'Coill (2002) contend that NGOs are taking over the role of the state and becoming the preferred providers of services in lieu of the nation state, "running projects that are motivated by charity, pity and doing things for people (implicitly who cannot do it for themselves), albeit with the verbiage of participatory approaches" (p. 581). Consequently, as Kamat

23

(2004) extends, "an effective policy for trade liberalization and privatization requires a minimalist state and a dynamic civil society," requiring a dynamic civil society because "the work of the state still needs to be done" (p. 164; quoted in Klees, 2008, p. 24). Malhotra (2000) argues that reduced aid for INGOs would force governments to become responsible for taking care of their own citizens, reminding governments and INGOs that INGOs should not be encroaching on the role of government and governments should not allow INGOs to take over the roles and responsibilities of government (p. 661), an explanation which does not consider the cultural and societal implications of INGO involvement in service provision.

INGOs as policymakers

INGOs engaged in service provision have used these experiences to illustrate their "understanding" of the needs of "local peoples" in order to insert themselves into the policymaking process. A USAID study found that for INGOs, sustainable education programs in Africa often requires changes in education policy, propelling INGOs "to try and change policies that hamper their work or seek new policies that would enhance it. In doing so, many INGOs have gone a step further, from trying to change specific policies to focusing on the policy process itself" (Academy for Educational Development, 2003). INGOs operate with a desire to influence attitudes, policy and practice, and to reform service provision by governments on the basis of their experiences in the field and through policy advocacy (Desai, 2008, p. 526). Addressing the dynamics of decentralization, redistribution of infrastructure and national planning should be

one of the functions of INGOs according to Dibie and Kawewe (2008, p. 107); furthermore, they argue that in most African nations, INGOs have moved beyond designing policies to involving grassroots organizations in fighting inequality and poverty due to the inability of African states to effectively handle the affairs of their economy (p. 109). Kadzamira and Kunje (2002) are concerned that the insistence of government that INGOs should work within existing policy frameworks sometimes frustrates the good intentions of INGOs. Kadzamira & Kunje (2002) disagree on the impact of INGOs, stating that INGOs have had limited impact on policy change in the educational sector in Malawi (p. 28). For Kadzamira & Kunje (2002), some INGOs programs have been successful in initiating debate and dialogue on policy issues, which they view as a positive development in the policy formulation process (p. 28). Furthermore, Foweraker (1995) and Robinson and White (2000) argue that governments of the global South have a responsibility to take advantage of INGO experiences in policy formulation (cited in Pollard & Court, 2008). Martens (2002) asserts that the professionalization of INGOs allows INGOs to engage in the policy process and sit as experts in drafting committees, for example, as they are not profit oriented and have a structure which allows them to work continuously for change.

INGOs participate in policymaking and policy dialogue among stakeholders, and policymaking, "an attribute of sovereignty for which government of the day is supposedly accountable to its people, is wrenched from the state and vested in the amorphous coterie of 'development partners' or stakeholders" (Shivji, 2007, p. 42). According to Shivji (2007), the report of

Tony Blair's Commission for Africa held African states primarily responsible for instances of bad government and lack of accountability, totally ignoring the role of imperialism (p. 22), wrenching policymaking, an important aspect of sovereignty, out of the hands of the African state (p. 23) to be handled by 'development partners' (p. 42). In an examination of the Manchester Conferences of 1991, 1994 and 1999, Edwards (2008) questions whether INGOs have made a difference. He argues that development INGOs have helped change the terms of the debate on globalization by expanding 'policy space' for "developing" countries while keeping the spotlight on the need for reforms in international institutions and global governance with relation to Africa (Edwards, 2008, p. 46).

According to Amutabi, policymaking has become one aspect of governance that is no longer in the hands of elected officials. Petras and Veltmeyer (2001) contend that INGOs reproduce the international and national power structure, thereby effectively becoming a part of the decision-making process (p. 134), and the role of INGOs has become the neutralization of political opposition at the bottom while promoting neoliberalism at the top (p. 137). Kamat (2004) argues that current debates on the role of INGOs illustrates the danger of INGOs and NGOs replacing the state as representatives of democracy and in fact delegitimizes the state (p. 159). This is problematic, according to Kamat (2004), because there are no mechanisms by which NGOs and INGOs can be made accountable to the people they claim to serve (p. 156). Malhotra (2000) contends that INGOs should not be involved in policymaking but should be strengthening the capacity of the poor, powerless and marginalized so that these populations can

26

make their own demands on governments (p. 667). As a consequence, a government that is being pushed out of the policymaking process by INGOs may be in the process of losing its own sovereignty and of being colonized by both INGOs and their governments which fund them.

While the belief that INGOs engage in participatory decision-making has resulted in unprecedented levels of success in the policymaking process for many INGOs, it has also been extremely problematic with regards to "the capacity and legitimacy of [I]NGOs to act as pseudo-democratic representatives of the poor" while also possibly undermining true democratic reforms (Bebbington, Hickey, & Mitlin, 2008 p. 15). Desai (2008) contends that INGOs engage in policymaking by playing "a catalytic or seeding role – demonstrating the efficacy of a new idea, publicizing it, perhaps persuading those with access to greater power and budgets to take notice and then encouraging the widespread adoption of the idea by others" (p. 527).

INGOs as participatory agents of change

Donor organizations have begun to actively promote the concept of participation of the poor in their own emancipation and empowerment, suggesting that those who are the recipients of aid should have a voice in deciding aid policies and practice; in reality, this has merely been development jargon as even within "participatory decision-making", policies are decided by those who hold power – the development experts. It is within this context that INGOs have become embroiled in development. The reasons given for INGO engagement in development is often that participation should involve a wide range of

stakeholders, including the "poor", vulnerable and women who can "influence and share control" through institutions such as INGOS (Brown, 2004, p. 239). For donor organizations and nations, local participation is "now perceived as an instrument for greater effectiveness as well as a new source of investment ... [and] is becoming a good fundraising device" (Rahnema, 1992, p. 119).

However, this notion of NGOs and INGOs as encouraging grassroots participation in their own emancipation has been heavily criticized by numerous scholars. Rahnema (1992) argues that participation has become a buzz word, used as an effective fundraising tool "due to the reputation acquired by NGOs and INGOs that their 'participatory' and less bureaucratic approaches have allowed them to meet the needs of people with greater efficiency and less cost" (p. 119). Shivji (2007) argues:

> [I]NGOS did not develop as, nor have we managed to become, organic to the mass of the people, at least so far. The relationship between the [I]NGOs and the masses therefore remains, at best, that of benefactor and beneficiaries. This is not the best of relationships when it comes to genuine activism with, rather than for, the people. (p. 54).

Furthermore, according to Choudry (2009), INGOs frequently allow limited space for Indigenous peoples to discuss issues, keeping strict "control over the parameters of what is discussed and the overall framework of the 'big picture' analysis" (p. 101). Those who are included in participation, often lose the ability to be dissenters (Kothari, 2005, p. 441). By participating in the process, dissent is managed. This exclusion also occurs at a secondary level when communities are

seen as an idealized, homogenous whole (Williams, 2004, p. 92).

Makuwira (2004) contends that the participatory nature of INGOs and NGOs appears in most cases to be an afterthought, something which occurs subsequent to an INGO's or NGO's decision to invest in a particular project. Makuwira (2004) exemplifies this misrepresentation by NGOs through a case study of a Malawian NGO, Tigali Literacy Project (TLP). According to Makuwira (2004), a "thorough analysis of TLP's documents reveals that the organization was established after a "needs assessment" that, according to top TLP officials, engaged a number of people"; however, contrary to this claim, numerous project officers in the TLP openly stated that there was a plan in existence before consulting local community members (p. 117). This reveals the inner workings of the neo-liberal framework which assumes that NGOs and other structures of the development order consider local populations in need of empowerment, empowerment which only they can provide and which local peoples may not even be fully cognizant they are in need of (Rahnema, 1992, p. 123). Furthermore, this illusionary impression of participatory development denies the role which development "experts" play in shaping how participants contribute to the process (Williams, 2004, p. 93). According to Kothari (2005), participatory development has become professionalized through the use of training manuals and the implementation of skill training workshops for example; therefore, the power and authority of development experts who are not locals are established (p. 440).

The involvement of individuals and groups from the grassroots cannot be described as democracy or participatory action; it is a "trivial form of

29

participation in the wielding of power, the structure and channels of which have already been established" (Demirovic, 2003, p. 215). Cornwall and Brock (2006) would criticize the description of INGOs as grassroots organizations, arguing that in reality INGOs reinforce the hegemonic positions of powerful actors and institutions through the appropriation of the language of development (cited in Utting, 2006, p. 7). INGOs cannot engage in true participatory development as this would require donors and INGOs to give up their power (Porter & Wet, 2009, p. 297). In actuality, INGOs decide who to employ as facilitators – whether local or foreign, and communities have little choice but to acquiesce to the decisions made by INGOs or to no longer be a part of their own development (Waddington & Mohan, 2004, p. 221). INGOs have failed in many regards; they have internalized functions that should have been distributed across the local and are franchising global brands as opposed to "supporting authentic expressions of Indigenous society" (Edwards, 2008, p. 47).

The relationship between INGOs and local communities

Participatory decision-making as that which INGOs are seen to be responsible for necessitates that INGOs work with local communities. Mundy and Murphy (2001) attempt to validate NGOs and INGOs as the voices of local communities, arguing that the relationship between Oxfam International and Education International – an international association of teacher trade unions – for example "suggests a renewed solidarity and internationalism among teachers' unions and marks the beginning of a new era of cooperation between international trade union associations and other international non-governmental actors around a

common agenda for global change" (p. 107). Patel and Mitlin (2002) view INGOs involvement as problematic, arguing that when INGOs or professionals are involved in civil society, local peoples are less likely to participate as the intervention by professionals is altered by "a particular set of associations" which are not in accordance with local beliefs; furthermore, "professionals claim the role of knowledge specialist, thus holding back the participatory process" (127). Michael (2004) contends that many INGOs forego working with local organizations, choosing instead to fund or create new community based organizations (CBOs). Ideally, these CBOs are set up to empower communities but in reality "offer community members few opportunities to set their own priorities for development and undertake self-designed projects based on those priorities" (Michael, 2004, p. 122); furthermore, with no fulltime employees and no financial resources, these CBOs often go under when INGOs leave the community (Michael, 2004, p. 122). Development work once again becomes professionalized.

Petras and Veltmeyer (2001) assert that INGOs undermine democracy by creating dependence on non-elected overseas officials as well as local INGO leaders instead of allowing local peoples to deal with issues surrounding social programs and other local issues (p. 132). According to Senarclens (1997), INGO claims to defend and respect Indigenous cultures are simply a pretext as INGOs are really interested in disassociating local populations from their reciprocal based economy, and "to achieve this, they define the local ... in Western terms (p. 202) while also destroying community "bases of reciprocity, to impose either

privatization or collectivization" (p. 203). Kamat (2003) finds problematic that INGO approaches to community development and empowerment encourage "the poor" to find solutions to their problems within a neoliberal context as individuals are seen as both the problem and solution as this contradicts the communal nature of many communities. Edwards (2008) is also contemptuous of the methods of INGOs, stating:

> Little concrete attention is paid to downward accountability or the importance of generating diverse, local sources of funds for so-called partners in the South.... They have internalized functions that should have been distributed across other organizations – local fundraising by international NGOs inside developing countries, ... franchising global brands instead of supporting authentic expressions of Indigenous civil society, and crowding out southern participation in knowledge creation and advocacy in order to increase their own voice and profile. (p. 47)

Guttal (2006) contends that INGOs must break the monopoly these development organizations hold over the development agenda through "a strategic awareness of the political economy of knowledge creation, and actively support alternative ways in which knowledge is generated and shared" (p. 39).

Education, Development and INGOs in Ethiopia

Understanding the Ethiopian education system

Emperor Menelik II came to power in Ethiopia in 1889 with the intention to expand education in order to modernize Ethiopia and to ensure the centralization of government, the reform of administrative apparatus, and the

improvement of social conditions for the people as well as for the sovereignty of the country (Areaya, 2008, p. 38). Menelik viewed education as the answer to a sustainable peace, thereby allowing Ethiopia to remain "a great nation in the face of European powers" (Areaya, 2008, p. 37). Ethiopia was the only nation in Africa not colonized or occupied by a colonizing force at the time. Menelik assumed that a Westernized education system would ensure Ethiopian sovereignty (Pillay, 2010, p. 95). Ethiopian education followed a Westernized education system in which the language of instruction was English from grade three and had a curriculum designed by a committee of foreign "experts" which emphasised non-Ethiopian concepts such as textbooks, classroom management and examinations (Areaya, 2008, 41). In 1972, the system was criticized as inefficient due to the high number of drop-outs (Areaya, 2008, p. 48).

Pushing Ethiopia along the path towards development appears to continue to be the mandate of the Ethiopian government's education policy. In a 2004 televised debate on Ethiopian Television (ETV), the Capacity Building Minister, Tefere Walwa, stated:

Every individual who completed grade eight will not necessarily be admitted to secondary education because ... we then can't afford for every grade eight completer to join secondary education. The country doesn't have such capacity to absorb all primary education graduates into secondary level. If we let all primary school completers join secondary education, the majority of the people, in turn, will not get the opportunity of completing primary education. The majority of primary education

33

graduates will join some kind of post primary technical and vocational education and prepare themselves for the world of work. Only a few will prepare for higher education. At the ends of grades 8 and 10, the majority of students are expected to embark on vocational training in order to bring about rapid development and achieve our goals. (Translated by and cited in Areaya, 2008, p. 66)

Economic development has become one of the primary objectives of the Ethiopian education system. Asgedom (2005) argues that this imported education system has displaced traditional Ethiopian values, "such as, emphasis on *gebregeninet* (what is virtuous and moral), emphasis on *moya* (skills, ability, craft, profession, etc) and mutuality of communal life" (p. 18). Proclamation 41/1993 of January 20, 1993 demonstrates Ethiopia's top-down and Westernized approach to development, bestowing the Ministry of Education with the power and duty to:

- Formulate the country's education policy and strategies and, upon approval follow up and supervise their implementation;

- Determine and supervise the implementation of the country's educational standard;

- Determine the educational curriculum offered at the level of Senior Secondary Schools, higher education institutions. (Cited in Areaya, 2008, p. 56)

A review of Ethiopian literature on INGOs in Ethiopia

In the aftermath of the widespread famine of the 1970s and 1980s, the

34

number of international humanitarian and aid NGOs and INGOs in Ethiopia ballooned (Clark, 2000, p. 4). With the victory of the EPRDF and a decrease in the need for humanitarian aid, many INGOs switched focus and became employed in the education sector (van Beurden, 1998). According to Seboka (2004), over one-third of NGOs and INGOs working in Ethiopia are engaged in education in service provision and advocacy, and this trend of "[I]NGO engagement in the education sector shows that [I]NGOs are now paying more attention to the development of human resources in the country, putting education as one of the priority areas of intervention in their poverty reduction strategies" (p. 20).

While the Ethiopian government may view the role of INGOs as that of service providers, numerous INGOs working in Ethiopia are involved in the policymaking process. According to Seboka (2004), SC/Norway and Action Aid Ethiopia have both been successful in influencing policy by professionalizing their roles (p. 42). Clark (2000) contends that between 1998 and 2000, the frequency with which the Ethiopian government has approached INGOs for guidance on policy decisions has increased substantially (p. 13). This can be attributed to the belief that INGOs act only in conjunction with grassroots desires (Pillay, 2010, p. 104), an image extremely appealing to the Ethiopian government as the Ministry of Education (2009) has identified community empowerment as one goal of the government (p. 37).

The current guidelines for educational policy in Ethiopia are defined in the General Education Quality Improvement Program (GEQIP) which was first

formulated by federal education officials including foreign experts working with World Bank officials before being sent to regional and woreda officials for comments (World Bank, 2008). The Ministry of Education contends that the only way in which to meet the first millennium development goal (MDG) – the eradication of poverty – is through increased literacy levels, a goal which the government alone does not have the capacity to ensure; therefore, INGOs must be actively involved in meeting the MDGs (Federal Democratic of Ethiopia, 2004, p. 32). Tobia (1995) quotes one long-time Ethiopian educator who asserts that participation by a few passers-by does not mean that the people have been involved (cited in Tefera, 1996, p. 24). According to Hailu (2007), the lack of community participation in the decision-making processes is also evident when one examines the selection process for the contents of the curriculum (p. 54). Hence, the assumption that through the involvement of INGOs in the policymaking process, the Ethiopian government is ensuring community and grassroots participation is invalidated.

However, no population is homogenous and within Ethiopia many support the role being played by INGOs in development and see a need for a greater role. Yimam (1998) contends that INGOs have made a valuable contribution in not only improving basic services but also in challenging traditional practices and beliefs (p. 83). Rahmato (2008) states that INGOs and NGOs must shift away from service provision towards activism and advocacy (p. 121) if they are to be "relevant to society and faithful to [their] own values and principles" (p. 128). Birke (2008) concurs that INGOs must address critical issues

related to policy and programming quality (p. 141). Seboka (2004) maintains that INGOs must engage in policy advocacy in order to be a voice for the disadvantaged. Considering the literature above and if as Asgedom (2005) argues, the imported Ethiopian education system has displaced traditional Ethiopian values, what is the role and impact of INGOs which engage in the policymaking process?

Summary

Given the extensive research which argues that INGOs are having a detrimental effect on the cultures, languages and belief systems held by the peoples of the global South, it is somewhat surprising that INGOs continue to hold such powerful positions within the educational policymaking process. In Ethiopia, limited research has been conducted with regards to the influence and role played by INGOs in the educational policymaking process. Consequently, it is integral that research is conducted with examines the role of INGOs in educational policymaking within the context of Ethiopian history, cultures and belief systems. More specifically, research conducted on policymaking in Ethiopia must consider the role of education within the development paradigm put into place by IFIs, intergovernmental organizations, donor organizations and INGOs. It is within this context that this study was conducted.

CHAPTER 3

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Introduction

Postcolonial theory views the formulation of non-Western modes of discourse as a viable means to challenge the West (Quayson, 2000), while compelling a rethinking of issues of knowledge and power which have been authorized by the dominant West, the colonizers (Peet & Hartwick, 2009). Employing Bhabha's concept of hybrid modalities, Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin (2006) claim that the colonial space is an agonistic space in which the relationship between colonized and colonizer becomes one of contestation and opposition, thereby creating hybrid modes of being (p. 11).

In terms of major thinkers relevant for postcolonial analyses in Africa, the findings of the research will be analysed predominantly through the writings of Chinua Achebe, Claude Ake and Julius Nyerere – African postcolonial scholars, theorists, writers and leaders. Grosfoguel (2005) contends that the idea that the overthrow of colonial administrations lead to decolonization is a myth which is still being perpetrated and that those in the "peripheral zones" still live within a "colonial power matrix" imposed by development organizations (p. 287). Postcolonial theory allows for an in-depth understanding of the relationship between the internal and external forces working within the Ethiopian education system as well as whether Ethiopia's current educational system has been affected by a modern day colonialism (recolonization) operating from outside and within.

According to Bhabha (1994/2005), postcolonial perspectives formulate a critical revision "around issues of cultural difference, social authority and political discrimination in order to reveal the antagonistic and ambivalent moments within the rationalizations of modernity" (p. 246). Consequently, in order to understand the need for a postcolonial analysis, an understanding of modernization theory and its relationship to development is integral; thus, this chapter will commence with a description of the role of modernization theory in education in the global South. I will then discuss the theories and ideas of Achebe, Ake and Nyerere in order to ensure an understanding of the complexities surrounding the role of INGOs in the educational policymaking process.

The Utilization of Modernization Theory to Propel the Role of Education

Education has become the means by which the educated can change to meet the needs of modern economic activity (Rostow, 1960/1991, p. 6). Modernization as espoused by Rostow became the basis for development theory in the 1960s. Education, in particular, has become a tool used by INGOs and IFIs such as the World Bank to manage dissatisfaction by those in "developing" countries towards the lack of success from development aid projects. Alex Inkeles and David H. Smith (1974) argue that modern men and women are characterized by the traits of "rationality, abstractness of knowledge, scientific thinking, and urbanity" (cited in Peet & Hartwick, 2009, p. 125). Therefore, the growth of a society is a result of "literacy, education, increased communication, mass media exposure, and urbanization" (Huntington, 1971/2007, p. 63), and

education has become the means through which "developing" societies are exposed to modernist ideologies. Consequently, this spread of a world education model can be attributed to modernization theory. The majority of governments in the "developing" world have bought into the premise that education is the answer to poverty alleviation.

INGOs have been pressuring the World Bank to increase public expenditure on education and healthcare in order to achieve poverty reduction (Toye & Toye, 2006, p. 105). Education and, in particular, the formal school system is being sold to peoples of "developing" countries as the answer to their problems of underdevelopment (Ki-Zerbo, Kane, Archibald, Lizop & Rahnema, 1997, p. 158). Dibie (2008) maintains that foreign investment and INGOs intervention and activities in Africa has promoted growth and development, and is "contributing positively towards human and social progress" (p. 7). The modernization of the 'developing' world is seen as possible through a renewed education system and thereby as the answer to poverty alleviation.

Due to lack of capital, states are incapable of providing education to all citizens; therefore, INGOs, local community groups and grassroots organisations working in conjunction with one another to provide educational services may be one solution for the provision of basic education in Africa (Buchmann, 1999). The Millennium Development Goals have made universal primary education by 2015 one of their six main goals. Donor organizations such as the World Bank are

fully in favour of such goals as they confirm World Bank dogma of a knowledge economy. According to the World Bank (2007), "Education is central to development... It is one of the most powerful instruments for reducing poverty and inequality and lays a foundation for sustained economic growth" (cited in Spring, 2009, p. 30). Therefore, not only is knowledge the key driver of development, knowledge is central to the continued livelihood of the aid industry (King, 2006. p. 108). Nation states have little choice but to also favour such goals as aid funding is dependent on nation states trying to meet the goals put into place by donors. Education, especially the type of education, is simply accepted as the answer to developing the global South. INGOs, as the middlemen of IFIs on the ground, become the service providers of education and, in many cases, the decision makers with regards to educational policy which meets the standards sets out to meet the needs of the knowledge economy. It appears that the goals of the knowledge economy are predominantly accepted by INGOs and governments which formulate educational policy.

An understanding of the role of modernization theory in propelling education as the answer to poverty alleviation is essential to understanding the role being played by INGOs in the education sector in "developing" nations. Modernization theory offers the basis upon which development theory has been built. Through understanding the role of modernization theory in creating the need for development, one can critically utilize postcolonial theory as a framework to examine the role played by INGOs – an instrument of modernization theory – on

41

education, as postcolonial theory developed in effect as a response to modernization theory.

The Construction of Africa as "What Not to Be": The Need for Development

Modernization theory decries the need for development in the global South. Africa was seen and continues to be seen as in need of improvement, in need of development. This view of Africa has continued unabated into contemporary times. The theory of development idealizes the west at the expense of the "developing" nations. According to Ake (1996b), African nations are portrayed as examples of what nations should not be which has severely affected the African image of itself as well as what Africa and Africans are capable of. Ake (1996b) states that

> One of Africa's problems is its highly visible negative image. Africa is being construed as the ideal of how not to be. In a world increasingly motivated by a materialist culture which is obsessively competitive, the continent has assumed unprecedented backwardness as the measure of backwardness and also of the spectacular achievements of the industrialized countries (p. 7).

This vision of African nations portrays Africa and Africans in an extremely negative light which "is not only demoralizing for Africa, it reduces its ability to manoeuvre. ... This negative image of Africa may well be more threatening than its marginalization" (Ake, 1996a, p. 14).

42

This vision of African nations is even more problematic when one realizes that it is held not only by non-Africans but by many Africans themselves. According to Kamat (2002) the consent of the dominated classes in accepting the hegemonic programs of the dominating classes further marginalizes the dominated classes (p. 32). Ake (1996b) argues that this hegemonic domination occurred because African leaders wrongly accepted the support of the international community, replacing "self-government" with the "ideology of development" which in reality was a "strategy of power which merely capitalized on the objective need for development" (p. 17). This was exemplified when "East African leaders changed the nationalist slogan from *Uhuru* (Freedom) to *Uhuru na Kaze* (Freedom means Hard Work)", giving rise to the belief that Africa was in need of development and that development required newfound behaviour from Africans (Ake, 1996b, p. 17).

It was the West which brought a paradigm for development to Africa. Modernization meant "the achievement of industrialization, a high per capita income, and high mass consumption" (Ake, 1996b, p. 18). The modernization and development of Africa did not acknowledge African culture and history other than to see African culture and ways of life as something to overcome. Africans were and are viewed as "enemies of progress for it is their own peculiar characteristics which sustain their underdevelopment" (Ake, 1996b, p. 21). The focus is "on the possibility of Africa becoming what it is not and probably can never be. Implicitly it discourages any belief in the integrity and the validity of African societies can

43

only find validity in their total transformation, that is in their total self-alienation"
(Ake, 1996b, p. 21).

Africa is being developed by outsiders whose aim is to reproduce Africa into their image as opposed to allowing Africans to engage in a process of self-discovery or take pride in their cultures and ways of life. Ake (1996b) argues that this illustrates the vertical, top-down relationship between Africa and the West (p. 30). Ake (1996b) questions the validity of the assumption that one can develop another and of transferring values from the "haves" to the "have nots". There is, according to Ake, no evidence to suggest this to be plausible. Ake (1996b) argues:

> The society to be developed, its people and its culture are by definition, what ought not to be, and so, bad. In so far as there is interest in them, it is to problematize them, to explore how the deficiencies which frame their underdevelopment can be. Instead of taking them as they are and exploring how they might make progress on terms which they understand and accept, the development paradigm judges them negatively by what they ought to be and inevitably degenerates into an exercise in alienation.... This problem is inherent in their development paradigm and overcome cannot be appropriately addressed in the context of this paradigm even when it is recognized. (p. 34)

African culture is viewed as in need of change and modernization, in effect as a hindrance to African development. Education plays a key role in this promoting

44

this assumption.

Recognizing the view commonly held of Africa and the supposed needs of Africa is integral to understanding the current functioning of many African states. According to Achebe (1999):

The point of all of this is to alert policymakers in such institutions as the World Bank to the image burden that Africa bears into the 21st Century and make them recognize how the image has molded contemporary attitudes, including perhaps their own to that continent (p. 317).

Achebe (2009) argues that the derogatory images of Africa since the slave trade have allowed the continuation of a tradition of devaluing Africa, a devaluation which has been bequeathed to those in the business of developing Africa and Africans (p. 79). For Nyerere (1967), the only possible solution to this vision of Africa and Africans comes when Africans "start from a full acceptance of our African-ness and a belief that in our own past there is very much which is useful for our future" (p. 2).

The Valuation/Devaluation of Knowledge

During colonization, the North depicted Indigenous ways of knowing as inferior. The culture, knowledge and language of the colonizers dominated. According to Alvares (1992), "In a world consisting of dominating and dominated cultures, some cultures are bound to be considered more equal than others" (p. 220). The self-acknowledged superiority of the colonizers along with their

military might aided in the subjugation of the South, leading to severe economic inequities. These inequities were further exacerbated by the North's portrayal of "African traditional education and systems of thought as either non-existent, basically non-tenable, and/or non-coherent primitive noises that the native population was to be cleansed of" (Abdi, 2005, p. 27). Shizha (2005) argues that this inequality was aggravated through colonial education leading to "psychological and cultural alienation and cultural domination" (p. 67), resulting in a "heritage of inequality, inaugurated and cemented during colonialism ... [and] still largely intact today" (Alvares, 1992, p. 220). The notion of modernity and development, identified through the image of the North, is prevalent in the South and in the image created by the colonized of the future South. This post-facto 'after picture' is a result of a colonization of the mind and an educational system that "destroyed all previously established systems of cultural reference [and] ... systematically discredited all previously established mechanisms that different cultures had created throughout their histories for fostering knowledge and culture" (Ki-Zerbo, Kane, Archibald, Lizop & Rahnema, 1997, p. 158).

Education, for example, became a competition in which those who successfully adapted to the system were able to take advantage of the education they received and 'liberate themselves from poverty', further exacerbating the economic gap between the 'educated' and 'un-educated'. Instilling new values and attitudes leads students to reject their own cultural and personal identity, thereby acquiring a false sense of superiority, turning them away from manual

work, and all unschooled people, whom they perceive as ignorant and underdeveloped (Ki-Zerbo et al., 1997, p. 159; Nyerere, 1968, p. 57). Education reinforces the individual ambitions learned in colonial education; the collectivist teachings of Indigenous knowledge are forgotten. Students are separated from their parents and their cultural milieu, creating a cultural gap between the 'educated' and 'non-educated'. The educated often become ashamed of the life of the non-educated, losing their ties to the land and to Indigenous knowledge (Ki-Zerbo et al.. 1997, p. 159). These elite are now the educated middle class who become the 'Indigenous' members of INGOs. However, their situations and life styles are far removed from those whom they are expected to speak for. For these elite, "power decides what is knowledge and what it not knowledge" (Alvares, 1992, p. 230). They now have the power to actively ensure that the voices of Indigenous peoples are heard; in effect, the educated have been colonized and often reiterate the opinions of those in power and those who pay their salaries, not the local Indigenous peoples who they have little in common with. They no longer identify with the 'non-educated'. Their identity is constructed along a more Western notion of the individual which "does not correlate among many non-Western or non-modern peoples" (Escobar, 2008, p. 204).

The assumption that African knowledge systems are of little value has been detrimental to Africa. Achebe decries the absence of an Indigenous research tradition in Africa, arguing that imported theories and concepts have severe shortcomings within the African context as there has been no assessment to

determine how these theories impact the future of Africa (Achebe, Okeyo, Magadza & Hyden, 1990, p. 7). This is further evidence of the strength of modernization theory which assumed and viewed anything counter to Western economic rationalism as an obstacle to development.

> Indigenous cultural values, for instance, tend to be regarded as outdated and due to be changed at any cost. The inevitable outcome has been disrespect and disregard for anything African, and the emergence of a "top-down" approach to development. The nature and quality of social interaction as well as human creativity and self-esteem tend to be ignored in this perspective. (Achebe et al., 1990, p. 7)

Reinforced is the belief that Africans are "enemies of progress, including their own progress, for it is their own peculiar characteristics that sustain their underdevelopment" (Ake, 1996a, p. 15). It is people and culture which becomes problematic as opposed to the notion of development itself (Ake, 1996a, p. 15).

As Nyerere (1968) points out, all must question the purpose of development and the purpose of education in the quest for development.

> ... The people of this country ... have been demanding more education for their children. But we have never really stopped to consider why we want education – what its purpose is.... we have never thought about education except in terms of obtaining teachers, engineers, administrators, etc. Individually and collectively we have in practice thought of education as a

training for the skills required to earn high salaries in the modern sector of our economy. (Nyerere, 1968, p. 44)

Nyerere (1968) decries the system which "stresses book learning, and underestimates the value to [the] society of traditional knowledge and the wisdom which is often acquired by intelligent men and women as they experience life, even without their being able to read at all" (p. 57). It is a system which encourages students to view as worthwhile knowledge only that which is acquired from books or from "educated people" – those who have had formal education; "the knowledge and wisdom of other old people is despised, and they themselves regarded as being ignorant and of no account" (Nyerere, 1968, p. 56). Furthermore, Nyerere (1968) rails against the idea of education as purported by the colonial society, an education which "induced attitudes of human inequality, and in practice underpinned the domination of the weak by the strong, especially in the economic field" (p. 48). Nyerere (1968) argues that colonial education was a deliberate attempt to remake African societies into a colonial society. The result while not the total absorption of colonial ideals was the prevalent influence "on the attitudes, ideas, and knowledge of the people" who experienced such education (p. 48).

Nyerere (1967) does not argue against development but argues that it must come from African nations' own roots and must be determined as Africans see as appropriate (p. 1). For Nyerere (1967), change can only occur from within and

must include those who are members of the society in want of change.

> A country, or a village, or a community, cannot be developed; it can only develop itself.... If real development is to take place, the people have to be involved. Educated people can give a lead – and should do so.... Educated people, in other words, can only be effective when they are full members of the society they are trying to change, involved in its good and bad fortune, and committed to it whatever happens (Nyerere, 1967, p. 25).

It is important to recognize that "the generation and application of knowledge is shaped by class and societal interests" which the elite of the North have power to create (Guttal, 2006, p. 39). Social knowledge residing in the history, culture, institutions, collective consciousness, accumulated knowledge, experience and wisdom of the different levels of the society "needs to be recognized and validated" (Girvan, 2006, p. 82). "Schools should empower students to redefine their own destiny and cultural selves" (Shizha, 2005, p. 67), instead of continuing to erase and/or subordinate Indigenous peoples' knowledges and world views with dominant Western knowledges, "especially in the educational academy" (Choudry, 2009, p. 101). The classist differences among Africans must be erased as "the educated people of Africa have to identify themselves with the uneducated, and do so without reservation; otherwise their best efforts will be wasted" (Nyerere, 1973, p. 25).

Individual versus Collective Consciousness: The Role of Community

Colonial education promotes the culture of the colonizers in which the individual triumphs over the collective. According to a 2005 World Bank study, 75% of Africans are uncomfortable with wealth disparities and are strongly committed to equality within the society (Bond, 2006, p. 104). Education, for example, became a competition in which those who successfully adapted to the system were able to take advantage of the education they received and 'liberate themselves from poverty', further exacerbating the economic gap between the 'educated' and 'un-educated'. Instilling new values and attitudes leads students to reject their own cultural and personal identity, thereby acquiring a false sense of superiority, turning them away from manual work, and all unschooled people, whom they perceive as ignorant and underdeveloped (Ki-Zerbo et al., 1997, p. 159; Nyerere, 1968, p. 57). Education then reinforces the individual ambitions learned in colonial education; the collectivist teachings of Indigenous knowledge are forgotten. Students are separated from their parents and their cultural milieu, creating a cultural gap between the 'educated' and 'non-educated'.

The educated often become ashamed of the life of the non-educated, losing their ties to the land and to Indigenous knowledge (Ki-Zerbo et al.. 1997, p. 159). These elite are now the educated middle class who become the 'Indigenous' members of INGOs. However, their situations and life styles are far removed from those whom they are expected to speak for. For these elite, "power decides what is knowledge and what it not knowledge" (Alvares, 1992, p. 230). Their identity is constructed along a more Western notion of the individual which "does

51

not correlate among many non-Western or non-modern peoples" (Escobar, 2008, p. 204). This creates a re-imagining of oneself within the image of the other; the elite are defined in reference to the colonizer and attempt to become indistinguishable from the colonizer.

African nations are composed of those educated by a colonialist education system and those who still share a strong belief in the importance of community and communality. Nyerere (1974) illustrates the difficulties facing African societies because it is "with an educational elite whose whole teaching encouraged motives of individualistic advancement, [that Africans] are trying to create an egalitarian society" (p. 4), and "the vast majority do not think of their knowledge or their strength as being related to the needs of the village community" (Nyerere, 1968, p. 59). According to Ake (1993):

> For the African, especially the rural dweller, participation is linked to communality. Africans do not generally see themselves as self regarding atomized beings in essentially competitive and potentially conflicting interaction with others. Rather, their consciousness is directed towards belonging to an organic whole. The point is to find one's station and duty in life, not to assert one's interests and claim rights over others. People participate not because they are individuals whose interests are different and need to be asserted, but because they are part of an interconnected whole. Participation rests not on the assumption of individualism and conflicting interest, but on the social nature of human beings. Related to

52

this, the African concept of participation is as much a matter of taking part as of sharing the rewards and burdens of community membership.... Participation ... is rather the active involvement in a process, that of setting goals and making decisions. More often than not, it is the involvement in the process rather than the acceptability of the end decision, which satisfies the need to participate (p. 243).

Nyerere (1968) condemns the colonialist education system which "emphasized and encouraged the individualistic instincts of mankind, instead of his co-operative instincts" as this system "led to the possession of individual material worth being the major criterion of social merit and worth" (p. 47). For Achebe (1999), "If the philosophical dictum of Descartes – I think, therefore I am – represents an European individualistic ideal, the Bantu declaration – umuntu ngumuntu ngabantu (a human is a human because of other humans) – represents an African communal aspiration" (p. 321).

Is an Equal Partnership Between North and South Possible?

The methodology as well as the fundamental assumptions of development are arranged and understood in terms of binaries – the North for those who are developed and South for those in need of development. Within these two categories, nations may be placed on a continuum in which the end goal is the same for all – becoming a mirror image of the developed nations of the world. For the development industry, the development of the South can only occur with the

aid of the North, in effect continuing the patriarchal relationship of North and South. According to Ake (1996b), this dependence of the South on the North is firstly an economic dependence which has been embraced by Southern leaders and contrived by those who view the concept of "partnership in development" as a means to continue to influence Southern nations towards Northern interests (p. 16). Achebe (1990) derides the notions of partnerships between North and South, arguing:

> It is also the source of the impediment, because no definition of partnership can evade the notion of equality. And equality is the one thing which [the North is] conspicuously incapable of extending to others, especially Africans. Of course partnership as a slogan in political rhetoric is a different matter and is frequently bandied about. But anyone who is in any doubt about its meaning in that context need only be reminded about a British governor of Rhodesia in the 1950s defined the partnership between black and white in his territory, apparently without intending any sarcasm, as the partnership between the horse and its rider! (p. 23)

The notion of an equal partnership, while a catchy slogan, seldom plays out as positive. Development became the rallying call of the "benevolent" North in the 1950s and 1960s, and as the initiative for development was conceded to the North, "development came to be regarded not so much as what Africans do as what is done about Africa" by the North (Ake, 1996b, p. 19). According to Ake

54

(1996a), it was the North that supplied the development paradigm, a paradigm based on a Western model of social transformation; namely modernization theory (p. 9) and which favoured "more aid on more lenient terms, more access for African goods in western markets and on better terms, more transfer of technology, more investment, more debt forgiveness," all determined by the North as to the needs of the South (Ake, 1996b, p. 19).

Achebe (1990) maintains that the North can only see the South as a "partner," in all that the term means only when it accepts the African's humanity and the equality that flows from it, while simultaneously rejecting the notion of Africans as "a beast of burden" (p. 23). For Ake (1996a), a real partnership between North and South may never be possible as the North does "not take seriously the idea of the people developing themselves. They also have political interests that are unlikely to be served by making development an open-ended democratic process, determined by the will of the people, drawing on their energy, and serving their interest" (p. 119). Nyerere (1978) argues that aid in the form of charity cannot lead to development; people need jobs and need to be actively involved in the development process (p. 55). An equal relationship between North and South is essential if the peoples of the South are to be the determiners of their own paths.

Consciousness of the Dispossessed

Colonization is an ongoing phenomenon as the colonizer is no longer only from the outside but emerges from within as well. The elite who have been educated using the educational system of coloniality become the colonizers in many instances. Development becomes a desire from within as well as outside. According to Ake (1996a, 1996b,), a colonial mindset was continued after the independence of African nations by the African elite which succeeded the colonial regime and whom chose to "inherit the colonial system" instead of "transforming it in accordance with the democratic aspirations of the nationalist movement" (Ake, 1996b, p. 14) as these elite Africans "internalized the paradigm's negative images of themselves as well as notions of the superiority of developed societies" (Ake, 1996a, p. 16).

Escobar (2008) argues that "local expressions of the desire for development ... need to be seen against the background of the complex history of several hundred years of discrimination, including the experience of promises made and never fulfilled since independence" (p. 175). The history of colonization taught Indigenous populations the importance of success within the colonial educational system in order to not only survive colonialism but to be a voice for independence for one's own people. It is not surprising that the lessons learnt during the prolonged period of colonialism were not easily discarded once countries achieved independence. In this way, development projects will usually reproduce "old power and knowledge asymmetries" (Escobar, 2008, p. 175).

Achebe exemplifies this supposition through the words of a fellow Nigerian writer:

 Writing coming from Nigeria, from Africa ... sounds quite stilted. After reading the first page you tell yourself you are plodding. But when you are reading the same thing written by an English person or somebody who lives here you find you are enjoying it because the language is so academic, so perfect. Even if you remove the cover you can always say who is an African writer. But with some of my books you can't tell that easily anymore because, I think, using language everyday and staying in the culture my Africanness is, in a way, being diluted. My paperback publisher, Collins, has now stopped putting my books in the African section. (cited in Achebe, 2000, p. 70)

For Achebe (2000), "the psychology of the dispossessed can be truly frightening" (p. 72).

Fanon argues that Africans have a desire to become like their colonizers, that they see their destiny in eventually becoming white (Fanon, 2008/1952, p. 202). According to Fanon (2008/1952):

When Blacks make contact with the white world, a certain sensitizing action takes place. If the psychic structure is fragmented, we observe a collapse of the ego. The black man stops behaving as an actional person. His actions are destined for "the Other" (in the guise of the white man),

since only "the Other" can enhance his status and give him self-esteem at

the ethical level (p. 132).

Escobar utilizes Fanon's theory to explain development. According to Escobar

(2008):

Even the most enlightened expert-driven participatory projects re-enact the

conditions of coloniality, including knowledge and ethnic hierarchies....

The local notion of development includes the acquisition of those tools of

dominant knowledge systems that might empower them to envision and

implement a viable future.... Local talk [is] about development per se as

about history and culture – about the state, citizenship, difference,

knowledge and exploitation. It is about the colonial difference, namely,

the communities' position within the modern colonial world system. (p.

176).

For Fanon and Escobar, as for Ake and Achebe, development becomes about the

South becoming a mirror of the North; there is little discussion even among

Africans as to what constitutes development within the African context. As long

as those who are leading the discussion are those who have been schooled to

believe in the superiority of Northern ideals, little will change.

Summary

Ethiopia has a long history of INGO involvement, particularly during the

famine of the 1980s. However, with the end of the famine, many INGOs already

58

in Ethiopia took up education as their *raison d'être.* INGOs became educational service providers. However, the question now becomes whether INGOs have limited themselves to the role of service provision for the last 20 years. In Ethiopia, many INGOs recruit foreign experts to work in teacher training colleges, universities, regional education bureaus and the ministry of education as opposed to having foreign experts work in local schools. It is usually educational decision-makers who work in these institutions and at these levels. Why are foreign experts from the global North (the West) part of the decision-making environment of the Ethiopian education system. Furthermore, while Ethiopians are employed to work at the in-country headquarters of many INGOs and while Ethiopians predominantly work in policymaking in the Ministry of Education, should educational policymaking solely be in the hands of the privileged elite, a group which constitutes about five percent of the total population of Ethiopia. Postcolonial theory will allow for this research to examine whose voices are being heard within the Ethiopian educational system. As a nation which proudly exclaims that it has never been colonized, the changes to the Ethiopian education system over the past twenty years would argue that while a military force did not colonize Ethiopia, the nation's education system has steadily changed to look much like the education systems of countries in the global North. Is a non-Ethiopian education system the best choice for Ethiopians?

CHAPTER 4

METHODOLOGY

Introduction

This research is intended to include a critical analysis of the role of INGOs in the policymaking process in Ethiopia. The aim of this research is to develop a critical understanding of the role of INGOs and extrapolate from the data the implications of INGO participation in the policymaking process for Ethiopia and Ethiopians. I utilized a postcolonial theoretical framework in my interpretation of the data and based my framework on a critical perspective while utilizing critical discourse analysis. My arguments for the use of a critical perspective and critical discourse analysis are presented in the chapter.

Ontological and Epistemological Perspectives

In accordance with a critical perspectivist ontology, reality is constructed through, and driven by power and power relations. Knowledge, therefore, is constructed, suggesting that theory utilized in research should be practical, self-reflexive, explanatory and normative (Paul, 2005, p. 47). The researcher must work to uncover the dynamics of power and ideology while employing social and cultural criticism in an effort to reveal and challenge oppressions, thereby working towards the emancipation of the oppressed (Noblit, 2005, p. 76) and the creation of a more just society. According to Thomas (1993), the central task of a critical perspective is for the researcher to raise "their voice to speak to an audience on behalf of their subjects as a means of empowering them, giving more

authority to the subject's voice" (p.4; cited in Noblit, 2005, p. 76). White (2004) maintains that a critical perspectivism "retains the traditional concern with power, but allows for more indeterminacy in identifying it in specific cases" as "the question of who is responsible for the effects of power in a given situation is sometimes not easy to discern" and "attributions of responsibility may identify multiple agents in the economy and in various levels of the state" (p. 322). Benhabib contends that while "struggle, contestation, contingency, and partiality" are central to the decision-making process, "we can criticize decisions and rulings if the people affected were not given a chance to speak, be heard, and have their claims and objections answered" (cited in Chambers, 2004, p. 242).

According to Carspecken (1996), critical perspectivism includes these characteristics: 1) Researchers utilize critical perspectivism in cultural and social criticism; 2) Researchers are opposed to inequality in all its forms; 3) Research should reveal oppression, challenge and change it; 4) All forms of oppression should be studied; and 5) Mainstream research contributes to oppression and thus critical epistemology should presuppose equal power relations (p. 6-7; cited in Noblit, 2005, p. 77). Elaborating on the major characteristics of critical perspectivism, Carspecken (1996) stipulates that:

1. critical epistemology must be extremely precise about the relationship of power to research claims, validity claims, culture and thought

2. critical epistemology must make the fact/value distinction very clear and must have a precise understanding of how the two interact

61

3. critical epistemology must include a theory of how symbols are used to represent reality, how this changes, and how power is implicated in symbolic representation and changes in symbolic representation (p. 9; cited in Noblit, 2005, p. 77)

With regards to this research, it attempts to critique the belief that educational policymaking in Ethiopia is solely in the hands of local officials working in the Ethiopian Ministry of Education who have the ability to speak for all Ethiopians. This research, indeed, questions the validity of that belief. The epistemology of critical perspectivism holds that knowledge is constructed by those who hold power (Paul, 2005, p. 47). As the researcher, this leads me to examine which individuals and or groups are in control of knowledge creation, thereby affecting educational policymaking? The stakeholders involved in the education sector in Ethiopia do not have a homogenous social and historical practice, and to assume so negates the reality that the practices, beliefs and experiences of some are privileged over the practices of others. Therefore, a critical perspective is ideal as it allows me as the researcher to consider issues of power while also insisting that as a researcher I am reflexive and aware of my own position within the research.

Selection of Qualitative Research Methodology

This research is a qualitative case study. Qualitative methodology investigates the why and how of decision making and is useful in understanding how and why certain outcomes are achieved, not just what was achieved. An

instrumental case study is the best method to inquire into an issue as the results can be applied beyond the study itself (Sarantakos, 2005, p. 211). Furthermore, an instrumental case study allows for an in-depth study of the case and facilitates greater understanding of a larger topic, providing insight into an issue (Stake, 2005, p. 445). The strength of case study research is in "its ability to examine, in-depth, a 'case' within its 'real-life' context" (Yin, 2005, p. 380).

In conducting research on the role of INGOs in educational policymaking, I utilized the experiences of Ethiopia as the case study. When considering the history of sub-Saharan Africa, Ethiopia is the lone nation to have not undergone long-term colonization by a European power (though it is important to note that the Italian occupation of Ethiopia from 1935-1941 did bring about some longstanding changes to Ethiopian society). However, due to the limited period in which Ethiopia was occupied, the entrenchment of Western-Eurocentric beliefs which may be prevalent within Ethiopian society today cannot be solely the result of historical colonization by Europe, but if present actually the result of a more contemporary process. This allowed me to examine the role of INGOs in the policymaking process as distinct and independent of historical colonialism and, therefore, could allow for the findings of this research to be contextualized to other sub-Saharan African nations.

Qualitative methodology, in particular, case study research calls for an interpretivist epistemology (Sarantakos, 2005, p. 37; Gall, Borg & Gall, 1996, p. 544). According to Crotty (1998), interpretivism attempts to uncover "culturally

63

derived and historically situated interpretations of the social life world" (p. 67) which examines the way in which people make sense of and assign meanings to their world (Sarantakos, 2005, p. 40). Interpretivism requires the researcher to openly disclose his/her own self-interests as the researcher's understanding of others begins with his/her own experiences (Paul, 2005, 124). Furthermore, interpretivism requires the researcher to ensure that the limitations and tensions which arise from the research are identified and disclosed. My analysis of the data collected resulted in an examination of the various beliefs, experiences, and tensions held by the participants. In attempting to understand the constructed realities of the participants as well as their relationships with and understanding of power dynamics, interpretivism – through the analytical lens of critical discourse analysis – was utilized in this research.

Critical discourse analysis

The research perspective which I have chosen to use to guide my research is critical discourse analysis (CDA). I will utilize CDA in order to observe power relations in educational policymaking. According to Foucault (1975/2006):

> We must cease once and for all to describe the effects of power in negative terms: it 'excludes', it 'represses', it 'censors', it 'abstracts', it 'masks', it 'conceals'. In fact, power produces; it produces reality, it produces domains of objects and rituals of truth. The individual and the knowledge that may be gained of him belong to this production. (p. 136)

Foucault's understanding of power allows researchers questioning the

64

construction of education policy to examine the role of the powerful in producing knowledge and reality. Foucault believed that power resides "in the community of experts that sets up the rules for telling the truth" (Peet & Hartwick, 2009, p. 206). With regards to educational policymaking, this begets the question of who constitutes the community of experts: locals working in the Ministry of Education, non-governmental organization staff working at the Ministry of Education, locals working at the grassroots levels or management from international non-governmental organizations. Additionally, this research will consider the question of whose knowledge is being privileged with regards to educational policy. Extending CDA to the analysis of policy is imperative in understanding "how political power constructs and is constructed by larger social practices" due to the effects on social structures, relations, and agendas (Woodside-Jiron, 2004, p. 202). CDA has the ability to not only bring to light those who are marginalized in the policy-making process but to also push for the emancipation of these groups from the margins of society.

Critical discourse analysis (CDA) allows researchers to gain an understanding of the: relationship between power and knowledge, relationship between language and discourse in the constructing and representing the social world, while allowing researchers to "describe, interpret, and explain such relationships" (Rogers, 2004, p. 1). Van Dijk (2001) maintains that CDA "studies the way in which ideology, identity and inequality are (re)-enacted through texts produced in social and political contexts" (cited in Hart, 2010, p. 13). Wodak

65

(2009) contends that through revealing the structures of power and unmasking ideologies, the aim of CDA is the emancipation of human beings from all forms of domination. Jager and Maier (2009) outline the questions around which Foucauldian critical discourse analysis would centre:

1. What is valid knowledge at a certain place and a certain time

2. How does this knowledge arise and how is it passed on

3. What function does it have for constituting subjects?

4. What consequences does it have for the overall shaping and development of society? (p. 34)

Participant group selection and profile

Understanding the role of INGOs in educational policymaking in the Ethiopian context required that participants in the study be actively involved in the policymaking process and engaged with INGOs through direct employment or through government programs. My own experiences working with an INGO in Ethiopia and with government educational institutions from September 2007 until June 2009 meant that I had developed numerous contacts employed with INGOs and at various levels of government, many of whom were engaged in the policymaking process. As a result of my employment in Ethiopia and upon completion of my employment contract in Ethiopia, I decided to return to university to study many of the issues which had pervaded my work and time in Ethiopia – one of which constituted developing a greater understanding of the role being played by INGOs in educational policymaking. This research topic was a

66

result of many of my own discomforts with the work I had been engaged in and which I hoped to gain a better understanding of. The professional relationships which I had cultivated while working in Ethiopia allowed me access to participants working at various levels of government and INGOs.

The criteria used for choosing participants was:

- They were working in the education either with either an international NGO or the Ministry of Education

- Their duties to some extent involved engagement in the policymaking process

- They were either local Ethiopians or "foreign experts"

- They are able and willing to participate in the study.

- An equal representation from participants working at the Ministry of Education and at international NGOs

- Representation from both male and female participants

- They are able and free to discuss and articulate their ideas and thoughts about their experiences, and beliefs.

After receiving ethical approval for my research from the University of Alberta, I began to process of recruiting research participants. Utilizing targeted interviewing in which I approached those I knew to be knowledgeable in this research area, I selected participants for the study in two stages. Two of the six participants were recruited over email prior to my travelling to Ethiopia. These two participants included an Ethiopian whom I had been in professional contact

with while working in Ethiopia through his employment with various INGOs and a foreign expert affiliated with an international INGO but working at the Ministry of Education. I contacted my Ethiopian colleague through email, sending first a letter of initial contact and then once he indicated interest a formal information letter. I had made contact with the foreign expert through an expatriate acquaintance I had met on a previous trip to Ethiopia. After emailing this acquaintance about the research, he suggested the second participant as a possibility and was able to discuss the research briefly with the participant and pass along my contact information should she be interested in being a participant. The intermediary used signed a confidentiality agreement, agreeing to keep in confidence the participants' participation in the research.

Four remaining participants were recruited through a combination of in-person, email and telephone requests. Of these four participants, two were recruited through the use of an intermediary – a former Ethiopian colleague employed at the Ministry of Education, who was made aware of the particulars of the research project and after signing a confidentiality agreement, put me in contact with two Ethiopians employed at the Ministry of Education and working primarily with INGOs and development organizations. I contacted both individuals over telephone and spoke to them about the research individually. The two remaining participants were Ethiopians employed by an INGO. After making contact with the office manager of the INGO and informing him of the study, he allowed me to make contact with two Ethiopians employed by the INGO through

email – one of whom was the education program manager whom I had met previously while working in Ethiopia and the second, the Director of the INGO. All six individuals consented to participating in the research. For the three individuals (local and foreign) employed by the INGO, contact regarding a time and place for the interview was made through email. For the remaining three individuals, arrangements were made over telephone.

Research Strategy

Data collection method

Individual semi-structured interviews were chosen as the main data collection strategy. According to Gall, Borg, and Gall (1996), semi structured interviews provide greater depth of answers from respondents than can be obtained from a structured interview. Furthermore, as I was interviewing participants in English, many of whom speak English as a foreign language, it was at times necessary for me to reformulate questions and to use different probes and prompts. There were also occasions when participant responses required me to ask an additional question to clarify my original question. Semi-structured interviews are extremely flexible and allow the researcher to engage in an open, stimulating discussion with the participant while allowing participants to express their personal views with no external limitation being placed on responses (Sarantakos, 2005, p. 270). Most importantly in terms of this research, the data collection method chosen allowed me as the researcher to engage in reflexive practice throughout the research process. Therefore, semi-structured interviews

69

were the best option for my research.

As I had chosen to conduct semi-structured interviews, I decided with the approval of my supervisor to create three prompter questions for the interviews. As a result of the answers given to these questions, I was able to formulate new questions expressly created for each participant based on the objectives of the study as well as their own experiences. In order to ensure the appropriateness of the prompter questions, I piloted the questions with two individuals familiar with knowledge surrounding Ethiopian education. These practice interviews – though simulated – provided me with the opportunity to reword questions as to ensure that they were not ambiguous while also allowing me to feel greater comfort as an interviewer.

Interview process

All of the interviews took place in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, at the participants' respective places of employment. At the beginning of each interview, I spoke briefly about myself, explaining my history with Ethiopia to the four participants I had not met previously as well as introducing my research. I then gave them a hard copy of the information sheet and went over it and the ethical considerations of the research, including their rights as participants of the research. I asked permission to use a digital recorder and asked the participants to sign consent forms prior to beginning the interview. Of the six participants, one participant requested that I not use the digital recorder; for that interview I took hand written notes. The remaining five participants all agreed to the use of the

recorder. The two Ethiopians employed at the Ministry of Education had spoken and were aware that I was interviewing both; they requested that their interview be held together. While this had not been my intention, I accepted their decision as they stated that this would be their preference.

The duration of the interviews was from forty to ninety minutes. I found that with the later interviews, my own confidence grew, and the interviews had a smoother flow. While the questions asked were much the same in all interviews (as much as possible with semi-structured interviews), in the later interviews I was better able to ask these questions as the conversation dictated as opposed to following a strict script. Furthermore, a few of the participants became very engaged with the questions and gave much more detailed answers which lengthened the time of the interviews. Each participant was interviewed once. At the end of every interview, I asked participants if there was anything else they would like to add to the discussion or if they had any questions for me. Once I thanked the participant for their time, I stopped the recorder. Before departing, I reminded the participants that I would be transcribing the interviews and emailing to them for member checks. I also informed participants that while I would be transcribing the interviews verbatim, the member checks were for them to ensure that I had not misconstrued the meaning of their words and to not be concerned with the grammar of the transcriptions as we do not speak in grammatically correct sentences. I felt that this was important as many of my participants spoke English as a second, third or fourth language. Upon returning to Canada, I

transcribed the interviews verbatim and emailed the transcriptions to the participants. I did not receive any emails or letters requesting changes to the transcripts.

Data Analysis

In the analysis of the data collected from the six interviews, I utilized iterative qualitative analysis; I began to examine the data as soon as I had collected it. Due to having to travel to Ethiopia to conduct the research, it became necessary to examine the data soon after conducting the interviews in the event that I required further clarification from participants prior to returning to Canada. In addition, iterative analysis is necessary in research which is reflexive. I began with a preliminary analysis of the data, highlighting themes, concepts and any personal insights which had arose during or after the interviews. This process was continued in subsequent interviews.

I began the process of transcribing the interviews while in Ethiopia. It was my initial hope to complete transcriptions prior to returning to Canada; however, a case of food poisoning in my final days prevented me from achieving this goal. Upon returning to Canada, I transcribed each interview verbatim and emailed them to the participants for member checks. Participants were asked to email me back within two weeks with requested changes to the interview transcripts. After the two week period had passed, I began a more in-depth analysis of the data. In my analysis, I utilized critical discourse theory. Texts were read and re-read numerous times in order to find recurrent patterns and themes. I first identified

72

three main themes in the data; subsequent readings led to the identification of a number of sub-themes. In collating the thematic documents, I copied and pasted directly from the transcripts. While the compilations did not include any participant names, I was aware of who had spoken the words in each section. I then began the process of analysing the documents.

Credibility

In order to ensure the credibility of the research findings, I utilized member checks and peer debriefing. According to Guba and Lincoln (1999), peer debriefing allows the researcher to "check growing insights", discuss the "evolving design" of the research as well as personal feelings and anxieties regarding the research (p. 147). Member checks allowed participants to scrutinize the transcripts from interviews and request changes to any of the information present, thereby giving the study a second measure of credibility (Guba & Lincoln, 1999, p. 147). While working through the data finding and analysis of the texts, I had numerous conversations with peers regarding my perceptions of the data and emergent observations. These conversations allowed me to test my hypotheses and ask questions, thus ensuring that my insights were valid and based on the data. The peer debriefings ensured that some findings were deemed unworthy whereas others were deemed valid. Through this process, I was able to grow as a reflexive researcher. Peer debriefings and member checks offer this research a measure of credibility.

Dependability and confirmability

The use of qualitative methodology inevitably brings to question the dependability and confirmability of the research findings. As the researcher, I aimed to ensure the dependability and confirmability of the research findings by situating myself openly in the research, stating my own biases and prejudices throughout the research process and engaging in reflexive practice throughout the research process. I constantly examined and re-examined the data in order to ensure that the hypotheses made were a result of the data while acknowledging that in qualitative methodology, neutrality is not a realistic goal as my own beliefs and experiences do impact my understandings.

Ethical Consideration

This research was approved by the University of Alberta's regulations for research ethics involving human subjects. The following was undertaken to address any ethical concerns:

- Participants were advised about the details of the study as well as what I as a researcher required from them prior to conducting the interviews. All participants were informed that a digital recorder would be used if agreed to by them. Prior to beginning the interviews, all participants were required to sign a letter of consent

- Participants were advised that they had a right to not participate in this research and to opt out without penalty and to have any collected data withdrawn from the data base and not included in the study should they wish. Participants were informed that they may contact myself or

my research supervisor via email, telephone, or in writing if they wished to opt out of the research. Contact information was listed at the end of the information letter.

- Participants could opt out of the research up until two weeks after member checks had been sent to participants for feedback.

- Participants were advised of their right to privacy, anonymity and confidentiality. The participants involved in this study are known to me and to the three intermediaries who helped me find participants. All intermediaries signed confidentiality agreements.

- I informed participants that to safeguard the security of data, data will be kept in a secure place for a minimum of 5 years following completion of the research project and at that time would be appropriately destroyed in a way that ensures privacy and confidentiality. All data is being kept on a password enabled laptop, to be destroyed after five years.

Summary

The primary aim of this study is to critically examine the role of INGOs in the educational policymaking process in Ethiopia. In order to achieve these aims, I utilized critical perspectivism and interpretivism in order to better understand how culture, history and life experiences influence the attitudes, beliefs and decision-making abilities of those involved in the policymaking process. Employing a critical discourse analysis lens allowed me to examine power

relations and the privileging of knowledge with regards to educational policymaking in Ethiopia.

CHAPTER 5

FINDINGS

Introduction

The six research participants provided a rich source of data for this study. Through the utilization of a postcolonial theoretical framework, three main themes emerged from the data collected: the proposed role of INGOs in educational policymaking, the suitability of INGOs to engage in policy discussion, and supporting inclusive educational development in Ethiopia. Within these themes, emerged numerous sub-themes which expounded upon the issues arising when INGOs engage in educational policymaking as well as examining the appropriateness of INGOs engaging in policymaking decisions. Participants offered unique understandings of the role of INGOs in education while also illustrating common support for the modernization of Ethiopian education. Reflected within these interviews was the participants' understanding of Africa's need for development, African and Euro-American knowledge systems, the role of community in decision-making, the issue of a North-South partnership and an understanding of the effects of colonization. These themes were instrumental in developing an understanding of how NGOs engage in educational policymaking in Ethiopia.

Proposed Role of INGOs in Educational Policymaking

Ensuring quality improvement

Among those interviewed, Ministry of Education (MoE) officials, foreign

"experts" and Ethiopian INGO employees, there was a clear belief that that education in Ethiopia was not of a sufficient quality. Those interviewed were very clear that quality improvement could only occur by building up the capacity of local Ethiopians. Building up capacity requires INGOs to move beyond their traditional role of service delivery. As one participant stated:

> *Recently most [I]NGOs are beyond service provision trying to change their approach towards capacity building. Some combining the service delivery with capacity building, some focusing exclusively with capacity building.*

Furthermore, quality improvement is seen as not being inherent in Ethiopian programs and policies. According to one participant, the programs and policies which do attempt to ensure quality right from the start are those which have been implemented by INGOs and have had extensive input by INGOs in their creation and implementation. The participant stated that:

> *That sort of thing [quality control] does not happen here. With the HDP[higher diploma program] it does but that was introduced when the program was introduced. And the program was introduced 7 years ago.*

Another participant spoke of how the government has done a lot to *"improve quality of education in Ethiopia"*. The Ethiopian government considers quality improvement to be an integral aspect of their ESDP. This allows many INGOs to design programs which are *"in line with the government's priorities and ... to work with the MoE ... designing policies"*. For many INGOs this involvement

means ensuring quality through supporting *"the Ministry to develop the policies and also guidelines and ... provide support for the implementers – the regional education bureaus, colleges, universities, district education offices ... to translate the policies to action and into practice".*

INGO staff are highly regarded due to their foreign experience. For one participant, the importance of INGOs lay in their ability to recruit foreign experts who could work at all levels of government.

This would allow communication from the federal to the regional and then ... to the colleges particularly because ... it's the REBs [Regional Education Bureaus] that are really responsible for them and ... hopefully it will improve the quality. Because that's what the approach is really now. It's quality improvement.

The process of policy development through the sharing of skills between foreigners and locals

A central theme which came across from participants has been the idea that INGOs facilitate the two-way sharing of skills between foreign "experts" and locals which will eventually lead to societal and political changes in Ethiopia. A participant working in the MoE extrapolated on the policy creation process.

They went through it every word. It was two solid days and we broke it down into sections and they were doing it pages at a time. Here in Ethiopia,... you do it there and then and they read it through and they make their comments. And then we had group discussions and ... got

79

feedback. And all that feedback actually influenced the document. I mean, there was debate with us and them and you know. For us it was brilliant because they were actually so involved in that and not just doing it as a matter of well I've got to be here and do this. They were really wanting this document to work. They like it. But you know some of it they didn't feel was appropriate so we've amended it in those ways. And it was people from across the sector.

The above quotation reiterates the notion of "us" (the INGO workers) and "them" (locals). The process in the above description (the sharing of skills) appears to be one sided for the most part. Furthermore, participants described in great detail the process by which policies were created. From one participant's description, it appears that the initial document is created prior to meeting with locals who then receive an opportunity to provide feedback on the documents.

As one participant identifies below, there appears to be a misunderstanding of how policy development should occur and who should be involved and to what extent that involvement should be. Whose skills are being utilized?

But it just shows the process. It's long. But for it to actually work, you have to have this process, you have to involve our Ethiopian colleagues. Because we are not in the business of coming in here and saying we're going to tell you what to do. We know better because we don't you know. We can only share what we do know and put it into the context here if

possible, if it's appropriate you know.

Another participant described a slightly different process for policy development, one in which INGOs are very involved in the process. According to this participant:

> *There are two major sessions that bring all the stakeholders together. One is the joint review mission (JRM)... The development partners including the [I]NGOs and government will come together and will randomly select regions and they will see the performance and they will report back. And this report will be consolidated and there is an annual review meeting which involves the government partners, the development partners ... All these actors will come together, and they will evaluate the performance of the strategy or the plan. Based on that if there is a need to revise, even the policy direction, they have their say and they contribute in that regard.*

Emerging from the interviews was the belief that the sharing of skills between local and foreign experts was integral to the policymaking process. One participant commented that the role of INGOs and their foreign expert workers is the sharing of skills in order to create sustainability so that over time *"their jobs to be taken over by their Ethiopians counterparts"*. The participant reiterated that INGOs are not in the business of taking *"jobs from Ethiopians but ... there are some areas which couldn't be done [and] jobs which couldn't be done by Ethiopians"* and in those circumstances INGOs support those areas and those jobs. Regarding policy development, the participant commented:

81

We do support them because our contribution is more on human capacity
building and we need to start it from somewhere ... If we need to start
implementing development policies we need to develop good policy first of
all. And for that if the Ethiopians can do then well and good but if there's
a gap we're happy to support it.... We do not impose on the MoE or any
other partner.

A local participant reiterated the need for INGOs, government and communities to work together to ensure sustainability, arguing that when communities are not involved in the process, the likelihood that policies and projects will continue once the INGO is no longer involved is quite small.

Meeting the needs of society

The belief that Ethiopian society was in need of change and people need to be allowed to make their own decisions was prevalent as well. A participant was very clear that this was not just a political need but a requirement for every household. The participant discussed her previous work in India, comparing that situation to what was currently occurring in Ethiopia:

I was working in India before and there are some similarities to you know
that there. I was working in the North of India and people there did not
take responsibility and didn't even in the particular area where we were
didn't even choose their children names when their children were born.
Someone else did that. ... Well if you say what do you think? How would
you like this to be? Well why are you asking? We don't know. I mean

82

we've never been asked to think type approach. I think it's an element of

that. But I think it's .. I won't say it's wrong. It's different. But if I can

have an ideal world, then it would be the people are totally involved in

decision-making.

Teachers are the single largest group of government employees in most nations and Ethiopia is no exception. The Ethiopian Teachers' Association is the only legitimate teachers' association in Ethiopia. As one participant stated, as the representative of Ethiopian teachers, the ETA must learn how to best represent its members. This was achieved when an INGO sponsored the trip of the chairperson of the ETA to Ireland to meet with Educational International and learn about teacher unions in Ireland. The expectation was that the chairperson would be able to bring back those learnings to Ethiopia to implement. The role of taking experiences from outside Ethiopia and implementing inside Ethiopia and to benefit Ethiopian society came up repeatedly. One participant explained that this phenomenon is due to the fact that "*the way people learn is much the same. The curriculum is developed by Ethiopians and [foreign experts] also contribute to curriculum development. Therefore, the curriculum is contextualized to the country.*"

In the past 15 years the number of universities and schools has grown dramatically in Ethiopia. The Ethiopian government is determined to achieve 100% universal primary education by 2015 as well as to increase the number of students completing post-secondary education. One participant felt that the

83

"emphasis is on coverage at the cost of other issues such as quality" while a second participant was more open to the government's actions:

> *I'm impressed with what the government is doing here in Ethiopia. The opening of new colleges and new universities, it's ambitious and I think the infrastructure is not there yet in many of them but what I do like is that you're not going to have a lost generation or a lost couple of generations.... They've gone for the quantity to open the new universities, open the new colleges and so on and I think ESDP IV [Education Sector Development Program IV] is now trying to address quality. Now some people might say that should have come you know first. You keep small and have got quality but I think with the numbers that we're talking about and the population, the size of the population you could have ended up with two or three generations not having the chance to access higher education and that would be really sad. But it's a huge challenge.*

Influencing policy through advocacy

There is much debate as to what extent INGOs are in fact involved in influencing policy. One participant argued that many INGOs are engaged in advocacy for specific policies and programs which government has not traditionally been a part of providing and that within Ethiopia this is the main way in which INGOs can influence policy.

> *In Ethiopia, it is very hard to say [I]NGOs are directly influencing policy because we have a very active government developing the rationale of*

84

development plans and sector development plans. The minister of education is very active in developing and reviewing subsequent ESDPs 1 2, 3, and they have just developed ESDP IV. The government has been very pro-active in coordinating national development, in putting strategies and planning developments in the sector. The role of [I]NGOs has been substantial in that in the consultation process I'm sure. And the work they are doing in one way or another is also fitting into what the government is compiling into a sector development plan. I know some [I]NGOs have been active in for example adult literacy in where the government has not been doing very much in the past, past years. And from the current ESDP and [I]NGOs like local NGOs were very active in advocating for adult literacy and informal education and I am very happy to see that as a critical component of ESDP IV. So that way [I]NGOs are influencing [policy]. I don't want to say they are the only factors anyway but their contribution is paramount in getting the government to think about it and getting the ministry to think about specific issues.

A second participant provided greater details of the extensive role being played by INGOs in influencing policy.

For example, in the case of pastoral education, there is an [I]NGO involved in establishing alternative basic education centres – mobile schools and other innovative approaches and in the case of girls' education, in creating child friendly schools such as separate latrines for

boys and girls. The government does not have much interest in the area of pre-school because of the priority being shifted to basic education. But even in this area, [I]NGOs are supporting the government in policy and strategy formulation and other activities. Another international NGO is working here ... in the area of adult education. They help us in formulating adult education strategy and other guidelines; most of what has been produced by them even before the government has done much in the area. They try to integrate skill with literacy by establishing community skill training centres, by incorporating adult education into the higher education curriculums, and by supporting other local NGOs so that best practices and innovative approaches could be multiplied and duplicated by the government and the government could implement that into a large scale program.

Also emerging was the view that INGOs involvement in helping develop policy was instrumental to ensuring that INGOs will then support the implementation of policies. Without INGO support, many policies may not be successful due to lack of funding and or lack of expertise in implementing such policies. According to one participant:

[I]NGOs are involved in this. [They] bring new ideas and announce what the government is doing. So the[ir] involvement is very much [a part of] the ESDP. Currently, with the ESDP – the fourth which we are going to implement – when we are creating this sector development program [as

86

compared to the] the previous one these stakeholders [INGOs] are very much involved. The government is not the only [stakeholder involved with creating] this sector development program. When we start implementing this development program it is good that the stakeholder has been involved in the initial point. When we come to the implementation there aren't problems because all [stakeholders have] accepted.

The role of INGOs in influencing policy goes beyond the creation of specific policies. As one participant discussed, INGOs can influence policy through their relationships with local groups which are actively involved in the policy process such as the Ethiopian Teachers' Association.

Last year, a new NGO legislation was developed in Ethiopia, and it restricts those organizations which work in social development from engaging in advocacy. We believe we can bring change through advocacy. We advocate for the disadvantaged. Especially for the education sector, the advocacy focuses on valuing teachers. We do conduct research based advocacy to look at issues which affect the morale and motivation of teachers because their motivation, their morale has a high [on] improving quality and access to education in this country. So we do that advocacy but there is another organization which can collaborate with VSO to take this advocacy initiative forward— that's the Ethiopian Teachers' Association. We do work with them; we build their capacity if for example they may lack skills in a certain area.... We try to

87

build the capacity of other organizations which work in education.

There are many who still question the role that INGOs should play in influencing policy. Should INGOs be active members at the policymaking table or should their role be more indirect? One participant stated:

I wouldn't say [I]NGOs should take a leading role in policymaking but they should help inform policymaking at the national or regional level, informing the government as it [government] does the planning.

Suitability of INGOs Engaging in Policy Discussion

Role of foreign experts in educational decision-making

INGOs working in Ethiopia are made up of two types of employees: local educated Ethiopians and foreign "experts" from "developed" nations or successful "developing" nations whose development path Ethiopia should follow such as Uganda, India, Kenya and the Philippines. When speaking to one participant as to the rationale for foreign experts playing a role in the Ethiopian education system, the participant responded:

They already come from a culture, or ... education systems that are better, or that are [the] best, so they have a lot to share in terms of skills within education – in terms of teaching strategies, methodologies, creative ways of building teaching, developing, teaching supplies, teaching and learning aids. That's obviously a plus. In addition, they come from a different culture with a different perspective, different ways of thinking, different ways of working. I think beyond [that]..., they have a lot to share in terms

88

of ways of working, how to organize their time, time management, and other organizational skills are valuable for their counterparts and the team they are working with.

A second participant spoke from intimate knowledge of some of the work being done by foreign "experts" who are:

responsible for monitoring and evaluating the HDP which is a program ... for teacher educators. Which then means that [they] are looking at strategy and policy for the HDP and for teacher education. ... That includes running workshops, and writing reports and doing research.

The various roles of foreign experts in the policymaking process also arose. A participant described in great detail the role played by foreign "experts" in the policymaking process.

We've put together a new moderation plan for the colleges and universities because the old one has not been working very well so we're waiting for that to be approved by the state minister and then we will ... discuss that at the workshop but also what's happened this last year or in some cases what has not happened. So it's again a chance for people to communicate to share their issues and challenges. It's also for orientating new[comers]... and so that will be the first time that they've come together since arriving in Ethiopia.... We're also going to look at active learning methods at this workshop because the program has been running for seven years and we have anecdotal evidence, no real impact study has been

done. We are about to start on one. But people say that you know everyone

does the HDP, they love what they do on it and then afterwards they don't

put it into practice. So we're going to rather than see it as a problem

we're going to try to address it as okay seven years on, with the

experience we got here what can we actually do positively about it, and

take some of the issues that have been raised and let people work on those

and see if we can come up with a plan for encouraging implementation....

We've been working on a framework for introducing continuing

professional development into higher education and that is now with both

the state minister of general education and state minister of higher

education. It's been validated by the universities and colleges who came

to a validation workshop. The validation workshop – that was really good.

That was very intensive. They took it apart. ... Because I mean anything

needs to be for Ethiopia and not for us. We're not doing it for any reasons

for ourselves. You know we came here to share our skills.

It is evident that foreign "experts" such as exemplified by the participant

emphasise that their desire to work in Ethiopia is not about themselves but

because they came to share their skills with Ethiopians. One participant discussed

the role of their INGO in creating the new ESDP IV.

We were invited [to participate] in one of the workshops. ... We have

contributed to it -- ... the cross cutting themes: Gender, HIV/AIDS, and

leadership and management have come up as cross cutting issues in the

ESDP IV document.... We have done lots of work in gender and HIV/AIDS

mainstreaming so my colleague has contributed ideas as to how effectively

these ideas can be mainstreamed across the education system in Ethiopia.

One participant discussed how INGOs and foreign experts can generally support
education in Ethiopia through building local capacity.

I think capacity building is one area of involvement and off course if there

is a need, if the government needs support in the area of policy

development ... that's a very good area I think to be involved.... We need

to know how the government, how the people we are accountable to, how

the poor need us to support them. And according to that we can

implement our developmental programs. ... [We also work on] local level

policies; for example we work with universities, we work with colleges and

develop policies on specific issues. And these policies have been shared

with other people, with other stakeholders, and there are occasions where

these other stakeholders have recognized the benefits of this policy and

modified it accordingly and somehow adapted to their context as well....

These kinds of approaches are recognized by the MoE or other

stakeholders; they have contributed to policy development as well.

Many INGOs operate through volunteers from outside. One participant discussed
the role of international foreign experts who worked as volunteers supporting
Ethiopian education.

Papers and reports produced by volunteers also play a role in influencing

policy. Volunteers are a support system for policy development. The
outcome of next week's HDP workshop [at the MoE] will feed into
planning the national HDP policy, for example.

Top down approach to development and participatory decision-making

INGOs have become a dominant force in development due to the
perception that their policies and practices reflect the will of "local peoples" and
that INGOs employ participatory decision-making strategies which involves all
peoples in determining policies and practices. This perception was clearly evident
when speaking to participants as to the reasons that INGOs have a right to play
such a large role in creating the development agenda. As one participant
explained:

> *I think INGOs have ... best practice from the field, whatever the scale of*
> *their program is. Every INGO will have their own catchment area, their*
> *own specific program area, their own target, their own stories to tell. So I*
> *think there is enough justification for INGOs to be able to make a case or*
> *share their best practices with other INGOs not just for the sake of*
> *policymaking but for scale of purpose as well. So since they are involved*
> *at the grassroot level, ... not just in Addis Ababa talking to the Ministry,*
> *talking to the planning people; they are down in the regions, they are*
> *down in the specific implementing agencies in the education system. They*
> *work with colleges, they work with universities, others work directly with*
> *schools. Some work with communities. So that experience should put*

INGOs in the best position to come and tell the government this is what we

have found working and this is why things are not working. So that puts

them in a good position to inform policymaking.

There is a very clear understanding from many of the participants that participatory decision-making involves working not just with the MoE but also with practitioners working at colleges, universities, woreda offices, zonal education bureaus and regional education bureaus – organizations which are already part of the government hierarchy. One participant discussed the role of INGOs in supporting grassroots organizations as supporting *"the capacity, especially the financial capacity of the grassroots organizations like for example colleges, district education offices – these are the organizations, these are our strategic partners"*. This somewhat top down approach to development is echoed by another participant.

As far as education is concerned, [we] want to improve the quality of

education in schools but starting from you know top down really. No one's

in schools anymore as you know. They tend to be in the REBs and ZEBs

or based in colleges of teacher education so we've people working on

Continuous Professional Development in clusters of school like in

Nekempte, Mekelle and Assella.

Can INGOs work effectively within a model that advocates a top-down approach to development? One participant questioned not whether INGOs should be involved in top down development but whether the Ethiopian people were

ready for anything else.

>*For most of my life I've been working with people trying to make them*
>*have a role in making decisions about their own situation whether it's*
>*education or in community work and so on. I think there's a need for both.*
>*I don't think people are ready necessarily to do everything at the bottom*
>*up level. Because I don't think people are used to make decisions and*
>*taking responsibility for their actions. And I think that's a concept that*
>*comes with time.... I think there's a need for encouraging participation*
>*and people having a voice. I think people should be able to make a choice*
>*and have informed choice you know but people should be able to make a*
>*choice by themselves.... People are assigned for instance to work in the*
>*colleges and universities. Students are assigned to where they're going to*
>*do their courses. So that element I find a challenge. You know in my*
>*thinking when I'm thinking about you know how to take things forward*
>*and you don't want that to become a barrier and sometimes you think it*
>*well actually it maybe more useful to use the top direction because that's*
>*where people are working on. They're working on that starting point.*

Need to involve community in decision-making process

There is a clear discrepancy among participants as to what constitutes participatory decision-making and grassroots. Some participants also eloquently spoke of the need to involve community members in a decision-making process as the communities were to be the beneficiaries of these policies and programs.

94

[During] the transition time [between the previous Derg government and the current government], all the schools were looted by the community because the community was not involved in participating. But now-a-days when you start, you must involve the government and the community.... So in that time even if the government is not functioning, [the community] believes that they are the one that can protect [education].

One participant detailed the challenge in ensuring INGOs are supporting communities and local people as they pledged to while accepting that they cannot bypass government at local or federal level.

When the agreement is going to be produced between these [I]NGOs or development partners and the government bodies it could be a federal level agreement, or it could be a regional level. ... One of the challenges regarding this is sometimes bilateral partners sign an agreement with the federal government. They go directly to the woredas and grassroot level; they want to start there. On one hand, they don't consult the regions in woreda selection; even sometimes they hire other local NGOs instead of bringing the government to take that ownership at woreda [level] and they start when they go in the process there becomes a conflict there. They come back to [the government to request the government to] write a support letter to such region so that they can support [the INGO]. Regions have their own mandate because Ethiopia is following a decentralized government; they have certain mandates that belong to them so they do

95

not accept every letter which is coming from the federal government. On the other hand, since they were not involved initially there, the issue they raise is "We don't know about this project. What project are you talking about? Did you communicate with us about that project that you have agreed?" because you see the agreement is signed at federal level. So what we are saying is whether they are [I]NGOs or not, they are here to support the country, to support that community but they have to work with the institutions there. Otherwise if the institutions are not in place there, nobody's going to be accountable for the conflict or challenge to be created there. And at the end of the day it will be difficult because if you request a certain region to react in this regard, if they are not involved from the inception, they don't want to recognize that.

Participants described the problems associated with working within a system in which contradictions appeared at every level, arguing that part of the problem is that no one wants to take responsibility for instigating change.

Very often, particularly at the university, they say we're autonomous. We don't want the Ministry to be telling us what to do. And then the next minute they'll say well we want we want Ato Fuad or Dr. Caba to send a directive from the Ministry to tell us to do it and then we'll do it. So there's a contradiction there. And that's what you find in the workshops – this sort of contradiction in this sense that they want to make the decisions and do everything and you haven't done this and you haven't done that

96

then to the Ministry team. We've decided this but you've got to do it. So

again it's that mixed sort of approach and I think that's because of what

we've been talking about really that they're used to things coming from

the top and people telling them what to do. And again then you don't have

to take responsibility do you? The responsibility is at the Federal level and

you can't change that.

Supporting Inclusive Educational Development in Ethiopia

Are all partners equal?

The participants' interviews hinted at frustration over the relationship

between INGOs and the government within the Ethiopian education sector.

While INGOs may be seen as the voice of the grassroots by many, it is also

apparent that the Ethiopian government is at times resistant to involving INGOs in

initial decision-making with regards to policies and programs. As one participant

explained:

The initial ESDP is a priority to the government.... This document initially

produced by the government was late and a stakeholder was complaining

that "you are not involving us" but you know you cannot sit together and

do from the grassroot level when you produce a document because the

government has a direction of where the country has to go. So they

include government input first and then bring that to the stakeholder to

amend, to question it and to supplement what it is in the document.... The

stakeholders [want to be involved] when the government is producing the

97

first draft documents, but that cannot be possible because the government is the one that is owning that document because the government knows what direction the country has to go in.... So I think the previous ESDP was not like the ESDP IV that is involving the stakeholder. In here the stakeholder is very involved.

The level of engagement between the government and INGOs with regards to influencing policy appears to be growing as exemplified by the participant's above statements. There is, however, a clear attempt according to the participant to limit INGO involvement in the initial stages of policy creation.

As explained by one participant, INGOs and governments cannot play an equal role in creating policies and programs as governments are best able to make decisions about the needs of their country. However, the role being played by INGOs is increasing exponentially. As one participant stated:

There is an increase in the level of participation and there is an increase in the level of consultation. The initial one cannot be the same, similar to what level we are reaching now. But generally speaking now, at least by this stage the words or the sayings of the stakeholders is appreciated and it is incorporated. But as I told you in general, even now, even now for example, some [I]NGOs might not agree with certain strategies. That might be the case but the government being responsible to the citizens, it is up to the government mandate to decide on some measures or issues.

Part of the reason for the exponential rise in the role being played by INGOs as

expounded by one participant:

> *There has been significant progress [with Ethiopian education] over the past years. Coverage and access has improved. When I left Ethiopia 16 years ago, there were two universities. There are now over 20. The MoE has done a very good job with regards to access but has this come at the cost of quality is the question that must be asked. ... Needs in education are huge in Ethiopia. The level of capacity of many Ethiopians is not strong. In my opinion, to start with coverage is okay. The issue then is of quality as related to capacity. [We] should support the education system by building capacity at every level including policy to address as one [I]NGO a particular focus as within the education program and Education Program Area Plan which sets out our key areas and strategies. [Our] overall aim is to improve the quality of education.*

The participants in this study portray INGOs as either needing to repair an Ethiopian education system which the government does not have the capacity to do or as working as a partner with the government as the government sees fit. This dichotomy is present from participant responses and highlights the dynamic and often contradictory nature of the relationship between INGOs and the Ethiopian government.

The need to align priorities to influence policies

There appears to be agreement among government and INGOs that the government cannot achieve it aims for education without the support of INGOs.

However, a discrepancy arises when the aims of government differ from the aims of INGOs. The aim of government is to create self-sufficiency, to cease to be reliant on foreign aid over time. However, when the aims of government and INGOs diverge and without government support, sustainability is not realistic. According to one participant:

> *[INGOs] have to contribute to the national policy and poverty reduction strategy. They have to have some contributions to the national education system strategy policy. In that regard sometimes some of them might need to [work] by themselves with grassroot [groups] even. In some cases this could be good because they might ultimately identify the needy beneficiaries there. On the other hand, in order to create ownership, in order to have a sustainable development, the owner has to be communicated. Otherwise, they will work for a certain time – three years, four years – then when they depart the whole thing will stop there.... At the end of the day if the government of Ethiopia is being supported either by specific [I]NGOs or by the development partners, the long term effect is to own the program by itself and to replicate it. Otherwise we cannot entirely rely on donation in that regard. No country would. So in such cases, there could be differences for example in priority identification. A specific [I]NGO could come with its own specific priority and the government might say "No. For this specific area this is the most important priority." Sometimes there could be such [cases] but in most cases this could be*

100

resolved by discussion and negotiation.

It is imperative that INGOs align their priorities with government priorities as this will ensure that the government will *"be able to participate in the inception of that project [and] ... be able to own the program at the end of the day."*

However, as one participant illustrated through their answer, the law requires INGOs to act in one manner whereas the goals of the INGO are clearly not in line with the laws put in place by the government.

> *I do not see [our organization] as policy developers. I see [our] role as a supporter of the MoE in implementing policy. The MoE has their ESDP IV. There have been consultations between [us] and the MoE with regards to formulating ESDP IV. [Our] role is to support the MoE.... The Charities and Societies Proclamation has placed restrictions on what [NGOs] can do, such as advocacy work. So we have to be careful in terms of what we do. We need to work with diplomacy and tact. [We] can influence policy from within because we have volunteers placed at the MoE. These volunteers are expected to share successes, best practices, what works and what does not work on the ground. That is our approach to policy and it is working well.*

According to the participant, it is very clear that the INGO is cleverly subverting the law to suit their agenda.

There are numerous programs and policies which INGOs are contributing to. As detailed by one participant:

101

The HDP is one in which [we are] contributing well to the development of the national policy for the program. Volunteers working in at the MoE are playing a key role in its development.... In the continuous professional development (CPD) of teachers, volunteers are playing a significant role which is feeding into educational policy. Documents and reports by volunteers are all playing a role in influencing CPD policy revisions. In December 2009 and January 2010, volunteers organized various workshops. This is how [we] work from within the industry and implements change from within. [We] work from within the education sector in conjunction with the MoE as otherwise we will just be seen as an [I]NGO from outside which just makes a lot of noise. The MoE appreciates [our] role as it is research based, and therefore, we can have an impact and move policy forward.

Laws such as the Charities and Societies Proclamation which restricts INGO work in advocacy have not been happily accepted by INGOs. As can be seen from the interviews, many INGOs are finding alternate methods to bypass the Proclamation in order to continue to advocate for policies they feel are important. One result of the Societies and Charities Proclamation has been that INGOs have had to find more subversive manners in which to influence policy. This is made apparent by one participant's argument that the MoE must encourage cooperation and coordinate the activities of all stakeholders involved.

In the education sector in Ethiopia, it is worth looking at coordination.

102

There are many actors: donors, international NGOs, local NGOs, the MoE. However, lacking is coordination among all these actors. The MoE needs to bring together all these actors around one table to discuss important issues such as policy and programs which the Ministry feels needs support. The Ministry needs to organize a forum in which all these different actors can exchange information and share Ministry objectives. This is a huge gap. What happens is that a few stakeholders get together in a very fragmented way. All actors need to get together to learn from each other and share resources and to discover where each actor can best contribute. I have seen this in other countries where I have worked in which governments have facilitated such a forum. It could be that the Ministry does not have the resources, experience, capacity to do this. They may, therefore, need to go to [INGOs] and donors and ask for their support in facilitating such a forum. This relates to policy both directly and indirectly. In this way, the Ministry can put their policies and objectives on the table and stakeholders can discuss what is working and what is needed to meet the objectives of the Ministry.

Need for research

One commonality in the findings from participant employed with the government and INGOs was a belief in the need for greater research to be done in order to assess needs and better determine policies. As one participant explained using the example of alternative basic education (non-formal or non-school based

103

education):

> *Alternative basic education (ABE) is normally an alternative for the*
> *formal basic education program. The intention is to provide the four year*
> *first cycle primary within 3 years period, shortening the period and fixing*
> *the curriculum which is somewhat relevant to the pastoral community....*
> *In the first ESDP, ABE was not there.... The targets set were excellent for*
> *most of the regions. But most of the pastoralists, particularly the Afar and*
> *Somalie were lagging much behind. At the same time, [I]NGOs were*
> *practicing some innovative approaches bringing from the outside in these*
> *areas. So, they have shown through the research in consultation with the*
> *Ministry within each department ... "An Alternative Role to basic*
> *education"... is the study. It is based on this ABE project. [I]NGOs, you*
> *see by introducing such an innovative approach based on research, doing*
> *the research in a participatory way. Sometimes you see they might*
> *produce the research by themselves and they want to bring the findings the*
> *government may not want because you see they may not be reliable*
> *probably. So they did it together. In the ESDP 2, one of the major*
> *strategies put into place was ABE but this was an approach which was*
> *initially introduced by [I]NGOs which was being practiced in the*
> *grassroots levels to address the unreachable ones. This was this approach*
> *– an alternative approach for those marginalized and vulnerable peoples.*

Another participant explained that the only way to understand the effectiveness of

104

policies was through research.

> *When you try to implement a policy, first of all there has to be a time gap because here you establish a policy, you cannot know today whether it can be successful or not. You need time. And in between this time there is a need to continuously do research and bring those findings to update the policy.*

Partnerships between government and INGOs were an important theme in the study. One participant expounded that only by INGOs and government working together can development occur.

> *When these developmental partners and INGOs are working alone they cannot go very far unless they come to the government with the findings which they're getting from the grassroots and bring that to the table and discuss the research which they have made. The government is the one that signed a promise [for universal primary education] by 2015.... So the government sees that it is appropriate and we have introduced this to the ESDP. So in this ... the government is taking responsibility [and INGOs must work with the government].*

Government officers and INGO workers seem to agree that research is integral to understanding the needs of Ethiopia and to ensuring that policies in place are meeting those needs and having the desired outcomes. Furthermore, there appears to be agreement that research should be participatory and involve the grassroots. The questions that remain are who constitutes the grassroots and who ensures

105

quality control over research being conducted by non-government sources.

Summary

The data collected from this study illustrates the hybrid modes of viewing the development of the Ethiopian education system. What is surprising in the findings is the similarities found among those interviewed, all who are from different organizations and who have had a multitude of experiences. Postcolonial theory and my own experiences working with an INGO within the Ethiopian educational context – to some extent – have guided my analysis of these findings. Engaging with this data has meant challenging the current discourse on the need for development and a Euro-American knowledge system and a development paradigm designed by those outside the global South. In the following chapter, I will critically analyse the findings presented in this chapter.

CHAPTER 6

DISCUSSION

Introduction

In order to gain greater understanding of the role of INGOs in educational policymaking, participants working at various government institutions and international INGOs were interviewed. From these interviews emerged five main themes: 1) The construction of Africa as "what not to be": The need for development; 2) The valuation/devaluation of knowledge; 3) Individual versus collective consciousness: The role of community; 4) Is an equal partnership between North and South possible?; and 5) Consciousness of the dispossessed. The participants' understanding of the role of INGOs in the policymaking process is a result of their personal educational experiences, understanding of what constitutes knowledge, comprehension of the development paradigm, the role of community in deciding development priorities and the effects of colonialism on their psychological understanding of development. Utilizing a postcolonial theoretical lens, these perceptions are analyzed in order to determine the inherent tensions and struggles of INGO engagement in the policymaking process. The findings of this research surprisingly highlights a general uniformity of belief among government employees, foreign INGO experts and local Ethiopians employed by INGOs regarding the development paradigm while also underscoring that while tensions do exist between INGOs and government institutions, these tensions are for the most part in response to the management of

development projects and not to the influence of INGOs in the policymaking process.

The Construction of Africa as "What Not to Be": The Need for Development

The image of Ethiopia that exists today is one of a country in need of change, a country that has been characterized by what it should be and not celebrated for what it is. It is not a modernized nation similar to Canada, the United States or any Western European country. It is a nation in the global South in which over 80% of the population live on less than $2 a day; it is a nation in which only 18% of the population is urbanized. It is also interestingly enough, the only African nation to have never experienced long-term colonization by European powers. However, postcolonial theory still offers the most effective criticism of the role being played by INGOs in the Ethiopian system.

For many, the image of Ethiopia continues to be that which was shown on Northern television screens during the famines of the 1980s. The negative light with which Ethiopia is viewed is detrimental to the country (Ake, 1996b, p. 14). One participant saw the role of INGOs as being responsible for quality control as "*That sort of thing [quality control] does not happen here. With the HDP[higher diploma program] it does but that was introduced when the program was introduced. And the program was introduced 7 years ago".* And while it was not mentioned by this participant, a second participant confirmed that the program had been initiated by an INGO working in collaboration with the Ministry of Education (MoE) and foreign experts from the INGO have been involved in the

planning and implementation of the program for the past seven years. It becomes apparent from the above that Ethiopia is viewed as a country in need of foreign intervention.

Ake (1996b) argues that African leaders wrongly accepted the support of the international community, replacing "self-government" with the "ideology of development" which in reality was a "strategy of power which merely capitalized on the objective need for development" at the expense of the needs of Africans (p. 17). For one participant INGOs could be extremely helpful in development: "*I think capacity building is one area of involvement and off course if there is a need, if the government needs support in the area of policy development ... that's a very good area I think to be involved.* Are Africans and Ethiopians incapable of developing themselves? Must development always occur from the outside? For Ake (1996b), the problem lies with a development paradigm which refuses to take people as they are and instead insists defines them as deficient and in need of aid (p. 34).

For other participants, the role of INGOs is not limited to capacity building. "*[I]NGOs ... bring new ideas and announce what the government is doing. So the[ir] involvement is very much [a part of] the education sector development program (ESDP). Currently, with the ESDP – the fourth which we are going to implement – when we are creating this sector development program [as compared to the] the previous one these stakeholders [NGOs] are very much involved. The government is not the only [stakeholder involved with creating]*

this sector development program. When we start implementing this development program it is good that the stakeholder has been involved in the initial point. When we come to the implementation there aren't problems because all [stakeholders have] accepted. It appears that the Ethiopian government has been instrumental in allowing INGOs to play a role in setting policy. The question which must be answered is who is benefitting from this. According to Ake (1996b), allowing outside influence in national development decisions if often at the expense of the very people, development organizations are attempting to help.

The image of Africa as in need of aid from the North is usually held by those with extremely noble desires to change Africa for the better. As one participant observed:

> *But for it to actually work, you have to have this process, you have to involve our Ethiopian colleagues. Because we are not in the business of coming in here and saying we're going to tell you what to do. We know better because we don't you know. We can only share what we do know and put it into the context here if possible, if it's appropriate you know.*

However, there is little understanding that while involving Ethiopians in the decision-making process is important, in reality it is a superficial consideration as the decision that Ethiopia is in need of development, is in need of support from the North for that development is accepted without criticism.

This vision for development in Ethiopia is not only held by foreign experts working at INGOs. It was held by local Ethiopians working at INGOs and at

110

government institutions. As one participant explained: "*They already come from a culture, or ... education systems that are better, or that are [the] best, so they have a lot to share in terms of skills within education*". The belief in the need for development is held by members of the Ethiopian society. This offers the issue greater complexity as while one can argue that development plans are the making of foreign experts working in Ethiopia and, therefore, not relevant to Ethiopia, it becomes harder to argue against Ethiopians who are demanding development for Ethiopia, for they are a significant part of the population and also have the right to a voice. Furthermore, the majority of these Ethiopians are members of the educated elite, those who are in charge of making and influencing the decisions made regarding development in Ethiopia.

Those in power in Ethiopia – the educated Ethiopian elite and foreign experts – are all products of a colonial education system which valued the knowledges of the colonial education system over Indigenous knowledges. This colonial education system is viewed by many as the reason for the prosperity of many former colonizers. In reality, the prosperity of former colonizers is due to a myriad of reasons, including the wealth which was taken from the colonized. Ethiopian leaders and development organizations have all decided that education is the answer to development. Lip service is paid to the notion that the type of education should be decided through participatory means involving all Ethiopians. It is lip service because development organizations often involved local citizens in participatory decision-making in ways which allow the discussion of mainly

111

dominant views and which propel a dominant worldview.

The Valuation/Devaluation of Knowledge

According to the 2007 Ethiopian census, Ethiopia is a diverse nation of over eighty ethnic groups, all with various cultures and ways of living. At the centre of the vast number of groups lies the Federal Government of Ethiopia and the MoE which is ultimately responsible for determining the educational goals of the nation, in effect deciding what knowledge is valuable. While technically, the MoE has the sole responsibility for deciding the educational goals of the nation, in reality this decision is made by numerous stakeholders – a large number of which originate outside of Ethiopia.

For the majority of participants, there was no questioning as to whether the educational goals put forward for Ethiopians is in the best interests of the majority of the population. Ethiopia is a nation of 80 million people of which over eighty percent live in rural areas with limited access to running water and electricity, much less formal education. When non-governmental organizations which originate in the "North" are part of the decision-making process for educational policy, can educational policy truly meet the diverse needs of local peoples? The participants themselves offer conflicting viewpoints on this as can be seen from the following participant: "*They went through it every word.... You do it there and then and they read it through and they make their comments. And then we had group discussions. We broke them into groups and so on and then got feedback. And all that feedback actually influenced the document. I mean,*

112

there was debate with us and them and you know.... They were really wanting this document to work. They like it. But you know some of it they didn't feel was appropriate so we've amended it in those ways. And it was people from across the sector". Whose understanding of what constitutes knowledge is becoming policy? Had the policy been designed by Ethiopians first, would it resemble the document that was in actuality created?

Indigenous cultural values, for instance, tend to be regarded as outdated and due to be changed at any cost. The inevitable outcome has been disrespect and disregard for anything African, and the emergence of a "top-down" approach to development. The nature and quality of social interaction as well as human creativity and self-esteem tend to be ignored in this perspective (Achebe et al., 1990, p. 7). This was exemplified by one participant who discussed her previous work with an INGO in India. "*I was working in the North of India and people there did not take responsibility and didn't even in the particular area where we were didn't even choose their children names when their children were born. Someone else did that. ... Well if you say what do you think? How would you like this to be? Well why are you asking? We don't know. I mean we've never been asked to think type approach.... But if I can have an ideal world, then it would be the people are totally involved in decision-making.* This participant is working in nations with little understanding of the cultures and worldviews of the people she is there to "help". There appears no attempt to understand that those who live in different cultures do not have the same sense of family or community as those in

113

the North or that culture may be part of the reason as to why the decision-making process is different. Without an understanding of the culture in which one works, it is not possible for those involved in the policymaking process to ensure that the viewpoints of locals is fully represented, and the input of Ethiopians in the decision-making process can only be superficial. Furthermore, the presumption being made is that the ways of life of those of the North is superior to those in the South, a notion which ensures that local worldviews and knowledge will always be considered inferior.

As can be seen from the participant's comments above, it is people and culture which become problematic as opposed to the notion of development itself (Ake, 1996a, p. 15). This ideology is mirrored in the neo-liberal development ideology of the World Bank which is a major funder of Ethiopian education through World Bank support of IGOs, INGOs and World Bank programs operated in conjunction with the Ethiopian government. Development is seen as necessary and as only possible if Ethiopians are willing to re-evaluate their priorities and change their culture. However, no participant argued against an education system which values book learning over all other learning, which views alternative basic education as simply finding an alternate approach to ensuring that people gain the knowledge of the basic education curriculum. Only one type of knowledge is acknowledged – a knowledge system which is supported and has been exported by the North. It is imperative to note that all six participants of the study are themselves recipients and graduates of this exported Northern education system,

an education which has allowed them to be extremely successful within their chosen professions.

Many participants openly discussed that for development to work, INGOs must speak to "local peoples" first to understand their needs. However, when asked to explain the role being played by one INGO in the development of the new federal education policy, one participant explained that the particular INGO in question emphasized issues such as HIV/AIDS and gender mainstreaming, issues which constitute essential objectives of this INGO's global policy. Furthermore, there was no evidence to support this decision to promote these issues was a result of participatory decision-making which allowed "local peoples" to voice their wants and needs without being influenced by outsiders. While all participants advocated for all Ethiopians to be involved in the discussion to decide policy, there was varied understanding of what constituted participatory decision-making. For some, it constituted allowing Ethiopians to amend policy and programs already drawn up by others; for others, it meant that the even the objectives of the policymaking process had to begin with the grassroots. This discrepancy among those working to develop Ethiopia illustrates the difficulties facing participatory development and policymaking in Ethiopia.

Furthermore, when INGO personnel work in conjunction with communities and local peoples, to what extent do these outsiders influence local peoples in the decision-making process? There is an obvious power differential as INGO personnel are seen as having knowledge of greater value; within this

115

context, it is more plausible that INGO personnel will influence community groups as opposed to communities being allowed to advance views opposed by INGOs.

Individual versus Collective Consciousness: The Role of Community

A 2005 World Bank survey showed that 75% of Africans are uncomfortable with wealth disparities and are strongly committed to equality within the society (Bond, 2006, p. 104). A discrepancy comes to light when one examines the education system espoused in nations in the South against these African values of community and communal life. The education systems of Great Britain, western European nations and North America assume an individualistic worldview in which people's first responsibility is to themselves and their immediate families. An education system which promotes individualistic notions of success, therefore, is based on a worldview foreign to a substantial number of Africans.

International NGOs which work in various nations often argue that INGO programs and policies are contextualized to individual nations. One participant explained that this phenomenon is due to the fact that "*the way people learn is much the same. The curriculum is developed by Ethiopians and [foreign experts] also contribute to curriculum development. Therefore, the curriculum is contextualized to the country.*" However, there was no consideration given to the fact that when people share widely different worldviews, it may be impossible to contextualize one policy to nations in different geographical locations, with

116

differing histories, cultures and belief systems. According to Ake (1993):

> For the African, especially the rural dweller, participation is linked to communality.... People participate not because they are individuals whose interests are different and need to be asserted, but because they are part of an interconnected whole. Participation rests not on the assumption of individualism and conflicting interest, but on the social nature of human beings. Related to this, the African concept of participation is as much a matter of taking part as of sharing the rewards and burdens of community membership (p. 43).

Furthermore, there is little questioning of for whom is educational policy being contextualized? A population of 80 million people who constitute over 80 different ethnicities cannot be homogenous and cannot have the same educational needs. Consequently, the system which encourages homogeneity disadvantages the least powerful members of society who are continually seen as in need of changing to become more like those who have accepted the benefits of Ethiopian modernization.

There appears to be a belief among development workers, both international and national that INGOs are propelling an education system which is better. This belief appears to be entirely due to the economic positions of the countries from which these organizations and their employees originate with little understanding that while a nation like Great Britain may be prosperous, that prosperity is not only a result of the education system and that within the British

117

education system, there are countless students and families whose needs have not been met. These students have been failed by an education system which values individuals over the collective and which produces a competitive learning environment which hampers true education from taking place.

Many participants congratulated the government on their decision to focus on building new universities and colleges and increasing access to higher education for Ethiopians. In a nation which is racing to meet the millennium development goals of universal primary education and which has allowed greater and greater numbers of students into secondary schools, the next logical step is greater numbers of post-secondary institutions. However, this model of education is borrowed directly from the North and no attempt has been made to contextualize it to the needs of Ethiopians. Universities in Ethiopia promote a similar individualism as those in the North and were derided by many participants as in need of capacity building for not only the instructors but also the students.

The participants of this research, foreign and national, were all educated in a school system which valued those individualistic notions of living, an education which has allowed them to attain success as defined by international INGOs and the development industry. The ultimate goal would be for all Ethiopians to attain similar levels of success. The question which must be asked is who has decided these goals is this the desire of all Ethiopians? The elite now have the power to actively ensure that the voices of Indigenous peoples are heard; in effect, the educated have been colonized and often reiterate the opinions of those in power

118

and those who pay their salaries, not the local Indigenous peoples who they have little in common with. They no longer identify with the 'non-educated'.

Participatory decision-making and community involvement in the decision-making process is often touted as the answer to ensuring that development is meeting the needs of all "local peoples". One participant explained that if the community is not involved in the decision-making process, the project will ultimately die as outsiders must eventually leave and locals will have little desire to continue. However, participatory decision-making is too often simply a buzz term. Participants discussing the development of the new ESDP IV spoke of the various stakeholders involved in the process; not once were community and local organizations mentioned. NGOs – extolled as being "more accountable, more efficient, more innovative, more democratic, participatory, and empowering than their governmental, bureaucratic counterparts" (Amutabi, 2006, p. 45) – take the place of communities at the decision-making table. The participants in this research did not consider that INGOs may extol different worldviews than those held by local populations. When asked about the possibility that a westernized education system may not be the answer to the needs of Ethiopians, one participant responded that "*the way people learn is much the same*", effectively stating that education can be universal.

The notion that INGOs work in participatory ways with local communities was brought forward by participants as a reason for NGOs to inform policy and the decision-making process. As one participant explained: *Since [INGOS] are*

119

involved at the grassroots level, ... not just in Addis Ababa talking to the Ministry,

talking to the planning people; they are down in the regions, they are down in the

specific implementing agencies in the education system. They work with colleges,

they work with universities, others work directly with schools. Some work with

communities. So that experience should put [I]NGOs in the best position to ...

inform policymaking. It is, first, surprising that participants viewed colleges and

universities as grassroots organizations, given that the instructors at these

institutions and students who attend them tend to be amongst the most privileged

in Ethiopian society. It also leads to the question of whether those most in need in

Ethiopian society are given opportunities to voice their concerns and desires for a

better life. While the elites of Ethiopian society may share more in common with

those living on the periphery than foreign experts, they do not share the same

voice as often instilling new knowledge leads students to reject their own cultural

and personal identity, thereby acquiring a false sense of superiority leading them

to perceive the unschooled as ignorant and underdeveloped (Ki-Zerbo et al., 1997,

p. 159; Nyerre, 1968, p. 277). The comments made by participants regarding

which groups constitute "grassroots" brings into question the dialectic which

supports NGOs as grassroots organizations.

Is an Equal Partnership between North and South Possible?

In order to alleviate many of the problems present in the South, there must

exist between North and South an equal partnership in which both are equally

involved in the decision-making process. Postcolonial theorists such as Ake,

Achebe and Nyerere would argue that as long the knowledge/power nexus of the north is dominant and valued higher than other experiences, an equal partnership between the governments of nations of the North and South is not possible, nor is it possible between northern developmental organizations and Southern governments. For as long as aid is in the form of charity (Nyerere, 1978, p. 55), for as long as Africans are seen as burdens (Achebe, 1990, p. 23), for as long as political and economic interests are not served (Ake, 1996a, p. 119), Africans will never be viewed as equal partners.

INGOs, more so than governments, are seen goodwill ambassadors of the "North", organizations whose mandate it is to engage in a bilateral sharing of skills with "local peoples". As can be seen from the participants, in reality, the process is unilateral; often, the role of locals in this skill sharing endeavour is extremely limited. Power and decision-making often remains in the hands of INGOs. A participant working in the MoE extrapolated on the role of INGO staff and local Ethiopians in the policy creation process:

> *[The local Ethiopian staff] went through it every word ... And then we had group discussions. We broke them into groups ... and then got feedback. And all that feedback actually influenced the document. I mean, there was debate with us and them.... They were really wanting this document to work.... But you know some of it they didn't feel was appropriate so we've amended it in those ways*.

Evident in the quote above is that the "foreign experts" were primarily responsible for creating the document as well as negotiating with local Ethiopians as to how the document should be changed to reflect their desires. The need for negotiation and debate is puzzling given that the document is intended not for foreign experts but for the use of local Ethiopians. The lack of equality among the group is also evident in the words used by the interview participant to describe the local Ethiopians' reaction to the document, "*They were really wanting this document to work"*. The tone is remarkably condescending with an element of surprise that Ethiopians would want a policy that would work. It is obvious that the participant does not take seriously the notion of Africans developing themselves, seeing herself as the benevolent Northerner there to aid the Ethiopians in achieving development (Ake, 1996b, p. 19; Nyerere, 1978, p. 55).

Also inherent in many comments made by participants is an "othering" of Ethiopians by foreign "experts". "*We are not in the business of coming in here and saying we're going to tell you what to do.... We can only share what we do know and put it into the context here if possible, if it's appropriate"*. While the participant is voicing participatory decision-making ideals at some points of the interview, when explaining the process taken for creating policy, it becomes obvious that the process began and ended with the foreign experts; they took the comments made by Ethiopians and allowed it to influence the revisions of the document, debating and negotiating the changes which needed to be made. The political and economic interests of development organizations are "unlikely to be

122

served by making development an open-ended democratic process, determined by the will of the people, drawing on their energy, and serving their interest" (Ake, 1996a, p. 119). Therefore, it is unlikely that an equal partnership will ever exist.

The contribution of INGOs in the creation of policymaking process is advertised as in the best interests of "local peoples" whose voices are being heard through INGOs. Why is it necessary for Ethiopian voices to be filtered through INGOs? INGOs are expected to ensure that the grassroots have a voice at the bargaining table. However, the effect of their actions is instead a silencing of "local peoples" who are not allowed to be a part of the formal policy creation process as outlined by one participant:

> *There are two major sessions that bring all the stakeholders together. One is the joint review mission (JRM)... The development partners including the NGOs and government will come together.... there is an annual review meeting which involves the government partners, the development partners I told you... So ... all these actors will come together, and they will evaluate the performance of the strategy or the plan.... if there is a need to revise, even the policy direction, they have their say and they contribute in that regard.*

Those organizations sitting at the table are interested in deciding how to help Africa without realizing that Africa has the capability to help itself. Development organizations hijack the policymaking process in order to ensure that the transformation in Africa is occurring along a development paradigm designed by

123

the North – modernization theory.

Evidence of the lack of equality between so-called development partners is illustrated through INGO subversion of the Charities and Societies Proclamation of 2009, created by the Ethiopian government to restrict INGO advocacy work which may not be in line with government priorities. One local Ethiopian participant admitted that while the new law affected the ability of INGOs to fulfill their mandate, INGOs have a newfound strategy.

> *We need to work with diplomacy and tact. [We] can influence policy from within because we have volunteers placed at the MoE … expected to share successes, best practices, what works and what does not work on the ground. That is our approach to policy and it is working well.*

INGOs have adapted a strategy to ensure that they may continue to work in advocacy and policymaking by ensuring that the foreign experts affiliated with their organizations are employed at government organizations which are heralded as the centres of the decision-making process. Furthermore, one local Ethiopia INGO employee contends that the fragmented development industry in Ethiopia requires INGOs which have the "*resources, capacity and experience*" to organize a forum in which all the development stakeholders *"can exchange information and share Ministry objectives"* is imperative to ensuring coordination among all the actors involved in the development process. According to this participant, this would allow INGOs to discuss with Ministry officials how INGOs can best help to *"meet the objectives of the Ministry"*. Problems arise with this scenario when

one realizes that foreign experts affiliated with INGOs are contributing to deciding Ministry objectives as they *"influence policy from within"*.

The lack of equality among development partners is evident in the perception that there are areas for development and specific jobs which no Ethiopian has the capacity to carry out. This lack of capacity became the raison d'être of INGOs who claim they are not in the business of taking *"jobs from Ethiopians"* and that by building human capacity, INGOs create sustainability. According to one participant, *"If we need to start implementing development policies we need to develop good policy first of all. And for that if the Ethiopians can do then well and good but if there's a gap we're happy to support it"*. This misperception by INGO workers that in a nation of eighty million people, there is no person capable of doing specific jobs is an example of the privileging of Euro-Western knowledge at the expense of African knowledge and confirms Achebe's theory that equality is the one thing which the North is conspicuously incapable of extending to others, especially Africans (Achebe, 1990, p. 23).

Consciousness of the Dispossessed

The participants in this study: foreign experts working for INGOs and Ethiopians employed with the MoE, regional education bureaus, and INGOs are among the most privileged members of Ethiopian society. This privilege has, in part, been a result of participants having the opportunities to attend formal schooling which historically promoted first a British and later an American education system. This submersion into a colonial education system has produced

an educated population which has "internalized the paradigm's negative images of themselves as well as notions of the superiority of developed societies" (Ake, 1996a, p. 16), mistakenly believing that "the Other" (in the guise of the white man) can enhance his status and give him self-esteem at the ethical level (Fanon, 2008/1952, p. 132).

One participant, an Ethiopian who had been working outside of the country numerous years before returning spoke about the challenges he faced acclimatizing once again to Ethiopia; compared to African nations such as Kenya and Tanzania for example, Ethiopia's "development" would be on a much smaller scale. Living outside of Ethiopia and in nations considered to be further on the development scale made adapting to life in Ethiopia challenging. A similar experience was faced by participants who moved to Ethiopia as foreign experts to engage in development work. This suggests that the experience of becoming alienated from one's culture can result in people becoming dispossessed from their heritage (Achebe, 2000, p. 72). This dispossession is then recreated in development programs which reproduce "old power and knowledge asymmetries" (Escobar, 2008, p. 175).

The participants in the study never question whether the development paradigm being followed by nations from the South is in the best interests of the South. Their words imply that they have accepted the promises offered as to the benefits of development. There is among all participants, the acceptance that INGOs work with the best interests of local peoples in mind. It is never

126

considered that INGOs are part of the development industry, one which is worth over twenty-three billion dollars annually (Riddell, 2008, p. 48) and that should nations of the South decide that development has been achieved or that development is a hoax, countless numbers of "well-meaning" individuals will be jobless. I contend that the reason for this is two-fold: 1) the participants themselves are employed as a result of the development industry and hindering their own economic security would go against their basic instincts, and 2) the participants are themselves products of a colonial education system and instead of "transforming it in accordance with the democratic aspirations of the nationalist movement" have continued to propagate a colonialist worldview (Ake, 1996b, p. 14). When the leaders and managers of INGOs hold a colonial worldview, INGOs will also propel a similar worldview through the projects and policies they support, advocate for and create.

Colonization and modernization has created large segments of populations which have become disassociated from traditional cultures, ways of livings, belief systems and languages. In Ethiopia, the quest for modernization which began with Emperor Menelik has resulted in a small but significant segment of the population which had adopted a non-traditional way of living, one which is not in accordance with the vast majority of the population. The creation of these hybrid modalities suggests that a "development in a box" approach cannot be successful as within the Ethiopian population there is a multitude of needs. Furthermore, within this strategy, not only is the knowledge of the elite privileged but the elite are seen as

127

eligible to speak on the behalf of other locals based on an assumption that all Ethiopians share a common knowledge basis. Therefore, consultation is negated to the realm of powerful. In effect, not only is the process of policymaking colonized but so are the spaces in which participatory policymaking should occur. The development agenda is allowed to continue unabated and the cycle of disenfranchisement of local peoples remains unbroken.

Summary

Ethiopians are not homogenous. However, the development industry views all Ethiopians as in need of development and charity from the North. The decision regarding the development needs of Ethiopians is rarely made by Ethiopians themselves, particularly those Ethiopians who the North views as most in need. This continuing paternalism towards Africa and by some Africans themselves is both subjugating and serves to suppress Ethiopians and Africans from choosing their own development path. INGOs play an integral role in this as INGO employees are often those sitting at policymaking tables as the voices of the grassroots. Whose voices are INGOs engaged in policymaking privileging? Governments, however, permit INGOs to engage in the policymaking process despite the fact that INGOs often act in their best interests as opposed to the government interests. I contend that governments allow INGOs to engage in policymaking in order to ensure that INGOs will then support the implementation of policies as many governments realize that they do not have the capacity to support the numerous programs required by development organizations and need

INGOs for that purpose.

CHAPTER 7

REFLECTIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Conclusions and Implications

In "developing" nations, education is viewed as the answer to development. Nyerere (1968) questions the purpose of development and the purpose of education in the quest for development (p. 49). These are questions which must be asked for all who ask for a more developed and thus a more educated Africa. What is the purpose of education for Africans? Only when the peoples of Africa answer such a question for themselves, can the question turn to: What education is needed to meet the needs of all Africans? Those responsible for the "development" of Ethiopia – donor organizations, INGOs and the government have decided that Ethiopia requires an education system modelled on Euro-American educational practices. Those employed within the development sector (both government and non-government) argue that these practices will work when contextualized to African or Ethiopian needs. I contend that a Euro-American education system cannot effectively be contextualized to the diverse needs of eighty million Ethiopians whose ethnic and cultural heritage is dispersed among over eighty cultural and ethnic groups or for the eighty percent of who live in rural areas.

When the expectation of the education system is that students will begin to learn in the medium of English from as early as grade five, the system unfairly privileges those with access to English tutorial classes and better trained teachers

and who are from families who can afford such luxuries. This ensures that the rest will continue to have to play catch-up with the most privileged. Furthermore, this privileging of non-Ethiopian, non-local knowledge results in a population that once "educated" begins to turn away from its history, culture and traditions, away from the collectivist, communal African lifestyle toward a more individualist way of living. It is not the democratic participation of the World Bank, Western INGOs or even the African elite which has become a significant issue as these groups have all been well represented; it is the society which is still pre-industrial and communal and whose cultural idiom is radically different whose members are in need of participation in the decision making process (Ake, 1993, p. 239).

As shown from the research, the decision-makers of education policy are those privileged few who have succeeded within the Ethiopian educational system and are now the leaders of society or local experts. These local experts may be employed by INGOs or government and along with foreign experts affiliated and/or employed by INGOs play a significant role in the policymaking process. These experts spoke of the policymaking process as including various stakeholders which were identified as leaders of universities, colleges, and various development organizations. Community participation in the policymaking process was discussed by local experts employed by the government; however, this discussion was related to the programs being directly planned in local communities as opposed to the broader policymaking process. The power to generate ideas is held by a small group of privileged people, thus limiting the

cognitive framework with which policies that appeal to all peoples can be devised (Mongo, 1996, p. 188).

As can be seen from the participant responses of those working for the federal government, NGOs are seen as having the ability and capacity to be involved in educational service provision, advocacy and policymaking with the Ethiopian context. This is due to the belief that NGOs are "more accountable, more efficient, more innovative, more democratic, participatory, and empowering than their governmental, bureaucratic counterparts" (Amutabi, 2006, p. 45) and "foster reliability, responsibility, respect for the law, and continuity" while being "autonomous, politically competent, publicly respected, knowledgeable, and possess[ing] local knowledge and contacts" (Demirovic, 2003, p. 227). The research findings suggest that these beliefs are held not only by INGOs, NGOs, IGOs, IFIs and donors but also by local government officials. This is problematic as according to Schafer (1999), INGOs often challenge particular state policies and actions while also legitimating the existence of states, helping to shape state authority often at the expense of the local and communities. This is evident in the responses by the participants as not only do the government participants indicate criticism of INGO methods with regards to participatory decision-making but INGO managers openly admit to working to subvert government laws and mandates.

Not only are INGOs viewed as having the ability to do work which governments are unable to do, they also propel a specific worldview – a vision of

132

development which calls for the sharing of skills between North and South but in reality is unilateral. Edwards (2008) contends that NGOs act as a conduit through which donor organizations can channel not only aid but also their view of development into the global South. According to Peet and Hartwick (2009), INGOs inculcate in "people an entire system of values, beliefs, and morality" (p. 176) that supports the established order and its dominating classes. As illustrated by the research participants, INGOs play a significant role in training and capacity building with regards to the policymaking process. In effect, INGOs represent particular interests and contribute to the formation of these interests as they train people in new roles and create new relationships between the state and the population (Demirovic, 2003). The role being played by INGOs ensures that the aid industry is becoming "institutionalized and professionalized" as aid is no longer "an event nor an act; it is a strategy" (Gronemeyer, 1992, p. 54). One participant articulated this through the example of how policy was developed within the Ministry of Education, as it was the NGO employee which acted as the facilitator and who made the initial policy decisions and who accepted and/or rejected the ideas of the local Ethiopians. For INGOs to engage in true participatory decision making, donors and INGOs would have to give up their power (Porter & Wet, 2009) and allow locals full control of the decision making process.

Amutabi decries the role of INGOs within Africa, arguing that INGOs "are used for the purpose of maintaining and extending Northern material,

political, social and cultural influence while promoting a local comprador bourgeoisie" (p. xxvi). This is evident within the Ethiopian context as NGO employees who are considered to be the spokespeople for Ethiopians due to their shared heritage and Ethiopian government employees live lives vastly different from that of the vast majority of the population and are espousing a worldview similar to that held in the North as opposed to the majority of peoples in Ethiopia. INGOs play a critical role in creating a segment of the population with values not is accordance with Ethiopian values, "such as, emphasis on *gebregeninet* (what is virtuous and moral), emphasis on *moya* (skills, ability, craft, profession, etc) and mutuality of communal life" (Asgedom, 2005, p. 18).

In Ethiopia, the needs of Ethiopians are various as this tremendously heterogeneous population has neither common development nor common educational goals. Without an understanding of the needs of the very people, education and development are meant to "help", the Ethiopian education system will continue to provide an education which is not meeting the needs of the vast majority of the population. Regardless of my personal views regarding development, I am aware that within this vast population, Ethiopians have various beliefs regarding the needs of their country, society and education system. Within this population, there are those who vehemently call for development and a more Westernized education system. While in Ethiopia, I was privy to a discussion on a bus between two university instructors discussing whether Ethiopia would have benefitted from European colonization in the 1800-1900s and, thereby, be more

developed than it currently is. I have also spoken to Ethiopians who lament that their educated children are lured away from their homes by the false promises of education.

In my discussion, I speak about the *consciousness of the dispossessed* as exemplified through the Ethiopian participants in this study. It is my supposition that identifying colonization within the Ethiopian context is vital to gaining greater understanding of the issues facing Ethiopian education. All Ethiopians have not gone through this process of colonization. However, many of those in positions of power have undergone a psychological colonization in which the ways of the "North" are deemed superior, and it is this group which is now making policy decisions for an entire nation, decisions which are meant to benefit all but which may have a detrimental effect on the lives of Ethiopians. So to decolonize educational policy, an important pre-requisite becomes the decolonization of the mind, which should instil in the minds and the psyche of Ethiopians some confidence of consciousness that is willing to drag the historical and cultural realities of Ethiopian life into the educational context, not as excluding what is about western education, but as at least affirming both the ontological and epistemological contexts of the Ethiopian learner. As things are now, those who cling to the machinery of western structures of reading and understanding, as well as western languages and worldviews might survive the project; in Ethiopia, those are the few people (out of what is now 85 million Ethiopians) who have a stake in the current status quo.

135

Recommendations

International NGOs operating in Ethiopia have recognized the importance of local voices impacting policy and programs. However, they must now realize that those voices cannot speak for all Ethiopians. The government and INGOs must move towards a policy of de-colonizing the Ethiopian education system. According to Freire (1973), this de-colonization requires the processes of conscientizaçao in which meaningful praxis leads to the lifting of the ideological veil from people's consciousness. Therefore, the first act of INGOs and governments must be a growing awareness that colonization is a reality in Ethiopia and impacts on policy decisions. INGOs which are powerful organizations have the ability to work for the common good, to ensure that the policies they are supporting are also supported by Ethiopians who are expected to benefit from them.

Undertaking a process of conscientization requires an understanding of the historical processes which have led to the current held views of Ethiopia and Africa as these long-held perceptions of Africa have contributed to a devaluation of Africa (Achebe, 2009). Furthermore, the process of conscientization requires the commitment of both foreigners and locals. If Ethiopia is to engage in a process of decolonization, those Ethiopians in positions of power must see that a successful future for Africa lies in accepting that Africa's past has already created the path for a successful future (Nyerere, 1967). Those involved in development must understand that African ideals, cultural beliefs and traditions have an

136

integral role to play in determining a future for Africa that includes all Africans.

Ultimately, Ethiopians and Africans must be the determinants of their own future. The North cannot decide the path to be taken by those in the South and must cease to use charity as an instrument of controlling the decision-making process of the South. Realistically, this is not probable. Development is a multi-billionaire dollar a year industry and should the North ever decide to allow the South to determine their own path, hundreds of thousands of jobs would be lost. Therefore, it becomes the responsibility of Africans to ensure that their futures are decided by themselves. For it is only the oppressed who have the strength and ability to end their own oppression (Freire, 1970/2000).

Ethiopia, a nation of over eighty million is composed of over 80 ethnicities with distinct cultures and histories, all of which must be taken into account when developing educational policy. One education policy cannot meet the needs of such a diverse population. In order for education to best meet the needs of this diverse population, educational policy planning must be decentralized. Regional governments must be allowed to ensure that educational policy planning is occurring at community level as this is integral to ensuring social development. The final draft of ESDP IV, for example, calls for all illiterate adults to participate in a two year Functional Adult Literacy (FAL) course (Federal Ministry of Education, 2010, p. 7). Will a two year literacy program meet the needs of communities, helping communities and local peoples live better lives? In the past year, inflation in Ethiopia has increased by 35% (The

Africa Report, 2011, ¶2), rendering it harder for people to buy basic goods to take care of themselves and their families. I question whether a two year adult literacy program will help these most vulnerable of Ethiopians and whether communities would ask for such a program or for support which would allow them to see tangible results in improving their lives as soon as possible. It is, therefore, imperative that communities be involved in the decision-making process as policies developed must ultimately allow peoples to live a better life, as defined by "local peoples".

Consequently, dynamic local population participation in policy- and decision- making is a myth for most groups and Southern nations. Patel and Mitlin (2002) attempt to change this by introducing an empowerment methodology, an explicit attempt to promote quality participation by local peoples. INGOs tend to be seen as the best source for generating analytical knowledge. This is important in the NGO debate because INGOs and local NGOs tend to use either expatriate labour or local labour who promote non-local knowledge, thus devaluing local skills and knowledge. The empowerment and exchange methodology is an attempt to begin to reverse this devaluing of the South and Southern peoples. The rich culture and history of nations in the global South has produced citizens with a multitude of skills which can be used for self development. However, the privileging of the knowledge of the other has led to fewer opportunities for "local peoples" to utilize their skills, leading "local peoples" to severely doubt the value of their skills and knowledge.

Exchanges start by encouraging communities to reflect on their own situation. Communities meet together and exchange ideas without outside involvement in the process (Patel & Mitlin, 2002, p. 127). This allows community members to exchange ideas and identify local solutions to local problems; in the process, participants gain confidence and skills, making them willing to try other endeavours. Furthermore, women, in particular, benefit as their ability to control the development process is strengthened. Indigenous peoples, especially poor women, are usually sceptical about the solutions presented to them by professional experts but do not have the confidence to voice their scepticism. According to Patel and Mitlin (2002), learning from another community member is not as intimidating as from a professional (p. 129). Knowledge held by locals is more appropriate to meeting local needs. Community members are working with others of similar status who cannot use their status or more 'privileged knowledge' to hijack the agenda. Development and education policies are thus decided by those whom are most affected by policy outcomes, thereby allowing communities with the best understanding and knowledge of local history, culture, language and societal needs to decide their own development and educational goals.

Considerations for Future Research

Ethiopia provides a rich environment in which to conduct future research. While interviewing participants for this study, numerous participants mentioned the need of additional research. One participant discussed the need to examine in

greater detail the effects of the new law on civil society organizations – the Charities and Societies Proclamation – which restricts the ability of international INGOs to engage in advocacy. The law which came into effect in 2009 caused many INGOs to close departments working on issues such as human rights, which comprise mainly of advocacy work. INGOs working in education did not face the same restrictions as many engage in a mixture of activities, including service provision which is considered acceptable. It would be interesting to examine in greater detail than accomplished in this study the effects of the Proclamation on INGOs working in education.   Furthermore, INGOs continue to engage in advocacy in issues such as ensuring access to educational opportunities for females, issues which have been propelled by the Millennium Development Goals.   As a female, I fully support the right of females to access educational opportunities. Nevertheless, this research has the possibility to examine the politicization of the educational development agenda on a grander scale and consider the interconnected relationship among, international financial institutions, donor organizations, INGOs and federal and regional governments.

Ethiopia's unique history among African nations has resulted in limited research examining the effects of colonization on the identity, cultures and traditions of Ethiopians. As a result of this study, it is obvious that colonization is a reality in Ethiopia. Research is needed to examine first the ways in which colonization has occurred in Ethiopia and the effects of this colonization on the Ethiopian psyche. This research is necessary to interrupt the prevailing belief

system that Ethiopia is a nation devoid of first-hand experience of colonization. Furthermore, the process of decolonization can only occur once a nation and its people realize and accept that colonization is a reality and has been occurring for generations.

This study was limited to the Ethiopian context. It would be useful for future research to compare the findings of this research to that of other African nations in order to examine whether the role of INGOs as implementers of colonization is occurring in other African nations. Have INGOs become the contemporary masters of colonization in other parts of Africa? Furthermore, this research would be enriched by allowing diverse groups of local peoples to be participants in the research. This research only considered the view of those already engaged in the policymaking process and not the views of those who would be impacted by the policies made. A thorough understanding of the effects of current and future policies requires that those most impacted have a voice in any future research that arises as a result of this study.

Final Reflections

My decision to conduct research on this topic was a result of my own experiences working with an INGO in Ethiopia and a desire to identify some of the discomforts I felt while employed as a "foreign expert" in Ethiopia. Even prior to reading the work of the various scholars and theorists identified in the research, I began to contemplate the idea of INGO workers as recolonizers. This questioning arose as a result of a comment made by a close Ethiopian friend who

referred to a fellow INGO worker as "the colonizer". The comment led me to begin to re-examine not only my role within the development paradigm but the larger role being played by INGOs in the decision-making process.

I conducted this research as the Ethiopian government was finalizing its new Education Sector Development Program (ESDP). The government had issued a draft document for approval. It was within this context in which the research participants had been involved in a national education policy formulation that this research was conducted. It is for this reason that many participants refer to ESDP IV in their interviews. As a researcher, this provided me with a rich environment in which to conduct research on the policymaking process.

Upon returning to Ethiopia to engage in data collection, I was surprised by the openness and willingness of the research participants I recruited to participate. The same friend I spoke about above asked me how the recruitment process was going. I replied, "Amazing. Everyone has been so helpful." His response was "Off course, they are. You're a ferenji [foreigner]. If you were Ethiopian, you wouldn't have been so lucky". It astounds me that even within this nation where I should be an outsider, due to the very nature of my nationality and experiences, I have been privileged to hear about and question to an extent that those who are most affected by these very policies cannot. However, I also wonder whether my stature as a novice researcher, as a researcher-in-training allowed me greater access as I was non-threatening.

All of my participants conducted the interviews in English. The Ethiopian

participants were all bi- or multi-lingual and all had learned English as a foreign language. While those employed directly with INGOs were confident in their speaking abilities, their counterparts employed with the government always apologized for what they deemed were deficient English language skills. As someone who only speaks English, I am always humbled by those who are bi- and multi- lingual especially considering that vastly different language structures of the languages spoken in Ethiopia – Amharic, Tigryna, Afaan Oromo (to name a few) – and English. This has caused to ruminate on the reason that the world in which we live has led to many who do not speak English as a mother tongue to be embarrassed by their English speaking abilities. The very primitive act of communication has become colonized.

On a professional level, this was my first experience as a researcher. As I listen to the recordings from my first interview to my last, I am astounded by the growth I experienced as I became more confident and more adept at asking questions in a clearer manner and at responding to the participants' statements. While I still have much more learning to do, this has been an invaluable learning experience for me. And as I reflect on the process, it is clear that part of my success with recruiting participants lay with my ability to connect with them when first meeting. I made sure to introduce myself and research but also my own connections to Ethiopia – personal and professional. I believed that it was important that the participants were aware that while in many ways I was an outsider, for two years I had lived and worked in Ethiopia and had some

understanding of Ethiopian culture, society and education system.

As described earlier in the chapter, there is much within the Ethiopia education system which must be examined. I hope that this will be the first of many opportunities that I will have to engage in research and scholarship in Ethiopia. Hopefully, in the future that research can be done in partnership with Ethiopians, as it is integral that research is not done just for the sake of doing research but to bring about a new understanding of conditions and issues facing peoples.

References

Abdi, A.A. (2005). African philosophies of education: Counter-colonial criticisms. In A.A. Abdi & A. Cleghorn (Eds.), *Issues in African education: Sociological perspectives* (pp.26-41). New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

Academy for Educational Development. (2003). *Partnerships in education: Key findings on the role of NGOs in basic education in Africa*. Washington: American Institutes for Research. Retrieved from http://search.ebscohost.com.login.ezproxy.library.ualberta.ca.

Achebe, C. (1999). Africa is people. *The Massachusetts Review*, 40(3), 310-321.

Achebe, C. (2009). The education of a British protected child. New York: Alfred A. Knopf.

Achebe, C., Okeyo, A.P., Magadza, C. & Hyden, G. (1990). *Beyond hunger in Africa: Conventional wisdom and a vision of Africa in 2057*. Nairobi: Heinemann Kenya.

Aikman, S. (1999). Schooling and development: Eroding Amazon women's knowledge and diversity. In C. Heward & S. Bunwaree (Eds.), *Gender, education, and development: Beyond access to empowerment* (pp. 65-79). London: Zed Books.

Ake, C. (1993). The unique case of African democracy. *International Affairs*, 69(2), 239-244.

145

Ake, C. (1996a). *Democracy and development in Africa*. Washington, D.C.: The

    Brookings Institute.

Ake, C. (1996b). The marginalization of Africa: Notes on a productive confusion.

    East Lansing: Michigan State University Press.

Alvares, C. (1992). Science. In W. Sachs (Ed.), *The development dictionary: A*

    guide to knowledge as power (pp. 219-232). Johannesburg: Witwatersrand

    University Press.

Amutabi, M.N. (2006). *The NGO factor in Africa: The case of arrested*

    development in Kenya. New York: Routledge.

Areaya, S. (2008). *Policy formulation, curriculum development and*

    Implementation in Ethiopia. Addis Ababa: Addis Ababa University: The

    Book Centre.

Asgedom, A. (2005). Freedom as quality of education: A postmodern perspective.

    IER Flambeau 12(2), 1-21.

Ashcroft, B., Griffiths, G., & Tiffin, H. (2006). Introduction to part one. In B.

    Ashcroft, G. Griffiths, & H. Tiffin (Eds.), *The post-colonial studies reader*

    (pp. 9-13). New York:Routledge.

Bebbington, A., Hickey, S., & Mitlin, D. (2008). Can NGOs make a difference?

    The challenge of development alternatives. In A. Bebbington, S. Hickey,

    & D. Mitlin (Eds.), *Can NGOs make a difference: The challenge of*

    development alternatives (pp.3-18). London:Zed Books.

146

Berthoud, G. (1992). Market. In W. Sachs (Ed.), *The development dictionary: A guide to knowledge as power* (pp. 70-87). Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press.

Bhabha, H.K. (1994/2005). *The location of culture*. New York: Routledge.

Birke, A. (2008). Civil society networking and coalition building in Ethiopia: Challenges and prospects. In T. Assefa & B. Zewde (Eds.), *Civil society at the crossroads* (pp. 135-142). Addis Ababa: Forum for Social Studies.

Bloom, D. (2004). Globalisation and education: An economic perspective. In M. Suarez-Orozcom & D. Qin-Hillard (Eds.), *Globalisation: Culture and education in the new millennium* (pp.56-77). Berkeley: University of California Press.

Bond, P. (2006). *The economics of exploitation*. Pietermaritzburg: University of Kwa-Zulu Natal Press.

Brown, D. (2004). Participation in poverty reduction strategies: Democracy strengthened or democracy undermined? In S. Hickey & G. Mohan (Eds.), *Participation: From tyranny to transformation* (pp. 237-251). London: Zed Books.

Buchmann, C. (1999). Poverty and educational inequality in sub-Saharan Africa. *Prospects* 29(4), 503-515. Retrieved from http://www.springerlink.com.login.ezproxy.library.ualberta.ca.

Chambers, S. (2004). The politics of critical theory. In F. Rush (Ed.), *The Cambridge companion to critical theory* (pp. 219-247). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Chambers , S., & Kymlicka, W. (2002). Introduction: Alternative conceptions of civil society. In S. Chambers & W. Kymlicka (Eds.), *Alternative conceptions of civil society* (pp. 1-12). Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Choudry, A. (2009). Challenging colonial amnesia in global justice activism. In D. Kapoor (Ed.), *Education, decolonization and development: Perspectives from Asia, Africa and the Americas* (pp. 95-110). Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

Choudry, A. (2010). Global justice? Contesting NGOization: Knowledge politics and containment in anti-globalization networks. In A. Choudry & D. Kapoor (Eds.), *Learning from the ground-up: Global perspectives on social movements and knowledge production* (pp.35-59). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Clark, J. (2000). Civil society, NGOs and development in Ethiopia: A snapshot view. Washington: The World Bank. Retrieved from http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTRANETSOCIALDEVELOPMENT /873204-1111663470099/20489508/CSandDevEthiopiaSnapshotView.pdf

Crotty, M. (1998). *The foundations of social research: Meaning and perspective in the research process.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Demars, W. E. (2005). *NGOs and transnational networks: Wild cards in world politics*. London: Pluto Press.

Demirovic, A. (2003). NGOs, the state, and civil society: The transformation of hegemony. *Rethinking Marxism* 15(2), 213-235. doi: 10.1080/0893569032000113541

Desai, V. (2008). The role of non-governmental organizations. In V. Desai & R.B. Potter (Eds*.), The companion to development studies* (pp. 525-529). London: Hodder Education.

Dibie, R.A. (2008). Introduction: NGOs and human development in Africa: Theory and model for collaboration. In R.A. Dibie (Ed.), *Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and sustainable development in sub-Saharan Africa* (pp. 1-26). Plymouth: Lexington Books.

Dibie, R.A., & Kawewe, S. (2008). NGOs and development in Botswana and Nigeria. In R.A. Dibie (Ed.), *Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and sustainable development in sub-Saharan Africa* (pp.107-120). Plymouth: Lexington Books.

Edwards, M. (2008). How NGOs make a difference?: From Manchester to Birmingham with an elephant in the room. In A.J. Bebbington, S, Hickey, & D.C. Mitlin (Eds.), *Can NGOs make a difference: The challenge for development alternatives* (pp. 38-52). London: Zed Books.

Edwards, M., & Hulme, D. (1996). *Beyond the magic bullet: NGO performance and accountability in the post-Cold War world*. West Hartford: Kumarian.

149

Escobar, A. (2008). *Theories of difference: New ecologies for the 21st century*.

> Durham: Duke University Press.

Fanon, F. (2006/1961). National Culture. In B. Ashcroft, G. Griffiths, & H. Tiffin

> (Eds.), *The post-colonial studies reader* (pp. 119-122). New York:

> Routledge.

Fanon, F. (2008/1952). *Black skin, white masks*. New York: Grove Press.

Fisher, J. (1993). The road from Rio: Sustainable development and the

> nongovernmental movement in the third world. Westport: Praeger.

Foucault, M. (1975/2006). The means of correct training. In Lauder, H., Brown,

> P., Dillabough, J., & Halsey, A.H. (Eds.), *Education, globalization and*

> *social change* (pp. 124 – 137). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Freire, P. (1970/2000). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York: Continuum.

Freire, P. (1973). Education as the practice of freedom in education for critical

> consciousness. New York: Continuum.

Gall, M.D., Borg, W.R., & Gall, J.P. (1996). *Educational research: An*

> *introduction*. White Plains: Longman Publishers.

Gardener, H. (2004). How education changes: Considerations of History, Science,

> and values. In M.M. Suárez-Orozco & D. Baolian Qin-Hilliard (Eds.),

> *Globalization: Culture and education in the new millennium* (pp. 235-

> 258). Berkeley: University of California Press.

Girvan, N. (2006). The search for policy autonomy in the global South. In P.

    Utting (Ed.), *Reclaiming development agendas: Knowledge, power and*

    international policy making (pp. 73-89). New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

Gondolfo, A.J. (2009). English-medium and African linguistic rights in the

    context of Globalisation. *Globalisation, Societies and Education 7(3)*,

    321-336. doi**:**0.1080/14767720903166129.

Gronemeyer, M. (1992). Helping. In W. Sachs (Ed.), *The development dictionary:*

    A guide to knowledge as power (53-69). Johannesburg: Witwatersrand

    University Press.

Grosfoguel, R. (2005). The implications of subaltern epistemologies for global

    capitalism: Transmodernity, border thinking, and global coloniality. In R.

    Appelbaum & W. Robinson (Eds.), In Critical globalization studies (pp.

    283-292). New York : Routledge.

Guba, E.G., & Lincoln,Y.S. (1999). Naturalistic and rationalistic enquiry. In J.P.

    Keeves & G. Lakomski (Eds.), *Issues in Educational Research* (pp. 141-

    149). London: Pergamon Press.

Guttal, S, (2006). Challenging the knowledge business. In P. Utting (Ed.),

    Reclaiming development agendas: Knowledge, power and international

    policy making (pp. 25-42). New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

Hailu, D. (2007). *Implication of formal education for rural communities in*

    Ethiopia: The case of Woyisso-Qancaaro Kebele, Oromia Region. Addis

    Ababa: Department of Sociology and Social Anthropology.

151

Hart, C. (2010). Critical discourse analysis and cognitive science: New

    perspectives on immigration discourse. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Huntington, S. (1971/2007). The Change to change: Modernization, development

    and politics (1971) and political order in changing societies (1968). In J.T.

    Roberts & A.B. Hite (Eds.), *The globalization and development reader:*

    perspectives on development and global change (pp. 56-68). Malden:

    Blackwell Publishing Ltd.

Jäger, S., & Maier, F. (2009). Theoretical and methodological aspects in

    Foucauldian critical discourse analysis and dispositive analysis. In

    R.Wodak & M. Meyer (Eds.), *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis* (pp.

    34-61). London: Sage.

Kadzamira, E.C., & Kunje, D. (2002). *The changing roles of non-governmental*

    organizations in education in Malawi. Washington: American Institutes

    for Research. Retrieved from

    http://search.ebscohost.com.login.ezproxy.library.ualberta.ca

Kamat, S. (2002). *Development hegemony: NGOs and the state in India*. New

    Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Kamat, S. (2003). NGOs and the new democracy: The false saviours of

    international development. *Harvard International Review*, 65-69.

Kamat, S. (2004). The privatization of public interest: Theorizing NGO discourse

    in a neoliberal era. *Economy* 11(1), 155-176.

    doi:10.1080/0969229042000179794

King, K. (2006). Knowledge management and the global agenda for education. In

  P. Utting (Ed.), *Reclaiming development agendas: Knowledge, power and*

  international policymaking (pp. 108-127). New York: Palgrave

  MacMillan.

Ki-Zerbo, J., Kane. C.H., Archibald, J., Lizop, E., & Rahnema, M. (1997).

  Education as an instrument of cultural defoliation: A multi-voice report. In

  M. Rahnema & V. Bawtree (Eds.), *The post-development reader* (pp. 152-

  160). London: Zed Books.

Klees, S. (2008). NGOs, civil society, and development: Is there a third way?

  Current Issues in Comparative Education 10(1/2), 22-25. Retrieved from

  http://www.tc.columbia.edu/cice/Archives/10/PDFs/10_Klees.pdf.

Kothari, U. (2005). Authority and expertise: The professionalisation of

  international development and the ordering of dissent. *Antipode*, *37*(3),

  425-446.

Leys, C. (1996). *The rise and fall of development theory* (2nd ed.). London: James

  Currey Ltd.

Malhotra, K. (2000) NGOs without aid: Beyond the global soup kitchen. *Third*

  World Quarterly 21(4), 655-668. doi:10.1080/01436590050079047

Manji, F., & O'Coill, C. (2002). The missionary position: NGOs and development

  in Africa. *International Affairs* 78(3), 567-583.

Makuwira, J. (2004). Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and participatory

    development in basic education in Malawi. *Current Issues in Comparative*

    Education 6(2), 113-124. Retrieved from

    http://www.tc.columbia.edu/cice/Archives/6.2/62makuwira.pdf

Martens, K. (2002). Mission impossible? Defining nongovernmental

    organizations. *Voluntas: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit*

    Organizations 13(3), 271-285.

Michael, S. (2004). *Undermining development: The absence of power among*

    local NGOs in Africa. Oxford: James Currey.

Ministry of Education, (2005). *Education sector development program III (ESDP*

    III) 2005/2006 – 2010/2011 (1998 EFY – 2002 EFY): Program action plan

    (PAP). Addis Ababa: Ministry of Education.

Ministry of Education. (2009). *General education quality improvement program*

    (GEQIP): Performance agreement between the Regional Education

    Bureau and the College of Teacher Education. Addis Ababa: Ministry

    of Education.

Ministry of Education. (2010). *Education Sector Development Program IV*

    (2010/2011-2014/2015): Program Action Plan (PAP). Addis Ababa:

    Ministry of Education.

Mongo, C. (1996). *The Anthropology of anger: Civil society and democracy in*

    Africa. Boulder: Lynne Rienner Publisher, Inc.

154

Mundy, K., & Murphy, L. (2001). Transnational advocacy, global civil society? Emerging evidence from the field of education. *Comparative Education Review, 45*(1), 85-126. Retrieved from http://search.ebscohost.com.login.ezproxy.library.ualberta.ca

Noblit, G. (2005). Perspective 7: Critical theory. In Paul, J.L. (Ed.), *Introduction to the philosophies of research and criticism in education and the Social Science* (pp. 76-79). New Jersey: Pearson Prentice Hall.

Nyerere, J.K. (1967). The President explains the Arusha Declaration: August 1967**.** Dar Es Salaam: National Printing Co. Ltd.

Nyerere, J.K. (1968). *Ujamaa: Essays on socialism*. London: Oxford University Press.

Nyerere, J.K. (1973). *Freedom and cevelopment*. Dar Es Salaam: Oxford University Press.

Nyerere, J.K. (1974). *Stability and change in Africa: Address by President Julius K. Nyerere of the United Republic of Tanzania at the University of Toronto, Canada, on 2ⁿᵈ October 1969*. Dar Es Salaam: National Printing Co. Ltd.

Patel, S., & Mitlin, D. (2002). Sharing experiences, changing lives. *Community Development Journal*, 37(2): 125-136. Retrieved from http://search.ebscohost.com.login.ezproxy.library.ualberta.ca.

Paul, J.L. (2005). *Introduction to the philosophies of research and criticism in education and the Social Science*. New Jersey: Pearson Prentice Hall.

Peet, R., & Hartwick, E. (2009). *Theories of development: Contentions, arguments, alternatives.* New York: The Guilford Press.

Petras, J., & Veltmeyer, H. (2001). *Globalization unmasked: Imperialism in the 21st Century* (4th ed.). Halifax: Fenwood Publishing.

Pillay, T. (2010). Critical perspectives on NGOs and educational policy development in Ethiopia. *Journal of Alternative Perspectives in the Social Sciences*, 2(1), 92-121.

Pollard, A., & Court, J. (2008). How civil society organizations use evidence to influence policy processes. In A.J. Bebbington, S, Hickey, & D.C. Mitlin (Eds.), *Can NGOs make a difference: The challenge for development alternatives* (pp. 133-152). London: Zed Books.

Porter, S., & Wet, J. (2009). Who will guard the guardians? Amartya Sen's contribution to development evaluation. *Development in Practice*, 19(3), 288-299. doi: 10.1080/09614520902807987

Quayson, A. (2000). *Postcolonialism: Theory, practice or process*? Cambridge: Polity Press.

Rahmato, D. (2008). The voluntary sector in Ethiopia: Challenges and future prospects. In T. Assefa & B. Zewde (Eds.), *Civil society at the crossroads* (pp. 81-134). Addis Ababa: Forum for Social Studies.

Rahnema, M. (1992). Participation. In W. Sachs (Ed.), *The development dictionary: A guide to knowledge as power* (pp. 116-131). Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press.

156

Riddell, R.C. (2008). *Does foreign aid really work*? Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Robertson, S., Novelli, M., Dale, R., Tikly, L., Dachi, H., & Alphonce, N. (2007). *Globalisation, education and development: Ideas, actors and dynamics (Researching the Issues 68).* London: DFID.

Rogers, R. (2004). An introduction to critical discourse analysis in education. In R. Rogers (Ed.), An introduction to critical discourse analysis in education (pp. 1-18). Mahwah: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Inc.

Rostow, W.W. (1960/1991). *The stages of economic growth: A non-communist manifesto* (3rd ed.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Sarantakos, S. (2005). *Social research*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Schafer , M. J. (1999). International nongovernmental organizations and third world education in 1990: A cross national study. *Sociology of Education, 72* (2), 69-85. Retrieved from http://www.proquest.com.login.ezproxy.library.ualberta.ca

Schech, S., & vas Dev, S. (2007). Governing through participation? The World Bank's new approach to the poor. In D. Moore (Ed.), *The World Bank: Development, poverty, hegemony* (pp. 171-202). Scottsville: University of Kwa-Zulu Natal Press.

Seboka, B. (2004). *Assessment of NGOs/CSOs participation in the education sector development program of Ethiopia*. Addis Ababa: Christian Relief and Development Association.

157

Seligman, A.B. (2002). Civil society as idea and ideal. In S. Chambers & W. Kymlicka (Eds.), *Alternative conceptions of civil society* (pp. 13-33). Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Senarclens, P. (1997). How the United Nations promotes development through technical assistance. In M. Rahnema & V. Bawtree (Eds.), *The post-development reader* (pp. 190- 203). London: Zed Books.

Shivji, I. G. (2007). *Silences in NGO discourse: The role and future of NGOs in Africa*. Nairobi: Fahuma – Networks for Social Justice.

Shizha, E. (2005). Reclaiming our memories: The education dilemma in postcolonial African school curricula. In A.A. Abdi & A. Cleghorn (Eds.), *Issues in African education: Sociological perspectives* (pp.65-83). New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

Spring, J. (2009). *Globalization of education: An introduction*. New York: Routledge.

Stake, R.E. (2005). Qualitative Case Studies. In H.K. Denzin & Y.S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research* (pp 443-466). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Stromquist, N. (2002). *Education in a globalized world: The connectivity of economic power*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

Tefera, S. (1996). Attempts at educational reform in Ethiopia: A top-down or bottom-up reform? *The Ethiopian Journal of Education*, 16(1), 1-37.

The Africa Report. (2011, June 15). Ethiopia's escalating inflation rate raises

    concerns. Retrieved from

    http://www.theafricareport.com/archives2/business/5141656-ethiopias-

    escalating-inflation-rate-raises-concerns.html.

The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, (2004). *Report on the development*

    of education in Ethiopia to the UNESCO Forty-seventh session of the

    international conference on education 8-11 September 2004. Geneva,

    Switzerland.

Toye, J., & Toye, R. (2006). The World Bank as a knowledge agency. In P.

    Utting (Ed.), *Reclaiming development agendas: Knowledge, power and*

    international policymaking (pp. 90-107). New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

Utting, P. (2006). Introduction: Reclaiming development agendas. In P. Utting

    (Ed.), *Reclaiming development agendas: Knowledge, power and*

    international policymaking (pp. 1-23). New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

van Beurden, J. (1998). *Ethiopia – Country Profile 1998.* Retrieved from

    http://www.crdaethiopia.org/Country%20Profile/ethiopia.htm.

Waddington, M., & Mohan, G. (2004). Failing forward: Going beyond PRA and

    imposed formsof participation. In S. Hickey & G. Mohan (Eds.),

    Participation: From tyranny to transformation (pp. 219-234). London:

    Zed Books.

White, S. K. (2004). The very idea of a critical social science. In F. Rush (Ed.), *The Cambridge companion to critical theory* (pp. 310-335). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Williams, G. (2004). Towards a repoliticization of participatory development: Political capabilities and spaces of empowerment. In S. Hickey & G. Mohan (Eds.), *Participation: From tyranny to transformation* (pp. 92-107). London: Zed Books.

Wodak, R., & Meyer, M. (2009). Critical discourse analysis: History, agenda, theory and methodology. In R. Wodak & M. Meyer (Eds.), *Methods of critical discourse analysis*, (pp. 1-33). London: Sage.

Woodside-Jiron, H. (2004). Language, power, and participation: Using critical discourse analysis to make sense of public policy. In R. Rogers (Ed.), *An introduction to critical discourse analysis in education* (pp. 173-205). Mahwah: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Inc.

World Bank. (2008). *Ethiopia general education quality improvement program (GEQIP): Project appraisal* document. Washington: World Bank.

Yimam, W. (1998). The contribution of NGOs in social recognition. *IER Flambeau* 6(1), 72-84.

Yin, R.K. (2005). *Introducing the world of education: A case study reader*. London: Sage Publications.

APPENDIX A: Letter of Initial Contact

Dear [Participant's Name]:

As part of my study for my Master's Degree in Education, I will be doing a thesis research project on the role of NGOs in educational policymaking in Ethiopia. Due to your knowledge and experience from working in the education sector in Ethiopia and your understanding of the work being done by NGOs working within the education sector in Ethiopia, I believe that your knowledge and expertise will allow me to gain a better understanding of this topic. I will be in Ethiopia in November and December 2010 and would appreciate holding an interview with you to discuss the above mentioned issues. Attached to this email is an Information Letter which details the study I plan to undertake. I would appreciate it if you could read the attached letter. Please feel free to email me or contact me using the contact details below with any questions or concerns you may have and/or your decision within the next seven days.

Sincerely,

Thashika Pillay

Graduate Student Researcher
7-104 Education North
Department of Educational Policy Studies
University of Alberta
Edmonton, AB
T6G 2G5
(780) 885-5222
pillay@ualberta.ca

APPENDIX B: Information Letter

Thashika Pillay
Department of Educational Policy Studies
Faculty of Education
7-104 Education North
University of Alberta
Edmonton, AB
T6G 2G5

21 November 2010

RE: Research project information letter

Name of Research Project: ***The Role of NGOs in Educational Policymaking in Ethiopia***

Researcher's Name: **Thashika Pillay**

Dear [Participant's Name],

Within Ethiopia, NGOs have become prominent educational service providers. However, NGOs are also attempting to become involved in educational policymaking at the federal and regional levels. There remains little empirical research surrounding the outcomes when NGOs engage in educational policymaking. The purpose of this research is to gain a better understanding of the effects on nations when NGOs engage in educational policymaking. This study is part of my Masters of Education degree and is the focus of my thesis.

For this research project, I will be conducting 6 one on one interviews of approximately 30-45 minutes in length. The interviews will be open ended in nature. I, the researcher, will approach potential interview participants directly or through an intermediary. The intermediary will be associated with your organization, institution or government office and will be familiar to participants. A digital recording device will be used to record the interviews. I will keep in strict confidence information obtained in interviews. While anonymity of identity within the bounds of the interview site may be impossible, I will keep individual participant contributions in strict confidence. I will endeavor to hold interviews in a location that is approved by the participant and which will allow participants to remain anonymous.

I will comply with the University of Alberta Standards for the Protection of Human Research Participants
http://www.uofaweb.ualberta.ca/gfcpolicymanual/policymanualsection66.cfm.
Dr. Ali A. Abdi, the research supervisor, will sign a confidentiality agreement in order to ensure that all data is kept confidential.

All interview data will be typed and sent back to participants for them to verify and make any additions or deletions that they wish. Also, participants will be given the opportunity to verify or reject my researcher interpretations of their comments made in the interviews.

Participants have the right:
- o To not participate in this research.
- o To opt out without penalty and to have any collected data withdrawn from the data base and not included in the study. Participants may contact myself or my research supervisor Dr. Ali A. Abdi if they wish to opt out of the research. This may be done verbally, via email, via telephone, or in writing. Contact information is listed at the end of this information letter. Participants may opt out of this research up two weeks after member checks have been sent to participants for feedback.
- o To privacy, anonymity and confidentiality.
- o To safeguards for security of data (data are to be kept in a secure place for a minimum of 5 years following completion of research project) and when appropriate destroyed in a way that ensures privacy and confidentiality.
- o To disclosure of the presence of any apparent or actual conflict of interest on the part of the researcher(s).
- o To a copy of a report of the research findings. If participants are interested in a copy of the research report, they may let me know verbally or in writing, and I will keep a record of this and send a research report to participants via email or postal service.

The findings from this research may be used in research articles, conference presentations, book chapters, or web postings. All data will be handled in compliance with the University of Alberta Standards for the Protection of Human Research Participants.

The plan for this study has been reviewed for its adherence to ethical guidelines and approved by the Faculties of Education, Extension, Augustana and Campus Saint Jean Research Ethics Board (EEASJ REB) at the University of Alberta. For questions regarding participant rights and ethical conduct of research, contact the Chair of the EEASJ REB c/o (780) 492-2614.

Thank you!

Thashika Pillay

Contact Information for this research project:

Thashika Pillay
Graduate Student Researcher
7-104 Education North
Department of Educational Policy Studies
Studies   University of Alberta
Edmonton, AB
T6G 2G5
(780) 885-5222
pillay@ualberta.ca

Dr. Ali A. Abdi
Research Supervisor
7-115 Education North
Department of Educational Policy
University of Alberta
Edmonton, AB
T6G 2G5
Phone: 780-492-6819
Fax: 780-492-2024
aabdi@ualberta.ca

Thashika Pillay
Department of Educational Policy Studies
Faculty of Education
7-104 Education North
University of Alberta
Edmonton, AB
T6G 2G5

[Date]

Name of Research Project: ***The Role of NGOs in Educational Policymaking in Ethiopia***

Researcher's Name: **Thashika Pillay**

Dear [Participant's Name]:

Within Ethiopia, NGOs have become prominent educational service providers. However, NGOs are also attempting to become involved in educational policymaking at the federal and regional levels. There remains little empirical research surrounding the outcomes when NGOs engage in educational policymaking. The purpose of this research is to gain a better understanding of the effects on nations when NGOs engage in educational policymaking. This study is part of my Masters of Education degree and is the focus of my thesis.

For this research project, I will be conducting 6 one on one interviews of approximately 30-45 minutes in length. The interviews will be open ended in nature. I, the researcher, will approach potential interview participants directly or through an intermediary. The intermediary will be associated with your organization, institution or government office and will be familiar to participants. A digital recording device will be used to record the interviews. I will keep in strict confidence information obtained in interviews. While anonymity of identity within the bounds of the interview site may be impossible, I will keep individual participant contributions in strict confidence. I will endeavor to hold interviews in a location that is approved by the participant and which will allow participants to remain anonymous.

I will comply with the University of Alberta Standards for the Protection of Human Research Participants
http://www.uofaweb.ualberta.ca/gfcpolicymanual/policymanualsection66.cfm.

Dr. Ali A. Abdi, the research supervisor, will sign a confidentiality agreement in order to ensure that all data is kept confidential.

All interview data will be typed and sent back to participants for them to verify and make any additions or deletions that they wish. Also, participants will be given the opportunity to verify or reject my researcher interpretations of their comments made in the interviews.

Participants have the right:
- o To not participate in this research.
- o To opt out without penalty and to have any collected data withdrawn from the data base and not included in the study. Participants or their parents/guardians may contact myself or my research supervisor Ali A. Abdi if they wish to opt out of the research. This may be done verbally, via email, via telephone, or in writing. Contact information is listed at the end of this information letter. Participants may opt out of this research up until two weeks after member checks have been sent to participants for feedback.
- o To privacy, anonymity and confidentiality.
- o To safeguards for security of data (data are to be kept in a secure place for a minimum of 5 years following completion of research project) and when appropriate destroyed in a way that ensures privacy and confidentiality.
- o To disclosure of the presence of any apparent or actual conflict of interest on the part of the researcher(s).
- o To a copy of a report of the research findings. If participants are interested in a copy of the research report, they may let me know verbally or in writing, and I will keep a record of this and send a research report to participants via email.

The findings from this research may be used in research articles, conference presentations, book chapters, or web postings. All data will be handled in compliance with the University of Alberta Standards for the Protection of Human Research Participants.

You are invited to sign this consent letter in the space provided below once you read the following guidelines for participation:

- • As a research participant, you are asked to sign this consent letter to participate.
- • You will have the right to refrain from answering any particular questions, and you will have the right to opt out of the research without penalty. If you do choose to opt out of the research, you may do so at any time during the data collection phase, and up until two weeks after members check have been sent to participants for feedback.
- • Processes to provide accuracy of data, security, confidentiality, and anonymity are implemented in the design of the study. A technical

recording device will be used to ensure accuracy of data collected from the interviews. Security and confidentiality measures will be implemented, including the back up of data, secure storage of tapes, and a plan for deleting electronic and taped data.

- Only the researcher and her supervisor will have access to data and information. To ensure anonymity, pseudonyms will be used.
- You agree that I can use information in secondary writing beyond the research report, which includes such writing as conference papers, book chapters, or journal articles. The same ethical considerations and safeguards will apply to secondary uses of data.
- You will be able to review research material as part of an iterative process. You will be provided with drafts of analyses for your correction, amendment, and editing. Your interpretations, resistances, and challenges will be taken into account in rewriting and editing processes.
- You may request to be provided with a copy of the research report culminating from this study.

The plan for this study has been reviewed for its adherence to ethical guidelines and approved by the Faculties of Education, Extension, Augustana and Campus Saint Jean Research Ethics Board (EEASJ REB) at the University of Alberta. For questions regarding participant rights and ethical conduct of research, contact the Chair of the EEASJ REB c/o (780) 492-2614.

Contact Information for this research project:

Thashika Pillay
Graduate Student Researcher
7-104 Education North
Department of Educational Policy
Studies University of Alberta
Edmonton, AB
T6G 2G5
(780) 885-5222
pillay@ualberta.ca

Dr. Ali A. Abdi
Research Supervisor
7-115 Education North
Department of Educational Policy
University of Alberta
Edmonton, AB
T6G 2G5
Phone: 780-492-6819
Fax: 780-492-2024
aabdi@ualberta.ca

_____

I consent to participate in a research project entitled ***The Role of NGOs in Educational Policymaking in Ethiopia***

Participant's Print Name: _____

Signature: _____ Date: _____

I would like a copy of the final research report and Thashika Pillay can provide me with this report via the following contact method:

Participant's contact details:

_____
_____
_____
_____
_____

Researcher's Print Name: ***Thashika Pillay***

Signature: _____ Date: _____

Hello [Participant's Name]:

Thanks you for agreeing to do this interview with me. I have a few questions which I would like to ask. The interview should not take more than 45 minutes. At any time during the interview you may stop the interview. You also do not need to answer any question which you are uncomfortable with. If at any time between now and two weeks after you have been sent member checks for feedback, you decide that you do not want to be a part of this study, you may contact me or my research supervisor using the contact details I have provided to withdraw from the study. During the interview, feel free to ask for any clarification that you require.

Do you have any questions before I begin?

1. Can you describe examples of the work being done by NGOs in the education sector in Ethiopia?

2. What do you think should be the role of NGOs in the education sector? Why?

3. What do you think is or should be the role of NGOs in educational policymaking?

These questions are conversation starters. Depending on how participants answer the above questions, I (the researcher) will ask follow up probing questions.