Long-term grazing effects on soil greenhouse gases emission and soil microbial communities of Alberta grasslands

by

Ekaterina Stolnikova

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Science

in

Rangeland and Wildlife Resources

Department of Agriculture, Food and Nutritional Science University of Alberta

© Ekaterina Stolnikova, 2018

# Abstract

Grasslands cover a large area of the terrestrial surface and their soils store vast amounts of carbon (C) and nitrogen (N). Small changes in the processes driving C and N cycling can lead to either sequestration of these elements or their release as greenhouse gases (GHG) into the atmosphere. While livestock grazing is the primary use of grasslands worldwide, its effect on soil GHG fluxes and soil microbial communities remains unclear, especially in northern temperate grasslands. This thesis reports on the effect of long-term cattle grazing on soil GHG fluxes and soil microbial communities across the grasslands of Alberta, Canada (Central Parkland, CP; Dry Mixedgrass, MG; Foothills Fescue, FF subregions), over two growing seasons (2015 and 2016).

Using static chambers and gas chromatography, the CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes from soils were measured. Livestock grazing itself did not affect cumulative GHG fluxes in either year. However, the cumulative CO<sub>2</sub> emission was altered by a grazing and year interaction, being relatively lower from grazed than non-grazed areas in the dry year, while the opposite was true during the wet year. Among subregions the lowest cumulative CO<sub>2</sub> was observed within MG. The soil microbial communities (bacterial, archaeal and fungal) was quantitatively and qualitatively assessed using quantitative polymerase chain reaction and high-throughput sequencing. Livestock grazing did not affect the abundance of bacterial and archaeal communities, or richness and beta diversity in either year. However, fungal alpha diversity was lower in grazed areas during the dry year, but greater in the same areas during the wet year. Also, richness of bacterial and archaeal communities was greater within MG, while their abundance was greater within FF.

Overall this study showed that light to moderate long-term grazing had limited impact on soil GHG fluxes and soil microbial communities, compared to non-grazed areas of the

ii

grasslands, while regional characteristics (climatic conditions) and soil properties had a greater impact.

"We know more about the movement of celestial bodies than about the soil underfoot"

Leonardo Da Vinci, circa 1500's

# Acknowledgments

I would like to thank my supervisors, Dr. Cameron Carlyle and Dr. Edward Bork, for their guidance, motivation and patience during my study. I would also like to thank my committee members, Dr. Benjamin Willing and Dr. Scott Chang, for their valuable advises regarding research and suggestions for improvement.

I am thankful to many people, whose inspiration and support allowed me to reach the finish line. It is pleasure to thank, Casey Carlisle, Mariem Oloroso, Kate Herauf, Jessica Roberts, Logan Fairgrieve-Park and Stanislav Lebedev, who provided extensive assistance in the field and laboratory. I am particularly grateful to Dr. Willing's group, especially Tingting Ju, Dr. Janelle Fouhse, Jinghong Kang and Benjamin Bourrie, who shared their knowledge and research experience with me. Many thanks to Dr. Chang's group, namely Dr. Mark Baah-Acheamfour and Dr. Jin-Hyeob Kwak. Also, I am thankful to Dr. Daniel Hewins and Dr. Karen Thompson; graduate students, Sean Chuan, Lysandra Pyle, Faezeh Najafi, Monica Kohler and Jessica Grenke; AFNS staff, Dr. Urmila Basu, Dr. Kelvin Lien, Lisa Raatz and Robin Miles for useful advice and help with various aspects of my research.

Finally, thank you to my family, who supported me all the time.

This project was funded by Alberta Livestock Meat Agency (ALMA).

# **Table of Contents**

Abstract	ii
Acknowledgments	v
List of Figures	. viii
List of Tables	X
Chapter 1. Literature review	1
1.1. Overview	1
1.2. Grasslands of Alberta, Canada	2
1.3. Grasslands management in Alberta, Canada	3
1.4. Grazing effect on grasslands	3
1.5. Greenhouse gases and grassland soils	4
1.6. Soil microbial communities of grasslands	5
1.7. Thesis format and research objectives	6
Chapter 2. Effect of long-term grazing on greenhouse gas fluxes in northern temperate grassla	ands
	8
2.1. Introduction	8
2.2. Materials and methods	10
2.2.1. Study sites	10
2.2.2. Gas sampling and measurements	12
2.2.3. Calculations	13
2.2.4. Soil sampling and analysis	. 14
2.2.5 Climatic conditions soil temperature and soil water content measurements	15
2.2.6. Statistical data analysis	15
2 3 Results	17
2.3.1 Climatic conditions and soil properties	17
2.3.2. GHG fluxes	18
2.3.2. Giro nuxes	19
2.3.4 GHG and environmental conditions	20
2.4 Discussion	21
2.4.1 Long-term grazing effect on GHG	21
2.4.1. Long term grazing enect on one and interview in GHG flux	24
2.4.2. Geographical and temporal variability in Grio nux	24
Chapter 3 Long-term grazing effect on soil microbial communities of Alberta grasslands	20
3.1 Introduction	
3.2 Materials and methods	+5
3.2.1 Study locations	+5
3.2.2. Soil compling and DNA extraction	<del>т</del> .) Лб
3.2.2. Son sampling and DIVA extraction (aPCP)	+0
2.2.4. Next generation sequencing (NGS)	<del></del> /
2.2.5 Disinformatics analysis	<del>4</del> 0
2.2.6. Statistical analysis	
2 2 Degulto	
2.2.1 Abundance of bacteria archaes and fungi	52
2.2.2. Sail water content and bacterial archaeol and fungal abundance	52
2.2.2. Doptorial ambagal and fungal towar are a barratoristica	
5.5.5. Dacterial, archaeal and lungal taxonomic characteristics	33

3.3.4. Alpha diversity metrics of bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities	55
3.3.5. Beta diversity metrics of bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities	58
3.3.6. Indicator species- and differential abundance analyses	59
3.4. Discussion	60
3.4.1. Long-term grazing effect on soil microbial communities	60
3.4.2. Regional effect on soil microbial communities	63
3.5. Summary	64
Chapter 4. General discussion and conclusion	88
References	92
Appendices	102

# List of Figures

<b>Fig 2.1.</b> Location of the study sites in the Central Parkland, Dry Mixedgrass and Foothills Fescue subregions of Alberta, Canada
<b>Fig. 2.2.</b> Mean annual precipitation (MAP, A) and mean annual temperature (MAT, B) for the Central Parkland (CP), Dry Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions during 2015 and 2016. Horizontal lines within each subregion represent the MAP and MAT from Downing and Pettapiece, 2006
<b>Fig. 2.3.</b> Consumption rates of CH <sub>4</sub> between grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments and Central Parkland (CP), Dry Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions in 2016. Different lowercase letters indicate 2-way interaction between treatments and subregions 37
<b>Fig. 2.4.</b> $CO_2$ emission rates (kg C ha <sup>-1</sup> d <sup>-1</sup> ± standard error) during 2015 (A) and 2016 (B) from northern temperate grasslands of the Great Plains
<b>Fig. 2.5.</b> Consumption rates of CH <sub>4</sub> (g C ha <sup>-1</sup> d <sup>-1</sup> $\pm$ standard error) in 2015 (A) and 2016 (B) from northern temperate grasslands of the Great Plains
<b>Fig. 2.6.</b> Cumulative CO <sub>2</sub> emission (A), cumulative CH <sub>4</sub> consumption (B) in each of 2015 and 2016 from northern temperate grasslands of the Great Plains. Different lowercase letters indicate (A) 2-way interaction between grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments and years; (B) 2-way interaction between and Central Parkland (CP), Dry Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions and years
<b>Fig. 2.7.</b> Relationship between soil water content ( $m^3 m^{-3}$ ) and carbon dioxide (CO <sub>2</sub> ) emission (kg C ha <sup>-1</sup> d <sup>-1</sup> ) in 2015 (A) and 2016 (B, C) and CH <sub>4</sub> consumption (g C ha <sup>-1</sup> d <sup>-1</sup> ) in 2015 (D) and 2016 (E, F)
<b>Fig. 2.8.</b> Relationship between soil temperature (°C) and carbon dioxide (CO <sub>2</sub> ) emission (kg C ha <sup>-1</sup> d <sup>-1</sup> ) in 2015 (A) and 2016 (B, C), as well as CH <sub>4</sub> consumption in 2016 (D)
<b>Fig. 3.1.</b> Abundance of soil bacteria (B, gene copies per gram of soil, dry weight) in grassland soils of Alberta, Canada. (A) different lowercase letters indicate significant differences for the 3-way interaction between grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments, Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions, and month in 2015; (B) different lowercase letters indicate significant differences for the 2-way interaction between months and Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions in 2016. Vertical bars represent ± standard error
<b>Fig. 3.2.</b> Abundance of soil archaea (gene copies per gram of soil, dry weight) in grassland soils of Alberta, Canada in 2015. Vertical bars represent ± standard error
<b>Fig. 3.3.</b> Abundance of soil fungi (gene copies per gram of soil, dry weight) in grassland soils of Alberta, Canada. ( <i>A</i> ) different lowercase letters indicate significant differences for the 2-way interaction between months and Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions in 2015; ( <i>B</i> ) different lowercase letters indicate significant differences for the 3-way interaction between grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments, Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions and months in 2016. Vertical bars represent $\pm$ standard error

**Fig. 3.4.** Relationship between gravimetric soil water content (GWC) and the abundance of soil bacteria (B) in 2015 (A, B, C) and 2016 (D, E, F). (A) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions in 2015; (B) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and months in 2015; (C) represents the 3-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2015; (D) represents the overall interaction between GWC and bacterial abundance in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and bacterial abundance in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (C) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016. Only significant lines are presented in the graphs C and F....... 81

**Fig. 3.10.** Fungal community composition differences between the NG and G treatments in 2015 (A) and 2016 (B). Differences were calculated using the DESeq2 package in R as log2(NG/G). Negative values indicate higher representation of the individual family under long-term grazing.

# List of Tables

<b>Table 2.1.</b> Main characteristics of the studied subregions according to Downing and Pettapiece,   2006
<b>Table 2.2.</b> Grassland soil properties (0-5 cm mineral layer) and ANOVA test output for long-term grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments for the three subregions of Alberta. The valuesrepresent mean $\pm$ standard error
<b>Table 2.3.</b> Effect of long-term grazing treatment exposure, geographic (subregion) variability,and their interactions, on the measured soil temperature and water content of northern temperateGreat Plains grasslands during each of 2015 and 2016.30
<b>Table 2.4.</b> Effect of long-term grazing treatment exposure, geographic (subregion) and temporal (sampling date) variation, as well as their interactions, on the emission rates of carbon dioxide (CO <sub>2</sub> ), methane (CH <sub>4</sub> ) and nitrous oxide (N <sub>2</sub> O) from soils of the northern temperate Great Plains grasslands during each of 2015 and 2016
<b>Table 2.5.</b> Effect of long-term grazing, spatial (subregion) and temporal (year) variabilities aswell as their interactions, on the cumulative emission of carbon dioxide ( $CO_2$ ), methane ( $CH_4$ )and nitrous oxide ( $N_2O$ ) from rangeland soils in Alberta, Canada.32
<b>Table 2.6.</b> Effect of soil moisture and its interaction with grazing treatment (G/NG) and geographic subregions, on the emission of carbon dioxide (CO <sub>2</sub> ), methane (CH <sub>4</sub> ) and nitrous oxide (N <sub>2</sub> O) from northern temperate Great Plains grassland soils during 2015 and 2016
<b>Table 2.7.</b> Effect of soil temperature and its interactions with grazing treatment (G/NG) geographic subregion, on the emission of carbon dioxide (CO <sub>2</sub> ), methane (CH <sub>4</sub> ) and nitrous oxide (N <sub>2</sub> O) of northern temperate Great Plains grassland soils during 2015 and 2016
<b>Table 3.1.</b> Description of the primers used for the quantitative polymerase chain reaction (qPCR) and next-generation sequencing (NGS).
<b>Table 3.2.</b> Results of a mixed-model testing the effects of long-term grazing, geographicallocation (subregion) and temporal (monthly) variability, and their interactions, on abundance(gene copies per gram of soil, dry weight) of bacteria, archaea and fungi in rangeland soils ofAlberta, Canada
<b>Table 3.3.</b> Results of a mixed-model testing the effects of soil water content (GWP), long-termgrazing, geographic location (subregions), temporal (months) variabilities, and their interactions,on the bacterial, archaeal and fungal abundance within rangeland soils of Alberta, Canada in2015 and 2016
<b>Table 3.4.</b> Results of a mixed-model testing the effects of long-term grazing, geographic location(subregion) and temporal (month) variability, and their interactions, on alpha diversitycharacteristics of the bacterial community in rangeland soils of Alberta, Canada
<b>Table 3.5.</b> Results of a mixed-model testing the effects of long-term grazing, geographic location(subregion) and temporal (month) variability, and their interactions, on alpha diversitycharacteristics of the archaeal community in rangeland soils of Alberta, Canada.70
<b>Table 3.6.</b> Results of a mixed-model testing the effects of long-term grazing, geographic location(subregion) and temporal (month) variability, and their interactions, on alpha diversitycharacteristics of the fungal community in rangeland soils of Alberta, Canada.71

<b>Table 3.7.</b> Results of permutational analysis of variance (Bray-Curtis distance) testing the effectof treatment (grazed / non-grazed), geographic location (subregion) and temporal (month)variability, and their interactions, on each of the bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities inrangeland soils of Alberta, Canada.72
<b>Table 3.8.</b> Summary findings of long-term grazing effect on the abundance (qPCR), richness(observed OTUs), alpha diversity (Shannon and Simpson diversity indexes) and beta diversity(Bray-Curtis, unweighted UniFrac, weighted UniFrac) measures of soil bacterial (B), archaeal(A) and fungal (F) communities.73
<b>Table 3.9.</b> Indicator OTUs analysis of soil bacterial communities associated with grazed andnon-grazed treatments in 2015 and 2016.74
<b>Table 3.10.</b> Indicator OTUs analysis for soil fungal communities associated with grazed andnon-grazed treatments in 2015 and 2016.76

# List of Symbols and Abbreviations

ACIS, Alberta Climate Information Service BD, bulk density bp, base pair C, carbon C/N, carbon to nitrogen ratio CH<sub>4</sub>, methane CO<sub>2</sub>, carbon dioxide CP, Central Parkland DNA, deoxyribonucleic acid FF, Foothills Fescue G, grazing GHG, greenhouse gases GWC, gravimetric water content GWP, global warming potential ISA, indicator species analysis ITS, internal transcribed spacer km, kilometer MAP, mean annual precipitation MAT, mean annual temperature MG, Dry Mixedgrass N, nitrogen N<sub>2</sub>O, nitrous oxide NG, non-grazed NS, Natural Subregion OTU, operational taxonomic unit PCR, polymerase chain reaction qPCR, quantitative polymerase chain reaction SOC, soil organic carbon SON, soil organic nitrogen TN, total nitrogen

#### **Chapter 1. Literature review**

# 1.1. Overview

The three main greenhouse gases (GHG) that accumulate in the atmosphere, alter the Earth's radiative balance and cause "global warming", are carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>), methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) and nitrous oxide (N<sub>2</sub>O; Oertel et al., 2016). Since the late 1700s, when the industrial era began, the concentration of these gases has increased on 40, 20 and 150% and reached the level of ~400, 2 and 0.3 ppm for CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O, respectively (IPCC, 2014). Thus, rising concentrations of GHG in the atmosphere and global climate change increase the need for data about the global carbon (C) and nitrogen (N) cycles (LeCain et al., 2002).

Grasslands cover up to 40% of the Earth's terrestrial surface and play an important role in global biogeochemical cycles of C and N (Wu et al., 2010). The upper meter of grassland soils can store 100 and 10 Mg (10<sup>6</sup> gram) per hectare of soil organic carbon (SOC) and soil organic nitrogen (SON), respectively, with the potential to sequester more under proper management (Jobbágy and Jackson, 2000; Piñeiro et al., 2010). This potential is an opportunity to remove GHG from the atmosphere, and thereby mitigate climate change (Soussana et al., 2010; Follett and Reed, 2010). On the other hand, due to ongoing biological processes grassland soils can produce GHG with the resulting magnitude of gas emission or consumption dependent, in part, on land use (Leahy et al., 2004; Liebig et al., 2010). Livestock grazing is the primary use of grasslands worldwide, however, the role that it plays in altering GHG exchange between soil and atmosphere remains unclear (Bremer et al., 1998; Liebig et al., 2010; Healy et al., 1996; Shi et al., 2017).

#### 1.2. Grasslands of Alberta, Canada

Alberta's landscape is the most diverse of any region in North America (Downing and Pettapiece, 2006). The province was divided into 6 Natural Regions and subdivided into 21 Natural Subregions, which provided an ecological context for the planning resource management activities in the province (Downing and Pettapiece, 2006). More than 70% of Alberta's grazing lands are located within the Grassland and Parkland Natural Regions (Alberta Agriculture and Forestry, 2015). In this study, I focused on three subregions within these two Natural Regions. The Dry Mixedgrass and Foothills Fescue Natural Subregions both lay within the Grassland Natural Region. The Dry Mixedgrass subregion is located in the south-east corner of the province and is characterized by high temperatures and low summer precipitation that lead to large moisture deficits, and low-growing and drought-tolerant mixed grass vegetation (Adams et al., 2013). The dominant soil type in this region is a Brown Chernozem, which forms with low organic matter input into the soil and high mean annual temperatures (Downing and Pettapiece, 2006). The Foothills Fescue is the wettest Natural Subregion and is characterized by cool summers and higher precipitation. The dominant vegetation is diverse and productive (Adams et al., 2003). Black Chernozem is the main soil type within the subregion, which forms with high organic matter input into the soil and moderate temperatures (Alberta Environment and Parks, 2015). The largest Natural Subregion within the Parkland Region is the Central Parkland, covering 88% of the Region. This area is a broad transitional zone located between the cool, moist boreal forests to the north and dry, warm grasslands to the south and thus is a matrix of aspen forest, shrubland and grassland. The dominant soil type is Black Chernozem (Downing and Pettapiece, 2006). More detailed description of the subregions, e.g. plant community composition, is provided in Chapter 2 of the thesis. The diversity and uniqueness of the

grasslands in Alberta allows to reveal response to long-term grazing under various conditions, which might be variable across the province.

# 1.3. Grasslands management in Alberta, Canada

Grazing by large herbivores is the natural conditions of the World's rangelands (LeCain et al., 2000). Bison were the dominant grazer in the Canadian prairies until 1880, at which time they were extirpated (Willms et al., 2011). In 1881, there were only 9000 cattle in the northwest of Canada, but this number increased markedly thereafter with advancing European settlement (Wang et al., 2014). From 1911 to 1941, the number of cattle doubled and reached 1.35 M, which led to overgrazing (Willms et al., 2011). Grasslands deterioration was further exacerbated by a 12-year drought lasting from 1917 to 1930 that in turn, increased soil erosion. All of these factors together, heavy and unregulated grazing pressure, coupled with an extended drought, affected soil quality and led to high losses of soil organic carbon (Wang et al., 2014). Since then, government land managers and livestock producers have both gained much knowledge about the agronomic and ecological impacts of grazing, which pushed them to the develop an improved grazing management practices, which included regulating of grazing duration, frequency and intensity (Wang et al., 2014).

# 1.4. Grazing effect on grasslands

Livestock grazing can affect grasslands in many ways by defoliation, nutrient redistribution (dung and / or urine deposition) and trampling (Liu et al., 2015). Duration, frequency and intensity of grazing are the factors that determine and regulate all above- and belowground processes in grasslands (Hodel et al., 2014, Bardgett and Cook, 1998). Over

stocking lead to plant groundcover reduction, increase wind and water soil erosion, which leads to losses of soil organic carbon and nutrients, breaks soil pore continuity, which reduces water infiltration and air permeability (Eyles et al., 2015; Greenwood and McKenzie, 2001; Liebig et al., 2014). Whereas, good grazing management practice improve the productivity of grasslands, soil health and nutrient cycling (Liebig et al., 2014; Follet and Reed, 2010). These effects are apparent in Alberta, high intensity grazing in early spring reduced vegetation cover and soil organic matter, and increased bare ground, while light intensity of grazing did not change these factors (Naeth et al., 1991). Similarly, 45-years of high intensity grazing in Alberta's fescue grassland decreased fertility and water-holding capacity, while light grazing provided better soil characteristics (Dormaar and Willms, 1998). Thus, grazing itself is a tool to control and maintain soils quality and ecosystem functionality, as well as goods and services provided by grasslands (Sanjari et al., 2008).

#### **1.5. Greenhouse gases and grassland soils**

Soils of grasslands are an important component of the global biogeochemical cycles as they have wide geographical distribution and can store more than 100 and 10 Mg ( $1Mg = 10^6$ gram) ha<sup>-1</sup> of C and N in their top meter (Conant et al., 2005; Jobbágy and Jackson, 2000; Piñeiro et al., 2010). Ongoing biological processes in soils lead to generation or consumption of the major greenhouse gases, namely CO<sub>2</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> (Baldock et al., 2012). Carbon dioxide is emitted into the atmosphere through respiration of soil microorganisms, which use an organic material as a source of energy and nutrients, and roots (Conrad, 1996). Methanogens and methanotrophs are responsible for the production and consumption of methane, respectively (Conrad, 1996). Nitrous oxide is generated in soils due to nitrogen transformation by

microorganisms during the processes of nitrification (conversion of ammonium to nitrate) and denitrification (conversion of nitrate to N<sub>2</sub>O and N<sub>2</sub>; Wrage et al., 2001). However, the exchange rate of the gases between soil and atmosphere depends on management practice and consequently, soil properties (Conant, 2010; Smith et al., 2003; Oertel et al., 2016). Thus, management of the duration, frequency and intensity of livestock grazing, which can alter soil properties, regulates the potential of grassland soils to reduce or enhance greenhouse gases concentration and as a result the magnitude of climate change (Baldock et al., 2012). However, there is inconsistent information regarding livestock grazing effects on GHG emission which does not enable a clear determination of the role grasslands and grazing play in regulating global GHG flux (Leahy et al., 2004; Wang and Fang, 2009; Liebig et al., 2010). These contradictory results of GHG emissions from grasslands, besides history and management of grazing, might be also associated with variable features of study sites, including climatic and hydrological conditions (Wang and Fang, 2009; Chen et al., 2015; Oertel et al., 2016).

# 1.6. Soil microbial communities of grasslands

Studying the soil microbial community is a challenging task as soil is a complex and variable system, which supports an enormous diversity of soil microorganisms (Tiedje et al., 1999). Moreover, less than 1% of the community has been cultivated or characterized, which is commonly known as "the great plate count anomaly", and thus, soil still can be considered as a "black box" in terms of our understanding of the microbial community and the processes it regulates (Torsvik and Øvreås, 2002; Staley and Konopka, 1985). Next-generation sequencing (NGS) technologies revolutionized the area of microbial ecology, as they enable a comprehensive analysis of microbial communities and provide insight into their interaction with

the environment (Boughner and Singh, 2016; Shokralla et al., 2012). Prokaryotes (bacteria and archaea) and eukaryotes (fungi) are involved in a wide range of soil biochemical processes, such as nutrients transformation and cycling, maintain the sustainability of an ecosystem (Wagg et al., 2014; Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2016; Bardgett and Putten, 2014). In particular, soil microorganisms play an important role in climate regulation through their key role in soil processes, which lead to either consumption or formation of GHG (Classen et al., 2015). Grassland soils maintain a vast and diverse community of microorganisms (Bardgett and Cook, 1998; Macdonald et al., 2015); however, they remain poorly characterized (Evans et al., 2017; Griffin, 2016). Additionally, the impact of domestic livestock grazing on the community composition and abundance of soil bacteria, archaea and fungi is not well studied and results of previous studies are inconsistent across various microbial groups and different grazing intensities (Brussaard et al., 1997; Aldezabal et al., 2015; Eldridge et al., 2017; Radl et al., 2007; Chroňáková et al., 2009; Jirout et al., 2011; Elhottová et al. 2012; Chroňáková et al., 2013; Chroňáková et al., 2015; Gou et al., 2015; Huhe et al., 2017; Zhou et al., 2010; Qu et al., 2016). However, knowing the effect of cattle on these microbial groups is critical to understanding effects on ecosystem function, maintaining ecosystem sustainability and overall, human wellbeing (Eldridge et al. 2017).

#### 1.7. Thesis format and research objectives

The overall goal of the research presented in this thesis was to investigate the effects of long-term livestock grazing on soil GHG emissions and soil microbial communities in Alberta's grasslands. The research was divided into two distinct parts.

The first study (Chapter 2) investigated whether livestock grazing altered emissions of GHG from grassland soils in northern temperate grasslands of Alberta, and if so, what is the direction and magnitude of this alteration? Specific objectives were to (i) estimate and compare emission rates of CO<sub>2</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> from rangeland soils exposed to long-term grazing and grazing exclusion across a broad climatic gradient, (ii) evaluate cumulative GHG emission in relation to long-term grazing history.

The second study (Chapter 3) investigated the effect of grazing on soil microbial communities, in particular, the bacterial, fungal and archaeal communities. Specific objectives for this study were to (i) to assess abundance of bacteria, archaea and fungi in soil samples collected from grazed and non-grazed subplots from the three natural subregions of Alberta in 2015 and 2016 (ii) to examine the diversity of the bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities in grazed grassland soils in comparison with non-grazed treatment.

Chapter 4 is a synthesis of the work conducted, and reviews management implications for ranchers and policy makers interested in mitigating atmospheric GHG, and discusses future research needs.

# Chapter 2. Effect of long-term grazing on greenhouse gas fluxes in northern temperate grasslands

# 2.1. Introduction

Grasslands cover up to 40% of the Earth terrestrial surface and they are a significant component of the global C and N cycles (LeCain et al., 2002; Wu et al., 2010). The upper meter of grassland soils can store 100 and 10 Mg (1 Mg =  $10^6$  gram) per hectare of soil organic carbon (SOC) and soil organic nitrogen (SON), respectively (Jobbágy and Jackson, 2000; Piñeiro et al., 2010). Even small changes in the processes driving soil cycles of C and N might alter the magnitude of soil fluxes and lead to releasing of large amounts of GHG into the atmosphere (Johnston et al., 2004; Mohammed, 2015). Livestock grazing is the primary use of grasslands worldwide (Bremer et al., 1998; Fynn et al., 2010). Duration, frequency and intensity of livestock grazing might alter plant productivity, soil physical and chemical properties (Greenwood and McKenzie, 2001) which, in turn, regulate biogeochemical cycling of C and N within the grasslands, the balance between C and N input (e.g. photosynthesis) and the output (gaseous C and N release; Piñeiro et al., 2010; Roy and Misra, 2005). While grasslands can mitigate climate change through their potential for C and N sequestration (Wu et al., 2010; Conant et al., 2005; Follett and Reed, 2010; Piñeiro et al., 2010; Soussana et al., 2010), however, the role that livestock grazing plays in altering gaseous C and N losses from grassland ecosystems remains unclear (Bremer et al., 1998; Liebig et al., 2010; Healy et al., 1996; Shi et al., 2017). However, the understanding of livestock grazing effect on the C and N release is essential to assess the contribution of grazed lands into the global C and N cycles and budgeting (Cao et al., 2004).

Biological transformation of C and N compounds in soils lead to emission or consumption of GHG, which are causing climate change through their rising concentrations in the atmosphere and alteration to the Earth's radiative balance (Abbasi and Müller, 2011; Oertel et al., 2016; IPCC, 2014). The most common GHG in the agriculture sector are carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>), methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) and nitrous oxide (N<sub>2</sub>O) (Asgedom and Kebreab, 2011; Soussana et al., 2010). While CO<sub>2</sub> is the most abundant (400 vs. 0.3 and 2 ppm for CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O, respectively) and longest lasting (300 vs. 12 and 120 years for CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O, respectively) gas in the atmosphere, the global warming potential (GWP) over a 100-year period for CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O is 25 and 298 times higher than that for CO<sub>2</sub> (Oertel et al., 2016; Abbasi and Müller, 2011). Soil respiration, which includes heterotrophic and autotrophic sources, is the primary pathway for CO<sub>2</sub> release to the atmosphere (Wang and Fang, 2009). The net-exchange of CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O between soil and atmosphere is a result of gas consumption and production processes, namely methanogenesis and methanotrophy for CH<sub>4</sub>, and denitrification and nitrification for N<sub>2</sub>O (Conrad, 1996; Flechard et al., 2007).

There is no global consensus on the effect of livestock grazing on GHG fluxes within grassland soils, with some studies demonstrating increased fluxes (Frank et al., 2002; LeCain et al., 2000), others no effect (Risch and Frank, 2006), and yet others showing reduced emission (Samal et al., 2015; Bremer et al., 1998) in comparison with soils without grazing. Relatively few studies have examined GHG in northern temperate grasslands of the Great Plains, and those that have were typically done at few locations (Gao et al., 2017, Thomas et al., 2018). Thus, the widespread effect of grazing on GHG from soils of the region remain poorly understood. Given that grasslands occupy a vast area with a diversity of grassland types, and that GHG emissions or

consumption from the area may be large, a quantitative assessment of the GHG under livestock grazing is necessary.

The objectives of this study were to (i) compare emission rates of  $CO_2$ ,  $N_2O$  and  $CH_4$  from grassland soils with a long-term history of light to moderate cattle grazing to soils where grazing had been excluded, across a broad climatic gradient, (ii) evaluate cumulative GHG emission in relation to long-term grazing history.

#### 2.2. Materials and methods

#### 2.2.1. Study sites

The study was conducted across south-central Alberta, Canada within three different natural subregions, including the Central Parkland (CP), Dry Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) (Fig. 2.1; Downing and Pettapiece, 2006). These subregions represent major grasslands of the northern temperate Great Plains with wide ranging climatic conditions, soil types, vegetation composition and topography (Table 2.1). Briefly, the main features of the MG subregion is high temperatures and low precipitation during the summer as well as dominance of low-growing drought tolerant vegetation (Adams et al., 2013). The dominant vegetation is a *Stipa-Bouteloua-Agropyron* community, which is resilient to low grazing stocking rates (Dormaar et al., 1997) The main soil type is a Brown Chernozem, which forms with low organic matter input into soil and high mean annual temperatures (Downing and Pettapiece, 2006). The FF is the wettest subregion, which characterized by cooler summers with higher precipitation level. The dominant vegetation is diverse and productive, including *Festuca campestris* and *Danthonia parryi* (Chuan et al., 2018; Adams et al., 2003). Black Chernozem is the main soil type, which forms with high organic matter input into the soil and moderate temperatures (Alberta Environment and Parks, 2015). The CP is a broad transitional zone located between the cool, moist boreal forests to the north and dry, warm grasslands to the south. Vegetation represents a matrix of forests, shrublands and grasslands, including *Populus tremuloides*, *Symphoricarpos occidentalis*, *Festuca hallii*, *Hesperostipa curtiseta*, *Pascopyrum smithii*, *Koeleria macrantha* (Chuan et al., 2018). The dominant soil type is Black Chernozem (Downing and Pettapiece, 2006). Livestock grazing has been an important land use across these regions for the past 140 years since European settlement (Willms et al., 2011).

Fifteen locations were examined in this study, with five in each natural subregion (Fig. 2.1). Of the sites, 12 were on public land and part of the Alberta Rangeland Reference Area program, a long-term monitoring program of ongoing grazing impacts on grasslands vegetation (Willoughby et al., 2004). Two additional locations were at the University of Alberta Mattheis and Kinsella Research Ranches, and one other location was on private land. Each location included a fenced area that excluded cattle, and was compared to the surrounding grasslands that had been annually grazed by cattle, typically during the summer growing season (late May-October). Exclosures were rectangular or circular in shape and varied in size from 0.05 to 0.2 ha, varied in age from construction between 15 and 60 years (Willoughby et al., 2004). Studied subplots were established on areas with a uniform ecosite (aspect, slope, soil texture). This study design created a total of 30 subplots, half of which were non-grazed (NG), with each paired to a grazed (G) subplot on the same ecosite in a blocked design. There was no specific information available on the localized stocking rates associated with grazing within each grazed subplot as the large size of each pasture did not ensure uniform use throughout. However, cattle stocking rates on all pastures containing the exclosures were generally considered light to moderate, consistent with allowable grazing practices on public land in Alberta. Additionally, while

exclosures did not exclude wildlife (e.g., deer, elk, moose, antelope) from accessing them, the small size of exclosures was likely to limit use by these species (Knight et al., 2014).

# 2.2.2. Gas sampling and measurements

Two static chambers were installed randomly within each of the G and NG subplots at each location (Livingston and Hutchinson, 1995). To protect equipment from damage by cattle, wire cages (~1 m in diameter) were placed over each chamber after their installation in grazed areas (Gao et al., 2017; Baah-Acheamfour et al., 2016). However, chambers were removed from the ground during the winter of 2015-2016 to protect them from freeze-thaw damage, and reinstalled in 2016 at a new random location to avoid grazing exclusion effects created by the cages the previous year. Overall, 17 gas sampling events were performed at all sites during the course of two grazing seasons in 2015 (n=8 samplings) and 2016 (n=9 samplings), generally beginning in early to mid-May and ending in October (Appendix A). Because of the large area over which the study locations were distributed (260 km in latitude and 450 km in longitude), more frequent gas sampling was considered infeasible (Gao et al., 2017).

All chambers were permanently inserted into the ground to approximately 2-3 cm depth at least a day prior to the first sampling each year to avoid capture of gas emission splashes after soil disruption (Saurette et al., 2008). Each static chamber consisted of an acrylic base (17 cm wide x 15 cm high x 66 cm long) that lacked a bottom and was covered with a detachable lid. The lid was equipped with a sampling port with rubber septa 15 mm in diameter and fan (25 x 25 x 10 mm, ADDA, Orange, CA, USA). Lids were tightly clamped onto the chambers during gas sampling. Chambers and lids were covered with silver tape to reflect sunlight and thereby reduce warming of air inside chambers during the gas sampling (Rochette and Eriksen-Hamel, 2008). During each gas sampling event, 20 ml of air were taken at 0, 10, 20 and 30 minutes after the closure of the chamber, using 20 ml syringes fitted to 26G ½ needles (Becton Diskinson, Franklin Lakes, NJ, USA). The samples were then force-filled into pre-evacuated 12 ml glass exetainers® (Labco Ltd., Lampeter, CGN, UK). As removing of vegetation from the inside of chamber might imitate defoliation by cattle on the non-grazed subplots, we did not clip vegetation in the static gas chambers (Collier et al., 2016). A previous study showed limited difference in gas fluxes between chambers where vegetation was clipped or when vegetation was folded to fit in the chamber; however, the authors suggested estimation of biomass volume, when possible (Collier et al., 2016). In the present study, assessment of biomass was not possible, because chambers were installed permanently into the ground and biomass mass varied through the growing seasons.

Gas concentrations were subsequently measured by gas chromatography (Varian-3800, Varian Instruments, Palo Alto, CA, USA) in the laboratory no later than one week after sampling to prevent leakage and contamination of gas samples (Rochette and Eriksen-Hamel, 2008). The analyzer was equipped with a thermal conductivity-, flame ionization- and electron capture detectors to measure concentrations of CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O, respectively. To calibrate the gas chromatograph, certified standards of CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O were used (Praxair, Edmonton, AB, CA).

# 2.2.3. Calculations

The emission rate of gases was calculated using the equation provided by Saurette et al. (2008):

$$F = \frac{\Delta C \times T \times h}{\Delta t},$$

where *F* is the emission rate of CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub> or N<sub>2</sub>O (µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>),  $\Delta C / \Delta t$  is the slope of the gas concentration change over the 30 min measurement period (µmol mol<sup>-1</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>), *h* is the height of the chamber (m), and *T* is the air temperature adjustment for the molecular volume of gas (mol m<sup>-3</sup>). To prevent underestimation of gas fluxes, all data were fitted to both linear and quadratic models (Stolk et al., 2009; Silva et al., 2015). The model, and thus slope, was selected based on the highest adjusted R<sup>2</sup> (Baah-Acheamfour et al., 2016; Stolk et al., 2009; Silva et al., 2015). Afterwards, observed fluxes were converted to kg C ha<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>, g C ha<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup> and g N ha<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup> for CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O, respectively, using the corresponding molecular weight (g mol<sup>-1</sup>) of each gas.

To assess cumulative emission or consumption of each gas during 2015 and 2016, the area under the curve was calculated by summing mean gas fluxes for each interval multiplied by the number of days within each interval (Gao et al., 2017).

# 2.2.4. Soil sampling and analysis

Soil samples were collected in May, July and October of 2015 and 2016. During each sampling period ten soil cores were randomly collected from throughout each subplot from the 0-5 cm mineral soil layer using a soil corer 5 cm in diameter. Composite samples for each subplot were transported to the laboratory, where they were stored at -20 °C prior to further analysis. Soil pH was measured in a 1:2 soil-water mixture (Accumet® Basic A150, Fisher Scientific, Hampton, NH, USA). To determine soil organic carbon (SOC) and total nitrogen (TN) contents, soil samples were dried (60 °C), sieved (2 mm), ground to a fine powder using a ball mill (Spex<sup>TM</sup> SamplePrep 8000D, Metuchen, NJ, USA), treated with HCl to remove carbonates, and then analyzed using a LECO TruSpec C/N analyzer (LECO Corporation, Saint Joseph, MI, USA).

To determine bulk density (BD), two soil cores per subplot were collected from the 0-5 cm mineral soil layer using a 6 cm diameter soil corer in early August of 2016. Soil samples were placed into paper bags separately for each replicate and transported to the laboratory, where they were oven-dried (60 °C) to a constant weight. Values of BD were calculated by dividing the soil sample dry mass by the volume of the core, after removing any rocks and debris larger than 2 mm (i.e. larger size fraction was removed; Blake and Hartge, 1986).

# 2.2.5. Climatic conditions, soil temperature and soil water content measurements

Air temperature and precipitation data were downloaded from the Alberta Climate Information Service (ACIS) website (http://agriculture.alberta.ca) for both study years. The closest weather station to each of the 15 locations was selected and data were averaged for each subregion (n=5) for comparison to long-term norms. Additionally, to directly examine the relationship between environmental factors and GHG, soil volumetric water content (m<sup>3</sup> m<sup>-3</sup>) and temperature (°C) were continuously monitored at the 5 cm soil depth for each subplot using an automated data collection system (EM50, Decagon Devices Inc., Pullman, WA, USA) equipped with moisture and temperature sensors (5TE, Decagon Devices Inc., Pullman, WA, USA).

# 2.2.6. Statistical data analysis

All statistical analysis and graphical output were done using RStudio, version 1.0.136 (RStudio Inc., Boston, MA, USA). Differences were considered significant at p-values <0.10. Linear mixed-effect models were used to test the impact of historical grazing treatment (grazed

vs. non-grazed) on soil properties, emission or consumption rates of GHG, cumulative fluxes and GWP over the growing season.

As suggested by Gao et al. (2017), analyses of GHG emission rates need to be performed separately for each year to account for variation among the dates of gas sampling, fluctuations in weather and changes in chamber locations between years. Thus, data were analyzed separately for 2015 and 2016 to isolate effects of grazing treatments, as well as geographic (subregion) and temporal (sampling dates) variation, together with their interactions, on the GHG emission rates during each year. Treatment (grazed vs. non-grazed) and subregions were included as fixed effects, while sampling dates within a year were treated as a repeated measures fixed factor. Duplicate chambers within a subplot were averaged prior to analysis. Individual study sites nested within subregions and treatment subplots within sites were treated as random effects. To check the distribution of residuals and equality of variances for the models, diagnostic plots were used. CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O gas data were normalized with a normal quantile transformation applied (Moulin et al., 2014). While analyses were done on transformed data, original (non-transformed) data were presented in all tables and figures to maintain interpretability.

To compare the effect of long-term grazing on cumulative gas emission or consumption, the same model was applied as described above; however, year was considered the repeated measure factor (instead of individual sampling dates) to capture the overall effect of long-term grazing treatment between 2015 and 2016 (Gao et al., 2017). To make the data comparable between years, we examined only those data from the growing season of each year that had overlapping sampling periods, thereby ensuring that the number of days used to calculate cumulative fluxes were the same for each year.

Soil pH, SOC and C/N ratio from the three sampling periods in each of the two years were averaged, as were the two replicate values for bulk density, prior to statistical analysis. Treatments and subregions were considered as fixed factors in the model, while individual study sites nested within subregions and treatment subplots within sites were treated as random effects. To test the effects of soil moisture, soil temperature and their separate interactions with grazing treatments and subregion on GHG emissions, the latter were fit to a linear fixed-effect model, where random effects were as described above.

#### 2.3. Results

# 2.3.1. Climatic conditions and soil properties

Climatic conditions varied between years and subregions (Fig. 2.2A, B). Overall, 2015 was drier than 2016. In 2015, MAP was lower by 23, 17 and 32% compared to the 30-yr average for the CP, MG and FF, respectively. In 2016, MAP was 12 and 9% greater than the 30-yr average for the MG and FF, while being 3% lower in the CP (Fig. 2.2A). MAT was generally above that of the 30-yr average for all study locations and years by more than 1°C, although the difference between 2015 and 2016 never exceeded 0.5°C (Fig. 2.2B).

Soil pH and C/N ratio did not differ between grazing treatments and subregions (Table 2.2). Differences in soil properties between grazed and non-grazed subplots were limited to SOC and BD (Table 2.2). Overall, SOC values were greater (P=0.002) in grazed areas ( $5.95 \pm 0.32$  %) than non-grazed areas ( $4.96 \pm 0.26$  %). Similarly, bulk densities were greater (P=0.013) in grazed areas ( $1.19 \pm 0.07$  g cm<sup>-3</sup>) than adjacent non-grazed grassland ( $1.05 \pm 0.06$  g cm<sup>-3</sup>). SOC and BD values also varied among subregions (Table 2.2). Observed SOC were lower within MG compared to the both other subregions (P<0.10). Lower soil BD values (P<0.10) were detected within FF, higher within MG and intermediate within CP.

Mean daily soil temperature increased under long-term grazing (P=0.019) in 2015 and was 17.6 and 16.7 °C for the G and NG, respectively (Table 2.3). Soil temperature did not vary in relation to grazing on the year later. In 2015, soil temperatures were 16.9, 19.1 and 15.1°C for the CP, MG and FF, respectively, with higher values within MG, lower values within FF and intermediate values within CP. In 2016, soil temperature followed a similar pattern, at 16.9, 18.1 and 14.8°C for the CP, MG and FF, respectively, with higher values within CP and MG, lower values within FF (P<0.10). Mean soil water content was not affected (P>0.10) by long-term grazing (Table 2.3), but varied among subregions. Greater soil moisture (P<0.10) was found within the within CP and FF relative to the MG for both study years (Table 2.3).

# 2.3.2. GHG fluxes

Long-term grazing did not affect N<sub>2</sub>O emission, but CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> exhibited main effects of grazing (P<0.10) in 2015 (Table 2.4). Mean emission rates of CO<sub>2</sub> were lower for G areas compared to adjacent NG grassland,  $21.2 \pm 1.3$  and  $24.4 \pm 1.3$  kg C ha<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>, respectively. Consumption rates of CH<sub>4</sub> were also reduced under grazing and was  $-10.7 \pm 0.9$  and  $-13.4 \pm 0.9$  g C ha<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup> for G and NG, respectively. Consumption of CH<sub>4</sub> was additionally affected by the interaction treatments x subregions (Table 2.4). The lowest consumption rate of CH<sub>4</sub> was observed within the MG subregion regardless of grazing treatment (Fig. 2.3). In contrast, CH<sub>4</sub> uptake was intermediate in the FF, and was particularly high in the CP, but only for soils under long-term grazing.

Fluxes of CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> varied with a subregion x sampling date interaction (P<0.10) in both 2015 and 2016 (Table 2.4). However, the pattern of CO<sub>2</sub> emissions and CH<sub>4</sub> consumption remained highly variable among subregions and throughout the growing season (Fig. 2.4A, B, 2.5A, B; Appendix B and Appendix C). Among all three subregions in 2015, CO<sub>2</sub> emission rates were lower within MG (15.6 ± 1.7), higher within FF (27.2 ± 1.4) and intermediate within CP (24.7 ± 2.3 kg C ha<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>). Among all three subregions in 2016, lower CO<sub>2</sub> emission rates occurred within MG (25.1 ± 1.9), higher within CP (43.6 ± 2.9) and intermediate within FF (36.7 ± 2.5 kg C ha<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>).

The mean consumption rate of CH<sub>4</sub> in 2015 was lower within the MG (-7.5 ± 0.6) compared to the both, CP (-14.4 ± 1.5) and FF (-14.5 ± 1.1 g C ha<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>). Among all three subregions in 2016, the mean consumption rate of CH<sub>4</sub> was once again lower within MG (-7.8 ± 0.4), higher within CP (-13.2 ± 1.1) and intermediate within FF (-10.1 ± 0.7 g C ha<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>). No differences in N<sub>2</sub>O emissions were detected between grazing treatments or subregions, though it varied throughout the 2016 growing season (P=0.02; Table 2.4). The lowest N<sub>2</sub>O emission was observed at the end of May with higher emission of N<sub>2</sub>O revealed at the beginning of July (data not shown).

#### 2.3.3. Cumulative emission of GHG

Cumulative CO<sub>2</sub> emission were affected by the interaction between treatments and subregions, years and subregions (Table 2.5; Fig. 2.6A). While grazing led to lower emission of CO<sub>2</sub> in 2015 relative to non-grazed subplots, the opposite pattern was detected in 2016 (Fig. 2.5A). Also, grazed areas experience a much greater increase in CO<sub>2</sub> emission between years (+50%), while the increase in CO<sub>2</sub> emission from non-grazed subplots between years was much less (+23%). Among all three subregions, lowest cumulative CO<sub>2</sub> emission was observed within MG (2758  $\pm$  249) compared to the both, CP (4149  $\pm$  451) and FF (4117  $\pm$  274 kg C ha<sup>-1</sup>). Overall, cumulative emission of CO<sub>2</sub> varied between years with lower values observed in 2015and it was 2861  $\pm$  221 and 4512  $\pm$  275 kg C ha<sup>-1</sup> for 2015 and 2016, respectively.

Cumulative CH<sub>4</sub> consumption was affected by subregions, year of sampling, and their interaction (Table 2.5). Lowest cumulative CH<sub>4</sub> consumption was observed within MG compared to FF in 2015 (Fig. 2.6B). Among all three subregions, lowest cumulative CH<sub>4</sub> consumption was observed within MG ( $1.04 \pm 0.07$ ) compared to the both, CP ( $1.91 \pm 0.20$ ) and FF ( $-1.62 \pm 0.13$  kg C ha<sup>-1</sup>). Overall, in 2015 soils consumed more CH<sub>4</sub> compared to 2016 and cumulative CH<sub>4</sub> consumption was  $-1.6 \pm 0.2$  and  $-1.4 \pm 0.1$  kg C ha<sup>-1</sup> in 2015 and 2016, respectively. While cumulative emission of N<sub>2</sub>O was unaffected by grazing, however it varied only in relation to years, being lower during 2015 ( $0.03 \pm 0.03$  kg N ha<sup>-1</sup>) compared to 2016 ( $0.11 \pm 0.04$  kg N ha<sup>-1</sup>).

## 2.3.4. GHG and environmental conditions

Emission of CO<sub>2</sub> and consumption of CH<sub>4</sub> were associated with soil water content and its interaction with grazing treatments in both 2015 and 2016 (Table 2.6). Overall, emissions of CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> had a positive linear relationship with soil water content. At the same level of soil water content in 2015, emissions of CO<sub>2</sub> tended to be higher from soils without grazing (Fig. 2.7A). In 2016, soil moisture levels below  $0.10 \text{ m}^3 \text{ m}^{-3}$  led to emissions of CO<sub>2</sub> that were greater from the NG, while being higher from G when soil moisture was high (Fig. 2.7B). The CP generally had higher CO<sub>2</sub> emissions than the MG, while FF did not have a significant regression fit (Fig. 2.7C). CH<sub>4</sub> consumption rates were greater for soils without grazing under the same soil water content in 2015 (Fig. 2.7D); however, the relationship between CH<sub>4</sub> and soil water content did not have a significant regression fit. In 2016, MG had lower consumption rates than the FF, while the CP did not have a significant regression fit (Fig. 2.7E). Overall in 2016, lower consumption CH<sub>4</sub>

rates were associated with higher soil water content, except NG within MG (Fig. 2.7F). Soil water content did not affect N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes (Table 2.6).

Emission of CO<sub>2</sub> and consumption of CH<sub>4</sub> were associated with soil temperature and its interaction with treatments and subregions (Table 2.6). In 2015, CO<sub>2</sub> and soil temperature as well as its interaction with grazing treatments did not have a significant regression fit (Fig. 2.8A). In 2016, NG subplots emitted less CO<sub>2</sub> than that from G (Fig. 2.8B) and emission of CO<sub>2</sub> within CP was higher than that within MG, while FF did not have a significant regression fit (Fig. 2.8C). CH4 consumption rate was lower within MG compared to the CP and FF (Fig. 2.8D), however a significant regression fit was not observed. Soil temperature did not affect N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes (Table 2.7).

#### 2.4. Discussion

Exchange of GHG between soil and atmosphere is a large component of the C and N balance within grassland ecosystems (Bremer et al., 1998). This study addressed a critical gap in our knowledge of how long-term grazing affects GHG fluxes from grassland soils by examining these processes across a broad climatic gradient of northern temperate grasslands in the Great Plains. Unlike many previous studies that have been done only at a single or select few locations (Gao et al., 2017; Thomas et al. 2018), this study examined GHG fluxes in response to long-term grazing at 15 different locations with widely varying vegetation, soils and climate. Importantly, in the present study it was reported that a history of long-term grazing altered cumulative CO<sub>2</sub> emission depending on climatic conditions. Given that grassland ecosystems occupy a large area of the terrestrial surface, these results improve our understanding of their role in supporting

global cycles of C and N and reducing GHG fluxes (C and N release), and in turn, provide an important component for C and N balance of grasslands under grazing.

# 2.4.1. Long-term grazing effect on GHG

The results of this study showed reduction of averaged CO<sub>2</sub> emission over growing season in 2015 under long-term grazing, while in 2016 averaged CO<sub>2</sub> emission was similar between grazed and non-grazed treatments. This finding is consistent with previous studies of soil CO<sub>2</sub> emissions within the more arid regions (MAP < 410 mm) of the Great Plains such as the shortgrass steppe (LeCain et al., 2002), mixed-grass prairie (LeCain et al., 2000). None of the latter studies detected differences in CO<sub>2</sub> emission between grazed and non-grazed soils, while CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from soils in more mesic areas of the tall-grass prairies (MAP 856 mm) were reduced under grazing (Bremer et al., 1998, Johnson and Matchett, 2000). Notably, the reversal of long-term grazing effects on cumulative CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from soils between the two years of the study suggests that environmental conditions are likely to dictate when and where grazing may alter GHG in northern temperate grasslands. In the current study, the lower precipitation conditions of 2015 led to lower cumulative CO<sub>2</sub> emission under long-term grazing, while the subsequent wetter (i.e. near normal rainfall) year led to more CO<sub>2</sub> release under long-term grazing.

Emission of CO<sub>2</sub> comes from two sources, namely autotrophic (roots) and heterotrophic (microorganisms) pathways (Rastogi et al., 2002; Wang et al., 2017), which can potentially be affected by grazing through defoliation, trampling, as well as the redistribution of nutrients via dung and urine. Removal of aboveground biomass, subsequent litter residue, and reductions of leaf area by defoliation can increase soil temperature and accelerate respiration of both sources

(Bremer et al., 1998). In the present study, we observed increased soil temperatures under longterm grazing subplots in 2015, this year was also associated with reduced precipitation across all subregions, which likely led to a lower input of decomposable organic material (living roots, exudates) into soil (Bremer et al., 1998), which in turn decreased  $CO_2$  emission from soils under long-term grazing. Livestock excreta can affect soils properties (Eyles et al., 2015) and stimulate microbial activity (Bardgett and Cook, 1998), which in turn, can increase heterotrophic CO<sub>2</sub> emission from soils (Wang et al., 2017). In the present study the short-term impact of grazing on soil respiration was eliminated within chambers by the protection of cages, and thus the absence of fresh urine and dung within chambers. SOC is closely and positively correlated with CO<sub>2</sub> emission from soils (Liebig et al., 2010) and higher SOC contributes to higher soil respiration (Liebig et al., 2013). In the present study SOC was higher under long-term grazed soils, however as mentioned above soil moisture was likely the driving factor for the CO<sub>2</sub> reduction from grazed soils in 2015. Grazed areas also demonstrated greater inherent variation in GHG flux from yearto-year compared to non-grazed areas, thereby highlighting the need for multi-year studies to fully quantify and characterize observed patterns in GHG flux within these ecosystems. Finally, high litter mass on the non-grazed subplots studied here (Chuan et al., 2018) may have protected microbial communities from severe climatic alterations between years, which was confirmed by more stable  $CO_2$  emission between years within non-grazed areas.

The results of this study showed a reduction in average CH<sub>4</sub> consumption over the growing season from soils under long-term grazing in 2015, while remaining similar non-grazed areas in 2016. These findings supported previous observations that rangeland soils serve as a small sink for atmospheric methane (Mosier at al., 1997; Liebig et al., 2010; Wei et al., 2012). The negative values obtained for CH<sub>4</sub> net-flux indicated that methane consumption prevailed

over the process of methanogenesis (Topp and Pattey, 1997; Schönbach et al., 2012). This result occurred despite grazed subplots having higher bulk density, which likely reduced diffusion of CH<sub>4</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> (substrates for methanotrophs activity) from the atmosphere into soil (Chen et al., 2011), thereby inhibiting CH<sub>4</sub> uptake to some degree. Soil methanotroph activity may also have been inhibited on grazed areas by increased evaporation from soil and associated water stress (Chen et al., 2011). The balance between the fore-mentioned processes determine the overall grazing effect on methanogenesis and methanotrophy, and in turn, ultimately regulate overall CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes.

Long-term grazing did not affect averaged N<sub>2</sub>O emissions over both growing seasons from the grassland soils studied here. This might be attributed to the high variability of N<sub>2</sub>O emission, which is commonly observed in many field experiments and explained by complex interaction between microbiological processes, namely nitrification and denitrification, climatic conditions and soil properties, including soil moisture and temperature, oxygen supply and others (Cowan et al., 2015; Liebig et al., 2010; Gao et al., 2017; Butterbach-Bahl et al., 2013; Luo et al., 2013). Furthermore, grazing increases the spatial and temporal variability of N<sub>2</sub>O emission due to local soil compaction, and the re-distribution of urine and dung (Oenema et al., 1997; Gao et al., 2017). Finally, because of the inherent greater variability of N<sub>2</sub>O flux, low sampling frequencies may be insufficient to detect differences in this GHG, and indeed the errors around the flux values observed in this study were high (Wei et al., 2012). Due to the large area encompassed by the study sites examined in this research, more frequent gas sampling was infeasible (Gao et al., 2017; Baah-Acheamfour et al., 2016).

# 2.4.2. Geographical and temporal variability in GHG flux
In the present study, differences between natural subregions in their cumulative  $CO_2$ emission rates were observed. Spatial variability of CO2 emission was attributed to soil organic matter content, soil water content and live root biomass, in the study of three contrasting temperate steppe types in northern China (Shi et al., 2017), as well as strong climatic gradients of temperature and precipitation, which are considered a main driving factor of soil organic matter decomposition, and therefore CO<sub>2</sub> formation (Follet et al., 2012). Lower CO<sub>2</sub> emissions within the MG can be attributed to the low SOC content in the region (in comparison with CP and FF), which otherwise positively influences soil respiration (Liebig et al., 2013). The lowest cumulative CH<sub>4</sub> uptake observed was within the MG as well. Soil water and organic matter content, together with soil texture, are the main drivers of spatial variability of CH<sub>4</sub> uptake (Shi et al., 2017). Ultimately, the balance of interactions among these factors determines the rate of CH<sub>4</sub> uptake. While a coarse (high sand content) soil texture of soils within the MG subregion might promote methanotrophy due to the availability of O<sub>2</sub> from the atmosphere (Bock, 2016), water limitations in the region due to low precipitation can reduce the magnitude of the CH4 consumption and overall activity of methanotrophs (Wang et al., 2005; Luo et al., 2013).

Cumulative CO<sub>2</sub> emissions were affected by interannual variability of climatic conditions, with the lowest soil respiration observed in the dryer year. Soil water content has often been shown to be a controlling factor for GHG emission or consumption (Oertel et al., 2016; Rastogi et al., 2002; Wang and Fang, 2009). Both microbial and root respiration increase with greater water availability (Liu et al., 2009; Wang and Fang, 2009; Rastogi et al., 2002), and may explain differences in CO<sub>2</sub> cumulative emission between years; the lower cumulative emission in 2015 was likely related to lower precipitation levels. Cumulative CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O emissions were different between years as well with lower CH<sub>4</sub> consumption and higher N<sub>2</sub>O emission in 2016. Both processes are known to be highly dependent on soil water content, as a regulator of soil microbial activity (Soussana et al., 2010; Liebig et al., 2010; Samal et al., 2015; Oertel et al., 2016; Wu et al., 2010). More specifically, higher consumption of CH<sub>4</sub> in 2015 was likely attributed to lower precipitation level, which increased diffusion of substrates for methanotrophs activity (CH<sub>4</sub> and O<sub>2</sub>) into soils (Chen et al., 2011). While, as discussed above, wet, anaerobic conditions are likely to favor CH<sub>4</sub>- and N<sub>2</sub>O-producing bacteria (Oertel et al., 2016).

# 2.5. Summary

While average  $CO_2$  and  $CH_4$  fluxes over growing season in 2015 were reduced by longterm grazing, in 2016 both averaged over season fluxes was on the same level between grazed and non-grazed subplots. Cumulative emission of  $CO_2$  varied widely between years and treatments, indicating that climatic conditions have importance in the processes regulating GHG dynamics. In dry year cumulative  $CO_2$  emission was lower from grazed area and it was 50% higher in wet year, while for non-grazed area the differences between years was 23% with higher emission in wet year as well. This is an important information for range managers and livestock producers, as well as for C and N balance calculation for the grassland ecosystems globally and locally. It should be stressed that while the grazing intensity applied within the studied locations was light to moderate, higher intensities of grazing might have led to different effects.

The finding that cumulative  $CO_2$  emission varied with climatic conditions among treatments and years is an important result as future climate scenarios predict increases in mean annual precipitation and temperature (Hufkens et al., 2016), however the effect of these changes on GHG fluxes remains uncertain. Any short-term moisture increases could increase the potential for GHG emissions, while these fluxes could be reduced by the increased risk of more frequent and severe drought years.

Central Parkland		Dry Mixedgrass		Foothills Fescue	
53706		46937		13623	
7.	50	800		1100	
Black Cl	nernozem	Brown Chernozem		Black Chernozem	
27	7.9	42.6		29.6	
2	.3	4.2		3.9	
44	1.2	333.3		469.6	
0.04-3.08		0.1-0.88		0.63-3.25	
$97.6\pm2.5$	$91.0\pm2.5$	$59.5\pm2.6$	$59.2\pm2.8$	$81.7\pm4.4$	$83.4\pm4.9$
$2403\pm97$	$2664 \pm 102$	$1789\pm203$	$2020\pm21$	$1772\pm158$	$1954\pm249$
$2905\pm147$	$3031\pm115$	$1989 \pm 171$	$2176\pm48$	$2807\pm301$	$2323\pm210$
$1215\pm290$	$2840\pm 645$	$1378\pm128$	$2442\pm247$	$1071\pm279$	$3452\pm760$
Aspen (Popi	ılus	Blue grama grass		Foothills rough fescue	
tremuloides), plains		(Bouteloua gracilis),		(Festuca campestris),	
rough fescue (Festuca		western wheatgrass		Parry's oatgrass	
hallii)		(Pascopyrum smithii),		(Danthonia parryi), Idaho	
		needle and thread grass		fescue (Festuca	
		(Hesperostipa comata)		idahoensis)	
	Central 53' 7 Black Cl 2' 44 0.04 $97.6 \pm 2.5$ $2403 \pm 97$ $2905 \pm 147$ $1215 \pm 290$ Aspen ( <i>Popi</i> <i>tremuloides</i> ) rough fescue <i>hallii</i> )	$\begin{array}{r} \hline Central Parkland \\ 53706 \\ 750 \\ Black Chernozem \\ 27.9 \\ 2.3 \\ 441.2 \\ 0.04-3.08 \\ 97.6 \pm 2.5  91.0 \pm 2.5 \\ 2403 \pm 97  2664 \pm 102 \\ 2905 \pm 147  3031 \pm 115 \\ 1215 \pm 290  2840 \pm 645 \\ Aspen (Populus \\ tremuloides), plains \\ rough fescue (Festuca hallii) \\ \end{array}$	Central ParklandDry Mit53706467508Black ChernozemBrown C27.9422.34441.2330.04-3.080.1-97.6 $\pm$ 2.591.0 $\pm$ 2.52403 $\pm$ 972664 $\pm$ 1022905 $\pm$ 1473031 $\pm$ 1151215 $\pm$ 2902840 $\pm$ 645Aspen (PopulusBlue grama grama grough fescue (Festucarough fescue (FestucaWestern whehallii)(Pascopyrunneedle and th(Hesperostip)	$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $

Table 2.1. Main characteristics of the studied subregions according to Downing and Pettapiece, 2006.

<sup>a</sup> Data were taken from Range plant communities and range health assessment guidelines (2013); <sup>b</sup> Data were taken from Chuan et al., 2018

Subregion	Treatment	$pH_{H2O}$	SOC, $\%^1$	C/N	BD, g cm <sup>-3</sup>
Central	G	$6.13\pm0.11$	$7.20\pm0.42$	$11.43\pm0.30$	$1.24\pm0.08$
Parkland	NG	$6.13\pm0.09$	$5.39\pm0.32$	$11.34\pm0.23$	$1.03\pm0.04$
Dry	G	$6.54\pm0.06$	$2.89\pm0.15$	$11.73\pm0.27$	$1.36\pm0.11$
Mixedgrass	NG	$6.62\pm0.07$	$2.48\pm0.12$	$11.63\pm0.47$	$1.23\pm0.05$
Foothills	G	$6.36\pm0.06$	$7.81\pm0.44$	$11.31\pm0.35$	$0.98\pm0.10$
Fescue	NG	$6.43\pm0.09$	$7.11\pm0.37$	$11.57\pm0.32$	$0.89\pm0.10$
ANOVA					
Factor	Statistics <sup>2</sup>	pH <sub>H2O</sub>	SOC, %	C/N	BD, g cm <sup>-3</sup>
	Р	0.474	0.002	0.875	0.013
Treatment (GT)	F	0.545	14.687	0.026	8.771
	df (n, d)	1, 12	1, 12	1, 12	1, 11
	Р	0.277	<.0001	0.763	0.022
Subregion (S)	F	1.431	37.320	0.277	5.449
	df (n, d)	2, 12	2, 12	2, 12	2, 11
	Р	0.868	0.102	0.559	0.642
GT x S	F	0.143	2.782	0.609	0.462
	df(n, d)	2, 12	2, 12	2, 12	2, 11

Table 2.2. Grassland soil properties (0-5 cm mineral layer) and ANOVA test output for long-term grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments for the three subregions of Alberta. The values represent mean  $\pm$  standard error.

<sup>1</sup> SOC, soil organic carbon; C/N, ratio of carbon and nitrogen; BD, bulk density <sup>2</sup>P, probability value; F, F-statistics; df (n, d), degrees of freedom for numerator and denominator, respectively

Table 2.3. Effect of long-term grazing treatment exposure, geographic (subregion) variability, and their interactions, on the measured soil temperature and water content of northern temperate Great Plains grasslands during each of 2015 and 2016.

Submarian	Tractmont	Soil temperature,	, °C	Soil water content, m <sup>3</sup> m <sup>-3</sup>		
Subregion	Treatment	2015	2016	2015	2016	
Central	$G^1$	$18.13\pm0.25$	$17.17\pm0.21$	$0.15\pm0.003$	0.17 + 0.004	
Parkland	NG	$16.12\pm0.18$	$16.61\pm0.17$	$0.14\pm0.003$	$0.16\pm0.003$	
Dry	G	$19.55\pm0.23$	$18.12\pm0.19$	$0.10\pm0.003$	$0.12\pm0.002$	
Mixedgrass	NG	$18.75\pm0.22$	$18.11\pm0.21$	$0.10\pm0.002$	$0.10\pm0.002$	
Foothills	G	$15.18\pm0.19$	$14.89\pm0.16$	$0.16\pm0.003$	$0.21\pm0.003$	
Fescue	NG	$15.03\pm0.18$	$14.60\pm0.16$	$0.13\pm0.002$	$0.19\pm0.003$	
ANOVA						
Factor	Statistics <sup>2</sup>	2015	2016	2015	2016	
	Р	0.019	0.229	0.149	0.223	
Treatment (GT)	F	7.317	1.615	2.376	1.669	
~ /	df (n, d)	1, 12	1, 11	1, 12	1, 11	
	Р	0.004	0.007	0.009	0.035	
Subregion (S)	F	9.302	7.680	7.149	4.504	
	df (n, d)	2, 12	2, 11	2, 12	2, 11	
	Р	0.186	0.950	0.117	0.955	
GT x S	F	1.941	0.051	2.581	0.046	
	df(n, d)	2, 12	2, 11	2, 12	2, 12	

<sup>1</sup>G, grazed; NG, non-grazed

 $^{2}$ P, probability value; F, F-statistics; df (n, d), degrees of freedom for numerator and denominator, respectively

Table 2.4. Effect of long-term grazing treatment exposure, geographic (subregion) and temporal (sampling date) variation, as well as their interactions, on the emission rates of carbon dioxide  $(CO_2)$ , methane  $(CH_4)$  and nitrous oxide  $(N_2O)$  from soils of the northern temperate Great Plains grasslands during each of 2015 and 2016.

Factor	2015				2016			
	df <sub>num</sub> *	df <sub>res</sub>	F	Р	$df_{num}$	df <sub>res</sub>	F	Р
	1							
$CO_2$ flux, kg C ha <sup>-1</sup> d	·1							
Treatment (GT)	1	12	4.979	0.011	1	11	1.018	0.335
Subregion (S)	2	12	4.465	0.027	2	11	6.354	0.014
Sampling date (SD)	7	107	11.218	<.0001	8	135	22.092	<.0001
S x GT	2	12	0.708	0.463	2	10	0.009	0.991
GT x SD	7	108	0.949	0.324	8	138	0.827	0.580
S x SD	14	106	3.281	<.0001	16	135	3.426	<.0001
S x GT x SD	14	107	0.888	0.573	16	137	0.313	0.995
CH <sub>4</sub> flux, g C ha <sup>-1</sup> d <sup>-1</sup>								
Treatment (GT)	1	12	5.213	0.041	1	11	0.134	0.721
Subregion (S)	2	12	3.316	0.071	2	11	4.796	0.031
Sampling date (SD)	7	124	2.203	0.019	8	140	9.199	<.0001
S x GT	2	12	0.192	0.828	2	11	3.337	0.072
GT x SD	14	125	0.717	0.658	8	141	1.669	0.111
S x SD	7	124	2.198	0.011	16	140	6.438	<.0001
S x GT x SD	14	125	0.616	0.848	16	141	0.444	0.968
$N_2O$ flux, g N ha <sup>-1</sup> d <sup>-1</sup>								
Treatment (GT)	1	11	0.451	0.514	1	9	0.307	0.592
Subregion (S)	2	11	0.681	0.526	2	11	0.067	0.935
Sampling date (SD)	7	87	1.464	0.191	8	93	2.371	0.023
S x GT	2	11	0.942	0.419	2	9	1.464	0.281
GT x SD	7	87	0.728	0.649	8	93	0.707	0.685
S x SD	14	86	0.643	0.822	16	92	1.250	0.247
S x GT x SD	14	86	0.679	0.789	16	92	0.910	0.560

Values in bold indicate significant differences at p<0.10

\* Df<sub>num</sub>, numerator degrees of freedom; df<sub>res</sub>, residuals degrees of freedom, F, F-statistic, P, probability value.

Factor	$df_{num}$	Dfres	F	Р
$CO_2$ kg C ha <sup>-1</sup>				
Treatment (GT)	1	12	0.007	0.934
Subregion $(S)$	2	12	3 363	0.754
$V_{ear}(V)$	2 1	23	56 232	
$S \times GT$	$\frac{1}{2}$	12	0 383	~.0001 0.680
GT v V	2 1	23	12 152	0.007
S v V	$\frac{1}{2}$	23	1 0 6 3	0.002
S x GT x Y	$\frac{2}{2}$	23	0.005	0.995
2			0.000	0.770
CH4, kg C ha <sup>-1</sup>				
Treatment (GT)	1	12	0.069	0.797
Subregion (S)	2	12	3.951	0.048
Year (Y)	1	23	3.031	0.095
S x GT	2	12	2.751	0.105
GT x Y	1	23	2.200	0.151
S x Y	2	23	3.529	0.046
S x GT x Y	2	23	0.349	0.709
NO ka Cha <sup>-1</sup>				
$N_2O, Kg C Ha$	1	10	0.196	0.647
Subragion (C)	1	12	0.180	0.04/
Subregion (S)	ے 1	12	0.1/1	0.843
r ear(r)	1	25	5.40/ 0.12C	0.075
SXGI CT V	2 1	12	0.136	0.8/4
GIXY		23	0.665	0.423
S X Y	2	23	0.332	0.721
S x GT x Y	2	23	0.785	0.468

Table 2.5. Effect of long-term grazing, spatial (subregion) and temporal (year) variabilities as well as their interactions, on the cumulative emission of carbon dioxide ( $CO_2$ ), methane ( $CH_4$ ) and nitrous oxide ( $N_2O$ ) from rangeland soils in Alberta, Canada.

Values in bold indicate significant differences at p<0.10

Factor	2015				2016				
Factor	$df_{num}$	df <sub>den</sub>	F	Р	$df_{num}$	df <sub>den</sub>	F	Р	
CO <sub>2</sub> flux, kg C ha <sup>-1</sup> d	1								
Moisture (M)	1	23	2.591	0.121	1	21	0.039	0.843	
M x GT	1	12	10.053	0.008	1	11	6.832	0.024	
M x S	2	14	0.635	0.544	2	13	4.142	0.039	
M x GT x S	2	12	0.309	0.739	2	10	0.672	0.532	
CH <sub>4</sub> flux, g C ha <sup>-1</sup> d <sup>-1</sup>									
Moisture (M)	1	20	0.377	0.546	1	18	0.327	0.574	
M x GT	1	12	5.156	0.043	1	11	1.039	0.329	
M x S	2	14	2.685	0.101	2	13	4.279	0.038	
M x GT x S	2	12	0.338	0.719	2	11	3.535	0.067	
N <sub>2</sub> O flux, g N ha <sup>-1</sup> d <sup>-1</sup>									
Moisture (M)	1	17	1.116	0.305	1	16	0.034	0.857	
M x GT	1	12	1.005	0.335	1	11	0.650	0.438	
M x S	2	12	0.267	0.769	2	12	0.337	0.718	
M x GT x S	2	13	0.429	0.660	2	11	0.416	0.670	

Table 2.6. Effect of soil moisture and its interaction with grazing treatment (G/NG) and geographic subregions, on the emission of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>), methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) and nitrous oxide (N<sub>2</sub>O) from northern temperate Great Plains grassland soils during 2015 and 2016.

GT, treatment; S, subregion;

Values in bold indicate significant differences at the p<0.10.  $Df_{num}$ , numerator degrees of freedom;  $df_{den}$ , denominator degrees of freedom, F, F-statistic, P, probability value.

Factor	2015				2016			
Factor	df <sub>num</sub>	df <sub>den</sub>	F	Р	df <sub>num</sub>	df <sub>den</sub>	F	Р
CO <sub>2</sub> flux, kg C ha <sup>-1</sup> d	1							
Temperature (T)	1	23	3.453	0.076	1	21	0.416	0.526
T x GT	1	12	6.715	0.023	1	10	4.549	0.058
T x S	2	13	1.677	0.225	2	11	5.471	0.022
T x GT x S	2	12	0.122	0.886	2	11	0.384	0.691
CH <sub>4</sub> flux, g C ha <sup>-1</sup> d <sup>-1</sup>								
Temperature (T)	1	22	2.546	0.124	1	19	2.089	0.165
T x GT	1	13	2.696	0.125	1	10	0.881	0.369
T x S	2	13	2.499	0.121	2	11	4.786	0.032
T x GT x S	2	12	0.596	0.566	2	11	2.409	0.136
N <sub>2</sub> O flux, g N ha <sup>-1</sup> d <sup>-1</sup>								
Temperature (T)	1	16	0.307	0.587	1	19	0.002	0.965
T x GT	1	13	2.134	0.168	1	10	0.538	0.479
T x S	2	12	0.047	0.954	2	11	0.545	0.589
T x GT x S	2	13	1.085	0.367	2	12	0.378	0.694

Table 2.7. Effect of soil temperature and its interactions with grazing treatment (G/NG) geographic subregion, on the emission of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>), methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) and nitrous oxide (N<sub>2</sub>O) of northern temperate Great Plains grassland soils during 2015 and 2016.

Values in bold indicate significant differences at the p<0.10.  $Df_{num}$ , numerator degrees of freedom;  $df_{den}$ , denominator degrees of freedom, F, F-statistic, P, probability value.



Fig 2.1. Location of the study sites in the Central Parkland, Dry Mixedgrass and Foothills Fescue subregions of Alberta, Canada. Map credit to M. Kohler.



Fig. 2.2. Mean annual precipitation (MAP, A) and mean annual temperature (MAT, B) for the Central Parkland (CP), Dry Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions during 2015 and 2016. Horizontal lines within each subregion represent the MAP and MAT from Downing and Pettapiece, 2006. Data were downloaded from http://agriculture.alberta.ca.



Fig. 2.3. Consumption rates of CH<sub>4</sub> between grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments and Central Parkland (CP), Dry Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions in 2016. Different lowercase letters indicate 2-way interaction between treatments and subregions.



Fig. 2.4.  $CO_2$  emission rates (kg C ha<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup> ± standard error) during 2015 (A) and 2016 (B) from northern temperate grasslands of the Great Plains.

\*Due to high variation of  $CO_2$  emission rates across subregions and sampling dates in both study years, post-hoc tests are provided in Appendix 3.



Fig. 2.5. Consumption rates of CH<sub>4</sub> (g C ha<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>  $\pm$  standard error) in 2015 (A) and 2016 (B) from northern temperate grasslands of the Great Plains.

\*Due to high variation of the CH<sub>4</sub> consumption rate across subregions and sampling dates in 2016 the posthoc test is provided in the Appendix 4.



Fig. 2.6. Cumulative CO<sub>2</sub> emission (A), cumulative CH<sub>4</sub> consumption (B) in each of 2015 and 2016 from northern temperate grasslands of the Great Plains. Different lowercase letters indicate (A) 2-way interaction between grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments and years; (B) 2-way interaction between and Central Parkland (CP), Dry Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions and years.



Fig. 2.7. Relationship between soil water content ( $m^3 m^{-3}$ ) and carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) emission (kg C ha<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>) in 2015 (A) and 2016 (B, C) and CH<sub>4</sub> consumption (g C ha<sup>-1</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>) in 2015 (D) and 2016 (E, F).

(A, B) represent 2-way interaction between soil water content and grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments for CO<sub>2</sub> emission in 2015 and 2016, respectively; (C) represent 2-way interaction between soil water content and Central Parkland (CP), Dry Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions for CO<sub>2</sub> emission in 2016; (D) represent 2-way interaction between soil water content and grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments for CH<sub>4</sub> consumption in 2015; (E) represent 2-way interaction between soil water content and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions for CH<sub>4</sub> consumption in 2015; (E) represent 2-way interaction between soil water content and Central Parkland (CP), Dry Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions for CH<sub>4</sub> consumption in 2016; (F) represent 3-way interaction between soil water content, grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments and Central Parkland (CP), Dry Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions for CH<sub>4</sub> consumption in 2016; (F) represent 3-way interaction between soil water content, grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments and Central Parkland (CP), Dry Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions for CH<sub>4</sub> consumption in 2016; (F) subregions for CH<sub>4</sub> consumption in 2016.



Fig. 2.8. Relationship between soil temperature (°C) and carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) emission (kg C  $ha^{-1} d^{-1}$ ) in 2015 (A) and 2016 (B, C), as well as CH<sub>4</sub> consumption in 2016 (D).

(A) represent overall relationship between soil temperature and  $CO_2$  emission as well as 2-way interaction between soil temperature and grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments for  $CO_2$  emission in 2015; (B) represent 2-way interaction between soil temperature and grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments for  $CO_2$  emission in 2016; (C) represent 2-way interaction between soil temperature and Central Parkland (CP), Dry Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions for  $CO_2$  emission in 2016; (D) represent 2-way interaction between soil temperature and grazed (NG) treatments for  $CO_2$  emission in 2016; (D) represent 2-way interaction between soil temperature and grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments for  $CH_4$  consumption in 2016.

# Chapter 3. Long-term grazing effect on soil microbial communities of Alberta grasslands

## 3.1. Introduction

Soil microorganisms are key drivers of nutrient transformation and cycling, are sensitive indicators of soil quality and play a critical role in regulating the functionality of an ecosystem (Doran and Zeiss, 2000; Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2016). While high microbial diversity promotes a variety of ecosystem functions, simplification of community composition negatively alters ecosystems processes and sustainability (Wagg et al., 2014; Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2016; Bardgett and van der Putten, 2014). However, microbial communities within grasslands remain poorly characterized (Evans et al., 2017) and the impact of livestock grazing on community composition of soil bacteria, archaea and fungi is not well known (Brussaard et al., 1997; Aldezabal et al., 2015; Eldridge et al., 2017).

Up to 90% of soil processes are mediated by soil microorganisms (Nannipieri et al., 2003). Prokaryotes (bacteria and archaea) are highly diverse phylogenetically and functionally (Killham and Prosser, 2015), they are catalyzing reactions involved in greenhouse gases production or consumption (Chroňáková et al., 2015). Archaeal contribution to the total activity of prokaryotes in soils is ~1%, which makes them an important component of ongoing biological processes (Nicol et al., 2003). Similar to bacteria and archaea, fungal community in soils are extremely species rich (Aislabie and Deslippe, 2013; Taylor and Sinsabaugh, 2015), and have profound impact on biogeochemical cycles due to the wide range of substrates they utilize for growth (Taylor and Sinsabaugh, 2015).

Microbial communities are highly sensitive to soil disturbances and environmental conditions (Kotzé et al., 2017). Human activities, such as cultivation of lands and deforestation,

are known to alter the composition and richness of microbial communities, whereas less is known about the influence of livestock grazing on soil microorganisms. Moreover, published data provided contradictory findings (Hodel et al., 2014; Brussaard et al., 1997; Aldezabal et al., 2015; Eldridge et al., 2017; Radl et al., 2007; Chroňáková et al., 2009; Jirout et al., 2011; Elhottová et al. 2012; Chroňáková et al., 2013; Chroňáková et al., 2015; Gou et al., 2015; Huhe et al., 2017; Zhou et al., 2010; Qu et al., 2016). For example, livestock grazing can lead to no changes of soil microbial abundance (assessed as microbial biomass; Hodel et al., 2014; Medina-Roldán et al., 2012; Tom et al., 2006), increase (Aldezabal *et al.*, 2015; Bardgett *et al.*, 1997), or decrease (Ingram et al., 2008). While severe grazing has been shown to increase the biomass of aerobic bacteria, archaea and fungi, in turn resulting in the development of a qualitatively new community profile compared to areas without grazing (Elhottová et al. 2012), others have found that the type of grassland has a much greater impact on soil microbial communities than grazing itself (Ford et al., 2013).

Livestock grazing is an important factor regulating all above- and belowground processes in grasslands (Hodel et al., 2014, Bardgett and Cook, 1998). Defoliation, trampling, and the redistribution of dung and urine by large herbivores can alter vegetation, soil thermal, hydrological, physical and chemical properties, which in turn, can affect soil microbial communities (Bremer et al., 1998; Bardgett and Cook, 1998; Aldezabal et al., 2015; Hodel et al., 2014). Consequently, grazing has the potential to positively, negatively or have no effect on soil microorganisms depending on the balance between these different processes (Bardgett and Wardle, 2003). Also, soil microbial communities vary markedly across environmental gradients (soil type and properties, topography) and through time (season of soil sampling) (Tracy and Frank, 1998; Hodel et al., 2014). Grasslands of the Northern Great Plains are highly diverse in their climatic conditions, topography, soil types and vegetation composition, but all are commonly used for livestock grazing. Thus, studies examining the effects of livestock grazing on microbial communities under different environmental and climatic conditions through time are needed to fully understand the range of potential responses by soil microbial communities to ongoing land use.

In the present study, the response of soil microbial communities to long-term livestock (cattle) grazing was examined across a broad agro-climatic gradient of northern temperate grasslands of Alberta over two growing seasons. The specific objectives of the study were: (i) to quantify the abundance of bacteria, archaea and fungi in these grasslands, and (ii) compare the compositional structure of bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities in soils associated with long term grazing with that present in adjacent non-grazed areas.

#### 3.2. Materials and methods

#### 3.2.1. Study locations

The study locations were situated within three subregions of Alberta, Canada, including the Central Parkland (CP), Dry Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF; Downing and Pettapiece, 2006; Table 2.1; Table 2.2). Briefly, the main features of the MG subregion is high temperatures and low precipitation during the summer as well as dominance of low-growing drought tolerant vegetation (Adams et al., 2013). The dominant vegetation is a *Stipa-Bouteloua-Agropyron* community, which is resilient to low grazing stocking rates (Dormaar et al., 1997) The main soil type is a Brown Chernozem, which forms with low organic matter input into soil and high mean annual temperatures (Downing and Pettapiece, 2006). The FF is the wettest subregion, which characterized by cooler summers with higher precipitation level. The dominant

vegetation is diverse and productive, including Festuca campestris and Danthonia parryi (Chuan et al., 2018; Adams et al., 2003). Black Chernozem is the main soil type, which forms with high organic matter input into the soil and moderate temperatures (Alberta Environment and Parks, 2015). The CP is a broad transitional zone located between the cool, moist boreal forests to the north and dry, warm grasslands to the south. Vegetation represents a matrix of forests, shrublands and grasslands, including Populus tremuloides, Symphoricarpos occidentalis, Festuca hallii, Hesperostipa curtiseta, Pascopyrum smithii, Koeleria macrantha (Chuan et al., 2018). The dominant soil type is Black Chernozem (Downing and Pettapiece, 2006). A total of 15 locations were examined in this study, with five locations in each of the three subregions. Each location was comprised of an exclosure wherein livestock (i.e. cattle) grazing was excluded for at least 15 and up to 60 years, each of which in turn, were compared to the surrounding grazed area to determine the long-term grazing effect on soil microbial communities. Cattle grazing has occurred in these regions for approximately 140 years (Wang et al., 2014), and recent grazing practices typically include light to moderate stocking rates between May and October annually (see Table 2.1). This created a total of 30 subplots, half of which were non-grazed (NG), with each paired to a grazed (G) subplot. For the present study, there was no specific information available on the localized stocking rates associated with grazing within each grazed subplot as the large size of grazing paddocks did not necessarily lead to uniform use across each pasture.

# 3.2.2. Soil sampling and DNA extraction

Soil samples were collected in the late spring, middle of summer and fall over two years (May 26-29 and 18-23, July 28-31 and 12-15, October 5-9 and 1-9, during 2015 and 2016, respectively). Ten soil cores were randomly collected per grazed and non-grazed subplot of each

of the 15 sites from the 0-5 cm mineral soil layer using a soil corer Ø 5 cm, placed into plastic bags, and thoroughly mixed. Overall 180 composite samples were collected. The composite samples were transported on dry ice to the laboratory, where they were stored at -20°C prior to DNA extraction.

Total DNA was extracted from 250 mg of each composite sample using Power Soil DNA Isolation Kits (MO BIO Laboratories Inc., Carlsbad, CA, USA) following the manufacturer's protocol. The kit was chosen as it eliminates humic substances as well as other PCR inhibitors, and provides DNA that is ready to use in downstream analysis, such as PCR, qPCR and NGS (mobio.com). Quality and quantity of the DNA were assessed with a NanoDrop2000C spectrophotometer (ThermoScientific, Wilmington, DE, USA) before further analysis. The extracted DNA was stored at -80°C prior to molecular analysis.

## 3.2.3. Quantitative polymerase chain reaction (qPCR)

To assess the abundance of soil bacteria, archaea and fungi, a quantitative polymerase chain reaction (qPCR) assay was applied to the DNA obtained from the previous step as the template and 10x diluted in nuclease-free water (dilution was revealed beforehand). The sets of primers used for the qPCR assays are listed in Table 3.1. The volume of the reaction was 10  $\mu$ l, which included 5  $\mu$ l of PowerUP<sup>TM</sup> SYBR Green Master Mix (Applied Biosystems, Foster City, CA, USA), 0.8 (bacteria), 0.4 (archaea) and 0.6 (fungi)  $\mu$ l of 10 $\mu$ M primers, 1  $\mu$ l of template DNA, and an adjusted volume of H<sub>2</sub>O (to 10  $\mu$ l). For the no-template control, 1  $\mu$ l of nuclease-free water was added instead of template DNA. All the samples were analyzed in duplicate on the reaction plates (Applied Biosystems, Foster City, CA, USA). The thermocycler (StepOne, Applied Biosystems, Foster City, CA, USA) program was: 50°C for 2 min, 95°C for 2 min

followed by either 40 (bacteria and fungi) or 35 (archaea) cycles of 95°C for 15 sec, 55°C (bacteria) / 66°C (archaea) / 56°C (fungi) for 15 sec and 72°C for 1 min. To confirm the absence of non-specific amplification and that amplified products had the appropriate size (180, 570 and 380 bp for bacteria, archaea and fungi, respectively), melting curve and gel electrophoresis analyses were performed, respectively. The qPCR efficiencies were 98-104% ( $R^2 = 0.997-0.999$ ) for bacteria, 90-92% ( $R^2 = 0.997-0.998$ ) for archaea and 90-98% ( $R^2 = 0.992-0.996$ ) for fungi.

The 10<sup>8</sup> to 10 copy numbers standards were made using serially diluted custom-made gBlocks® (Integrated DNA Technology, Caroalville, USA), the design of which was based on partial sequences of *Clostridium thermocellum*, *Methanoscarcina mazei* and *Aspergiillus niger* strain P-19 for bacterial, archaeal 16S rRNA and fungal 18S rRNA, respectively. Copy numbers of bacterial and archaeal 16S rRNA and fungal 18S rRNA genes were expressed as the copy number per gram of dry soil weight (oven-dried at 105°C for 48 hrs).

## 3.2.4. Next-generation sequencing (NGS)

To explore alpha and beta diversity of soil bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities, 16S / ITS amplicon sequencing was applied. The sets of primers used are listed in Table 3.1. For bacteria, the amplicon libraries were prepared according to the Illumina protocol (Part #15044223 Rev. B). A modified Illumina protocol was utilized for archaea and fungi as described below.

Selection of archaeal and fungal primer sets were based on the following criteria: amplicon length, coverage and selective amplification (Toju et al., 2012). For the 1<sup>st</sup> stage PCR annealing temperature, the number of cycles and PCR mix were optimized. For all samples, the volume of PCR reaction was 25  $\mu$ l and contained 10  $\mu$ l of Platinum Hot Start PCR 2x Master

Mix (Invitrogen, Lithuania, Vilnus), and 0.5 µl of each 10µM forward and reverse primers, 1 µl of the diluted DNA (5 ng µl<sup>-1</sup> in 10mM Tris pH 8.5) and 13 µl of nuclease-free water (www.earthmicrobiome.org). The thermocycler (ProFlex PCR system, Applied Biosystems, Foster City, CA, USA) program was as follows: (i) *archaea*, 94°C for 2 min with subsequent 40 cycles of 94°C for 30 sec; the annealing temperature was lowered from 67°C by 1°C every cycle until it reached 55°C, which was used for the remaining cycles, and for 30 sec, 72° for 30 sec; and 72°C for 5 min (Fontana et al., 2016; Takahashi et al., 2014); (ii) *fungi*, 94°C for 2 min followed by 40 cycles of 94°C for 30 sec, 50°C for 30 sec, 72° for 30 sec, and a final extension of 72°C for 5 min.

Subsequently, all PCR products were purified using AMPure XP beads (Beckman Coulter, Pasadena, CA, USA) following the Illumina protocol, however, 45 µl of beads to 25 µl reaction were added as suggested by the AMPure XP beads manufacturer protocol (# 001298v001). For the 2<sup>nd</sup> stage PCR, the volume of PCR reaction was 50 µl and contained 25 µl of Platinum Hot Start PCR 2x Master Mix (Invitrogen, Lithuania, Vilnus), 5 µl of each Nextera XT Index Primer 1 and 2 (Illumina, San Diego, CA, USA), 5 µl of the DNA obtained after 1<sup>st</sup> stage PCR / clean up step and 10 µl of nuclease-free water. The thermocycler (ProFlex PCR system, Applied Biosystems, Foster City, CA, USA) program was as follows: 94°C for 2 min with subsequent 8 cycles of 94°C for 30 sec, 55°C for 30 sec, 72° for 30 sec and 72°C for 5 min. A second PCR clean-up as well as further library preparation was performed according to the Illumina protocol without any modifications. As an internal control, 10% PhiX was used. Pairedend sequencing (2x300) was performed on the Illumina MiSeq platform (Illumina, San Diego, CA, USA) at the University of Alberta, AFNS department (Edmonton, AB, Canada).

## 3.2.5. Bioinformatics analysis

Obtained FASTQ files were processed with LotuS pipeline (Hildebrand et al., 2014). Briefly, paired-end reads were merged and quality filtered with default parameters. Further, sequences were clustered at a 97% similarity using UPARSE (Edgar, 2013). UCHIME was used alongside the *gold.fna* database for the detection and elimination of chimeric sequences (Edgar et al., 2011). Representative sequences of each OTU were taxonomically classified by similarity search with Lambda (Hauswedell et al., 2014) against SILVA v.128 and UNITE databases for bacteria / archaea and fungi, respectively. The representative sequences, biom file, and OTU tree were merged into a phyloseq object for further statistical analysis (McMurdie and Holmes, 2013).

# 3.2.6. Statistical analysis

All statistical analysis and graphical output were done using Rstudio, version 1.0.136 (RStudio Inc., Boston, USA). Differences were considered statistically significant with p<0.10. As 2015 was drier than 2016, data from the two years were analyzed separately (see Chapter 2).

The effects of treatments (long-term grazing, non-grazed), geographic location (subregions) and time of sampling (months), on the gene copy abundance of bacteria, archaea and fungi were tested with a linear mixed effects model (lme4, Bates et al., 2017). Grazing treatments and subregions were fixed effects, while month of sampling was treated as a repeated measure. Individual study sites nested within subregions and treatment subplots within sites were treated as random effects. To check the distribution of residuals and equality of variances of the model, diagnostic plots were used. A logarithmic transformation was applied to normalize qPCR data. While analyses were done on transformed data, untransformed data were presented in all tables and figures to maintain interpretability. To summarize the effects of factors compact letter

display (cld) method along with least-squares means (lsmeans / emmeans) was used (Lenth, 2017).

To assess the coverage of libraries rarefaction curves were built by applying the R function provided on the http://genoweb.toulouse.inra.fr website. To assess richness and the alpha diversity metrics (Shannon and Simpson diversity indexes), the phyloseq package in R was used (McMurdie and Holmes, 2013). To test long-term grazing effects, as well as geographic (spatial) and seasonal (temporal) variabilities on richness and alpha diversity metrics, a linear mixed effect model with the same model structure described above was used. To assess beta diversity, PerMANOVA analysis was performed based on phylogenetic (weighted and unweighted UniFrac) and non-phylogenetic (Bray-Curtis) dissimilarities, and ordination plots (non-metric multidimensional scaling, NMDS) were created using the vegan package (Oksanen et al., 2013).

The specific OTUs that characterize long-term grazing or non-grazed subplots were identified using an indicator species analysis (ISA) with the IndVal package in R (Dufrene and Legendre, 1997). The predictive value of A is the probability that a subplot was either grazed or non-grazed based on the OTUs found there, while the predictive value B is the probability of finding a particular OTUs in the long-term grazing / non-grazed subplots (Dufrene and Legendre, 1997). While the ISA revealed the OTUs specific for each treatment, a differential abundance analysis tested differences in relative abundance of OTUs that occurred in both treatments (DESeq2); the Benjamini & Hochberg approach was used for multiple mean comparison adjustment (Love et al., 2014).

# 3.3. Results

# 3.3.1. Abundance of bacteria, archaea and fungi

Long-term grazing itself did not affect the abundance of bacterial, archaeal or fungal gene copies in either of the study year (Table 3.2). However, gene copy values varied across subregions and months (Table 3.2). In 2015, a 3-way interaction treatments x subregions x months affected the abundance of soil bacterial gene copies (Table 3.2). The latter was significantly higher within the FF subregion under grazing in July, while the lowest abundance was observed within the MG in May for both treatments (Fig. 3.1A). Overall, lowest gene copies abundance was observed within MG (2.74 x 10<sup>9</sup>), highest within FF (5.56 x 10<sup>9</sup>) and intermediate within CP (4.13 x 10<sup>9</sup> gene copies g<sup>-1</sup> soil d.w.). Bacterial gene copies abundance also varied between months, and was higher in July (4.84 x 10<sup>9</sup>) and October (4.37 x 10<sup>9</sup>) than May (3.31 x 10<sup>9</sup> gene copies g<sup>-1</sup> soil d.w.). In 2016, the abundance of bacterial gene copies abundance was observed within the MG, while the highest were in the FF during May (Fig. 3.1B). Overall, the gene copies abundance of bacteria in the different subregions was 5.11 x 10<sup>9</sup>, 3.27 x 10<sup>9</sup> and 6.59 x 10<sup>9</sup> gene copies g<sup>-1</sup> soil d.w. for the CP, MG and FF, respectively.

In 2015, soil abundance of archaeal gene copies was affected by a treatments x subregions x months interaction (Table 3.2). Closer examination of the latter revealed lowest abundance of archaeal gene copies for the non-grazed treatment in May within the CP, while the highest for grazed treatment in July within the FF and the non-grazed treatment in July within the MG (Fig. 3.2). Overall, archaeal abundance differed over time with lowest values in May ( $5.36 \times 10^8$ ), higher values in July ( $7.29 \times 10^8$ ) and intermediate values in October ( $6.43 \times 10^8$  gene copies g<sup>-1</sup> soil d.w.). Gene copies abundance of archaea also varied between subregions and was lower within the

CP (4.20 x  $10^8$ ), while being significantly higher within the MG (7.04 x  $10^8$ ) and FF (7.84 x  $10^8$  gene copies  $g^{-1}$  soil d.w.). In 2016, the abundance of archaeal gene copies varied between subregions and months (Table 3.2). Among subregions the lowest values were detected within the CP (3.08 x  $10^8$ ), highest values within the FF (1.19 x  $10^9$ ) and intermediate values within MG (6.21 x  $10^8$  and gene copies  $g^{-1}$  soil d.w.). Between months the values were higher in May (8.17 x  $10^8$ ), lower in July (5.61 x  $10^8$ ) and intermediate in October (6.90 x  $10^8$  gene copies  $g^{-1}$  soil d.w.).

In 2015, an interaction subregions x months had an effect on fungal abundance as well as subregions and months (Table 3.2). The lowest abundance of fungi was observed in May for all subregions, while being highest in October within the FF (Fig. 3.3A). Among subregions fungal gene copies varied and was  $7.14 \times 10^7$ ,  $7.71 \times 10^7$  and  $1.42 \times 10^8$  gene copies  $g^{-1}$  soil d.w. for the CP, MG and FF, respectively. Between months the lowest values were observed in May (1.20 x  $10^7$ ), while highest in July (9.62 x  $10^7$ ) and October (1.18 x  $10^8$  gene copies  $g^{-1}$  soil d.w.). In 2016, a 3-way interaction treatments x subregions x months affected the gene copies abundance of soil fungi as well as months (Table 3.2). Within the MG fungal abundance was lower during July in the grazed treatment, while being higher in October for the same (grazed MG) treatment (Fig. 3.3B). Overall, fungal abundance was higher in October (9.39 x  $10^7$ ), lower in July (5.01 x  $10^7$ ) and intermediate in May (1.02 x  $10^8$  gene copies  $g^{-1}$  soil d.w.).

## 3.3.2. Soil water content and bacterial, archaeal and fungal abundance

Bacterial gene copies abundance was affected by GWC x subregions x months, GWC x subregions and GWC x months interactions in 2015 (Table 3.3). Closer examination showed positive linear relationships between GWC and bacterial gene abundance within each of the MG and FF subregion, as well as in May, July and October with higher abundance in October at the

same level of GWC (Fig. 3.4A, B). In July within the CP subregion, relationships between GWC and bacterial gene abundance were negative, while within the MG in July and October they were positive and linear (Fig. 3.4C). In 2016, bacterial gene copies abundance generally had positive and linear relationships with GWC (Table 3.3; Fig. 3.4D), with additional interactions between GWC x months and GWC x subregions x months (Table 3.3). Bacterial gene copies abundance were positively associated with GWC in May and July, particularly within the MG in May and July, and the FF in July (Fig. 3.4E, F).

Archaeal gene copies abundance was affected by the GWC x subregions x months, GWC x subregions and GWC x months interactions in 2015 (Table 3.3). Closer examination however, showed a non-significant regression fit for all relationships (Fig. 3.5A, B, C). In 2016, GWC, GWC x subregions, GWC x months and GWC x subregions x months affected archaeal gene copies abundance (Table 3.3). Overall, the relationships detected were typically linear and positive (p=0.07,  $R^2=0.20$ ). Archaeal gene copies abundance was positively associated with GWC within the FF (Fig. 5D), and stronger in May (Fig. 3.5E). Similar positive relationships were evident within the CP in May, and within the MG in May and July, as well as within the FF in October (Fig. 3.5F).

Fungal gene copies abundance were affected by GWC x subregions, GWC x months and GWC x subregions x months in 2015 (Table 3.3). The relationships detected were positive and linear within the CP and MG (Fig. 3.6A), but non-linear overall in May, July and October (Fig. 3.6B), while being linear and positive within the MG during July and October (Fig. 3.6C). In 2016, fungal gene copies abundance was positively and linearly associated with GWC in May (Fig. 3.6D).

# 3.3.3. Bacterial, archaeal and fungal taxonomic characteristics

A total 2,394,992 high quality bacterial sequences were obtained with an average of 13,764 sequences per sample. These sequences were distributed on average between 1512 different OTUs at 97% identity. The rarefaction curve showed that all study samples tended to approach a saturation plateau (Appendix D). Approximately 99% of the sequences were assigned to 42 phyla across all samples. The predominant phyla were Actinobacteria (6-42%), Proteobacteria (14-32%) and Acidobacteria (10-20%) (Appendix E).

A total of 7,286,502 high quality archaeal sequences were obtained with an average of 42,862 sequences per sample. These sequences were distributed on average between 105 different OTUs at 97% identity. Rarefaction curves showed that all study samples tended to approach a saturation plateau (Appendix D). Approximately 99% of the sequences were assigned to 8 phyla across all samples. The predominant phyla were Thaumarchaeota (81-100%) and Euryarchaeota (<19%; Appendix F).

A total of 8,521,071 high quality fungal sequences were obtained with an average of 48,415 sequences per sample. These sequences were distributed on average between 502 different OTUs at 97% identity. The rarefaction curve showed that all study samples tended to approach a saturation plateau (Appendix D). Almost 100% (99.99%) of the sequences were assigned to 9 phyla across all samples. The predominant phyla were Ascomycota (8-94%), Basidiomycota (3-89%) and Zygomicota (0.1-21%; Appendix G).

#### 3.3.4. Alpha diversity metrics of bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities

Long-term grazing itself did not affect bacterial richness or Shannon's diversity index in either of the study years; however, the Simpson index was lower in 2016 under non-grazed subplots compared to grazed, with values of  $0.990 \pm 0.001$  and  $0.991 \pm 0.001$  for the NG and G, respectively (Table 3.4). In 2015, richness varied between months and was lower in May (1210  $\pm$ 41), higher in July ( $1292 \pm 39$ ) and intermediate in October ( $1237 \pm 36$ ). Also, a 2-way interaction between treatment and months affected bacterial richness (Table 3.4). The latter was higher within the MG for NG treatment, while being lower within the CP for NG treatment as well as within the MG for G treatment (Fig. 3.7A). Shannon's index also varied between months and was lower in May  $(5.89 \pm 0.06)$ , higher in July  $(6.03 \pm 0.06)$  and intermediate in October  $(5.97 \pm 0.08)$ . Shannon index was affected by a treatment x month interaction (Table 3.4). Shannon's index was higher in July for the NG, while being lower in May for both treatments and in October for the NG (Fig. 3.7C). Simpson diversity index varied among subregions and between months in 2015 (Table 3.4). Lower Simpson values were observed within the CP ( $0.987 \pm 0.002$ ) and FF ( $0.989 \pm 0.001$ ) compared to the MG (0.993  $\pm$  0.001). Between months, the Simpson diversity index varied and was  $0.989 \pm 0.001$ ,  $0.991 \pm 0.001$  and  $0.989 \pm 0.003$  for May, July and October, respectively. In 2016, richness of the bacterial community was affected by subregions and months, as well as the interaction of treatment x months (Table 3.4). Among subregions significantly lower values was observed within the CP (1139  $\pm$  38), significantly higher within MG (1325  $\pm$  26) and intermediate within FF (1198  $\pm$  36). Between months, lower values of richness were observed in July (1162  $\pm$ 34), the highest values in October  $(1277 \pm 41)$  and intermediate in May  $(1235 \pm 36)$ . Bacterial richness was higher in October for the G treatment, while being lower in July for the G (Fig. 3.7B). Shannon diversity index was lower within the CP ( $5.86 \pm 0.07$ ), higher within MG ( $6.18 \pm 0.02$ ) and intermediate within FF (5.89  $\pm$  0.04). The Simpson index was lower within the CP (0.989  $\pm$ (0.001) and FF ( $(0.990 \pm 0.001)$ ), while remaining higher within the MG ( $(0.993 \pm 0.001)$ ).

Archaeal richness or diversity indexes were not affected by long-term grazing itself (Table 3.5). In 2015, archaeal richness varied among subregions and was lower within the CP  $(79 \pm 2)$ and FF (79  $\pm$  3) compared to the MG (95  $\pm$  2). Richness of archaea was also affected by a 3-way interaction treatments x subregions x months; richness was higher within the MG for NG treatment in May and July, while being lower within the CP for NG in May, and also the G in July (Fig. 3.8A). Shannon's index for archaeal diversity varied between months, and was lower in May (1.78)  $\pm$  0.06), higher in October (1.90  $\pm$  0.04) and intermediate in July (1.87  $\pm$  0.03). Also, Shannon's index varied between subregions x months (Table 3.5); while this metric did not change within the CP and MG during the growing season, it was lowest within the FF during May and higher within the FF during July and October (data not shown). The Simpson index varied among subregions and between months (Table 3.5). Lower Simpson indices were observed within the MG (0.739  $\pm$ 0.005) and FF (0.734  $\pm$  0.019) compared to the CP (0.786  $\pm$  0.011). Between months the lowest values were observed in May ( $0.730 \pm 0.018$ ), while in July ( $0.762 \pm 0.009$ ) and October ( $0.769 \pm$ 0.010) they were higher. In 2016, archaeal richness, Shannon's and Simpson indexes varied among subregions (Table 3.5). Higher richness was observed within the MG ( $94 \pm 2$ ), while it was lower within the CP ( $79 \pm 2$ ) and FF ( $74 \pm 2$ ). Shannon's diversity was lower within the FF ( $1.66 \pm 0.04$ ), higher within the CP (1.95  $\pm$  0.05) and intermediate within the MG (1.79  $\pm$  0.02). Simpson diversity index was higher within the CP ( $0.785 \pm 0.010$ ), lower within the FF ( $0.721 \pm 0.012$ ) and intermediate within the MG (0.732  $\pm$  0.007). Finally, Simpson diversity was affected by the interaction of subregions x months, whereby it was higher in May for NG and lowest in July for NG (Fig. 3.8B).

While long-term grazing did not alter richness of the fungal community, it affected alpha diversity indices in both years (Table 3.6). In 2015, the Shannon's and Simpson indices were lower

in soils under long-term grazing than those without grazing, with values of  $3.69 \pm 0.11$  and  $3.96 \pm 0.09$  (Shannon's) and  $0.89 \pm 0.02$  and  $0.92 \pm 0.01$  (Simpson) for the G and NG, respectively. In 2016, both the Shannon's and Simpson indices were higher in soils under long-term grazing than in areas without grazing, with values of  $3.69 \pm 0.13$  and  $3.39 \pm 0.15$  (Shannon's), and  $0.89 \pm 0.02$  and  $0.83 \pm 0.03$  (Simpson) for the G and NG, respectively. Richness of the fungal community also varied across subregion in 2015 and months in 2016 (Table 3.6). Among subregions fungal community richness was higher within the MG ( $507 \pm 15$ ), lower within the CP ( $415 \pm 17$ ) and intermediate within the FF ( $473 \pm 19$ ) in 2015. Between months lower richness was observed in May ( $402 \pm 15$ ) and July ( $403 \pm 17$ ) compared to October ( $457 \pm 21$ ) in 2016. Shannon's index varied among subregions in 2015, and was lower within the CP ( $3.53 \pm 0.17$ ), higher in the MG ( $4.10 \pm 0.07$ ), and intermediate in the FF ( $3.84 \pm 0.11$ ).

# 3.3.5. Beta diversity metrics of bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities

Long-term grazing did not affect beta diversity metrics (Bray-Curtis, unweighted UniFrac and weighted UniFrac) of the bacterial and archaeal communities in either study year (Table 3.7, Appendix H, I). However, dissimilarities of the bacterial community were affected by subregions. This was confirmed by NMDS ordination based on Bray-Curtis dissimilarities, which showed strong clustering of bacterial and archaeal communities into the three groups, which were associated with the CP, MG and FF subregions (Fig. 3.5). While bacterial abundance was associated with increased SOC, TN, GWC, MAP within the FF subregion, in general, richness and Shannon's diversity of the bacterial community were elevated in the MG for both study years (Fig. 3.5, Appendix J). While archaeal abundance increased in the FF subregion, richness as well as Shannon's and Simpson diversity indexes of the archaeal community were all elevated within the MG (Fig. 3.5, Appendix J). Long-term grazing affected beta diversity metrics of the fungal community (Table 3.7, Appendix H, I). Additionally, dissimilarities of the fungal community were affected by subregions. This was confirmed by NMDS ordination based on Bray-Curtis dissimilarities, which showed strong clustering of the fungal community within each of the CP, MG and FF regions (Fig. 3.5).

A summary of findings obtained from the Tables 3.2, 3.4-3.7 about long-term grazing effects on soil microbial communities is provided in Table 3.8, which includes the abundance (qPCR), richness (observed OTUs), and alpha and beta diversity metrics, of bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities. Overall, long-term grazing itself had limited effects on soil bacterial and archaeal communities, while fungal communities were more sensitive to long-term grazing.

#### 3.3.6. Indicator species- and differential abundance analyses

In 2015, indicator species analysis for the bacterial community revealed 38 OTUs, 16 of which were associated with soils under long-term grazing, while another 22 were associated with soils without grazing impact (Table 3.9). In 2016, ISA revealed 17 OTUs associated with soils under long-term grazing, while another 19 OTUs were associated with soils without grazing. In 2015, two OTUs were strongly associated with long-term grazing as indicated by a positive predictive value equal to 1 (Table 3.9). Within non-grazed subplots, seven strongly associated OTUs were found. For the archaeal community, ISA analysis did not reveal any indicator OTUs for the long-term grazed treatment or non-grazed soils. In 2015, indicator species analysis for the fungal community revealed 37 OTUs, 11 of which were associated with long-term grazed soils, while another 26 were associated with non-grazed subplots (Table 3.10). In 2016, ISA on the fungal community revealed 24 OTUs, eight of which were associated with soils under long-term

grazing, while other 16 with soils without grazing. For soils under long-term grazing, 3 OTUs overlapped between 2015 and 2016, while for soils without grazing 6 OTUs overlapped (Table 3.10). Another 2 OTUs were strongly associated with long-term grazing, while 8 OTUs were strongly associated with soils without grazing.

Differential analysis for bacteria and archaea did not reveal any differences between longterm grazed and non-grazed treatments for both study years. For fungi, in 2015 Mortierellaceae, Microascaceae, Cordycipitaceae, Chaetomiaceae dominated soils with grazing (Fig. 3.10A), while in 2016 Mortierellaceae, Microascaceae and Entolomataceae prevailed in soils with long-term grazing (Fig. 3.10B).

# 3.4. Discussion

Examining the response of soil microbial communities to long-term grazing under various environmental and climatic conditions can improve our understanding of microbial ecology and the role of microorganisms in regulating grassland ecosystem function. The uniqueness of the present study is that it assessed the effects of long-term grazing on the abundance, richness, alpha and beta diversity metrics of soil bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities in different northern temperate grasslands. Moreover, the study was conducted across a broad geographic area (260 km in latitude and 450 km in longitude) over two growing seasons. With a few exceptions, we observed that microbial communities were generally resistant to long-term grazing, but changed markedly across climatic regions and seasonally through time.

## 3.4.1. Long-term grazing effect on soil microbial communities
We observed no main effects of long-term grazing on bacterial, archaeal and fungal abundance, despite known effects of grazing at these sites on vegetation (RRA, 2016; RRA, 2017), litter decomposition rates (Chuan et al. 2018) and soil properties, namely BD and SOC (see Chapter 2, Hewins et al. 2018). These findings are consistent with previous studies of soil microbial abundance assessed as microbial biomass carbon under long-term grazing in Australia (50 years; Tom et al., 2006), Switzerland (100 years; Hodel et al., 2014) and England (>16 years; Medina-Roldán et al., 2012), while other investigations have found that light grazing intensities increased microbial biomass (McGonigle and Turner, 2017), and though we found higher SOC under long-term grazing this did not increase microbial abundance at our study locations. It should be noted that the current study locations were exposed to only light to moderate grazing intensities, and higher intensities of grazing can induce more change to soil properties and therefore lead to greater changes in microbial abundance (Tom et al., 2006).

Grazing affected the composition of microbial communities to different extents; fungal communities responded directly to grazing, while bacterial and archaeal communities responded via interactions with other factors. Despite grazing induced changes in vegetation composition within our study region (RRA, 2016; RRA, 2017), concomitant effects on the microbial community may not be expected due to a low correlation between the alpha diversity of plants and soil microorganisms (Prober et al., 2015) as well as shift absence of major plants (Hodel et al., 2014). There were numerous OTUs that characterized bacterial and fungal communities under long-term grazing, but no archaea indicator OTUs were found for this same treatment. While other studies have found that the archaeal community can be affected by livestock grazing

(Chroňáková et al., 2015), in the present study the main effect of grazing did not affect the community.

In 2015, the Proteobacteria phylum was revealed as an indicator for long-term grazing treatment. This is a metabolically diverse group divided on  $\alpha$ -,  $\beta$ -,  $\gamma$ -,  $\delta$ - subphyla. While  $\alpha$ -,  $\beta$ - and  $\delta$ -Proteobacteria prevail in soils with recalcitrant carbon (cellulose, lignin),  $\beta$ - and  $\gamma$ - Proteobacteria are dominant under low-molecular-weight carbon (root exudates) input into soils (Aislabie and Deslippe, 2013). In 2015, Firmicutes, Actinobacteria, Bacteroides, Chloroflexi, Microgenomates and Chlamydiae were associated with non-grazed soils. While little is known about the ecology of the latter three phyla, the other three have been characterized (Aislabie and Deslippe, 2013). Members of the Firmicutes degrade various carbon sources, members of Bacteroidetes degrade complex organic molecules (starch, proteins, cellulose, and chitin) as well as plant material, and members of Actinobacteria dominate in soils with inputs of labile carbon (Aislabie and Deslippe, 2013). Thus, the main feature of the indicator phyla is that they participate in the decomposition of various substrates and may potentially impact carbon and nitrogen cycling.

Low richness and diversity of archaeal community has previously been observed (Chroňáková et al., 2015; Auguet et al., 2010). While there were no indicator archaeal OTUs between treatments, Thaumarchaeota was the dominant phylum in soils, which was consistent with a previous study (Xie et al., 2017). Members of the Thaumarchaeota play an important role in carbon and nitrogen cycles (Pester et al., 2011). The second most abundant phylum of archaea in our study was Euryarchaeota, which includes methanogens, suggesting that methane flux from these soils may not change. Overall, the dominant phyla of bacterial and archaeal communities did not change due to long-term grazing, indicating that the dominant phyla of soil bacteria and

archaea are stable under long-term grazing (Zhang et al., 2016), at least when grazing is light to moderate intensity.

Fungal microbial communities under long-term grazing were characterized by the Basidiomycota phylum, while soils without grazing included Ascomycota, Zygomycota and Chytridiomycota. Fungal communities play an important role in the carbon cycle as they are involved in the decomposition of various organic matters, such as plants, cellulose, keratin and collagen (Aislabie and Deslippe, 2013). Within the fungal community of soils under grazing were found microorganisms that are associated with animal origins, such as dung, meat and living tissue (e.g. Mortierellaceae, Microascaceae; hbm-mnb.ca).

## 3.4.2. Regional effect on soil microbial communities

Communities of all three soil microbial groups differed markedly among the three distinct study subregions. Spatial studies of soil microbial components conducted on scales ranging from the micro (from  $\mu$ m<sup>2</sup> to mm<sup>2</sup>)-, through plot- (from m<sup>2</sup> to hundreds m<sup>2</sup>) and regional- (from km<sup>2</sup> to hundreds km<sup>2</sup>), to global (>100000 km<sup>2</sup>; Constancias et al., 2015) level revealed significant spatial structuring of soil microbial communities (Constancias et al., 2015). Abiotic factors, namely edaphic (e.g. soil pH, texture) and climatic (precipitation, temperature) variables determine the distribution of soil microorganisms at a regional scale (Chen et al., 2016). The regions in this study were selected to represent broad differences in climate (and therefore vegetation and soils) and this likely altered the beta diversity clustering of bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities across the subregions. Similarly, beta plant diversity has been used to predict soil microbial beta diversity (Prober et al., 2015); the pronounced differences in

vegetation across the studied subregions therefore likely affected the soil microbial community in each region.

The abundance of each of the three microbial groups generally increased with soil moisture. A number of other studies have similarly reported positive relationships between soil moisture and the abundance of soil microorganisms, as well as species richness (Wang et al., 2015; Hawkins et al., 2003). However, other environmental factors such as soil properties might explain microbial abundance and community composition (Bachar et al., 2010). We observed higher abundance of bacteria and archaea within the FF subregion, which is one of the wettest subregions in the province. Interestingly, the richness of bacterial and archaeal communities tended to be higher in the MG, the driest, warmest and generally least productive subregion (Downing and Pettapiece, 2006). One possibility for this difference is soil texture, which within the MG subregion was mostly coarse (high sand content, Ø 0.5-1 mm), while the CP and FF had more medium textured soils (high silt content, Ø 0.002-0.5; Bock, 2016; www.fao.org). Compared to fine textured soils that have more water-filled pores, coarse textured soils tend to have isolated water films at the same soil water content (Chau et al., 2011), which creates isolated microhabitats that prevent competition between microorganisms and can increase species richness (Chau et al., 2011).

#### **3.5. Summary**

The amount of research on soil microbial ecology has increased sharply in recent years because of the importance that microbial communities play in regulating ecosystem function. However, within the Canadian Prairies this information is sparse. Given the spatial extent of grazing and the increasing demand for understanding the processes regulating carbon storage and

GHG emissions, these results suggest that microbial communities are largely resistant to moderate levels of grazing, such as those found in the study sites. However, it is essential that we understand the effects of higher levels of grazing in order to ensure the conservation of microbial resources (Aislabie and Deslippe, 2013) and provide capacity for these communities and the ecosystems in which they reside to adapt to future environmental changes.

Target	Primer sequence (5'-3')	Primer name	Reference
	<i>qPCR</i>		
Bacteria	ACT CCT ACG GGA GGC AGC AG	Eub338	Fierer et al., 2005
	ATT ACC GCG GCT GCT GG	Eub518	
Archaea	CGG GGY GCA SCA GGC GCG AA	A364a	Kemnitz et al.,
	GTG CTC CCC CGC CAA TTC CT	A934b	2007
Fungi	TTA GCA TGG AAT AAT RRA ATA GGA	nu-SSU-0817	Borneman and
	TCT GGA CCT GGT GAG TTT CC	nu-SSU-1196	Hartin, 2000
	NGS*		
Bacteria	CCT ACG GGN GGC WGC AG	341F	Klindworth et al.,
	GAC TAC HVG GGT ATC TAA TCC	805R	2013
Archaea	ACG GGG YGC AGC AGG CGC GA	344F	Takahashi et al.,
	GGA CTA CVS GGG TAT CTA AT	806R	2014
Fungi	CTT GGT CAT TTA GAG GAA GTA A	ITS1	Orgiazzi et al.,
	GCT GCG GTT CTT CAT CGA TGC	ITS2	2012

Table 3.1. Description of the primers used for the quantitative polymerase chain reaction (qPCR) and next-generation sequencing (NGS).

\* Illumina adapters TCG TCG GCA GCG TCA GAT GTG TAT AAG AGA CAG and GTC TCG TGG GCT CGG AGA TGT GTA TAA GAG ACA G were added to the forward and reverse primers, respectively

Table 3.2. Results of a mixed-model testing the effects of long-term grazing, geographical location (subregion) and temporal (monthly) variability, and their interactions, on abundance (gene copies per gram of soil, dry weight) of bacteria, archaea and fungi in rangeland soils of Alberta, Canada.

Factor	đf	2015			2016							
racioi	uI <sub>num</sub>	df <sub>res</sub>	F	Р	df <sub>res</sub>	F	Р					
			_									
Bacterial abunda	nce, gen	e copie	s $g^{-1}$ soil,	d.w.								
Treatment (GT)	1	12	0.116	0.739	11	0.998	0.338					
Subregion (S)	2	12	10.169	0.003	12	2.869	0.097					
Month (M)	2	47	13.707	<.0001	38	1.488	0.238					
S x GT	2	12	0.845	0.454	11	0.389	0.686					
GT x M	2	47	0.238	0.789	39	0.086	0.917					
S x M	4	47	1.389	0.252	38	2.149	0.093					
S x GT x M	4	47	2.533	0.053	39	1.791	0.151					
Archaeal abundar	Archaeal abundance, gene copies $g^{-1}$ soil, d.w.											
Treatment (GT)	1	12	0.040	0.844	12	1.075	0.319					
Subregion (S)	2	12	3.514	0.063	12	8.028	0.006					
Month (M)	2	48	5.879	0.005	43	2.695	0.079					
S x GT	2	12	0.491	0.624	12	0.226	0.801					
GT x M	2	48	0.835	0.440	44	1.719	0.191					
S x M	4	48	1.025	0.404	43	0.606	0.661					
S x GT x M	4	48	2.743	0.039	44	0.794	0.536					
Fungal abundanc	e, gene (	copies g	g <sup>-1</sup> soil, d.	W.								
Treatment (GT)	1	12	2.652	0.129	14	0.111	0.745					
Subregion (S)	2	12	3.002	0.088	13	1.445	0.349					
Month (M)	2	39	109.68	<.0001	35	4.713	0.015					
S x GT 2		12	0.239	0.791	13	0.081	0.922					
GT x M 2		39	1.147	0.328	34	0.589	0.561					
S x M 4		39	2.728	0.042	34	1.747	0.162					
S x GT x M	4	39	1.053	0.393	34	3.185	0.025					

Table 3.3. Results of a mixed-model testing the effects of soil water content (GWP), long-term grazing, geographic location (subregions), temporal (months) variabilities, and their interactions, on the bacterial, archaeal and fungal abundance within rangeland soils of Alberta, Canada in 2015 and 2016.

Factor	df	2015			2016	2016						
Factor	uI <sub>num</sub>	df <sub>den</sub>	F	Р	$df_{num}$	df <sub>den</sub>	F	Р				
Bacterial abundance, gen	e copies	s g <sup>-1</sup> soi	<i>l, d.w.</i>									
Water content (GWC)	1	62	1.697	0.197	1	52	4.530	0.038				
GWC x Treatment (GT)	1	17	0.410	0.531	1	11	0273	0.612				
GWC x Subregion (S)	2	25	8.182	0.002	2	21	0.333	0.721				
GWC x Month (M)	2	52	10.976	0.001	2	40	3.764	0.032				
GWC x GT x S	2	16	0.558	0.583	2	11	0.349	0.713				
GWC x S x M	4	54	3.094	0.023	4	40	2.566	0.053				
GWC x GT x M	2	51	0.076	0.927	2	38	0.113	0.893				
GWC x GT x T x M	4	52	0.782	0.542	4	38	1.805	0.148				
Archaeal abundance, gene copies $g^{-1}$ soil, d.w.												
Water content (GWC)	1	55	2.562	0.115	1	61	4.474	0.038				
GWC x Treatment (GT)	1	20	0.471	0.500	1	11	1.569	0.235				
GWC x Subregion (S)	2	31	5.607	0.008	2	22	7.131	0.004				
GWC x Month (M)	2	50	5.394	0.008	2	46	2.833	0.069				
GWC x GT x S	2	18	0.008	0.992	2	12	0.301	0.745				
GWC x S x M	4	53	3.762	0.009	4	47	2.479	0.056				
GWC x GT x M	2	53	0.790	0.458	2	42	0.329	0.721				
GWC x GT x T x M	4	53	0.787	0.539	4	43	0.433	0.784				
Fungal abundance, gene	copies g	g <sup>-1</sup> soil,	d.w.									
Water content (GWC)	1	45	1.622	0.209	1	49	0.620	0.435				
GWC x Treatment (GT)	1	20	0.689	0.416	1	13	0.142	0.712				
GWC x Subregion (S)	2	20	7.499	0.004	2	25	0.254	0.778				
GWC x Month (M)	2	48	59.044	<.001	2	39	3.819	0.030				
GWC x GT x S 2		17	1.037	0.376	2	14	0.417	0.666				
GWC x S x M 4		46	2.418	0.062	4	40	0.910	0.467				
GWC x GT x M	2	45	0.501	0.609	2	37	1.039	0.364				
GWC x GT x T x M	4	45	0.774	0.548	4	NA	NA	NA				

Table 3.4. Results of a mixed-model testing the effects of long-term grazing, geographic location (subregion) and temporal (month) variability, and their interactions, on alpha diversity characteristics of the bacterial community in rangeland soils of Alberta, Canada.

Factor	df	2015			2016						
Factor	dI <sub>num</sub>	df <sub>den</sub>	F	Р	$df_{den}$	F	Р				
Bacterial richnes	S										
Treatment (GT)	1	11	2.099	0.176	12	0.001	0.973				
Subregion (S)	2	12	2.712	0.106	12	5.416	0.021				
Month (M)	2	35	3.000	0.063	40	3.966	0.027				
GT x S	2	10	5.062	0.029	12	0.397	0.681				
GT x M	4	34	1.379	0.266	40	3.365	0.044				
S x M	2	34	1.053	0.394	39	0.806	0.528				
GT x S x M	4	34	0.615	0.655	39	0.316	0.866				
Shannon diversity index (bacteria)											
Treatment (GT)	1	12	1.075	0.321	12	0.035	0.855				
Subregion (S)	2	12	2.672	0.109	12	4.628	0.032				
Month (M)	2	32	8.003	0.001	38	2.020	0.146				
GT x S	2	12	1.800	0.209	12	1.256	0.319				
GT x M	4	32	2.802	0.075	38	1.906	0.162				
S x M	2	32	1.601	0.198	38	0.713	0.588				
GT x S x M	4	32	0.234	0.917	38	0.253	0.906				
Simpson diversity	v index (	bacteri	<i>a</i> )								
Treatment (GT)	1	12	2.021	0.181	12	4.112	0.065				
Subregion (S)	2	12	6.646	0.011	12	10.221	0.002				
Month (M)	2	33	5.512	0.008	39	2.425	0.102				
GT x S	2	12	1.341	0.298	12	2.538	0.120				
GT x M	4	33	2.135	0.134	39	1.064	0.355				
S x M	2	32	1.072	0.386	38	1.362	0.265				
GT x S x M	4	32	0.191	0.941	38	0.847	0.504				

Table 3.5. Results of a mixed-model testing the effects of long-term grazing, geographic location (subregion) and temporal (month) variability, and their interactions, on alpha diversity characteristics of the archaeal community in rangeland soils of Alberta, Canada.

Enotori	16	2015			2016	5	
Factor	dI <sub>num</sub>	df <sub>den</sub>	F	Р	df <sub>den</sub>	F	Р
Archaeal richness							
Treatment (GT)	1	12	0.962	0.345	12	0.927	0.355
Subregion (S)	2	12	9.688	0.003	12	18.852	0.001
Month (M)	2	39	2.153	0.129	45	0.829	0.443
GT x S	2	12	1.410	0.281	12	0.240	0.790
GT x M	4	39	1.342	0.273	45	0.014	0.986
S x M	2	39	1.317	0.281	45	1.342	0.269
GT x S x M	4	39	3.483	0.016	45	0.567	0.688
Shannon diversity	index (ar	chaea)					
Treatment (GT)	1	13	0.212	0.653	12	0.001	0.981
Subregion (S)	2	12	1.573	0.246	12	5.780	0.017
Month (M)	2	37	4.839	0.014	44	0.782	0.464
GT x S	2	12	0.155	0.858	12	0.048	0.953
GT x M	4	38	1.573	0.221	45	1.632	0.207
S x M	2	37	3.305	0.021	44	0.074	0.989
GT x S x M	4	37	0.349	0.843	45	0.885	0.481
Simpson diversity	index (ar	chaea)					
Treatment (GT)	1	13	0.107	0.749	12	0.124	0.731
Subregion (S)	2	12	2.959	0.089	12	5.453	0.021
Month (M)	2	38	2.988	0.062	44	0.409	0.667
GT x S	2	12	0.007	0.993	12	0.074	0.929
GT x M 4		38	0.686	0.509	45	2.757	0.074
S x M 2		37	1.918	0.128	44	0.025	0.999
GT x S x M	4	38	0.188	0.943	45	0.844	0.505

Table 3.6. Results of a mixed-model testing the effects of long-term grazing, geographic lo	cation
(subregion) and temporal (month) variability, and their interactions, on alpha diversity	
characteristics of the fungal community in rangeland soils of Alberta, Canada.	

Factor	đ	2015			2016		
Factor	aInum	df <sub>den</sub>	F	Р	df <sub>den</sub>	F	Р
Fungal richness							
Treatment (GT)	1	11	1.206	0.295	12	0.008	0.929
Subregion (S)	2	12	4.955	0.027	12	0.449	0.648
Month (M)	2	45	1.297	0.283	42	3.489	0.039
GT x S	2	11	1.097	0.367	12	1.485	0.265
GT x M	2	45	1.446	0.246	43	0.903	0.413
S x M	4	45	1.774	0.151	42	1.995	0.113
GT x S x M	4	45	0.598	0.666	43	0.990	0.423
Shannon diversity	, index	(fungi)					
Treatment (GT)	1	11	3.489	0.087	12	3.858	0.073
Subregion (S)	2	12	3.310	0.072	12	0.611	0.559
Month (M)	2	45	0.501	0.609	43	1.024	0.368
GT x S	2	11	0.092	0.912	12	2.734	0.106
GT x M	2	45	0.709	0.498	44	1.387	0.261
S x M	4	45	1.496	0.219	43	0.832	0.513
GT x S x M	4	45	0.348	0.844	43	1.477	0.226
Simpson diversity	index (	(fungi)					
Treatment (GT)	1	11	3.638	0.082	12	4.789	0.049
Subregion (S)	2	12	1.694	0.226	12	0.794	0.474
Month (M)	2	45	0.132	0.877	43	0.912	0.409
GT x S 2		11	0.103	0.903	12	2.219	0.152
GT x M 2		45	0.239	0.788	44	1.598	0.214
S x M	4	45	1.073	0.381	43	1.445	0.236
GT x S x M	4	45	0.395	0.811	43	1.403	0.249

Factor	201	5					201	6				
ractor	df	SS	MSS	F	R <sup>2</sup>	р	df	SS	MSS	F	R <sup>2</sup>	р
Bacteria												
Treatment (GT)	1	0.145	0.145	1.015	0.013	0.382	1	0.149	0.149	1.029	0.013	0.348
Subregion (S)	2	1.736	0.868	6.062	0.160	0.001	2	1.726	0.863	5.934	0.145	0.001
Month (M)	2	0.252	0.126	0.881	0.023	0.646	2	0.247	0.124	0.849	0.021	0.759
GT x S	2	0.289	0.145	1.012	0.027	0.385	2	0.262	0.131	0.899	0.022	0.644
GT x M	2	0.188	0.094	0.657	0.017	0.985	2	0.231	0.115	0.793	0.019	0.849
S x M	4	0.393	0.098	0.686	0.036	0.994	4	0.439	0.109	0.755	0.037	0.983
GT x S x M	4	7.444	0.099	0.697	0.037	0.987	4	0.427	0.107	0.734	0.036	0.991
Residuals	52	10.847	0.143		0.686		58	8.436	0.145		0.708	
Archaea												
Treatment (GT)	1	0.133	0.133	1.690	0.019	0.142	1	0.058	0.058	0.814	0.007	0.535
Subregion (S)	2	1.565	0.782	9.922	0.226	0.001	2	2.415	1.207	16.908	0.313	0.001
Month (M)	2	0.170	0.085	1.080	0.025	0.383	2	0.064	0.032	0.447	0.008	0.935
GT x S	2	0.099	0.049	0.629	0.014	0.775	2	0.142	0.071	0.995	0.018	0.432
GT x M	2	0.046	0.023	0.289	0.006	0.981	2	0.071	0.036	0.499	0.009	0.891
S x M	4	0.186	0.047	0.591	0.027	0.900	4	0.149	0.037	0.524	0.019	0.958
GT x S x M	4	0.073	0.018	0.230	0.010	1.000	4	0.105	0.026	0.369	0.014	0.994
Residuals	59	4.652	0.079		0.672		66	4.713	0.071		0.610	
Fungi												
Treatment (GT)	1	0.515	0.514	1.565	0.016	0.034	1	0.394	0.394	1.124	0.013	0.231
Subregion (S)	2	4.376	2.188	6.657	0.140	0.001	2	4.017	2.008	5.730	0.129	0.001
Month (M)	2	0.722	0.361	1.099	0.023	0.230	2	0.571	0.286	0.815	0.018	0.921
GT x S	2	0.714	0.357	1.086	0.023	0.262	2	0.780	0.390	1.113	0.025	0.183
GT x M	2	0.421	0.210	0.640	0.013	1.000	2	0.545	0.272	0.778	0.017	0.963
S x M	4	1.225	0.306	0.932	0.039	0.688	4	1.202	0.300	0.857	0.039	0.920
GT x S x M	4	0.919	0.229	0.699	0.029	1.000	4	1.176	0.294	0.839	0.038	0.957
Residuals	68	22.351	0.329		0.715		64	22.432	0.351		0.721	

Table 3.7. Results of permutational analysis of variance (Bray-Curtis distance) testing the effect of treatment (grazed / non-grazed), geographic location (subregion) and temporal (month) variability, and their interactions, on each of the bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities in rangeland soils of Alberta, Canada.

Table 3.8. Summary findings of long-term grazing effect on the abundance (qPCR), richness (observed OTUs), alpha diversity (Shannon and Simpson diversity indexes) and beta diversity (Bray-Curtis, unweighted UniFrac, weighted UniFrac) measures of soil bacterial (B), archaeal (A) and fungal (F) communities.

Maagura	20	15		20	16		Sourroo
wieasure	В	А	F	В	А	F	Source
Abundance (qPCR)	-	-	-	-	-	-	Table 2
Richness	-	-	-	-	-	-	
Shannon		-	+	-	-	+	Table 4, 5, 6
Simpson	-	-	+	+	-	+	
Bray-Curtis	-	-	+	-	-	-	
Unweighted UniFrac		-	+	-	-	+	Table 7, Appendix 5, 6
Weighted UniFrac		-	+	-	-	-	

"+" indicates that significant effect of long-term grazing on bacteria, archaea or fungi was found

	OTU	Phylum	А	В	S	Р	OTU	Phylum	А	В	S	Р		
			2015				2016							
	3507	Actinobacteria	0.764	0.487	0.61	0.010	1076	Acidobacteria	0.813	0.342	0.527	0.027		
	1808	Actinobacteria	0.794	0.297	0.486	0.035	3418	Actinobacteria	0.771	0.447	0.587	0.008		
	1229	Bacteroidetes	0.865	0.378	0.572	0.006	3463	Actinobacteria	0.760	0.289	0.469	0.036		
	2560	Bacteroidetes	0.832	0.405	0.581	0.007	3809	Actinobacteria	1.000	0.158	0.397	0.027		
	2407	Bacteroidetes	0.831	0.351	0.54	0.020	4008	Bacteroidetes	0.889	0.237	0.459	0.028		
	2443	Bacteroidetes	0.906	0.243	0.469	0.039	3033	Bacteroidetes	0.882	0.237	0.457	0.011		
	2610	BRC1	0.768	0.324	0.499	0.048	9453	Bacteroidetes	0.933	0.184	0.415	0.023		
pa	2436	Chloroflexi	0.885	0.243	0.464	0.022	6405	Bacteroidetes	0.933	0.184	0.415	0.031		
'az(	2116	Chloroflexi	0.794	0.216	0.414	0.049	1665	Chlorobi	0.786	0.316	0.498	0.020		
5	2667	Gemmatimonadetes	0.908	0.216	0.443	0.035	1312	Firmicutes	0.838	0.342	0.535	0.011		
	1095	Proteobacteria	0.763	0.459	0.592	0.016	1740	Planctomycetes	0.79	0.342	0.52	0.014		
	1133	Proteobacteria	0.784	0.432	0.582	0.018	3056	Proteobacteria	0.695	0.421	0.541	0.028		
	2835	Proteobacteria	0.751	0.405	0.552	0.037	1034	Proteobacteria	0.792	0.368	0.54	0.032		
	2674	Proteobacteria	0.926	0.216	0.447	0.018	636	Proteobacteria	0.714	0.368	0.513	0.043		
	2953	Proteobacteria	1.000	0.162	0.403	0.027	2393	Proteobacteria	0.95	0.237	0.474	0.006		
	5285	Proteobacteria	1.000	0.135	0.368	0.050	3346	Verrucomicrobia	0.804	0.289	0.482	0.046		
_							2075	Verrucomicrobia	0.750	0.237	0.421	0.040		
	4111	Acidobacteria	0.955	0.182	0.417	0.024	1276	Actinobacteria	0.829	0.342	0.533	0.011		
	2321	Acidobacteria	0.931	0.182	0.411	0.038	2828	Bacteroidetes	0.889	0.263	0.484	0.012		
	2229	Actinobacteria	0.849	0.273	0.481	0.034	6551	Bacteroidetes	0.900	0.184	0.407	0.045		
	7586	Actinobacteria	1.000	0.121	0.348	0.039	2391	Bacteroidetes	1.000	0.158	0.397	0.025		
	2331	Bacteroidetes	1.000	0.212	0.461	0.002	3336	BRC1	0.709	0.368	0.511	0.043		
zed	12635	Bacteroidetes	1.000	0.121	0.348	0.045	3302	Gracilibacteria	0.765	0.421	0.567	0.019		
graz	2530	Chlamydiae	0.768	0.515	0.629	0.009	6744	Microgenomates	0.92	0.211	0.440	0.018		
а-ц	6322	Chlamydiae	1.000	0.152	0.389	0.014	1444	Planctomycetes	0.808	0.474	0.619	0.005		
No	11029	Chloroflexi	1.000	0.152	0.389	0.029	2230	Planctomycetes	0.765	0.500	0.618	0.004		
	3216	Elusimicrobia	0.864	0.242	0.458	0.024	2001	Planctomycetes	0.867	0.237	0.453	0.026		
	4001	FCPU426	0.858	0.394	0.581	0.003	1881	Planctomycetes	0.764	0.421	0.567	0.029		
	9857	Firmicutes	1.000	0.121	0.348	0.050	1218	Planctomycetes	0.809	0.368	0.546	0.025		
	5879	Firmicutes	0.959	0.242	0.482	0.009	2429	Proteobacteria	0.786	0.342	0.518	0.015		
	8089	Microgenomates	1.000	0.152	0.389	0.029	1296	Proteobacteria	0.78	0.342	0.517	0.022		

Table 3.9. Indicator OTUs analysis of soil bacterial communities associated with grazed and non-grazed treatments in 2015 and 2016.

5318	Parcubacteria	0.925	0.152	0.374	0.043	3192	Proteobacteria	0.771	0.342	0.514	0.013
6953	Peregrinibacteria	0.842	0.242	0.452	0.046	2538	Proteobacteria	0.913	0.237	0.465	0.017
7371	Planctomycetes	0.771	0.242	0.432	0.040	1862	Proteobacteria	0.714	0.342	0.494	0.032
6308	Proteobacteria	0.883	0.242	0.463	0.029	460	Proteobacteria	0.985	0.184	0.426	0.038
16798	Proteobacteria	0.953	0.182	0.416	0.023	1872	Proteobacteria	0.917	0.184	0.411	0.047
4348	Proteobacteria	0.940	0.152	0.377	0.036						
1763	Verrucomicrobia	0.909	0.303	0.525	0.005						
2268	Verrucomicrobia	0.857	0.303	0.51	0.003						

Text in bold indicates strong association of species with grazed or non-grazed treatment

GT	OTU	Phylum	А	В	S	Р	OTU	Phylum	А	В	S	Р
			2015						2016			
	626	Ascomycota	0.946	0.250	0.486	0.013	486	Ascomycota	0.924	0.600	0.744	0.006
	776	Ascomycota	0.722	0.386	0.528	0.035	350	Ascomycota	0.922	0.400	0.607	0.049
	965	Ascomycota	0.856	0.227	0.441	0.032	776	Ascomycota	0.879	0.300	0.513	0.024
	1140	Ascomycota	0.995	0.205	0.451	0.008	519	Ascomycota	0.949	0.250	0.487	0.032
pa	350	Ascomycota*	0.850	0.546	0.681	0.006	626	Ascomycota	0.986	0.225	0.471	0.002
az(	152	Basidiomycota	0.867	0.409	0.595	0.035	1559	Ascomycota	0.897	0.150	0.367	0.037
5	228	Basidiomycota	0.939	0.341	0.566	0.024	2443	Ascomycota	0.967	0.125	0.348	0.037
	1291	Basidiomycota	1.000	0.159	0.399	0.015	208	Basidiomycota	0.954	0.200	0.437	0.041
	1961	Basidiomycota	0.829	0.318	0.514	0.014						
	2920	Basidiomycota	0.978	0.136	0.365	0.045						
	4869	Basidiomycota	1.000	0.136	0.369	0.027						
	629	Ascomycota	0.886	0.619	0.741	0.001	441	Ascomycota	0.974	0.524	0.714	0.001
	572	Ascomycota	0.835	0.595	0.705	0.010	239	Ascomycota	0.991	0.381	0.615	0.001
	441	Ascomycota	0.904	0.548	0.704	0.001	581	Ascomycota	0.829	0.476	0.628	0.013
	611	Ascomycota	0.808	0.595	0.694	0.008	1711	Ascomycota	0.917	0.262	0.490	0.008
	837	Ascomycota	0.863	0.452	0.625	0.013	647	Ascomycota	0.826	0.262	0.465	0.020
	239	Ascomycota	0.876	0.429	0.613	0.027	689	Ascomycota	0.971	0.167	0.402	0.041
	543	Ascomycota	0.86	0.429	0.607	0.004	543	Ascomycota	0.978	0.309	0.550	0.006
	4121	Ascomycota	1.000	0.167	0.408	0.008	2529	Basidiomycota	1.000	0.262	0.512	0.001
zed	1593	Ascomycota	0.988	0.119	0.343	0.04	762	Basidiomycota	0.699	0.309	0.465	0.032
graz	500	Ascomycota	0.821	0.357	0.541	0.007	1078	Basidiomycota	1.000	0.167	0.408	0.012
ц- ц	1604	Ascomycota	0.979	0.19	0.432	0.006	135	Basidiomycota	0.887	0.405	0.599	0.017
No	1087	Ascomycota	0.739	0.381	0.531	0.016	43	Basidiomycota	0.921	0.524	0.694	0.049
	992	Ascomycota	0.941	0.190	0.423	0.039	504	Basidiomycota	0.811	0.476	0.621	0.016
	1711	Ascomycota	0.842	0.286	0.490	0.020	316	Basidiomycota	0.997	0.167	0.408	0.048
	1147	Ascomycota	0.86	0.262	0.475	0.014	682	Chytridiomycota	1.000	0.167	0.408	0.010
	1819	Ascomycota	0.981	0.214	0.458	0.004	836	Zygomycota	1.000	0.143	0.378	0.027
	689	Ascomycota	0.969	0.214	0.456	0.005						
	221	Ascomycota	1.000	0.190	0.436	0.002						
	2037	Basidiomycota	0.876	0.190	0.409	0.021						
	832	Basidiomycota	0.792	0.357	0.532	0.046						

Table 3.10. Indicator OTUs analysis for soil fungal communities associated with grazed and non-grazed treatments in 2015 and 2016.

 316	Basidiomycota	0.972	0.167	0.402	0.012
731	Basidiomycota	0.873	0.286	0.500	0.018
167	Basidiomycota	0.819	0.405	0.576	0.048
891	Glomeromycota	0.777	0.381	0.544	0.011
2276	Zygomycota	1.000	0.119	0.345	0.021
3268	Zygomycota	1.000	0.095	0.309	0.037

\*Italic text indicates overlap between years within grazed or non-grazed treatments; text in bold indicates a strong association of species with grazed or non-grazed treatment



Fig. 3.1. Abundance of soil bacteria (B, gene copies per gram of soil, dry weight) in grassland soils of Alberta, Canada. (A) different lowercase letters indicate significant differences for the 3-way interaction between grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments, Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions, and month in 2015; (B) different lowercase letters indicate significant differences for the 2-way interaction between months and Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions in 2016. Vertical bars represent ± standard error.



Fig. 3.2. Abundance of soil archaea (gene copies per gram of soil, dry weight) in grassland soils of Alberta, Canada in 2015. Vertical bars represent  $\pm$  standard error.



Fig. 3.3. Abundance of soil fungi (gene copies per gram of soil, dry weight) in grassland soils of Alberta, Canada. (*A*) different lowercase letters indicate significant differences for the 2-way interaction between months and Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions in 2015; (*B*) different lowercase letters indicate significant differences for the 3-way interaction between grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments, Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions and months in 2016. Vertical bars represent  $\pm$  standard error.



Fig. 3.4. Relationship between gravimetric soil water content (GWC) and the abundance of soil bacteria (B) in 2015 (A, B, C) and 2016 (D, E, F). (A) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions in 2015; (B) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and months in 2015; (C) represents the 3-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2015; (D) represents the overall interaction between GWC and bacterial abundance in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; (F) represents the 3-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016. Only significant lines are presented in the graphs C and F.



Fig. 3.5. Relationship between gravimetric soil water content (GWC) and abundance of soil archaea (A) in 2015 (A, B, C) and 2016 (D, E, F). (A) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions in 2015; (B) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and months in 2015; (C) represents the 3-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2015; (D) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and subregions in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and months in 2016; (F) represents the 3-way interaction between GWC, subregions in 2016; (E) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and months in 2016; (F) represents the 3-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2016; Only significant lines are presented in the graphs C and F.



Fig. 3.6. Relationship between gravimetric soil water content (GWC) and abundance of soil fungi (F) in 2015 (A, B, C) and 2016 (D, E, F). (A) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions in 2015; (B) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and months in 2015; (C) represents the 3-way interaction between GWC, subregions and months in 2015; (D) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and months in 2015; (D) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and months in 2015; (D) represents the 2-way interaction between GWC and months in 2016. Only significant lines are presented in the graph C.



Fig. 3.7. Bacterial richness and Shannon diversity index in 2015 (A, C) and 2016 (B). (A, B) represent the 2-way interaction between Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions and grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments in 2015 and 2016, respectively; (C) represents the 2-way interaction between months and grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments in 2015.



Fig. 3.8. Archaeal richness and Simpson index in 2015 (A) and 2016 (B). (A) represents the 3way interaction between months, Central Parkland (CP), Mixedgrass (MG) and Foothills Fescue (FF) subregions as well as grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments in 2015; (B) represents the 2-way interaction between months and grazed (G) and non-grazed (NG) treatments in 2016.



Fig. 3.9. Non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMDS) plot based on Bray-Curtis dissimilarities between bacterial (upper), archaeal (middle) and fungal (lower) communities of rangeland soils. Only significant variables are shown. Direction of arrows indicates increasing values of the variables, while length of arrows indicates stronger relationship.



Fig. 3.10. Fungal community composition differences between the NG and G treatments in 2015 (A) and 2016 (B). Differences were calculated using the DESeq2 package in R as log2(NG/G). Negative values indicate higher representation of the individual family under long-term grazing.

#### Chapter 4. General discussion and conclusion

Grasslands cover up to 40% of the Earth's terrestrial surface and provide a wide range of benefits for the environment, economy and society (Wu et al., 2010; Follet and Reed, 2010). The maintenance of healthy and productive rangelands is a critical task for the well-being and survival of millions of people (Evans et al., 2017). However, development of appropriate grassland management to promote their conservation is impossible without comprehensive studies of the ecosystem and an understanding of their underlying processes.

Sequestration of carbon and nitrogen by grassland soils have the potential to play an important role in regulating climate change, as grasslands cover a large amount of the terrestrial surface and can be a significant sink for GHG (Piñeiro et al., 2010; Soussana et al., 2010). However, the specific role livestock grazing plays in altering GHG exchange between soil and atmosphere is still unclear, especially in Alberta, where only a few studies have been conducted at a limited number of locations (Gao el., 2017; Tomas et al., 2018). While soil microbial communities play a critical role in ecosystem functions, including producing or consuming of GHG (Doran and Zeiss, 2000; Classen et al., 2015; Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2016), the study of long-term grazing effects on soil microorganisms is largely neglected, especially in grasslands (Eldridge et al., 2017).

The overall purpose of this thesis was to investigate the effect of long-term livestock grazing on GHG and soil microbial communities across Alberta grasslands. In Chapter 2, I investigated the long-term grazing effect on GHG exchange between soil and atmosphere. In Chapter 3, I assessed the impact of long-term grazing on soil microbial communities. Below, I highlight the findings from both chapters and provide suggestions for future research.

In Chapter 2, I provided a quantitative assessment of soil GHG emission / consumption from rangelands widely distributed across Alberta. The study's uniqueness is that it was the first to do so across a broad range of edaphic and climatic conditions. GHG were quantified in areas with and without long-term grazing over two growing seasons. I then used these data to calculate the global warming potential of soils. The cumulative values of  $CO_2$  fluxes during both years were not affected by livestock grazing itself, but fluxes varied further with the grazing x year interaction, which indicated strong inter-annual variation in grazing-induced changes. Hence, grazing effects on GHG were strongly mediated by variation in growing conditions such as climate. This study was conducted during two years that differed highly in climatic conditions; higher emissions of CO<sub>2</sub> were evident from long-term grazing in the wet year, while remaining lower compared to the non-grazed area in the dry year. The broad geographic range of the study further allowed subregion-specific properties (i.e., content of soil organic carbon and soil water content) to be assessed, both of which had a high importance in regulating GHG fluxes. Overall, the study provides important information on the carbon and nitrogen balance calculations for these grasslands. Moreover, the large spatial coverage and multiple years evaluated allowed quantification of GHGs across the various climatic conditions, which provide important information for the development / modification of rangeland management practice within each individual subregion.

In Chapter 3, I investigated long-term grazing effects on soil microbial communities by examining the abundance and community composition of bacteria, archaea and fungi using molecular biology techniques. The uniqueness of the study is that it is one of the first to examine belowground biodiversity in northern temperate grasslands across multiple locations. Soil microbial communities in grazed areas had few differences compared to non-grazed areas. While

abundance of microbial communities was not affected by long-term grazing itself as well as alpha and beta diversity of bacterial and archaeal communities, however alpha and beta diversity of fungal communities were affected by main grazing effect, while the abundance of these communities was not affected. Also, I identified numerous individual OTUs within the fungal community that were associated with either grazed or non-grazed areas. Hence, the difference within the fungal community may have been associated with animal impacts, such as the provision of extra substrate for them (tissues, urine etc.). Strong clustering of the bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities was found, which in turn, were associated with the three subregions studied. This likely indicates that climatic conditions and environmental factors other than long-term grazing have greater impact on soil microbial communities. Moreover, the richness and abundance of communities were also associated with regional (spatial) variability. These findings were attributed to the unique soil characteristics of the different subregions. Thus, this investigation helps to understand the biotic component of rangeland soils as well as the effect of long-term grazing within them.

Combined, the two data chapters in this thesis show that long-term grazing itself had limited impacts on overall GHG and soil microbial communities. In contrast, subregion specific characteristics (soils as well as climatic conditions) had greater impact on the observed GHG and soil microorganisms. The results from this study are important as they demonstrate that these soils and associated processes related to GHG fluxes appear to be relatively resistant to the main effect of light to moderate levels of grazing, and provide a broad assessment of microbial diversity across Alberta grassland ecosystems.

## Further direction

While I have provided new information about GHG and microbial diversity across Alberta's grassland ecosystems, there are few questions that remain uncovered. First, I identified numerous OTUs that responded to grazing, and the link between ecosystem processes and the identity of these microorganisms remains unclear. Further testing of functional features (e.g. functional genes) of specific microbes and the microbial communities and their effects on ecosystem processes (e.g. GHG flux) can be achieved by applying bioinformatic tools (e.g. PICRUSt) based on the data that were obtained in the present study, or further molecular analysis (e.g. shotgun metagenomics) or microarrays (e.g. GeoChip). Characterizing the linkages between key biogeochemical processes and functional community composition will provide further understanding of how these processes can be managed in grasslands under long-term grazing. Also, a further analysis can be done, e.g. connection diversity of plants and microbial community's composition as well as GHG and microbial taxa. Secondly, in this study I examined two distinctly divergent systems, grazed or non-grazed, while in actuality grazing management employs a broad spectrum of grazing systems that are known to have differential effects on plant communities (Vermeire et al., 2008). Furthermore, the grazed sites in this study were provincial lands that were light to moderately grazed, at stocking rates lower than those potentially practiced on private land. Further work could explore the impacts of a larger range of both grazing systems and grazing intensities to provide further information on how grazing management can be modified to offset greenhouse gases.

# References

- Abbasi M.K., Müller C. (2011) Trace gas fluxes of CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O in a permanent grassland soil exposed to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> in the Giessen FACE study. Atmos. Chem. Phys. 11: 9333-9342.
- Adams, B.W., J Richman, L. Poulin-Klein, K. France, D. Moisey and R.L. McNeil. 2013.
  Rangeland Plant Communities for the Dry Mixedgrass Natural Subregion of Alberta.
  Second Approximation. Rangeland Management Branch, Policy Division, Alberta
  Environment and Sustainable Resource Development, Lethbridge, Pub. No. T/0401 35pp.
- Adams, B.W., R. Ehlert, D. Moisey and R.L. McNeil. 2003. Rangeland Plant Communities and Range Health Assessment Guidelines for the Foothills Fescue Natural Subregion of Alberta. Rangeland Management Branch, Public Lands Division, Alberta Sustainable Resource Development, Lethbridge, Pub. No. T/038 85 pp.
- Aislabie J., Deslippe J.R. Soil microbes and their contribution to soil services. In Dymond JR ed. Ecosystem services in New Zeland-conditions and trends.
- Alberta Agriculture and Forestry. 2015 Range and pasture management, http://www1.agric.gov.ab.ca/\$department/deptdocs.nsf/all/sag2111
- Alberta Environment and Parks. 2015. Grazing and range management, http://aep.alberta.ca/lands-forests/grazing-range-management/default.aspx
- Aldezabal A., Moragues L., Odriozola I., Mijangos I. (2015) Impact of grazing abandonment of plant and soil microbial communities in an Atlantic mountain grassland. Applied Soil Ecology. 96: 251-260.
- Asgedom H., Kebreab E. (2011) Beneficial management practices and mitigation of greenhouse gas emissions in the agriculture of Canadian Prairie: a review. Agronomy for Sustainable Development. 31 (3): 433-451.
- Auguet J., Barberan A., Casamayor E. (2010) Global ecological patterns in uncultured Archaea. The ISME Journal. 4 (2). 182-190.
- Baah-Acheamfour M., Carlyle C., Lim S-S., Bork E.W., Chang S.X. (2016) Forest and grassland cover types reduce net greenhouse gas emissions from agricultural soils. Science of the total Environment. 571: 1115-1127.
- Bachar A., Al-Ashhab A., Ines M., Soares M., Sklarz M.Y., Angel R., Ungar E.D., Gillor O. (2010) Soil microbial abundance and diversity along a low precipitation gradient. Microbial Ecology. 60: 453-461.
- Baldock J.A., Wheeler I., McKenzie N., McBrateny A. (2012) Soils and climate change: potential impacts on carbon stocks and greenhouse gas emissions, and future research for Australian agriculture. Crop and Pasture Science. 63 (3). 269-283.
- Bardgett R.D., Cook R. (1998) Functional aspects of soil animal diversity in agricultural grasslands. Applied Soil Ecology. 10 (1): 263-276.
- Bardgett R.D., Leemans D.K., Cook R., Hobbs P.J. (1997) Seasoality of the soil biota of grazed and ungrazed hill grassland. Soil Biology and Biochemistry. 29 (8): 1285-1294.
- Bardgett R.D., van der Putten W.H. (2014) Belowground biodiversity and ecosystem functioning. Nature. 515: 505-511.
- Bardgett R.D., Wardle D.A. (2003) Herbivore-mediated linkages between aboveground and belowground communities. Ecology. 84 (9): 2258-2268.
- Bates D., Maechler M., Bolker B., Walker S., Christensen R.H.B., Singmann H., Dai B., Scheipl F., Grothendieck G., Green P. (2017) Package "Ime4". pp. 114.

- Blake G.R., Hartge, K.H. (1986) Bulk density. In: Klute, A., Ed., Methods of Soil Analysis, Part
  1—Physical and Mineralogical Methods, 2nd Edition, Agronomy Monograph 9,
  American Society of Agronomy—Soil Science Society of America, Madison, 363-382.
- Bock M.D. (ed.), Alberta Soil Information Centre. 2016. Alberta Soil Names File (Generation 4) User's Handbook. Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, Science and Technology Branch, Edmonton, AB. 166 pp.
- Borneman J., Hartin R.J. (2000) PCR primers that amplify fungal rRNA genes from environmental samples. Appl Environ Microbiol. 66 (10). 4356-4360.
- Boughner L.A., Singh P. (2016) Microbial Ecology: where are we now? Postdoc J. 4 (11). 3-17.
- Bremer D.J., Ham J.M., Owensby C.E., Knapp A.K. (1998) Responses of respiration to clipping and grazing in tallgrass prairie. Journal of Environmental Quality. 27: 1539-1548.
- Brussaard L. (1997) Biodiversity and Ecosystem Functioning in Soil. AMBIO. 26 (8): 563-570.
- Butterbach-Bach K., Baggs E. M., Dannenmann M., Kiese R., Zechmeister-Boltenstern S. (2013) Nitrous oxide emission from soils: how well do we understand the process and their control? Philosophical transactions of the Royal society B. 368: 1-13.
- Cao G., Tang Y., Mo W., Wang Y., Li Y., Zhao X. (2004) Grazing intensity alters soil respiration in an alpine meadow on the Tibetan plateau. Soil Biology and Biochemistry. 36: 237-243.
- Chau J.F., Bagtzoglou A.C., Willing M.R. (2011) The effect of soil texture on richness and diversity of bacterial communities. Environmental Forensics. 12: 333-341.
- Chen J., Hou F., Chen X., Wan X., Millner J. (2015) Stocking rate and grazing season modify soil respiration on the Loess Plateau, China. Rangeland ecology and Management. 68: 48-53.
- Chen W., Wolf B., Zheng X., Yao Z., Butterbach-Bahl K., Brüggemann N., Liu C., Han S., Han X. (2011) Annual methane uptake by temperate semiarid steppes as regulated by stocking rates, aboveground plant biomass and topsoil air permeability. Global Change Biology. 17: 2803–2816.
- Chen Y-L., Ding J-Z., Peng Y-F., Li F., Yang G-B., Liu L., Qin S-Q., Fang K., Yang Y-H. (2016) Patterns and drivers of soil microbial communities in Tibetian alpine and global terrestrial ecosystems. Journal of Biogeography. 43: 2027-2039.
- Chroňáková A., Ascher J., Jirout J., Ceccherini M.T., Elhottová D., Pietramellara G., Šimek M. (2013) Cattle impact on composition of archaeal, bacterial and fungal communities by comparative fingerprinting of total and extracellular DNA. Biol Fertil Soils. 49. 351-361.
- Chroňáková A., Radl V., Čuhel J., Šimek M., Elhottová D., Engel M., Schloter M. (2009) Owervintering management on upland pasture causes shifts in an abundance of denitrifying microbial communities, their activity and N2O-reducing ability. Soil Biology and Biochemistry. 41. 1132-1138.
- Chroňáková A., Schloter-Hai B., Radj V., Endesfelder D., Quince C., Elhottová D., Šimek M., Schloter M (2015) Response of archaeal and bacterial communities to changes associated with outdoor cattle overwintering. PLoS ONE. 10 (8): e0135627.
- Chuan X. Carlyle C.N., Bork E.W., Chang S.X., Hewins D.B. (2018) Long-term grazing accelerated litter decomposition in northern temperate grasslands. Ecosystems.
- Classen A.T., Sundqvist M.K., Henning J.A., Newman G.S., Moore J.A.M. Cregger M.A., Moorhead L.C., Patterson C.M. (2015) Direct and indirect effects of climate change on soil microbial and soil microbial-plant interactions: what lies ahead? Ecosphere. 6 (8). Article 130.

- Collier S.M., Dean A.P., Oates L.G., Ruark M.D., Jackson R.D. (2016) Does plant biomass manipulation in static chambers affect nitrous oxide emissions from soils? Journal of Environmental Quality. 45: 751-756.
- Conant R.T., Paustian K., Del Grosso S.J., Parton W.J. (2005) Nitrogen pools and fluxes in grassland soils sequestering carbon. Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems. 71: 239-248.
- Conrad R. (1996) Soil Microorganisms as controllers of atmospheric trace gases (H<sub>2</sub>, CO, CH<sub>4</sub>, OCS, N<sub>2</sub>O and NO). Microbiological Reviews. 60 (4): 609-640.
- Constancias F., Terrat S., Saby N.P.A., Horrigue W., Villerd J., Guillemin J-P., Biju-Duval L., Nowak V., Dequiedt S., Ranjard L., Prevost-Bouré N.C. (2015) Mapping and determinism of soil microbial community distribution across an agricultural landscape. MicrobiologyOpen. 4 (3): 505-517.
- Cowan N.J., Norman P., Famulari D., Levy P.E., Reay D.S., Skiba U.M. Spatial variability and hotspots of soil N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes from intensively grazed grasslands. Biogeosciences. 12: 1585-1596.
- Delgado-Baquerizo M., Maestre F.T., Reich P.B., Jeffries T.C., Gaitan J.J., Encinar D., Berdugo M., Campbell C.D., Singh B.K. (2016) Microbial diversity drives multifunctionality in terrestrial ecosystem. Nature Communicators. 7:10541 doi: 10.1038/ncomms10541
- Doran J.W., Zeiss M.R. (2000) Soil health and sustainability: managing the biotic component of soil quality, Applied Soil Ecology. 15: 3–11.
- Dormaar J.F., Adams B.W., Willms W.D. (1997) Impact of rotational grazing on Mixed Prairie soils and vegetation. Journal of Range Management. 50 (6): 647-651.
- Dormaar J.F., Willms W.D. (1998) Effect of forty-four years of grazing on fescue grassland soils. Journal of Range Management. 51. 122–126.
- Downing, D.J., Pettapiece, W.W. 2006. Natural regions and subregions of Alberta. Government of Alberta. Publication Number: T/852.
- Dufrene M., Legendre P. (1997) Species assemblages and indicator species: the need for a flexible assymetrical approach. Ecological Monographs. 67: 345-366.
- Edgar R.C. (2013) UPARSE: highly accurate OTU sequences from microbial amplicon reads. Nat Methods. 10 (10): 996-998.
- Edgar R.C., Haas B.J., Clemente J.C., Quince C., Knight R. (2011) UCHIME improves sensitivity and speed of chimers detection. Bioinformatics. 27 (16): 2194-2200.
- Eldridge D.J., Delgado-Baquerizo M., Travers S.K., Vai J., Oliver I., Hamonts K., Singh B.K. (2017) Competition drives the response of soil microbial diversity to increased grazing by vertebrate herbivores. 98 (7): 1922-1931.
- Elhottová D., Koubová A., Šimek M., Cajthaml T., Jirout J., Esperschuetz J., Schloter M., Gattinger A. (2012) Changes in soil microbial communities as affected by intensive cattle husbandry. Applied Soil Ecology. 58. 56-65.
- Evans R.D., Gill R.A., Eviner V.T., Bailey V. (2017) Soil and belowground processes. In: Rangeland Systems (Briske D.D., ed.)
- Eyles A., Coghlan G., Hardie M., Hovenden M., Bridle K. (2015) Soil carbon sequestration in cool-temperate dryland pastures: mechanisms and management options. Soil research. 53: 349-365.
- Fierer N., Jackson J.A., Vilgalys R., Jackson R.B. (2005) Assessment od soil microbial community structure by use of taxon-specific quantitative PCR assays. Applied and Environemtal microbiology. 71 (7): 4117-4120.

- Flechard C.R., Ambus P., Skiba U., Rees R.M., Hensen A., van Amstel A., van den Pol-van Dasselaar A., Soussana J.-F., Jones M., Clifton-Brown J., Raschi M., , Horvath L., Neftel A., Jocher M., Ammann C., Leifeld J., Fuhrer J., Calanca P., Thalman E., Pilegaard K., Di Marco C., Campbell C., Nemitz E., Hargreaves K.J., Levy P.E. Ball B.C., Jones S.K., van de Bulk W.C.M., Groote T., Blom M., Domingues R., Kasper G., Allard V., Ceschia E., Cellier P., Laville P., Henault C., Bizouard F., Abdalla M., Williams M., Baronti S., Berretti F., Grosz B. (2007) Effects of climate and management intensity on nitrous oxide emissions in grassland systems across Europe. Agriculture, Ecosystems & Environment. 121 (1–2): 135–152.
- Follet R.F., Reed D.A. (2010) Soil carbon sequestration in grazing lands: societal benefits and policy implications. Rangeland ecology and management. 63 (1): 4-15.
- Follet R.F., Stewart C.E., Pruessner E.G., Kimble J.M. (2012) Effect of climate change on soil carbon and nitrogen storage in the US Great Plains. Journal of soil and water conservation. 67 (5): 331-342.
- Ford H., Rousk J., Garbutt A., Jones L. (2013) Grazing effects on microbial community composition, growth and nutrient cycling in salt marsh and sand dune grasslans. Biology and Fertility of Soils. 49 (1). 89-98.
- Frank A.B., Liebig M.A., Hanson J.D. (2002) Soil carbon dioxide fluxes in northern semiarid grasslands. Soil Biology and Biochemistry. 34: 1235-1241.
- Fynn A.J., Alvarez P., Brown J.R., George M.R., Kustin C., Laca E.A., Oldfield J.T., Schohr T., Neely C.L., Wong C.P. (2010) // Soil carbon sequestration in United States rangepands. Integrated Crop Management. 11: 57-104.
- Gao X., Thomas B.W., Beck R., Thompson D.J., Zhao M., Willms W.D., Hao X. (2017) Longterm grazing alters soil trace gas fluxes from grasslands in the Foothills of the Rocky Mountains, Canada. Land Degradation and Development. DOI: 10.1002/ldr.2664.
- Gou Y.N., Nan Z.B., Hou F.J. (2015) Diversity and structure of a bacterial community in grassland soils distributed by sheep grazing, in the Loess Plateau of northwestern China. Genetics and Molecular Research. 14 (4). 16987-16999.
- Greenwood K.L., McKenzie B.M. (2001) Grazing effect on soil physical properties and the consequences for pasture: a review. Australian Journal of Experimental Agriculture. 41: 1231-1250.
- Griffin J.C. (2016) Insights into the soil microbial communities in New Zealand indigenous tussock grasslands. PhD thesis.
- Hauswedell H., Singer J., Reinert K. (2014) Lambda: the local aligner for massive biological data. Bioinformatics. 30: 349-355.
- Hawkins B.A., Field R., Cornell H.V., Currie D.J., Guégan J-F., Kaufman D.M., Kerr J.T., Mittelbach G.G., Oberdorff T., O'Brien E.M., Porter E.E., Turner J.R.G. (2003) Energy, water, and broad-scale geographic patterns of species richness. *Ecology.* 84: 3105-3017.
- Healy R.W., Striegl R.G., Russell T.F., Hutchinson G.L., Livingston G.P. (1996) Numerical evaluation of static-chamber measurements of soil-atmosphere gas exchange: identification of physical processes. Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J. 60: 740-747.
- Hewins D.B., Lyseng M.P., Schoderbek D.F., Alexander M., Willms W.D., Carlyle C.N., Chang S.X., Bork E.W. (2018) Grazing and climate effects on soil organic carbon concentration and particle-size association in northern grasslands. Nature Scientific reports. 8: 1-9.
- Hildebrand F., Tadeo R., Voigt A. Y., Bork P., Raes J. (2014) LotuS: an efficient and userfriendly OUT processing pipeline. Microbiome. 2 (30): 1-7.

- Hodel M., Schütz M., Vandegehuchte M. L., Frey B., Albrecht M., Busse M. D., Risch A. C. (2014) Does the aboveground herbivore assemblage influence soil bacterial community composition and richness in Subalpine grasslands? Microbial Ecology. 68: 584-595.
- Hufkens K., Keenan T.F., Flanagan L.B., Scott R.L., Bernacchi C.J., Joo E., Brunsell N.A., Verfaillie J., Richardson A.D. (2016) Productiviety of Northern American grasslands in increased under future climate scenarios despite rising aridity. Nature Climate Change. 6: 710-714.
- Huhe, Chen X., Hou F., Wu Y., Cheng Y. (2017) Bacterial and fungal community structures in Loess Plateau grasslands with different grazing intensiites. Frontiers in Microbiology. 8: 1-10.
- Ingram L.J., Stahl P.D., Schuman G.E., Buyer J.S., Vance G.F., Ganjegunte G.K., Welker J.M., Derner J.D. (2008) Grazing impact on soil carbon and microbial communities in a mexed-grass ecosystem. Soil Science Society of America Journal. 72: 939-948.
- IPCC (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, 2014) Synthesis report. Summary for policy makers. pp. 32.
- Jirout J., Šimek M., Elhottová D. (2011) Inputs of nitrogen and organic matter govern the composition of fungal communities in soil disturbed by overwintering cattle. Soil Biology and Biochemistry. 43. 647-656.
- Jobbágy E.G., Jackson R.B. (2000) The vertical distribution of soil organic carbon and its relation to climate and vegetation. Ecological Applications. 10 (2): 423-436.
- Johnson L.C., Matchett J.R. (2000) Fire and grazing regulate belowground processes in tallgrass prairie. Ecology. 82 (12): 3377-3389.
- Johnston C.A., Groffman P., Breshears D.D., Gardon Z.G., Currie W., Emanuel W., Gaudinski J., Jackson R.B., Lajtha K., Nadelhoffer K., Nelson D., Post W.M., Retallack G., Wielopolski L. (2004) Carbon cycling in soil. Fron Ecol Environ. 2 (10): 522-528.
- Kemnitz D., Kolb S., Conrad R. (2007) High abundance of Crenarchaeota in a temperate acidic forest soil. FEMS Microbiol Ecol. 60: 442-228.
- Killham K., Prosser J.I. (2015) The Bacteria and Archaea. In: Soil Microbiology, Ecology, and Biochemistry. Research Bulletin. 4603. pp. 41-76.
- Klindworth A., Pruesse E., Schweer T., Peplies J., Quast C., Horn M., Clöckner F.O. (2013) Evaluation of general 16S ribosomal RNA gene PCR primers for classical and nextgeneration sequencing-based diversity studies. Nucleic Acids Res. 41 (1): 1-11.
- Knight J.E. (2014) Effectiveness of modifying fences to exclude ungulates from high-value livestock pastures. pp. 8.
- Kotzé E., Sandhage-Hofmann A., Amelung W., Oomen R.J., du Preez C.C. (2017) Soil microbial communities in different rangeland management systems of a sandy savanna and clayey grassland ecosystem, South Africa. Nutr Cycl Agroecosyst. 107: 227-245.
- Leahy P., Kiely G., Scanlon T.M. (2004) Managed grasslands: A greenhouse gas sink or source? Geophysical research letters. 31. 1-4.
- LeCain D.R., Morgan J.A., Schuman G.E., Reeder J.D., Hart R.H. (2002) Carbon exchange and species composition of grazed pastures and exclosures in the shortgrass steppe of Colorado. Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment. 93: 421-435.
- LeCain D.R., Morgan J.A., Schuman G.E., Reeder J.D., Hart R.H. (2000) Carbon exchange rates in grazed and ungrazed pastures of Wyoming. J. Range Management. 53: 199-206.
- Lenth R., Love J., Herve M. (2018) Package "emmeans". pp. 60.
- Liebig M.A., Gross J.R., Kronberg S.L., Phillips R.L., Hanson J.D. (2010) Grazing management contributions to net global warming potential: A long-term evaluation in the Northern Great plains. Journal of Environmental Quality. 39: 799-809.
- Liebig M.A., Kronberg S.L., Hendrickson J.R., Dong X., Gross J.R. (2013) Carbon dioxide efflux from long-term grazing management systems in a semiarid region. Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment. 164: 137-144.
- Liebig M.A., Kronberg S.L., Hendrickson J.R., Gross J.R. (2014) Grazing management, season, and drought contributions to near-surface soil property dynamics in semiarid rangelands. Rangeland Ecology and Management. 67: 266-274.
- Liu N., Kan H.M., Yang G.W., Zhang Y.J. (2015) Changes in plant, soil, and microbes in typical steppe from simulating grazing: explaining potential change in soil C. Ecological Monographs. 85 (2): 269-286.
- Liu W., Zhang Z., Wan S. (2009) Predominant role of water in regulating soil and microbial respiration and their responses to climate change in a semiarid grassland. Global Change Biology. 15: 184-195.
- Livingston G.P., Hutchinson G.L. (1995) Enclosure-based measurement of trace gas exchange: application and source of error. In P. Matson and R. Harris (ed.) Biogenic trace gases: measuring emissions from soil and water. Blackwell Scientific, Oxfrod, England.
- Love M.I., Huber W., Anders S. (2014) Moderated estimation of fold change and dispersion for RNA-seq data with DESeq2. Genome Biol. 15 (550): 1-21.
- Luo G.J., Kiese R., Wolf B., Butterbach-Bahl K. (2013) Effects of soil temperature and moisture on methane uptake and nitrous oxide emissions across three different ecosystem types. Biogeosciences. 10: 3205-3219.
- Macdonald C.A., Crawley M.J., Wright D.J., Kuczynski J., Robinson L., Knight R., Abu Al-Soud W., Sørensen S.J., Deng Y., Zhou J., Singh B.K. (2015) Identifying qualitative effects of different grazing types on below-ground communities and function in a longterm field experiment. Environmental Microbiology. 17 (3): 841–854.
- McGonigle T.P., Turner W.G. (2017) Grasslands and croplands have different microbial biomass carbon levels per unit of soil organic carbon. Agriculture. 7 (57): 1-8.
- McMurdie P.J., Holmes S. (2013) phyloseq: An R package for reproducible interactive analysis and graphics of microbiome census data. PLoS ONE. 8 (4): 1-11.
- Medina-Roldán E., Paz-Ferreiro J., Bardgett R.D. (2012) Grazing exclusion affects soil and plant communities, but has no impact on soil carbon storage in an upland grassland. Agriculture, Ecosystem and Environment. 149: 118-123.
- Mohammed M.A. (2015) Impact of soil microbial respiration on atmospheric carbon under different land use in part of Kano state, Northern Nigeria. International Journal of Animal Biology. 1 (5): 158-164.
- Mosier A.R., Patron W.J., Valentine D.W., Ojima D.S., Schimel D.S., Heinemeyer O. (1997) CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes in the Colorado shortgrass steppe: 2. Long-term impact on land use change. Global Biogeochemical Cycles. 11 (1): 29-42.
- Moulin A.P., Glenn A., Tenuta M., Lobb D.A., Dunmola A.S., Yapa P. (2014) Alternative transformations of nitrous oxide soil flux data to normal distributions. Can. J. Soil Sci. 94: 105-108.
- Mu Z.J., Huang A.Y., Ni J.P., Li J.Q., Liu Y.Y., Shi S., Xie D.T., Hatano R. (2013) Soil greenhouse gas fluxes and net global warming potential from intensively cultivated

vegetable fields in southwestern China. Journal of Plant Science and Plant Nutrition. 13 (3): 566-578.

- Naeth M.A., Bailey A.W., Pluth D.J., Chanasyk D.S., Hardin R.T. (1991) Grazing impacts on litter and soil organic matter in mixed prairie and fescue grassland ecosystems of Alberta. Journal of range management. 44 (1). 7-12.
- Nannipieri P., Ascher J., Ceccherini M.T., Landi L., Pietramellara G., Renella G. (2003) Microbila diversity and soil functions. European Journal of Soil Science. 54: 655-670.
- Nicol G.W., Glover L.A., Prosser J.I. (2003) The impact of grassland management on archaeal community structure in upland pasture rhizosphere soil. Environmental Microbiology. 5 (3). 152-162.
- Oenema O., Velthof G.L., Yamulki S., Jarvis S.C. (1997) Nitrous oxide emissions from grazed grassland. Soil Use and Management. 13 (4): 288-295.
- Oertel C., Matschullata J., Zurba K., Zimmermann F., Erasmi S. (2016) Greenhouse gas emission from soils A review. Geochemistry. 76 (3): 327-352.
- Oksanen J., Blanchet F.G., Kindt R., Minchin P.R. (2013) Vegan: community ecology package.
- Orgiazzi A., Lumini E., Nilsson R.H., Girlanda M., Vizzini A., Bonfante P., Bianciotto V. (2012) Unravelling soil fungal communities from different Mediterranean land-use backgrounds. PLoS ONE. 7 (4): 1-9.
- Pester M., Schleper C., Wagner M. (2011) The Thaumarchaeota: and emerging view of their phylogeny and ecophysiology. Curr Opin Microbiol. 14 (3). 300-306.
- Piñeiro G., Paruelo J.M., Oesterheld M., Jobágy E.G. (2010) Pathways of grazing effect on soil organic carbon and nitrogen. Society of Range management. 63 (1): 109-119.
- Prober S.M., Leff J.W., Bates S.T., Borer E.T., Firn J., Harpole W.S., Lind E.M., Seabloom E.W., Adler P.B., Bakker J.D., Cleland E.E., DeCrappeo N.M., DeLorenze E., Hagenah N., Hautier Y., Hofmockel K.S., Kirkman K.P., Knops J.M., La Pierre K.J., MacDougall A.S., McCulley R.L., Mitchell C.E., Risch A.C., Schuetz M., Stevens C.J., Williams R.J., Fierer N. (2015) Plant diversity predicts beta but not alpha diversity of soil microbes across grasslands worldwide. Ecol. Lett. 18(1). 85-95.
- Qu T.-B., Du W.-C., Yuan X., Yang Z.-M., Liu D.-B., Wang D.-L., Yu L.-J. (2016) Impact of grazing intensity and plant community composition on soil bacterial community diversity in a steppe grassland. PLOS ONE. 11(7). 1-16.
- R Core Team (2013). R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R. Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria.
- Radl V., Gattinger A., Chroňáková A., Němcová A., Čuhel J., Simek M., Munch J.C., Schloter M., Elhottová D. (2007) Effect of cattle husbandry on abundance and activity of methanogenic archaea in upland soils. The ISME Journal. 1. 443-452.
- Range Reference Area (RRA) report (2016). Grasslands. pp. 116.
- Range Reference Area (RRA) report. (2017) Central Parkland and Northern Fescue Natural Subregions. pp.73.
- Rastogi M., Singh S., Pathak H. (2002) Emission of carbon dioxide from soil. Current Science. 82 (5): 510-517.
- Rochette P., Eriksen-Hamel N.S. (2008) Chamber measuremtns of soil nitrous oxide flux: are absolute values reliable? Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J. 72 (2): 331-342.
- Roy R.N., Misra R.V. (2005) Soil nitrogen balance assessment and its application for sustainable agriculture and environment. Science in China Ser. C Life Sciences.48: 843-855.

- Samal L., Sejian V., Bagath M., Suganthi R.U., Bhatta R., Lal R. (2015) Gaseous emission from grazing lands. In book: Encyclopedia of Soil Science. DOI: 10.1081/E-ESS2-120053664.
- Sanjari G., Ghadiri H., Ciesiolka C.A.A., Yu B. (2008) Comparing the effects of continuous and time-controlled grazing systems on soil characteristics in Southeast Queensland. Australian Journal of Soil Research. 46: 348–358.
- Saurette D.D., Chang S.X., Thomas B.R. (2008) Autotrophic and heterotrophic respiration rates across a chronosequence of hybrid poplar plantations in northern Alberta. Canadian Journal of Soil Science. 88 (3): 261-272.
- Schönbach P., Wolf B., Dickhöfer U., Wiesmeier M., Chen W., Wan H., Gierus M., Butterbach-Bahl K., Kögel-Knabner I., Susenbeth A., Zheng X., Taube F. (2012) Grazing effect on the greenhouse gas balance of a temperate steppe ecosystem. Nutr. Cycl. Agroecosyst. 93: 357-371.
- Shi H., How L., Yang L., Wu D., Zhang L., Li L. (2017) Effects of grazing on CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub>, and N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes in three temperate steppe ecosystems. Ecosphere. 8 (4): 1-12.
- Shokralla S., Spall J.L., Gibson J.F., Hajibabaei M. (2012) Next-generation sequencing technologies for environmental DNA research. Molecular Ecology. 21 (8). 1794-1805.
- Silva J.P., Lasso A., Lubberding H.J., Peña M.R., Gijzen H.J. (2015) Biases in greenhouse gases static chambers measurements in stabilization ponds: Comparison of flux estimation under linear and non-linear models. Atmospheric Environment. 109: 130-138.
- Smith K.A., Ball T., Conen F., Dobbie K.E., Massheder J., Rey A. (2003) Exchange of greenhouse gases between soil and atmosphere: interactions of soil physical factors and biological processes. European Journal of Soil Science. 54: 779–791.
- Soussana J.F., Tallec T., Blanfort V. (2010) Mitigating the greenhouse gas balance of ruminant production systems through carbon sequestration in grasslands. Animal. 4 (3): 334-350.
- Staley J.T., Konopka A. (1985) Measurements of in situ activities of nonphotosynthetic microorganisms in aquatic and terrestrial habitats. Annu Rev Microbiol. 39. 321-346.
- Stolk P.C., Jacobs C.M.J., Moors E.J., Hensen A., Velthof G.L., Kabat P. (2009) Significant nonlinearity in nitrous oxide chamber data and its effect on calculated annual emissions. Biogeosciences Discussions. 6: 115-141.
- Takahashi S., Tomita J., Nishioka K., Hisada T., Nishijima M. (2014) Development of a Prokatyotic universal primer for simultaneous analysis of Bacteria and Archaea using next-generation sequencing. PLoS ONE. 9 (8): 1-9.
- Taylor D.L., Sinsabaugh R.L. (2015) The soil fungi: occurrence, phylogeny, and ecology. In: Soil Microbiology, Ecology, and Biochemistry. pp. 77-109.
- Thomas B.W., Gao X., Zhao M., Bork E.W., Hao X. (2018) Grazing altered carbon exchange in a dry mixed-grass prairie as a function of soil texture (in press)
- Tiedje J.M., Asuming-Brempong S., Nüsslein K., Marsh T.L., Flynn S.J., (1999) Opening the black box of soil microbial diversity. Applied Soil Ecology. 13 (2). 109-122.
- Toju H., Tanabe A.S., Yamamoto S., Sato H. (2012) High-coverage ITS primers for the DNAbased identification of Ascomycetes and Basidiomysetes in environmental samples. PLoS ONE. 7 (7): 1-11.
- Tom N., Raman A., Hodgkins D.S., Nicol H. (2006) Populations of soil organisms under continuous set stocked and high intensity-short duration rotational grazing practices in the central tablelands of New South Wales (Australia). New Zeland Journal of Agricultural research. 49: 261-272.

- Topp E., Pattey E. (1997) Soils as sources and sinks for atmospheric methane. Canadian Journal of Soil Science. 77 (2): 167-177.
- Torsvik V., Øvreås L. (2002) Microbial diversity and function in soil: from genes to ecosystems. Ecology and industrial microbiology. 5: 240-245.
- Tracy B.F., Frank D.A. (1998) Herbivore influence on soil microbial biomass and nitrogen mineralization in a northern grassland ecosystem: Yellowstone National Park. Oecologia. 114: 556-562.
- Vermeire L.T., Heitschmidt R.K., Haferkamp M.R. (2008) Vegetation response to seven grazing treatments in the northern Great Plains. Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environemt. 125 (1-4). 111-119.
- Wagg C., Bender S.F., Widmer F., van der Heijden M.G.A. (2014) Soil biodiversity and soil community composition determine ecosystem multifunctionality. PNAS. 111 (14): 5266-5270.
- Wang H., Liu H., Wang Y., Xu W., Liu A., Ma Z., Mi Z., Zhang Z., Wang S., He J.-S. (2017) Warm- and cold- season grazing affect soil respiration differently in alpine grasslands. Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment 248 (2017) 136–143.
- Wang W., Fang J. (2009) Soil respiration and human effects on global grasslands. Global and Planetary Change. 67: 20-28.
- Wang X., Nostrand J.D.V., Deng Y., Lü X., Wang C., Zhou J., Han X. (2015) Scale-dependent effects of climate and geographic distance on bacterial diversity patterns across northern China's grasslands. FEMS Microbiology Ecology. 91: 1-10.
- Wang X., VandenBygaart A.J., McConkey B.C. (2014) Land management history of Canadian grasslands and the impact on soil carbon storage. Rangeland Ecology and Management. 67: 333-343.
- Wang Y., Xue M., Zheng X., Ji B., Du R., Wang Y. (2005) Effects of environmental factors on N<sub>2</sub>O emission from and CH<sub>4</sub> uptake by the typical grasslands in the Inner Mongolia. Chemosphere. 58: 205–215.
- Wei D., Ri X.. Wang. Y., Wang Y., Liu Y., Yao T. (2012) Responses of CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes to livestock exclosure in an alpine steppe on the Tibetan Plateau, China. Plant Soil. 359: 45–55.
- Willms W., Adams B., McKenzie R. (2011) Overview: anthropogenic changes of Canadian grasslands. In: Floate K.D. [ed.]. Arthropods of Canadian grasslands. V. 2. Inhabitants of a changing landscape. Lethbridge, Alberta, Canada: Biological Survey of Canada. p. 1-22.
- Willoughby M., Adams B., Moisey D., Lawrence D., Stone C., Hincz C., Alexander M., Burkinshaw A., Cole L. (2004) Rangeland reference area program for the province of Alberta. Rangeland management branch. pp.27.
- Wrage N., Velthof G.L., van Beusichem M.L., Oenema O. (2001) Role of nitrifier denitrification in the production of nitrous oxide. Soil Biology and Biochemistry. 33: 1723-1732.
- Wu X., Yao Z., Brüggemann N., Shen Z.Y., Wolf B., Dannenmann M., Zheng X., Butterbach-Bahl K. (2010) Effects of soil moisture and temperature on CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> soil atmosphere exchange of various land use/cover types in a semi–arid grassland in Inner Mongolia, China. Soil Biology and Biochemistry. 42 (5): 773-787.
- Xie W., Jiao N., Ma C., Fang S., Phelps T.J., Zhu R., Zhang C. (2017) The response of archaeal species to seasonal variabilities in a subtropical aerated soil: insight into the low abundant methanogens. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol. 101: 6505-6515.

- Zhang Y., Dong S., Gao Q., Liu S., Zhou H., Ganjurjav H., Wang X. (2016) Climate change and human activities altered the diversity and composition of soil microbial community in alpine grasslands of the Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau. Science of the Total Environment. 562: 353-363.
- Zhou X., Wang J., Hao Y., Wang Y. (2010) Intermediate grazing intensities by sheep increase soil bacterial diversities in an Inner Mongolian steppe. Biol Fertil Soils. 46. 817-824.

## Appendices



Appendix A. Gas sampling schedule conducted during each of 2015 and 2016; D, day of month; CP, Central Parkland; MG, Dry Mixedgrass and FF, Foothills Fescue subregions

Subregion	2015		2016	
	Sampling #	Group	Sampling #	Group
СР	1	А	9	234567890ABCDE
	2	AB	10	67890ABCDE
	3	Е	11	67890ABCDE
	4	ABCDE	12	67890ABCDE
	5	DE	13	CDE
	6	CDE	14	56789ABCDE
	7	CDE	15	67890ABCDE
	8	ABCDE	16	234567890AB
			17	1234
MG	1	ABC	9	2345689
	2	ABC	10	467890ABCDE
	3	ABCDE	11	12
	4	ABCDE	12	234568
	5	AB	13	34567890ABCDE
	6	ABCDE	14	70ABCDE
	7	ABCDE	15	467890ABCDE
	8	ABCD	16	235
			17	1
FF	1	ABCDE	9	234567890ABCDE
	2	BCDE	10	234567890ACD
	3	E	11	23456
	4	E	12	9ABDE
	5	ABCDE	13	BE
	6	BCDE	14	890ABCDE
	7	ABCDE	15	34567890ABCDE
	8	ABCDE	16	23456780C
			17	1234567

Appendix B. Post-hoc test results for  $CO_2$  emission rates for comparison between all subregions and all sampling dates in 2016

Subregion	2015		2016	
	Sampling #	Group	Sampling #	Group
СР	1	ABC	9	12345
	2	ABC	10	8
	3	ABC	11	12345
	4	ABC	12	12
	5	ABC	13	678
	6	ABC	14	1234567
	7	ABC	15	12345
	8	ABC	16	12345
			17	12345
MG	1	ABC	9	12345678
	2	ABC	10	45678
	3	ABC	11	12345678
	4	ABC	12	12345678
	5	ABC	13	345678
	6	ABC	14	45678
	7	ABC	15	12345678
	8	ABC	16	12345678
			17	12345678
FF	1	А	9	78
	2	AB	10	578
	3	С	11	245678
	4	BC	12	13
	5	BC	13	12345678
	6	BC	14	12346
	7	ABC	15	245678
	8	ABC	16	245678
			17	12345678

Appendix C. Post-hoc test results for CH<sub>4</sub> consumption rates for comparison between all subregions and all sampling dates in 2016



Appendix D. Rarefaction curves for (A) bacteria, (B) archaea and (C) fungi representing the number of OTUs versus the number of reads across all study samples. Each line within a graph represents an individual sample.



Appendix E. Relative abundance of the bacterial community at phylum level for each individual sample.



Appendix F. Relative abundance of the archaeal community at phylum level for each individual sample.



Appendix G. Relative abundance of the fungal community at phylum level for each individual sample.

Feeter	2015					2016						
racioi	df	SS	MSS	F	$\mathbb{R}^2$	р	df	SS	MSS	F	$\mathbb{R}^2$	р
Bacteria												
Treatment (GT)	1	0.013	0.013	0.919	0.012	0.441	1	0.012	0.012	0.889	0.010	0.489
Subregion (S)	2	0.209	0.105	7.503	0.199	0.001	2	0.199	0.099	7.361	0.173	0.001
Month (M)	2	0.024	0.012	0.859	0.023	0.573	2	0.029	0.015	1.076	0.025	0.352
GT x S	2	0.020	0.010	0.713	0.019	0.705	2	0.024	0.012	0.868	0.020	0.591
GT x M	2	0.012	0.006	0.415	0.011	0.983	2	0.022	0.011	0.804	0.019	0.672
S x M	4	0.025	0.006	0.449	0.024	0.999	4	0.043	0.011	0.793	0.037	0.763
GT x S x M	4	0.026	0.007	0.474	0.025	0.990	4	0.035	0.008	0.646	0.030	0.949
Residuals	52	0.726	0.014		0.688		58	0.788	0.014		0.683	
Archaea												
Treatment (GT)	1	0.018	0.018	0.857	0.009	0.461	1	0.027	0.027	0.703	0.006	0.565
Subregion (S)	2	0.509	0.254	11.965	0.264	0.001	2	1.403	0.701	18.318	0.338	0.001
Month (M)	2	0.030	0.015	0.715	0.015	0.646	2	0.011	0.006	0.149	0.003	0.998
GT x S	2	0.012	0.006	0.294	0.006	0.964	2	0.057	0.029	0.747	0.014	0.636
GT x M	2	0.032	0.016	0.759	0.016	0.619	2	0.029	0.014	0.374	0.007	0.923
S x M	4	0.053	0.013	0.618	0.027	0.849	4	0.057	0.014	0.371	0.014	0.981
GT x S x M	4	0.016	0.004	0.189	0.008	0.999	4	0.043	0.011	0.284	0.010	0.997
Residuals	59	1.254	0.021		0.652		66	2.527	0.038		0.608	
Fungi												
Treatment (GT)	1	0.061	0.061	1.744	0.017	0.068	1	0.058	0.058	1.364	0.015	0.136
Subregion (S)	2	0.668	0.334	9.519	0.187	0.001	2	0.549	0.275	6.450	0.144	0.001
Month (M)	2	0.100	0.050	1.431	0.028	0.071	2	0.072	0.036	0.849	0.019	0.675
GT x S	2	0.059	0.029	0.855	0.017	0.662	2	0.096	0.048	1.129	0.025	0.232
GT x M	2	0.049	0.024	0.691	0.014	0.918	2	0.073	0.036	0.853	0.019	0.662
S x M	4	0.128	0.032	0.915	0.036	0.627	4	0.133	0.033	0.782	0.035	0.897
GT x S x M	4	0.113	0.028	0.806	0.032	0.850	4	0.113	0.028	0.662	0.029	0.987
Residuals	68	2.384	0.035		0.669		64	2.728	0.043		0.713	

Appendix H. Results of permutational analysis of variance (weighted UniFrac distance) testing effect of long-term grazing, geographic location (subregion) and temporal (month) variability, and their interactions, on bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities in rangeland soils of Alberta, Canada.

Factor	2015					2016						
	df	SS	MSS	F	R <sup>2</sup>	р	df	SS	MSS	F	R <sup>2</sup>	р
Bacteria												
Treatment (GT)	1	0.178	0.178	1.059	0.015	0.291	1	0.174	0.174	1.041	0.013	0.336
Subregion (S)	2	0.941	0.471	2.792	0.078	0.001	2	0.947	0.474	2.829	0.073	0.001
Month (M)	2	0.318	0.159	0.942	0.026	0.691	2	0.301	0.151	0.900	0.023	0.882
GT x S	2	0.337	0.169	1.000	0.028	0.460	2	0.342	0.171	1.022	0.026	0.336
GT x M	2	0.280	0.140	0.831	0.023	0.980	2	0.303	0.151	0.905	0.023	0.839
S x M	4	0.561	0.140	0.832	0.047	0.999	4	0.594	0.148	0.886	0.046	0.973
GT x S x M	4	0.613	0.153	0.909	0.051	0.894	4	0.619	0.155	0.924	0.048	0.884
Residuals	52	8.7652	0.169		0.731		58	9.709	0.167		0.747	
Archaea												
Treatment (GT)	1	0.176	0.176	1.215	0.015	0.188	1	0.141	0.141	0.934	0.011	0.538
Subregion (S)	2	1.588	0.794	5.478	0.133	0.001	2	1.540	0.770	5.089	0.114	0.001
Month (M)	2	0.269	0.134	0.927	0.022	0.589	2	0.207	0.104	0.684	0.015	0.972
GT x S	2	0.239	0.119	0.824	0.020	0.795	2	0.299	0.149	0.987	0.022	0.481
GT x M	2	0.222	0.111	0.766	0.019	0.892	2	0.234	0.117	0.773	0.017	0.900
S x M	4	0.489	0.122	0.844	0.041	0.852	4	0.527	0.132	0.871	0.039	0.841
GT x S x M	4	0.405	0.101	0.699	0.034	0.997	4	0.521	0.130	0.861	0.038	0.853
Residuals	59	8.553	0.145		0.716		66	9.988	0.151		0.742	
Fungi												
Treatment (GT)	1	0.339	0.339	1.419	0.015	0.022	1	0.308	0.308	1.277	0.014	0.052
Subregion (S)	2	2.731	1.365	5.699	0.122	0.001	2	2.512	1.256	5.201	0.117	0.001
Month (M)	2	0.496	0.248	1.035	0.022	0.337	2	0.483	0.241	0.999	0.023	0.431
GT x S	2	0.547	0.273	1.141	0.024	0.111	2	0.607	0.303	1.256	0.028	0.033
GT x M	2	0.359	0.179	0.749	0.016	0.999	2	0.386	0.193	0.799	0.018	0.993
S x M	4	0.839	0.209	0.876	0.038	0.967	4	0.892	0.223	0.923	0.042	0.798
GT x S x M	4	0.707	0.177	0.738	0.032	1.000	4	0.789	0.197	0.817	0.037	0.998
Residuals	68	16.291	0.239		0.730		64	15.456	0.242		0.721	

Appendix I. Results of permutational analysis of variance (unweighted UniFrac distance) testing effects of treatment (grazed / nongrazed), geographic location (subregion) and temporal (month) variability, and their interactions, on bacterial, archaeal and fungal communities in rangeland soils of Alberta, Canada.

Appendix J. Regression values of non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMDS) analysis for environmental factors and microbial communities characteristics. MAT, mean annual temperature; MAP, mean annual precipitation; SOC, soil organic carbon; TN, total nitrogen; GWC, gravimetric water content.

Factor	2015		2016	2016			
	r <sup>2</sup>	р	$r^2$	р			
Bacteria							
MAT	0.253	0.003	0.252	0.001			
MAP	0.817	0.001	0.819	0.001			
pН	0.639	0.001	0.747	0.001			
SOC	0.477	0.001	0.676	0.001			
TN	0.491	0.001	0.621	0.001			
C/N	0.086	0.092	0.008	0.834			
GWC	0.218	0.006	0.469	0.001			
Abundance	0.346	0.001	0.264	0.001			
Richness	0.622	0.001	0.317	0.001			
Shannon	0.722	0.001	0.583	0.001			
Simpson	0.492	0.001	0.499	0.001			
Sand	0.407	0.001	0.507	0.001			
Clay	0.471	0.001	0.559	0.001			
Silt	0.366	0.001	0.413	0.001			
Archaea							
MAT	0.370	0.001	0.309	0.001			
MAP	0.307	0.001	0.335	0.001			
pН	0.733	0.001	0.712	0.001			
SOC	0.190	0.003	0.508	0.001			
TN	0.212	0.002	0.498	0.001			
C/N	0.090	0.062	0.037	0.320			
GWC	0.075	0.097	0.459	0.001			
Abundance	0.254	0.001	0.308	0.001			
Richness	0.288	0.001	0.374	0.001			
Shannon	0.477	0.001	0.653	0.001			
Simpson	0.322	0.001	0.483	0.001			
Sand	0.134	0.016	0.086	0.084			
Clay	0.183	0.001	0.187	0.003			
Silt	0.167	0.007	0.119	0.020			
Fungi							
MAT	0.326	0.001	0.469	0.001			
MAP	0.734	0.001	0.832	0.001			
pН	0.675	0.001	0.795	0.001			
SOC	0.484	0.001	0.779	0.001			
TN	0.506	0.001	0.744	0.001			
C/N	0.054	0.233	0.016	0.694			
GWC	0.225	0.001	0.624	0.001			
Abundance	0.077	0.121	0.045	0.354			
Richness	0.083	0.094	0.062	0.243			
Shannon	0.120	0.034	0.048	0.315			
Simpson	0.051	0.242	0.061	0.224			
Sand	0.365	0.001	0.425	0.001			
Clay	0.532	0.001	0.555	0.001			
Silt	0.330	0.001	0.253	0.001			