University of Alberta

Between Hope and Despair:
Social and Political Learning in the Women's Movement in Chile

by

Donna Maureen Chovanec   Ⓒ

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for

the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

in

International/Intercultural Education

Department of Educational Policy Studies

Edmonton, Alberta

Fall 2004

Canadä

ACKNOWLEGEMENTS

This research has almost been derailed several times by the vicissitudes of life. Through these challenges, I maintained my focus on the objective: To tell the story of the learning dimension of the women's movement in Arica, Chile. So, I first acknowledge my own perseverance. But not being an island, I was only able to accomplish the objective through the help and support of many others.

Miles de gracias to many people who helped me, each in their own way, with the fieldwork in Chile.

> To the many women in Arica who accepted me in their lives, told me their stories, and shared with me the *pena*, joy, nostalgia, learnings, and profound pain guarded deep in their memories. I learned so much from them. I hope that the words written in these pages resonate for them as echoes of their courageous struggle.

> To the team at *Casa de Encuentro de la Mujer* (CEDEMU) – Berta Moreno (director), Sandra Bravo, Marianella González, and Lorena R os – who warmly welcomed me and included me as part of the team during my stay in Arica. Especially to Berta and Sandra for being, on top of everything else, good and very patient friends. Also to Carmen Fuentes, the previous director of CEDEMU, who initially facilitated my request to work with CEDEMU on this project.

> To the various members of *Movimientos por los Derechos de la Mujer* (MODEMU) who shared their memories and their archives with me.

> To Sandra Bravo and Héctor González for their immeasurable assistance as research collaborators. Especially for their help in reaching participants, building trust and rapport, clarifying language and cultural nuances, and for being partners to share the research journey.

> To Magaly Ort z for professionally transcribing countless hours of interviews.

> To Dr. Susan Franceschet, now a professor at Acadia University, for her valuable assistance in preparing me for the fieldwork, for sharing her references, and for introducing me to useful resources in Chile.

I also extend my deepest appreciation to many who helped me during the much longer part of the doctoral process in Canada.

> To my doctoral supervisor, Dr. Marilyn Assheton-Smith, who waited patiently through the ups and downs of my progress, believed in me, and steadfastly guided me toward completion.

> To the other professors on the committee who read drafts, provided valuable feedback, offered suggestions, and encouraged me. Especially to Dr. Sue Scott who was my 'university connection' while I was in the field and who first introduced me to 'education for social change' almost fifteen years ago.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

INTRODUCTION

The women were the first to organize in Chile for the need to be united. Fundamentally, to defend the family, defend the children, to defend life. Because they had no food, because their husbands didn't have work, because they didn't have a lot of things. So they united to be able to do things. I'm talking about the collective kitchens. [Because maybe] they won't kill you but if you don't eat, anyway you will die... So they grouped together and created a greater maturity. From the roots of this we saw emerging, not a tiny organization, but a more massive thing. And the women organized external demonstrations, not only to be united but also to go out into the street with strength. The first demonstrations in Chile against the dictatorship were done by women. So they initiated the road to the rupture. To be able to say to the government, I mean to the military, that despite everything that they had done to restrict liberty, the women could do things anyway. And they demonstrated in the street that, yes, you can break what the military had tried to carry out. You see? They went out and no one could stop them. (a participant in the women's movement in Arica, Chile)[1]

I don't know how it happened that I grew into adulthood not knowing anything about Chile's dictatorship or the brave women and men, young and old, who struggled against it. How is it possible that we can live *in* the world, be *of* the world but know so little *about* the world? What does this say about my education as a citizen in the global village? Surely, a worthy topic of a dissertation research project, but not the topic of the one presented here.

This dissertation is a journey that starts with a spark of curiosity in a university adult education graduate seminar, whose flames are then fanned into life by *amor* and *justicia*, that then travels across continents to meet women who open their lives and their hearts to share their stories, and finally to be set down on paper in words that can hardly express the profundity of the real life stories. The spark is from reading Paulo Freire, the *amor* is for a Chilean, the *justicia* is for making visible the struggles, the travel is from Edmonton, Alberta to Arica, a small city in northern Chile, the women are courageous participants in the women's movements in Arica, the paper is this dissertation, and the words a humble attempt to represent the learning dimension of social movements as seen through the lives of these women.

Research Objectives

Within the study of social movements, there is often implicit acknowledgement that social movements are sites of profound learning – sites where knowledge itself is contested and constructed, where identities and subjectivities (both individual and

1

collective) are defined and redefined, where citizens are formed, and where oppression is named – ultimately, where people "learn to 'know' differently and to act differently" (Schild, 1994, p. 66). These activities, so integral to social movements, are clearly educational or social learning processes. However, "while systematic education does occur in some social movement sites and actions, learning in such situations is largely informal and often incidental – it is tacit, embedded in action and is often not recognised as learning. The learning is therefore often potential, or only half realized." (Foley, 1999, p. 3). Holst (2002) concurs.

> Much of the radical adult education that has taken place, largely informally, has occurred in meetings, protests, cultural events, and the day-to-day activities of social movements and organizations instigated by people who do not necessarily consciously consider the educational aspects of what they are doing... In other words, the field of adult education and the activists overlook much vital educational work for politics. (p. 5)

It was the intent of my research project to explore the phenomenon of social and political learning in social movements – in all its informal, obscured and partial ways, to explicitly expose the learning dimension of a social movement, and to spotlight the educational processes at work within the movement. In the quote below, Griff Foley's (1999) poignant words echo my own sentiments about social movement learning – a subject which has fascinated me for some time.

> Some of the most powerful learning occurs as people struggle against oppression, as they struggle to make sense of what is happening to them and to work out ways of doing something about it. (p. 1-2)

In an earlier research project (Chovanec, 1994), I wondered how abused women *learned* their way out of victimization to become survivors and then social advocates/activists in the struggle against violence against women. In their own words and from their own experience, the women elucidated the critical learning process called consciousness-raising that "includes the actual experience of power on the individual level, a theoretical grasp of power as a larger social reality, and a practical orientation toward emancipatory action" (Hart, 1990b, p. 70-71), a distinctly and undeniably educational process that was systematically facilitated by their involvement in an abused women's program.[2] Once I belatedly became aware of the anti-dictatorship women's movements in Chile and throughout Latin America, I asked basically the same question: How did women *learn* their way out of victimization to become oppositional activists against the dictatorship? More specifically, I wondered: What were the methods (processes and content) of social and political learning within the social movement? How were

2

knowledge and skills transmitted through social movement participation? What was the relationship of these processes to social change? Knowing, too, that Latin American social movements had diminished since the demise of the dictatorships, I also asked: How are the methods and means of knowledge transmission transformed or sustained as movements wax and wane in different periods? What alternatives for social and political learning might arise when major movements become quiescent in any given period?

Chilean women's movements are particularly ideal for a study of this nature. Historically, while confronting structural barriers similar to those faced by women elsewhere in the world, Chilean women have played an important role in their country's social and political struggles (Chaney, 1974; Kirkwood, 1986). Drawing on this tradition despite the grave risks, political mobilization of women increased sharply in the 1980s in the midst of almost two decades of state repression and stringent economic policies (Agos n, 1996; Schild, 1994; Valdés & Weinstein, 1993; Waylen, 1993). "The Chilean case is useful because it had one of the strongest and most successful women's movements in Latin America. The strength, internal coherence and public visibility of the movement helped it to achieve many of its demands..." (Franceschet, 2001b, p. 208). However, it is the "extra-economic" (Schild, 1994) educational and consciousness-raising strategies, now known as the feminist "curriculum" (Valdés & Weinstein, 1993), "gender pedagogy" (Quiroz Martin, 1997), or "political learning" (Hipsher, 1996; Schild, 1994), that was the impetus for change and mobilization.

Moreover, the potential to explicate the informal social learning processes and the transmission of political knowledge via social movements is highlighted in the Chilean situation because it can be studied through three very different socio-political periods within two living generations of women with radically different social learning experiences: those that had previously gained the political skills and applied them dauntlessly during the dictatorship and those who were too young to have experienced democracy before participating in anti-dictatorship movements. How, then, is social and political knowledge created, transmitted and transformed across generations? How has the loss of a generation affected the ability of civil society to organize and participate in social movements or in a democratic society at all?

As the study progressed, it became apparent that Arica was an especially rich study environment because of its own particular blend of macro and micro politics. The women of Arica, facing danger in the midst of a militarized zone in the northern frontier, were at the forefront of protests against the human rights abuses of the

3

dictatorship. The women living in the popular neighbourhoods in Arica, far from the centres of power in the capital city, represent diverse disenfranchised groups such as poor and indigenous peoples. Further, Arica represented a socialist enclave of sorts prior to the military coup.

Theoretical Framework

While the original questions have been addressed to one degree or another, once in the field setting, new, more salient questions also emerged.[3] In addition to a wealth of information about what and how the women learned, the individual and collective effects of their learning, and the current social learning environment, the emerging data compelled me to interrogate specific aspects of social movement learning, and furthermore, to engage a particular theoretical framework for sense-making, i.e., marxist historical materialism. Within the recent literature on adult education and social movements, there is a convergence from three continents that persuasively argues for a marxist engagement in social movement theorizing, signifying a return to the radical roots of adult education (2001a; Allman, 2001b; 1995; Foley, 1999; Holst, 2002).[4] Foley's (1999) comment is representative of this perspective.

> I argue for the analytical strength and political utility of holistic and materialist analyses of learning in particular sites and struggles, maintaining that a critique of capitalism must lie at the heart of emancipatory adult education theory and practice. (p. 6)

For me, this literature heralded a welcome return to the radical adult education literature after my forays through a variety of literatures related to social movements – political science, sociology, social psychology, radical democracy, cultural theory, and some adult education as well – and numerous accounts of the women's movements in Chile. In Allman, Foley and Holst I regained my initial excitement about the radical potential of adult education that I experienced when I first read Paulo Freire a dozen years earlier. It felt like I was coming home.[5]

However, this is not the only reason for selecting this framework for my study. Its usefulness more specifically stems from my recognition that it compellingly resonates with the data that emerged in this study. The socio-political learning environment of the vast majority of women who participated in the study was decidedly marxist: specifically from the communist and (to a lesser degree) socialist parties in Chile, through the liberation theology of the Catholic Church,[6] and via the political trajectory

4

that led to three years of experience in a socialist state during Salvador Allende's 1970-1973 presidency. Furthermore, in Arica, the women's movement, and its learning dimension, cannot be analyzed outside the formal and informal educational influence of the Communist Party.[7] A historical materialist framework contributes the analytical tools "… to explain connections between three sets of variables: learning and education, local politics and ideologies, and broad social forces and changes" (Foley, 1999, p. 3).

Situating Myself In The Research Process

For many years now, I have been motivated to study the experiences of the women in the popular women's movements in Chile. I approach this task as a student of social theory; one particularly interested in the constructed and multiple marginalizations of women and in women's resistance to/within them. As an adult educator, what interests me most is how women learn to *know* themselves as actors, rather than as victims. As I have developed this project, the post-colonial feminist critique has pushed me to continually question my place in it. Locating myself in the research requires a candid self-conscious reflexivity about my various subject positions, those that experience oppression and those that contribute to oppression, those that position me as both an insider and as an outsider. I am a first world white woman, victimized by gendered violence yet privileged by colour/race, education and geo-political location. Not only my privilege but also my complicity in the structures of domination that engender those privileges must be interrogated. Therefore, I am challenged to confront my own classism, racism and ethnocentrism.

I am further challenged to be constantly self-reflexive and vigilant about what gets represented, how, and by whom. From the outset, it has been my intention to foreground women's oppositional activities and forms of resistance. Oppositional knowledges are by definition repressed. They are not part of the dominant knowledge base. Mohanty (1991a) reports that "few studies have focused on women workers as *subjects* – as agents who make choices, have a critical perspective on their own situations, and think and organize collectively against their oppressors" (p. 29). This is precisely the intent of my research endeavour – to "make women visible as politically organised and organising participants" (Küppers, 1992, p. 2), as active agents. This is the crux of Mohanty's (1991a) "imagined communities," i.e., communities of resistance whose active engagement against "pervasive and systemic" forces that dominate and oppress

5

are accented (p. 4-5). This escapes both the victim and the heroine stances and relies instead on oppositional agency that arises within particular social-historical junctures.

But, what is *my* place in recording and representing the experiences of these women? Lazreg (cited in Mohanty, 1991b) offers counsel.

> The point is neither to subsume other women under one's own experience nor to uphold a separate truth for them. Rather, it is to allow them to *be* while recognizing that what they are is just as meaningful, valid, and comprehensible as what we are. (p. 77)

Abdo (1993) suggests that there is nothing inherent in the concept of outsider that should prevent research by outsiders.

> Immoral, unethical, and unacceptable traits in research are not attributes of the researcher's color, race, nationality, or creed. The quality of research has to be determined by its ability to truly and clearly represent the interests and concern of its subjects, a task that can be effectively accomplished when the relationship of powerful-powerless between the researcher and researched is removed. (p. 36)

Literature Review

This review of the relevant literature is organized into five major sections. In the first, I provide a brief overview of the Latin American socio-political and economic context. The second section is a brief introduction to the region's social movements and the third highlights Latin American women's movements with examples from the Chilean situation.[8] In the fourth section, I briefly review social movement theories and lastly, summarize the relationship of adult education to social movements.

Latin America: The Socio-political and Economic Context

The region known as Latin America encompasses countries in Central and South America and some Caribbean nations. Five centuries of European colonization have left enduring and devastating cultural and economic imprints in the region. In some countries, such as Cuba, indigenous populations were virtually eradicated and in others, such as Guatemala, indigenous peoples are the most marginalized sectors of the population. In Latin America, as elsewhere, colonialism also resulted in the rape of natural resources including precious metals and agricultural products.

Although most Latin American countries achieved their independence from the Spanish and Portuguese colonizers during the 19th century, colonialism effectively paved the way

6

for 20th century neo-colonial domination: development, modernization and globalization. Indeed, Escobar states that post-war development discourse has affected the region "in even more devastating ways than its colonial predecessor" (Escobar, 1992, p. 66).

Development discourse is related to western economic theories that proposed a link between the industrialization and consumer capitalism of the western world and its wealth. The assumption that all societies need necessarily follow this same developmental path spawned theories, policies and practices that were intended to modernize the traditional economies of Third World nations. Drawing on North American sociological discourse, especially that of Talcott Parsons, and using western models as the template, development theorists focused on identifying and promoting the sociological, psychological, political and economic factors that would advance the 'traditional' society to the status of a 'modern' society. Through the expert intervention of more 'advanced' countries, it was expected that other nations would 'catch up' (see for example Allahar, 1995; Kryzanek, 1995; Larrain, 1989). From a Foucauldian perspective, Escobar (1992) makes a compelling argument that development is an "overarching cultural discourse" that "invented" the Third World as underdeveloped thereby signifying a position of inferiority. He critiques the "regime of truth" that underpins the knowledge production and institutional networks of the development apparatus.

> The discourse of development portrayed Third World societies as imperfect, abnormal, or diseased entities in relation to the "developed" societies... This hegemonic discourse transformed the system through which identities were defined. What we now have is a vast landscape of identities – the "illiterate," the "landless peasants," "women bypassed by development," "the hungry and malnourished," 'those belonging to the informal sector," "urban marginals," and so forth – all of them created by the development discourse and catalogued among the many abnormalities that development would treat and reform through appropriate "interventions"... (p. 65-66)

Such an oppressive hierarchical positioning is often supported by a powerful combination of militarism, economic control, political restructuring, and social/cultural domination. And so, after a somewhat successful attempt in Latin America during the 1950s to 1970s to reverse the effects of economic 'dependency' (through "import substitution industrialization"),[9] Latin America's dependent position in the global hierarchy was re-established by a dual reign of terror – brutally repressive military regimes in combination with a crippling monetarist economic model – that effectively inaugurated the neo-liberal era. Since the so-called 'transitions to democracy,' the dual

7

reign of terror has been replaced by the inter(twin)ed pillars of domination in Chile and elsewhere in the region – weak representative democracy and strong economic neo-liberalism.

The Dual Reign of Terror

During the 1960s and 70s, many countries in Latin America were governed by right wing military dictatorships or authoritarian regimes . The few countries with socialist governments faced externally generated anti-government propaganda or direct obstruction of internal policies.

Unlike many of its neighbours, Chile had a long social democratic tradition that resulted in the election of a socialist president, Salvador Allende, in 1970.[10] However, the socialist experiment, that included nationalization of industry (especially in natural resources) and land reform, proved too threatening for both national and international powers. Aided by internal agitation by the upper classes and involvement of the United States,[11] a military coup d'etat overthrew the government and installed a military dictatorship under the direction of General Augusto Pinochet in 1973. Immediately thereafter, the constitution was suspended, media censured, political parties and trade unions prohibited. During the bloody early days of the coup, thousands were captured, detained, tortured, disappeared, and/or executed. Almost 3000 people were assassinated by the Chilean state during the dictatorship years, 1000 of which remain disappeared. Both women and men suffered at the hands of the military but many have commented on the gender-specific torture and terrorism of women. Political leaders, community organizers, labour activists, and intellectuals that escaped this fate were forced into hiding while the rest of the citizenry was paralyzed by fear.[12]

The repression of the citizenry established the climate needed to experiment with economic restructuring (i.e., the "neo-liberal laboratory")[13] without worrying about the destabilizing tendency of popular political activity (Craske, 1998).

> In Chile, there exists a high degree of consensus, that during the military regime, human rights were repeatedly violated with the aim of annihilating the political opposition to the regime as a necessary condition for laying the foundations of a new state whilst making the economic model of this new state a reality. (CODEPU cited in Derechos Chile, 2004)

Strongly influenced by adherents to the Chicago School of Economics, the Chilean military regime applied international guidelines for a market economy within the first years of the coup.[14] In Chile as elsewhere, external economic control was heightened

8

further when, prompted by the debt crisis of the 1980s,[15] international monetary organizations (primarily the IMF) instituted austerity measures called Structural Adjustment Policies (SAPs), the highlights of which were to:

- decrease government spending, including relentless reductions in social programs and privatization of public enterprises and services.[16]

- devalue currency.

- promote export rather than import.

- establish trade and market liberalization, including reduced tariff barriers and liberalized labour law.

As economic aid is typically tied to the social, political and economic agendas or ideologies of the donors, international lending institutions (such as the World Bank) were also implicated in the enforcement of SAPs. Thus, in return for implementing SAPs, debtor nations retained the right to remain in the world economy through injections of new loans, bilateral aid, and foreign investment.

Consolidating the Twin Pillars in the Transition Period

While most dictatorships dissolved for various reasons during the early 1980s, the Chilean military government outlasted all others. When a plebiscite dictated by Pinochet's own 1980 constitution was called in 1988, a broad-based coalition of anti-dictatorship movements successfully waged a campaign to vote against continued military rule. This obliged Pinochet to hold elections in 1989, after seventeen years of military rule. A coalition of center-left parties, the *Concertación por la Democracia*, mainly represented by the Christian Democratic party, initially negotiated the terms of transfer to civil rule and has been successful in each of the three subsequent elections.

Throughout Latin American, the period of time after the downfall of a dictatorship was known as the "transition to democracy" – a time during which electoral processes and party systems were gradually re-established.[17] But, the return to democracy also came with an economic price tag. Acquiescing to continued participation in the global economic order would appease internal elites and conform to external neo-liberal pressures (Petras & Vieux, 1994). While initially instigated by military regimes in Latin America, neo-liberalism has since been "embraced" by the new democratic regimes (Craske, 1998).

Nonetheless, "democratization with adjustment," writes Elizabeth Jelin (1998), creates a paradoxical reality. "Economic growth, formal democracy, and increasing inequality

9

(and therefore growing poverty) seem an unlikely combination of outcomes" (p. 406). The negative consequences of SAPs eventually became undeniable, prompting policies and programs that would ameliorate some of the more disastrous effects on the most vulnerable groups, mainly women. Supported by foreign donors through "social investment funds," the new democratic governments are now instituting Poverty Alleviation Programs (PAPs) to address the effects on those that are the hardest hit.

> These policies have replaced the notion of universality with that of "targeted investment." The word "investment" stresses that social spending serves to strengthen an economic factor – "human capital" – which, like all capital, must offer a return on investment. The word "targeted" stresses that the spending is limited to certain segments of the population: the very poorest. (Cáceres, 2000, p. 24)

From a critical perspective, three salient features of PAPs are noted in the literature, which, in a Foucauldian sense, are instrumental in creating a disciplined and policed subject (Alvarez et al., 1998b).

- Because poverty is now defined as exclusion from participation in the marketplace, the basic assumption is that the marginalized person is deficient in the necessary skills to participate in the market economy. PAPs are, therefore, intended to provide remedial skills for access to the market (Alvarez, 1999; 1998a; 1998b; Schild, 2000a; 2000b), echoing the post-war development theory of human capital.

- PAPs create a new client-oriented identity founded on individualism and self-consumption and further entrench class-based inequalities (Alvarez, 1999; Alvarez et al., 1998b; Schild, 1998b).

- PAPs "bolster civilian governments in the face of potentially destabilizing socioeconomic situations" (Schild, 1998a, p. 247). Because services are getting to the most needy, PAPs effectively de-politicize both service provision (Craske, 1998) and the very basis for mobilization (Alvarez et al., 1998b). This then sidelines the real issues and induces support for economic policies (Craske, 1998; Schild, 1998b).

Alvarez, Dagnino and Escobar (1998b) suggest that the Chilean approach to PAPs is touted as a model for the region. Again Chile leads the way, demonstrating its proclivity as the "neo-liberal laboratory."

The political reality buttresses this economic hegemony. Worldwide, the liberal democratic state has been retrofitted for the neo-liberal economic agenda (Petras & Vieux, 1994; Schild, 2000a). According to Schild (1998b),

> transitions to civilian rule in Latin America today thus involve a reconfiguration of state-civil society relations along the lines of the neoliberal modernizing project, with powerful cultural effects. Central to this modernizing project is the redefinition of citizenship as the active

10

exercise of responsibilities, including economic self-reliance and political
participation. (p. 94)

Political participation in a reconfigured democracy also requires reconstituting the
notion of citizenship and civil society. The role of civil society is to facilitate the
development of market citizens, i.e., self-reliant individuals who bear rights and
responsibilities in relation to the market (Alvarez et al., 1998b; Craske, 1998; Dagnino,
1998; Schild, 1998b). Unlike the notion of a participatory social democracy, marketplace
liberalism, argues Walzer (1992), "largely dispenses with politics; it requires at most a
minimal state" (p. 94). Furthermore, it "does not make for citizenship" and it "provides
no support for social solidarity" (p. 95). The inherent competition and inequality of such
a democracy is troubling to many.

> People come to the marketplace with radically unequal resources – some
> with virtually nothing at all. Not everyone can compete successfully in
> commodity production, and therefore not everyone has access to
> commodities. (Walzer, 1992, p. 95)

For many fearful and demoralized citizens in the aftermath of dictatorships, democracy
simply means "the absence of military rule."

> In an attempt to preserve democratic stability and not provoke the Right,
> the parties discouraged protest and encouraged institutionalized forms of
> political participation. The consensus about and commitment to
> democracy were also present among social movement leaders and
> activists, making them more moderate for fear of an authoritarian
> involution. (Hipsher, 1996, p. 274)

Thus, in order to secure a stable transition to democracy, economic and social justice
demands were put on hold. "Responsible citizens put the needs of the nation (that is, the
economy) before personal demands (that is, social justice)" (Craske, 1998, p. 110). By de-
politicizing social demands, neo-liberal states in Latin America are "democrac(ies)
without citizenship" (Cammack cited in Craske, 1998, p. 101). Hipsher (1996) offers a
litany of examples, even prior to the official transition, that demonstrate an
"antimobilization strategy" that called for "prudence and patience" so as not to
"endanger democracy" (p. 283-286). This bracketing of social demands might explain, in
part, why the country returned to "politics as usual" rather than the optimistically
anticipated remaking of politics. It is well documented that Chile, along with the other
countries in the region, has reverted to a strong system of traditional party politics,
regaining, what Waylen (1995) refers to as, the "hegemony" of political parties.

Even in the absence of a military ruler, some feel that the civilian governments maintain
a "culture of fear." Petras and Vieux (1994) suggest that the new democracies are

11

"neoauthoritarian" in that, despite the revival of electoral processes and institutions, "these regimes have continued to function within an authoritarian institutional framework and to... practice many of the same institutional policies and political processes begun under the military" (p. 5). Based on their assessment of decision-making and power structures, civic culture, social and human rights, and budgetary allocation in the region, Petras and Vieux conclude that "contemporary Latin American electoral regimes fail to meet the basic criteria for democracy" (p. 18). Many of their examples are drawn from Chile; for example, they discuss the power still held by the military in Chile at the time of their writing. Nowadays, while Pinochet is aging and has more ambiguous international support (as witnessed by his detainment from October 1998 to March 2000 in England), vestiges of Chilean military rule remain entrenched in policy, law, and the Constitution. Indeed, as part of the negotiated terms of the transition, the Chilean military government imprinted a number of important legacies that ensured its continuing political power. For example, the electoral system guarantees advantage to the right wing; Pinochet was declared senator-for-life; immunity clauses were built into the Constitution; and the *Centros de Madres*[18] are headed by the wife of the military commander.

Foreshadowed in the preceding sections, the role of the global economic structure and its relationship to restructured governments is important in understanding a new form of social control.

> The neo-liberal transformations remantle the state so as to restrict its functions... The economic agenda is already defined and is determined more or less externally by experts and agencies within the premises of economic globalization; the role of the state is to see that this agenda is carried out without courting excessive social unrest or political instability. (Pannu, 1996, p. 98)

Escobar (Alvarez et al., 1998b; Escobar, 1992, 1995) convincingly argues that economics and politics are cultural artifacts that imprint on the identities and social practices of citizens in profound ways. Taylor (1998) observes that in Chile, "the ideology of neo-liberalism has permeated deeply not only within formal economic relations, nor only political decisions, but has entered the social psyche" (p. 3). These quotes suggest that, while the state's 'interference' in the economy is curtailed, its role in controlling dissent and in forming social identities is magnified. Paradoxically, then, the 'minimalist' state is highly interventionist in the social realm.

Adherents of neo-liberal economics proclaim that the well-publicized economic growth in counties such as Chile vindicate their claims. Despite this triumphalism, however,

distressingly similar critical analyses reveal the inadequacies and highlight the contradictions in the neo-liberal project. "Indeed they are so well recognized that they have the familiarity of a mantra" (Antrobus, 2002, p. 46). The net flow of capital remains reversed (i.e., to foreign corporations) while growing unemployment, a widening gap between rich and poor, spiraling poverty, increasing violence, and ecological destruction have clearly worsened in the new order.[19] The enforced and extreme economic measures initially consolidated neo-liberalism in the region, escalating economic hardship for increasing numbers of citizens and fundamentally changing the social structure of the family and the society.[20]

Chile's transition period began in 1990 and, despite three subsequent elections all won by the *Concertación*, there is growing pessimism about the ability of this government to consolidate a true democracy in Chile. In the early days of the transition, the new government was hampered by the combination of anxiety about the potential for a renewed military takeover and the negotiated terms of the transition. However, recent commentators cite disquieting examples that demonstrate lack of political will over twelve years of civilian rule to take advantage of opportunities to align itself with a citizenry still hungry for justice.[21]

Social Movements in Latin America

Although the history of oppression is strong throughout Latin America, so too is that of resistance and dissent. The region has a vibrant history of trade unionism and women's, worker's, peasant's, and indigenous people's movements. Communist, socialist and workers' political parties challenge right wing entrenchment. Even more dramatic are the revolutionary movements such as those in El Salvador and Nicaragua. Cuba is the only revolutionary government to have persisted in the hemisphere while withstanding intense and sustained opposition from the United States.

Despite the climate of intense fear in Chile and elsewhere during the dictatorships, various forms of resistance emerged in the midst of the repression. Not the least of these were women's oppositional struggles. The emergence of a multiplicity of popular struggles during an intensely repressive period of Latin America's history and the fate of these movements during the subsequent period of democratization has spawned a sizable amount of social movement theorizing. In this section, I briefly review the Chilean social movements of these periods.

13

Covering the period between 1973 and the present in Chile, social movement mobilization has gone through various phases (Hipsher, 1996; Waylen, 1995). First, it is generally believed that, reeling from the brutal coup d'etat and associated state violence against the populace, social movements were dormant from 1973-1983. "...[M]obilization came to a drastic halt... During the first ten years of military rule the government nearly destroyed the fabric of civil society..." (Hipsher, 1996, p. 280). However, some movements quietly began to reorganize in the latter part of the decade. Then, "during the early 1980s social movements reemerged and formed the backbone of the popular protest movement" (Hipsher, 1996, p. 280-281). The years 1980-86 witnessed the organization of many types of communal survival activities, the establishment of formal opposition coalitions, and the outbreak of organized mass protests across all sectors of society. The first National Day of Protest occurred on May 11, 1983. However, a general strike orchestrated by the opposition forces in July 1986 followed by a near-successful attempt to assassinate Pinochet in September of the same year led to a tragic acceleration of violent reprisals.

Through the swift and violent reaction of the military, it became apparent that neither mass mobilization nor armed struggle would bring about the end of the military regime. Divisions within the opposition parties heightened causing a break in the alliances formed earlier. By excluding the more radical Communist Party, the centre and left formed a new coalition, *Concertación por la Democracia*, which moved into a negotiating stance with the military government, eventually leading to the 1989 elections in which the *Concertación* formed the new government. Social movements attempted to make their demands heard through the transition process but were hampered by the conciliatory position assumed by the political parties who had resumed ascendancy in transition politics. Throughout Latin America, there was a return to "politics as usual," neo-liberalism was entrenched, and social movements fell into decline (Craske, 1998; Hipsher, 1996; Oxhorn, 1994). The utopian sense of the possibilities of social movements to redefine the very nature of democracy, triggered by the obvious role played by social movements in the demise of military dictatorships, was left unrealized.

More recently, however, authors are again expressing some optimism, albeit with more caution (Alvarez et al., 1998a). New understandings have emerged about the relationship of social movements to the state and the assumptions of what constitutes movement success and autonomy from the state have been challenged (Dagnino, 1998; Hellman, 1992). Moreover, some remind us that the response is still unknown. The authors included in Alvarez, Dagnino, and Escobar's (1998a) collection on Latin

14

American social movements speculate that demobilization may be temporary, that new identities may be exploited in progressive or resistive ways, that neo-liberalism is neither inevitable nor totalizing, that the spaces created by the new civil society rhetoric may be negotiated or subverted, that citizens may refuse to accept the new rules, that new meanings may emerge, and that "it is precisely at the interstices generated by these contradictions that social movements sometimes articulate their politics" (Alvarez et al., 1998b, p. 23).

Women's Movements in Latin American

In this section, I review the different manifestations of women's activism in Latin America during two periods – military regimes and transition to democracy – with special attention to Chile.

Women's Movements in the Eye of the Storm

West and Blumberg (1990) have reported that, historically and globally, women have often expressed themselves politically through social protest in an effort to meet basic survival needs for themselves and their children. Furthermore, such activities are seen to be an extension of women's nurturing and mothering roles and for that reason marginally tolerated. Jelin (1990) deduces that women respond politically and publicly during 'critical' moments, that is, in times of deepest crisis, when others are more apt to be immobilized.

Political mobilization of women in Latin America increased sharply in the 1970s and 80s in the midst of state repression and stringent economic policies. At a time when traditional political avenues were prohibited and men were not as widely available for protest (due to detention, exile, and migration for employment), women took up the challenge. Three broad (but overlapping) categories of women's political activity are evident during this period: human rights groups, *movimientos populares de mujeres* (popular women's movements), and feminist activism.

Human rights groups were the first to organize opposition to the dictatorship. Formed by women searching for their disappeared loved ones, these groups brought international attention to the oppressive treatment of the citizenry. Probably the most well known of these is *Las Madres de la Plaza de Mayo* in Argentina who, still today, march in front of the presidential palace with pictures of their missing relatives. Among the Chilean groups is the *Agrupación de Familiares de Detenidos Desaparacidos de Chile*

15

(Association of the Relatives of Disappeared Detainees) who, among many other activities, sewed stories of suffering onto tapestries, called *arpilleras*, which they smuggled out of the country to publicize the repression of the dictatorship (Agos n, 1996).

Collectively termed the *movimientos populares de mujeres*, there is a vast and loose network of grassroots women throughout Latin America. During the dictatorships, these women were the force behind popular subsistence and survival-oriented initiatives in the many urban poor and working class *poblaciones* (neighbourhoods). Responding largely to the disastrous economic effects of structural adjustment policies, women organized to both demand basic services and to provide them. Examples are collective kitchens, craft workshops, popular health centres, land invasions, and defense committees. An "extra-economic" benefit to their participation is well-recognized. "Seen in the context of the ongoing continuum of collective activities of *pobladoras*, these groups are spaces in which many women acquire the elements of a gender-specific culture of citizenship" (Schild, 1994, p. 64, italics removed).

It is hardly possible to define a single feminism in a region covering half a hemisphere with diverse histories and identities. Yet, as Alvarez (1998) maintains, there is a "unity-in-difference" that signifies a distinct and recognizable feminist field. Latin American feminisms emerge from the region's particular historical-political backdrop. Therefore, despite some early commonalties with first-wave feminism in Europe and North America (particularly struggles for suffrage and educational access) fundamentally unique features have developed in the region (Franceschet, 2004). Remarkably, the feminist second-wave (post-1970) emerged as a consequence of the repressive economic and political situation across the region. "Contemporary feminisms in Latin America were therefore born as intrinsically oppositional movements... instrumental in shaping a Latin American feminist praxis distinct from that of feminist movements elsewhere" (Sternbach et al., 1995, p. 244).

Women in the proscribed left were the vanguard of the feminist front. These women were often educated and politicized women disillusioned with the immobility of the left in addressing women's issues. In Chile, the Catholic Church turned a blind eye to their political and feminist leanings during the years of the dictatorship and was active in sheltering their activities.[22] Feminist practice was generally linked to grassroots organizing and service provision in poorer neighbourhoods. Working from basic needs, such outreach activities included legal assistance and support to victims of torture and other abused women.

16

A number of important themes arise from the analyses of women's mobilization during this period. These themes demonstrate that women's mobilization is related to a convergence of a multitude of structural and subjective conditions (Alvarez, 1990; Schild, 1994).

While the traditional opportunities for men to organize and mobilize around social interests were eliminated, women were thrust to the forefront. Framing their oppositional activities as an extension of their traditional roles in the care and protection of their families, women made political claims from within a "maternalist" discourse. Appropriating this discourse gave them some moral authority and a small measure of safety in expressing their demands. Bringing private pain and privation into public view transformed spaces traditionally understood as private into profoundly public domains. Some feel that the maternal referent may have contributed to some of the current impasse in their political participation (Noonan, 1995).[23] However, Franceschet has argued that, while a strategy based on "women's difference" may have limited the possibility for a political voice in the transitional government (2001b), feminism and consciousness-raising "subverted the potentially conservative bases of a maternalist gender ideology" thereby "radicalizing" the discourse at the level of action (Okeke-Ihejirika & Franceschet, 2002, p. 459).

Feminists introduced a distinctly gendered political analysis. Particularly influential was the analysis of state repression as the ultimate expression of patriarchal relations entrenched in the private sphere (Kirkwood, 1986). The Chilean rallying cry of *"democracia en el país y en la casa"* (democracy in the country and in the home) encapsulates this premise. The emerging analysis of their situation and their growing activism caused women to newly apprehend themselves as political subjects and to redefine what counts as political. Thus, changing *consciousness* was an important subjective factor in the mobilization of women (Alvarez, 1990).

> In Latin America, a politics of *conscientización* has developed in which women have sought to awaken one another's awareness and understanding of their specific historical situation while providing the analytic tools and organizational modes to participate in the transformation of social conditions.... The fusion of a radical critique of economic, political, and social injustice with a gendered analysis has resulted in a syncretic understanding that has transformed both feminism and the politics of social change in Latin America. (Miller, 1995, p. 204-205)

The combination of bringing grassroots women together and the influence of feminists had a powerful impact on the consciousness of women. In Chile, consciousness-raising

17

activities, which came to be known as the feminist "curriculum" (Valdés & Weinstein, 1993),[24] were instrumental in politicizing and mobilizing masses of Chilean women. The literature is replete with examples of the ways that women's everyday experience and needs became the impetus for political learning (see for example Alvarez, 1990; Schild, 1994). According to Schild (1994),

> *pobladoras...* entered networks that could be called "symbolic" (in addition to "material") because they consist of an exchange of "knowledge" in language and because what women obtain through these networks is cultural-discursive resources... In other words, through this network women have learned to "know" differently and to act differently. (p. 65-66)

Women's Movements in the Transition to Democracy

There is no doubt that the convergence of women's efforts was instrumental in bringing an end to dictatorships in the region. Through their struggles, women had contested the very meaning of politics and were hopeful that democratization would bring a new kind of inclusive politics in which they would be legitimated as political actors. Since the return to democracy, however, traditional party politics and electoral representation have been resurrected and resources for women have been redirected to the state that administers services and programs within a more market-based framework compatible with neo-liberal economics. Critics such as Schild (1998a) and Waylen (1993) feel that these factors have effectively de-politicized and demobilized the grassroots movements. Others are cautiously optimistic (Alvarez et al., 1998a; Franceschet, 2003). Even so, most concur that during the re-democratization period, the earlier momentum of the movements diminished.

Nonetheless, women succeeded in transforming some of their demands during the transition process into major gains in national arenas. In most Latin American countries, the state apparatus now includes some form of women's ministry or bureau responsible for women's issues. In Chile, SERNAM (*Servicio Nacional de la Mujer*) is a ministry with the mandate to oversee the policies and practices of other ministries related to gender issues. However, it exists within the larger and more powerful Planning Ministry and has neither direct authority nor resources for program development. The role of SERNAM and its relationship to the women's movement has been the subject of considerable attention (Franceschet, 2003; Richards, 2003; Schild, 1997; 1998a; Valenzuela, 1998; Waylen, 1997). Notwithstanding some valuable contributions, such as legislative changes, SERNAM is hampered by its positioning in the coalition government and its weakening connections to the autonomous women's movements

18

(Schild, 1998b; Waylen, 2000). Other Chilean state initiatives as they relate to women also receive some critique, particularly those that focus on poor women. *Centros de Madres*, FOSIS, and PRODEMU are three such agencies of the government that draw on the discourses of family values and poverty alleviation.[25]

Another area of analysis is women's relationship to political parties. As mentioned earlier, traditional party structures and agendas were revived during the transition leaving little room for women's demands to be addressed. Craske (1998) contends that, historically, Latin American women have had little time, interest or affinity for "masculinized" party politics and have made few advances in that arena. Numerous authors have commented on the limited electoral advances made by women since re-democratization (Franceschet, 2001b; Waylen, 1997; 2000). Nonetheless, a fairly strategic success of feminist activism within the parties has been the establishment of quotas for women candidates and elected representatives in some countries, varying between 20 and 40 percent (Waylen, 2000).

By far the most contentious topic is the role and positioning of women's NGOs in the new democracies (Alvarez, 1999; Jelin, 1998; Schild, 1998a). Many of the feminist and women's groups previously sheltered by the Catholic Church have since become independent NGOs. In the shrinking neo-liberal state and the absence of other funding sources, these NGOs have become the contractors of state services. Dependent on the state for the funds to stay afloat, they are faced with the necessity of "retooling" their organizations to provide services required by the state. Income-generation programs, personal development, and citizenship training programs for poor women are typically provided by women's NGOs. A newer role for women's NGOs is to act as evaluators and advisors on gender issues in programs and policies.

Paradoxically, none of these activities are in themselves contrary to the basic aims of most feminist and women's organizations. In fact, most of these were initiated and advanced by women during the dictatorship and have been advocated by the global women's movement. Preparation for the Beijing conference in 1995 was particularly instrumental in publicizing women's issues throughout Latin America. What is troubling to most observers is that the very success of the women's movement has resulted in its cooptation to serve new ends. The learning orientation of earlier times is only partially and narrowly realized. For example, many are skeptical about the potential for income generating schemes to succeed without intentional and sustained support for women's personal development and in the absence of changes in economic structures that would allow these women to participate in the formal economy (Craske,

1998; Quiroz Martin, 1997; Schild, 1998a). An emphasis on professional expertise, visible impact and quantifiable results leaves little room for the slower, more process-oriented nature of consciousness-raising and community mobilization (Alvarez, 1999) that has proven effectiveness in creating sustainable employment in Chile (Bosch, 1998; Quiroz Martin, 1997).

A related concern is the increasing demand for "gender experts" to provide input on policies and to evaluate programs. Such experts are expected to be professional women who represent the interests of larger groups of women. Increasingly, therefore, the voice of women is presented by professional NGOs acting as "surrogates" for civil society (Alvarez, 1999) and grassroots women become further removed from the circles of power (Schild, 1998a; 1998b). Some fear new political identities and new social divisions between "clients" and professional deliverers of service have been created. What is especially troubling is that the new model relies on the very women who were instrumental in educating and mobilizing grassroots women during the dictatorships (Alvarez, 1999; Jelin, 1998; Schild, 1998a; Waylen, 2000). Thus, the formation of "new market citizens" (Schild, 1998a) is, in part, dependent on the institutionalization, or "NGO-ization" (Alvarez, 1999), of the women's movement.

Verónica Schild (see for example Schild, 1998b) is among the most vocal of the critics of these new arrangements. The fall out, she contends, is winners and losers. Winners are those that can meet the standards and expectations and win the right to speak on behalf of other women. Losers are those that are not able or willing to adapt. Typically, these are the organizations that are closest to the grassroots women's movements. Particular concerns revolve around professionalization and representation.

Despite their divergent interests and political persuasions, the urgency of the situation during the dictatorship caused women across the middle and working classes to act somewhat collectively, driving differences and divisions underground. In the new set of relationships between the state, NGOs and the women's movement, the professional service provider has more authority to speak on behalf of the client of service, establishing some women as sanctioned intermediaries. Thus, existing divisions in the women's movement are exacerbated, the popular sectors are further marginalized, and the movement is fragmented and less effective. Furthermore, NGO's have become a stand-in for both the state and civil society. Elizabeth Jelin (1998) is unequivocal in her denunciation of this approach.

> NGOs... do not have a built-in mechanism of accountability. They do not
> have a constituency or membership composed of their "sovereign

20

citizens"... Nobody obliges NGOs to guide their activities according to democratic and participatory principles... Social movements and collective participatory action on the part of societal movements cannot be totally institutionalized... (p. 412, italics removed)

Clearly, an important kind of emancipatory learning occurred for Chilean women within a most inhospitable learning climate during the long years of military rule. Just as clearly, new kinds of learning are involved in the making of a neo-liberal citizen. What is not so clear is how this is taken up by women nowadays and what this means for the potential of democracy at the grassroots.

Social Movement Theories

John Holst (2002) provides a comprehensive overview of social movement theorizing in which he resurrects early work in the mid 19th century that touches on collective behaviour and social movements (e.g., Marx, Durkheim, Compte), the early 20th century reactionary preoccupation with crowd behaviour (e.g., LeBon's book, *The Crowd*, published in 1896), the beginning of a specific field addressing the social psychology of collective behaviour in 1940s and 50s in which "the dominant paradigm sees collective behavior as ultimately irrational" (p. 29), and the introduction of macrosociological analysis in the 1960s and 70s. In the following quote, he explains the shift from there to the newest paradigms.

> We can see, then, that the early work on collective behavior was steeped in a very functionalist, psychologistic, and individualist perspective... Therefore, any collective action was seen as outside "conventional" or "normal" behavior. The social movements that emerged in the 1960s, however, shattered these perspectives by exposing several inadequacies in their ability to describe and explain these movements... With these movements, collective action became a part of political action and not separate from it, as previously theorized. In short, the social movement theorists of the 1960s could not explain the social movements erupting around them; this led to a reevaluation of the theory and the development of the two major social movement theory approaches of today. (p. 34-35)

There are two major types of approaches to studying contemporary social movements, Resource Mobilization (RM) and New Social Movements (NSM), distinguished primarily by their interrogatory focus (how vs. why) and explanatory logic (strategy vs. identity) (Carroll, 1997; Cohen, 1985; Escobar & Alvarez, 1992a; Holst, 2002). While there is an identifiable conceptual break from the past, each contemporary paradigm has a referent in a particular school of sociological thought.

Post World War II theorists, primarily in the U.S., attempted to determine *how* social movements form and act (e.g., Charles Tilley, Sidney Tarrow). Resource Mobilization theorists believe that explanatory potential is derived from the study of organizations, resources, interests, and strategies. The Political Process model is a variant of this approach that is more concerned about *when* social movements emerge. The "political opportunity structure" is an analytical tool that examines the relationship between social movements and the political context. Resource Mobilization is a pragmatic approach based on instrumental rationality, common interests and strategic interaction. Although newer theorists incorporate "collective action frames" that attempt to account for identity issues, RM theory is criticized for its lack of attention to consciousness or interpretive factors (Carroll, 1997).[26]

In contrast, mostly from outside the U.S., the New Social Movement theories focus on *why* social movements arise. Precipitated by socio-political events in the 1960s and 70s, particularly the student protests in France in 1968, this approach seeks to understand the multiplicity of new actors, actions and spaces of social movements in the latter half of the century. These are termed identity-centered theories because they are concerned with "processes by which social actors constitute collective identities as a means to create democratic spaces for more autonomous action" (Escobar & Alvarez, 1992a, p. 5). This analytical approach arises from the interest in the connections among political, economic, social, and cultural concerns (Calderón et al., 1992). Theorists in this vein – such as Melucci, Touraine, Offe (European) and Calderón, Escobar, Alvarez (Latin American) – are influenced by poststructuralist, post- or neo-marxist, and postmodern critiques, and distinguish new social movements from old social movements.

Movements for social change in the first half of the 20th century (i.e., old social movements) were assumed to be precipitated by capitalist expansion in the age of industrialization. Inspired largely by Marx' critique of capitalism and articulation of a revolutionary project based in the working class, oppositional politics were forged by workers and directed at the relations of production. Thus, the labour movement, composed of unions as well as other institutions established for the welfare of workers, was the primary vehicle for social change. This approach gives primacy to economic structures and the worker as the revolutionary subject. As a result of concerted and effective struggle, the conditions of workers in the capitalist arena were mitigated by the introduction of Keynesian welfare state policies. Some theorize that this operated as a balm applied by the state, which pacified the working class in the interests of capitalist expansion.

22

In contrast, newer forms of collective action have a broader range of oppositional subjects. Students, women, anti-war/peace activists, civil rights agitators, and environmental groups responded to the confluent influences of the disillusionment of the left and entry into the post-industrial, post-Fordist age of advanced capitalism. While the middle classes have expanded their presence, persons disenfranchised from or peripheral to the sphere of economic production, such as the unemployed and women in unpaid labour, are also included. New social movements do not seek state power, as do political parties, but rather aim to diffuse the exaggerated power of the economic and political spheres over the cultural sphere (Welton, 1993) and to negotiate collective identities and meanings (Escobar & Alvarez, 1992a). As it is the foundations of modernity itself that are questioned by new social movements, the basic tenets of liberalism and socialism are challenged for their universalizing and reductionist assumptions. Overly bureaucratic, centralized and hierarchical organizational processes are rejected in favour of more local, grassroots and consensual practices.

Discussion about social movements in recent decades has centered on defining, distinguishing, or debunking this somewhat ambiguous theoretical construct. However, there is considerable doubt about whether new social movements are actually new (Adkin, 1998; Cohen, 1985; Holst, 2002; Plotke, 1990). While some portray a radical break with the past and others claim it is a myth, many perceive a more fluid transition between earlier and later movements, the latter simply responding to changing realities in new ways. Likely, it is just as rash to believe that there is nothing new as to ignore the linkages. Indeed, some prefer the terms "alternative social movements" (Adkin, 1998), "new democratic struggles" (Mouffe, 1988) or "new identity within contemporary social movements" (Cohen, 1985, p. 667) over NSM so as not to obscure the similarities and continuities. In introducing their seminal theoretical volume *The Making of Social Movements in Latin America*, Escobar and Alvarez (1992b) state that their "contributors seek to identify the new in the old and the old in the new; perhaps more importantly, they examine the potentially innovative aspects of the historical meeting of old and new forms" (p. 8). Or stated more laconically, "the old transforms into the new" (Calderón et al., 1992, p. 19).

Escobar and Alvarez (1992a) admit that Latin American theorists, oriented mainly to the new social movement approach, have neglected the study of strategies employed by movement actors. In order to advance the study of social movements in Latin America, they contend, what is needed is a "cross-pollination" across theories, theorists and methods of study.[27] Jean Cohen proposed exactly that in her 1985 article on

23

contemporary social movements. In addition to comparing the RM and NSM paradigms, her objective was to "show how they could inform each other, despite significant differences" (p. 663). Although the aim is admirable, Calderón, Piscitelli and Reyna (1992) persuasively problematize the limits of non-indigenous theoretical constructs. They make a variety of interrelated arguments that can be summarized as follows. First, they argue, some analytical trends are not useful for the Latin American situation; others cannot be used uncritically. They contend that Latin American researchers have the advantage of the periphery to see beyond the view of the centre. Second, known paradigms are limited in their ability to effectively capture the Latin American reality. Only in looking beyond them, were the new actors and processes even analytically visible.

Notwithstanding these important arguments, Dagnino (1998) suggests that Latin Americans are open to "an antiauthoritarian eclecticism that makes it difficult to single out particular influences" (p. 40).[28] Calderón, Piscitelli and Reyna (1992) likewise contend that local theories in Latin American are produced through an effective process of "syncretism" – adapting and transforming foreign theories into new theories. An excellent example of this is provided by Evelina Dagnino (1998) as she traces the "Gramscian boom" that served as a "catalyst" for the renovation of the left in Latin America. She demonstrates how the particular political context of re-democratization in Latin America established the left's idiosyncratic reading of Gramsci, especially in re-thinking the notion of hegemomy.

> This particular environment seems to have nurtured a strong emphasis
> on the progressive or "revolutionary" possibility of hegemony as a
> project for the transformation of society. Such an emphasis contrasts with
> other readings of the concept; European theorists, for instance,
> consistently explored its application to an analysis of the maintenance of
> the status quo and dominant power relations. (p. 38-39)

Despite a growing body of literature theorizing the new social movements in Latin America, it is questionable whether the basic tenets of the theory make sense in that context. First, some critique holds true globally. There is nothing particularly new about feminism and women's struggles for citizenship; the new movements were started by and continue to be populated by left-wing thinkers; and the state and the economy continue to be prime sites for contestation (Holst, 2002). Second, specific to the global south, and Latin America in particular, there is nothing particularly new about globalization either. "Capital has always been global," says Holst (2002, p. 52), "[and] on the international stage the struggle between capital and labor as embodied in imperialist

24

relations has not seen a qualitative change" (p. 53). Furthermore, Schuurman (1993b) warns that post-modern interpretations of new social movements, particularly in the global south, may be an "example of theory moving faster than reality" (p. 189).

> Social movements (new and old) in the Third World are not expressions of resistance against modernity; rather, they are demands for access to it... When those excluded unite in groups and forge ties of solidarity, this must not be seen as an embryonic form of a new society, but rather as a survival strategy. (Schuurman, 1993a, p. 27)

> My major point is that new social movements in the South are not by any means post-modern. Categorizing the creation of new values, new life-styles, new ways of communication and new ways of collective action as post-modern denies the history of the movements and misinterprets what they are all about. Whatever the relevance of characterising Northern societies as post-industrial and post-modern, Southern societies for sure are not... It would be counterproductive and politically conservative to interpret the failure of the modernity project in the South as a post-modern condition... It would be politically na ve and demobilising to view social movements in the South solely as breeding grounds of a new post-modern identity. The history of many of these movements started in the 1970s when many countries in Latin America suffered from the political and economic consequences of military rule. The political, economic and cultural exclusion of the subaltern classes in that period was such that all sorts of popular organisations came into existence to defend their sheer physical existence and other basic human rights. (Schuurman, 1993b, p. 191)

Throughout his book, *Social Movements, Civil Society, and Radical Adult Education*, John Holst (2002) builds a persuasive critique of New Social Movement theories. He argues that the "politics of social movements and civil society have become the dominant paradigm within radical adult education today" (p. 4) as a result of the current crisis of marxism. But, he challenges the basic tenets of social movement theorizing. From his perspective, erroneous interpretations of Gramsci's civil society end up looking suspiciously like western democratic liberalism and ultimately, provide the "ideological foundation of neoliberal structural adjustment programs" (p. 74). He is especially critical of the radical pluralists (e.g., Melucci, Cohen and Arato, Mouffe and Laclau). He advocates a return instead to classical marxism's unequivocal critique of capitalism and its insistence on working-class leadership (through political parties), without which "... we are condemned to petit-bourgeois, reform-oriented social movements and limiting civil society theory" (p. 76). Rather, "for Allman and Wallis, the truly immense and educative project of a party of the left is to engage all the possible anticapitalist forces in an analysis of the origins of the various forms of oppression in society" (Holst, 2002, p. 95). Then invoking Foley (1999), Holst contends that,

adult educators who base their social analysis on radical pluralist theory are developing theories of education within social movements that address identity and cultural formation, yet their theories will remain inadequate while they fail to problematize relations of power based in political economy. (p. 87)

Adult Education and Social Movements

Adult education generally operates within the sphere of non-formal, community-based education although some activities also appear in more formal educational institutions such as community colleges (e.g., citizenship, adult basic education) or workplaces (e.g., training programs). In North America, adult education has deep roots in social initiatives that endeavoured to enhance citizens' experience of social life and promote social progress (Lindeman, 1926).[29] Many of these activities were informed by liberal humanist views within the principles of democratic participation. By aligning with critical social theories, a more radical or emancipatory edge to adult education has also carved a significant although marginalized terrain within the field. Influenced by marxist and neo-marxist discourses, such as those of Habermas, Luxemburg and Gramsci, this critical form struggles in growing opposition to and polarization from 'mainstream' adult education, education that is based largely on psychological learning principles and market rationality. Such an approach recognizes that education is not a neutral activity. Rather it is value-laden, normative and ultimately political. As Freire has stated, "it is impossible to deny, except intentionally or by innocence, the political aspect of education" (cited in Mayo, 1999, p. 58).

Located within such a history, a relationship between adult education and social movements has some justification and has received some attention in the North American literature (Chovanec, 1993; Davis, 1994; Finger, 1989; Hart, 1990b; Kastner, 1994; Schmitt-Boshnick, 1996; Welton, 1993; 1995a). Notwithstanding my earlier comments about the lack of attention to learning in social movements, "adult education (or at least a substantial part of it) has always been associated with social change, social action, social movements, community development, and participatory democracy" (Spencer, 1998, p. 62). Within the labour, feminist, peace, human rights, and environmental movements, for example, are found numerous educational activities, from awareness-raising and skill-building workshops to the highly informal learning of action-reflection cycles. Here, knowledge is being challenged, created and recreated – a profoundly educational enterprise. According to Kastner (1993), the epistemological processes which support the movement's aims are particularly salient for adult

26

educators. "Significant learning efforts are taking place within the many groups making up these movements... members select, critique, generate, organize and distribute knowledge... " (p. 143).

Adult educators derive theoretical grounding for education in social movements from Gramsci (1971), Freire (1990), and Habermas (1971).

Antonio Gramsci offers a rich contribution to educational theory that includes an understanding of the role of civil society in ideological reproduction and the pedagogical process for developing political consciousness. According to Mayo (1999), "Gramsci saw in the education and cultural formation of adults the key to the creation of counter-hegemonic action" (p. 53). Gramsci's notion of education is broadly conceived. "For Gramsci, every relationship of hegemony is essentially an educational relationship" (Mayo, 1994, p. 5). Morrow and Torres (1995) highlight Gramsci's account of the role of education in the formation of hegemony and consciousness and his explication of socialist pedagogical principles. Simply stated, ideological reproduction is accomplished through coercion or consensus, the latter being the responsibility of civil society where institutions such as schools, the church, and family play the largest role. Capitalist hegemony "basically means the ideological predominance of bourgeois values and norms over the subordinate social classes... by moral and intellectual persuasion" (Morrow & Torres, 1995, p. 253). Gramsci's treatment of the role of the "organic intellectual" in the promotion of a political consciousness and his concept of praxis as a dialectic relationship between theory/practice or learning/production have been incorporated into the work of many others, most notably Freire (1990). Indeed, the theoretical affinity between Gramsci and Freire is addressed by many adult educators, such as, Mayo (1999), Holst (2002), and Allman (2001b).

In North America, Freire is the most visible representative of the popular education paradigm that has been linked to popular social movements in Latin America. Drawing extensively on Gramsci's advocacy of political and revolutionary consciousness, popular education relies on a critical analysis of unjust living conditions within inequitable social arrangements. Popular education is an overtly political pedagogical process in that its goal is to mobilize the popular classes (i.e., poor and oppressed groups) in Latin America to demand equitable allocation of resources such as housing, potable water, health care, and education (Morrow & Torres, 1995). This is the crux of Freire's literacy campaign in Brazil. In a Canadian example, the Moment Project in Toronto uses Gramscian concepts and Freirian methods with "... activists and community workers to undertake collective socio-political analysis for action" (Davis, 1994). This process of

27

critical awareness and action for the transformation of political, economic and social structures is known as consciousness-raising or, in Freirian terms, conscientization. It has also been well described by feminist adult educators such as Hart (1990b).

Jürgen Habermas explicates the theory of communicative action, basically also an educative process, which relies on consensus, dialogue and democratic public spaces within the lifeworld. Within adult education, Welton (1998; 1995b) provides the most compelling argument for a Habermasian framework in studying social learning. He suggests that social and political learning processes are at the centre of Habermas' analyses of how modern societies are organized and reproduced. Morrow and Torres (2002) identify "shared themes" that justify a complementary reading of Habermas and Freire in relation to education. While many feminists, such as adult educator Mechtild Hart (1990a), also employ Habermasian logic, it often includes a critique of the gender blind analysis of the system/lifeworld distinction upon which the space for educative praxis is established (Fraser, 1994).

Summary

In order to understand how political knowledge and skills are transmitted through social movement participation, it is important to understand the context within which the process is situated and the lens through which it is viewed. Thus the intention of this literature review was to provide an introduction to some of the main concepts or issues that converge in this study: the Latin American socio-political context, social and women's movements in Latin America, social movement theories, and adult education's relationship to social movements. I also discuss the strengths and challenges of the research process.

Methodology

In this section, I review the research approaches (phenomenology, ethnography, and feminist critique) that guide this research project and I describe ethical procedures and the specific methods that I used for information-gathering, interpretation, and establishing trustworthiness.

Phenomenology, Ethnography, and Feminist Research Critique

While research methods cannot always be definitively determined in advance, "there exists a certain dialectic between question and method" (van Manen, 1990, p. 2) that guides the researcher to particular methods and methodologies congruent with the questions asked. As such, having established research questions that compelled me to examine the life experiences of a particular cultural group, I relied on approaches that would describe and interpret the meaning of human experience as experienced within that culture.

Methodologically, this study is inherently *phenomenological* in that it is the study of people's lived experience and of how they make meaning of their experiences. Meaning is what gives form and content to social experiences (van Manen, 1990). As Osbourne (1990) explains:

> If... all knowledge is human knowledge and apprehended through our phenomenal experience, then the study of phenomenal experience is a good starting place for developing an understanding of what it is to be human... The focus of such an approach is the understanding of persons' experiences of their world(s) and not the generation of explanatory laws... (p. 80)

Broadly speaking, this study explored the phenomenon of social and political learning in social movements – in all its informal, obscured and partial ways – and searched for the meanings within these human experiences. And furthermore, connected this to the particular socio-historic context of the women's movement in Arica, Chile. "A powerful phenomenology," notes Foley (1999) in his study of learning in social movements,

> will give a rich picture of how different people in a situation make sense of it and act on it, and it will seek to make explanatory connections between this micro activity and broader cultural, political and economic processes. A phenomenology is most powerful it is contextual, if it is *social*. (p. 12)

Phenomenologists point out that accounts of lived experience are never the same as lived experience itself, but approximations and transformations of those experiences (van Manen, 1990). Van Manen (1990) poetically writes:

> [W]e need to find access to life's living dimensions while realizing that the meanings we bring to the surface from the depths of life's oceans have already lost the natural quiver of their undisturbed existence. (p. 54)

While there is a debate about whether or not a method exists in phenomenology, in general, phenomenology relies on methods that encourage reflection on lived

29

experience. The capturing of human experience as "text" and the interpretation of this text introduces a hermeneutic element (van Manen, 1990).

Recognized as the hallmark method for describing a culture, *ethnography* emerged as a useful research method for this study. Doing ethnographic fieldwork is the disciplined study of a culture through the eyes of the people themselves (Spradley, 1980). "Rather than *studying people*," Spradley says, "ethnography means *learning from people*" (p. 3). The general methods of ethnography are experiencing (participant observation), enquiring (interviewing) and examining (document analysis). These methods are used to "describe what the people in some particular place or status ordinarily do, and the meanings they ascribe to what they do, under ordinary or particular circumstances, presenting that description in a manner that draws attention to regularities that implicate cultural process" (Wolcott, 1999, p. 68).

The combination of the "interpretive approach" of phenomenology with the "close engagement" of ethnography seems to be well suited to the study of Latin American social movements as envisioned by Escobar (1992).

> Theory must start with people's self-understanding, with giving an account of people as agents whose practices are shaped by their self-understanding... This requires a close engagement with the agents – a mutual exchange between the "subjects" that are written about and the critics who write about them... An interpretive approach grounded on how people understand themselves as creators and practitioners of their world is increasingly recognized as necessary. (p. 63)

Beyond these, however, feminists studying popular movements in Latin America convincingly demonstrate that social movement participation cannot be adequately understood in the absence of a gendered analysis (Alvarez, 1990; Jaquette, 1989; Miller, 1995; Schild, 1994; Waylen, 2000). Thus, in this study, a *feminist critique* overlays and permeates the other two approaches. Founded on feminist principles and beliefs, feminist research has two interrelated aims. The research is intended to both make visible the experience of women grounded in their everyday reality, and to contribute to an improvement in their lives (Cook & Fonow, 1990; Duelli Klein, 1983; Stanley & Wise, 1983b; Westkott, 1990). Central to feminist research theory are the rejection of the traditional objective/subjective dichotomy and the myth of neutrality. Post-structuralist and postcolonial feminists furthermore caution us to be vigilant in avoiding essentialist and universalizing constructions of women, insist that the analysis of class, race and other forms of oppression must be integrated into feminist analysis, and problematize the positionality of the researcher (Mohanty, 1991b).

30

Ethical Procedures

I followed standard academic ethical procedures and dedicated particular attention to cultural differences and safety issues. I incorporated accepted procedures to ensure that explanations, consent, confidentiality, right to opt out, minimal harm, and data security were addressed. These were approved by the University of Alberta and later reviewed and minimally revised with the work team at CEDEMU. With the help of the research collaborators in Arica, I translated all documents into Spanish.

I provided letters of introduction that outlined the nature and purpose of the research to all potential participants and other interested persons (see Appendices). I reviewed the letter with the participant at the beginning of each interview. Once questions or concerns were addressed, I recorded and dated the participant's verbal consent in the interview guide. Obtaining a signature was neither culturally appropriate nor in the best interests of confidentiality with this vulnerable group. I solicited additional consent specifically for the involvement of research collaborators and the use of a tape-recorder. I informed the participants about the right to opt out at any time, to decline participation in any aspect of the research, or to refuse the involvement of a research collaborator at any time. When observing and participating in informal or organized events, the consent of the participants was implicit; it would have been disruptive and discomfiting to expect any more. No objections were ever raised. Participants' identity was protected through the use of pseudonyms.[30]

I discussed confidentiality guidelines and practical procedures for data security with the transcriber and the research collaborators, who also signed a commitment to maintain a high standard of confidentiality (see Appendices).

Information-gathering Methods

During the cultural immersion of ethnographic field work, the methods I used for gathering information were those most often employed in interpretive forms of research and ethnography, i.e., participant-observation, interviews, document analysis, and field journals.

Participant Observation

From an ethnographic perspective, participant observation is a method that is based on experiencing firsthand and with all our senses what occurs naturally in the field setting (Wolcott, 1999). In phenomenological terms, it is "closely observing situations for their

31

lived meaning" (van Manen, 1990, p. 69). Acute observation is a requisite skill in ethnographic fieldwork. Both Spradley (1980) and van Manen (1990) acknowledge the dual purpose of observing and participating simultaneously, the level of the researcher's participation in the field ranging on a continuum from passive to moderate to active to complete (Spradley, 1980). Determining a suitable level of participation and negotiating the insider/outsider duality is often challenging. As Spradley predicts, "you will experience the feeling of being both an *insider* and an *outsider* simultaneously" (1980, p. 58).

In a research study such as this one, there are two particularly thorny issues to consider. First, assuming the stance of a feminist researcher does not allow me to remain detached in the traditional sense. A political commitment, or praxis, is always present that heightens the "insider" element.[31] Second, I am an "outsider" in terms of culture, nation, class, education, and language. Furthermore, my role as a *privileged* outsider must be problematized.

Cultural immersion was the main vehicle for participant observation in this study. I lived in Arica in a *población* with my four-year-old daughter, sixteen-year-old stepson, Chilean-Canadian common-law partner, and, at different intervals, members of the extended family. Living in the community, as a family with ties to the community of study, inserted me into the community as a neighbour, a mother, and as the *esposa* (spouse) of a fellow *Ariqueño* (male citizen of Arica) – but with the special status accorded to a white, Canadian researcher. In this context, I was constantly engaged in information-gathering through participant observation. Buying bread, talking to neighbours, watching television news, participating in social events, and many more daily activities were continual sources of information.

Immersion was further facilitated through my connection with *Casa de Encuentro de la Mujer* (CEDEMU), a community-based women's non-governmental organization (NGO) in Arica that served as my field base. Although CEDEMU was facing a number of challenges at the time (leadership changes, move to a new location, and ongoing funding problems), the team of four women welcomed me warmly and provided assistance in multiple ways. As I arrived in Arica during Chile's summer months, I spent the first weeks gathering contextual information, developing rapport with the CEDEMU team, consolidating the research approach, and establishing relevant community networks. Later, I was more directly involved in meetings, workshops and other events (e.g., downtown display for International Day of Women's Health). The balance between observation and participation was dependent on the context. Although no longer

32

officially constituted in the same way as CEDEMU, various women involved in the long-standing women's organization, *Movimiento por los Derechos de la Mujer* (MODEMU), also provided substantial assistance and information throughout the course of the study. Interesting off shoots of participant observation were invitations to participate in a SERNAM radio broadcast in Iquique, in an indigenous women's health conference in Arica, and in various social, educational, and neighbourhood events.

Individual, Group, and Organizational Interviews

Interviews are used to elicit more information about insights gained during field observation and to explore topics of which little is known. In part, interviews are used to explore emerging themes in greater depth with "cultural experts" (Schensul et al., 1999). Interviews may be formal or informal, and more or less structured. "Ethnographers converse with people over a wide range of topics and spend time with them in their own contexts. They not only ask questions, but they also talk about themselves"(Feldman et al., 1979, p. 26). What makes an interview different from a dialogue, though, is the explicit purpose, ongoing explanations, and particular kinds of questions that are inserted into the conversation. During the fieldwork in Arica, I conducted a variety of informal, formal, group, and organizational interviews.

Within the cultural immersion of the ethnographic method, there were countless opportunities for informal information-gathering in the field – with friends, neighbours, shopkeepers, the CEDEMU team, or with other people I fortuitously encountered. Related specifically to the theme of social movement participation and learning, I recorded twenty-two "impromptu unstructured interviews" in my field report that occurred throughout my travels during the nine months of field work (Table 1-1). Often this was with more than one person at a social or family event. For example, during my visit to the nearby city of Iquique, I informally interviewed: a family (mother, father and adult daughter) on their experiences during the dictatorship; a group of artists about the use of theatre and music in anti-dictatorship and current activities with youth; and a psychologist who had previously conducted research with women's movement participants in Arica.

TABLE 1-1 INFORMAL INTERVIEWS

	Interviews	Participants	Comments
TOTAL	22	# not recorded	Some overlap with formal interviewees

Formal interviews included open-ended, in-depth individual interviews (eight participants were interviewed twice), and a number of group interviews as well as semi-structured, supplementary interviews with governmental and non-governmental organizations. In total, I conducted forty-seven formal interviews with sixty individuals (Table 1-2).

TABLE 1-2 FORMAL INTERVIEWS

	Interviews	Participants	Comments
TOTAL	47	60	A number of participants were interviewed in more than one context but counted only once.

Because I would be conducting the formal interviews in Spanish and with women whose reality was different from my own, I was concerned from the outset that I might miss linguistic and cultural markers and nuances. To alleviate this concern, I hired two people from within the community to conduct most of the interviews with me. Sandra Bravo, a member of the CEDEMU team, worked with me most closely in interviewing and arranging interviews, and Héctor González, my common-law partner, assisted with translations, networking, analysis, and also conducted some interviews.[32] Both had some previous experience in qualitative interviewing and were open to the techniques I proposed. Only Héctor also spoke English.

Formal, open-ended group and individual interviews were conducted in Spanish in private homes (mine, Sandra's or the participant's) or the CEDEMU office. The typical routine followed these steps:

- Sandra or Héctor contacted the potential participant, provided a brief description of the research project, and scheduled the interview.

- At the start of the interview, I officially welcomed the participant(s), provided an information letter, verbally explained the purpose and process

34

of the research project, answered questions, and obtained the participant's consent to participate, to audio tape the session and to involve the identified research collaborators, recording their consent on the interview guide.

- I then obtained some basic demographic information. (In the larger groups, this was done on paper.)

- Loosely using the interview guide, Sandra or Héctor facilitated the interview and we each asked questions at the end. In later interviews, I interacted more comfortably throughout the interview as well.

Sandra and I conducted two pilot individual interviews and one pilot group interview. I originally arrived in the field with an interview guide that I translated and then revised twice more during the course of the interviews, each time lessening the number of topic areas for the first interviews (see Appendices). As my own previous research experience (Chovanec, 1994) concurs with Maguire's (1987) and others that women often feel a need to "tell their story" before addressing more focused questions, the first topic area, "the form and context of the woman's participation in movements for social change," was very open-ended and encouraged a story-telling type of response. Early on I discovered two things about this question: (a) participants used most of the available time in responding to this question in a thorough, thoughtful and generally chronological way, and more importantly, (b) the responses to the other (unasked) questions were usually embedded in their narrative, including my interest in the learning dimension of their participation in social movements.

Once a clear picture of the commonalities across narratives emerged, a separate page of questions was developed that targeted specific areas for follow-up in second interviews and in the last of the group and individual interviews (see Appendices). Included in the interview guide was a description of the techniques involved in open-ended interviewing, the objectives of each question, and a series of potential probes.

In this manner, a total of fifty-three individual women were interviewed in a series of thirty-nine group or individual interviews, as is presented in Table 1-3.

35

TABLE 1-3 PARTICIPANT INTERVIEWS

	Interviews	Participants	Comments
Formal individual interviews	21	23	2 pilots 1 family of 3
Formal second interviews	8	8	1 pilot
Formal group interviews	10	32	1 pilot 1 group met twice 2 to 7 individuals per group
TOTAL	39	53	Some women interviewed more than once but counted only once

The sampling of interviewees is primarily based on the participant's ability to give the most useful and relevant information regarding the focus of the study. Thus, all the women interviewed had been active in social and/or political movements in Arica at some time during the past thirty years. In fact, all the women had been active during the latter years of the dictatorship but few had remained active. The list of potential interviewees was initially developed by the CEDEMU director (Berta Morena) and the research collaborator (Sandra) and then revised and expanded to include other women in Héctor's network. In the end, far more women were invited to participate than I originally envisioned. Around a hundred women were the mainstay of the women's movement during the dictatorship years in Arica; I interviewed half of them. This was, in part, a case of including "self-appointed informants" (Wolcott, 1999) wherein potential interviewees often either presented themselves or were suggested by other women.[33] I decided to interview all the women who wanted to participate as a sign of respect to each of them and gratitude to the community. After the successful pilot group interview, group interviews became the primary vehicle for including larger numbers of interested women.

In compiling the list of participants, I attempted to follow the accepted axiom of maximum variation, i.e., selection based on ensuring that a variety of subject characteristics are included in the sample (Strauss & Corbin, 1990). In this case, many characteristics of the study population were similar (i.e., gender, geographic location, class) so, I purposefully sought variation in age, ethnicity, education, amount and type

36

of social movement experience. The participants ranged in age between 25 and 78 and represented women from all the left/centre parties, the Catholic Church, community kitchens, the University, and the *poblaciones* (poor and working class neighbourhoods). Some had held public office and some had lived in exile. Some had long-standing family histories of social/political involvement; others became involved later, sometimes against their family's wishes. Some women were born in Arica. Others were originally from elsewhere in Chile. Two women self-identified as indigenous but other women born in the north likely had indigenous background as well. Educational levels ranged from very little formal schooling to university degrees.

In most situations, sampling continues until the repetitiveness of themes relative to the research topic is undeniable and, despite variation in the selection of data sources, no new themes arise. The concept of "saturation" used by grounded theorists is instructive here.

> Saturation refers to the completeness of all levels of codes when no new conceptual information is available to indicate new codes or the expansion of existing ones... The researcher, by repeatedly checking and asking questions of the data, ultimately achieves a sense of closure. (Hutchinson, 1988, p. 137)

In this study, theoretical saturation (Strauss & Corbin, 1990) was accomplished early in the interviews. Despite the open-ended nature of the interviews and a concerted effort to include women whose experience might contradict the emerging theorization, there was considerable similarity and repetition of the research topics across the interviewees.

In addition to the interviews with social movement participants, I also conducted nine semi-structured supplementary interviews with local NGOs and government departments, including three with the work team at CEDEMU. These interviews were focused on the relationship to, policies regarding, and impact on women and women's movements, thus adding another dimension to the information gathered.

37

TABLE 1-4 ORGANIZATIONAL INTERVIEWS

Organization*	Type	Interviews	Participants	Comments
CEDEMU	NGO	3	4	2 to 4 individuals per session
SERPAJ	NGO	2	2	1 individual in each session
PRODEMU	Gov't	1	1	
OCMF	Gov't	1	3	
CINTRAS	NGO	1	1	The only male interviewed
MEMCH	NGO	1	1	
TOTAL		9	12	

* see Appendix 3 for descriptions

Except for information gathered in my far-ranging contact with CEDEMU, the information obtained from the organizational representatives in these interviews was consistent with information that could otherwise be obtained in formal documents. I had hoped, with confidentiality offered to the interviewees, to uncover some critique of the services offered to women but this was not the case. It is possible that, even though I interviewed most of these organizations on my own, my relationship to CEDEMU might have influenced the information obtained. Furthermore, despite repeated attempts, I was not able to connect with two other important women's organizations in Arica: *Taller de Estudio Andino* (a research NGO) and *Movimientos Autónomos de Mujeres* (a women's network). I believe that, because these organizations compete for funding and vie for status, this may also have been related to my connection with CEDEMU.

All formal interviews were transcribed in the original Spanish by a professional transcriber in Santiago.[34] I received the transcripts electronically, reformatted and printed them, and reviewed some with the research collaborators. At one point, Sandra asked for permission to keep copies of some transcripts. I declined her request citing strict ethical procedures established by the University. I did not incorporate the common practice of sharing transcripts with participants because I had concerns about the transcripts being left behind in the community in any manner. Only one participant requested her own transcript, which I provided electronically.

Document and Literature Review

Examining documents is an important field technique and a "vital source of data" (Wolcott, 1999, p. 59). In this study, document gathering and review were conducted in a variety of ways.

- By far the most useful and extensive document and literature gathering was conducted in Arica from within CEDEMU's tiny "library."

38

- A second valuable source of historical information in Arica was the informal "archives" of another women's organization (MODEMU).

- Upon first arriving in Chile, I remained in the capital city of Santiago where I conducted library research at ISIS International and briefly visited FLACSO.[35] With the help of the librarian at ISIS, I gathered a wide array of documents and literature that appeared related to my subject of study. I returned to ISIS mid-way through the fieldwork with a more targeted document search, and also collected information from MEMCH (a feminist NGO).

- Within the first month, I also made a trip to *Universidad Austral* in Valdivia (840 km south of Santiago) where I met with an anthropologist (Dr. Pia Poblete) for methodological advice on culturally appropriate research strategies and processes.[36]

- After two months in Arica, I visited the regional office of SERNAM in Iquique (300 km south of Arica) where I gathered relevant governmental documents such as the *Equal Opportunity Plan* that outlines the official policies and strategies related to the advancement of women in Chile.

- In Iquique, I also met with Aylen Cortez D az, who had previously conducted research on the women's movement in Arica (Cortez D az & Villagra Parra, 1999). She also shared valuable literature.

- At the end of my fieldwork, I spent a final day in Santiago buying books that had emerged as important sources of information.

Field Journals

In adherence to a basic fieldwork principle and technique, I made regular entries into journals throughout the period of the research in Chile. There were two main types of journal entries.[37] First, I recorded factual information such as dates, times, places, people, directions, as well as re-creations of observations, conversations, and activities.[38] I also included news clippings, photographs, notices, pamphlets or other data collected in the field that related to the research topic. Second, because phenomenological methods demand a considerable degree of introspection, keeping thorough and thoughtful journals was the beginning of the analysis and writing of the research (Boyle, conference notes, Feb. 22, 2001). As such, I recorded thoughts, feelings, observations, reflections, emerging analyses, biases, assumptions, strategies, ideas, and also assessed my progress and where/how to proceed.

Analysis and Interpretation

Because theory is grounded in the experiences of the research participants, analysis in an interpretive research project is an on-going process that occurs concurrently with

39

information-gathering. Moreover, when a period of participant observation precedes the interviews, an initial analysis may already be forming (Agar, 1980; Schensul et al., 1999).

> Close observation involves an attitude of assuming a relation that is as close as possible while retaining a hermeneutic alertness to situations that allows us to constantly step back and reflect on the meaning of those situations. (van Manen, 1990, p. 69)

The dialectic process between gathering and analyzing has the ultimate objective of explicating the meaning of the phenomenon under study. In an interpretive approach to social science, analysis is a process of moving conceptually between the whole to the parts – to look for relationships between the parts that give meaning to the whole. Thus, in order to make sense of human social life, we must look for order where none at first glance seems to exist, however tenuous and provisional it may be. The order that we seek might be described as "themes" as in van Manen's (1990) hermeneutic phenomenology, "patterns" as per Spradley's (1980) ethnography, or "codes" in Glaser and Strauss' (Glaser & Strauss, 1967; Strauss & Corbin, 1990) grounded theory. Regardless of the particular analytic 'technique,' all depend on the creativity, intuition, insight and sensitivity of the researcher to discover the meanings of the phenomenon.

In this study, I was struck by the repetition of certain key events, issues, and concepts that emerged early in the field and that appeared to be highly significant for understanding and/or problematizing learning and education within social movements. Many of the key findings were evident in early informal discussions and the pilot interviews. Once I recognized these key findings, I combined them into broad topic areas that I called 'analytical categories' and looked for means to empirically and theoretically elaborate the categories.

First, I subjected them to initial analysis in the field through a variety of methods. Concurrent with information-gathering, the research collaborators and I reviewed the transcripts and held ongoing reflective analysis sessions. Once all the interviews were completed, I prepared some analytical categories that we then reviewed with two selected participants. Afterwards, we incorporated some of these concepts into a final learning/cultural event with all the participants. Second, I sought explanation of these analytical categories within theories relevant to social movement learning. Lastly, I returned to the transcripts for empirical authentication.

From the face-to-face open-ended interviews, I obtained the core data for analysis and interpretation. In this, I was aided by the data management capabilities of *HyperRESEARCH*, a qualitative research software program. The program enabled me to

40

organize the text from the transcripts into thematic topic areas and then cluster them in various ways to further illuminate or challenge the analytical category.

While it is often common to build a larger picture from smaller pieces of data, such as the systematic techniques used in grounded theory (Strauss & Corbin, 1990), I found that, in this study, moving from the large to the small was more useful. Hence, although particular findings tweaked my interest, it was the analytical categories that I focused on most attentively and to which I subjected rigorous empirical and theoretical analysis. In a recent conference, ethnographer Michael Agar's description of just such a process resonated for me. He suggested beginning with "large chunks of content" (including observation and documents) that seem to have meaning at a broad level and then narrowing the focus, building patterns and connections (rather than isolating variables) until there is a "massive over-determination of a pattern" (conference notes, May 5, 2003, see also Agar, 1980). The resulting "patterns" are my analytical categories. I wrote each of the papers in this dissertation based on one of the analytical categories that arose from this process.

Trustworthiness

In interpretive research, the researcher asks the question: "How do we know that the findings reflect the participant's reality?" In other words, "Did we get the story right?" When the researcher aims to understand the social world of others, the simplest way to assure credibility is to ask the participants if their reality has been represented appropriately. In feminist and other forms of participatory research, such verification is "built into" the research process by the ongoing involvement of the participants themselves (Rheinharz, 1983). The most important set of tools for increasing our level of confidence in the interpretation of the findings are "checking" strategies such as those used in this study: probing, multiple interviews, member checks (with CEDEMU team and research collaborators), and collaborating (with CEDEMU and MODEMU).

Another method of assuring a fuller, deeper account of the findings is often referred to in qualitative research literature as "triangulation." Triangulation refers to the use of "a variety of data sources, different perspectives, or theories, different methods, and even different investigators... to cross-check data and interpretations" (Guba & Lincoln, 1983, p. 327). Simply, it is "the use of more than one research technique simultaneously" to increase the opportunity to gather information that might be missed with certain techniques (Cook & Fonow, 1990, p. 82) and to build "evidence" in understanding a

41

larger picture from smaller pieces of information (Stanley & Wise, 1983a). In this study, triangulation was accomplished through individual, group and organizational interviews (conducted by three different researchers) combined with participant observation and document review. Immersion and prolonged engagement in the field, regular journal writing, and an audit trail all contributed to the rigour of the research process. The trail of the analytic process is found in the raw data (e.g., field notes, journal entries, original transcripts, collected documents) and in the record of the developing analysis (e.g., theme lists, diagrams, reflective annotations in field journals, notes on analytical speculations, and recorded conversations with the research collaborators). Furthermore, the research team (the two research collaborators and I) prepared together prior to the interviews and debriefed afterwards, we reviewed a number of transcripts (especially prior to second interviews), and we met together twice to reflect on overall findings. Analysis then proceeded with assistance from two participants as noted in the section above.

For others who read this research, it is also important to know if the findings have any relevance for other groups. In interpretive research, this is called "transferability" or "fit." In order for a reader to judge the applicability of the findings to a similar context, the researcher must provide, what is commonly known as, "thick and rich description" of the context, methods, and assumptions of the study. The amount of detail in the written record should provide an almost vicarious encounter for the reader (Guba & Lincoln, 1983; Rheinharz, 1983). Stanley and Wise (1983a) develop this further by invoking an ethical element.

> We must make available to others the reasoning procedures that underlie the knowledge produced out of "research." We must say *how* we find out what we do, and not just *what* we find out... It involves us in a disciplined, scholarly and rigorous explication of the bases of our knowledge by tying in such an explication to a detailed analysis of the *contexts* in which such knowledge is generated. (p. 196-197) This is because without including an account of this process the sources of the researcher's knowledge are hidden from scrutiny. We don't know how or why she claims to know what she does... Here the power relationship between researcher and researched remains fundamentally unchanged and unchallenged. (p. 195)

Research Strengths and Challenges

I recognize a number of *strengths* in the methods I used. Being immersed within the community was undoubtedly the most valuable aspect of the research process. While entering and experiencing the research environment as a family was challenging, it was

42

also rewarding and ultimately helpful to the research endeavour as well. The required affiliation with an existing organization in the community was essential in providing not only a base of operations but also a sense of belonging from which to develop confidence in myself and a connection with the community.[39] Without question, involving local research collaborators was immeasurably helpful in every aspect of the research process, i.e., access to participants, trust and rapport, clarification of language and cultural nuances, and partners to share the research journey. The open-ended interview process allowed participants the long-awaited opportunity to "tell their story." In every case, the women provided an abundance of information related to the research questions without undue structure or prompting. The final learning/cultural event was important for all of us in terms of closure and for sharing some findings with participants at the earliest possible moment. Due to the financial support I received, I was able to leave both money and new skills behind in the community when I left. I was pleased to have contributed in these ways.

On the other hand, while having many advantages, being immersed in a small community was also *challenging* for a number of reasons. It was more difficult to maintain confidentiality (although this appeared to be more of a concern for me than for the participants). My reliance on CEDEMU may have created some limitations due to rivalries and competition. However, this was offset by the more significant advantages offered by this connection. As well, because it was a small community, I interviewed many more women than I otherwise would have using the interpretive methodology, resulting in somewhat more breadth than depth. Working in a second and admittedly shaky language in an unfamiliar cultural environment was the source of some frustration, considerable growth, and a few embarrassing incidents. It also raises questions about representation. While I became increasingly adept at understanding as I proceeded through the many interviews and studied the transcripts, I found it particularly challenging to translate the quotes into English equivalents that would convey the same meaning.

Another set of challenges was related to time and timing. First, I believe that a full year of fieldwork would have been more realistic for this project. This would have allowed me the opportunity to participate in a complete cycle of the cultural, professional and community 'seasons' in Arica.[40] Second, I felt rushed when I initiated the collaborative analysis not long before leaving Arica. In retrospect, it would have been helpful to suspend data collection after a number of months, switching emphasis to analytical reflection, and then returning to data collection with a re-orientation to the emerging

43

analysis. Third, my project design was flawed by inordinate attention to information-gathering in the initial stages. I now believe that it would have been a more focused, productive, and efficient use of time and resources and less personally stressful had I traveled directly to and established myself in Arica prior to visiting the research NGOs in Santiago and *Universidad Austral* in Valdivia.

Notwithstanding the challenges, the data gathered in the field was extensive and rich and will contribute to the knowledge base about learning in social movements.

Dissertation Overview

This dissertation is divided into six sections in a manner that departs from the traditional method of writing chapters. Instead, embedded between an introductory and conclusion chapter, I present selected research findings and my interpretations in four 'publishable' papers. Within each of these, the reader will find a brief review of research objectives, methodology, and related literature (introducing some unavoidable redundancy across the papers). Each paper focuses on one thematic area that emerged from analysis of the field data. In each of these, I direct the reader's attention to the untold stories, to aspects of the research findings that receive the least attention in the social movement literature. I conclude each paper by considering the implications for radical adult education.[41]

In **The Arica Story: Touching the Heart of a Woman's Movement,** I present the herstory of the women's movement in Arica – legacies and memories woven into a collective narrative. A narrative bordered by the struggles and accomplishments of the past and veiled by the despair and daily realities of the present. A narrative at whose heart still today, fourteen years post-dictatorship, are the terrors and the triumphs of the women's collective action during the dictatorship years. Containing information about their activities, motivations, hopes, fears, struggles, and especially, their learnings, this narrative is presented in written version for the first time through this dissertation. This is the story the women themselves most want told.

The paper titled *Conciencia*: **Critical and Gendered Consciousness in a Social Movement** grew out of repeated references to *conciencia* (consciousness) in the women's narratives. In this paper, I take up the notion of consciousness as a central concept in understanding the relationship between social movements and education, including the challenges of grasping the structure/agency and individual/social dialectic. I explore

44

the importance of early and ongoing learning and suggest implications for adult education that include consideration of the radical pedagogical potential of parenting and of political parties.

My interpretation of a defining moment in the gestation of the women's movement in Arica is the focus of **Social Movement Praxis: Analyzing Action and Reflection.**[42] I recognized early in the research that a clandestine meeting in 1983 held special significance for the participants. The meeting inaugurated the women's movement in Arica and precipitated a chain of activity that was sustained in diverse forms until the end of the dictatorship. However, the emergence of the movement is coincident with the division of the emerging movement into two philosophically distinct women's organizations (CEDEMU and MODEMU) that, from the outset, fractured the action/reflection dialectic needed for social change. In concert with other social and individual factors, this separation had long-lasting consequences for the movement. In this paper, I take up the notion of *praxis,* the dynamic interaction of action and reflection necessary for social change, apply it to an analysis of the consequences of this meeting, and suggest alternatives.

The final paper is entitled **Between Finding Ourselves and Losing Ourselves: Studying the Consequences of Social Movement Participation.** Here I investigate a topic that is rarely explored in social movement literature: the *effects* of movement participation. Along with the frequently recognized beneficial effects such as leadership skills, advanced knowledge, and personal and social empowerment, I also reveal the more detrimental or traumatic consequences of participant activism. In the paper, I explore how young women, with inadequate ideological preparation, were informally and contradictorily educated by both repression and resistance *"en las calles"* (in the streets) and the longstanding effects of maneuvering the contradictions between the two as part of daily life. While I focus on the empirical data in this paper, I also incorporate a selective review of potentially relevant literature, and suggest implications for radical adult education.

A concluding chapter completes the dissertation. Here, I specify the "guiding threads" that run through the four papers. They are: critical revolutionary praxis, feminist praxis, imprinting neo-liberalism, and the organic nature of education in social movements.

If "education is an instrument of power which shapes knowledge within social movements" (Zacharakis-Jutz cited in Holst, 2002, p. 79), then it is incumbent upon adult educators to reposition social movement theorizing from the margins to the center

45

in service of a more just and peaceful society. Documenting and analyzing the informal social and political learning experiences within the particular socio-political situation of the women's movement in Arica, is my modest contribution to the field and to society.

Potential Contributions of the Study

This research project has the potential to make a variety of theoretical and practical contributions, particularly to redress conspicuous gaps in the literature.

First, as I have already argued, there has been little attention paid to the learning dimension of social movements. According to Foley (1999), "learning is therefore often potential, or only half realised... To more fully realise the value of such learning we need to expose it" (p. 3). Detailed information about actual learning processes "... is the sort of data that we must have if we are to build up a rich picture of learning in social movements" (p. 104). In addition to a long list of learning outcomes, the specific learning processes of consciousness and praxis are elaborated in this dissertation. In my view, the concepts are often used in critical pedagogy but are not well theorized nor empirically explicated. Only by returning to Marx and Gramsci can adult educators fully grasp the libratory significance and the pedagogical processes of consciousness and praxis. Also included in this dissertation is information about the under-studied role of political parties in socio-political learning. "Organic intellectuals are not born, but are formed through the educational activities of working-class parties" (Holst, 2002, p. 109-110).

Second, another area that has witnessed recent attention in social theorizing is the role of emotions in social movements (2000; Goodwin et al., 2001b; Jaggar, 1996; Rosaldo, 1993). Commentators attribute the earlier dismissal of emotions to the rationality discourse that has pervaded science and society since the 18th century. In early social movement theorizing, emotions attracted the "wrong kind of attention" (Goodwin et al., 2000, p. 66), assuming outright that emotional expression was irrational (e.g., the so-called mass hysteria of crowds). According to Goodwin, Jasper, and Polletta (2000), long-standing neglect of the emotional aspects continues to the present.

> Emotions have led a shadow existence for the last three decades, with no place in the rationalistic, structural, and organizational models that dominate academic political analysis... Even the recent rediscovery of culture has taken a cognitive form, as though political participants were computers processing symbols. Somehow, observers have managed to ignore the swirl of passions all around them in political life. (p. 65-66)

46

In a recent volume titled *Passionate Politics: Emotions and Social Movements*, the editors (Goodwin et al., 2001a) claim that "a number of macrosociological concepts help to explain movements precisely because of the emotional dynamics hidden within them... Emotions are important in all phases of political action, by all types of political actors, across a variety of institutional areas" (p. 16). Feminists have long recognized the critical importance of emotion in knowledge-making and oppositional struggle (Jaggar, 1996) and recently, anthropologists too have acknowledged that "eliminat[ing] intense emotions not only distort[s] their descriptions but also remove[s] potentially key variables from their explanations" (Rosaldo, 1993, p. 12). The emotional side of social movement participation is palpable in the narratives of the study participants and contributes to a more holistic understanding of social movements.

Third, while there has been significant attention paid to Chilean popular social movements in recent years, little has been directed to activity outside the capital city of Santiago. Verónica Schild (personal communication, September 17, 1997) writes:

> Most of what is written about women's movements in Chile – my own work included – is from the perspective of the centre, Santiago to be more precise... What applies to Santiago may not apply to a place like Arica... Arica is not representative of Chile by any means, but it may be an interesting regional case [where] the question of race and ethnicity is rather prominent.

By conducting the research in Arica, the experiences of women in more marginalized and isolated communities is highlighted, contributing to the literature much that has not been documented to date and some that contradicts or enriches earlier analyses from the larger centres in Latin America.

But beyond these academic implications, one of the major contributions of this study (especially for the women themselves) is the act of writing the "unwritten story," as one young woman called it. Miller (1995) affirms, "in contexts where people's very lives have been 'disappeared' from the official story, the creation of a new historical record in which women's lives are visible is extremely important"(p. 200). In a feminist project, it is imperative to foreground subjugated knowledges, silenced histories, excluded realities, and resistance. "Resistance is encoded in the practices of remembering, and of writing" (Mohanty, 1991a, p. 38). Furthermore, according to Mohanty (1991a), personal and collective consciousness as well as historical and institutional questions must be addressed. This, she says, is apparent in the "plural or collective consciousness" of Latin American women's testimonials. As a form of oral history impelled by revolutionary ideals,

47

> their primary purpose is to (a) document and record the history of
> popular struggles, (b) foreground experiential and historical "truth"
> which has been erased or rewritten in hegemonic, elite, or imperialist
> history, and (c) bear *witness in order to change oppressive state rule*.
> Thus, testimonials do not focus on the unfolding of a singular woman's
> consciousness (in the hegemonic tradition of European modernist
> autobiography); rather, their strategy is to speak *from within* a collective,
> as participants in revolutionary struggles, and to speak with the express
> purpose of bringing about social and political change. (p. 37)

In a similar vein, Arthur Frank (conference notes, February 22, 2001) explains:

> A story is part and parcel of a life... Stories are about identity. Stories give
> us a sense of the world as a narratable place... Narratibility means that
> events and lives are worthy of telling thus worthy of living, especially for
> groups whose lives are not considered narratable. A story is a significant
> political intervention... a beginning of politics... How is the personal
> related to the social?

Fourth, a considerable amount has been published on the anti-dictatorship activities of
the women's movements and their role in the transition to democracy (Agos n, 1996;
Cañadell, 1993; Chuchryk, 1989; Schild, 1994; Waylen, 1993). However, the focus of
attention has since been diverted to the state and NGOs. Notwithstanding occasional
speculation on the effects on the *pobladoras* and their organizations (see for example
Schild, 1998a), nothing on the level of the previous studies has been published that
investigates the experience of the Chilean grassroots women's movements directly. In
this study, I look at movement participants a dozen years after the egression of the anti-
dictatorship movement. Along with a post-1990 chronology of the women's movement
and women's lives in Arica, the women also shared the effects – individual and
collective, positive and negative – of social movement participation. While this was not
an area that I set out to study, it emerged as a crucial aspect of the social movement
experience and one that has not been well documented to date in the Latin American
context.

From several studies on "biographical consequences" done on social movement
participants in the U.S., Klandermans (1997) concludes,

> activism, especially sustained activism, can have dramatic biographical
> consequences. This is certainly true in the case of participation in
> underground organizations... (p. 110)

Study done on "traumatic stress" from a social-psychological perspective may also have
implications for my findings.

48

> Trauma, in contrast to stress, profoundly alters the basic structure not just
> of the individual, but also of the cultural system as a whole: Society will
> never be the same again. (deVries, 1996, p. 401)

The dramatic effects of high-risk and/or clandestine participation in a terrorizing environment have especial implications for identity, citizenship learning, life choices and opportunities, and education.

Finally, by documenting and analyzing the informal social and political learning experiences and processes within the particular socio-political situation of popular women's movements in Arica, this work might be instructive to women and men interested in social development and social justice wherever they live.

Notes

---

[1] Note: All translations from transcripts and original sources in Spanish are mine.

[2] The abused women's program had three segments. Two initial segments focused more on personal development and a theoretical understanding of abuse as a social issue while a third segment was oriented to change strategies, such as personal and public advocacy.

[3] Within the interpretive research paradigm, it is common and accepted (even expected) that the research questions may change throughout the study. "Ethnographers begin with a set of questions, revise them throughout the course of inquiry, and in the end emerge with different questions than they started with" (Rosaldo, 1993, p. 7).

[4] Social movement theorizing within adult education that advocates a return to Marx has recently originated from Australia (Foley, 1999), from the United Kingdom (2001a; Allman, 2001b; 1995), and from the United States, (Holst, 2002).

[5] Foley (1999) made the adult education connection clear for me through his explicit attention to learning in his chapter analyzing Sonia Alvarez's (1990) book on the women's movement in Brazil. Allman (1995) provided the theory and language to analyze *consciousness* – a long-standing concern of mine and a salient theme in this study. Holst's (2002) thorough historical and theoretical review put all the pieces into a coherent explanation and critique and helped me to theoretically articulate the data from Arica. Thanks to Dr. Sue Scott and Dr. Tara Fenwick for steering me to adult education literature that resonated so fully with my own views and the findings of this study.

[6] Vatican II and the Conference of Latin American Bishops established the philosophical positioning of the Catholic Church as a "church of the poor" in the 1960s. It heralded the outbreak of liberation theology throughout the region.

[7] This relationship between the women's movements (and other social movements) and the Communist Party may be true elsewhere in Chile and in Latin America but has garnered no targeted academic attention in either English or Spanish.

49

[8] While I often speak in general terms about Latin America, I use Chile as my exemplar, except where a contrast or similarity is especially instructive. This is, however, not intended to imply that Chile is the representative case. Rather, as this is not a comparative study, it serves to focus my attention on the country of study.

[9] As Judson (2001) notes, the strategy instigated by Latin American nations for their own social and economic development (including government subsidies, tariff protection for domestic industries, and an expanded role of the state in the public sector), "fostered significant economic growth... [and] advances in levels of literacy, life expectancy, and education, while infant mortality rates and malnutrition declined" (p. 363-364).

[10] See, for example, Taylor (1998) for a comparison between Argentina and Chile.

[11] From documents and testimonies released to date, it is now indisputable that the military coup in Chile was a direct result of U.S. interference and that the dictatorship was heavily sponsored by the U.S. as part of (a) an obsessive anti-socialist campaign in the region and, correspondingly, (b) an economic strategy to establish the "neo-liberal laboratory" for the new global economy (Chavkin, 1985).

[12] The *Agrupación de Familiares de Detenidos Desaparacidos de Chile* published the statistics in this paragraph. [http://www.afdd.cl/]. They are drawn from the government reports produced by the National Truth and Reconciliation Commission (Rettig Report) and the National Corporation for Reconciliation and Reparation. Similar statistics were published in the Washington Post (*Pinochet's Chile*, 2000). While statistics differ across sources, most agree that the available numbers are an underestimate of the true extent of the tragedy.

[13] Regarding experimenting with neo-liberalism, see for example Chavkin (1985).

[14] A group of powerful Chilean banking conglomerates, known as the "Chicago Boys," are responsible for the design and implementation of the radical neo-liberal project in . Chile. The economic policies initially produced an economic boom that crashed along with the rest of the world economy in the early 1980s (Silva, 1991).

[15] The 1980s are sometimes referred to as the "lost decade" or a "reversal of development" (Chinchilla, 1992; Escobar, 1992).

[16] Neo-liberalism departs from more classical liberal economics in prescribing a more reduced role for the state thereby signaling the end of Keynesian welfare state policies. In Chile, this resulted in a 27 percent reduction in the public budget (Schuurman, 1993b).

[17] In the 1990 election, Patricio Aylwin was the only candidate put forward in opposition to General Pinochet. Multiple candidates were again presented in subsequent elections.

[18] During the presidency of Gabriel González Videla, these Mother's Centres were established across the country to work mainly with poor women under the direction of the wife of the president. Although the official objectives were focused on women's traditional role as homemakers, they "began to organize themselves as vehicles for the political formation of women" (Valdés & Weinstein, 1993, p. 47). The political education and organizing skills gained through this community-based organization, served Chilean women well in their later activism.

[19] See for example, articles in Pannu and Toh (1996) for a general analysis regarding neo-liberalism and in Bresnahan (2003) for current analyses regarding Chile.

[20] The social structure in Chile and other Latin America countries was indelibly changed by the obligatory entry of large numbers of women into the workforce as primary wage earners, due to the economic realities of this period (see for example Alvarez, 1990).

[21] See Bresnahan (2003) and the rest of the authors in this special edition for a discussion of the negative effects of neo-liberal economics on the democratization process in Chile.

[22] The unlikely and unintentional role of the Catholic Church in the re-emergence of feminism in Latin America is, in large measure, related to the emergence of liberation theology. The Latin American Church reverted to its traditional and conservative ministry after the return to democracy (Agos n, 1996; Bosch, 1998; Schild, 1995; 1998a).

[23] The maternalist nature of women's political participation in Chile was deftly explicated by Elsa Chaney's (1974) study of women politicians. She uses the term "*supermadre*" to signify the expansion of women's mothering role into a larger "*casa*."

[24] The formality of the term 'curriculum' belies the emergent nature of its expression in practice. I believe that it signifies a type of process as much as a certain content. The content includes sexuality and women's bodies, gendered power relations, personal development (e.g., self-esteem), and women's rights.

[25] The *Centros de Madres* (Mother's Centres) were established prior to the dictatorship to work mainly with poor women in providing technical and organizational support for income generation. Beyond that, they were a space for social and political participation (Valdés & Weinstein, 1993). During the dictatorship, the latter function was eradicated. FOSIS and PROMEDU, on the other hand, emerged during the transition. According to Schild (1998a), FOSIS "coordinates the funding of innovative social programs that explicitly target poor communities and encourage participatory social development" (p. 237). The wife of the president of Chile directs PRODEMU. As described to me by the provincial coordinator in Arica (Nelly Arriaran Covarrubias), PROMEDU employs a socio-educative method with the poorest women to promote personal development, citizenship, and fundraising.

[26] I have noticed more of a reliance on RM-based analyses by North Americans writing about Latin American social movements (for example Baldez, 2002; Franceschet, 2004; Hipsher, 1996; Noonan, 1995; Randall, 1998).

[27] The subtitle of the 1992 book by Escobar and Alvarez (1992b) (i.e., identity, strategy, and democracy) demonstrates this direction.

[28] The Latin American literature on social movements is replete with references to European and North American theories and theorists. Although not always directly concerned with social movements, they have unmistakably influenced social movement theorizing in Latin America. Michel Foucault, Antonio Gramsci, Jürgen Habermas, Hannah Arendt, Raymond Williams, Stuart Hall, Chantal Mouffe & Ernesto Laclau, Jean Cohen & Andrew Arato, Nancy Fraser – are some of the most referenced names.

[29] The collective learning orientation of Women's Institutes, the worker literacy movement of Frontier College, and labour education in Mechanic's Institutes are among the historic examples of adult education that are frequently cited in Canadian literature (Welton, 1987). Others, such as the Antigonish Movement (Moses Coady in Canada) and Highlander (Myles Horton in the U.S.), are laudable examples of

51

educational initiatives that assisted impoverished, working class, rural communities to struggle for the reform of oppressive economic structures. Jane Addams' immigrant settlement house in Chicago offers another example of the early relationship forged between education and social responsiveness (Deegan, 1987).

[30] In most cases, women were asked to select their own pseudonym by choosing a word that was not a proper name. In a few cases, women did not want to use a pseudonym, feeling little need to protect their identity outside the dictatorship. Nonetheless, I have protected all materials (tapes, transcripts, notes) with a pseudonym. In the dissertation, I have used neither names nor pseudonyms except in the case of leaders whose information would be clearly known by the community at large, wherein I have used an actual name. Representatives from organizations did not feel a need to have their identity protected.

[31] There are numerous examples of the "insider" element in the women's movement literature (see for example Chovanec, 1994; Chuchryk, 1984; Nielsen, 1990).

[32] Héctor conducted interviews with the women who knew him better than Sandra and with some that were best not interviewed by a member of CEDEMU. I did not perceive any difficulties with the friendship connection. In fact the reverse was true; a certain amount of trust and acceptance was automatically given to me because I was connected to Héctor and Sandra. Although I initially had concerns about Sandra's connection to CEDEMU, this did not appear to present many problems especially as Héctor was available as well. However, my research relationship with CEDEMU may have discouraged other NGOs from participating. I also conducted some interviews on my own. I fairly paid both research collaborators.

[33] Using self-appointed informants was also part of the thesis research conducted on women's movements in Chile by both Chuchryk (1984) and Franceschet (2001a).

[34] Because Arica is a small city, it was difficult to find a qualified person who could also maintain a high level of confidentiality. Hiring a transcriber from outside Arica proved useful because, although there were greater challenges in transporting the tapes, it ensured greater confidentiality of the transcribed information.

[35] *Facultad Latinoamericana de Ciencias Sociales* (Latin American School of the Social Sciences) is a longstanding research NGO operating throughout the region. As it was in the midst of a move, I was not able to use its library as I had originally intended.

[36] *Universidad Austral* is apparently a Cooperating Site of the International Institute for Qualitative Research. However, I had no success in finding anyone related to this Institute at the University. Fortunately, the University of Alberta, Faculty of Education has a connection with a professor (Dr. Luigi Campo) who connected me to Dr. Poblete.

[37] Some advocate separating the two functions into two different journals (Boyle, conference notes, Feb. 22, 2001, Chuchryk, 1984; Schensul et al., 1999) but I found this cumbersome and unnecessary.

[38] Detailed information about my field activity was also included in reports that were sent to IDRC (one of my scholarship sources) at regular intervals.

[39] To be eligible for their scholarships, both Canada's International Development Research Centre and the Organization of American States required that I have an affiliation with an organization within the country.

[40] For example, I missed an important women's movement activity held each September in Arica, *Mujeres de Luto*. In order to compensate, I engaged one of the research collaborators to video tape the event and conduct brief, informal interviews with some participants.

[41] Because each paper must contain sufficient information to stand alone and because the analytical categories overlap each other, there is redundancy across the papers, especially in the background information, references, and the selected quotes that explicate the analytical categories.

[42] Preliminary versions of this paper were presented at two conferences (Chovanec, 2002; 2004).

References

Abdo, Nahla. (1993). Middle East politics through feminist lenses: Negotiating the terms of solidarity. *Alternatives*(18), 29–38.

Adkin, Laurie E. (1998). *Politics of Sustainable Development: Citizens, Unions, and the Corporations*. Montréal: Black Rose Books.

Agar, Michael H. (1980). *The professional stranger: An informal introduction to ethnography* (2nd ed.). San Diego: Academic Press.

Agos n, Marjorie. (1996). *Threads of hope: The arpillera movement in Chile, 1974-1994*. Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press.

Allahar, Anton L. (1995). *Sociology and the periphery: Theories and issues* (2nd revised ed.). Toronto: Garamond.

Allman, Paula. (2001a). *Critical education against global capitalism*. Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Allman, Paula. (2001b). *Revolutionary social transformation: Democratic hopes, political possibilities, and critical education*. Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Allman, Paula & Wallis, John. (1995). Gramsci's challenge to the politics of the left in 'Our Times'. *International Journal of Lifelong Education, 14*(2), 120-143.

Alvarez, Sonia E. (1990). *Engendering democracy in Brazil*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Alvarez, Sonia E. (1998). Latin Amerian feminisms "go global": Trends of the 1990s and challenges for the new millenium. In Sonia E. Alvarez, Evelina Dagnino, & Arturo Escobar (Eds.), *Cultures of politics, politics of cultures: Re-visioning Latin American social movements* (pp. 293-323). Boulder, CO: Westview.

Alvarez, Sonia E. (1999). Advocating feminism: The Latin American feminist NGO "boom". *International Feminist Journal of Politics, 1*(2), 181-209.

Alvarez, Sonia E., Dagnino, Evelina, & Escobar, Arturo. (1998a). *Cultures of politics, politics of cultures: Re-visioning Latin American social movements*. Boulder, CO: Westview.

Alvarez, Sonia E., Dagnino, Evelina, & Escobar, Arturo. (1998b). Introduction: The cultural and political in Latin American social movements. In Sonia E. Alvarez, Evelina Dagnino, & Arturo Escobar (Eds.), *Cultures of politics, politics of cultures: Revisioning Latin American social movements* (pp. 1-29). Boulder, CO: Westview.

Antrobus, Peggy. (2002). Feminism as transformational politics: Towards possibilities for another world. *Development, 45*(2), 46-52.

Baldez, Lisa. (2002). *Why women protest: Women's movements in Chile.* Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Bosch, Anna E. (1998). Popular education, work training, and the path to women's empowerment in Chile. *Comparative Education Review, 42*(2), 163-183.

Bresnahan, Rosalind. (2003). Introduction: Chile since 1990: The contradictions of neoliberal democratization. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(5), 3-15.

Cáceres, Eduardo. (2000, July / August). Building a culture of rights. *NACLA Report on the Americas, 34,* 19-24.

Calderón, Fernando, Piscitelli, Alejandro, & Reyna, José Luis. (1992). Social movements: Actors, theories, expectations. In Arturo Escobar & Sonia E. Alvarez (Eds.), *The making of social movements in Latin America* (pp. 19-36). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Cañadell, Rosa M. (1993). Chilean women's organizations: Their potential for change. *Latin American Perspectives, 20*(4), 43-60.

Carroll, William K. (1997). Social movements and counterhegemony: Canadian contexts and social theories. In William K. Carroll (Ed.), *Organizing dissent: Contemporary social movements in theory and practice* (2nd ed., pp. 3-38). Toronton: Garamond Press.

Chaney, Elsa M. (1974). The mobilization of women in Allende's Chile. In Jane Jaquette (Ed.), *Women in politics* (pp. 267-280). New York: John Wiley and Sons.

Chavkin, Samuel. (1985). *Storm over Chile: The Junta under siege.* Westport, CT: Lawrence Hill and Company.

Chinchilla, Norma Stolz. (1992). Marxism, feminism, and the struggle for democracy in Latin America. In Arturo Escobar & Sonia E. Alvarez (Eds.), *The making of social movements in Latin America* (pp. 37-51). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Chovanec, Donna M. (1993). *The experience of consciousness-raising in abused women.* Paper presented at the Adult Education Research Conference, Penn State University, University Park, PA.

Chovanec, Donna M. (1994). *The experience of consciousness-raising in abused women.* Unpublished masters thesis, University of Alberta, Edmonton, AB.

Chovanec, Donna M. (2002). *"¿Y que?"Analyzing action and reflection in a social movement [on-line].* Available: http://www.ualberta.ca/~ckreber/papers/donna.htm.

Chovanec, Donna M. (2004). *Learning power from the margins: Analyzing action and reflection in a social movement.* Paper presented at the Joint International Conference of the Adult Education Research Conference and the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education, Victoria, BC.

Chuchryk, Patricia M. (1984). *Protest, politics and personal life: The emergence of feminism in a military dictatorship, Chile 1973-1983.* Unpublished doctoral thesis, York University, Toronto, ON.

Chuchryk, Patricia M. (1989). Feminist anti-authoritarian politics: The role of women's organizations in the Chilean transition to democracy. In Jane S. Jaquette (Ed.), *The women's movement in Latin America: Feminism and the transition to democracy* (pp. 149-184). Boston: Unwin Hyman.

Cohen, Jean L. (1985). Strategy or identity: New theoretical paradigms and contemporary social movements. *Social Research, 52*(4), 663-716.

Cook, Judith A. & Fonow, Mary Margaret. (1990). Knowledge and women's interests: Issues of epistemology and methodology in feminist sociological research. In Joyce McCarl Nielsen (Ed.), *Feminist research methods: Exemplary readings in the social sciences* (pp. 69-93). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Cortez D az, Aylen & Villagra Parra, Milka. (1999). *Imaginario y prácticas socio-políticas de las mujeres opositoras a la Dictadura Militar en Chile.*Unpublished manuscript, Arica, Chile.

Craske, Nikki. (1998). Remasculinisation and the neoliberal state in Latin America. In Vicky Randall & Georgina Waylen (Eds.), *Gender, politics and the state* (pp. 101-120). London: Routledge.

Dagnino, Evelina. (1998). Culture, citizenship, and democracy: Changing discourses and practices of the Latin American Left. In Sonia E. Alvarez, Evelina Dagnino, & Arturo Escobar (Eds.), *Cultures of politics, politics of cultures: Re-visioning Latin American social movements.* Boulder, CO: Westview.

Davis, Lynne. (1994). *From moment to movement: Linking education and action.* Paper presented at the Canadian Association for Studies in Adult Education, Simon Fraser University, Vancouver, BC.

Deegan, M. J. (Ed.). (1987). *Women and Symbolic Interaction.* Boston: Allen and Unwin.

Derechos Chile. (2004). *Under the dictatorship,* [Internet]. Derechos Chile. Available: http://www/chip.cl/derechos/dictadura_eng.html [2004, May 21].

deVries, Marten W. (1996). Trauma in cultural perspective. In Bessel A. van der Kolk, Alexander C. McFarlane, & Lars Weisaeth (Eds.), *Traumatic stress: The effects of ovewhelming experience on mind, body, and society* (pp. 398-413). New York: Guilford Press.

Duelli Klein, R. D. (1983). How to do what we want to do: Thoughts about feminist methodology. In G. Bowles and R. Duelli Klein (Ed.), *Theories of Women's Studies* (pp. 88-104). London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Escobar, Arturo. (1992). Culture, economics, and politics in Latin American social movements theory and research. In Arturo Escobar & Sonia E. Alvarez (Eds.), *The making of social movements in Latin America* (pp. 62-85). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Escobar, Arturo. (1995). *Encountering development: The making and unmaking of the Third World.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Escobar, Arturo & Alvarez, Sonia E. (1992a). Introduction: Theory and protest in Latin America today. In Arturo Escobar & Sonia E. Alvarez (Eds.), *The making of social movements in Latin America* (pp. 1-15). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Escobar, Arturo & Alvarez, Sonia E. (Eds.). (1992b). *The making of social movements in Latin America: Identity, strategy, and democracy.* Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Feldman, Harvey W., Agar, Michael H., & Beschner, George M. (1979). *Angel Dust: An Enthnographic Study of PCP Users.* Lexington: Lexington Books.

Finger, Matthias. (1989). New social movements and their implications for adult education. *Adult Education Quarterly, 40*(1), 15-22.

Foley, Griff. (1999). *Learning in social action: A contribution to understanding informal education.* London: Zed Books.

Franceschet, Susan. (2001a). *Gender and citizenship: Democratization and women's politics in Chile.* Unpublished doctoral thesis, Carleton University, Ottawa ON.

Franceschet, Susan. (2001b). Women in politics in post-transitional democracies: The Chilean case. *International Feminist Journal of Politics, 3*(2), 207-236.

Franceschet, Susan. (2003). "State feminism" and women's movements: The impact of Chile's Servicio Nacional de Mujer on women's activism. *Latin American Research Review, 38*(1), 9-40.

Franceschet, Susan. (2004). Explaining social movement outcomes: Collective action frames and strategic choices in first- and second-wave feminism in Chile. *Comparative Political Studies, 37*(5), 499-530.

Fraser, Nancy. (1994). Rethinking the public sphere: A contribution to the critique of actually existing democracy. In Henry Giroux & Peter L. McLaren (Eds.), *Between borders* (pp. 74-98). New York: Routledge.

Freire, Paulo. (1990). *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (Myra Bergman Ramos, Trans.). New York: Continuum.

Glaser, Barry G. & Strauss, Anselm. (1967). *The discovery of grounded theory: Strategies for qualitative research.* New York: Aldine de Gruyter.

Goodwin, Jeff, Jasper, James M., & Polletta, Francesca. (2000). The return of the repressed: The fall and rise of emotions in social movement theory. *Mobilization: An International Journal, 5*(1), 68-84.

Goodwin, Jeff, Jasper, James M., & Polletta, Francesca. (2001a). Introduction: Why emotions matter. In Jeff Goodwin, James M. Jasper, & Francesca Polletta (Eds.), *Passionate politics: Emotions and social movements* (pp. 1-24). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Goodwin, Jeff, Jasper, James M., & Polletta, Francesca (Eds.). (2001b). *Passionate politics: Emotions and social movements.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Gramsci, Antonio. (1971). *Selections from the prison notebooks* (Quinton Hoare & Geoffrey Nowell Smith, Trans.). New York: International Publishers.

Guba, E. G. & Lincoln, Y. S. (1983). Epistemological and methodological bases of naturalistic inquiry. In G. Madaus, M. Scriven, & D. Stufflebeam (Eds.), *Evaluation models* (pp. 311-333). Boston: Kluwer-Nijoff.

Habermas, Jürgen. (1971). *Knowledge and human interests.* Boston: Beacon Press.

Hart, Mechtild U. (1990a). Critical theory and beyond: Further perspectives on emancipatory education. *Adult Education Quarterly, 40*(3), 125–138.

Hart, Mechtild U. (1990b). Liberation through consciousness raising. In J. Mezirow & Associates (Ed.), *Fostering critical reflection in adulthood* (pp. 47–73). San Fransisco: Jossey Bass.

Hellman, Judith Adler. (1992). The study of new social movements in Latin America and the question of autonomy. In Arturo Escobar & Sonia E. Alvarez (Eds.), *The making of social movements in Latin America* (pp. 52-61). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

56

Hipsher, Patricia L. (1996). Democratization and the decline of urban social movements in Chile and Spain. *Comparative Politics, 28*(3), 273-297.

Holst, John D. (2002). *Social movements, civil society, and radical adult education.* Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Hutchinson, Sally A. (1988). Education and grounded theory. In R. Sherman & R. Webb (Eds.), *Qualitative research in education: Focus and methods* (pp. 123-140). London: Falmer Press.

Jaggar, Alison M. (1996). Love and knowledge: Emotion in feminist epistemology. In Ann Garry & Marilyn Pearsall (Eds.), *Women, knowledge, and reality: Explorations in feminist philosophy* (pp. 166-187). New York: Routledge.

Jaquette, Jane S. (1989). Conclusion: Women and the new democratic politics. In Jane S. Jaquette (Ed.), *The women's movement in Latin America: Feminism and the transition to democracy* (pp. 185-208). Boston: Unwin Hyman.

Jelin, Elizabeth. (1990). Introduction. In Elizabeth Jelin (Ed.), *Women and social change in Latin America* (pp. 1-11). London: Zed Books and United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.

Jelin, Elizabeth. (1998). Toward a culture of participation and citizenship: Challenges for a more equitable world. In Sonia E. Alvarez, Evelina Dagnino, & Arturo Escobar (Eds.), *Cultures of politics, politics of cultures: Re-visioning Latin American social movements* (pp. 405-414). Boulder, CO: Westview.

Judson, Fred. (2001). The South in global perspectives. In Janine Brodie (Ed.), *Critical concepts: An introduction to politics* (pp. 357-377). Toronto, ON: Prentice Hall.

Kastner, Andrea. (1993). *Knowledge and curriculum in contemporary social movements.* Paper presented at the 34th Annual Adult Education Research Conference, University Park, PA.

Kastner, Andrea. (1994). *Social theory and epistemology in new social movements: Implications for adult education.* Paper presented at the Canadian Association for Studies in Adult Education, Vancouver, BC.

Kirkwood, Julieta. (1986). *Ser política en Chile: Las feministas y los partidos.* Santiago, Chile: FLACSO.

Klandermans, Bert. (1997). *The social psychology of protest.* Cambridge, MA: Blackwell.

Kryzanek, Michael. (1995). *Latin America: Change and challenge.* New York: Harper Collins.

Küppers, Gaby. (1992). *Compañeras: Voices from the Latin American women's movement.* London: Latin America Bureau.

Larrain, Jorge. (1989). *Theories of development: Capitalism, colonialism and dependency.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Lindeman, Eduard. (1926). *The meaning of adult education.* Montreal: Harvest House.

Maguire, Patricia. (1987). *Doing participatory research: A feminist approach.* Amherst, MA: Center for International Education.

Mayo, Peter. (1994). A comparative analysis of the ideas of Gramsci and Freire from an adult education perspective. *Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education, 8*(2), 1-28.

Mayo, Peter. (1999). *Gramsci, Friere and adult education: Possibilities for transformative action*. London: Zed Books.

Miller, Francesca. (1995). Latin American women and the search for social, political, and economic transformation. In Sandor Halebsky & Richard L. Harris (Eds.), *Capital, power, and inequality in Latin America* (pp. 185-206). Boulder, CO: Westview.

Mohanty, Chandra Talpade. (1991a). Cartographies of struggle: Third World women and the politics of feminism. In Chandra Talpade Mohanty, Ann Russo, & Lourdes Torres (Eds.), *Third World women and the politics of feminism* (pp. 1-47). Bloomington, IL: Indiana University Press.

Mohanty, Chandra Talpade. (1991b). Under western eyes: Feminist scholarship and colonial discourses. In Chandra Talpade Mohanty, Ann Russo, & Lourdes Torres (Eds.), *Third World women and the politics of feminism* (pp. 51–80). Bloomington, IL: Indiana University Press.

Morrow, Ray A. & Torres, Carlos A. (1995). *Social theory and education: A critique of theories of social and cultural reproduction*. New York: State University of New York Press.

Morrow, Raymond A. & Torres, Carlos Alberto. (2002). *Reading Freire and Habermas: Critical pedagogy and transformative social change*. New York: Teacher's College Press.

Mouffe, Chantal. (1988). Hegemony and new political subjects: Toward a new concept of democracy. In Cary Nelson & Lawrence Grosberg (Eds.), *Marxism and the interpretation of culture* (pp. 89-104). Urbana, IL: University of Illinois.

Nielsen, Joyce McCarl (Ed.). (1990). *Feminist research methods: Exemplary readings in the social sciences*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Noonan, Rita K. (1995). Women against the state: Political opportunities and collective action frames in Chile's transition to democracy. *Sociological Forum, 10*(1), 81-111.

Okeke-Ihejirika, E. & Franceschet, Susan. (2002). Democratization and state feminism: Gender politics in Africa and Latin America. *Development and Change, 33*(3), 439-466.

Osborne, John W. (1990). Some basic existential-phenomenological research methodology for counsellors. *Canadian Journal of Counselling, 24*(2), 79-91.

Oxhorn, Philip. (1994). Where did all the protesters go? Popular mobilization and the transition to democracy in Chile. *Latin American Perspectives, 21*(3), 49-68.

Pannu, Raj. (1996). Neoliberal projects of globalization: Prospects for education. *Alberta, Journal of Educational Research*(42), 87–101.

Pannu, Raj & Toh, Swee-Hin. (1996). Theme issue: Education and development: Past lessons, present crises, future possibilities. *Alberta Journal of Educational Research, 42*(12).

Petras, James & Vieux, Steve. (1994). The transition to authoritarian electoral regimes in Latin America. *Latin American Perspectives, 21*(4), 5-20.

Pinochet's Chile(2000). The Washington Post Online. Available: http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-srv/inatl/longterm/pinochet/overview.htm [2004, July 15].

Plotke, David. (1990). What's so new about new social movements? *Socialist Review, 20*(1), 81-102.

Quiroz Martin, Teresa. (1997). Women, poverty and adult education in Chile. In Shirley Walters (Ed.), *Globalization, adult education and training: Impacts and issues* (pp. 39-46). London: Zed Books.

Randall, Vicky. (1998). Gender and power: Women engage the state. In Vicky Randall & Georgina Waylen (Eds.), *Gender, politics and the state* (pp. 185-205). London: Routledge.

Rheinharz, S. (1983). Experiential analysis: A contribution to feminist research. In G. Bowles & R. Duelli Klein (Eds.), *Theories of Women's Studies* (pp. 162-191). London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Richards, Patricia. (2003). Expanding women's citizenship? Mapuche women and Chiles's national women's service. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(2), 41-65.

Rosaldo, Renato. (1993). *Culture and truth: The remaking of social analysis* (2nd ed.). Boston: Beacon Press.

Schensul, Stephen L., Schensul, Jean J., & LeCompte, Margaret D. (1999). *Essential ethnographic methods: Observations, interviews, and questionnaires.* Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.

Schild, Verónica. (1994). Recasting "popular" movements: Gender and political learning in neighborhood organizations in Chile. *Latin American Perspectives, 21*(2), 59–80.

Schild, Verónica. (1995). NGOs, feminist politics and neo-liberal Latin American state formations: Some lessons from Chile. *Canadian Journal of Development Studies, Special Issue,* 123-147.

Schild, Verónica. (1997). New subjects of rights? Gendered citizenship and the contradictory legacies of social movements in Latin America. *Organization, 4*(4), 604-619.

Schild, Verónica. (1998a). Market citizenship and the "new democracies": The ambiguous legacies of the contemporary Chilean women's movements. *Social Politics, 5*(2), 232-249.

Schild, Verónica. (1998b). New subjects of rights? Women's movements and the consruction of citizenship in the "new democracies". In Sonia E. Alvarez, Evelina Dagnino, & Arturo Escobar (Eds.), *Cultures of politics, politics of cultures: Re-visioning Latin American social movements* (pp. 93-117). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Schild, Verónica. (2000a). "Gender equality" without social justice: Women's rights in the neoliberal age. *NACLA Report on the Americas, 34,* 25-28.

Schild, Verónica. (2000b). Neo-liberalism's new gendered market citizens: The 'civilizing' dimension of social programmes in Chile. *Citizenship Studies, 4*(3), 275-305.

Schmitt-Boshnick, Margo. (1996). *Women in associational life: Social learning and questions of citizenship.* Paper presented at the 15th Annual Conference for the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education, University of Manitoba, Winnipeg, MN.

Schuurman, Frans J. (1993a). Introduction: Development theory in the 1990s. In Frans J. Schuurman (Ed.), *Beyond the impasse: New directions in development theory* (pp. 1-48). London: Zed Books.

Schuurman, Frans J. (1993b). Modernity, post-modernity and the new social movements. In Frans J. Schuurman (Ed.), *Beyond the impasse: New directions in development theory* (pp. 187-206). London: Zed Books.

Silva, Eduardo. (1991). The political economy of Chile's regime transition: From radical to "pragmatic" neo-liberal policies. In Paul W. Drake & Iván Jaksic (Eds.), *The struggle for democracy in Chile, 1982-1990* (pp. 98-127). Lincoln, NB: University of Nebraska Press.

Spencer, Bruce. (1998). *The purposes of adult education: A guide for students*. Toronto: Thompson Educational Publishing.

Spradley, James P. (1980). *Participant observation*. New York: Holt, Reinhart & Winston.

Stanley, Lynne & Wise, Sue. (1983a). 'Back into the personal' or 'our attempt to construct feminist research'. In G. Bowles & R. Duelli Klein (Eds.), *Theories of Women's Studies* (pp. 192-209). London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Stanley, Lynne & Wise, Sue. (1983b). *Breaking out: Feminist consciousness and feminist research*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Sternbach, Nancy Saporta, Navarro-Aranguren, Marysa, Chuchryk, Patricia, & Alvarez, Sonia E. (1995). Feminisms in Latin America: From Bogotá to San Bernardo. In Barbara Laslett, Johanna Brenner, & Yesim Arat (Eds.), *Rethinking the political: Gender, resistance, and the state* (pp. 240-281). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Strauss, Anselm & Corbin, Julie. (1990). *Basics of qualitative research: Grounded theory procedures and techniques*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Taylor, Lucy. (1998). *Citizenship, participation and democracy: Changing dynamics in Chile and Argentina*. New York: St. Martin's Press, Inc.

Valdés, Teresa & Weinstein, Marisa. (1993). *Mujeres que sueñan: Las organizaciones de pobladoras en Chile, 1973-1999*. Santiago, Chile: FLACSO-Chile.

Valenzuela, Mar a Elena. (1998). Women and the democratization process in Chile. In Jane S. Jaquette & Sharon L. Wolchik (Eds.), *Women and democracy* (pp. 47-74). Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University.

van Manen, Max. (1990). *Researching lived experience: Human science for an action sensitive pedagogy*. London, ON: Althouse Press.

Walzer, Michael. (1992). The civil society argument. In Chantal Mouffe (Ed.), *Dimensions of radical democracy: Pluralism, citizenship, community* (pp. 89-107). London: Verso.

Waylen, Georgina. (1993). Women's movements and democratisation in Latin America. *Third World Quarterly, 14*(3), 573-587.

Waylen, Georgina. (1995). Women's movements, the state and democratization in Chile. *IDS Bulletin, 26*(3), 86–93.

Waylen, Georgina. (1997). Women's movements, the state and democratization in Chile: The establishment of SERNAM. In Anne Marie Goetz (Ed.), *Getting institutions right for women in development* (pp. 90-103). London: Zed Books.

Waylen, Georgina. (2000). Gender and democratic politics: A comparative analysis of consolidation in Argentina and Chile. *Journal of Latin American Studies, 32,* 765-793.

Welton, Michael R. (1987). *Knowledge for the people: The struggle for adult learning in English speaking Canada, 1828-1973*. Toronto: OISE.

Welton, Michael R. (1993). Social revolutionary learning: The new social movements as learning sites. *Adult Education Quarterly, 43*(3), 152-164.

Welton, Michael R. (1995a). In defense of the lifeworld: A Habermasian approach to adult learning. In Michael R. Welton (Ed.), *In defense of the lifeworld: Critical perspectives on adult learning* (pp. 127-156). Albany, NY: SUNY.

Welton, Michael R. (1998). Civil society as theory and project: Adult education and the renewal of global citizenship. In Danny Wildemeersch, Matthias Finger, & Theo Jansen (Eds.), *Adult education and social responsibility: Reconciling the irreconcilable?* (pp. 187-220). Frankfurt: Peter Lang.

Welton, Michael R. (Ed.). (1995b). In defense of the lifeworld: Critical perspectives on adult learning. Albany, NY: SUNY.

West, G. & Blumberg, R. L. (1990). *Women and social protest.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Westkott, M. (1990). Feminist criticism of the social sciences. In Joyce McCarl Nielsen (Ed.), *Feminist research methods: Exemplary readings in the social sciences* (pp. 58-68). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Wolcott, Harry F. (1999). *Ethnography: A way of seeing.* Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.

THE ARICA STORY:
TOUCHING THE HEART OF A WOMEN'S MOVEMENT

Introduction

The Scene: The date is October 29, 1983. On this evening, outside a particular senior citizen's centre in the small city of Arica in northern Chile, one would see about sixty women furtively entering the building, one by one and in silence.

What brings these women together? Do they not realize the hour? Have they not noticed that it is past curfew? Have they forgotten that it is illegal to meet in groups of more than three in Chile in this era? Surely, after ten years of a brutal military dictatorship they must know the risk they take. What prompts them, then, to join together in this clandestine and dangerous fashion?

The answer to this question is both simple and complex. In its most uncomplicated form, the answer is *"es necesario"* – it is necessary. But what makes it necessary? How and why and for whom is it necessary? What response does this deceptively simple imperative spawn?

To glimpse the depth of the response needed for these questions requires a journey from the distant past to the present. A journey that reads like a novel or a screenplay to those of us who have lived more sheltered lives. A journey that showcases the bravery of ancestors. A journey in which marches hold maternal rather than military significance; in which the very private and domestic act of cooking is a public act of defiance; in which balaclavas offer flimsy protection, not from a bitter wind but from a cruel torturer; in which the sanctity of the church becomes the sanctuary of the community; in which the university is more often a site of clashes than classes.

While individual understandings of exactly what happened and why at this meeting in 1983 differ, it is clear that it was a pivotal moment in the trajectory of the women's movement in Arica. The meeting signaled the birth of the second-wave of the women's movement in Arica and set the stage for the future of the movement.

The Arica Story is told in three parts, each part like an act in a play. The first act, like a prelude, and the last act, like a postscript, envelop the middle. While both the prelude and the postscript are temporally longer, and might be repositioned in a different telling of the Arica story, in this telling, what happens in the middle is the heart of the story. It is the story the women most want told, the story that preoccupies them and is imprinted

62

on their memories. From the middle, we can look back to *los antecedentes* (the antecedents) of the past, making more sense of how the middle unfolds, and look forward to the future, understanding *la continuación* (the continuation) more clearly from the perspective of the middle. The middle, the heart, of the story is – *la lucha* – the struggle. It is a tribute to their bravery, their commitment, their growth, their triumphs, and their failures.

To remember, to honour, to thank, to cry, and maybe to laugh – this is their story.[1][2]

The Setting

The setting is the city of Arica, Chile's most northern outpost. Situated in the Atacama Desert along the Pacific Border at the crossroads of Peru, Bolivia and Chile, it is more than 2000 km from the capital city of Santiago. It is a coastal city capriciously carved out of the driest desert in the world at the foot of the Andes mountains, crafting a fusion of sand, sea and sky that incongruously spawns fertile valleys unexpectedly appearing throughout the surrounding countryside. The cultural identity of this city is richly imprinted by the indigenous people of Inca ancestry, the Aymara and the Quechwa, who traditionally have lived in the *altiplanos* (highlands) high above Arica where llamas and their kin graze in vast plateaus. Like all of Latin America, Arica has been shaped by colonialism and conquest. Territorial battles over many centuries in this northern corner of the desert hold a significant place in the collective memory of *Ariqueños/as* (citizens of Arica).[3]

Arica itself is a small city of 180,000. Unlike Santiago, it stubbornly preserves many aspects of its own heritage evidenced in the lifestyle of the people and the functioning of the community. People still organize their daily routine according to the traditional large mid-day meal and siesta. There are no shopping malls filled with transnational retail outlets and only one struggling MacDonald's is located in Arica.[4] Prior to 1973, it was a socially and economically thriving community (Universidad de Chile, 1972). After the coup, it became a highly militarized and economically depressed zone. In general, the population is composed of diverse disenfranchised groups such as poor and indigenous peoples.

Walking along the main downtown street, closed to traffic, one sees all kinds of people – men in business suits, women in the attire of their office or company, school children in uniform, dogs running loose (lots of them!), and gypsies in traditional clothing engaged

63

in the very non-traditional act of begging. How the economy operates in Arica is transparent on that one street. There is a bank on every corner including Scotiabank and national private banks. There are smaller businesses selling clothing or household appliances, restaurants of every size and kind, micro-businesses operating out of tiny kiosks selling newspapers and candy, and the informal (underground) economy evident in the abundance of desperate vendors, mostly women with clinging children on the sidewalk, selling a few sticks of gum, some aspirin or anything else that might make a *peso* that day. There are talented local artisans and musicians, too – a whole street of them just off the main street.

In the *poblaciones* (popular neighbourhoods), one sees houses connected one to the other in block-long rows, each one vastly different from the other, divulging the economic means of its occupants.[5] Houses made for dry, rainless weather with flat rooftops that serve as storage areas and with artificial Christmas trees on outdoor patios. On every corner are a *peluquería* (hair salon) and a small store with a hand-written sign announcing *"hay pan"* meaning that the delicious fresh Chilean bread has arrived. Greeting folks and meeting new people is done with a *beso* (kiss) on the cheek. No one hurries. There's always another bus or *colectivo* (shared taxi) and a friend or colleague happy to see you when you get there. Summer days are spent on the many beaches in the city and summer evenings at the ocean-side park with the long length of promenade and playground, host to concerts, frolicking children, and mothers pushing strollers. In many *poblaciones*, problems with drugs and crime are evident and there are few recreational or social outlets for youth. A city of contrasts and contradictions like any other but, as elsewhere in the global south, more pronounced than a just world would allow.

The Context

Five centuries of European colonization have left enduring and devastating cultural and economic imprints in the region known as Latin America and have effectively paved the way for 20th century neo-colonial domination: development, modernization and globalization. During the inauguration of the neo-liberal era, Latin America's position in the global hierarchy was solidified by a dual reign of terror – brutally repressive military regimes in combination with a crippling monetarist economic model. During the 1960s and 70s, many countries in the region were forcibly overtaken and governed by right wing military dictatorships or authoritarian regimes. The few countries with socialist

64

governments faced externally generated anti-government propaganda or direct obstruction of internal policies.

Unlike many of its neighbours, Chile had a long and stable social democratic tradition that resulted, in 1970, in the election of a socialist president, Salvador Allende. The socialist experiment, however, proved too threatening for both national and international powers. Aided by internal agitation by upper classes and involvement of the United States (Chavkin, 1985), a military coup d'etat overthrew the government and installed a military dictatorship under the direction of General Augusto Pinochet in 1973. Immediately thereafter, the constitution was suspended, media censured, political parties and trade unions prohibited. During the bloody early days of the coup, thousands were captured, detained, tortured, disappeared, and/or executed. Over 3000 people were assassinated by the Chilean state during the dictatorship years, more than 1000 of whom remain disappeared. Both women and men suffered at the hands of the military but many have commented on the gender-specific torture and terrorism of women. Political leaders, community organizers, labour activists, and intellectuals that escaped this fate were forced into hiding while the rest of the citizenry was paralyzed by fear. "Five million women survived with the most profound fear on their shoulders." Moreover, about one million Chilean women were exiled and 500,000 children were born in exile.[6]

The repression of the citizenry established the climate needed to experiment with economic restructuring without worrying about the destabilizing tendency of popular political activity (Craske, 1998). The enforced and extreme economic measures consolidated neo-liberalism in the region, escalating economic hardship for increasing numbers of citizens and fundamentally changing the social structure of the family and the society.[7]

As a result of a 1988 plebiscite dictated by Pinochet's own 1980 constitution, Pinochet was obliged to hold elections in 1989 in which a coalition of centre-left parties (the *Concertación por la Democracia*) won and installed Patricio Aylwin as president. Throughout Latin America, the period of time after the downfall of a dictatorship was known as the "transition to democracy" – a time during which electoral processes and party systems were gradually re-established.[8] In Chile, the citizenry was required to re-learn the rules of democracy, altered by 17 years of military rule and the now-ascendant neo-liberalism. Chile's transition period began in 1990 and, despite three subsequent elections all won by the *Concertación*, there is growing pessimism about the ability of this government to consolidate a true democracy in Chile. In the early days of the transition,

65

the new government was hampered first, by anxiety about the potential for a renewed military takeover and second, by the negotiated terms of the transition which included amnesty for human rights abuses, an unjust Constitution, a binominal electoral system that favours the right, and the neo-liberal economic model. However, recent commentators cite disquieting examples that demonstrate a lack of political will to take advantage of opportunities to align the *Concertación* with a citizenry still hungry for justice.[9]

Historically, while confronting structural barriers similar to those faced by women elsewhere in the world, Chilean women have played an important role in their country's social and political struggles (Valdés & Weinstein, 1993). Paradoxically, political mobilization of women increased sharply in the 1980s in the midst of state repression and stringent economic policies. At a time when traditional political avenues were prohibited and men were not as widely available for protest (due to detention, exile, and migration for employment), the women took up the challenge. Despite threat to their own lives and livelihoods, women publicly protested against the human rights abuses of the regime, collectively organized popular subsistence and survival-oriented initiatives (e.g., collective kitchens), clandestinely disrupted the functioning of the regime, and inaugurated a second wave of feminism linked to grassroots organizing and service provision in poorer neighbourhoods. The strong, persistent and brave actions of the women who constituted the Chilean women's movement were a powerful force in the eventual downfall of the military dictatorship in 1989.[10]

The strong positioning of the women's movement gave it effective negotiating power during the transition period. This resulted in the creation of a women's ministry (SERNAM) in the new government that has garnered some successes but has been criticized for its growing distance from grassroots women (Schild, 1995; 1998a; Waylen, 2000). There are also some exceptions such as MEMCH in Santiago, a feminist NGO with credibility, tradition, organizational capacity, and some links to the regions. Since 1990, however, women have generally "returned to their homes" leaving mainly the official state women's apparatus and struggling community organizations to carry the banner. Some authors maintain that the recent emergence of women's networks may signal new life in the Chilean women's movement (Franceschet, 2003).

Act I: *Los Antecedentes*

Collective and Critical Consciousness: Pre-1973

As if it were a fundamental prelude, the women invariably began their narratives by drawing a contextual frame, grounded in their families and including their social context, that revealed the essential importance of *conciencia* (collective and critical consciousness) that was later experienced as *la necesidad* – the sense of necessity that prompted the imperative to act.

Women in Arica were raised in family and social environments that espoused a particular worldview. Sometimes it was implicit in a set of values such as dignity or community concern as in this quote from a woman who for many years had been the director of an NGO in one of the poorest *poblaciones* (neighbourhoods) in Arica.

> It's true that my family wasn't one with a lot of political consciousness, but it was one with a lot of consciousness of values. My father and my mother [were] a white man and an indigenous woman. They got us used to – I saw that many people arrived at my house, people from the rural area, indigenous people, very poor people, prostitutes, beggars. Many people entered my house. So therefore the values of solidarity were recurring values. I mean, there were many people who came to my house, who entered and then left with no problem. So, I have this, like, very ingrained in me. For me, it's like there was always the sense of being able to see beyond the person. There was always the sense of reciprocity, quite strongly, and of appreciating [people's] worth. My father saw someone that didn't have shoes to put on and my father gave him his sandals... And on top of that, my mother is a woman of indigenous origin, humble but with much faith... in people and in God and in *la Pacha* [the earth].

Many women also credited their *obrero* (worker), *campesino* (peasant) or *salitreras* (nitrate miners) origins, especially women whose personal stories are situated within the long history of territorial battles and conquered people over many centuries in the Chilean north. Participants were typically aware of the legacy of struggle within the mining communities of the north, where women and children protested, and sometimes died, alongside their husbands and fathers for condemning the oppressive and repressive treatment of the mining companies. Some of the elder women in this study had roots in *la Pampa* (the desert), in communities such as Chuquicamata, whose distinctive history is responsible for the "politicization" of the north.

> There is something to mention that is very important for the Chilean movements. All that culture that there was, that politicization that there was, that effervescent social thing that there was, wasn't because the Chilean people were tough. No. It was because in our history there was a

> very important man, Luis Emilio Recabarren... who organized the
> workers for their rights in the north. Then others followed. But all of it
> relates to the repression of the miners... Therefore... it was an
> organization that came from much before, the politicization and the
> organization of the Chilean people.

Few political/cultural events occur in Arica without the highly emotional performance of a popular folk song (*La última canción de la Cantata Santa María de Iquique*) that chronicles the tragic story of 20,000 marchers – men, women and children – from the northern mining communities who arrived in Iquique in 1907 to protest their unjust working and wretched living conditions. Many were shepherded into the courtyard of *La Escuela Santa Maria* where authorities opened fire. Fifteen hundred were massacred.[11] In our own learning/cultural event, the singer broke into tears while performing this song and continued only with the support of other singers who came to her aid on the stage.

Some women acknowledged their Catholic upbringing. "The truth is that inside the nun's school, they always gave you values of solidarity and all that business."

But most often in this group of women, consciousness was acquired through an explicit exposure to communism or socialism in the course of their family's participation in a political party. "*Desde la cuna*" (from the cradle), these women learned their philosophies and politics through their earliest childhood memories.

> Why do I have political consciousness? Because... my father worked in a
> naval shipyard in [a port city], and he had a political cell at his work but
> they met in my house. Therefore, from very small I knew what political
> stuff was all about.

Some women listed a variety of leftist parties to which a host of family members belonged. In some cases, it was a long-standing family tradition to belong to a particular political party.

> I am from a family that no one can be from another party because
> everyone is communist and we have all the generations, all, all, all of
> them are the same. And if someone marries someone who isn't, they are
> obligated to convert and those that don't, leave. Get it? It's like a clan.

One young woman had an interesting theory of how she came to be instinctively attracted to a communist political consciousness. During the interview, she first established that her father was right wing and her mother apparently apolitical. She then related two anecdotes from her preschool years that demonstrated her own aversion to the military and later, her attraction to communist neighbours and her growing recognition of the economic differences around her. At age 15, while visiting relatives in

68

the south of Chile, she discovered that "on my mother's side, they were all communists. But I had no idea, no idea. That's why I always say – it sounds kinda funny – but deep inside, I had it in my blood… For me, primordially, it came in my blood. My genes came out as communist genes."

Some women, daughters or daughters-in-law of communist fathers who fled to the north of Chile from Santiago in order to escape an earlier period of political repression, were deeply imprinted by this childhood experience. "In the era of the government of the traitor González Videla, my parents were communist militants. So from very young, I began to know what it meant to live violently uprooted. Unconsciously [my sister and I] found ourselves involved in the subject [of politics]."[12]

While the vast majority of study participants had at one time been Communist Party members, some were members of the Socialist Party, one was a Christian Democrat, and a few were members of *Movimiento Izquierda Revolucionaria* (MIR).[13] Again, the family connections were perceptible.

> I come from a family of socialists… Always in my house the environment was a socialist environment. Therefore, very early I started to participate. First when I was a little girl, so as not to leave me alone in the house, they took me to the meetings of the party.

Even among those that did not have family members in the Communist Party, most women in this study became formal members (*militantes*) of the Young Communists in their youth. A few of these women, introduced to party membership by trusted friends, recognized that the seeds of their attraction were sown in their families of origin.

> At a very young age, I joined the Young Communists. But my joining it wasn't from the family point of view. I come from a family where my father was uniformed and my mother was a peasant and I had, I mean, a social conception of the rights of people already. But I did have the luck to talk to some girls in school that worked in the Young Communists and because in my house they often said that every one must be respected for who they are, I was introduced to this concept of the equality of people. And I liked the way [the girls] presented things and I entered the Young Communists to serve very young.

A minority were not actual members of a particular party but had strong relationships with party members and affinities with party philosophies – a practice that one woman described as being "appendices" of the party, particularly the Communist Party.

The impact of an educational process, usually through political parties, was undeniable. The clearest example of this came from the eldest woman in the study who was an uneducated young girl of fifteen when her family was moved out of the north when

69

nitrate mining collapsed in 1940. Upon arriving in the south with her widowed mother and five siblings, accommodation and employment were secured for them by the Worker's Union, a mostly communist organization. After establishing through a number of examples that "after that we were *always* helped by the Communist Party," she concluded:

> So, I was formed in the party, I mean, my trajectory was politics within the Communist Party. By the way, I didn't know how to read or write... So, my school was the school of the party. The party taught me to write. It educated me, it taught me everything I know. I owe this to the party.[14]

Another woman deeply appreciated the values that she learned from the Communist Party as a youth: to love self and others, solidarity, class consciousness, and to respect the worker.

Moving into the second half of the twentieth century, Arica benefited from the growing ascendancy of the left in municipal government, in the consolidation of communitarian projects, in a healthy labour movement, and in a thriving industrial, agrarian and mining-based economy whose benefits were collectively shared through initiatives such as the *Junta de Adelanto de Arica* (Arica Council of Progress) that over a twenty year period accomplished numerous social and economic development projects such as in housing, education, and commercial construction (Universidad de Chile, 1972). The women provided many examples of active democratic citizen participation at the community level, especially in the *Juntas de Vecinos* (Neighbourhood Councils) and the *Centros de Madres* (Mother's Centres), two of the most prominent and active grassroots citizen's organizations.[15] *Tomas de terreno* (land takeovers), a legacy from earlier decades, were common as people from all over the country arrived in Arica (*inmigrantes internos*), a city unable to keep up with the housing demands of a growing population. The following is one of a number of quotes describing the actions involved in a land takeover.

> The problem was that I didn't have anywhere to live... Well, the *tomas de terreno* emerged. A man offered to give my husband a piece of land in [a *población* in Arica] but we had to take it clandestinely because it was the only way to live in 1958... So this is how we began to do the *tomas de terreno*. In one night, we would take, for example, five or six different *poblaciones*... At 3:00 in the morning, we put up the plywood, we put a flag on a pole, and we set everything down... Then all the cops came there... And that is what the struggle for the *pobladores* is all about, the *toma de terreno*. There was no water, there was no electricity, there was no sewer system.[16]

70

Then, in 1970, the Popular Unity government, a coalition led by socialist president Salvador Allende, was elected. Women of all ages spoke of the *alegría, esperanza* and *solidaridad* (happiness, hope and solidarity) of the Allende years. Women now in their forties were children and adolescents in 1970, such as one woman who remembered the optimism of the times. "I was little... we all went to raise the flag. It was the popular government, it was the hope of my family – that for four [times] had voted for Allende – with a sense that this is the government of the poor, this is *our* government." Older women had often worked for Allende's successive campaigns.[17]

> I participated actively, I mean actively, in the Popular Unity government and not only in the government but much before as well. Here we talk of four periods before Allende assumed power. I was involved in this, struggling so that our people would have real justice, that there would be equality, [because] there were so many things, scarcities that our people had.

They recalled the community programs and the community spirit. "The effervescence of the youth, the voluntary work, the summer work, the summer camps were realities... that we joyously lived." They remembered that "everyone participated, everyone had a job, whatever thing in the neighbourhood." Even the youngest women – now in their thirties, too young to remember or not yet born in 1970 – had heard their elders talk with wistful nostalgia about what was and what might have been. As opposition to the Allende government escalated over his three-year presidency, communitarian responses increased in an effort to support each other and to circumvent the anti-government propaganda and boycotts. For example, *Juntas de Abastecimiento y Precios* (Councils of Supplies and Prices) were established and charged with obtaining and fairly distributing food during the contrived food shortages.[18]

A teacher in the Brigade of Socialist Teachers described two ways that they tried to circumvent the anti-government propaganda and boycotts.

> So, for example, what we did is that those who had some leadership positions set up networks. I mean, I went to a meat market. I had an agreement and I arrived every Friday with my little box. And I gave a half a kilo of meat to everyone... as a way to have the people more or less provided for. And to be able to placate the situation a little because we knew that they were creating an environment for the people to refuse the government more and more.

> Remember that at that time, there was milk for all the children. Well, suddenly, we found that the parents were refusing to take the milk. We had the shelves in the classroom full of milk and the parents said, "no," that the milk was bad. So we handed out recipes of how to use the milk in desserts, in this and that, so that the people would take it.[19]

71

Additionally, Catholic doctrine during the age of liberation theology was a powerful educational tool through formal workshops and informal solidarity.

> And when I was a bit older, I began to see things. I began to realize what they were talking about, of what religion must be, that it is for everyone to be equal... What was important was that supposedly in the church we were all children of God, that everyone had the same rights. And I began to, like, see the ideal that one has. I mean, they preached about equality before the eyes of God, that we are all equal. And the priest and the nun, in the political part, also told you that we are all equal. I mean, before the society, we all have to be equal... For me, it was very important, very, very important.

In the summative words of one woman leader, "in those years, there was a high [level of] political consciousness. The political education that the whole society had was incredible."

From One Day to the Next: September 11, 1973

The day of the coup is indelibly imprinted in the memory of many women. Child or adult, women clearly remembered what they were doing when their lives were suddenly turned upside down. Girls playing in the streets, housewives and mothers going about their daily routine of shopping for groceries or walking children to school, teachers starting their classes. The women recalled, not only what was happening on that fateful day, but especially how they felt: bewildered, frightened and stunned. In the interviews, they struggled to convey in words what was so utterly unreal to them at the time. One woman remembered the day of the coup from her perspective as a child. From the freedom to play in the streets to suddenly being confined to the back of the house, the child understood that "something was happening."

> I was eight or nine years old, but I remember my house. Obviously, it was the way of a child to go out to play in the street. And from one day to the next, the curtains were closed in my house and we were not permitted to enter any of the front part of the house, not the living room, dining room or front hall. My father closed those parts. Even more than that, he put a lock on that part – because of the shooting that was happening in the middle of the night. I'm talking about September 11 in the night and September 12. Nobody explained anything to me. I came to understand it much later. I felt the shots. I felt that something was happening because we went to bed at 12 and now at 6 or 7 in the evening, the lights were turned off in the house. We had a street on both sides. It was a very sudden thing, very, very sudden.

The quote below poignantly conveys how drastically a mother's everyday reality changed between taking the children to school and returning home again.

72

> Look, so that you understand and can comprehend better, it is like you wake up one particular day to do your everyday things, as happened to me, for example. You wake up in the morning and I had to take my children to school, it was the little ones that I had to take. When I returned from the school, there my life changed. For me, it changed totally. When I saw nobody in the street, only military vehicles, tanks, trucks full of military all painted up, with machine guns. I mean, that occupation of the city was such a terrible thing... That change, so sudden, was so terrible.

Although there had been growing unrest throughout the country, especially in the capital city, the contra-Allende faction in Arica was quite small, likely due to the established leftist consciousness and practices in the city. "The demonstrations, the protests of women, the line-ups [for food], no, not here like in Santiago. [The support for Allende] was very strong here. The left was always very strong here." Thus, women in Arica, even those who were political leaders and party militants, were completely stunned by the coup. The exiled mayor of Arica remembered, "we had no idea that there was going to be a military coup. I arrived at work... like always before 8:00... and at 10 they took me into detention from there." Some, although shaken, felt confident that the traumatic disruption would quickly pass. In the meantime, lives were in chaos. One woman, a communist party leader at the time, touched on each of these themes, integrating the personal and the political, in the following excerpt.

> The coup caught me by surprise. It was such a mess. What happened? We were not convinced of what had happened. With so much fear, four months pregnant, not knowing what to do, I was sorry that I was pregnant because we thought – I talked with my husband, and we said that it was crazy to be pregnant in these times. What to do? I'll have an abortion today. What to do? Because we thought that there was going to be a response from the people and that people would be needed. And it was, I don't know if it was a relief or a great deception to see that there was no kind of response. In Arica, the response was minimal; the response to the coup was minimal... And the coup arrived and left us hanging, politically. Nothing happened. We had no contact with anybody for a long time. We came to know that people had been taken to prison. We tried to listen to Radio Moscow every night to have some news, without knowing, without being able to communicate with my family in Santiago either.

Many women sadly recognized the irrevocable effect that this day had on the rest of their lives, collectively and personally. In the women's words, "the future that might have been" was shattered "from one day to the next – everything, everything, all your dreams, your family... there is a 100 degree turn." "From September 11, 1973, it was an absolutely different world." "Life changed in that moment and for every moment after." Another woman and her husband, both "workaholics," lost their jobs. So, for them,

73

"from one day to the next without a salary, without a home, without a job, I mean, that meant a mental re-adaptation." A woman, who was a university student at the time, noted the collective effect of these personal changes.

> It has been a change at the level of the masses, collectively. Also, it was a change at the personal level. Why? Because the result is that each one of us – In that time, I was very young, I was finishing my studies. I had a projection for my life. I had said, "I am going to do this and this." I couldn't ever do that because I had to change those programs for others. First, to defend life, to see how we were going to organize ourselves to confront this.

A young woman whose uncle was executed recognized that this ominous event in her life was responsible for "reversing my history."[20] Like her, women wondered "if that hadn't happened in this country in 1973, what destiny would I have had today." Through their reflections, the women conveyed a sense of disorientation, of unfulfilled potential, of a future stolen by the sudden, brutal and wholly unwelcome interference in their life's trajectory.

As can already be glimpsed in the passages above, terror became an everyday phenomenon. The reality of new dangers was brought home to one *pobladora* on the first day of the coup.

> I am very patriotic so my first reaction was to [put up] a flag and black crepe at half-mast because [President Allende] had died. Well, the flag was raised for a few hours and a young man went by, running desperately over here and he stopped at the house and entered and he said to me, "*Señora*, please take down the flag." And I said, "I'm not going to take down the flag because the President of the Republic has died, they killed him." ... The young man climbed up and took down the black crepe and continued running. I never knew who he was, and well, it was really terrible. I don't know, maybe that young man saved me from many things because after that I knew that other *poblaciones*... did the same. The military came and struck the housewives.

For another woman who had read about fascism, the abstract notion was raised to an almost inconceivable reality.

> In a particular moment all that is certain ends and another part appears... [Some people] thought this would only last a while and afterwards the military would give back the power – a thing that didn't happen – because they didn't know fascism in its essence... I had access to a lot of literature so I knew very well, through the literature, what fascism was. But to live it is another thing.... How a human being can become such an animal in a particular moment.

From there, the story is familiar.

74

> Everyone knows now about the overthrow and, at the same time, the
> death [of Allende]... the torture, arbitrary detentions, deaths,
> disappearances – children, husbands, siblings, friends that were lost and
> disappeared. And still today, for many of them, the family has not
> received an answer. When 1983 arrived here in Arica, much before that
> there had also been detentions of a lot of young people at the university
> that went out to the street... and many youth died in the street.

Quiet Continuity: 1973-1983

From the women I learned that, rather than being a period of silence (implying

immobilization) as suggested in some of the literature, the ten year period that followed

the first days of the coup instead represented quiet continuity from the legacy of the past

to the bold *mobilization* of the future.[21]

Immediately, after the coup, all forms of social and political movements were

"disarticulated." In Arica, there were many reasons for this. One was fear. Because one's

friends either *"se fueron or las fueron"* (left or were taken away), "your whole social circle

was dismantled." Many women spoke, too, of distrust and suspicion, of being afraid to

talk to anyone for not knowing who was an informant. "Even to greet a person was

suddenly dangerous." So people tried "to pass by unnoticed... [and] as discreet as

possible." For a time, this kept women isolated and silent.

> Awhile passed without doing anything outside my home, I mean,
> nothing political, nothing social. [Q: Because of fear?] I don't know if it
> was fear in reality but I believe that it was also a bit of disarticulation,
> lack of organization, lack of contact. Nobody wanted to – one passed
> alongside of people, people didn't even – I mean, it was like you didn't
> know anybody, and didn't talk to anybody either because you didn't
> know with whom you were talking.

A second reason identified by the women was the conspicuous militarization of the city.

Not only "with the amount of people that were in regiments in Arica at that time, there

were a lot" but also, according to one leader,

> as a frontier city, the dictatorship had a different characteristic here. From
> my point of view, it was a city militarily surrounded. And how did they
> surround us? They surrounded us by putting people in the *poblaciones*,
> soldiers, military, in the *poblaciones*. For every two or three houses, one
> was a house of a military. In this way, they neutralized the
> neighbourhood; they kept an eye on everything and knew everything
> that happened in the *población*.

Women also explained that they were overloaded with all the tasks of managing things

alone. "Before [1980], it was survival. It was looking for food." Men, the traditional

family breadwinners, were unemployed. Many men had to leave Arica to work

75

elsewhere, usually in the mining communities. Referring to the unfamiliarly high unemployment, one participant noted that "for the first time, women, housewives, mothers, had to abandon their homes, as we say, to go out to work." Another woman, formerly very active in social and political activities, said, "I was left with little time to do other things outside of looking after my daughters because, imagine, I already had three."

Despite rampant fear and uncertainty, women soon sought out the company of others to obtain information, alleviate their fear, and make sense of their experience. A woman imprisoned and then exiled in the first year of the dictatorship, shared this perspective.

> In the three first months that I was here, from September to November, that was the period that I was free – then they detained me – the people looked for the ability to organize, not only out of need in that moment but also having the need for news, to know things. Because it happened that all the information was controlled. So nobody knew what was happening because it was all official through the radios, the television, everything. Therefore, the things that everyone wanted to know, couldn't be known through the collective communication that there was but through the information that moved in clandestine and underground [ways]... So, the people needed not only to organize themselves for events but also to acquire information. And the other thing that, psychologically, there also exists the need to be together to lose the fear. I mean when you are alone, you feel more fear than if you are in a group.

The woman with three daughters, a woman of strong consciousness and a leader all her life, felt "strange" to be isolated and inactive so she looked for alternative ways to get out and, eventually, to make contact again. "Awhile passed without doing anything outside my home, I mean, nothing political, nothing social... But in my house I felt strange without doing anything. I started to study in order to leave my house in some way, to do something."

A former university student explained that the university students who "had less to lose" and who had "lost fear" started to organize in 1974. As early as 1975, university students (and then high school students in 1976) began distributing political pamphlets against the regime. "Maybe they were very small things," she said, "but we felt solidarity in the work... and there was more strength."

Around 1978, the Communist Party in Arica began to rearticulate. As one Communist Party leader recalled, "... [the environment] began to, not to soften, but to show more possibilities of organizing... I began to contact people from the [Communist] Party... in 1978 more or less, to make contact, because *los viejos*, made contact with me and I started

76

to become politically active."[22] This opened a space for many women who wanted to become active. One woman explained:

> The truth is that I didn't get involved in the Communist Party because of conviction and doctrine. I didn't get involved because I loved the Communist Party nor because its ideology fascinated me much. I got involved in the Communist Party because it was the only party of the left that remained standing in Arica. Because MIR was destroyed, the Socialist Party had completely disappeared. The Communist Party was quiet for about three, four, five years, you know, with the people disarticulated and without political activity. And it was the first party that started to rearticulate here in Arica... So I decided to get involved in the Communist Party because when it rearticulated here in Arica, they had a job here. They offered you the possibility of doing a clandestine job, with security rules... that could be efficient. I mean, because a struggle against a tremendous colossus like the dictatorship wasn't a joke, you know. So, I considered that the Communist Party gave you at least the minimum of security.

Furthermore, the women were increasingly motivated by a sense of urgency and necessity – by a feeling that there was no option, no alternative – as in the two quotes below.

> Therefore, for those that had a real consciousness of [the dangers of fascism], it was necessary and urgent that things change and the only way was for the people to organize themselves. So, the urgent necessity was to organize ourselves.

> For us, as communists, there was no other alternative. We couldn't stay in our houses. We had to go out into the street to demonstrate.

For some, the motivation was for the future of their own and others' children.

> When I "took" consciousness, it was because... I knew that it would be for the well-being of my children, for the children of other *compañeras*, and all the children who came into the world later. So that we wouldn't be so bad anymore. So that they would enjoy [the benefits of] what we did in that time.

These feelings of necessity provided the emotional imperative for the women to act.[23] This launched a whole new life for many women, young and older, housewives, students and professionals – life in a world where one must "learn to live in clandestinity... [because] that's how we worked, in a clandestine way – with pseudonyms, false names, false addresses." Despite the challenges inherent in this way of working, the women in the Communist Party were very active at the community level. Said one woman, "we were a Communist Party in clandestinity but we were big, big. We had many women." A number of women confirmed that activity started to coalesce between 1980 and 1983. Cultural activities included theatre groups, *peñas*,

77

Pascuas Populares, Talleres Populares, and *Chucarruma.*[24] "The first movement of women undertaken to publicly denounce [the regime]," AFAVIR (Association of Relatives of the Victims of Repression) was formed in 1981 and the *ollas comunes* (collective kitchens) surfaced in the next year.

Moreover, within the Communist Party, groups of women began to form that would have a significant influence on the trajectory of the women's movement in the next few years.[25] One of the subsequent leaders of the women's movement chronicled the transition from her inscription into the Communist Party in 1979 to the decisive meeting in 1983. She described being disconcerted with the absence of analysis and over-emphasis on action in those years. In response, she introduced literature on historical materialism (that she had hidden away) to her communist cell "to begin with the political education part." For a full year or so, from 1981 to 1982, the women, who now also "included some socialists and some *miristas* [members of MIR] that went around abandoned" studied whatever they could get their hands on, although challenged by "information arriving to Arica a month after it happened." Sometime in 1983, an article "fell into our hands," a half page that affected them forever after. The article referenced a large gathering of Latin American feminists held in that same year.[26] The effect: "We read it and we began from there to work from another angle, I mean, we began, with this article… to talk and we began to question… and we began to talk from another perspective, the theme of women." The result: "we decided to transform that study group into an organization with the idea to bring along women from the party and from other sectors."

In August of that same year, four prominent Communist Party male leaders were detained. "Sometimes one wants to walk a block and what happened for us in that block was a whole world," stated one woman of what happened subsequent to her husband's detention. In response to the detentions, the wives initiated the first public demonstrations against the dictatorship in Arica by chaining themselves at the courthouse in protest. One woman detailed the event.

> We took the Appellate Court and we fought with the judges, with
> everyone… When we took the court, we were there for two or three days
> and then they took us to prison. All the police threw us from I don't know
> how high, and they pulled us out and took us to prison.

She concluded, "we were only four and from that moment was born the whole movement of social and political organizations, from that moment, because there wasn't anything, everything was clandestine."

But to go "public" was a dangerous choice. The women organizers well-remember what happened the night they prepared the invitations for a meeting that was to inaugurate the movement.

> L. took all the letters that same night and at dawn [the secret service] went to ransack her house. And they took her husband to prison... So, L. had the letters, they arrived, and she put them under the armchair in the living room... [The leader said], "Sit down señora, don't be afraid" and L. sat in the armchair underneath which were the letters – because they were turning over all the cushions, all of them, and there were all the letters of invitation. Fortunately, the CNI [secret service] did not discover them because L. sat on them. But the rest was all turned over.

And so begins the second act...

Act II: *La Lucha*

... where the heart of the women's movement in Arica is laid bare, where memory reigns, and emotions flow. Where all that comes before coalesces into this moment. And what a moment! Was the role of women in the anti-dictatorship movement important? According to all the women:[27]

> Yes, undoubtedly. The statistics, the photos, the record – everything makes it clear that, in large part, the women of the country headed the whole protest, the whole movement. They were the first that organized, the first ones on the subject of the political prisoners, later the detained and disappeared. They were the ones that first went out into the street. In Arica, we were the first ones that went out into the street, as well, as a protest. Getting organized, organized – we women were the first. And lots, lots. So many that we didn't even believe it ourselves when we saw them in the rally. It was impressive.

Another woman declared, "I am convinced of this, that if it hadn't been for the Chilean women, we would still be with the dictator."

The Movement Emerges and Diverges: October 29, 1983

> On October 29, 1983... they lent us the centre for retired people and there we met, about sixty women, basically militants of parties from the left. (Gaviola et al., 1994, p. 161-162)[28]

And so we arrive at the meeting. If one were observing, a number of things would be apparent about the women coming to this meeting: they are keen to act, they are already politicized and – they have different agendas. These agendas fall into two camps directly

79

related to the two precursor events: the emergence of feminist theorizing and the recent detentions.

About eight women, newly identified feminists, called the meeting hoping to advance the anti-dictatorship struggle by incorporating feminist analysis and reflection that would simultaneously contribute to women's advancement in Chilean society. The organizers explained that their purpose in integrating the "two things" (i.e., the anti-dictatorship and the feminist struggle) was, in large part, "to prepare women... for what would happen after Pinocho was out, that was our proposal, that on par with working to get Pinocho out, the women would prepare themselves, study. We were involved in this thing of feminism."[29] One feminist leader expanded on the idea of "preparation."

> You had to be able to comprehend that these two things can go parallel, together. And, also, it is necessary, isn't it, that you have to lay the foundation. That this is going to be for the long haul, and that we had to prepare ourselves. It wasn't just to go out in this moment, but it was from here forward. We had to know that a dictatorship was something very terrible, very grave, and that this was going to be for who knows how long. And that in some moment, we would have to take responsibility and that we had to make a sustainable thing that would permit you to form yourself as a person, socially, as we say, and confront things that were going to come later.

Based upon their period of self-study and reflection, the handful of feminists attempted to make a rehearsed presentation at the meeting about the potential role of feminism in the struggle. But the majority of women had come to the meeting with different intentions. First of all, prompted by the recent detentions, they perceived immediate and confrontational action to be the most urgent need, the single stated objective being to oust the dictatorship. In light of the immediacy of their stated needs, they saw no relevance of "study" or "preparation" as proposed by the organizers.

> There were more people that were affected directly by the dictatorship. It was an everyday thing. The education of women, in essence what she would need for – it had to go in hand. But in those times, there was an immediate thing, there was a thing of the moment that took away your time to think about other things. Because today four people disappeared and you, as a movement, have to go out to the street to struggle so that those four persons would reappear. So, that struggle that you had prepared for tomorrow, is no longer good for tomorrow because in the night there were five dead... In the night something worse had happened.

Second, as is usually the case, feminism was not well understood; it was feared and ridiculed. According to some sources, the Communist Party "planted" party women in the meeting to actively oppose the feminist influence and disrupt the organizers (who

80

were themselves loyal party militants). From one organizer's perspective, "the militant women from the parties came en masse, the socialists, the communists en masse, the most orthodox, the most *machista* came."

On the other hand, many of the party women were taken aback by this "foreign" concept and felt manipulated. They argued that the goals of feminism were neither consistent with nor as important or urgent as their commitment to the anti-dictatorship struggle. Women were clear on this point, often reinforcing the immediacy of their perceived needs.

> Maybe because within this whole group of *compañeros* and *compañeras* were all these that were more affected, because their husbands were in prison, they had had to escape to exile, relatives, children, whatever. We thought that, in that moment, the work wasn't a gender struggle but that we had to, in some way, involve ourselves in creating a movement that would fight – in our own way or within our possibilities – against the dictatorship.

One woman, in whose home the meeting was planned, described the clash of opinions that ensued.

> When we had to define, to make the Statutes, the letter of principles of the group, it came out that there was going to be a group of feminists, of the gender perspective and women's rights. And the fight began. That there was a dictatorship and that we had to overthrow it first and we had to get together for this. Another group said that feminism, that the woman had to re-establish her rights... And it was a fight... First one and then another defended the feminist thesis. And then the other said that, no, first we will organize ourselves to protest the dictatorship and then when the dictatorship is gone, then we will see to the other.

Consequently, the organizers were faced with an "insurmountable wall" of opposition, mostly from the other members of the Communist Party, that they experienced as a "sort of state coup" or "boycott." Moreover, the feminists were verbally attacked – accused of being bourgeois, imperialists and traitors – an experience that is still keenly felt by those who were attacked.[30] The outcome was to split the group.

> And we won the motion of, I mean, there were more of us who were pestering. I was in the group that was pestering that first we had to throw out the dictatorship. And a small group stayed with CEDEMU and we all left. There in that meeting, we stood up. We were fifty. Forty of us stood up and ten stayed. We left to form MODEMU and they formed CEDEMU.

Dazed and bewildered by the reaction of their *compañeras*, the feminist contingent regrouped and inaugurated *Centro de Estudio de la Mujer* (CEDEMU)[31] with the intention of pursuing a marxist-feminist praxis. These women did community-based feminist

81

work in the *poblaciones* raising awareness of the issues of violence and discrimination against women within the context of Chilean society in general and the dictatorship in particular. Meanwhile, the other women officially formed *Movimiento de los Derechos de la Mujer* (MODEMU)[32] and went to the streets every day in open demonstrations, as well as numerous clandestine activities. While a variety of other initiatives existed at the time, many of the women aligned themselves with one or the other of these two organizations.

By all accounts, this meeting precipitated the subsequent and prolonged activities of the women's movement in Arica. Despite their divergent philosophical stances on feminism and on the goals of the women's movement in Arica, there is no question that the women were united, at least, in this common objective – the downfall of the dictatorship.

Powerful Women in a Powerful Movement: 1983-1988

Without doubt, the meeting precipitated a chain of activity that was sustained in diverse forms until the end of the dictatorship. In this section of the paper, I recount the diversity of experiences and activities that made up the women's movement in Arica during this period.[33] Interview transcripts are replete with hundreds of specific examples. The sheer quantity of their activities is mind-boggling. The following synopsis is draw from our presentation at the farewell communal learning/cultural event (Chovanec et al., 2002).[34]

> And the women! They went out to the streets without thinking about it…
>
> Along with the struggle in the streets, we had to organize ourselves, to do something more. And we went around adding, one woman, another woman, and there quietly, another.
>
> Women who had never left their house started to be invited or simply to invite themselves. They shared the same problems, the same disquietudes, the disinformation or the distorted information that came officially, the uncertainty, the "not having," of having to make do a lot of times (maybe the majority of the time).
>
> We felt afraid, but we met just the same, in the parish, in a house, we talked, we gave ideas. We had to throw out the dictatorship. We began to control the fear. Then came permanent and clandestine meetings. The *ollas comunes* and the collective buying emerged. Some returned to the militancy of the political party, some had never left it. The organizations: commemorating March 8, MODEMU, CEDEMU, *Mujeres de Luto, Mujeres por la Democracia*, the Association of Relatives of the Victims of Repression, the Association of Relatives of the Political Prisoners, the Sebastián Acevedo Movement Against Torture, etcetera.

82

> Women everywhere! Women defending their rights, their lives, their families. The feminine struggle and the feminist struggle. Histories entwined for the common reality.
>
> Democracy in the country and in the home! (And in the political parties too!) We were sharing, learning, educating ourselves, and growing.

One woman rhetorically challenged her *compañeras* in a group interview: "Ask yourself, 'Who did [all the activities]?' The women, of course!" From among the countless activities, I draw examples of each of the following: women's organizations, acts of solidarity and resistance, communal survival-oriented activities, human rights groups, political and social movements, and the Catholic Church.

The two **women's organizations**, MODEMU and CEDEMU, overtly represented the "women's movement" in Arica. Officially inaugurated on January 14, 1984, MODEMU was the larger of the two in number. Although there were a few prominent women from other political parties among the leadership and many that were politically unaffiliated among the masses, the Communist Party was the impetus behind MODEMU. Formed largely in reaction to CEDEMU and in a situation of perceived urgency, these women went to the streets every day in open demonstrations, as well as numerous clandestine activities to disrupt the functioning of the regime and bring attention to the human rights abuses.

> We prepared work to confront the dictatorship... To go out for something specific. So we went out, we got together. We weren't fifty or sixty; we were 300, 400 women. We were women from the church, women from the parties, women from the social organizations, neighbours. Singly and clandestinely we invited them. And they came and came and we went out.
>
> We wanted women in the struggle, women in the street confronting, fighting, setting up. That's what we wanted, women to shock them.

Although their name implies that they were concerned about women's rights (*derechos de la mujer*), MODEMU activists eschewed the term 'feminist.' According to them, MODEMU was never a feminist organization nor were their objectives feminist. For some time, I struggled to understand how an organization claiming *not* to be concerned about gender issues had called itself the "Movement for Women's Rights." (Non-MODEMU participants found it "ironic.") Finally, one of the participants made it clear that the organization's name was a pseudonym, a common practice of the time in order to mask the true identities of individuals and the real motives of organizations for their own protection. As one leader admitted, "anyone could believe that the purpose of our

83

organization would be centered in the theme of gender, but it wasn't like that." Another explained the differences:

> We [MODEMU] fought in a direct way against the system, against the dictatorship. But [CEDEMU] made a struggle purely about women, in another form but where they valorized and wanted to improve the valorization of the person as a woman, as a gender. We did not work in that area.

Nonetheless, one woman added that an important women's right of that time was the right "to participate in the struggle."[35]

CEDEMU was the visible representation of a distinctly feminist movement in Arica. The history of CEDEMU parallels the community-based feminist work documented in Santiago (see for example Valdés & Weinstein, 1993). This small group of women worked with the poorest women, raising awareness of the issues of violence and discrimination against women, while at the same time acting in concert with MODEMU and their political party comrades in other anti-dictatorship activities. From her personal experience, a CEDEMU participant highlighted CEDEMU's main endeavours: feminist work on self-esteem and independence and with women-in-need in the community, critically integrated within the anti-dictatorship struggle.

> I entered CEDEMU more or less in the years 1984 or 85, around there. I entered precisely because I was invited by a friend who told me that women were getting together to participate. And when I arrived, from the beginning, I really liked it because they touched on different topics, all the topics related to women. And the first thing, more than anything, was to get to know yourself as a woman. It was a very nice experience. One learned to valorize oneself more, to love oneself more, to move away a bit from the yoke of the house. And apart from this, we did community actions, very nice social actions. We were always, more than anything, fighting against the dictatorship... We also helped many abused women, pregnant teens... in various sectors, in whatever sector where the presence of women was required. Afterwards, we went also to the jail. Sometimes we went to visit as well the women that were there because they had small children, and to the hospital as well... Well, apart from this we also always went downtown to throw pamphlets, we met outside the cathedral to do a minute of silence, to sing the national anthem, to do all those acts against [the regime], to accompany the detained and disappeared.

From the beginning, CEDEMU was tenuously connected with the broader feminist movement through its relationship with MEMCH in Santiago, especially with one of the founders, Olga Poblete.[36]

In the year following its inception, the CEDEMU leaders again attempted to broaden the scope of participation by starting a new women's organization, *Mujeres por la Democracia*

84

(Women for Democracy). One leader explained how they attempted to distance CEDEMU and its feminist label from the new organization in order to acquire support for their work with women in the *poblaciones*. According to her, "it was like a change of name at one time because of the thing of feminism. And we, the same women that were in CEDEMU, formed *Mujeres por la Democracia*, plus other women... so as not to lose the people that we had at that time." Recognizing that the two visible women's organizations (CEDEMU and MODEMU) were firmly entrenched in the left, another leader focused on the "advantage of agglutinating people that weren't militants."[37]

> There wasn't a more pluralist organization that joined... the blocs of opposition to Pinochet... *Mujeres por la Democracia* emerged because there was a vast movement of women who wanted to participate. First, those that weren't from a party, so they weren't going to go to organizations with a marked [political] tendency that already existed. Second, there were women of the church, many of them. Another reason was that there were some Christian Democratic militants and professional women, people that didn't have a party clearly defined. I mean, it was a way to open the specter of participation... Because we understood that not everyone was reduced to the four walls of a party but we had to incorporate more people. We had to add people.

For about three years, women from different sectors, carried out a long list of diverse activities that included workshops on women's sexuality, basic household maintenance (e.g., plumbing, electricity), hair cutting, and civic education, and into which were inserted political and feminist content. The organization eventually folded for political reasons when women "returned to their political parties." In the background, CEDEMU had remained active mainly as a study group and then assumed prominence once again after the demise of *Mujeres por la Democracia*.

Along with *Mujeres por la Democracia*, there were numerous instances where the groups and their activities united and intermingled. Referring to the divisions between the organizations, one CEDEMU leader retorted, "it was absurd. We were of the same current. We had the same ideas, the same disquietudes, we formed part of the same struggle." Indeed, there was such an intermingling among the participants and their activities that it was difficult for me to determine which activities and people "belonged" to which organizations in which period of time. Even the study participants were not completely clear about the distinctions between organizations. "Finally, these two options got together in the street and in the coordination to organize ourselves" (Gaviola et al., 1994, p. 162).

The first massive manifestation was held in the athletic stadium on March 8, 1984 for International Women's Day. Organized by MODEMU in collaboration with other

85

organizations including CEDEMU, this event drew about 1500 women. According to a CEDEMU leader,

> we succeeded in making a ceremony that made history in Arica. It was a cultural ceremony where we presented all the themes, with stage design, lighting, music and everything... It raised our spirits. I don't remember any manifestation against the dictatorship, right up to today, of the magnitude of that March 8th event. (Gaviola et al., 1994, p. 162)

Another participant, a MODEMU leader, proudly showed me a creased and folded document – the municipal government's permission to hold the event – that had been saved all these years among MODEMU's most cherished papers.[38] In the words of another organizer is glimpsed the obvious enjoyment of this triumphant example of their early efforts.

> We sent a punch right to the mouth of the dictatorship on March 8th because we reached a huge goal; we made March 8th political, anti-dictatorial. We said what we wanted. And with permission! I think that the old guy must have died to be thinking how, in what moment, they gave these women permission to do that.

While the stadium event is fondly and proudly remembered, the most memorable, poignant and lasting representation of the women's work together is *Mujeres de Luto* (Women in Mourning) – an event held each year on September 11 (the anniversary of the coup) since 1984 to bring attention to the injustices of the dictatorship. The women stand on the steps of the cathedral dressed in black for one hour of silence followed by a cultural performance. A number of women emotionally recalled the first occurrence of this event in which some 150 women participated.

> Well, we created that. That was an idea that, I remember, [arose] in a conversation with your friend. We didn't know what to do for September 11. So we began to talk. What should we do for September 11? What to do? What to do? And suddenly we thought to get dressed in black... And how to do it? Well, there was the idea of getting the women together and, at the end, we decided to be in the cathedral for one hour in silence, dressed in black. It was in the full dictatorship and here in Arica the repression was strong. So, it cost us a lot. And on top of that, we had to do it in secret so that it wouldn't get out. It cost us a lot to convince the people because there was fear; I mean there was fear for sure. But, in the end, we accomplished it. And the strategic part of how we did it? Well, I worked in the church – I always worked in the church – so we got a sacristan of the cathedral who left the cathedral open for us, one door on the side. So we arrived. We all went as usual, not dressed in black, but dressed ordinary. And inside the church we changed our clothes... At precisely twelve o'clock, we went out and we were there for one hour. The police arrived with their helmets, with their shields, submachine guns, everything. But they were disconcerted because of what we were going to do. And all our relatives were in the plaza and I believe that it

86

was super emotional. When it finished, when the clock struck one o'clock in the afternoon... we sang the national anthem and everyone cried. [There was a banner that said] "Democracy Now."

Another woman explained what happened next. "We were surrounded, all the women were very afraid because we didn't know what was going to happen when we left the cathedral... At the end, when we dispersed, each one ran to one side because of the fear we had." The effect was palpable. One woman supposed "it was like a psychological coup." Some women articulated the "crossing" or "entwined" relationship between *Mujeres de Luto* and the women's struggle because "it is a symbol of the strength of women." During the years of the dictatorship, the event gathered greater numbers each year (to a maximum of 600 one year) and other activities, such as a march to the cemetery, were added.

Although many activities occurred spontaneously as needs arose, a routine emerged around key dates, such as March 8 (International Women's Day), May 1 (Labour Day) and September 11 (anniversary of the coup), requiring the "scheduling of activities" (MODEMU) or "a calendar of protest activities" (CEDEMU). These were planned public activities that were used to raise consciousness among the citizens and to articulate the opposition. Manifestations, demonstrations, concentrations, protests, marches – all with particular nuances of meaning – occurred regularly, with hundreds to thousands of participants. MODEMU is credited with an "incredible power of convocation," boasting one demonstration with 3000 participants. Sometimes, entire neighbourhoods were involved in the struggle. As one *pobladora* said of her *población*, "very few were those who didn't participate." In one kind of demonstration (*los cacerolazos*), women went to the streets banging their cooking pots.[39] Other measures were organized to provide emotional and practical support.

> First there was a solidarity campaign that we did with the *compañeros* that were detained at that time. They were five *compañeras* [whose husbands] were detained in the jail in Arica, *compañeras* that participated in MODEMU. Some were leaders. And help for them to be able to help them maintain themselves as well. For example, we tried to sell used clothes among our friends to put together some money to buy some food to make family [food] baskets for them.

Still others were regular and clandestine.

> We had to dedicate ourselves to going out into the street every day; I mean *every day* in the street. And to go out into the street and to be able to do our clandestine work, we did it in the middle of the night so that no one would see us and we were all vigilant.

87

The clandestine activities she refers to were plentiful. These included producing mimeographed oppositional material, constructing various kinds of small homemade bombs, and spray painting – all potentially dangerous tasks with contraband materials – but activities that most of the women did during those years anyway. One of the women, a forty-year-old teacher and mother of teenagers at the time, carefully detailed these tasks.

> We studied how to make homemade mimeographs. We met in a rotation in the homes of some *compañeras* that were less risky and we prepared material, what we called *"las palomas,"* [the doves] or whatever, making a call to citizen consciousness. Also, disseminating [information] when there was going to be some specific activities. In the house of a *compañera*, they made *miguelitos*. So, someone bought nails, a quarter [kilo] of nails, I mean, we put together various quarters of nails. At different times, we brought them to this house so that there they made the *miguelitos*. And in the night, someone went to get them and make the distribution... We did spray painting in the night. In the same way, we bought spray paint and we went out, those that lived in the sectors, and we went out with two or three *compañeras* to spray paint, making the paintings that corresponded to the slogans of that time.

Another mother living in one of the most combative *poblaciones*, and with three sons (young men) heavily involved in the underground movements and the younger ones in *los Pioneros*, evocatively described her role in the "struggle in clandestinity" at the neighbourhood level.

> I didn't go out into the street much, or whatever, to protest because my preoccupation, my struggle, as we say, was more than anything in my home, because I lent my home for many clandestine meetings. There were high-level persons contrary to the regime having meetings, showing us slides... and showing us films that they brought from Santiago... Also I lent my home for making *miguelitos*, those molotovs... There they had... the mimeograph machines, my sons were always making pamphlets... I was the whole day in my house dispatching things to the people. "We came to look for this. We came to look for this other." "Come in. Come in." And me watching and watching that nobody saw us. Looking for material, looking even for tires. "We're going to make barricades, we need wood, we need all this." And me "sure, take it, take it"... There were many things that I suffered in that time, like I say, without being an active militant or whatever. But that was my struggle. That was my struggle.

By definition, clandestine work required that identity be protected. The young activists often wore balaclavas or handkerchiefs as they occupied the barricades or incited the crowd with megaphones from the back of a truck. In hindsight, women laughed about the incongruence of this practice because "everyone knew my ass" or "he always wore the same sandals" or "where is A. or S. going to hide with a voice like that?"

88

There were abundant examples of **acts of solidarity and resistance**. One task, often (but not always) borne by women, was to "make a presence, "to "bear witness" or to "make a denunciation." Sometimes mothers and neighbours watched out for youth during street actions and on the barricades. One mother told me that she got involved in the movement, in part, to alleviate the anguish she experienced when her children went out. She described her role. "I went out to see where the youth were, what they were doing, for example. So they would realize that there were always people [watching out for them]." Her daughter contributed her own perspective.

> We were there putting together a barricade and all that stuff. And I
> suddenly looked to the front and there were a whole lot of older people
> in one entire corner. My mother told me that ... there were many relatives
> of the kids who were there, of the youths that were there. So then when
> the military came, they started to yell, "run, run" because they knew that
> they were coming towards us. In the end, the people closest to you, or the
> neighbour that was involved in the Young Communists or the party, had
> that role.

Neighbours were trained to shout out and make any kind of commotion to undercut the secrecy of detentions. "You made a [denunciation] when they took someone to prison," clarified one woman, "you put at the house 'from this house, they took so-and-so.' Like they did with C. 'From this house, they took C. and his son. The CNI [secret police] has them.' So that they would see that." In another example, an entire neighbourhood responded instantly to word that the whole of one family had been detained – mother, father and three youths. *Vecinos* and *vecinas* (neighbours) bore witness to their forcible removal from the home, stood vigil at the family home, and organized denunciations. Over a period of a number of months, the family members were released one by one.[40]

Some unique activities were calculated to make particular political statements. The activity described here was designed to underscore the dire economic situation.

> We went to the supermarket, the only supermarket that there was. Then,
> we filled the carts with groceries. And when it came to the moment to
> move to the cashier, we left them there. We left a symbol as well because
> not everyone had access to those groceries, only those at some [economic]
> levels.

> And they left them there and said, "I can't take these because I don't have
> any money. My husband is unemployed. This is what I must buy but I
> can't buy it because I have no money"... It was like leaving evidence of
> the things that were happening at the time.

On another occasion, fifteen to twenty women drew attention to class divisions and the injustice of the military regime when they disrupted a special mass.

89

The other thing we did... and [now] we think it was quite risky. Here in Chile, for September 18 [Chilean Independence Day], they do a *Te Deum*. It's a special mass that is celebrated in the cathedral in all the cities in the country, where all the authorities of the province attend and of course, the military and the armed forces, those with high rank. So, it's a day of ceremony where not even the community of that church participates but it is a special ceremony... [We decided to go there and mix in as best we could until] we would sing the national anthem. But only to where it was *our* anthem, without singing the stanzas that they added during the dictatorship, and add on a little yelling in the part that said "freedom" or "against oppression"... The anthem started and then we started our show. Of course, when they heard our voices, they began to turn around. Everyone was surprised, but they couldn't do anything, they were officiating the mass and they couldn't do anything. But in that moment that we did it, we were surrounded by military... I feel that it was like completing a commitment. It was something that we had to do and besides, it mutually fortified us.

One young university student, nine months pregnant, chained herself to the cathedral

> ... as a form of protest against the accusations against the student leader, her husband, who is placed incommunicado in the Detention Centre ... Her purpose was to remain there until they lift the communication ban and retract the accusations against [him] and moreover, she requested that a doctor attend the detained person. Police arrived on the scene and proceeded to tear the posters and to cut the chains with a special tool. Before this, they ordered the students and others to depart... ("Se encadenó esposa de dirigente preso," 1988, p. 7)

Communal survival-oriented activities were plentiful across the country (and indeed throughout Latin America). Their various expressions are frequently grouped into the concept of "women's movement" because of the overwhelming representation of women in these activities and also because such activities were instigated in response to the women's difficulty, during the economic repression of the regime, in fulfilling their traditional roles as caregivers. Moreover, they are credited with a powerful public and personal consciousness-raising role.[41] The powerful phenomenon of collective handicraft workshops common in the capital city (e.g., *arpilleras*) does not seem to have appeared in Arica. In fact, I did not hear reference to any popular income-generating projects. However, there were many and varied forms of communal feeding activities. For example, in church courtyards, Catholic women cooked and served daily meals for university students in collective "dining rooms" (*comedores universitarios*). Collective kitchens (*ollas comunes*) are probably the most well known of these types of activities and have been emulated in other regions of the world. Two neighbouhood leaders described the origin, purpose and functioning of the *olla común* in their *población*, the first and the largest in Arica (with 120 families at one point). For one, a single mother of four,

90

economic necessity was paramount ("for my part, frankly, it was a necessity") but the other emphasized the consciousness-raising aspect. "More than anything, it was like a protest against the government because we had to do something to bring attention to the whole world." But it wasn't easy to get started. The women went house-to-house looking for people that could contribute and participate. People were afraid at first. The word "*olla*" (pot) was synonymous with "communist" and they had heard of the repression against the *ollas comunes* in Santiago. But, after a short period of operating secretly,

> we lost our fear. One day, we cooked with the military and shared the food with the tanks over here. Yes, later the door was open... At least, we were never detected; I mean they knew that there was an *olla* here because we had a military on the corner, a policeman over there. Yes, never. It was because they were neighbours, it was never so hard as in Santiago, where the repression was worse.[42]

The problem of cooking in huge quantities required a creative solution.

> We had to use washing machines, those big round washing machines. We sent them to be soldered below and we filled them to the top. There were hundreds of plates [of food] that came out of there because every family had four plates, five plates, ten plates.

Apart from families, many university students lived in that *población* and participated as well.

The *olla común* was highly organized with a definitive schedule of roles, responsibilities and activities for buying, preparing, and cooking the food as well as for organizational meetings, financial accounting, and for selling favourite local foods to raise money to "buy more meat, for example." Politically, the organizers were leftists but members included Christian Democrats and right wing people. So, the women "did not touch on the political theme" because, if they had, "most of the people would run away" or "immediately close their doors."

As with the *ollas comunes*, **human rights groups** motivated by mothers' concerns for their loved ones are usually included within the Latin American women's movement. In Arica, there were various organizations with this purpose, AFAVIR (mentioned above) being one such example. At least one of the participants in this study was an underground human rights leader and a number of others were members of the various human rights organizations, including the Human Rights Commission. One of the most demoralizing actions of the military regime in Arica was the detention of nineteen professionals including the entire Human Rights Commission in 1984, leaving all of the

91

activists unprotected. This tragic event is sadly remembered as *la Pascua Negra* (the Black Christmas).

A powerful human rights group was *El Movimiento Contra la Tortura Sebastián Acevedo*. This group was named after a man who burned himself at the steps of a cathedral in Concepción in 1983 protesting the detention of his son and daughter. Two months later, a Catholic priest spawned this non-violent human rights group (Derechos Chile, 2004). The group existed elsewhere in the country but, in the north, was most prominent in Arica. The women interviewees were careful to point out that men were also part of the group yet they credited women for the impetus that sustained all of the anti-dictatorship activities of the time. Members took a public, brave and non-violent approach to denouncing the abuses of the dictatorship. One of the group members described an action.

> We agreed to meet in a particular place that had to be a place that had a crowd because the idea was to denounce. Therefore, everything was organized and internally, there was a coordinator. And this coordinator established all the roles that were going to be completed by each one. And we went and gave the signal – the signal could be that someone would hug or kiss – and in that moment all of us were summoned from different sides, pretending that we didn't know each other. So, in the moment that they greeted each other, all of us that were there, grouped together. Those that had the banner opened the banner and [then we] made the denunciation. The action had various parts. We clapped first, then we read something, we made litanies, and afterwards we sang the song "*Yo te Nombro Libertad*" and [after five minutes] the group dissolved.

Their theme song ("And I Call You Freedom" by Paul Eluard) is another song that evokes powerful emotion among *Ariqeñas*. When sung at our learning/cultural event after the quote above was read aloud, everyone was reduced to tears. A verse and the chorus are translated here.

> For the tightened teeth
> For the restrained anger
> For the knot in the throat
> For the mouths that don't open
> For the clandestine kiss
> For the censured verse
> For the exiled youth
> For the prohibited names
>
> I name you... Liberty!

Chorus
I name you in the name of all.
By your true name
I name you and when it grows dark
when no one sees me
I write your name
on the walls of my city
I write your name
on the walls of my city
Your true name
Your name and other names
that I don't name, for fear.

I name you... Liberty!

Women also participated in a multitude of other kinds of **political and social movements** in Arica. Many of these same women simultaneously participated in CEDEMU, MODEMU or other facets of the women's movement. In fact, there was a great deal of cross-membership or cross-participation. While women did not comprise the entire membership of these elements of the anti-dictatorship movement, women were largest in number and were powerful influencers and activists during those years.

Many women belonged to *el Partido Comunista* or *las Joventudes Comunistas (la Jota)*.[43] As youngsters, some had been in *los Pioneros*, as well.[44] Clandestine cells were formed in schools, the university, workplaces, and the *poblaciones*. Some research participants represented the university communist cells, active in campus strikes and student demonstrations. Others were active in their *poblaciones*, setting up barricades, mobilizing the *vecino/as*, and establishing collective responses to economic survival.

The cultural component of the Communist Party was an important tool in the anti-dictatorship struggle. The folkloric group, *Chucarruma*, was often mentioned. Through music, dance, theatre, and poetry, this group of young communists publicly denounced the dictatorship by defiantly singing the banned songs and reciting the forbidden poems – cultural symbols that condemned injustice and oppression, bolstered solidarity, and offered hope. As well, popular theatre and children's events effectively served the same purposes.

> Like theatre, like folklore and music... On top of that, with the Theatre Group, we did *Pascuas Populares, Talleres Populares*. I mean, with stories, with games, everything that would entertain the children. And between the puppets and the theatre, we denounced... The generation of the 80s was after all, a struggle to denounce, to go out practically every day to the street to do cultural acts.

93

One single mother with six young children warmly recounted her experience with "the famous *Pascuas Populares*... [that were done] exclusively within the Communist Party."

> I remember one Christmas that was so emotional. I was with all my little kids, so hungry. And one night, knocking on the door, a disguised young person appeared and he gave me a package and he left. I never knew who he was but I knew that he was a kid from the collective in which I participated. Christmas bread, a chicken, jars of peaches, and underneath another bag with homemade games, old toys repaired by their hands. It was such a beautiful thing. For sure, because at that moment I didn't have anything to give to my children. They were running all over Arica where they knew that there were mothers alone, that their husbands were in prison or weren't there, whatever, and they arrived there.

Some young women were part of the communist brigade of artists who painted murals and slogans in public places at night, only to have them white-washed the next day by the military and to recreate the mural anew the next night. One such artist, while running away from the police on one particularly dangerous night,[45] dropped her paintbrush and went back for it despite the danger – a testament to the vital significance of this role in the struggle.

At least one woman interviewed was part of an armed communist paramilitary contingent.[46] She was reluctant to provide any clear information, saying only that, "there were other things that were more important than the protests, although we didn't leave them aside because they were important too. But there were more audacious things... Because it was not just about throwing a rock at the military. It was a thing of security... of the city."

In those years, the **Catholic Church** and liberation theology made a distinctive contribution to the women's movement in Arica. One woman who was very active in the church attested that,

> the church in Arica was fundamental in all the work of recovering democracy... The church played a fundamental role in terms of welcoming the people and of being the voice of those who had no voice, of taking risks with the people, who were oppressed.

Certain churches held significance for the women interviewed: *Iglesia de la Sagrada Familia, Iglesia del Carmen,* and *Parroquia Santa Cruz.*[47] These churches had foreign-born priests and nuns sympathetic to the anti-dictatorship movement; some were themselves members of the Communist Party. Activities were many: feeding students, providing a safe place for clandestine meetings and a sanctuary for the pursued and persecuted.

94

An especially important offshoot of the Catholic Church was (and still is) the NGO, *Servicio Para la Paz y la Justicia* (SERPAJ) from within whose auspices the Sebastián Acevedo Movement Against Torture was established.[48] In Arica, this group was founded in 1979. One of the founders reflected on its role in Arica.

> I believe that SERPAJ was like the authority that permitted many people to get together, many people. Because we did a series of discussion encounters, all in the church. They were a bit camouflaged but it permitted us to get together and converse about what was happening and how we could reorganize and reconstitute the social fabric... So, beginning from those encounters, people who had the motivation regarding human rights, who were waiting for the possibility to get together with others to discuss, started to get together.

The church's educational activities were also important in raising the consciousness of the population to the abuses of the dictatorship. One privileged woman attributed her "metamorphosis" near the end of the dictatorship to her church where she went to a seminar about the human rights abuses. Once she realized that she had been deceived by the whole apparatus of the dictatorship, she "opened her eyes" and started on a totally new life course of feminist work with women in the *poblaciones*. Another participant was part of the first aid brigade organized by her church that tended to the wounds of those injured in neighbourhood street actions.

The list of activities is seemingly endless, but what is most amazing is that a relatively small percentage of the populace was actually involved. Among the women, as many as 3000 might congregate for a massive demonstration but the force behind this group was probably around 100 women, most of whom participated in this study. The women say that they made a few appear as if many, largely by appearing everywhere that protest or denunciation erupted and by working endlessly and tirelessly ("like ants"), prompting the myth that they were many and especially powerful.

This "being everywhere" came at great cost, however. Women with children and husbands at home had "triple work because the woman went out into the street and she had to arrive home to cook ... [and she] had to watch her children." Others fuelled by the energy, passion and fearlessness of youth, fit activities into almost every hour of every day.

> We slept very little. What happened was this: I got up at 7:00 to go to work. I finished working at 1:00. I ate lunch and from there, until 3 or 4 in the morning, [I was] in all of this. For example, we went to SERPAJ from 3 to 5. After that, we went to *Chucarruma* from 6 to 8. From there, we went to the Association [AFAVIR] from 8 to 10. From there we went somewhere else from 10 to 12. After that, we went to the clandestine

activities in the street in the night, from 12 or 1 in the morning until 3 or 4 in the morning, doing things. From there, to sleep for 2 or 3 hours, [then] to work again. We slept little. But one goes around being involved, being involved, without thinking of it like an agenda.

While some of the activities were public, such as demonstrations or events organized around major dates like International Women's Day, many others were clandestine, requiring high levels of secrecy for security and participation through the night. Parents and children, husbands and wives, siblings did not know in what each was involved. One young couple, believing that each was having an affair, independently sought counsel from Communist Party comrades who assured them that their spouse's unexplained absences and unusual behaviour were not symptoms of an amorous tryst but of clandestine party activity. To this day, the couple, now separated, knows nothing more specific than this. Mothers knew the risk they took when they went to the streets and they suffered for the risks their children took. While the women suffered many repercussions from these years of struggle, none repent of their heartfelt commitment.

The richness of the learning intrinsic to this period is captured in countless phrases related to their growth and activity. Phrases such as "it served to awaken me," "it did us a favour in that sense because it liberated us" or "the street was our school." Clearly, the women learned numerous practical skills simply because "it was necessary to know things" such as how to operate a mimeograph machine, make Molotov cocktails, resist detention and torture, organize a protest, speak publicly, organize massive events on a moment's notice, and cook for the entire neighbourhood, along with numerous other requirements for learning to manage or overcome the challenging material conditions of their lives. Self-esteem, self-confidence, empowerment and undoubtedly, leadership skills, were strengthened in the course of their activism. In a very tangible way, women became increasingly aware of "the capacity of women to do things."

Many, like the woman quoted next, said that if not for the dictatorship, they would be stuck in their homes still, a slave to their husbands and children. "I achieved much more as a person and I grew more. I grew as a woman more in that time. All of that thanks to the dictatorship. If not for the dictatorship I would always have been more delayed in that sense." Through the contribution, whether overt or not, of feminism in the women's movement, women also gained a different perspective on themselves as women in Chilean society and acted from that position in the years that followed.[49] A union and human rights leader tried to put feminism aside for time but, "it begins to surface over there, right? After that... it starts to get into you like a little bug. Truthfully, when you

96

begin to know more as a woman, to want more as a woman, to grow, you get involved in the whole story, you begin from there."

A woman, now in her late thirties and raising a young child, claimed that "you have a capacity of a larger analysis and you have more capacity to see… [And in the end], you are left with that learning and that learning you transmit to your children as well… [And it] influenced me quite a bit in my work as a teacher, as an educator." Thus, critical learning was also profoundly woven within their experiences and activated in their lives. As one woman exclaimed, "what didn't I learn?"

Without doubt, what the women salvaged most from this period was the solidarity. This sentiment generated the most nostalgia by far.

> The solidarity, the ties that were created between all of us, a very strong sisterhood. The pain of the other, the help that each one could offer, not only material but also emotional. I believe that that was very important... And I tell you that I believe that despite the time, despite that many have lost that permanent connection... every time we meet, even if we haven't seen each other for five or six years, it's an outward happiness, a very wonderful feeling... with a lot of happiness and a lot of caring. I believe that those ties are so strong that time won't forget or diminish them.

Solidarity was related to security, sharing, "profound" friendships, managing fear, common purpose, life and death, and "maximum union." A *pobladora* picks up on the last point. "When we want to do something united, we can do a lot. When we are disunited, we do nothing. With unity and the struggle and everything synchronized, we did many things."

The Movement in Transition: 1988-90

Towards the end of the dictatorship years, after five or more years of sustained struggle in the myriad ways described above, the Arica movements were pacified by three particularly significant events: the visit of Pope John Paul II in April 1987 (who deeply disappointed Catholics and non-Catholics alike in the popular sector by not speaking out against the abuses of the regime), the formation of the *Concertación por la Democracia* in 1997 (the coalition of center-left political parties negotiating with the regime, that excluded the more revolutionary factions such as the Communist Party – a big blow for Arica), and the jubilant victory of the plebiscite in October 1988. Although the campaign waged in favour of the NO vote successfully mobilized all the opposition factions and resulted in victory, the triumph contributed to a sense of false security and an erroneous feeling that the battle was won, the work finished.

97

In the following quote, one leader shares her perspective on what happened in the final years of the dictatorship.

> Would you believe me that I didn't hope for anything? Not in the way the dictatorship terminated, no. For me, my hopes started to change after the visit of the Pope... I thought that Chile would have a different exit. I'm not talking about an armed exit but a different exit, a more democratic exit... After that came all the overturning of what had been the social movements in Chile. There was a change of, I don't know, of attitude, I don't know, a change of vocabulary. People that were abroad started to come in. The vocabulary of the opposition began to change. Without letting go of the inclination to get Pinochet out... it pacified the social movements, but incredibly so. And more, there was a tremendous manipulation of the social movement with the coming of the Pope because the truthful people wanted to talk and in the end, they didn't let them talk... And after the visit of the Pope, I saw a change, a total and absolute change in many people, in many people, in a lot of the discourse, a lot of the radio, a lot of the music. Everything changed from this incredible influence, incredible. The people fell sleep with the famous discourse that everything will come from heaven... that love was stronger than continuing to fight.

These events occurring in temporal proximity started a downward spiral of movement decline that was fuelled by many other factors as well: emotional and physical fatigue, fear that the tenuous coalition could topple, disillusionment with the process and goals of the coalition, lack of a sturdy ideological basis to the movement, return of traditional political actors (political parties and unions), and the now-apparent effect of the unanswered question of what would happen after the prime objective was won (i.e., lack of vision). Both the women and the literature credit the steadfastness of their purpose with the successful overthrow of the dictatorship in 1989, but also with the narrow strategizing, utilitarian coalitions, and truncated vision of the oppositional forces in the last years of the dictatorship (see for example Waylen, 1993). Many women now recognized that they had not prepared themselves adequately for anything beyond the daily struggle.

> We went out into the streets as women. So, we didn't prepare ourselves politically, we didn't educate ourselves as women. We forgot this part of ourselves because we didn't see any ambitions for the future. We saw nothing more than that this country was weighed down with pain, with *pena* [bitter sadness], with hunger, with misery.

Despite these understandings, however, the women were perpetually puzzled and saddened about the demise of the once-strong women's movement. Over and over again, with heads sadly shaking, women said, "*se fueron para la casa*" – they went home.

Act III: *La Continuación*

Despair and Hope: 1990-present

It is somewhat ironic that the women expanded their sphere of action and influence beyond their homes during the dictatorship – an arguably inhospitable period for women's organizing – only to retreat to their homes again upon the return of "democracy."[50] "We fought better in the dictatorship. It's sort of paradoxical," voiced a MODEMU leader. Women in Arica were well aware of the countless gender-specific and other social problems yet to be tackled in Chile. "It isn't the kind of work that [you can say] 'now we overthrew the dictatorship, done, the tyrant is gone'." "We knew that it wasn't going to be so easy to eradicate seventeen years, that we had to continue the struggle." Thus, the current situation in Chile is particularly baffling for the women. As one young woman asked aloud, "why did the woman who left her home to fight, return to her home?" The women often speculated on the reasons for this phenomenon. Representative of the most common explanations, one of the leaders of the feminist movement in Arica provided the following five-part analysis, which warrants inclusion in its entirety for its thoroughness and thoughtfulness.

> I believe that [the women] were the motor of the social movement in Chile and it's a pity that it has been lost. [Q: What happened?] It passed. I believe that there were various factors.

> One, the return of the political parties that, through their party activities, restricted the parallel activities. I mean, democracy arrived and the women went to their parties and to their home, those that didn't have a party. So, the organizations didn't continue to function. I believe that many people thought that with democracy there would be no need for more organizations. That was a big mistake. I think that was one of the things.

> And another that has been eroded, that stopped the movement, is the loss of hope, the anger, the impotence to see that so many things that they had thought they were going to see in democracy haven't been possible in any of the three governments of the *Concertación*. And even less are they going to be possible in a government of the right.

> And the other factor is that the women, unfortunately in the history of the women's movement in Chile – and I don't know, the world, I dare say – in Chile for sure, it is sort of cyclical. There are the big events that move great numbers of women, in the time of the suffragettes, in the time of MEMCH, in the time of the dictatorship. In the time of the Popular Unity [government], the women were the first that went out to protest against the government, the women from the right. And it has always been

99

cyclical like this. According to the events, there is mobilization for a time. These, I believe are the factors.

And another is the incapacity of our movement to recognize the women's movement, to maintain a homogenous movement or to have had a common line of thought, to learn to work through the diversity, respecting the differences – a thing that we don't know how to achieve even in the feminist movement, much less in the other movements. There are fewer things that unite. There are many political disagreements. The political parties, I believe, have done a slim favour to the popular and women's movements.

And another is the thing of the church. The churches have stopped being the centre that we knew at least in the period of the dictatorship, the center of meetings, the centre where the women met, the focus of work, the focus of solidarity work – they lost this as well. The doctrine of the church has changed the political discourse of the church a lot from what it was before to what it is now. The conservative church in Chile has a large presence and that influences women enormously.

So, in that aspect, I believe that those are the reasons for which the women's movement has not emerged, it hasn't re-emerged, despite the things that have happened and despite having been such a strong movement.

Thus, her analysis includes the common elements identified in the literature (see for example Alvarez, 1990; Craske, 1998; Franceschet, 2001; Hellman, 1992; Schild, 1991; Schuurman, 1993; Waylen, 2000).[51] Most frequently discussed by the women themselves were the first two themes, political parties and emotions.

When the political process was reconstituted, little space was left for the women's movement. Some women blamed the political parties because "it was they that demolished what could have been a great organization of women [through] the lack of vision, the lack of tolerance, the lack of recognition of some questions." There was an erroneous assumption that other social organizations were unnecessary. The women perceived this as a "great political error," "because, imagine the country that we would have now if they had taken advantage" of the women's solidarity, collaboration, creativity and organizational skills.

All the interviews bear testament to the kinds of emotions referred to in the quote above. As *solidaridad* is the hallmark emotion of the anti-dictatorship struggle, so is *pena* the key emotion of the post-dictatorship era. *Pena* is a word with complex emotional significance that is not easily translatable into English. For these women, it signifies a deeply felt combination of bitter pain and sorrow arising out of severe disappointment at the outcome of their efforts. "It's good that we achieved democracy. I believe that the

100

objective was completed, that is, if we no longer have the dictatorship. But, for me, I have been disillusioned by the democracy that we have." The word *'pena'* projects the image of the sad and frustrated shaking of one's head as one painfully contemplates a promising destiny gone awry.

Nonetheless, I also heard the idiom "*vale la pena*" in the context of their movement participation, meaning that, regardless of the limited outcome, it was worth all their pain and sorrow. The older women were especially unequivocal in this respect. "I don't regret anything that I did, nothing, nothing. If I had to live it again, I believe that I would live in the same way or maybe with more risk, try to do more things." But not all of the younger women were as certain. "Sometimes I think that if I were born again, I don't know if I would do it again." For all the women, the loss experienced most strongly is the loss of solidarity. The male research assistant observed that "it is incredible that they remember the era of the dictatorship with such fondness because it was the time of friendship, of solidarity, of other things. Despite all the problems, there was that which has now disappeared."

On another explanation put forth by the leader above, some felt that the women themselves did not adequately take advantage of the power at hand, that the opportunities slipped through their fingers. Towards the end of her account of the first *Mujeres de Luto*, the speaker becomes tearful and interjects, "I get angry, you know, because we haven't taken advantage of all that." This feeling is also apparent in the following exchange between a CEDEMU and a MODEMU leader.

> CEDEMU: Do you think that there was a certain quota of responsibility in those women that participated in those instances, like MODEMU and CEDEMU, with respect to the others that were *pobladoras*, in terms of education?
>
> MODEMU: I believe so. I believe that we lived responding to daily happenings, in the contingency, we lived the contingency. And afterwards, each one went to her home. What was missing was the preparing of ourselves for afterwards.
>
> CEDEMU: We had so many women in our hands, so many; an incredible power of calling the women together.

Apart from the possible culpability of the leaders, one of the youngest women activists sagely pondered, "and maybe we lived as *pobladoras* and we didn't realize either what was necessary to maintain an organization, what was necessary to maintain an activity with others, I mean, more than just greeting each other." Often, women said that they were not prepared for what was to come, not adequately educated politically. Younger

101

women complained that they were not prepared for democracy, not having experienced it themselves except vicariously through their parents. Women complained that "the people today have no possibility to make their own decisions because they don't have the tools," that "we women weren't prepared to be involved... There was no work to say how we were going to maintain democracy and maintain it in good form," that "the people today are not capable of solving their own problems of life," and that they are missing the "elements for democracy."

While there were various degrees of disappointment and cynicism, no one in this sample of women was satisfied that they had achieved what they thought they were fighting for. This sentiment was common: "In truth, I was happy that Pinocho was gone and I knew that difficult times were coming, but I never thought it would be so much. I thought that *something* would happen." Without any purposeful intention or prompting, women invariably raised their concerns about the current situation in Chile. Even among those who no longer formally belonged to a political party or those who considered themselves apolitical (not those who were formally interviewed), an urbane analysis of the political situation was part of everyday conversation in Chile.[52] The list of disappointments was long and had endured through the three governments to date.

- Ongoing amnesty, immunity from prosecution, lack of accountability regarding the human rights abuses, and no answers about the whereabouts of the disappeared.

- Continuation and escalation of the privatization of industry and public services (health care, pensions, unemployment insurance, education, utilities). For example, in the guise of "health care reform," the neo-liberal vision of health care, *Plan Auge*, was being sold to the people while I was there, but no one I talked to was buying it.

- No reform to the Constitution that was last re-written by the military government in 1980. Everyone recognized the central importance of this foundational document. "As long as there is no change in the Constitution, we are going to continue as we are."

- The binominal electoral system that favours the right. While I was there, a well-respected socialist physician in Arica garnered the most number of votes in the congressional elections, but did not win the seat. Although the "winners" are determined by a complicated mathematical formula, most people I talked to seemed to understand it clearly and recognized the built-in discrimination against the left.

- Growing poverty. One unemployed older woman, who had raised six children mostly on her own while an underground leader, equated her grinding poverty to violence. "Is it not violence to be living every day thinking about what I will cook tomorrow, where I will work, where I will live? This is violence. And everyday we are violated, women above all

102

because we are the leaders of the home, those that educate the children. And we are violated daily."

Women recognized that these issues are all related to neo-liberalism and were legacies of the dictatorship but, beyond that, they felt betrayed by the *Concertación*, especially the current socialist president, who are blamed for their "political turnaround" and "broken promises." Politicians were criticized for "accommodating" to the status quo and "taking advantage" of political openings. Especially disparaged were those that came from exile to assume high posts in the new government and those that had "abandoned" the Communist Party to jump on the bandwagon of the government in power. Additionally, people almost constantly spoke bitterly about *pituto* – the pervasive practice of favouring members of the political party in power for jobs.[53] Women who held public office or worked in the government, were the most critical. For example, "in Chile, the municipal councils don't have any decision-making power... It is a very undemocratic system." Cracks in their allegiance to the party in power were visible. One understood the need for caution in the early years of the transition but was frustrated with the continuously "slow" movement on social problems when "you see that there are no changes."

For all these reasons, there is a high level of cynicism among the population. Cynical references to the current democracy were rampant (e.g., "pseudo-democracy", "so-called democracy," "democracy, in quotes," "supposed democracy," "the famous democracy") as were derisive references likening the current situation to the previous democracy (e.g., "white dictatorship," "civil dictatorship," "dictatorship in suits and ties"). To the laughter of others, one woman said, "it is a penis that has only changed its underwear." But behind their jokes is a serious concern. Referring to the movement to the right evident in recent elections, one woman issued a general warning.

> That gives us some pretty interesting signals that we should reflect upon. Chileans have to reflect upon some things... It shows us where our country is strongly going at this time – to a government of the right, but a government with more terrible characteristics than has come before. Why? Precisely because of a hidden populism. Today, the right in Chile has the flags of the struggle that the left had, the same discourse. "We must change." "The poor have nothing." And this is all disguised so it is very dangerous. And it is dangerous precisely because our country and our people are not going to realize when they have another dictatorship on top of them... a civil dictatorship. Not with uniforms but with ties and whatever, that, in the end, is the same because they move the same.

103

And in all kinds of ways, the women concurred: "There is no democracy. Because democracy is not a question of a title. Democracy is a question of effective participation of the people. And there is none. Because they closed all the channels to the people."

What happened to the women themselves? Women entering that meeting in 1983 could not have envisioned the long and difficult road their lives would take nor how their commitment would affect the lives of others. Today, women are differentially affected by their previous activism. Most of the elder women (now over 45) returned to their traditional places in homes and families, albeit with new understandings, strengths and convictions. "The dictatorship did us a favour in that sense because it liberated us. I, for one, was stuck in the house all my life. So women became more independent... and learned to value [themselves] more." Although a few are left unemployed or underemployed and/or have separated from their husbands, for most the anti-dictatorship struggle was a traumatic, but passing, bump in their life's path.

The younger women, however, (those between 30 and 45) lived their formative years in the contradictory reality of repression and resistance from which they learned their world, their citizenship, their identities. "I was raised in the dictatorship. I was born in the dictatorship... The dictatorship formed me." Today, they must maneuver the contradictions between the two as part of daily life with observable effects on their relationships, their careers, and their choices. Due to their sudden jettison into politics, they were not as strongly situated ideologically as the older women. Today, they are neither politically active nor involved in movements. They have retreated to work with youth and personal development as a way to rebuild and recover their lost youth and build the youth of tomorrow.[54]

And what of the women's organizations? – remembering that, for the majority of the women, the outcome of the meeting in October 1983 was that "first we will organize ourselves to protest the dictatorship and then when the dictatorship is gone, then we will see to the other" ("the other" referring to feminist/gender issues).

Since the final days of the dictatorship, CEDEMU has been an established but small feminist NGO that focuses on women's rights, needs and issues (e.g., abortion and contraceptive rights and violence against women). These women today still carry the torch of a much-diminished feminist movement, although other similar organizations have also emerged. Of the success of their work, a CEDEMU leader reflected:

> The women will never see things the same way again. I mean, they have
> the information that allows them to reflect and that allows them to
> analyze, and that allows them to question... And together with that,

104

incorporating the issues of women, of gender, and... the political consciousness they have. So this is a question that the women – at least the women that passed through CEDEMU, the women that heard our discourse, the women that came to know what we were saying and what we were doing – no longer can say that they don't have the elements to be able to reflect, to be able to analyze the issues. [Q: Can you say this about all the women that passed through CEDEMU?] I believe, that for eighty percent of them... Including the women that [we have] attended in the area of violence. They are women that see things in another way today.

Since the dictatorship, MODEMU exists within the Communist Party in name only with a president and treasurer but little activity. Yet to some degree it still holds the power to call together women for specific events.

In retrospect, some women speculated that the division of the movement and the lack of a "study" component was a strategic error. They later recognized a need to have also prepared for what would come after the dictatorship, i.e., What would the new democracy look like and what would be women's place in it? – just as the CEDEMU organizers initially suggested. Some women felt that the near demise of MODEMU proves the point – the organization could not sustain itself once the sole objective for their action was achieved. Other women claimed that CEDEMU and the "gender perspective" have now rightly gained prominence, in the aftermath of the anti-dictatorship struggle. None are satisfied that women have made substantial social or economic gains since the fall of the dictatorship nor that they any longer have a visible presence to make such demands.

Of the other parallel organizations that were mainly populated and led by women, I do not know if any of the human rights organizations continue to exist in Arica, although attention to the tragedy of the disappeared remains constant. As part of a national organization, SERPAJ is probably the most solidly established social organization in Arica at this time. It continues to work with the poorest of families, many of which are headed by sole females and who experience multiple challenges including drug abuse. The *Centros de Madres* retain the more conservative character instilled during the dictatorship and the *Juntas de Vecinos* (Neighbourhood Councils), while still having significant numbers of women at the head, are falling to the right. "[They are] something we have given away for free," one woman wistfully stated. The women holding political positions in Arica felt alone with no help to "do good work."

There has been a general exodus from political parties among this group of women. Few of the participants still hold party membership, even among those who were committed communists, many of whom were previously in leadership positions. Women became

105

disillusioned with their party's inability to adapt to changing times, to attract youth, and to deal with women's issues.

The official government apparatus for women, SERNAM, a concession won by the feminist contingent during coalition negotiations, holds little relevance for the women in Arica (among all the interviews, it was spontaneously mentioned only twice). According to the ex-governor of the province,

> women [in Arica] don't feel represented by SERNAM... The policy of SERNAM has come from very high up; there is very little participation... There has to be a re-evaluation of the policies of SERNAM.

As governor she successfully participated in advocating for a small SERNAM office in Arica because "it is super complicated to think that you have to solve your problems in Iquique." For those who participated actively in the women's movement and still work directly with women in the popular sectors, it is especially galling that SERNAM arose from their struggles but is no longer responsive to their needs. In the opinion of a CEDEMU leader, "the *Concertación* has lost the possibility to do many things with SERNAM because they could have mounted a fine women's movement from there, working with women for real change, but they blew it." In later interviews, I specifically asked about SERNAM. One *pobladora's* response was typical: "I don't have any idea what SERNAM is."

Yet, SERNAM receives much of the attention in the literature. While many critique SERNAM's course, especially its institutionalization and distance from the grassroots (Schild, 1998b; 2000; Waylen, 1997; 2000), some analysts predict a possible re-articulation of the women's movement in Chile as evidenced by the formation of networks that represent a collection of diverse women's organizations[55] who are strategically using the discourse of women's equality offered by SERNAM to get their demands met (Franceschet, 2003).

I saw little evidence of this in Arica. Women talked about the lack of concern, the apathy and lethargy of their communities. Her aggravation at the retreat of women is apparent in this MODEMU leader's words.

> There is nowhere to go to try to get the women out of that numbness. It's like a lethargy. It's like we are so full of problems, *so* full of problems, that one whines everyday. But you see that they do nothing. I don't know if the television and the soap operas stunted the mind of those women fighters.

106

I heard their frustration, their resignation, and their hopelessness. These feelings permeated many of the interviews and imbued me with their apparent pessimism. When asked directly, a CEDEMU leader said, "I don't see anything yet, unfortunately not. There have been attempts but nothing has prospered... I don't see an emerging movement." None had expectations for large-scale change but many hoped for practical improvements such as better health, a nice home for their retirement, easier lives for their children, legalized abortion.

Yet, even though women often admitted to "retreating" or "opting out," to being "inactive" or "stagnant" and many had "abandoned the [party] militancy," hidden within their stories are various references to possibilities. The same CEDEMU leader that doesn't "see anything yet" suggested that there are "spaces of participation" such as the local NGOs like SERPAJ with youth, or APACHETA and TEA with indigenous peoples. The ex-governor provided examples of grassroots organizations of women, and cited the high number of women in leadership positions in the *Juntas de Vecinos* and in student councils. One younger woman, active in popular theatre, declared, "if I want to participate politically, I don't need to belong to a party." Another, while at the same time claiming to be in "an indefinite recess" from participation, put forth an assortment of ideas for working with youth in the *poblaciones*. President Lagos' appointment of one women's movement leader to the post of provincial governor, the first in their province, was an important milestone for women because, in the view of one *pobladora*, "one saw the protagonism of a woman in the regional government of Arica." The ex-governor, now in the ministry of education, attributes the respect she has garnered to her emphasis "on the social part" and "local interests," and to "having been close to the people." She also noted the importance of listening to people. This last element was reiterated by a current city councilor. "Many people come to talk with you about their problems and you try to solve them however you can... There is a need to listen."

In this group of women were many who were not content to "stay without doing anything." Among the research participants were members of the CEDEMU, MODEMU and SERPAJ leadership, an ex-governor, a city councilor, a popular theatre actor, a feminist artist, and numerous teachers, counsellors and child care workers. From CEDEMU's perspective, "the little influence that the women's movement has is through a small movement and achievements [are made] because there are groups of very committed women that move things." CEDEMU itself is a clear example of the stubborn endurance of a visible socialist-feminist praxis in Arica and MODEMU tries yet "to reactivate the organizations... [so] that there would be civic education."

107

One of the most enduring representations of the women's movement in Arica is *Mujeres de Luto* "because it is a space of vindication from the point of view of human rights" and because it "is also a symbol of the strength of women." Some women say that "there is a commitment that can't die, that we still have to be there," others have just dropped off, and a rupture in the leadership prompted one woman to initiate a solitary act across from the cathedral. Only one woman said, "I withdrew because the objective for which we were working was democracy and it was achieved." Today, the event carries on with fewer numbers, except for the notable exception of the 30th anniversary of the coup in 2003 when 200 women participated.

Moreover, I did see a keen interest among the women in recounting their experiences, a desire to regain the commitment and solidarity of the past, and a sophisticated analysis of their current situation. I saw CEDEMU holding on to its vision despite significant barriers. I saw the re-emergence of cultural forms more common during the dictatorship years such as *peñas* (a particularly northern cultural event incorporating music and dances attributed to the indigenous culture of the region) and *tambos*, where familiar folkloric and resistance songs are sung.

Some, especially the older women, expected something to happen again in the future. "I have confidence that, in some way, things will fall from their own weight... There is a saying that hope is the last thing lost." A few of the older women described themselves as "dreamers," "believers," and "optimists." During one interview, when a younger CEDEMU leader was despondent about the political situation, the eldest of the research participants responded, "but I believe there is still time, for example yourselves, in your organization." And there is some hope among the women that the youth will "make a better society."

But their optimism is tempered with caution. "If we don't open our eyes, if we don't stay alert" Chilean women may yet see suffering of the magnitude of Argentina after the 2002 economic collapse, said one woman. And the journey will be long. "I think that many years will pass before we can again say that we are really in a full democracy."

This tension between the "politics of despair and the politics of hope" is very apparent among the protagonists of the women's movement in Arica.[56]

> I am going to continue to struggle because I believe that it is the only way
> that human beings can go forward – continue to dream, to believe in a
> utopia, and to have internal strength. Because I believe that what I think
> is just, it is correct; it is what we have to do. Suddenly, we find ourselves
> with difficulties, with problems, but we are going to go forward... I
> believe that women will again show the way.[57]

108

These optimistic signs suggest that the women's movement in Arica may be dormant but by no means dead.

Summary

The women's movement in Arica has roots in a long history of activism by women and other marginalized sectors. The presidency of Salvador Allende, 1970-1973, moved the country along a socialist path that was brutally overthrown by a military coup on September 11, 1973. The antecedents of the Arica women's movement, therefore, included the historical precedent of a politicized consciousness and strong social and political organizations that were thrown into disarray by the severe repression of the military government. For the first ten years of the ensuing dictatorship, social organizations were quietly rearticulating. In Arica, as elsewhere in Chile, a convergence of factors prompted an explosion of resistance in 1983. The women's movement in Arica was born of a meeting held in October of that year. Among other organizations that developed in that time, the women's movement was most clearly represented by two parallel organizations, CEDEMU and MODEMU. Women's activism, while firmly situated within the anti-dictatorship movement, had a distinctly feminist character.[58]

After years of intense and varied activities in a repressive and clandestine environment, a plebiscite was won in 1988 that set the stage for elections in 1989 and the installation of a democratically elected president in 1990. During this two-year period, the women saw their own and other social movements decline for various reasons. Twelve years post-dictatorship, the women of Arica wondered how they arrived, after all their sacrifice and struggle, at the current situation – where they see only growing poverty and isolation in Arica and little real change for women. They were remembering and reflecting on their past, their present and their future and cautiously anxious to take action once again.

The history of the women's movement in Arica is dynamically related to the personal and collective narratives of its participants, particularly its main protagonists. Among CEDEMU's leaders, I was struck by the increasing clarity and intensity of their dedication to their feminist principles, their ambivalent relationship with the Communist Party, their creativity in finding ways to work despite the many obstacles, and the intense emotional intimacy in their relationships with each other – shifting alliances, re-conciliations, undying devotion.[59] MODEMU's leaders were warrior women – strong, brave, combative, and proud. I envision most clearly their public defiance, their single mindedness of purpose, and their courage. MODEMU women never questioned

their purpose; they had an unwavering faith in the justness and urgency of their cause. With little difficulty, I can imagine the experience described by the members of the *Movimiento Contra la Tortura Sebastián Acevedo* as they linked arms, held their ground, and sang with voices filled with sadness and with hope. By extending maternal feeling and responsibility outward from one's own home to an entire neighbourhood, as did the women in the *ollas comunes*, women politicized their private world and positioned it squarely in the public realm, precluding the theoretical distinctions between the polarities. [60] [61]

Sadly, I am left also with their grief, *pena*, bewilderment, disillusionment, and anger at the pacification and (a)quiescence of their once-powerful movement, submerged within a neo-liberal "pseudo-democracy" whose inherent contradictions leave little hope for the immediate future. However, if history is bound to repeat itself, it may be that the Arica women's movement is in a stage of quiet continuity once again where the women's foundational *conciencia*, astute socio-political analyses, and everyday actions weave quiet continuity from the legacy of the past to mobilization in the future.[62]

And so the curtain will rise on Act IV... Another meeting, another time?

Notes

---

[1] I gathered the information included here during nine months of ethnographic fieldwork in Arica. In addition to cultural immersion, research methods included document review and formal interviews. Interviews were conducted in Spanish with a total of 60 individuals including in-depth personal interviews, group interviews, and supplementary semi-structured interviews with local governmental and non-governmental organizations. All of the women I interviewed had been active in social and/or political movements in Arica at some time during the past 30 years. They ranged in age between 25 and 78 (with an almost equal split between those over and under 50) and represented women from all the left/centre parties, the Catholic Church, community kitchens, the University, and the popular neighbourhoods. I followed standard academic ethical procedures and dedicated particular attention to cultural differences and safety issues. I incorporated a variety of means for collaborative analytic reflection in the field. This paper (re)presents one set of findings – the women's account of their experience in the women's movement. Because the intent of this research project was to highlight the learning dimension of social movements, and such information was abundantly evident in the women's narratives, I have integrated their learning experiences within this paper. So as not to break the flow of the women's narrative, I append relevant literature in the endnotes.

[2] Note: All translations from transcripts and original sources in Spanish are mine.

110

[3] Linguistic note: In Spanish, all nouns are modified by a feminine or masculine modifier. When the noun is intended to represent both genders, the masculine modifier is typically used to signify gender neutrality. Following feminists in Chile, I use both modifiers as shown here so as to more clearly include both genders.

[4] This is in contrast to Iquique, the nearest Chilean city to Arica (300 km south), where there is more affluence, the economy is more robust, and which is the traditional seat of imperialist dominion.

[5] Drawn from a critical discourse and from the root word *pueblo* (common people), in both Spanish and English the word "popular," and its derivatives, generally connotes something related to the poorer sectors. For example, a *población* is a neighbourhood where *pobladores/as*, poor or common folk, live.

[6] The *Agrupación de Familiares de Detenidos Desaparacidos de Chile* published the statistics in this paragraph. The numbers are drawn from the government reports produced by the National Truth and Reconciliation Commission (Rettig Report) and the National Corporation for Reconciliation and Reparation. Similar statistics were published in the Washington Post (*Pinochet's Chile*, 2000). While statistics differ across sources, most agree that the available numbers are an underestimate of the true extent of the tragedy.

[7] Strongly influenced by adherents of the Chicago School of Economics, the military government applied international guidelines for a market economy within the first years of the coup. In fact, it is now well known that Chile functioned as the "neo-liberal laboratory" for the new global economy (Chavkin, 1985). This included economic austerity measures such as a reduced role for the state, market liberalization, export-driven economic development, and currency devaluation. In return for implementing these measures, debtor nations retained the right to remain in the world economy through injections of new loans, bilateral aid, and foreign investment. Adherents of these economic views proclaim that the well publicized economic growth in countries such as Chile vindicate their claims. Despite this triumphalism, however, distressingly similar critical analyses reveal the inadequacies and highlight the contradictions in the neo-liberal project. The net flow of capital remains reversed (i.e., to foreign corporations) while growing unemployment, a widening gap between rich and poor, spiraling poverty, and ecological destruction have clearly worsened in the new order. See for example, Pannu and Toh (1996) for a general analysis and Bresnahan (2003) for current analyses on Chile.

[8] In the 1990 election, Patricio Aylwin was the only candidate put forward in opposition to General Pinochet. Multiple candidates were again presented in the subsequent elections.

[9] See Bresnahan (2003) and the rest of the authors in this special edition for a discussion of the adverse effects of neo-liberal economics on the democratization process in Chile.

[10] The study of women's movements in Chile and elsewhere in Latin America has generated considerable interest (see for example Alvarez, 1990; Baldez, 2002; Chuchryk, 1989; Gaviola et al., 1994; Jaquette, 1989; Jelin, 1990c; Matear, 1997; Schild, 1994; Stephen, 1997; Sternbach et al., 1995; Valdés & Weinstein, 1993; Valenzuela, 1998; Waylen, 1993).

[11] The number of people killed at the school is contested. Depending on the source, the death toll is between 150 to 2000 (Equipo de Educación Popular, n.d.; Rojas, n.d.). In the text, I have used the statistic from Equipo de Educación Popular (n.d.).

111

[12] Gabriel González Videla was the elected president of Chile from 1946 to 1952. A member of the Radical Party, his party came to power in a coalition that included the Communist Party. However, in 1948 he turned against the communists, initially expelling communists from cabinet and then establishing the "Permanent Law of the Defense of Democracy" which made the Communist Party illegal. This commenced a period of persecution and imprisonment of communist leaders for which he established the first concentration camp in Chile at Pisagua, along the coastline between Arica and Iquique. For this brutal reversal, González Videla is known among the communists as "el Traidor" (the Traitor). General Pinochet reinstated the concentration camp at Pisagua in 1973. It was the site of documented executions and torture after the coup.

[13] Movement of the Revolutionary Left. It is also worth noting that a subset of women had changed party allegiances at various points in their lives and a number had also left their parties in recent years.

[14] This woman became a political leader and, eventually, the mayor of Arica during Allende's presidency. Immediately after the coup, she was imprisoned for a year and then sent to exile by the military junta. She was "hidden" (in her words) for 20 years in Spain, where she worked diligently against the dictatorship, before returning to Arica in 1995. In 2002, the mayor of Arica recognized her for her work with women. At the ceremony, she publicly reiterated that "her accomplishments have been the product of her formation in the Communist Party" (Olivares, 2002, p. A8).

[15] It is well documented that women comprised the majority of the membership and leadership positions in these community-based organizations (see for example Valdés & Weinstein, 1993).

[16] Through their community organizations, the pobladores/as then negotiated with the authorities to formally obtain the land and establish services in the community.

[17] Salvador Allende was elected to congress in 1937 and was Minister of Health 1939-1942. He was a senator for more than twenty years. He ran for president, unsuccessfully in 1931, 1958 and 1964, and then again successfully in 1970 as part of the Popular Unity coalition.

[18] According to Chavkin (1985), the JAP originated from a discussion between women's groups and the Minister of Economy. "The JAP was to operate in the neighborhoods. Women took an informal community census and set up a basis for rationing such items as sugar, rice, and bread. It was an unofficial operation, a kind of populist pressure action, to try to substitute for the anti-black market law that Allende tried and failed to push through Congress" (p. 203). Fifteen hundred of these groups were established throughout Chile.

[19] As part of the Allende platform to equalize resource distribution and educational access, every family was provided a litre of milk each day.

[20] Vicente Atencio was a Communist Party militant and municipal politician (he was a city councilor at the time of the coup). Many of the participants admired him for his good works and convictions and memorialized him for his tragic death. He was executed in the infamous desert concentration camp at nearby Pisagua. Some of his female relatives participated in this research study.

[21] There is little in the literature about the ten-year period preceding mass mobilization in 1983. Not surprising given the extreme repression. Indeed, a decree announced one

112

month after the coup declared that "the new government has the mission to eradicate Marxism from Chile." Under this umbrella, political parties (a number were specifically named in the decree), labour unions, agrarian reformers, indigenous leaders, and members of the religious community were persecuted (Derechos Chile, 2004). However, as the participants in this study and others in Chile attest, people organized and took action from the first days of the coup (Baldez, 2002; Valdés & Weinstein, 1993). An excellent example is provided by Gaviola, Largo and Palestro (1994) who meticulously document the early reaching out activities that were initiated by politicized women who felt a need "to do something," transferring their fear into "concrete action, at first informal" and then leading to formal organizations created mostly by women in response to the repression, and later still to the "seeds of a new force" in 1977-1982. This more closely parallels and clearly exemplifies the experience in Arica. It also resonates with literature that reveals the continuity between cycles of the women's movements in the United States (Taylor, 1989; Whittier, 1995).

[22] In Arica, *los viejos* commonly referred to the Communist Party leadership.

[23] This sense of necessity is present in countless analyses of radical activism (see for example Garland, 1988; Gaviola et al., 1994; Kane, 2001; Stephen, 1997; Wood, 2001). As I argue in another paper in this dissertation, I believe that the "necessity" which the women described is fundamentally related to the consciousness that they had developed earlier.

[24] *Peñas* are parties with Andean music and dancing. *Pascuas populares* are popular Christmas parties. *Talleres populares* are popular workshops. *Chucarruma* was a local musical/theatre group organized by the Young Communists.

[25] Historically, there have been women's departments and woman-only cells in the communist and other parties.

[26] The reference was to a region-wide biannual feminist conference that had recently been instituted. See Sternbach et al. (1995) for a helpful review of the first 10 years. In 1983, this meeting was held in Lima, Peru.

[27] The emergence of massive anti-dictatorship mobilization throughout the country in 1983 is typically credited to the severe economic downturn in 1982 (see for example Chavkin, 1985; Drake & Jaksic, 1991). Likewise in Arica, overt and massive resistance solidified in 1983 from many fronts. In relation to the women's movement, it seems almost magical that the year coincides with the rest of the country given that there was little connection between organizers from Santiago and Arica, and that the women themselves do not explicitly credit outside influences for their own emergence. It may be a testament to the geographic and political isolation of the city that the women's mobilization seems merely coincidental with other important events of the same period: the emergence of massive protest and women's activism in the capital, the 1982 publication of Julieta Kirkwood's (1986) seminal theoretical work on feminism in Chile, and the re-birth of MEMCH in 1983 (a women's organization previously active during the struggle for suffrage).

[28] This meeting is mentioned in the book from which this quote is drawn, *Una Historia Necesaria* (Gaviola et al., 1994). It is a book on the Chilean women's movement that makes a rare attempt to capture regional activities of the period. A woman who also participated in my study chronicles the brief section on Arica.

[29] *Pinocho* is the Spanish word for Pinocchio and is a derogatory reference to the Chilean dictator, General Augusto Pinochet.

113

[30] The tensions between feminism and socialism/marxism are well documented elsewhere. See for example, Chinchilla (1992), Hartsock (1983) and MacKinnon (1997).

[31] Women's Study Centre. Later it retained the acronym CEDEMU but was renamed *Casa de Encuentro de la Mujer* (Meeting Place for Women).

[32] MODEMU is the Movement for Women's Rights.

[33] Some authors theoretically distinguish between "feminine" activities that emerge from and support women's traditional roles (reactive) and "feminist" activities that actively question women's place in society (proactive) (Alvarez, 1990). There is also some relationship to Maxine Molyneux's (1998) practical-strategic distinction. Although I provisionally organized activities into these categories as part of the analytical process, I found the practice not only arbitrary but also confusing in the Arica context for a number of reasons. First, the women's movement in Arica was composed of a number of loosely related organizations and activities in which the same group of women cross-participated to one degree or another. Women frequently reported that, unlike their male comrades, the women worked together across party lines and organizational boundaries, for which they were often roundly criticized. Second, there are various kinds of activities, such as spontaneous acts, that do not fall into a particular category. Third, along with Beckwith (2000), Franceschet (2004), Jelin (1990b), Miller (1995) and Stephen (1997), for example, I argue that feminist engagement was evident even when the feminist label was renounced by the participants themselves. Jelin (1990b) contends that "the various types and planes of actions converge in social reality, thus obviating the analytical need to differentiate between women's participation, women's organizations and feminist movements" (p. 184). This, however, does not negate the need to respect the distinctions made by women themselves in this and other studies (Stephen, 1997) nor to distinguish analytical categories that facilitate comparative analysis (Beckwith, 2000).

[34] Upon the suggestion of one of the pilot interviewees, at the culmination of the fieldwork we organized an event that included a presentation of some of the research findings along with the performance of music and poetry by a number of the research participants.

[35] In reviewing the transcripts, I wonder whether MODEMU's name did not hold greater significance than they intended. This observation leads us full circle back to the argument about feminist engagement.

[36] Upon Olga Poblete's death, CEDEMU added her name to their own in homage, i.e., *Casa de Encuentro de la Mujer "Olga Poblete."*

[37] Elsewhere, the speaker makes a connection to church women who participated in the first *Mujeres de Luto* (see below) asking: "And now what? We want to do something more. We don't want to go home. We don't want to go on being dispersed" (Gaviola et al., 1994, p. 163).

[38] I am indebted to some women that did not participate in the formal interviews but were invaluable sources of informal information.

[39] Middle and upper class women banged their pots to protest the Allende government in the time of contrived food shortages. During the dictatorship, poor women banged their pots to protest their growing poverty.

[40] This family went into exile in Europe after the father and brothers were detained early in the dictatorship but returned some years later at the insistence of the young

114

daughter and her brothers that they should re-join the struggle from within their own country. And, as Young Communists, they did just that. Furthermore, the mother was an active member of MODEMU and the father a Communist Party militant.

[41] On the consciousness-raising character of the communal survival activities in Chile, see for example Agos n (1996), Chuchryk (1984), Schild (1994), and Valdés and Weinstein (1993). Jelin (1990a) makes a significant observation about the politicization of the collective kitchens across Latin America: "Collective kitchens are strategies emerging from this context that propose a new form of female organization. They are characterized by bringing women together in a public activity replacing the private and almost intimate activity of the kitchen in the domestic sphere. Collective kitchens are the new scenario for women's political work" (p. 189).

[42] The idea of sharing food together is an interesting (and positive) twist on the aspect of having military families inserted into the poblaciones.

[43] Except for CEDEMU, I do not address here the conflicting experiences women had within their political parties.

[44] Translations are: the Communist Party, the Young Communists, and the Pioneers. The latter two are Communist Party youth groups.

[45] A young man, Salvador Cautivo, was shot and killed at a demonstration on New Year's Eve 1988. This tragedy was a pivotal moment in the political trajectory of the younger women who participated in this study. Blaming the Communist Party for disorganization and lack of security on that night, many became disillusioned and dropped their formal membership in the party. This is covered in more detail in another paper in this dissertation.

[46] I assume there were other study participants who were armed but they did not discuss this with me.

[47] Churches in wealthier neighbourhoods and those that served the military were aligned with the conservative element of the Catholic Church in Chile, powerfully connected to the dictatorship.

[48] SERPAJ is an acronym for the Service for Peace and Justice.

[49] Feminist learning had contradictory effects on the women. While evidently liberating, for some women liberation came at a great cost. Some felt that their committed and collective challenge to gender roles in Chilean society within their personal lives made it difficult for them to maintain relationships with the men "left behind" in changing realities. On another level, women found it increasingly difficult to remain in political parties that would not address the sexism within the party.

[50] This phenomenon may be reminiscent of a similar situation in North America during and after WWI, wherein women entered the workforce in large numbers while men were away at war, followed by an exaggerated reversal to domestication afterwards (McAdam, 1992). However, second-wave feminism in Chile cannot be attributed to the same explanatory factors as those used in the North American context. Specifically, the repressive political climate and the motherhood discourse distinguish Latin America's second-wave feminism from that in North America (Franceschet, 2004) and shape "... a Latin American feminist praxis distinct from that of feminist movements elsewhere" (Sternbach et al., 1995, p. 244).

[51] Although her analysis of the women's movement is entirely consistent with the literature, the speaker finishes by humbly suggesting that I speak to someone who has studied the issue so as to get a better theoretical grasp of what really happened!

[52] Political sophistication and preoccupation appears to be a widespread cultural phenomenon in Chile. By way of example, a regular periodical that publishes all the new laws and statutes is quickly sold out of the news kiosks on publication day because of its popularity among the general citizenry. I was rarely involved in any formal or informal conversations in the field that did not turn to political topics at some point. During the time I was there, in addition to the list cited here, the main topics also included the political situation of their Latin American neighbours, i.e., the economic crisis in Argentina, the attempted overthrow of the Venezuelan government, and the mass strikes against privatization of the state-owned utilities company in Peru.

[53] Even much of the contingent of civil servants changes when a new party assumes power, especially so in Arica where there is a high unemployment rate. As the municipal government at the time was right wing, none of the women I interviewed were employed through that means, at least one having recently lost her municipal job.

[54] The consequences of movement participation on the younger women are addressed in another paper in this dissertation.

[55] Examples of emerging women's networks in Chile are *Red de Mujeres de Organizaciones Sociales* (REMOS) and ANAMURI (a network of indigenous and rural women).

[56] Adult education professor, Michael Law suggested the idea of the "politics of despair and the politics of hope" in his closing remarks at the 2004 CASAE conference. For him, it represented a summation of the sentiments revealed in numerous paper presentations on social movements at the conference.

[57] Literally translated, the phrase used by the speaker was: "women will again show where the bus is going."

[58] I concur with Franceschet's (2004) conclusion that "a number of the goals of women's organizations [in Chile], and indeed much of their rhetoric, is decidedly feminist in content" (p. 513).

[59] Because I was based at CEDEMU, I worked with and became friends with these women and was more personally connected to them than other women. Thus, I am privy to more intimate knowledge about their journeys as women, as feminists, as activists – as people in the world. This is a story unto itself that unfolds to this day.

[60] The movement's "maternal frame," as it is called by social movement theorists, has been analyzed from different perspectives (see for example Franceschet, 2001; 2004; Noonan, 1995; Stephen, 1997). Franceschet has argued that a strategy based on "women's difference" limited the possibility for a political voice in the transitional government (2001) but also that feminism and consciousness-raising "subverted the potentially conservative bases of a maternalist gender ideology" thereby radicalizing the discourse at the level of action (Okeke-Ihejirika & Franceschet, 2002 p. 459). In my view, the "maternal frame" is not contrary to a feminist or revolutionary politics. In international activism, the power of mothers is widely recognized by public figures such as Steven Lewis and Bono (from recent televised speeches). The radical politics of motherhood, militant mothers (Alvarez, 1990), subversive mothers (Wieringa, 1995), activist mothers (Naples, 1998), or a nurturance-activism-feminism synthesis (Garland, 1988) are alternative analytical stances. The potential for peacemaking in feminist

116

philosopher Sara Ruddick's (1990) "maternal thinking" would also play a useful analytical role in this discussion.

[61] The private-public polarization, first theorized by anthropologist Michele Rosaldo, has recently been challenged (see for example Stephen, 1997).

[62] The idea of "quiet continuity" is developed further in another paper in this dissertation where I draw on the notions of "abeyance structure" (Taylor, 1989) and "persistence" (Whittier, 1995) from studies on U.S. women's movements. There are some parallels to the Chilean case worth considering, especially in regards to CEDEMU's persistent feminist presence in Arica. Researchers speculate that a cadre of highly committed activists with a rich political and ideological culture keep the movement in a holding pattern that contributes to later mobilization through "preexisting activist networks, a repertoire of goals and tactics, and a collective identity" (p. 770). Klandermans (1997) also suggests that established activist networks increase the likelihood of subsequent activism through a "spiral of commitment and participation"(p. 111). Taylor (1989) concludes that "movements do no die, but scale down and retrench" (p. 772).

References

Agos n, Marjorie. (1996). *Threads of hope: The arpillera movement in Chile, 1974-1994*. Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press.

Alvarez, Sonia E. (1990). *Engendering democracy in Brazil*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Baldez, Lisa. (2002). *Why women protest: Women's movements in Chile*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Beckwith, Karen. (2000). Beyond compare? Women's movement in comparative perspective. *European Journal of Political Research, 37*, 431-468.

Bresnahan, Rosalind. (2003). Introduction: Chile since 1990: The contradictions of neoliberal democratization. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(5), 3-15.

Chavkin, Samuel. (1985). *Storm over Chile: The Junta under siege*. Westport, CT: Lawrence Hill and Company.

Chinchilla, Norma Stolz. (1992). Marxism, feminism, and the struggle for democracy in Latin America. In Arturo Escobar & Sonia E. Alvarez (Eds.), *The making of social movements in Latin America* (pp. 37-51). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Chovanec, Donna M., Bravo, Sandra, & González, Héctor. (2002). Libreto: El aprendizaje del poder desde los margenes: Movimientos populares de mujeres en Chile. Arica, Chile.

Chuchryk, Patricia M. (1984). *Protest, politics and personal life: The emergence of feminism in a military dictatorship, Chile 1973-1983*. Unpublished doctoral thesis, York University, Toronto, ON.

117

Chuchryk, Patricia M. (1989). Feminist anti-authoritarian politics: The role of women's organizations in the Chilean transition to democracy. In Jane S. Jaquette (Ed.), *The women's movement in Latin America: Feminism and the transition to democracy* (pp. 149-184). Boston: Unwin Hyman.

Craske, Nikki. (1998). Remasculinisation and the neoliberal state in Latin America. In Vicky Randall & Georgina Waylen (Eds.), *Gender, politics and the state* (pp. 101-120). London: Routledge.

Derechos Chile. (2004). *Under the dictatorship*, [Internet]. Derechos Chile. Available: http://www/chip.cl/derechos/dictadura_eng.html [2004, May 21].

Drake, Paul W. & Jaksic, Iván. (1991). Introduction: Transformation and transition in Chile, 1982-1990. In Paul W. Drake & Iván Jaksic (Eds.), *The struggle for democracy in Chile, 1982-1990* (pp. 1-17). Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press.

Equipo de Educación Popular. (n.d.). El juego del siglo: Episodios de la historia del Pueblo de Chile. Santiago, Chile: CIDE.

Franceschet, Susan. (2001). Women in politics in post-transitional democracies: The Chilean case. *International Feminist Journal of Politics, 3*(2), 207-236.

Franceschet, Susan. (2003). "State feminism" and women's movements: The impact of Chile's Servicio Nacional de Mujer on women's activism. *Latin American Research Review, 38*(1), 9-40.

Franceschet, Susan. (2004). Explaining social movement outcomes: Collective action frames and strategic choices in first- and second-wave feminism in Chile. *Comparative Political Studies, 37*(5), 499-530.

Garland, A. W. (1988). *Women activists: Challenging the abuse of power*. New York: Feminist Press.

Gaviola, Edda, Largo, Eliana, & Palestro, Sandra. (1994). *Una historia necessaria: Mujeres en Chile 1973-1990*. Santiago, Chile: Authors.

Hartsock, Nancy C. M. (1983). The feminist standpoint: Developing the ground for a specifically feminist historical materialism. In Sandra Harding & Merrill Hintikka (Eds.), *Discovering Reality*. London: D. Reidl.

Hellman, Judith Adler. (1992). The study of new social movements in Latin America and the question of autonomy. In Arturo Escobar & Sonia E. Alvarez (Eds.), *The making of social movements in Latin America* (pp. 52-61). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Jaquette, Jane S. (Ed.). (1989). *The women's movement in Latin America: Feminism and the transition to democracy*. Boston: Unwin Hyman.

Jelin, Elizabeth. (1990a). Citizenship and identity: Final reflections. In Elizabeth Jelin (Ed.), *Women and social change in Latin America* (pp. 184-207). London: Zed Books and United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.

Jelin, Elizabeth. (1990b). Introduction. In Elizabeth Jelin (Ed.), *Women and social change in Latin America* (pp. 1-11). London: Zed Books and United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.

Jelin, Elizabeth (Ed.). (1990c). *Women and social change in Latin America*. London: Zed Books and United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.

Kane, Anne. (2001). Finding emotion in social movement processes: Irish land movement metaphors and narratives. In Jeff Goodwin, James M. Jasper, & Francesca Polletta (Eds.), *Passionate politics: Emotions and social movements* (pp. 251-266). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Kirkwood, Julieta. (1986). *Ser política en Chile: Las feministas y los partidos*. Santiago, Chile: FLACSO.

Klandermans, Bert. (1997). *The social psychology of protest*. Cambridge, MA: Blackwell.

MacKinnon, Catharine. (1997). Feminism, Marxism, method, and the state: An agenda for theory. In Diana Tietjens Meyers (Ed.), *Feminist social thought: A reader* (pp. 64-91). New York: Routledge.

Matear, Ann. (1997). "*Desde la protesta a la propuesta*": The institutionalization of the women's movement in Chile. In Elizabeth Dore (Ed.), *Gender politics in Latin America: Debates in theory and practice* (pp. 84-100). New York: Monthly Review Press.

McAdam, Doug. (1992). Gender as a mediator of the activist experience: The case of Freedom Summer. *American Journal of Sociology, 97*(5), 1211-1240.

Miller, Francesca. (1995). Latin American women and the search for social, political, and economic transformation. In Sandor Halebsky & Richard L. Harris (Eds.), *Capital, power, and inequality in Latin America* (pp. 185-206). Boulder, CO: Westview.

Molyneux, Maxine. (1998). Analysing women's movements. *Development and Change, 29*, 219-245.

Naples, Nancy A. (1998). *Grassroots warriors: Activist mothering, community work, and the War on Poverty*. New York: Routledge.

Noonan, Rita K. (1995). Women against the state: Political opportunities and collective action frames in Chile's transition to democracy. *Sociological Forum, 10*(1), 81-111.

Okeke-Ihejirika, E. & Franceschet, Susan. (2002). Democratization and state feminism: Gender politics in Africa and Latin America. *Development and Change, 33*(3), 439-466.

Olivares, Francisco. (2002, March 9). Alcalde saludó a la mujer ariqueña. *La Estrella*, pp. A-8.

Pannu, Raj & Toh, Swee-Hin. (1996). Theme issue: Education and development: Past lessons, present crises, future possibilities. *Alberta Journal of Educational Research, 42*(12).

Pinochet's Chile(2000). The Washington Post Online. Available: http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-srv/inatl/longterm/pinochet/overview.htm [2004, July 15].

Rojas, Luis Emilio. (n.d.). *Nueva y moderna historia de Chile*. Santiago, Chile: Gong.

Ruddick, Sara. (1990). *Maternal thinking: Towards a politics of peace*. New York: Ballantine.

Schild, Verónica. (1991). *Gender, class and politics: Poor neighbourhood organizing in authoritarian Chile*. Unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Toronto, Toronto, ON.

Schild, Verónica. (1994). Recasting "popular" movements: Gender and political learning in neighborhood organizations in Chile. *Latin American Perspectives, 21*(2), 59–80.

Schild, Verónica. (1995). NGOs, feminist politics and neo-liberal Latin American state formations: Some lessons from Chile. *Canadian Journal of Development Studies, Special Issue*, 123-147.

119

Schild, Verónica. (1998a). Market citizenship and the "new democracies": The ambiguous legacies of the contemporary Chilean women's movements. *Social Politics, 5*(2), 232-249.

Schild, Verónica. (1998b). New subjects of rights? Women's movements and the consruction of citizenship in the "new democracies". In Sonia E. Alvarez, Evelina Dagnino, & Arturo Escobar (Eds.), *Cultures of politics, politics of cultures: Re-visioning Latin American social movements* (pp. 93-117). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Schild, Verónica. (2000). "Gender equality" without social justice: Women's rights in the neoliberal age. *NACLA Report on the Americas, 34*, 25-28.

Schuurman, Frans J. (1993). Modernity, post-modernity and the new social movements. In Frans J. Schuurman (Ed.), *Beyond the impasse: New directions in development theory* (pp. 187-206). London: Zed Books.

Se encadenó esposa de dirigente preso(1988, July 18). *La Estrella,* pp. 7.

Stephen, Lynn. (1997). *Women and social movements in Latin America: Power from below.* Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.

Sternbach, Nancy Saporta, Navarro-Aranguren, Marysa, Chuchryk, Patricia, & Alvarez, Sonia E. (1995). Feminisms in Latin America: From Bogotá to San Bernardo. In Barbara Laslett, Johanna Brenner, & Yesim Arat (Eds.), *Rethinking the political: Gender, resistance, and the state* (pp. 240-281). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Taylor, Verta. (1989). Social movement continuity: The women's movement in abeyance. *American Sociological Review, 54*(October), 761-775.

Universidad de Chile. (1972). *Enciclopedia de Arica.* Arica, Chile: Author.

Valdés, Teresa & Weinstein, Marisa. (1993). *Mujeres que sueñan: Las organizaciones de pobladoras en Chile, 1973-1999.* Santiago, Chile: FLACSO-Chile.

Valenzuela, Mar a Elena. (1998). Women and the democratization process in Chile. In Jane S. Jaquette & Sharon L. Wolchik (Eds.), *Women and democracy* (pp. 47-74). Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University.

Waylen, Georgina. (1993). Women's movements and democratisation in Latin America. *Third World Quarterly, 14*(3), 573-587.

Waylen, Georgina. (1997). Women's movements, the state and democratization in Chile: The establishment of SERNAM. In Anne Marie Goetz (Ed.), *Getting institutions right for women in development* (pp. 90-103). London: Zed Books.

Waylen, Georgina. (2000). Gender and democratic politics: A comparative analysis of consolidation in Argentina and Chile. *Journal of Latin American Studies, 32,* 765-793.

Whittier, Nancy. (1995). *Feminist generations: The persistence of the radical women's movement.* Philedelphia, PA: Temple University Press.

Wieringa, Saskia. (1995). Introduction: Subversive women and their movements. In Saskia Wieringa (Ed.), *Subversive women: Women's movements in Afica, Asia, Latin America and the Caribbean.* New Delhi: Kali for Women.

Wood, Elisabeth Jean. (2001). The emotional benefits of insurgency in El Salvador. In Jeff Goodwin, James M. Jasper, & Francesca Polletta (Eds.), *Passionate politics: Emotions and social movements* (pp. 267-281). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

CONCIENCIA: CRITICAL AND GENDERED CONSCIOUSNESS IN A SOCIAL MOVEMENT

Regarding the organization of women, the trajectory that Arica had as a city was rapid, it was more rapid than in other cities... Why? Because in Arica there was a different political reality than what there was [elsewhere]. In Arica, the left was the majority... and that meant that also there was a greater social organization... [and] a superior level of consciousness. (a university student in 1973)[1]

Introduction

Within the study of social movements, there is often implicit acknowledgement that social movements are sites of profound learning within civil society. However, "learning in such situations is largely informal and often incidental – it is tacit, embedded in action and is often not recognised as learning" (Foley, 1999, p. 3). Through a study of the popular women's movement in Arica, a small city in northern Chile, it is the intent of my research project to explicitly expose the learning dimension of a social movement and spotlight the educational processes at work within the movement.[2]

From the election of Salvador Allende in 1970, through the Pinochet dictatorship (1973-1990), to the present transition to democracy, Chile has undergone tumultuous socio-political and economic changes. The military coup in 1973 signaled a severe disruption in a longstanding democratic tradition and represented a brutal example of encroachment of the state into civil society and the elimination of democratic space: the constitution was suspended, media censured, political parties and trade unions prohibited, and thousands were captured and detained, exiled, disappeared, or executed. Furthermore, extreme economic measures were enforced that consolidated neo-liberalism in the region, escalating economic hardship for increasing numbers of citizens and fundamentally changing the social structure of the family and the society.[3]

Paradoxically, political mobilization of women increased sharply in the 1980s in the midst of state repression and stringent economic policies. At a time when traditional political avenues were prohibited and men were not as widely available for protest (due to detention, exile, and migration for employment), the women took up the challenge. Despite threat to their own lives and livelihoods, women publicly protested against the human rights abuses of the regime, collectively organized popular subsistence and survival-oriented initiatives (e.g., collective kitchens), clandestinely disrupted the functioning of the regime, and inaugurated a second wave of feminism linked to

121

grassroots organizing and service provision in poorer neighbourhoods. The strong, persistent and brave actions of the women who constituted the Chilean women's movement were a powerful force in the eventual downfall of the military dictatorship in 1989.[4]

This research is founded on nine months of ethnographic fieldwork in Arica (pop: 180,000), Chile's most northern outpost, more than 2000 km from the capital city of Santiago. Prior to 1973, it was a socially and economically thriving community. After the coup, it became a highly militarized and economically depressed zone. In general, the population is composed of diverse disenfranchised groups such as poor and indigenous peoples. During the study period, I was situated in a local women's NGO, *Casa de Encuentro de la Mujer* (CEDEMU). In addition to cultural immersion, research methods included document review and formal interviews.[5] I followed standard academic ethical procedures and dedicated particular attention to cultural differences and safety issues. I incorporated a variety of means for collaborative analytic reflection in the field. A number of analytical categories emerged early during the fieldwork that seemed promising for theorizing learning and education within social movements. Once these categories were empirically and theoretically elaborated, each became the basis for one of the papers in this dissertation.

One such analytical category grew out of repeated references to *conciencia* (consciousness) in the women's narratives. Women spoke about *conciencia política*, *conciencia social*, *conciencia ciudadana* and *vocación social*. Even without the descriptors, for these women, *conciencia* implicitly referred to *critical* consciousness. The processes related to *conciencia* included *educación política, educación social, formación ideological*, and *concientización*.[6]

In this paper, I take up the notion of consciousness as a central concept in understanding the relationship between social movements and education, including the challenges of grasping the structure/agency and individual/social dialectic. After presenting some of the relevant empirical data, I submit a set of analytical statements drawn from empirical analysis of this particular group of women situated in their particular socio-historic location. Thus, I am not speaking of all the ways one may develop a critical consciousness but of this apparently successful way in this particular context. From this discussion, I hope that some potentially useful ideas may generate further theoretical debate and empirical study about consciousness in social movements in other contexts. I conclude by suggesting implications for radical adult education.

122

Critical Consciousness

Almost all women chose to start their verbal narratives by situating themselves in their own early history. Women in Arica generally traced their commitment and activism to their families. Sometimes it was implicit in a set of values such as dignity or community concern as in this quote from an indigenous woman who for many years had been the director of an NGO in one of the poorest *poblaciones* (neighbourhoods) in Arica.

> It's true that my family wasn't one with a lot of political consciousness, but it was one with a lot of consciousness of values... The values of solidarity were recurring values... So, I have this, like, very ingrained in me. For me, it's like there was always the sense of being able to see beyond the person. There was always the sense of reciprocity, quite strongly, and of appreciating [people's] worth.

Some credited their Catholic upbringing. "The truth is that inside the nun's school, they always gave you values of solidarity and all that business." But most often in this group of women, consciousness was acquired through an explicit exposure to communism or socialism in the course of their family's participation in a political party. *"Desde la cuna"* (from the cradle), these women learned their philosophies and politics through their earliest childhood memories.

> Why do I have political consciousness? Because... my father worked in a naval shipyard in [a port city], and he had a political cell at his work but they met in my house. Therefore, from very small I knew what political stuff was all about.

Some women listed a variety of leftist parties to which a host of family members belonged. For example, one woman and her husband were Communist Party militants but their three children belonged to three different political parties. "There certainly were different opinions but we were all from the left... and that helped us and we felt more like a family." In some cases, it was a long-standing family tradition to belong to a particular political party.

> I am from a family that no one can be from another party because everyone is communist and we have all the generations, all, all, all of them are the same. And if someone marries someone who isn't, they are obligated to convert and those that don't, leave. Get it? It's like a clan.

Some women, daughters or daughters-in-law of communist fathers who fled to the north of Chile from Santiago in order to escape an earlier period of political repression, were deeply imprinted by this childhood experience. "In the era of the government of the traitor González Videla, my parents were communist militants. So from very young,

123

I began to know what it meant to live violently uprooted. Unconsciously [my sister and I] found ourselves involved in the subject [of politics]."[7]

While the vast majority of study participants had at one time been Communist Party members, some were members of the Socialist Party, one was a Christian Democrat, and a few were members of *Movimiento Izquierda Revolucionaria* (MIR).[8] Again, the family connections were perceptible.

> I come from a family of socialists... Always in my house the environment was a socialist environment. Therefore, very early I started to participate. First when I was a little girl, so as not to leave me alone in the house, they took me to the meetings of the party.

A minority were not actual members of a particular party but had strong relationships with party members and affinities with party philosophies.

Many women also gave credit to their *obrero* (worker), *campesino* (peasant) or *salitreras* (nitrate miners) origins, women whose personal stories are situated within the long history of territorial battles and conquered people over many centuries. Participants were typically aware of the legacy of struggle within the mining communities of the north, where women and children protested, and sometimes died, alongside their husbands and fathers for condemning the oppressive and repressive treatment of the mining companies. Some of the elder women in this study had roots in *la Pampa* (the desert), in communities such as Chuquicamata, whose distinctive history is responsible for the "politicization" of the north.

> There is something to mention that is very important for the Chilean movements. All that culture that there was, that politicization that there was, that effervescent social thing that there was, wasn't because the Chilean people were tough. No. It was because in our history there was a very important man, Luis Emilio Recabarren... who organized the workers for their rights in the north. Then others followed. But all of it relates to the repression of the miners... Therefore... it was an organization that came from much before, the politicization and the organization of the Chilean people.

The early family-based education that established a set of communitarian values, humanist/socialist philosophies, and/or marxist ideologies provided the foundation upon which the women developed, often at very young age, their *conciencia*. As they entered their youth, many women made their own deliberate choices to further expand and act upon this consciousness. Even among those that did not have family members in the Communist Party, most women in this study became formal members (*militantes*) of the Young Communists in their youth. A few of these women, introduced to party

124

membership by trusted friends, recognized that the seeds of their attraction were sown in their families of origin.

> At a very young age, I joined the Young Communists. But my joining it wasn't from the family point of view. I come from a family where my father was uniformed and my mother was a peasant and I had, I mean, a social conception of the rights of people already. But I did have the luck to talk to some girls in school that worked in the Young Communists and because in my house they often said that every one must be respected for who they are, I was introduced to this concept of the equality of people. And I liked the way [the girls] presented things and I entered the Young Communists to serve very young.

The impact of an educational process, usually through political parties, was undeniable. The clearest example of this came from the eldest woman in the study who was an uneducated young girl of fifteen when her family was moved out of the north when nitrate mining collapsed in 1940. Upon arriving in the south with her widowed mother and five siblings, accommodation and employment were secured for them by the Worker's Union, a mostly communist organization. After establishing through a number of examples that "after that we were *always* helped by the Communist Party," she concluded:

> So, I was formed in the party, I mean, my trajectory was politics within the Communist Party. By the way, I didn't know how to read or write... So, my school was the school of the party. The party taught me to write. It educated me, it taught me everything I know. I owe this to the party.[9]

Moving into the second half of the twentieth century, Arica benefited from the growing ascendancy of the left in municipal government, in the consolidation of communitarian projects, in a healthy labour movement, and in a thriving industrial, agrarian and mining-based economy whose benefits were collectively shared through initiatives such as the *Junta de Adelanto de Arica* (Arica Council of Progress) that over a twenty year period accomplished numerous social and economic development projects such as in housing, education, and commercial construction (Universidad de Chile, 1972). The women provided many examples of active democratic citizen participation at the community level, especially in the *Juntas de Vecinos* (Neighbourhood Councils) and the *Centros de Madres* (Mother's Centres), two of the most prominent and active grassroots citizen's organizations. *Tomas de terreno* (land takeovers), a legacy from earlier decades, was common as people from all over the country arrived in Arica (*inmigrantes internos*), a city unable to keep up with the housing demands of a growing population.

Then, in 1970, the Popular Unity government, a coalition led by socialist president Salvador Allende, was elected. Women of all ages spoke of the *alegría, esperanza* and

125

solidaridad (happiness, hope and solidarity) of the Allende years. Women now in their forties were children and adolescents in 1970, such as one woman who remembered the optimism of the times. "I was little... we all went to raise the flag. It was the popular government, it was the hope of my family - that for four [times] had voted for Allende – with a sense that this is the government of the poor, this is our government." Older women had often worked for Allende's successive campaigns.[10]

> I participated actively, I mean actively, in the Popular Unity government and not only in the government but much before as well. Here we talk of four periods before Allende assumed power. I was involved in this, struggling so that our people would have real justice, that there would be equality, [because] there were so many things, scarcities that our people had.

They claimed to recognize a qualitative difference in the people. "When Allende assumed power, it was like one was acquiring more political consciousness." They recalled the community programs and the community spirit. "The effervescence of the youth, the voluntary work, the summer work, the summer camps were realities... that we joyously lived." They remembered that "everyone participated, everyone had a job, whatever thing in the neighbourhood." Even the youngest women – now in their thirties, too young to remember or not yet born in 1970 – had heard their elders talk with wistful nostalgia about what was and what might have been. As opposition to the Allende government escalated over his three-year presidency, communitarian responses increased in an effort to support each other and to circumvent the anti-government propaganda and boycotts. For example, *Juntas de Abastecimiento y Precios* (Council of Supplies and Prices) were established and charged with obtaining and fairly distributing food during the contrived food shortages.

Likewise, Catholic doctrine during the age of liberation theology was a powerful educational tool through formal workshops and informal solidarity.

> And when I was a bit older, I began to see things. I began to realize what they were talking about, of what religion must be, that it is for everyone to be equal... What was important was that supposedly in the church we were all children of God, that everyone had the same rights. And I began to, like, see the ideal that one has. I mean, they preached about equality before the eyes of God, that we are all equal. And the priest and the nun, in the political part, also told you that we are all equal. I mean, before the society, we all have to be equal... For me, it was very important, very, very important.

While these two institutions are decidedly different in a multiplicity of ways, at the time both espoused a critical reading of poverty through a marxist lens and a collective

126

orientation to community problems that clearly contributed to the ongoing development of consciousness among these women. In the summative words of one woman leader, "in those years, there was a high [level of] political consciousness. The political education that the whole society had was incredible."

Gendered Consciousness

Many of the women interviewed for this study were conscious of the gendered nature of their involvement as political actors. The typical pattern for the mature women was early political exposure and militancy prior to the dictatorship followed later by the gendered consciousness that emerged through struggle and participation. For younger women, the exposure to feminism was simultaneous to their involvement in leftist political movements during the dictatorship.

Most women could recall disquieting experiences in their own families or communities that planted the seeds of a gender critique. A number of women said they were "rebellious" and "questioning" in their youth. An older woman remembered that her "first rebellion on the subject of women" was when her boyfriend made an unexpected marriage proposal directly to her father, bypassing her. Other women remembered feeling baffled and frustrated by different expectations for family chores, education, and behaviour between the male and female siblings and cousins. According to another, "my older cousins always said I was a pain in the butt because I always questioned... actions and attitudes." She credited this behaviour to her mother who drew on her indigenous background to "educate us that everyone has to iron and it's not because I am a woman and because you are a man that you're not going to do it." Thinking back to her pre-feminist days, one younger woman said, "the truth is I had an intuition that something was not functioning well [for women]." However, unlike their communist or socialist consciousness, the women had no language, theory or collective role models to understand or to challenge the gender hierarchy.

Second-wave feminism formally emerged in Arica when a handful of leftist women inadvertently discovered reference to a large gathering of Latin American feminists held in 1983.[11] Their mutual experiences of discrimination within their families, society and political parties fuelled their curiosity about the potential of feminist analysis to advance their political struggles. Although highly contested and marginalized in Arica in those years, the feminist consciousness that subsequently surfaced made an indelible mark on

127

the political landscape in Arica. As it arose within the left, feminist consciousness was inextricably woven into a marxist framework.

> From my point of view, marxism is an ideology that struggles for a just society, for a just distribution of the resources and a just distribution of life, where men and women can have the same opportunities, can do the same things, can have the same perspectives of life, of growth, of everything... From my feminist position, [there is] a great coherence with the marxist or socialist position.

But, at the same time, feminists challenged the patriarchal, *machista* orientation of the practice of communism and socialism ("don't come to me with tales that communism or socialism changes it; it doesn't change the mentality"), and especially of the operation of the political parties ("we saw also that the political parties without exception have discriminated and continue discriminating against women").

Once feminist theorists and organizations began unearthing and re-validating women's history as agents of social change in Chile, this information also became part of the women's movement and, contributed to a heightened gendered consciousness. In the group interview from which the following excerpt is taken, the eight women were very animated and all wanted to contribute to this topic.

> Before the gender perspective [arose], there were feminist movements in Chile. [Q: In '30, '35?] Yes, and they were gaining a level of maturity, a level of consciousness. Not yet political consciousness but the consciousness of the rights of women. There were very strong groups in Chile with respect to feminism. For example, there was MEMCH. [Q: So there was a history?] Yes, a very, very long history.

Even earlier, however, women were active against various forms of repression, especially in the north where the mining history contributed strongly to local consciousness. This had special relevance for *Ariqueñas* (women citizens of Arica) because of the northern context but also for the connection with the worker's movements. Women in Arica were familiar with the story of the 1907 massacre at *Escuela Santa María de Iquique* (Santa Maria of Iquique School) and the role that women played alongside their husbands in the strikes that led up to the march to Iquique and to their deaths.[12]

> The workers were politicized and the test of this was the big journey, the great march to the offices in Iquique where, in the *Escuela Santa María*, they killed impressive quantities of workers that had an extraordinary organization. Where the women had their own important role. With the stoves unlit, together with their husbands, they cooked no more.

128

Most evident during the anti-dictatorship struggle was a type of maternal consciousness that included a sense of social responsibility, as demonstrated in this representative statement: "The women went out for an almost instinctive attitude of the defense of life." The first women to mobilize throughout Chile, Arica included, were women whose children and husbands were imprisoned, tortured, executed, or disappeared. One younger woman explained how the public experience of mothers served to "conscientize" and mobilize the citizenry.

> It is the mothers that started all this business. And also you realize the strength that one has as a woman... When I heard the mothers speak when they came from Santiago – because the idea was to conscientize and to open a curtain and to say, in this country people are dying, in this country this is happening... But these mothers lost their children, understand? So to listen to them, you become so sensitive to the subject.

From there, women initiated numerous activities and were the "core" of many others. An older woman described various factors that motivated women's mobilization.

> The majority of the women had resentment for all that they had seen. That their neighbour's son was disappeared or their husband in prison. So, all those things [were] accumulating in women. Resentment to see that still all the industry was closed, that still there was no work, neither for the man nor for the woman... that a whole lot of worker's benefits had all disappeared. So, from all of that was accumulating a discontent. And who suffered? It was the housewife because her *compañero*, her husband didn't have stable work; her children couldn't live a life and [have] a normal education. So, all of that was in decline – the home, education, culture – was diminishing every day... We had to dedicate ourselves to go out into the street everyday, I mean *every day* to the street.

A younger woman recognized that her elders were looking beyond the confines of their home. "In this time, the woman fulfilled a very important role within the political movement... because the woman wasn't just for being in the house, the woman had political consciousness." But at the time, another admitted, "we didn't realize what was happening [with] the consciousness among the women during the struggle." Women were jettisoned into roles and responsibilities that they had not previously imagined such as one woman whose husband's detainment thrust her into public leadership in the emerging women's movement and a *pobladora* who ironically asserted that "*gracias a la dictadura*" (thanks to the dictatorship),

> the nice thing was that I met so many people; I got involved with many people that I never thought I would get involved with; I did many things that I never thought to do... I would have been always just inside my house with my children... I worked in things that I never thought to work in. So, a lot materialized for me as a person and I grew more, grew more

129

as a woman in that time. All this thanks to the dictatorship. If not for the dictatorship, I would always have been more delayed in this sense.

The younger women recognized that women's activism was a powerful testament to the strength of women and they comprehended the profound effect of feminism on their lives in later years. "We were part of that important process and we grew with that, we grew with those images." From one young woman's perspective, "when I say the women's movement [I include] gaining consciousness of being a woman, that you are not an object and all that."[13]

Thus, a new gendered (or feminist) consciousness became combined with a political and social consciousness. As one young woman said, "it all fits, it is all very interconnected."[14]

Building a Theory of Consciousness in Social Movements

In sum, the women's narratives began with the crucial positioning of *conciencia* – a socio-political consciousness born of their families, their political parties, the communities, and their church and embedded in the collective history of a relentless "struggle for rights" in the north and "participation for the common good" during the Allende years. Looking back in time, the women stressed that "*la izquierda tenía la fuerza de su conciencia*" (the left had the power of its consciousness). For these women, the coupling of this critical socio-political consciousness with a gendered consciousness multiplied the effect. While claiming that the actions that followed during the dictatorship years were "necessary," ultimately, it was this "power of consciousness" that motivated these women to action.

In the literature on social movements, there is considerable attention to topics that relate peripherally to the concept of consciousness. New social movement (NSM) theorists consider identity issues and Resource Mobilization (RM) theorists focus on recruitment, but their questions are often related to who joins movements and why and, beyond that, what motivates movement actors to stay even in the face of significant personal costs. In other words, instrumental notions of movement participation seem to prevail. Notwithstanding new theorizing on so-called "collective action frames," RM theory is specifically criticized for its lack of attention to consciousness (Carroll, 1997; Taylor, 1989).[15]

130

In contrast, I believe that it is more fruitful to concentrate explicitly on the concept of consciousness in social movements, as is common in feminist theorizing about the women's movement. In the literature about the women's movement in Latin America, the importance of consciousness and consciousness-raising in the mobilization of women is well recognized (see for example Alvarez, 1990; Miller, 1990; Schild, 1994; Valdés & Weinstein, 1993).

Thus, through the analysis that follows, I endeavor to contribute to the theoretical understanding of consciousness in social movements – where it comes from and how it develops. While relevant aspects of some related theories used in adult education and/or social movement theorizing are intermittently incorporated, the main thrust of the theoretical argument in this paper is drawn from a marxist conceptualization of consciousness.[16] [17]

Before introducing the analytical statements that build my theoretical argument, I will address the question of definition. Put simply, "our consciousness is comprised of thoughts, ideas and concepts" (Allman, 2001b, p. 33). Thus a theory of consciousness is a theory of the formation of ideas. The first point (the definition) provokes little debate. However, speculating on the second (how consciousness is formed) has captured the attention of many philosophers and has been the subject of much philosophical debate to this day. In the 1800s, two contradictory views were held about the origin of consciousness. Hegelian idealism posited that ideas preexist independently of the real world and that, in fact, ideas create the real world. Conversely, mechanical materialism (Feuerbach), postulated that ideas are the mere recording of the material world. Rejecting both views, Marx contended that ideas originate in our *relationship* with the material world.

> Marx's materialism postulated that ideas and concepts arise from relations between people and from relations between people and their material world... According to Marx we actively and sensuously experience these relations; therefore, our consciousness is actively produced within our experience of social, material and natural existence. (Allman, 2001b, p. 37)

In a material world based on domination and oppression (including but not limited to capitalism, imperialism, racism, patriarchy, heterosexism), consciousness becomes distorted and fragmented so as to maintain the relationship of domination. Conversely, becoming critically conscious requires taking the standpoint of the oppressed from which vantage point the relations of domination can become visible and social transformation possible.[18]

131

Through the following three analytical statements, it will become apparent that the research reported here supports the perspective that critical consciousness is a collective and relational concept, and, furthermore, that it incorporates the structure/agency and individual/social dialectics.[19]

Acquiring Consciousness

ACQUIRING consciousness reflects the pre-eminence of social-structural elements in the early years.

Early learning is critical. These women typically credited their families for their activist tendencies. Most were embedded in families and communities that espoused leftist philosophies. But, even for those women whose environment was not explicitly so, seeds were sown in their early learning of values related to fairness, dignity, and community. This early family-based education that established a set of communitarian values, humanist/socialist philosophies, and/or marxist ideologies provided the foundation upon which the women developed, often at very young age, their *conciencia*. Cortez D az and Villagra Parra (1999) unveiled this same dynamic in an earlier study of the women's movement in Arica.

> The women began at a very early age to become interested in the political. They were helped by close referents – mother, father, grandparents, etc. – that had some militancy. And they participated in a family dynamic where the political was part of the conversations...
> Under those conditions, it wasn't strange that a particular worldview would be shaped in childhood: "I thought that life was like that." (p. 118)

Very little theoretical literature addresses the possibility that one might acquire a critical consciousness early in life. Most adult education literature is concerned with the *trans*formation, rather than the *formation* of consciousness. In marxist terms, efforts are made to turn false consciousness into critical consciousness. Freire's (1990) stages of consciousness from magical/naive consciousness to critical consciousness are similar to those that Mezirow (1990) draws on to explicate "transformative learning" among adults. But little attention is paid to adults who (a) have already acquired a critical consciousness (or at minimum are predisposed in this direction) or (b) are already critically conscious *parents* in a powerful position to influence the developing consciousness of their offspring.

Yet for many of the women in this study, their *formation* as critically conscious citizens/women through the teachings and example of significant others (mostly

132

parents) was most striking. This socialization is recognized in some of the social movement literature. For example, Klandermans (1997) disputes the supposedly "new" collective identities of social movement actors.

> These new identities, however, do not necessarily represent a disjunction with the past, since they evolve from beliefs an individual already shared with the collective... Individuals are born into social environments in which specific collective beliefs that describe and interpret the world prevail. (p. 52)

In addition: research on student movements in the 1960s in the U.S. demonstrated that "the actions of student radicals were motivated by values learned from their parents" (Marx & McAdam, 1994, p. 88), "family dynasties" were common in the Argentinean underground (Moyano, 1992), and elsewhere "young activists often reflected a continuity with the political traditions of their families" (della Porta, 1992, p. 7).

In a recent study, Lange (2004) challenges some of the assumptions of transformation theory and arrives at a similar realization. Among her Canadian middle class study participants, the socio-historical context of economic disruptions (e.g., downsizing, recession) precipitated a reflective period that resulted in the conscious restoration of values and ethics learned early in life that had been submerged in the frenetic pace of their adult lives. She contends that incorporating the notion of *restorative* learning would enrich *transformative* learning theories.

However, having such a background does not account for the long-recognized discrepancies between how one thinks and how one acts. In the case of Arica, many more women would have been exposed to the same set of early learnings but only this particular group of women chose to act on them publicly. Thus, I concur with G. Marx and McAdam (1994) that, while not all people with a certain set of values or attitudes will participate, "attitudes remain important insofar as they serve as a kind of minimum requirement for involvement in a given movement" (p. 89).

In a marxist conceptualization, "consciousness is actively produced within our experience of our social, material and natural existence" (Allman, 2001b, p. 37). Therefore, it stands to reason that the everyday practice and material conditions of a move towards socialism (and resistance to capitalist exploitation) that these women learned and experienced as they developed was distinctive and thus, it distinctly framed their resulting consciousness. Likewise, González (1997) demonstrates how, in the Cuban population, a distinct socialist consciousness is established through societal values and institutions from a very young age.

Early acquisition of critical consciousness is to some extent a passive and externalized process. In analyzing the ways in which *conciencia* was used in spoken text, I noticed that a variety of verbs were used to signify the actions related to consciousness. Many were words that implied a more or less passive, unidirectional or objectified process – words such as gaining, developing, growing, and acquiring. As it emerged in this research, the idea of *acquiring* critical consciousness suggests a process of absorbing, somewhat passively, elements (such as values, beliefs, philosophies) from the external social structures in which one is embedded (i.e., family and community). This is most explicit in an passage in which one woman refers to her "innocent" and "unconscious" involvement from very young. While it is not a wholly conscious experience, it establishes the predisposition for developing a more robust critical consciousness over time. This may not be much different than passively and unconsciously acquiring the dominant capitalist consciousness for most North American children and youth. However, I suggest that the "standpoint" held by these women in the economic order offered a more vigourous and perceptive consciousness by its very nature.

> The material position of those who are most exploited by an economic system gives them the experience of oppression that the dominant ideology denies and that more advantaged members of society do not see. (Meyers, 1997, p. 461)

This suggests that *social-structural* dimensions play an important role in the early acquisition phase. According to Gramsci (1971), "the child's consciousness is not something 'individual' (still less individuated), it reflects the sector of civil society in which the child participates, and the social relations which are formed within his family, his neighbourhood, his village, etc." (p. 35). However, this is not a completely passive process. Coulson and Riddell (1980), while recognizing that "social consciousness depends on learning," (p. 72) caution that sociologists have over-emphasized the notion of socialization.[20] Instead, they suggest that "what we should be examining in a discussion of the development of social consciousness is not a one-way relationship [of society to individual], but a structured dialectic" (p. 73) wherein "structure is dominant" (p. 80). For me, this implies that, while there is always an interplay between agency and structure, early consciousness is more likely to be stimulated by social-structural factors as is suggested by the empirical data in this study.

This initial passivity or peripheral engagement may also be true for the early stages of the acquisition of critical consciousness later in life. When referring to working with other women, it was common for the leader-participants to use phrases such as "we were going to raise the consciousness of the women" or "we wanted to form

134

consciousness in the youth." This indicates that, at least initially, they imagined the conscientization process to be similar to the much-maligned process of "banking education" that Freire (1990) likens to a process of depositing or filling an empty vessel. I speculate that, rather than being wholly negative, there may instead be a potential relationship to Gramsci's (1971) idea of an organic intellectual. In Holst's (2002) interpretation, it is an "elite of specialized organic intellectuals from the working class" (p. 109) that is responsible for leading the people towards a critical consciousness. This is discussed at greater length in the next paper. Suffice it to say here that the concept supports my notion that acquiring critical consciousness in adulthood requires a conducive social environment, including others that might play the role of an organic intellectual.

In relationship to feminist consciousness, it is clear from this study and many others on the women's movement in Chile that a vanguard of women arising out of the left was responsible for initiating a conscientizing process among the popular sector. Some younger women recognized the influence of their elders in encouraging the development of their own feminist consciousness.

> I began to watch the women leaders... that were working in the whole women's movement. Those women probably didn't realize that we were very much in their hands. We were learning all that they were doing at that time, as the first step, because there they started to talk about the subject of violence, because there they started to talk about the rights of women. The feminist movement here in Arica started to grow, so we were part of that important process and we grew with that and we grew with those images.

Taking Consciousness

Taking critical consciousness is an act of agency.

But the process of developing a critical consciousness cannot stop there. Individual agency must act upon the predispositions and opportunities presented by the structural or material conditions. Unlike the more passive implication of a word such as acquiring, in Spanish it is common to use the word "*tomar*" (to take) when referring to consciousness. As such, there is a qualitative difference in the two forms of expression – acquiring vs. taking – that are possibly similar to Freire's (1990) "distinction between being *accessible* to consciousness and *entering* consciousness" (p. 62, italics added) or Goldman's (cited in Freire, 1990) differentiation between *potential* and *real* consciousness.

> Real consciousness [is] the result of the multiple obstacles and deviations
> that the different factors of empirical reality put into opposition and
> submit for realization by [the] potential consciousness. (p. 105)

Thus, the idea of *taking* critical consciousness implies maturity, action, engagement, and agency. It suggests an intentional individual choice and commitment that is made by women whose own lived experience resonates with their already acquired consciousness. As Allman states (2001a), ideas or thoughts can "become part of our consciousness when we receive them from an external source... [but] reception depends upon our active engagement with them – an engagement that is, simultaneously, physical and mental" (p. 165-66). Once engaged, this consciousness becomes internalized and subjectified – it is *taken* into oneself.

As they entered their youth, many women in the study made conscious choices to act upon their *conciencia*. Cortez D az and Villagra Parra (Cortez D az & Villagra Parra, 1999) concluded that the first intentions toward militancy were like a quest for spaces to express their "potential capacities for the political life" or their "*ser política*" (political being) (p. 118). Thus, women became party militants themselves or they affiliated themselves with party militants. Some actively participated in the "church of the poor."[21] Prior to the coup, the older participants had worked for Allende's campaigns, participated in Mother's Centres, established their homes through *tomas de terreno*. So that, in living out their potential consciousness, it was deepened, reinforced, matured, and expanded into a real consciousness. It was brought to a level of awareness and integration that is only possible through action. In a passage comparing uncritical to critical thought, Gramsci (cited in Allman, 2001b) supports the idea of an active engagement in developing one's own "conception of the world."

> Is it better to work out consciously and critically one's own conception of
> the world and thus, in connection with the labour of one's own brain,
> choose one's sphere of activity, take an active part in the creation of the
> history of the world, be one's own guide, refusing to accept passively and
> supinely from outside the moulding of one's personality? (p. 113)

Clearly, Gramsci is referring to a process that requires human agency. The agency/structure dialectic is thus re-integrated in the maturing individual through this process of "*tomar de conciencia.*"

It is clear in the words of the older participants, those who were adults at the time of the coup, that their consciousness was strong, clearly established, a firm foundation for their anti-dictatorship activism. It was something that, having "taken," they could now hold

136

on to and run with. Repeatedly, as in the two quotes below, women said that they mobilized out of "necessity," that they "didn't have an alternative."

> Therefore, for those that had a real consciousness of [the dangers of fascism], it was necessary and urgent that things change and the only way was for the people to organize themselves. So, the urgent necessity was to organize ourselves.

> For us, as communists, there was no other alternative. We couldn't stay in our houses. We had to go out into the street to demonstrate.

Embedded in these quotes are the elements of my contention that the imperative labeled "necessity" that mobilized the women could more accurately be understood as the manifest expression of a "real" critical consciousness. It is this dialectical pairing of a critical consciousness with the imperative to act that prompted the women to "go to the streets, everyday" for a number of years despite fear and danger.[22]

For most women in this study, socialist consciousness was later coupled with a growing gendered consciousness. This was so across Latin America during the dictatorships of the 1970s and 80s.

> In Latin America, a politics of *conscientización* has developed in which women have sought to awaken one another's awareness and understanding of their specific historical situation while providing the analytic tools and organizational modes to participate in the transformation of social conditions... The fusion of a radical critique of economic, political, and social injustice with a gendered analysis has resulted in a syncretic understanding that has transformed both feminism and the politics of social change in Latin America. (Miller, 1995, p. 205)

In part because the traditional opportunities for men to organize and mobilize during the dictatorship were eliminated, women were thrust to the forefront. Framing their oppositional activities as an extension of their traditional roles in the care and protection of their families, women made political claims from within a "maternalist" discourse. Appropriating this discourse gave them some moral authority and a small measure of safety in expressing their demands. Bringing private pain and privation into the public view transformed spaces traditionally understood as private into profoundly public domains and redefined what counts as political. This had a powerful impact on the consciousness of women during military regimes in the region (Alvarez, 1990). According to Schild's (1994) analysis of the popular women's movement in Chile,

> *pobladoras*... entered networks that could be called "symbolic" (in addition to "material") because they consist of an exchange of "knowledge" in language and because what women obtain through these networks is cultural-discursive resources... In other words, through this

137

network women have learned to "know" differently and to act differently. (p. 65-66)

Schild's reference to "learning to know differently" could be translated to mean a changing consciousness – a gendered consciousness. I concur with authors who contend that feminist consciousness and feminist engagement were evident even among women who renounced the feminist label.[23]

In this sense, some of the women were transforming. For a few, the experience was life changing in the deepest sense, akin to Brookfield's (2000) conceptualization of transformative learning as, not simply a deeper understanding of assumptions, but "a fundamental reordering of assumptions... a shift in the tectonic plates of one's assumptive clusters" (p. 139). For one of the feminist leaders, for example, while her socialist consciousness was not shaken, she was transformed through her feminist consciousness, what she calls here, the "woman's position."

> There are rebellions that I have always had but today I have them with theory, with practice, with an ideology that is distinct from before. Today, I know why I am like this. I have arguments, I have experience, I have work, I have readings, I have everything that validates [my experience]. Today I have the ability to have a distinct discourse [related to] the theme of women. [But] I tell you that, for me, it's contradictory because neither the political aspect nor the aspect of repression has been as difficult as the ability to assume the woman's position that I have today.

Some of the women referred to doors or curtains opening that could never be closed. One younger woman said, "truthfully, when you begin to know more as a woman, to want more as a woman... it starts to get into you like a little bug."

The form of consciousness that develops, i.e., critical or "political consciousness, then, is central to an activist's identity" (Klandermans, 1997, p. 112). Women in Arica felt firm in their *conciencia,* adamant that they would never relinquish it, and critical of those who might. For most, their reference is to a socialist consciousness; for others, this is also combined with a deliberate feminist consciousness. Even women who had left their political party were steadfast in their ideological commitment. "I have not stopped being a communist nor will I ever stop being a communist." Although referring to transformation in the following quote, there is a resonance here with the depth of the unwavering foundation of consciousness formed in these women.

> Authentic and lasting transformations in consciousness can occur only when alternative understandings and values are actually experienced "in depth" – that is, when they are experienced sensuously and subjectively as well as cognitively, or intellectually. In other words, the revolutionary transformations in self... can only come about through a unitary and

138

> coherent *deep transformation* or a transformation through which, as
> Gramsci suggests, knowledge becomes so well "integrated" and
> "assimilated" that it becomes located within our subjectivities, and thus,
> in addition to being known, it is felt, or subjectively experienced, as a
> type of "lived" compassion and commitment. (Allman, 2001a, p. 170)

The sturdy formation of consciousness through early exposure and consolidation acted as a buffer and a foundation upon which the women depended even through the shocking jolt to their consciousness precipitated by the coup, sustained through the seventeen years of dictatorship, and challenged by the rampant passivity of the current neo-liberal era.

Nurturing Critical Consciousness

Developing critical consciousness is a process that must be nurtured over time.

Critical consciousness is one part of the action/reflection dialectic that is called revolutionary praxis (Allman, 2001b). In order for its potential to be fully realized in a sustained critical revolutionary praxis, critical consciousness must be nurtured and cultivated. Allow me to play momentarily with the trite but useful learning/teaching metaphor of a growing plant. Somewhere in one's early life, seeds are sown by parents, other family members, and communities that introduce at least the basic elements of a critical consciousness based on justice and reciprocity. With adequate sun and water, the seeds sprout, the plant takes root, and the plant thrives. For the plant to realize its full potential, however, it requires continuous sustenance, in greater quantities, as it grows larger. Older women, already adults during the years of repression and resistance, had benefited from this nurturance as they learned and lived their consciousness over the years in more politically open times.

In contrast, the critical consciousness of the younger women participants was more fragile for at least two reasons. First, the material circumstances of their formative years during the dictatorship were contradictory, complicated, and traumatizing. They were simultaneously educated by repression and resistance on an intense and daily basis. Second, there was not enough conscious, systematic education for critical consciousness to counteract these conflicting realities. Younger women complained about the lack of "ideological formation." They were initiated into "politics" by their involvement in actions, such as barricades in their neighbourhood streets or strikes on campus, so were not so strongly situated ideologically as the older women. Thus, for younger women,

139

without adequate *"educación política"* or *"formación ideological"*, consciousness was not yet well grounded.[24]

Notwithstanding my earlier judgment that older women were more solidly situated, the lack of attention to ongoing nurturance of critical consciousness had repercussions for the women's movement as a whole in Arica. Consciousness is not a static phenomenon. It is fragmentary, contradictory, and constantly in the process of becoming. New situations, particularly those as traumatically disjunctive from the past as happened with the coup in Chile, demand that a critical consciousness be constructed and re-constructed through an ongoing and deliberate educational process. This became very apparent in the post-dictatorship era when social movement activity and citizen participation declined, women left their political parties, and "returned to their homes."[25] As I argue in the next paper, the women's prior (in the case of the older women) or nascent (in the case of the younger women) critical consciousness was not fully realized due to inadequate attention to its central importance in a critical revolutionary *praxis*. Even so, any "changes in consciousness can have long-term significance because they can serve as a resource for future mobilization" (Taylor, 1989, p. 771).

Implications for Radical Adult Education

In this paper, I have established the fundamental importance of critical consciousness – both socialist and feminist – in the political trajectory of the women in the women's movement in Arica. I have demonstrated that families, political parties and the women's movement played foundational roles in the development of this consciousness. I have made distinctions between acquiring and "taking" consciousness and have problematized the lack of attention to the ongoing realization of critical consciousness. In this section, I will confine my remarks on the implications for adult education to three specific suggestions that arise directly out of these empirical findings, and which I perceive to be gaps within the adult education literature.

Adult educators must seize the opportunity to maximize the potentially radical effects of early learning.

First, although adult educators are not teachers of children, we are teachers of adult members of society, including parents and teachers of children. The theories and practices of critical pedagogy provide direction for classroom teachers. However, little if

140

any attention is paid to the role of the radical adult educator in parenting education. Most parents are aware that they transmit basic values to their children; many may even intentionally educate their offspring in ethical and critical thinking. But how many are able to be radical educators of their children? How many would have the skills to initiate in their children the journey towards critical consciousness? Based on my findings, I suggest that *parents* are the "organic intellectuals" within family and community social systems and we, as adult educators, are challenged to find ways to work with parents in this important foundational work.

In Chile, the current generation of teachers and parents were raised in the dictatorship. While I argue elsewhere that those who were active in the resistance movements are committed to teaching and parenting in ways that promote critical consciousness, it is also true that they do not have a firm ideological foundation from which to do so. Even less so in the North American context, where political education is hardly considered in the parenting repertoire.

Second, adult educators must be attentive to the pedagogical openings afforded by the early learning experiences of adults. As Lange (2004) discovered among her research participants,

> ethics of "honesty, integrity, fairness, courage, respect, loyalty, community service, and citizen responsibility" did not require transformation but restoration to a rightful place in their lives and in society at large. Contrary to various social analyses, these ethics were not missing among these participants but had been submerged. (p. 130)

Even within the literature arising internationally, Latin America included, the emphasis on the transformation of na ve consciousness to critical consciousness (Freire, 1990) appears to preclude or ignore the possibility that the original starting place may be less na ve and more critical than initially supposed. In this, we can take a cue from Gramsci who reasons that "... 'everyone' is a philosopher and that it is not a question of introducing from scratch a scientific form of thought into everyone's individual life, but of renovating and making 'critical' an already existing activity" (cited in Allman, 2001b, p. 114).

In Chile, everyone is a political analyst; politics is a way of life. Everywhere I went, the conversation turned to "political" subjects, sooner rather than later. Even when speakers prefaced their conversations with the comment "I'm not interested in politics," they proceeded to voice opinions on the government, the latest legislation on health and education, unemployment, and privatization. Despite the seventeen-year cessation of

141

the democratic political process and a vulnerable transition process since, critical consciousness has a distinctive presence in Chile.[26] Considerable foundation upon which to "restore" and re-build a revolutionary politics.

Political parties hold historical promise as institutions of radical adult education.

Political parties in Canada are an undervalued and near-forgotten potential educational resource. For political parties of the left throughout the world, this may be a reflection of the so-called "crisis of the left." In Chile, the strong role that the political parties played in the consolidation of critical consciousness was striking in the narratives of the older women. But the women also suggested that this crucial role was marginalized during the dictatorship years, apparently due in equal measure to political repression and to the paramount concern with mobilization, and has not recovered its place in the years since the reinstatement of political parties in Chile.

Both Allman (2001b) and Holst (2002), taking their lead from Gramsci, are unequivocal in their view that a revolutionary political project is based on a radical education process. Holst maintains that "the pedagogical nature of the most widely adopted and successful form of revolutionary organization of the twentieth century," i.e., political parties, has been largely ignored (p. 113). Holst argues for a central role of the political party in education for critical consciousness. Starting from the claim about organic intellectuals made earlier, Gramsci maintains that it is the political party that "elaborates" the organic intellectual from within itself. "Organic intellectuals are not born but are formed through the educational activities of working-class parties" (Holst, 2002, p. 110).

With the political parties acting as "schools," the leaders are then in a position to work with the proletariat to "come to a clear theoretical consciousness of [their] practical activity," to provide "political explanation... to workers actually experiencing and confronting in action a problem," and to "teach the masses clearly what we have received from them confusedly" (Holst, 2002, p. 113).[27] In other words, it is the role of the political party to provide the leadership needed for the development of a critical consciousness among the working classes.

Allman (2001b) pays more attention to the methodology inherent in this pedagogical project. She sees numerous consistencies between Gramsci and Freire on this point, although Freire is more explicit in terms of method. Particularly, she emphasizes the mutuality of the teacher/learner relationship and dismisses any idea that the "elite" core of organic intellectuals would be dogmatic or directive. Freire, she states,

142

> expects socialist cultural workers and revolutionary leaders to have already developed [a critical] perception. Their role, however, is not to tell the people what to think but to enable them also to think critically. His contribution is an analysis of how to be *with* the people so they can develop this way of thinking. (p. 90)

From Gramsci, she recounts:

> The leader's or radical educator's role is to persuade and encourage people to undertake these renovations and to help them question their already existing activity (common-sense thinking) until it becomes "critical" activity (dialectical thinking). (p. 115)

Resurrected to their historical place in society, revitalized for the current realities of transnational capital, and purged of the sexism and other oppressive apparatuses that have infiltrated most "progressive" or "revolutionary" institutions, political parties would be powerful tools for conscientization. Not a small order. However, if adult education, as a discipline, were to fully grasp this potential and if the energy currently invested in maintaining or reforming capitalist structures of education were redirected to the enterprise of transforming society, the order might be filled.

Radical adult education occurs through the organic presence of adult educators within social movements in a dialectical relationship with organizing.

I take up this theme in a variety of ways throughout the papers that make up this dissertation. In relation to the findings and analysis presented in this paper, I will confine myself to two points.

First, there were no professionally designated "adult educators" in the women's movement in Chile. Nor are there or have there been in most social movements, old or new.

> The majority of radical adult education before and during the time that adult education emerged as a field of study has occurred in settings not necessarily considered educational, and it has been practiced by people not necessarily considered... as educators. (Holst, 2002, p. 5)

Indeed, as Kastner (1993) has pointed out in her study of Canadian social movements, professional adult educators are viewed with suspicion. Yet, adult education and adult educators abound in social movements whether designated as such or not. According to Freire (cited in Holst, 2002), educating and organizing are in a dialectical relationship.

> When we're in the process of mobilizing or organizing it begins to be seen also as an educational problem... Education is *before*, is *during* and is *after*... It's impossible to organize without educating and *being* educated by the very process of organizing. (p. 80)

143

If one concurs with this premise, it becomes apparent that the educational endeavour is integral and inherent in social movement organizing. Not only is everyone a philosopher as Gramsci maintains, so too is everyone an adult educator.

This might appear to imply that there is no role for the particular knowledge and skills that an adult educator might bring to social movements. This is not the case. Traditional "intellectuals are necessary in the construction of socialism. They have served, as representatives of political science and technology, to give the proletariat a consciousness of its historic mission" (Gramsci cited in Holst, 2002, p. 109). Organic and traditional intellectuals who have developed a revolutionary ideology must link together. In Gramsci's (1971) vision of organizing for revolutionary change, intellectuals play a significant role.

> ... There is no organization without intellectuals, that is without organizers and leaders, in other words, without the theoretical aspect of the theory-practice nexus being distinguished concretely by the existence of a people "specialized" in conceptual and philosophical elaboration of ideas. (p. 334)

Furthermore, Holst (2002) maintains that alliances with intellectuals from other classes help the working class to develop a more complete understanding of capitalism.

However, this brings me to my second point and the point upon which I will close this discussion. Adult educators cannot and should not position radical adult education as a professional enterprise from the outside. Although many would disagree, Cunningham (1989) insists that "the education of adults is a social activity, not a discipline and can be seen as unique in that its history is not made behind the backs of people: it is made by people" (p. 40). Only by being "organically" present in movements will the particular skills we have acquired be useful in building consciousness among the citizenry. Very simple in its presentation yet profound in its implications for individual adult educators and the field in general, my admonition is intended to redress the ever-present but, I believe, misguided question of: "What is the role of the adult educator in social movements?" I suggest that a more appropriate question might be: "What is the role of the social movement in the adult educator?"

144

Notes

[1] Note: All translations from transcripts and original sources in Spanish are mine.

[2] Drawn from a critical discourse and from the root word *pueblo* (common people), in both Spanish and English the word "popular," and its derivatives, generally connotes something related to the poorer sectors. For example, a *población* is a neighbourhood where *pobladores/as*, poor or common folk, live.

[3] I provide more detailed information in the introductory chapter of this dissertation. For a discussion of the military coup and dictatorship era, see for example (Bianchi, 1988; Chavkin, 1985; Loveman, 1988; Rojo & Hassett, 1988). For a discussion regarding neo-liberalism in Chile, see for example (Agacino, 1996; Boron & Torres, 1996; Cademartori, 2003; Drake & Jaksic, 1991; Nef, 2003; Schild, 2000; Silva, 1991). See also Bresnahan (2003) and the rest of the authors in this special edition for a recent discussion of the adverse effects of neo-liberal economics on the democratization process in Chile.

[4] The study of women's movements in Chile and elsewhere in Latin America has generated considerable interest (see for example Alvarez, 1990; Baldez, 2002; Chuchryk, 1989; Gaviola et al., 1994; Jaquette, 1989; Jelin, 1990b; Matear, 1997; Schild, 1994; Stephen, 1997; Sternbach et al., 1995; Valdés & Weinstein, 1993; Valenzuela, 1998; Waylen, 1993). How this is manifest in Arica, is addressed in another paper in this dissertation.

[5] Interviews were conducted in Spanish with a total of 60 individuals including in-depth individual interviews, group interviews, and supplementary semi-structured interviews with local governmental and non-governmental organizations. All of the women interviewed had been active in social and/or political movements in Arica at some time during the past 30 years. They ranged in age between 25 and 78 (with an almost equal split between those over and under 50) and represented women from all the left/centre parties, the Catholic Church, community kitchens, the University, and the popular neighbourhoods. More detailed information is provided in the introductory chapter of this dissertation.

[6] Translations of the Spanish terms used in the text are: political consciousness, social consciousness, civic consciousness, social vocation, political education, social education, ideological formation, and conscientization.

[7] Gabriel González Videla was the elected president of Chile from 1946 to 1952. A member of the Radical Party, his party came to power in a coalition that included the Communist Party. However, in 1948 he turned against the communists, initially expelling communists from cabinet and then establishing the "Permanent Law of the Defense of Democracy" which made the Communist Party illegal. This commenced a period of persecution and imprisonment of communist leaders for which he established the first concentration camp in Chile at Pisagua, along the coastline between Arica and Iquique. For this brutal reversal, González Videla is known among the communists as *"el Traidor"* (the Traitor). General Pinochet reinstated the concentration camp at Pisagua in 1973. It was the site of documented executions and torture after the coup.

[8] MIR is Movement of the Revolutionary Left. It is also worth noting that a subset of women had changed party allegiances at various points in their lives and a number had also left their parties in recent years.

[9] This woman became a political leader and, eventually, the mayor of Arica during Allende's presidency. Immediately after the coup, she was imprisoned for a year and then sent to exile by the military junta. She was "hidden" (in her words) for 20 years in Spain, where she worked diligently against the dictatorship, before returning to Arica in 1995. In 2002, the mayor of Arica recognized her for her work with women. At the ceremony, she publicly reiterated that "her accomplishments have been the product of her formation in the Communist Party" (Olivares, 2002, A8).

[10] Salvador Allende was elected to congress in 1937 and was Minister of Health 1939-1942. He was a senator for more than twenty years. He ran for president, unsuccessfully in 1931, 1958 and 1964, and then again successfully in 1970 as part of the Popular Unity coalition.

[11] The reference was to a region-wide biannual feminist conference that had recently been instituted. See Sternbach et al. (1995) for a helpful review of the first 10 years. In 1983, this meeting was held in Lima, Peru. The feminist second wave in Latin America (post-1970) emerged as a consequence of the repressive economic and political situation across the region. See Chovanec (2000) for a summary of this period.

[12] Twenty thousand workers arrived in Iquique from the northern mining communities. The exact number of those killed at the school is contested. Depending on the source, the death toll is between 150 to 2000 (Equipo de Educación Popular, n.d.; Rojas, n.d.).

[13] The feminist identity of the younger women is addressed in another paper in this dissertation.

[14] I use the term 'gendered' to be inclusive of women who do not see themselves as 'feminist.' However, I prefer the term 'feminist' because the term 'gendered' renders the particular struggle of women and critique of patriarchy (as it interacts with imperialism, capitalism, racism, heterosexism and other forms of oppression) invisible.

[15] According to Klandermans (1997), "collective action frames are sets of collective beliefs that serve to create a state of mind in which participation in collective action appears meaningful" (p. 17). Collective action frames have been used to analyze the women's movement in Chile (see for example Franceschet, 2004; Noonan, 1995).

[16] For my analysis, I found Paula Allman's (2001b) rigourous treatment of consciousness (using Marx, Gramsci, and Freire) most useful.

[17] In this section, I also integrate information from a study that was conducted towards a psychology degree on the women's movement in Arica (Cortez D az & Villagra Parra, 1999). I was fortunate to meet with one of the authors during my fieldwork and to obtain a copy of their work. Some of the same women interviewed in their study were also interviewed in mine.

[18] More on distorted vs. critical consciousness follows and also appears in another paper in this dissertation.

[19] There is little argument in the literature that consciousness entails some sort of interplay between person and society, however, most theories place more significance on one or the other of the personal/social dialectic. For example, the most influential theory related to consciousness in North American adult education is Jack Mezirow's

146

(2000; 1990) transformative learning theory that purports to advance a form of critical consciousness through the process of challenging taken-for-granted, uncritically assimilated assumptions. However, the theory has consistently been criticized for its individualistic orientation (Collard & Law, 1989; Collins, 1991; Cunningham, 1992; Scott, 2003). The contributions of Russian psychologist, Len Vygotsky, in relation to the social origins and social nature of human consciousness (Wertsch, 1985) have become increasingly recognized throughout psychology and could provide a valuable extension to the marxist theoretical perspective applied to my discussion. Although his overall thesis is clearly influenced by the socio-historic context of the project of socialism in the Soviet Union, its application in the North American context is through the discipline of developmental psychology where he is seen in contrast to Piaget (see for example Daniels, 1996; Smith et al., 1997; Wertsch, 1985). Applying his concepts to transformative learning theory, as has been initiated by Scott (2003), has the potential to add a more social dimension and radical perspective to transformative learning theory.

[20] In this context, the term "social consciousness" is devoid of the critical notion implicit in its usage among the study participants.

[21] Vatican II and the Conference of Latin American Bishops established the philosophical positioning of the Catholic Church as a "church of the poor" in the 1960s. It heralded the outbreak of liberation theology throughout the region.

[22] I explore the relationship of action and reflection (i.e., praxis) more thoroughly in another paper in this dissertation.

[23] There are differences of opinion in relation to what counts as "feminist" in women's movements. For a discussion of the different perspectives, see for example Alvarez (1990), Beckwith (2000), Franceschet (2004), Jelin (1990a), Molyneux (1998), and Stephen (1997).

[24] The distinct trajectory of the younger women's participation in the women's movement is addressed in another paper in this dissertation.

[25] A more hopeful perspective on the post-dictatorship era is explored in another paper in this dissertation.

[26] See Bresnahan (2003) and the rest of the authors in this special edition for a discussion of the negative effects of neo-liberal economics on the democratization process in Chile.

[27] The three quotes cited in Holst (2002) on the pedagogy of political parties are attributed to Gramsci, Lenin, and Mao Ze-dong, respectively.

147

References

Agacino, Rafael. (1996). El neoliberalismo en Chile: Apertura econónica, competitividad y estrategias empresariales. In Zabrina Peréz A. & Luis Vitale C. (Eds.), *Teoría y Práctica de la Escuela de la Formación Sindical para Mujeres (Chile 1993-1996)* (pp. 15-30). Santiago, Chile: Buntstift.

Allman, Paula. (2001a). *Critical education against global capitalism*. Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Allman, Paula. (2001b). *Revolutionary social transformation: Democratic hopes, political possibilities, and critical education*. Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Alvarez, Sonia E. (1990). *Engendering democracy in Brazil*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Baldez, Lisa. (2002). *Why women protest: Women's movements in Chile*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Beckwith, Karen. (2000). Beyond compare? Women's movement in comparative perspective. *European Journal of Political Research, 37*, 431-468.

Bianchi, Soledad. (1988). Where to begin to grasp this land? Reflections on culture and authoritarianism in Chile: 1973-1986. In Grinor Rojo & John J. Hassett (Eds.), *Chile: Dictatorship and the struggle for democracy* (pp. 53-74). Gaithersburg, MD: Ediciones Hispamérica.

Boron, Atilio Alberto & Torres, Carlos Alberto. (1996). The impact of neoliberal restructuring on education and poverty in Latin America. *Alberta Journal of Educational Research, 42*(2), 102–114.

Bresnahan, Rosalind. (2003). Introduction: Chile since 1990: The contradictions of neoliberal democratization. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(5), 3-15.

Brookfield, Stephen D. (2000). Transformative learning as ideology critique. In Jack Mezirow and Associates (Ed.), *Learning as transformation: Critical perspectives on a theory in progress* (pp. 125-148). San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass.

Cademartori, José. (2003). The Chilean neoliberal model enters into crisis. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(5), 79-88.

Carroll, William K. (Ed.). (1997). *Organizing dissent: Contemporary social movements in theory and practice* (2nd ed.). Toronto: Garamond Press.

Chavkin, Samuel. (1985). *Storm over Chile: The Junta under siege*. Westport, CT: Lawrence Hill and Company.

Chovanec, Donna M. (2000). Latin American Feminism. In Lorraine Code (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of Feminist Theories* (pp. 289-291). New York: Routledge.

Chuchryk, Patricia M. (1989). Feminist anti-authoritarian politics: The role of women's organizations in the Chilean transition to democracy. In Jane S. Jaquette (Ed.), *The women's movement in Latin America: Feminism and the transition to democracy* (pp. 149-184). Boston: Unwin Hyman.

Collard, Sue & Law, Michael. (1989). The limits of perspective transformation: A critique of Mezirow's theory. *Adult Education Quarterly, 39*(2), 99-107.

Collins, Michael. (1991). *Adult education as vocation: A critical role for the adult educator.* New York: Routledge.

Cortez D az, Aylen & Villagra Parra, Milka. (1999). *Imaginario y prácticas socio-políticas de las mujeres opositoras a la Dictadura Militar en Chile.*Unpublished manuscript, Arica, Chile.

Coulson, Margaret A. & Riddell, Carol. (1980). *Approaching sociology.* London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Cunningham, Phyllis M. (1989). Making a more significant impact on society. *New Directions in Continuing Education, 44,* 33-45.

Cunningham, Phyllis M. (1992). From Freire to feminism: The North American experience with critical pedagogy. *Adult Education Quarterly, 42*(3), 180-191.

Daniels, Harry (Ed.). (1996). *An Introduction to Vygotsky.* London: Routledge.

della Porta, Donatella. (1992). Introduction: On individual motivations in underground political organizations. *International Social Movement Research, 4,* 3-28.

Drake, Paul W. & Jaksic, Iván. (1991). Introduction: Transformation and transition in Chile, 1982-1990. In Paul W. Drake & Iván Jaksic (Eds.), *The struggle for democracy in Chile, 1982-1990* (pp. 1-17). Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press.

Equipo de Educación Popular. (n.d.). El juego del siglo: Episodios de la historia del Pueblo de Chile. Santiago, Chile: CIDE.

Foley, Griff. (1999). *Learning in social action: A contribution to understanding informal education.* London: Zed Books.

Franceschet, Susan. (2004). Explaining social movement outcomes: Collective action frames and strategic choices in first- and second-wave feminism in Chile. *Comparative Political Studies, 37*(5), 499-530.

Freire, Paulo. (1990). *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (Myra Bergman Ramos, Trans.). New York: Continuum.

Gaviola, Edda, Largo, Eliana, & Palestro, Sandra. (1994). *Una historia necessaria: Mujeres en Chile 1973-1990.* Santiago, Chile: Authors.

González, Héctor M. (1997). *Conciencia socialista and education in Cuba.* Unpublished masters thesis, University of Alberta, Edmonton, AB.

Gramsci, Antonio. (1971). *Selections from the prison notebooks* (Quinton Hoare & Geoffrey Nowell Smith, Trans.). New York: International Publishers.

Holst, John D. (2002). *Social movements, civil society, and radical adult education.* Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Jaquette, Jane S. (Ed.). (1989). *The women's movement in Latin America: Feminism and the transition to democracy.* Boston: Unwin Hyman.

Jelin, Elizabeth. (1990a). Introduction. In Elizabeth Jelin (Ed.), *Women and social change in Latin America* (pp. 1-11). London: Zed Books and United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.

Jelin, Elizabeth (Ed.). (1990b). *Women and social change in Latin America.* London: Zed Books and United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.

Kastner, Andrea. (1993). *Knowledge and curriculum in contemporary social movements.* Paper presented at the 34th Annual Adult Education Research Conference, University Park, PA.

Klandermans, Bert. (1997). *The social psychology of protest*. Cambridge, MA: Blackwell.

Lange, Elizabeth A. (2004). Transformative and restorative learning: A vital dialectic for sustainable societies. *Adult Education Quarterly, 54*(2), 121-139.

Loveman, Brian. (1988). Military dictatorship and political opposition in Chile. In Grinor Rojo & John J. Hassett (Eds.), *Chile: Dictatorship and the struggle for democracy* (pp. 17-52). Gaithersburg, MD: Ediciones Hispamérica.

Marx, Gary T. & McAdam, Douglas. (1994). *Collective behavior and social movements: Process and structure*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.

Matear, Ann. (1997). "*Desde la protesta a la propuesta*": The institutionalization of the women's movement in Chile. In Elizabeth Dore (Ed.), *Gender politics in Latin America: Debates in theory and practice* (pp. 84-100). New York: Monthly Review Press.

Meyers, Diana Tietjens (Ed.). (1997). *Feminist social thought: A reader*. New York: Routledge.

Mezirow, Jack. (2000). Learning to think like an adult: Core concepts of transformation learning. In Jack Mezirow and Associates (Ed.), *Learning as transformation: Critical perspectives on a theory in progress* (pp. 3-33). San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass.

Mezirow, Jack & Associates (Eds.). (1990). *Fostering critical reflection in adulthood*. San Fransisco: Jossey Bass.

Miller, Francesca. (1990). Latin American feminism and the transnational arena. In Emilie Bergman, Janet Greenberg, Gwen Kirkpatrick, Francine Masiello, Francesca Miller, Marta Morello-Frosch, Kathleen Newman, & Mary Louise Pratt (Eds.), *Women, culture, and politics in Latin America: Seminar on feminism and culture in Latin America* (pp. 10-26). Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Miller, Francesca. (1995). Latin American women and the search for social, political, and economic transformation. In Sandor Halebsky & Richard L. Harris (Eds.), *Capital, power, and inequality in Latin America* (pp. 185-206). Boulder, CO: Westview.

Molyneux, Maxine. (1998). Analysing women's movements. *Development and Change, 29*, 219-245.

Moyano, Maria Jose. (1992). Going underground in Argentina: A look at the founders of a guerilla movement. *International Social Movement Research, 4*, 105-129.

Nef, Jorge. (2003). The Chilean model: Fact and fiction. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(5), 16-40.

Noonan, Rita K. (1995). Women against the state: Political opportunities and collective action frames in Chile's transition to democracy. *Sociological Forum, 10*(1), 81-111.

Olivares, Francisco. (2002, March 9). Alcalde saludó a la mujer ariqueña. *La Estrella*, pp. A-8.

Rojas, Luis Emilio. (n.d.). *Nueva y moderna historia de Chile*. Santiago, Chile: Gong.

Rojo, Grinor & Hassett, John J. (1988). Introduction. In Grinor Rojo & John J. Hassett (Eds.), *Chile: Dictatorship and the struggle for democracy* (pp. 9-16). Gaithersburg, MD: Ediciones Hispamérica.

Schild, Verónica. (1994). Recasting "popular" movements: Gender and political learning in neighborhood organizations in Chile. *Latin American Perspectives, 21*(2), 59–80.

Schild, Verónica. (2000). Neo-liberalism's new gendered market citizens: The 'civilizing' dimension of social programmes in Chile. *Citizenship Studies, 4*(3), 275-305.

Scott, Sue M. (2003). The social construction of transformation. *Journal of Transformative Education, 1*(3), 264-284.

Silva, Eduardo. (1991). The political economy of Chile's regime transition: From radical to "pragmatic" neo-liberal policies. In Paul W. Drake & Iván Jaksic (Eds.), *The struggle for democracy in Chile, 1982-1990* (pp. 98-127). Lincoln, NB: University of Nebraska Press.

Smith, Leslie, Dockrell, Julie, & Tomlinson, Peter (Eds.). (1997). *Piaget, Vygotsky and beyond: Future issues for developmental psychology and education*. London: Routledge.

Stephen, Lynn. (1997). *Women and social movements in Latin America: Power from below*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.

Sternbach, Nancy Saporta, Navarro-Aranguren, Marysa, Chuchryk, Patricia, & Alvarez, Sonia E. (1995). Feminisms in Latin America: From Bogotá to San Bernardo. In Barbara Laslett, Johanna Brenner, & Yesim Arat (Eds.), *Rethinking the political: Gender, resistance, and the state* (pp. 240-281). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Taylor, Verta. (1989). Social movement continuity: The women's movement in abeyance. *American Sociological Review, 54*(October), 761-775.

Universidad de Chile. (1972). *Enciclopedia de Arica*. Arica, Chile: Author.

Valdés, Teresa & Weinstein, Marisa. (1993). *Mujeres que sueñan: Las organizaciones de pobladoras en Chile, 1973-1999*. Santiago, Chile: FLACSO-Chile.

Valenzuela, Mar a Elena. (1998). Women and the democratization process in Chile. In Jane S. Jaquette & Sharon L. Wolchik (Eds.), *Women and democracy* (pp. 47-74). Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University.

Waylen, Georgina. (1993). Women's movements and democratisation in Latin America. *Third World Quarterly, 14*(3), 573-587.

Wertsch, James V. (1985). *Vygotsky and the social formation of mind*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

SOCIAL MOVEMENT PRAXIS:
ANALYZING ACTION AND REFLECTION

[People's] activity consists of action and reflection: it is praxis; it is
transformation of the world. And as praxis, it requires theory to
illuminate it. [People's] activity is theory and practice; it is reflection and
action. (Freire, 1990, p. 119)

That was our proposal. That on par with working to get [Pinochet] out,
the women would prepare themselves, study. (a feminist leader in Arica)[1]

Introduction

Within the study of social movements, there is often implicit acknowledgement that
social movements are sites of profound learning within civil society. However, "learning
in such situations is largely informal and often incidental – it is tacit, embedded in action
and is often not recognised as learning" (Foley, 1999, p. 3). Through a study of the
popular women's movement in Arica, a small city in northern Chile, it is the intent of
my research project to explicitly expose the learning dimension of a social movement
and spotlight the educational processes at work within the movement.[2]

From the election of Salvador Allende in 1970, through the Pinochet dictatorship (1973-
1990), to the present transition to democracy, Chile has undergone tumultuous socio-
political and economic changes. The military coup in 1973 signaled a severe disruption
in a longstanding democratic tradition and represented a brutal example of
encroachment of the state into civil society and the elimination of democratic space: the
constitution was suspended, media censured, political parties and trade unions
prohibited, and thousands were captured and detained, exiled, disappeared, or
executed. Furthermore, extreme economic measures were enforced that consolidated
neo-liberalism in the region, escalating economic hardship for increasing numbers of
citizens and fundamentally changing the social structure of the family and the society.[3]

Paradoxically, political mobilization of women increased sharply in the 1980s in the
midst of state repression and stringent economic policies. At a time when traditional
political avenues were prohibited and men were not as widely available for protest (due
to detention, exile, and migration for employment), the women took up the challenge.
Despite threat to their own lives and livelihoods, women publicly protested against the
human rights abuses of the regime, collectively organized popular subsistence and
survival-oriented initiatives (e.g., collective kitchens), clandestinely disrupted the

152

functioning of the regime, and inaugurated a second wave of feminism linked to grassroots organizing and service provision in poorer neighbourhoods. The strong, persistent and brave actions of the women who constituted the Chilean women's movement were a powerful force in the eventual downfall of the military dictatorship in 1989.[4]

This research is founded on nine months of ethnographic fieldwork in Arica (pop: 180,000), Chile's most northern outpost, more than 2000 km from the capital city of Santiago. Prior to 1973, it was a socially and economically thriving community. After the coup, it became a highly militarized and economically depressed zone. In general, the population is composed of diverse disenfranchised groups such as poor and indigenous peoples. During the study period, I was situated in a local women's NGO, *Casa de Encuentro de la Mujer* (CEDEMU). In addition to cultural immersion, research methods included document review and formal interviews.[5] I followed standard academic ethical procedures and dedicated particular attention to cultural differences and safety issues. I incorporated a variety of means for collaborative analytic reflection in the field. A number of analytical categories emerged early during the fieldwork that seemed promising for theorizing learning and education within social movements. Once these categories were empirically and theoretically elaborated, each became the basis for one of the papers in this dissertation.

In this paper, I take up the notion of *praxis*, the dynamic interaction of action and reflection necessary for social change, and apply it to an analysis of the empirical data from the women's movement in Arica. Rarely are researchers presented with an opportunity to unambiguously analyze a scenario from a particular perspective. From the outset of my immersion into the community, my attention was drawn to repeated references to a clandestine meeting of women held in October of 1983. Concurrently, I was alerted to the potential significance of praxis as an analytical tool by the terminology used by the women themselves. The following statement, made by a woman in my first group interview, stayed with me throughout the research project: "We will get rid of Pinochet and then – what?" My analysis of an especially significant meeting presented a remarkable opportunity to apply a theoretical concept to empirical scrutiny in the real world.

While it may be considered overly simplistic to pursue a definitive analytical path (especially in the shadow of postmodernism), I was convinced from the outset that the account of this meeting cried out to be analyzed from the perspective of praxis.[6] Notwithstanding other factors that could also be considered, I focus here on this

153

interpretation because of its centrality to radical adult education and its potential to contribute to a better understanding of the meaning of praxis in social movements. The notion of the rupture between action/reflection that I pursue here was subjected to analysis and critique in the field through analytical discussion and targeted questions in later interviews.

In the paper preceding this one, I contend that the critical consciousness of the women in Arica was foundational to their subsequent activism. In this paper, I argue that their prior (in the case of the older women) or nascent (in the case of the younger women) critical consciousness was not fully realized due to inadequate attention to its central importance in a critical revolutionary *praxis*. First, I introduce the theoretical construct of praxis from a marxist perspective. Next, I describe "the meeting." Then, through an interaction between empirical data and theoretical literature, I construct my interpretation of this defining moment in the gestation of the women's movement in Arica using the concept of praxis. I follow this with two examples wherein I apply my interpretation by speculating on alternative processes. Lastly, I propose implications for adult education and summarize the chapter.

The Theory: What is Praxis?

Radical adult educators know that for transformative learning and social change to occur, a cycle of both action and reflection are required. This dialectic is termed *praxis.*

The idea of praxis has its roots in early philosophy. It became a central tenet of marxist philosophy in the 1800s (Youngman, 1986). Marx challenged both Hegel's idealist philosophy that held that our ideas create the world and Feuerbach's mechanist materialism wherein the material world is merely recorded as ideas. Rather, Marx contended that ideas originate in our *relationship* with the material world. "Basically, [praxis] refers to the human activity by which people shape and are shaped by the world around them" (Youngman, 1986, p. 55). Praxis is a uniquely human phenomenon because human interaction with the environment is conscious and purposive. "The idea of praxis at the level of individual behaviour therefore conceptualises the connection between consciousness and reality, between thought and action" (Youngman, 1986, p. 56).

To understand praxis, we must grapple with two ideas. First, while I tend to use the words "reflection" and "action," there are many terms that describe the two "internally

related" (Allman, 2001a) facets of praxis. For example, thought, theory, or vision might also signify reflection and practice or experience might alternatively signify action. In the following list, I itemize several terms to point out the centrality, relevance, and basic simplicity of the notion in our everyday lives and to prepare the reader for the variety of terms that appear in quotes below.

TABLE 4-1 REFLECTION AND ACTION WORDS

Reflection[7]	Action
Thought	Practice
Theory	Experience
Knowledge	Production
Consciousness	Work
Speculation	Reality
Vision	
Ideology	
Education	
Learning	
Word	

Second, it was indisputably *not* Marx's intention to present action and reflection as polarities, dualisms or dichotomies as might be suggested by a two-column list such as the one depicted above. Instead, drawing on Hegelian dialectical conceptualization, Marx intended to demonstrate that praxis was a dialectical relationship between action and reflection. As Allman (2001b) explains:

> To understand a phenomenon dialectically, or as a unity of opposites, involves conceptualizing it as composed of two parts that are necessary to each other because they could not exist as they currently do without each other. (p. 52)

Thus, praxis is the dialectical unity of thought and action. In the following quote, Freire (1990) demonstrates the fundamental relationship of action and reflection by drawing attention to the potential consequences of de-linking the two.

> When a word is deprived of its dimension of action, reflection automatically suffers as well; and the word is changed into idle chatter, into *verbalism*... On the other hand, if action is emphasized exclusively, to the detriment of reflection, the word is converted into *activism*. The latter – action for action's sake – negates the true praxis and makes dialogue impossible. (p. 75-76)[8]

While the notion of praxis in radical education is often assumed to imply a revolutionary or transformative phenomenon, this is a misreading of the basic notion. Rather, as noted

155

above, praxis is the dialectical unity between one's thought and one's action in the material world – a neutral interpretation of human experience. It follows then that there are different forms of praxis. Allman (2001a) describes the difference between "uncritical reproductive praxis" and "critical revolutionary praxis" in the following quote.

> If we simply partake in the relations and conditions that we find already existing in the world and assume that these are natural and inevitable – that this is the way things are, always, or at least for a considerable time, have been, and always will be – then our praxis is uncritical and simply reproduces the existing relations... In contrast, we can choose to question critically the existing relations and conditions and actively seek to transform or abolish them and to create relations and conditions that will lead to a better future for all human beings, in which case our praxis becomes critical or revolutionary praxis as opposed to uncritical/reproductive praxis. (p. 167-168)

A critical revolutionary praxis, then, requires a certain *kind* of reflection. Not only does one need to reflect, but also, aided by a revolutionary ideology, one needs to reflect *critically*. Marx, Gramsci and Freire provide us with ideas about what it means to think critically and, in contrast, how we come to *not* think critically. In brief, "control over... the means of mental production" (Marx cited in Youngman, 1986, p. 67) by the oppressors, bourgeois classes, or dominant groups intentionally results in the development of "a distorted and partial consciousness that arises from people's lived experience of bourgeois society" (Allman & Wallis, 1995, p. 124) and reproduces ways of thinking (and acting) that serve the dominant classes. Marx's critique of bourgeois ideology introduced the notion of false consciousness. Gramsci problematized "the more fragmented forms of popular consciousness, namely the type of consciousness he calls 'common sense'" (Allman & Wallis, 1995, p. 124). And Freire (1990), bringing the idea home to education, likened the dominant educational approach to "banking" – as in an "act of depositing" information or knowledge (p. 58).

> The more students work at storing the deposits entrusted to them, the less they develop the critical consciousness which would result from their intervention in the world as transformers of that world. The more completely they accept the passive role imposed on them, the more they tend simply to adapt to the world as it is and to the fragmented view of reality deposited in them... For the more the oppressed can be led to adapt to that situation, the more easily they can be dominated. (p. 60)

In a dialectical conception, it stands to reason that a particular form of thought would be related to a particular form of action. Integrated with a critical consciousness, critical praxis includes actions that are a "critical intervention in reality" (Freire, 1990, p. 68) and

156

that "transform the relations that constitute the social contradictions" (Allman, 2001b, p. 89).

In sum, a critical praxis, conceived as a unity of reflection and action, is a necessary element of social change. It follows, then, that praxis should be evident in a social movement such as the women's movement in Arica.

The Meeting

> On October 29, 1983... they lent us the centre for retired people and there we met, about 60 women, basically militants of parties from the left...
> (Gaviola et al., 1994, p. 161-162)[9]

During approximately two years preceding this portentous meeting, a number of activities organized by women had quietly emerged in Arica that were connected in various ways to the underground activities of the political parties (especially the Communist Party but also including the Socialist Party and *Movimiento Izquierda Revolucionaria*[10]) and the Catholic Church. In October, a small group of women "had this idea... that we would make a larger organization of women," "... with all the women of Arica." So an organizational meeting was held and invitations were prepared and defiantly signed. In such repressive times, what they proposed was extremely risky. Almost as a cautionary reminder of that risk, the day that the invitations were prepared, the house of one of the organizers was ransacked (while she sat on the invitations to hide them from view) and her husband, a Communist Party leader, detained.

Nonetheless, the women held fast to their commitment and the meeting was convened. Despite their brave intentions, however, divergent objectives set the women on a conflicting course from the outset. In part, this is related to the two significant occurrences that acted as precipitating factors for the meeting.[11]

The first precipitating factor relates to the emergence of feminism in Arica. Arising originally from a communist cell composed solely of women,[12] a handful of leftist women who met regularly inadvertently discovered reference to a large gathering of Latin American feminists held earlier in the year.[13] Their mutual experiences of discrimination within their families, society and political parties fuelled their curiosity about the potential of feminist analysis to advance their political struggles. One leader explained how the article prompted them to recognize and challenge their marginalized place in the movement.

157

> We always got together and read about a topic, discussed a topic. And
> there appeared in the *Revista Análisis* a document that had to do with a
> feminist conference. And we read this and, from there, we began to work
> from another angle. I mean, we began to question, with this article, and to
> discuss, and everything. That's how we began to discuss and we began to
> question that... inside the anti-dictatorship movement, the women are the
> ones that go to the front and, at the end, those that appear in the
> declarations are the men. And we began to talk from another perspective,
> the theme of women.

Like their sisters in Santiago, they began to analyze state repression as the ultimate
expression of patriarchal relations entrenched in the private sphere of Chilean society
(Kirkwood, 1986). They hoped to advance the anti-dictatorship struggle by
incorporating feminist analysis and reflection that would simultaneously contribute to
women's advancement in Chilean society. In his chronology of women's movement
activities in Chile, Vitale (1996) encapsulates this phenomenon in the following
summative statement.

> In this decade [1980s], the consciousness of gender combined with an
> anti-dictatorial political consciousness develops. Previously manipulated
> by the parties, women start taking control of their right to decide
> autonomously in the struggle. Under the dictatorship, groups of women
> were developing that related their specific aspirations with the
> mobilizations of the Chilean people to end the military dictatorship. (p.
> 71)

One of the feminist organizers in Arica confirmed, "our idea was to combine these, that
it would have weight, that it would have consciousness, that there was a space for
development. And beyond that, that we would go out but that we would go out in an
organized way." Having been warned that it would be difficult to persuade other
women to this perspective, the women prepared "a type of speech" the night before the
meeting to present their ideas.

The second precipitating factor concerned the detention of four prominent Communist
Party male leaders in August of that same year. Their wives had recently initiated a
series of public demonstrations against the dictatorship in Arica to protest the
detentions. This included the defiant and courageous act of chaining themselves at the
courthouse. To the meeting, they brought a petition denouncing the detentions and
solicited signatures among the women. They imagined that they would democratically
form an association of women that would organize such actions on a larger scale.
Prompted by the recent detentions, they perceived immediate and confrontational action
to be the most urgent need, the single stated objective being to oust the dictatorship.
They saw no immediate relevance of either feminism or "study" as proposed by the

158

organizers because, as one opponent saw it, "in those times there was a specific thing, of the moment, that took away from the time to think about other things outside of that."

No doubt the feminist label separated the women from the outset. According to some sources, the Communist Party "planted" party women to actively oppose the feminist influence and to disrupt the organizers (who were themselves loyal party militants). As has also been noted by others, marxists were suspicious, distrustful and misinformed about feminism.[14] Many women were taken aback by this "foreign" concept and felt manipulated. "They came with an executive already formed," said one woman. The feminists were verbally attacked – accused of being bourgeois, imperialists and traitors.

One woman organizer described the clash of opinions that ensued and the eventual result.

> And it was a fight... First one and then another defended the feminist thesis. And then the other said that, no, first we will organize ourselves to protest the dictatorship and then when the dictatorship is gone, we will see to the other.... And we won the motion... that first we had to throw out the dictatorship. And a small group stayed with CEDEMU and we all left. There in that meeting, we stood up. We were 50 – 40 of us stood up and 10 stayed. We left to form MODEMU and they formed CEDEMU.

The Analysis

Originating within their woman-only communist cell in the early 1980s, a half dozen women embarked on an analytical quest, a "study," whose outcome was to be a redefinition of themselves in the world and a redefinition of the world itself. Based on their material circumstances *as women* in an impoverished and terrorizing reality and within political party structures that reproduced the patriarchal relations of the larger society, the women began to think differently – more critically – about themselves, the struggle, and the society. As their thinking transformed through collective study and dialogue, and as they grew more secure in their analysis, their actions and impacts also changed. Combining their longstanding marxist praxis with their newly discovered feminist praxis promoted the imperative to act, to include their political party comrades in this stimulating praxis, and eventually to convene the meeting. In their view, there was nothing incompatible between the two philosophies. On the contrary, they speculated that the integration of the two held exciting potential for revolutionary practice in their current context.

These women intuitively recognized that "... revolutionary theory and practice must be conceived as a unity. In other words, revolutionary theory must not be seen as a complement or accessory of practice" (Allman & Wallis, 1995, p. 123). Even though they were acutely aware of the need for definitive action against the regime, they had discovered the value of theorizing, studying, and dialoguing as an imperative component of the actions they knew would be necessary. However, their mission was in direct conflict with the dominant perspective that the priorities and needs of the day dictated urgency for single-minded action, leaving no time for reflection or theorizing beyond the established marxist rhetoric. Hence, the women were left misunderstood, isolated, and vigorously opposed by both the other women and their party.

Thus, **the emergence of the women's movement is coincident with the division of the emerging movement** into two philosophically distinct women's organizations, each focused around one of two strong-minded women then active in the Communist Party in Arica. Dazed and bewildered by the reaction of their *compañeras*, the small study circle regrouped and inaugurated *Centro de Estudio de la Mujer* (CEDEMU).[15] With the intention of pursuing a marxist-feminist praxis, these women did community-based feminist work in the *poblaciones* (poor and working class neighbourhoods) raising awareness of the issues of violence and discrimination against women within the context of Chilean society in general and the dictatorship in particular. Meanwhile, the other women officially formed *Movimiento de los Derechos de la Mujer* (MODEMU)[16] and went to the streets every day in open demonstrations, as well as numerous clandestine activities. While the women were also involved in a variety of other, inter-connected initiatives that existed at the time, many of the women aligned themselves with one or the other of these two organizations.[17]

I have already established that revolutionary social change requires a dialectically occurring cycle of both action and reflection. In the Arica situation, while the emerging movement was polarized so too were the two elements of praxis needed for social transformation. Simply stated, MODEMU wanted action while the much smaller CEDEMU hoped to also incorporate reflection. Therefore, **the action/reflection dialectic needed for social change was fractured** from the outset. Cortez D az and Villagra Parra (1999) discovered a similar dynamic in an earlier study of the women's movement in Arica.

> The division between theory and praxis appears here. This is
> demonstrated in two ways: the first is the demand to bring to bear the full
> knowledge of the contingent information on the political and the second
> is the refusal of political theory as a "knowing without practice." These

160

> extreme positions give an account of what was or could be, in any
> moment, an alienated practice. (p. 119)

Without doubt, political and social activism is a powerful tool to achieve social change. In Chile, the singular emphasis on ousting the dictator was a useful means of mobilizing large sectors of women with differing political and class affiliations.[18] Despite their divergent philosophical stances on feminism and on the goals of the women's movement in Arica, there is no question that the women were united, at least, in this common objective. They worked together across political perspectives and class lines and they instituted various initiatives to pull their forces together. Women in Arica, as elsewhere, demonstrated amazing courage, determination and creativity and contributed in large measure to the achievement of the imperative change they sought – the downfall of the dictatorship.

Furthermore, activism is impossible without some form of reflection. As Allman acknowledges, "we do not stop thinking when we act, and thinking itself is a form of action" (2001a, p. 167). In Arica, the women planned their activities, analyzed security issues, evaluated outcomes, and formulated strategies. They learned skills, they discussed politics, and, through their public action, they forced others to think about what was really going on in the country. They infiltrated community organizations and used music, theatre and cultural events to raise awareness. One of the MODEMU leaders admitted too that "in our meetings, one way or another, we selected some literature where they specified the real discrimination in the role of women." "But," she added, "it was information that we had as supplementary." Oftentimes unconsciously (and sometimes in spite of themselves), movement participation prompted many women to critique and challenge their place in society.[19] In this reflection, one MODEMU leader demonstrated her recognition of women's multiple roles and her own development as a leader while in her late thirties.

> The work of a woman is double work, triple work because the woman
> went out into the street and she had to arrive home to cook. And they
> snatched away her husband and hid her husband... So, a woman did
> many things because her work is multiple. Not just going out into the
> street. The woman had to watch her children; she knew the risk she ran.
> When I went into the street, my *compañero* was in prison. I never would
> have gone to the street; I never would have known what the struggle in
> the street was all about. Later, I was the leader of organizations.

Moreover, as discussed at length in another paper, their original route to activism was through their existing social and political consciousness. While claiming that the actions that followed during the dictatorship years were "necessary," ultimately, it was their

161

"power of consciousness" that motivated these women to act, and to act in particular ways.

Nor is the reification or privileging of reflection the desirable approach. As Allman (2001b) points out, "using concepts critically will not, in itself, change anything" (p. 50). I am reminded, too, of Marx's well-known maxim: "The philosophers have only interpreted the world, in various ways; the point is to change it" (Marx, 1977, p. 158). I add Jane Addams' voice of experience: "Perhaps education in a democracy must in the end depend on action" (cited in Cunningham, 1989, p. 39).

Yet, intuitively, many women knew that they needed time to think, to process, to reflect, to prepare and to plan. The CEDEMU organizers explained:

> We weren't against the idea of working against the dictatorship. Our proposal was to prepare the women. For what? Why? For what would happen after Pinocho was out. That was our proposal. That on par with working to get Pinocho out, the women would prepare themselves, study. We were involved in this thing of feminism... We would analyze this feminist current that we did not consider to be incompatible with what we were doing, that it was a different proposal but also libratory. And that what we needed was to maintain a large organization of women for after the tyrant was gone. Because what are we going to do after the tyrant goes?... It wasn't our idea that the women would go back to their homes. At the time, we thought that the women would capacitate themselves... to have leadership.[20]

But women repeatedly told me that "there was no time to think." Given the "triple duty" of mature women and the inconceivably demanding schedule of young women activists during those years, women had almost no "free" time, and little support for reflective activity. This phenomenon is likely typical of underground movements, as the following excerpt from a summary of various biographical studies attests.

> Many recall the time they spent in the underground as a period of frenetic activism... The result of this "24-hours-a-day" commitment to the organization was, as one Italian militant put it, the lack of any time for "thinking," for critically reflecting..." (della Porta, 1992, p. 18)

Not only was there no time to reflect on *what* they were doing, neither was there time to reflect on *why* they were doing it. Older women regretted that "we didn't prepare ourselves politically" and younger women complained that "there was no ideological preparation." Older women, leaders of the women's movement, later assumed "a certain quota of responsibility" for "what was missing, [that is] the preparing of ourselves for afterwards." It was exactly this concern that prompted the leader below to initiate the study concept in the first place.

162

> I quickly started to be bothered by the orders that came from above that weren't discussed, not even analyzed in your cell... It was doing things just for the sake of doing them: go out and throw pamphlets, generate a protest, throw rocks at the cops, go and bang on the railings there in Tucapél [street], make a fuss, you know. But the truth is that I felt that there was no political formation, none.

Younger women were initiated into politics by their involvement in actions, such as barricades in their neighbourhood streets or strikes on campus, so were not so strongly situated ideologically as the older women who had learned their politics in a more open, earlier environment. In one small group interview, two young women who were militants of the Young Communists explained that the lack of an adequate ideology to buttress their action was a precipitating factor for leaving the party.

> I saw it as a process of ideological learning, I mean, like the time when you had to read a lot, to know what the Young Communists are all about, what are the basic principles at least. I believe that not much of this happened... That it was the time to fight and go out into the streets but there was no ideological preparation... We students worked in accordance with our necessities... There was no solidness, ideological solidness. It was like they threw us to the mouth of the lions... For me, the *Pioneros* part was a time to prepare oneself to participate in the larger movement and I felt that it wasn't. I mean, for me, it was like that. And the people that were there, that had to prepare me, didn't.[21]

Conversely, the actions themselves offered rich potential for reflection. Torres (Morrow & Torres, 2002) contemplates that "the question for me is that inside of practice, we have a hidden theory. The point for me is how to unveil the practice at its moments in order to take into the hands the unknown theory" (p. 46). Thus, by interrogating practice (e.g., collective kitchens) more closely, the implicit and partially formed theory or ideology might surface. The following action instigated by MODEMU offers an example.

> We went to the supermarket, the only supermarket that there was. Then, we filled the carts with groceries. And when it came to the moment to move to the cashier, we left them there. We left a symbol as well because not everyone had access to those groceries, only those at some [economic] levels.

In the urgency of the moment, it seems that a resistance to theory, almost an anti-intellectualism, developed within the movement. "A certain hostility to 'theory' ...," as Rosa Luxemburg (cited in Holst, 2002) pointed out a century ago, "is quite natural for people who run after immediate 'practical' results to want to free themselves from such limitations and to render their practice independent of our 'theory'" (p. 4). Likewise, Moyano (1992) reports that, as Argentinean underground groups became more separated from their political intent, a debate ensued between those that "argued this

163

was time to regroup and develop adequate ideological formulations" and those that "held that [their] strength had always resided in [their] a-theoretical behavior" (p. 117). Holst (2002) suggests that "a turn away from theory toward practice" is one of the characteristics of two generations of the "crisis of Marxism" (p. 3).[22]

In Arica, as elsewhere, women effectively united under one objective – that Pinochet be overthrown – and constructed alliances across ideological and class diversity to achieve it. One woman, the lone Christian Democrat, was "rejected by my party because I worked with people from the left." But for her, like others, "the objective was more important than the ideology. We just put the ideology aside." Another concurred, "we forgot about the struggle of the party, we forgot that we were from the communist party, the socialist, we struggled as women... We saw nothing more than that this country was burdened with pain." While there was undeniable strength and effectiveness in these alliances so proudly forged, Gramsci offers a clue to a missing element in the women's movement in Arica that concurs with the perception of the young woman above – the absence of a cohesive ideology.

> The crucial element for Gramsci in holding social movements together was the 'cement' of ideology... in his case the "philosophy of praxis"... Without such theoretical/analytical principles, elements within every social movement only cohere – to borrow Marx's term – like "potatoes in a sack."[23] (Allman & Wallis, 1997, p. 118)

Not surprisingly, Gramsci suggests that a marxist philosophy would make good "cement" for social movements. Such a philosophy would not have been unfamiliar to most of the women's movement participants in Arica. Women raised, educated and committed to socialism or communism through their families, communities, and political parties were favourably situated to take up a critical revolutionary praxis. Those who participated in social actions at the neighbourhood level prior to the coup and those who witnessed the society-changing experiences of the socialist project under Allende had glimpsed the transformative potential of a critical revolutionary praxis. Young women who had heard about the experiences of their parents, and who lamented their own lack of "ideological formation" were hungry for a critical revolutionary praxis. Thus, few women in the MODEMU coalition, or the broader movement, would have resisted the "cement" of marxist philosophy and its methodological implications (i.e., incorporating a critical analysis of capitalism). Moreover, as the quote below suggests, the women in Arica were well positioned to take up a feminist critique on the sound foundational base of the marxist critique. One feminist leader explained how, in her view, the two are "coherent."

164

> I believe that my political formation has served me well in upholding my
> ideological position in the theme of women. For me, my political posture
> and the theme of women are very coherent, although they are
> contradictory inside my party... From the ideological point of view, the
> themes of gender and marxism being coherent in regards to equality.
> Well, the theme was in the famous book, *State and Private Property*, that
> has to do with how Marx saw the theme of women within the whole of a
> socialist society... where men and women are able to have the same
> opportunities, are able to do the same things, are able to have the same
> perspectives of life, of growth, of everything.

Consciously embracing a marxist ideology within the women's movement might have allowed the women to analyze their reality, and the potential of feminist critique, through the benefit of their own marxist philosophies (perhaps combining them in time), thereby salvaging a true revolutionary praxis.

The Application to Practice

As I have argued thus far, the Arica women's movement was hindered by the symbolic and actual schism of the action/reflection dialectic. As Freire states, "there is no authentic praxis outside the dialectical unity, action-reflection, practice-theory" (cited in Morrow & Torres, 2002, p. 134). I speculate that the lack of an "authentic" praxis could, in part, explain why the women's movement could not sustain itself into the transition period despite (a) the women's solid political consciousness, spirited engagement, just cause, gratification in the solidarity of their collective activism, and (b) no absence of consequential causes in need of collective action in the neo-liberal state.

Adult educator Beth Lange (2001) proposes that "critical transformative learning involves a pedagogy of critique (of what is) tempered by a pedagogy of hope (for what could be)" (p. 2). In this section, I apply my analysis to two examples. I identify two theoretical touchstones that, if incorporated into movement praxis, might have contributed a critical analysis that may have amplified the radicalization of the movement. These are: analyzing capitalist relations (critique) and clarifying the vision (hope).

Analyzing Capitalist Relations

I suggest that one useful analytical tool may have been to consider Marx's exhortation to challenge the *relations* of capitalism, not the *results*. In the Chilean case, we can examine the military coup, subsequent dictatorship, and all its political, economic and social

165

brutality within this framework. From documents and testimonies released in the past number of years, it is now indisputable that the military coup in Chile was a direct result of U.S. interference and that the dictatorship was heavily sponsored by the U.S. as part of: (a) an obsessive anti-socialist campaign in the region and, correspondingly, (b) an economic strategy to establish the "neo-liberal laboratory" for the new global economy (see for example Chavkin, 1985).

Critiqued in the manner suggested by Marx, the *result* (the dictatorship) would not then be the sole focus of attention as it was during those years. Rather, an analysis of the neo-liberal project would place the immediate crisis (i.e., the dictatorship) squarely into the capitalist system of *relations*, a system of relations based on economic domination, buttressed by other forms of exploitive relationships (e.g., social, cultural, racial, gender). According to Marx, capitalism is marked by inherent crises due to its own internal contradictions (e.g., the impossibility of never-ending growth, growing gap between rich and poor which increasingly alienates potential markets and negates the "trickle down" theory, the un-liberating freedom of the market). Hence, focusing on the crisis (or symptom) will not fundamentally transform the relations (or cause) from which it emerges. It stands to reason then that "the system cannot be *reformed* so as to produce a more just future for humankind" (Allman, 2001b, p. 80, italics added). Allman (2001b) maintains,

> Marx was able to dispel the notion that such antagonisms could be resolved through reforms. He maintained that in such relations one of the opposites depended, for its continuous existence, on a position of advantage... [The other] can liberate itself from domination and exploitation only by abolishing the relation... (p. 64-65)

I interpret the goal of removing the dictator as one purely of reform because the system is left completely intact once the objective is achieved – precisely what happened. In this sense, removing the dictator was not an adequate goal. Marx exhorts us "not to confuse the starting-point of the struggle and of the revolutionary movement with the goal" (McLellan, 1977, p. 271). Similarly, based on their research with the women in Arica, Cortez D az and Villagra Parra (1999) conclude that the "myth of the common enemy... was confused with the idea of social change." (p. 142). Unlike the mostly unspoken expectations of the women that Chile would swerve back onto its previous socialist path, Chile today carries the unmistakable stamp of the success of the capitalist project. If the women had viewed the dictatorship as one critical (and brutal) crisis of capitalism, they might have been in a position to work towards eradicating the dictatorship while at the same time critically analyzing capitalism, imperialism, globalization, Chile's position

166

in the world economy, and the various exploitive relations, including gender, that underpin it. What the feminists in Arica prophetically recognized was that neither the single objective of removing the dictator nor feminism alone would get them there.

In the following excerpt, Holst (2002) inserts quotes from Ehrenberg in order to make a rebuttal to neo-marxist re-visions of marxist theory that could be applied to the struggle during the dictatorship years, especially during the transition negotiations.[24]

> It is curious how the left looks at history and seems to want to punish itself for "trying to go too far" when we have rarely ever gone far enough. ... In an effort to be more "realistic" by trying to be less ambitious, it becomes less realistic and more utopian... Socialists of late have not suffered from an excess of "orthodoxy" but from "insufficient fidelity to its roots." (p. 72)

In the final years of the dictatorship, various coalitions were formed to pressure an end to the dictatorship and later, to negotiate the transition. Chileans held out hope for the *Asemblea de la Civilidad* (Assembly of Civilians) at which the women's movement was well represented due to its internal coherency and effectiveness during the struggle. Indeed, the women's movement was able to garner some concessions for women through this process. However, a moderating process occurred as the negotiations proceeded. In an effort to make the potential alternative to the dictatorship more palatable, the Chilean left commenced a process of "renovation."[25] First, the Socialist Party split into two groups with the new faction going public and moving politically closer to the centre. Second, through a left-centre alliance the *Concertación por la Democracia* (Coalition for Democracy) was formed that fortified relations with the Christian Democratic Party (in which certain factions remained aligned with Pinochet) and excluded the communist and other far left parties. The effect of the exclusion of the Communist Party in the negotiation process was particularly pronounced in Arica due to the powerful position of the Communist Party historically and during the anti-dictatorship struggle. Third, in return for winning their most sought after goal – ousting the dictatorship – the negotiating *Concertación* accepted a transition pact that included an agreement to retain the neo-liberal economic model previously imposed through force. Fourteen years post-dictatorship, the un-resolvable contradictions between the economic model and the democratic process are undeniable and the continuity between the dictatorship and the still ruling *Concertación* painfully apparent (see for example Bresnahan, 2003). The dictator is gone but the relations of capitalism remain securely in place. Like elsewhere in Latin America, capitalism did a fine job of "... deflect[ing]

167

struggles away from itself and toward the expansion of democracy" (Burawoy cited in Holst, 2002, p.).

Here we can supplement our analysis with Marx and Gramsci's concept of ideology. Marx contended that the dialectical contradictions inherent in bourgeois ideology are masked because they are experienced in different times and spaces (e.g., production and consumption). "It is the repeated experience of this tendency that makes it so difficult to mentally grasp these opposites as related" thus giving the distorted perception of a coherent reality (Allman & Wallis, 1995, p. 124). Gramsci, concentrating specifically on the fragmented popular consciousness known as "common sense," declared that common sense thinking must be exposed and critically analyzed.

In the Chilean example, a now-obvious contradiction was not immediately apparent because ousting the dictatorship was 'naturally' equated as a return to democracy and, in turn, a return to democracy 'naturally' implied a return to socialism (common-sense thinking). Thus, by separating democracy from socialism in the transition period, it was some time before the real impact of a reformist agenda could be grasped. In the meantime, capitalism's reach was solidified, even though Chile now has a 'socialist' president once again.

At twenty-nine years of age, one of the youngest woman in my study group reflected about the work still to be done by the women's movement.

> I ask myself "Why didn't the women continue?" I mean, it isn't a job of
> now we defeated the dictatorship, done, the tyrant is gone. But now
> comes all the work, all the work of construction and reconstruction, of
> reconstructing a people.

Thus, she recognized (as did all of the women in hindsight), that the women's job was not yet complete, that the true objective was not yet won. "The notion within the theory is that if you have a solid political and economic analysis, you will know that falling the dictator will not solve your problems, but be barely a baby step on moving forward. You will probably correctly predict ways that the 'revolution' could be lost after his fall, and the critical importance of certain kinds of steps... " (M. Assheton-Smith, personal correspondence, March 10, 2004). Exactly the point made by the CEDEMU organizers.

Clarifying the Vision

This last point is a useful segue to my next theoretical touchstone. According to my on-line dictionary, the definition of vision includes: an image or concept in the imagination

168

and the ability to anticipate possible future events and developments. Thus, visioning is a reflective process. Vision, or lack thereof, is another way to approach the issue addressed in this paper. Although the term "vision" is rarely used in marxist theorizing, Allman (2001b) eloquently speaks to it in her book *Revolutionary Social Transformation*. As a political activist and radical adult educator, the vision to which she is committed is a "process of social transformation based on the writings of Karl Marx" (p. 7). She is adamant about the role of vision in the process of social transformation. She argues that we must dialogue, debate, and struggle together to come to some form of shared and cohesive vision about the meaning of socialism and social transformation that brings together our various efforts towards social change.

> Without vision, or what can be called social imagination, the type of
> social transformation advocated in this book would be impossible. If we
> are going to create a more humanized form of existence, we need at least
> a broad notion of what this would entail... I make no claims that
> overcoming capitalism and other aspects of injustice and oppression will
> be easier given a clearer vision of what we might be trying to create.
> However, I cannot understand how we can get anywhere without a clear
> and realistic vision. (p. 9-10)

Reiterating Freire's principles of moral philosophy, Morrow and Torres (2002) include one related to the concept of vision that I am postulating here.

> We ought (collectively and dialogically) to consider what kind of world –
> what social structures, processes, relationships, and so on – would be
> necessary to enable (all) people in a given social setting to pursue their
> humanization. (p. 104)

Vision, in Allman's (2001b) usage, is neither totalitarian nor utopian.

> It is primarily an expression of values rather than a blueprint, as the latter
> would thwart the creative intervention of human beings. This creative
> intervention is one of the – if not the – most fundamental values in Marx's
> vision; therefore, a blueprint would be sheer hypocrisy. (p. 7) Any vision
> worth striving for must be realistic rather than whimsical. It must be
> based on considerations and critiques of the past and present human
> condition. In other words, to be achievable, a vision must be derived from
> the real, the material world. (p. 9)

In Arica, the vision of what the new democracy would look like and what would be women's place in it was not openly discussed. In interview after interview, I heard that citizens fought together to rid themselves of the military regime without a vision or a clear sense of what should follow. One of the underground leaders voiced a regret shared by others. "It's frustrating... we committed a grave error. We worked exclusively to overthrow, so that Pinochet would be gone. But we did not make a definite

169

alternative of what to do after that. I believe that is also the cost that we are paying."
Younger women did not voice even a shadowy outline of the future, likely due in part to
their youth and lack of experience in a democratic environment, but also associated with
lack of attention to the issue. One young woman, "blaming" her elders in the
Communist Party for her lack of "political preparation," made the following
observation.

> I've lived all my life in the dictatorship... I don't know what it is to live in
> democracy... [They] know the difference between democracy and
> dictatorship.

If the older women held any assumption at all, it was that Arica would return to the
socialist project that they knew from the Allende era. This woman, who hosted a
collective kitchen in her home, spoke for the majority when she recalled,

> I thought that it was going to be something that looked more or less like
> the time of Allende, that we were going to continue the same, with the
> same rights for the workers, the same opportunity for all to work... So we
> all had hope that it would again be like before, nothing more.

That is not what they got. As one women said, "we thought that democracy was going
to return and recuperate everything... I think that the expectations were too high." On
the contrary, their expectations may not have been high enough. "Making capitalism
more egalitarian, more equitable, more accountable to the poor and to minority
populations, and more friendly overall... doesn't go far enough because it doesn't
challenge the basic laws of motion of capital and existing social relations of production
(McLaren's foreword in Holst, 2002, p. xvii).

Or maybe their expectations were not formulated *clearly* enough. The clearest objective
was an *absence* of something (the dictator) rather than a solid notion of the *creation* of
something (democracy/socialism). In all my interviews (formal and informal), the
women criticized the current situation in Chile, from the privatization of the health care
system and pension plans to growing poverty and unemployment to cultural
imperialism to Constitutional stagnation.[26] The most heart rendering sentiment that I
heard over and over again was the kind of self-questioning that these women shared in
a my first group interview.

> And you say, "why did we struggle so much to have a democracy? For
> what? For this? This is what we were searching for?"
>
> After having participated in so many things, there comes a moment also
> when... you say, "well of all this, what? What?" That after having

170

contributed with such caring, with such surrender, a moment arrives in which one starts to become desperate.

The Implications for Radical Adult Education

> Adult education thus turns out to be the most reliable instrument for social actionists... Every social action group should at the same time be an adult education group, and I go even so far as to believe that all successful adult education groups sooner or later become social action groups. (Lindeman cited in Rachal, 2000, p. 166)

In my view, an analysis of the marxist concept of praxis in the Arica context leaves little doubt as to the organic nature of education within social movements. What the CEDEMU/feminist women proposed was a "study" component to their mobilization that would prepare them for "*despúes de*" (after the dictatorship); what the younger women in the *poblaciones* craved was "ideological preparation" connected to their activism. Unlike most of us in North America, these women had the historical example of just these kinds of education. They knew or knew of educational processes similar to what Freire (1990) calls "the pedagogy of the oppressed" which "makes oppression and its causes objects of *reflection* by the oppressed, and from that reflection will come their *necessary engagement* in the struggle for their liberation" (p. 33, italics added). This quote succinctly contains the elements of a true revolutionary praxis (i.e., reflection and engagement) and precisely encapsulates the motivating "*necesidad*" the women described to me – that sense of urgency that originated from the pre-dictatorship political education acquired within their families, communities and political parties, and that imposed upon them the imperative to act.

The type of organic educational activity that had been experienced by these women was abruptly interrupted by the military coup. The official educational curriculum in schools and universities was drastically revised and enforced by the dictatorship and non-official educational materials destroyed. Meetings of any kind were forbidden. All sources of potentially 'political' discourse were banned (verbal, written, musical, etc.) and if discovered could result in severe punishment. People were suspicious of each other and protective of their own; they lived in fear and operated in secrecy. So, in order to protect their families, women did not openly teach their children to think critically as they were taught and family members kept their activities secret from each other. In this environment, it was a remarkable challenge for the social and political organizations to have clandestinely re-established themselves as they did. Not only did the political parties, unions, churches, and women's organizations circumvent the official apparatus,

171

so too did school children and youth clandestinely participate in the *Pioneros* and *la Jota* (the Young Communists).[27] Also unlike many North American women, these women were educated to act and moreover, to act politically. Indeed, the definition of 'political' was re-crafted by the women's movement here as elsewhere. In this excerpt, one young woman defines "political" in the context of the anti-dictatorship women's movement. "But all of them were making ends meet and all of them were organized. And that is political, huh, that is doing politics." Education for social action in this context included learning how to run a mimeograph machine, make Molotov cocktails, resist detention and torture, organize a protest, and cook for the entire neighbourhood among numerous other requirements of the challenging material conditions of their lives.

However, "the real starting place for the political activist is the point that people think" (Allman & Wallis, 1995, p. 125). Gramsci contends that "... 'everyone' is a philosopher and that it is not a question of introducing from scratch a scientific form of thought into everyone's individual life, but of renovating and making 'critical' an already existing activity" (Gramsci, 1971, p. 330-331). But, he cautions that this does not happen spontaneously. "The active man-in-the-mass has a practical activity but no clear theoretical consciousness of his practical activity" (Gramsci, 1971, p. 333). The point here is that everyone thinks, but we may need help to learn to think critically. In Gramsci's view, "organic intellectuals," intellectuals who arise from within the masses and who remain of the masses, provide such assistance. It is the role of these intellectuals to facilitate the process of critical reflection and analysis. Just such an activity emerged organically in Arica among the women who comprised the original woman-only communist cell. Yet, as can be seen in the following exchange between a CEDEMU and a MODEMU leader, they blame themselves for letting so many women slip through their fingers.

> CEDEMU: Do you think that there was a certain quota of responsibility in those women that participated in those instances, like MODEMU and CEDEMU, with respect to the others that were *pobladoras*, in terms of education?

> MODEMU:I believe so. I believe that we lived responding to daily happenings, in the contingency, we lived the contingency. And afterwards, each one went to her home. What was missing was the preparing of ourselves for afterwards.

> CEDEMU: We had so many women in our hands, so many; an incredible power of calling the women together.

172

Thus, the various organizations were able to minimally conscientize the citizenry and mobilize them for mass action but did not, it seems, provide the type of educational depth that at least some of the women in Arica sought. Due to the fracture of the women's movement and the smaller impact and influence of CEDEMU (as well as other factors), the space to work out a shared (and critical) ideology, as Allman recommends above, was not available. Without a clear ideology, the full potential of their critical consciousness was not realized. So, the established consciousness of the older women failed them and the nascent consciousness of the younger women was unfulfilled. Ultimately, there was no theory to maintain their solidarity and capacity to work together.

Still, Gramsci claims that, among "disparate social elements" acting in the desperation of their situation, is an opportunity to be "educated, directed... in a living and historically effective manner" (cited in Allman & Wallis, 1995, p. 134-135). In other words, an "opportunity for critical, Marxist education" (Allman & Wallis, 1995, p. 134). During the anti-dictatorship struggle in Chile, political parties and other movements (e.g., worker, student, and women's movements) had a role to play in conscientizing the "disparate elements." The neo-liberal laboratory in which they lived required a counterpart in an analysis of neo-liberalism (and the associated relations of domination). Both the laboratory and the analysis are educational activities. The laboratory being the site of learning through experimenting with altered (and profoundly unjust) material conditions and the analysis being the required reciprocal activity of learning through the critical consciousness of those material conditions. Exactly the intent of consciousness-raising or conscientization. As marxists well know, material conditions form the basis of a critical consciousness.

But what is to be done today, fourteen years into the 'transition'? Clearly, women still have a critical consciousness and an astute ability to analyze themselves and their social, political, and economic reality. Indeed, such an analysis is characteristic of Chilean society, even among self-identified 'apolitical' citizens and the many that have dropped out of the institutionalized political process in Chile (Olavarr a, 2003).[28] Moreover, as I argue in another paper in this dissertation, despite the women's pessimism, pockets of activity are still realized by the same core group of women that were active in the post-dictatorship struggle.

There is no reason to assume that critical praxis could not yet be built on this solid foundation. On the contrary, notwithstanding the so-called 'crisis of the left' and the useful critiques introduced by postmodernism, never has it been more important to

173

engage in a solid critique of capitalism. As Peter McLaren states in his introduction to Holst's (2002) book on social movements,

> education scholars are finally beginning to take a long-overdue notice of this beast and connect its selective appetite to advanced capitalism's missing persons list. Educational researchers are finally directing their attention to the living contradictions of capital. (p. xv-xvi)

Herein, lies the critical importance of adult education today. "The political explanation of concrete problems in struggle *is* radical adult education" (Holst, 2002, p. 113, italics added). The adult educators whom I reference in this paper offer just such an approach to adult education in social movements through a rejuvenated reading of Marx and Gramsci (Allman, 2001b; Foley, 1999; Freire, 1990; Holst, 2002).

Applying critical consciousness and analytic capacities to the *current* material conditions existing in Chile, offers a starting place for a renewed pedagogy of critique and revitalized pedagogy of hope (Lange, 2001). Starting from this new place – the previously unimagined neo-liberal present – and building on the past, with new analyses, new visions, new actions, and sharing "... not only what we are doing but also our reflections on why we have chosen to engage in a particular struggle and how we think this might relate to the global campaign for social transformation" (Allman, 2001b, p. 5). For feminists today, this analysis would include "acknowledg[ing] differences in women's lives as well as links between transnational power structures" (Grewal & Kaplan, 1994, p. 27) and analyzing how "under democracy, oppression now looks different, as do the oppressors and circumstances in which women might win or lose" (Fitzsimmons, 2000, p. 217). Referring to the position of DAWN (a feminist international development organization), Francisco (2003) notes that women's struggle must be multi-dimensional.[29]

> Gender inequity in power relations cannot be separated from other power inequalities. It is deeply entangled. Thus, it is futile to address gender issues singly, exclusively and in isolation from other struggles against unjust and undemocratic power systems. (p. 24)

Understandings about transnational capital, market-driven globalization, liberalization of financial markets, international monetary institutions, and all the other machinations of neo-liberalism are much harder to grasp than the specific 'enemy' embodied in one unquestionably brutal dictator. Moreover, effectively tackling the more amorphous 'enemy' requires the roll-up-your-sleeves, soul-searching, uncomfortable, conflictual, collaborative work of dealing with difference and diversity, while at the same time building some kind of unity (so as to avoid the "potatoes in the sack" approach). The

174

gender discrimination in the left and the class discrimination in the women's movement, among other forms of domination *within* oppositional struggles, are well known. The only way forward is to recognize multiple and intersecting oppressions and contextualize them within broader political, economic, and historical issues and interests.

Summary

A meeting held in October 1983 signaled the birth of the second wave of the women's movement in Arica and set the stage for the future of the movement. While individual understandings of exactly what happened (and why) at the meeting in 1983 differ, it is clear that the meeting precipitated a chain of activity that was sustained in diverse forms until the end of the dictatorship. Nonetheless, the emergence of the movement is coincident with the division of the emerging movement into two philosophically distinct women's organizations, MODEMU and CEDEMU, that in turn fractured the action/reflection dialectic – the dialogue, the critical consciousness – needed for social change. Regrettably, by marginalizing the reflective component proposed by the feminists, the women were left without a clear analysis of their socio-political situation or a vision for what would or could follow. Since the elections of 1990, older women have generally returned to their homes and their previous lives. Younger women whose formative years were framed by both the dictatorship and the struggle, have opted out in disillusionment and disappointment. In retrospect, some women feel that the division of the movement and the lack of a "study" component was a strategic error. Some feel that the near demise of MODEMU proves the point – the organization could not sustain itself once the sole objective for their action was achieved (even though the figurehead remains in place).

Twelve years post-dictatorship, the women of Arica wonder how they arrived, after all their sacrifice and struggle, at this neo-liberal, "pseudo-democracy"[30] where they see only growing poverty and isolation in Arica and little real change for women. To their dismay, they realize now that "then what?" was neither answered nor asked during the anti-dictatorship struggle. Many now see the need to have been more concrete in their vision, combining it with a critical analysis of the real world. They are remembering and reflecting on their past, their present, and their future and cautiously anxious to take action once again.

In this research project, I document not only actual learning *processes*, but also specific learning *effects* – effects that had important consequences on the collective movement and the individual actors. The analytical category addressed in this paper exemplifies the *organic* educative and learning dimension of social movements and the vital importance of the action/reflection dialectic. In the Chilean case, the urgency of the anti-dictatorship struggle left little room for an anti-capitalist, anti-sexist, anti-racist analysis, even within the left. I argue that, ultimately, the socialist and feminist dialectic that we call praxis was inhibited in this instance by a lack of an "explicit curriculum" (Youngman, 1986, p. 106) of concrete theorizing – a vital role of political parties and other social movements.

I conclude this paper by arguing that the women in Arica are in a sound position to engage in a true revolutionary praxis – through *reflection* on "a pedagogy of critique and a pedagogy of hope" (i.e., critical analysis and vision) informing new *actions* for the current, but hardly less traumatic, capitalist era in Chile. Will action and reflection join hands in the next wave of the women's movement in Arica?

Notes

[1] Note: All translations from transcripts and original sources in Spanish are mine.

[2] Drawn from a critical discourse and from the root word *pueblo* (common people), in both Spanish and English the word "popular," and its derivatives, generally connotes something related to the poorer sectors. For example, a *población* is a neighbourhood where *pobladores/as*, poor or common folk, live.

[3] I provide more detailed information in the introductory chapter of this dissertation. For a discussion of the military coup and dictatorship era, see for example (Bianchi, 1988; Chavkin, 1985; Loveman, 1988; Rojo & Hassett, 1988). For a discussion regarding neo-liberalism in Chile, see for example (Agacino, 1996; Boron & Torres, 1996; Cademartori, 2003; Drake & Jaksic, 1991; Nef, 2003; Schild, 2000; Silva, 1991). See also Bresnahan (2003) and the rest of the authors in this special edition for a recent discussion of the adverse effects of neo-liberal economics on the democratization process in Chile.

[4] The study of women's movements in Chile and elsewhere in Latin America has generated considerable interest (see for example Alvarez, 1990; Baldez, 2002; Chuchryk, 1989; Gaviola et al., 1994; Jaquette, 1989; Jelin, 1990; Matear, 1997; Schild, 1994; Stephen, 1997; Sternbach et al., 1995; Valdés & Weinstein, 1993; Valenzuela, 1998; Waylen, 1993). How this is manifest in Arica, is addressed in another paper in this dissertation.

[5] Interviews were conducted in Spanish with a total of 60 individuals including in-depth individual interviews, group interviews, and supplementary semi-structured interviews with local governmental and non-governmental organizations. All of the

176

women interviewed had been active in social and/or political movements in Arica at some time during the past 30 years. They ranged in age between 25 and 78 (with an almost equal split between those over and under 50) and represented women from all the left/centre parties, the Catholic Church, community kitchens, the University, and the popular neighbourhoods. More detailed information is provided in the introductory chapter of this dissertation.

[6] Certainly, I do not believe that this could be the only or defining factor or the sole interpretation of the significance of this meeting. Indeed, there are multiple factors for any process or outcome in every situation that interact in complex and imprecise ways. My analysis reveals that a number of factors contributed to a rupture in the women's movement in Arica: anti-feminist elements, especially in the Communist Party who actively sought to discredit the women; strongly held and divergent views about the type of activities needed (reflection vs. action); and strong-minded and powerfully situated leaders in both camps. In other words, a dynamic interaction between structural, ideological, and personal differences.

[7] I find it interesting that there is such a multiplicity of terms to describe the reflective part of the dialectic, which in the present day is generally less valued.

[8] Elsewhere, Freire adds illustrative adjectives: "simple verbalism" and "blind activism" (cited in Morrow & Torres, 2002, p. 134). We generally use the term *activism* to signify the totality of social movement work, implying perhaps that we are typically guilty of Freire's accusation.

[9] This meeting is mentioned in the book from which this quote is drawn, *Una Historia Necesaria* (Gaviola et al., 1994). It is a book on the Chilean women's movement that makes some attempt to capture regional activities of the period. A woman who also participated in my study chronicles the brief section on Arica.

[10] MIR is Movement of the Revolutionary Left.

[11] It may be a testament to the geographic and political isolation of the city that the occurrence of the meeting in 1983 seems merely coincidental with other important events of the same period: the emergence of massive protest and women's activism in the capital in the same year, the 1982 publication of Julieta Kirkwood's (1986) seminal theoretical work on feminism in Chile, and the re-birth of MEMCH in 1983 (a women's organization previously active during the struggle for suffrage).

[12] Historically, there have been women's departments and woman-only cells in the communist and other parties in Chile.

[13] The reference was to a region-wide biannual feminist conference that had recently been instituted. See Sternbach et al. (1995) for a helpful review of the first 10 years. In 1983, this meeting was held in Lima, Peru.

[14] Emerging as it did out of the disillusionment of leftist women, the debate about whether and how socialism and feminism could be integrated played a pivotal role early in second-wave feminism throughout Latin America especially at the regional feminist conferences. See for example Chinchilla (1992), Stephen (1997), Sternbach, et al. (1995). In Arica, the idea of a feminist/socialist fusion was continuously contentious. At one point, a prominent woman communist party leader was sent to dissuade the CEDEMU leaders from their feminist mission. Another time a feminist leader from Santiago attempted to persuade the MODEMU president of the merits of the feminist perspective. Neither camp was deterred from their paths.

177

[15] Women's Study Centre. Later it retained the acronym CEDEMU but was renamed *Casa de Encuentro de la Mujer* (Meeting Place for Women).

[16] MODEMU is Movement for Women's Rights. For some time, I struggled to understand how an organization claiming *not* to be concerned about gender issues had called itself the "Movement for Women's Rights." (Non-MODEMU participants found it "ironic.") Finally, one of the participants made it clear that the organization's name was a pseudonym, a common practice of the time in order to mask the true identities of individuals and the real motives of organizations for their own protection. Nonetheless, in reviewing the transcripts, I wonder whether the name did not hold greater significance than they intended.

[17] The range of organizations and activities that made up the women's movement in Arica are discussed in another paper in this dissertation.

[18] See women's movement references cited above.

[19] See women's movement references cited above.

[20] "Pinocho," is the Spanish word for Pinocchio and is a derogatory reference to the Chilean dictator, General Augusto Pinochet.

[21] *Pioneros* is a Communist Party group for younger children.

[22] Holst (2002) argues that "the current crisis of Marxism can be seen as one more crisis in a long history of crises since at least the defeats of the revolutions of 1848" (p. 3). He finds commonalities in the current crisis to that of the crisis at the turn of the nineteenth century.

[23] While writing in prison, Gramsci masked risky concepts by using euphemisms. The "philosophy of praxis" was Gramsci's code word for Marxist philosophy.

[24] By way of example, Holst (2002) chastizes the Chilean left for not going "far enough" during the Allende years: "The problem for example, during the Allende years in Chile was not that the left was too revolutionary but that it was not revolutionary enough" (p. 72).

[25] The Chilean 'renovation' process also coincides with a global 'crisis of the left' that spawned so-called 'new left' theorizing throughout the world.

[26] I write more on the women's own analysis of the current situation in Chile in another paper in this dissertation.

[27] No youth groups from other political parties operating clandestinely were mentioned to me.

[28] By Olavarr a's (2003) calculation, forty percent of the Chilean electorate "chose not to voice a preference" in the 1997 parliamentary elections, including one million young people who did not register to vote (p. 10). This reportedly compares to ninety-eight percent voter turnout in 1990 when the transition began. In contrast, in the Santiago *poblaciones*, she found high levels of social consciousness and social activism occurring outside the formal political process.

[29] From DAWN's website: "Development Alternatives With Women for a New Era is a network of women scholars and activists from the economic South who engage in feminist research and analysis of the global environment and are committed to working for economic justice, gender justice and democracy." http://www.dawn.org.fj/

178

[30] The women claim that their's is not a democracy, but a dictatorship of a different sort – an economic one ("a dictatorship in suit and tie"). They are very critical of the Chilean political, economic and social situation.

References

Agacino, Rafael. (1996). El neoliberalismo en Chile: Apertura econónica, competitividad y estrategias empresariales. In Zabrina Peréz A. & Luis Vitale C. (Eds.), *Teoría y Práctica de la Escuela de la Formación Sindical para Mujeres (Chile 1993-1996)* (pp. 15-30). Santiago, Chile: Buntstift.

Allman, Paula. (2001a). *Critical education against global capitalism*. Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Allman, Paula. (2001b). *Revolutionary social transformation: Democratic hopes, political possibilities, and critical education*. Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Allman, Paula & Wallis, John. (1995). Gramsci's challenge to the politics of the left in 'Our Times'. *International Journal of Lifelong Education, 14*(2), 120-143.

Allman, Paula & Wallis, John. (1997). Commentary: Paulo Freire and the future of the radical tradition. *Studies in the Education of Adults, 29*(2), 113-120.

Alvarez, Sonia E. (1990). *Engendering democracy in Brazil*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Baldez, Lisa. (2002). *Why women protest: Women's movements in Chile*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Bianchi, Soledad. (1988). Where to begin to grasp this land? Reflections on culture and authoritarianism in Chile: 1973-1986. In Grinor Rojo & John J. Hassett (Eds.), *Chile: Dictatorship and the struggle for democracy* (pp. 53-74). Gaithersburg, MD: Ediciones Hispamérica.

Boron, Atilio Alberto & Torres, Carlos Alberto. (1996). The impact of neoliberal restructuring on education and poverty in Latin America. *Alberta Journal of Educational Research, 42*(2), 102–114.

Bresnahan, Rosalind. (2003). Introduction: Chile since 1990: The contradictions of neoliberal democratization. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(5), 3-15.

Cademartori, José. (2003). The Chilean neoliberal model enters into crisis. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(5), 79-88.

Chavkin, Samuel. (1985). *Storm over Chile: The Junta under siege*. Westport, CT: Lawrence Hill and Company.

Chinchilla, Norma Stolz. (1992). Marxism, feminism, and the struggle for democracy in Latin America. In Arturo Escobar & Sonia E. Alvarez (Eds.), *The making of social movements in Latin America* (pp. 37-51). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Chuchryk, Patricia M. (1989). Feminist anti-authoritarian politics: The role of women's organizations in the Chilean transition to democracy. In Jane S. Jaquette (Ed.), *The women's movement in Latin America: Feminism and the transition to democracy* (pp. 149-184). Boston: Unwin Hyman.

Cortez D az, Aylen & Villagra Parra, Milka. (1999). *Imaginario y prácticas socio-políticas de las mujeres opositoras a la Dictadura Militar en Chile.*Unpublished manuscript, Arica, Chile.

Cunningham, Phyllis M. (1989). Making a more significant impact on society. *New Directions in Continuing Education, 44,* 33-45.

della Porta, Donatella. (1992). Introduction: On individual motivations in underground political organizations. *International Social Movement Research, 4,* 3-28.

Drake, Paul W. & Jaksic, Iván. (1991). Introduction: Transformation and transition in Chile, 1982-1990. In Paul W. Drake & Iván Jaksic (Eds.), *The struggle for democracy in Chile, 1982-1990* (pp. 1-17). Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press.

Fitzsimmons, Tracy. (2000). A monstrous regiment of women? State, regime, and women's political organizing in Latin America. *Latin American Research Review, 35*(2), 216-229.

Foley, Griff. (1999). *Learning in social action: A contribution to understanding informal education.* London: Zed Books.

Francisco, Josefa S. (2003). Paradoxes for gender in social movements. *Development, 46*(2), 24-26.

Freire, Paulo. (1990). *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (Myra Bergman Ramos, Trans.). New York: Continuum.

Gaviola, Edda, Largo, Eliana, & Palestro, Sandra. (1994). *Una historia necessaria: Mujeres en Chile 1973-1990.* Santiago, Chile: Authors.

Gramsci, Antonio. (1971). *Selections from the prison notebooks* (Quinton Hoare & Geoffrey Nowell Smith, Trans.). New York: International Publishers.

Grewal, Inderpal & Kaplan, Karen. (1994). Introduction: Transnational feminist practices and questions of postmodernity. In Inderpal Grewal & Karen Kaplan (Eds.), *Scattered hegemonies: Postmodernity and transnational feminist practices* (pp. 1-33). Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Holst, John D. (2002). *Social movements, civil society, and radical adult education.* Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Jaquette, Jane S. (Ed.). (1989). *The women's movement in Latin America: Feminism and the transition to democracy.* Boston: Unwin Hyman.

Jelin, Elizabeth (Ed.). (1990). *Women and social change in Latin America.* London: Zed Books and United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.

Kirkwood, Julieta. (1986). *Ser política en Chile: Las feministas y los partidos.* Santiago, Chile: FLACSO.

Lange, Elizabeth Ann. (2001). *Living transformation: Beyond midlife crisis to restoring ethical space.* Unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Alberta, Edmonton, AB.

Loveman, Brian. (1988). Military dictatorship and political opposition in Chile. In Grinor Rojo & John J. Hassett (Eds.), *Chile: Dictatorship and the struggle for democracy* (pp. 17-52). Gaithersburg, MD: Ediciones Hispamérica.

Marx, Karl. (1977). Theses on Feuerbach. In David McLellan (Ed.), *Karl Marx: Selected writings* (pp. 156-158). Oxford, England: Oxford University Press.

Matear, Ann. (1997). "*Desde la protesta a la propuesta*": The institutionalization of the women's movement in Chile. In Elizabeth Dore (Ed.), *Gender politics in Latin America: Debates in theory and practice* (pp. 84-100). New York: Monthly Review Press.

McLellan, David (Ed.). (1977). *Karl Marx: Selected writings*. Oxford, England: Oxford University Press.

Morrow, Raymond A. & Torres, Carlos Alberto. (2002). *Reading Freire and Habermas: Critical pedagogy and transformative social change*. New York: Teacher's College Press.

Moyano, Maria Jose. (1992). Going underground in Argentina: A look at the founders of a guerilla movement. *International Social Movement Research, 4,* 105-129.

Nef, Jorge. (2003). The Chilean model: Fact and fiction. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(5), 16-40.

Olavarr a, Margot. (2003). Protected neoliberalism: Perverse institutionalization and the crisis of representation in postdictatorship Chile. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(6), 10-38.

Rachal, John R. (2000). We'll never turn back: Adult education and the struggle for citizenship in Mississippi's Freedom Summer. *Adult Education Quarterly, 50*(3), 166-196.

Rojo, Grinor & Hassett, John J. (1988). Introduction. In Grinor Rojo & John J. Hassett (Eds.), *Chile: Dictatorship and the struggle for democracy* (pp. 9-16). Gaithersburg, MD: Ediciones Hispamérica.

Schild, Verónica. (1994). Recasting "popular" movements: Gender and political learning in neighborhood organizations in Chile. *Latin American Perspectives, 21*(2), 59–80.

Schild, Verónica. (2000). Neo-liberalism's new gendered market citizens: The 'civilizing' dimension of social programmes in Chile. *Citizenship Studies, 4*(3), 275-305.

Silva, Eduardo. (1991). The political economy of Chile's regime transition: From radical to "pragmatic" neo-liberal policies. In Paul W. Drake & Iván Jaksic (Eds.), *The struggle for democracy in Chile, 1982-1990* (pp. 98-127). Lincoln, NB: University of Nebraska Press.

Stephen, Lynn. (1997). *Women and social movements in Latin America: Power from below.* Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.

Sternbach, Nancy Saporta, Navarro-Aranguren, Marysa, Chuchryk, Patricia, & Alvarez, Sonia E. (1995). Feminisms in Latin America: From Bogotá to San Bernardo. In Barbara Laslett, Johanna Brenner, & Yesim Arat (Eds.), *Rethinking the political: Gender, resistance, and the state* (pp. 240-281). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Valdés, Teresa & Weinstein, Marisa. (1993). *Mujeres que sueñan: Las organizaciones de pobladoras en Chile, 1973-1999.* Santiago, Chile: FLACSO-Chile.

Valenzuela, Mar a Elena. (1998). Women and the democratization process in Chile. In Jane S. Jaquette & Sharon L. Wolchik (Eds.), *Women and democracy* (pp. 47-74). Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University.

Vitale, Luis C. (1996). Cronolog a comentada del movimiento de mujeres en Chile. In Zabrina Peréz A. & Luis Vitale C. (Eds.), *Teoría y Práctica de la Escuela de la Formación Sindical para Mujeres (Chile 1993-1996)* (pp. 59-74). Santiago, Chile: Buntstift.

Waylen, Georgina. (1993). Women's movements and democratisation in Latin America. *Third World Quarterly, 14*(3), 573-587.

Youngman, Frank. (1986). *Adult education and socialist pedagogy.* London: Croom Helm.

BETWEEN FINDING OURSELVES AND LOSING OURSELVES: STUDYING THE CONSEQUENCES OF SOCIAL MOVEMENT PARTICIPATION

In the time of the dictatorship, there begins a women's movement so big, so good, and so beautiful that the women begin to grow. With all this pain we are growing and we are learning and we are knowing and we are finding ourselves and losing ourselves. But between finding and losing ourselves, the result is still growth.
(Paloma, a young women's movement activist)[1]

Introduction

Although there is implicit acknowledgement that social movements are sites of profound learning, "learning in such situations is largely informal and often incidental – it is tacit, embedded in action and is often not recognised as learning" (Foley, 1999. p. 3). Through a study of the popular women's movement in Arica, a small city in the north of Chile, it is the intent of my research project to explicitly expose the learning dimension of a social movement and spotlight the educational processes at work within the movement.[2]

In the social movement literature, very little attention has been paid to the personal and social consequences of movement participation – positive or negative – and this is especially so for underground or clandestine movements (della Porta, 1992a).[3] My online dictionary informs me that a consequence is "something that follows as a result." I fully expected to discover, reveal and generally celebrate the learning that followed as a result of social movement participation. Just as I anticipated, I was treated to a wealth of such information throughout the research. The women itemized numerous positive effects of their participation in social and political movements. Responding to the stated purpose of the study, women either directly or indirectly identified all sorts of *aprendizaje* (learning). Beyond these, we also explored *los rescates* – things that one saves, rescues, or recovers from a disastrous or catastrophic event. These conversations often encouraged the women to nostalgically and emotionally reflect on their experiences.[4] Such positive consequences included: solidarity, empowerment as women, and skill development.

As stimulating and encouraging as the positive consequences were, however, more surprising and impactful (and what I did not expect to find) were the painful negative consequences, the individual and collective cost of the women's participation in social movements during the dictatorship years in Arica. This aspect surfaced in the earliest

interviews, most commonly in the stories of the younger women. When one of the pilot interviewees suggested that we pay more attention to this area, we purposely began to explore the negative consequences – *las heridas* (the wounds), *las secuelas* (the sequelae) , *los costos* (the costs), *los dolores* (the pain) – of social movement participation. In this paper, I do not tackle the impossible task of distinguishing the consequences that arose from the terror of living in a military dictatorship from the consequences related to movement participation, for in reality they are intertwined and inseparable in the women's lives.

Although I knew from personal experience that movement participants might have experienced traumatic aftereffects, I was not well prepared, emotionally nor theoretically, for this aspect of their lives. It was not covered in the social movement literature that I had read in preparation for this research project. Having emerged so powerfully in the interviews, a thorough analysis of this analytic category required attention to literatures that are unfamiliar to me, possibly including psychological or psychiatric theories (as they might apply to learning). This was not a prudent prospect near the end of a long and challenging dissertation. Another alternative was to leave these data aside for the time being. I did not choose this alternative either because it would have dishonoured such a prevalent and powerful part of the story of the women's movement in Arica. It is important information about learning in social movements that cannot be ignored or put aside for another time.

The compromise I selected was to write a paper that focuses on a relevant subset of the empirical data (i.e., the younger women), integrates some relevant literature, and suggests implications for radical adult education. My speculations are informed by a selective review of potentially relevant literature and the reflections of the remarkably analytical participants themselves. In attempting to make sense of the findings outside familiar literature, I cast a wide net but did not investigate any particular literature in-depth. In this paper, I foreground the narrative of one woman, *Paloma*, to highlight the diverse and contradictory consequences experienced by the younger group of movement participants. Paloma's narrative is followed by a synthesis of the life experiences of the other younger women specific to the consequences they identified.

Because of the formative nature of experience at this stage of human social development, it is especially fitting to analyze the younger women's experience from a learning perspective. From this analysis emerges a profile of the learners themselves as well as of their 'teachers' and of the contradictory learnings (or consequences) that result from the

183

interaction of the two. The project's male research collaborator, summarized the contradictory nature of these consequences as revealed by the women.

> The *compañeras* that we have interviewed tell us that it is sort of contradictory. How to salvage from the bad that which was very good. That everywhere was pain, was terror, everywhere was a tense atmosphere, distrust. I mean, all those adjectives were said. But what they salvaged was the solidarity.

Before beginning, I present some background information about the socio-political context and the study.

Background Information

From the election of Salvador Allende in 1970, through the Pinochet dictatorship (1973-1990), to the present transition to democracy, Chile has undergone tumultuous socio-political and economic changes. The military coup in 1973 signaled a severe disruption in a longstanding democratic tradition and represented a brutal example of encroachment of the state into civil society and the elimination of democratic space: the constitution was suspended, media censured, political parties and trade unions prohibited, and thousands were captured and detained, exiled, disappeared, or executed. Furthermore, extreme economic measures were enforced that consolidated neo-liberalism in the region, escalating economic hardship for increasing numbers of citizens and fundamentally changing the social structure of the family and the society.[5]

Paradoxically, political mobilization of women increased sharply in the 1980s in the midst of state repression and stringent economic policies. At a time when traditional political avenues were prohibited and men were not as widely available for protest (due to detention, exile, and migration for employment), the women took up the challenge. Despite threat to their own lives and livelihoods, women publicly protested against the human rights abuses of the regime, collectively organized popular subsistence and survival-oriented initiatives (e.g., collective kitchens), clandestinely disrupted the functioning of the regime, and inaugurated a second wave of feminism linked to grassroots organizing and service provision in poorer neighbourhoods. The strong, persistent and brave actions of the women who constituted the Chilean women's movement were a powerful force in the eventual downfall of the military dictatorship in 1989.[6]

184

This research is founded on nine months of ethnographic fieldwork in Arica (pop: 180,000), Chile's most northern outpost, more than 2000 km from the capital city of Santiago. Prior to 1973, it was a socially and economically thriving community. After the coup, it became a highly militarized and economically depressed zone. In general, the population is composed of diverse disenfranchised groups such as poor and indigenous peoples. During the study period, I was situated in a local women's NGO, *Casa de Encuentro de la Mujer* (CEDEMU). In addition to cultural immersion, research methods included document review and formal interviews.[7] I followed standard academic ethical procedures and dedicated particular attention to cultural differences and safety issues. I incorporated a variety of means for collaborative analytic reflection in the field. A number of analytical categories emerged early during the fieldwork that seemed promising for theorizing learning and education within social movements. Once these categories were empirically and theoretically elaborated, each became the basis for one of the papers in this dissertation.

Women's Movement Participants

In this paper, I look at the 'positive' and 'negative' consequences of social movement participation among a subset of women participants, i.e., the younger women. In the language of the participants, consequences are those things that "marked me" (*me marcó*) on two dimensions: what "cost me" (*me costó*) and what "taught me" (*me enseñó*).

Although there were many similarities between the 'younger' and the 'older' movement participants, from the beginning I also noticed significant differences unfolding in their narratives. Determining a specific dividing line between these two age groups is somewhat arbitrary but I perceived that the experiences of the women seemed to be different above and below forty-five years of age. In 1973, the younger group were either not yet born or were children or younger adolescents. In contrast, the older group of women were already adults, no longer studying and already married (although this group also includes four women who were sixteen to nineteen years of age).

The terms 'older' and 'younger' are stand-ins to signify the different positioning that is correlated to age because of the social roles, life experiences, and responsibilities associated with different ages. Older is not meant to imply elderly, it is merely meant to suggest a contrast to the younger. In Spanish, it is common to refer to a person or group of people by an adjective that describes the person or group. As they often refer to

185

themselves and each other in this way, I will sometimes use *las jóvenes* and *las viejas* for the younger and older women, respectively.

In total, fifty-three formal interviewees are included in this analysis (excluding four group interviewees for whom I did not have birth dates).[8] They ranged in age between twenty-five and seventy-eight, with an almost equal number above and below age fifty. In Table 5-1, I detail the age ranges at key historical points, divided by the younger and the older women.[9] Of these, twelve were in their thirties and seventeen were in their fifties at the time of the interviews (18 of 22 women were between age 33 and 43). This two-decade age difference between the majority of respondents may also explain why I noticed a different collective narrative between the two groups.

TABLE 5-1 AGE OF WOMEN INTERVIEWED

	2002 Interviews	1973 Coup d'etat	1983 Movements	1989 Elections	TOTAL #
Age Younger Women *Las jóvenes*	25-43	0-14	6-24	12-30	22
Age Older Women *Las viejas*	45-78	16-49	26-59	32-65	27

The eldest six women of the group of *las jóvenes* were 14 years of age at the time of the coup. Nine women were six and under (three of these were born after the coup). Almost all were either members of the Young Communists (*la Jota*) or peripherally affiliated to it.

Paloma's story, infused with a coherent and compelling analysis, provides a snapshot of some of the most salient themes that emerged in the stories of these younger women. Formed by both the dictatorship and their resistance to it, the intense and enduring impact on the Chilean people through this single generation is revealed in the narratives of these twenty-two women, *las jóvenes*.

186

Paloma's Story

> I believe that the dictatorship changed us. I mean, I believe that for us
> there is no other change. I believe it was so strong, it was so many years
> that it is difficult to change again. What could be so big or so terrible that
> it could make me change more? I mean, one rebuilds maybe in terms of
> new scenarios but at the bottom you are already a different person. I
> mean, you will never be the same.

Paloma means "dove." Paloma's story is marked by emotional, and enduring changes in the flight path of her life. She refers to her childhood self as a happy, innocent and pampered "*pájaro de primavera*" (bird of spring). But when the bird leaves the nest, she commits to a much different flight path as she joins her husband in the anti-dictatorship struggle. When the dictatorship and her marriage end, the bird takes wing once again, choosing a path that allows her to keep aloft in the midst of conflicting emotions and realities.

The first interview with thirty-seven year old Paloma is predictably and regularly interrupted by our two young daughters wanting water, cookies, a movie – or any other form of attention that pre-schoolers might demand. Paloma's rented house is spacious, comfortable and well appointed, possibly a testament to this single mother's career as a psychologist. Paloma attempts to make sense of her own experience through a socio-psychological analysis of her generation, a dedicated quest that she has undertaken through her studies and her profession. Therefore, she tells her story through an analytical and collective schema, implicitly inserting her own experience into the broader picture and, in the process, handing me analytic treasures that help me to interpret her own and others' stories. Through this more detached positioning, Paloma projects an incongruously dispassionate demeanor during the interview. She tells us later that the interview left her very emotional but unable to show it fully because of her daughter's presence.

Paloma was born and raised in another mining community in the northern desert region of Chile. The only daughter among three sons in a "*machista*" working class family, she describes herself as a "favoured child" and a "good girl, according to this society." She was educated by nuns during her twelve years of formal schooling. From the Catholic Church and her father she learned the values of truth and justice. Paloma was only eight on September 11, 1973. Because her parents were not politically involved, during her childhood years she knew nothing about the impact of the dictatorship on the country,

even though twenty-six people of their small city had been executed and secretly buried in the desert in the first days after the coup.

At 18 in 1983, Paloma entered the *Universidad de Tarapacá* in Arica to study early childhood education – at a moment that exactly coincides with the explosion of anti-dictatorship movement activity. "In the university, I began to see something different or strange that, in truth, I had not been able to visualize in [my city] – the epoch of the 80s with all the big protests... I began to see the reality." At first, she was taken aback by the violence on campus, not understanding what it was all about, merely a "spectator" until she made friends with another young woman in her program at the university who was involved in the movement through the church. This introduced her to many other committed young people including her future husband and his family. With eight siblings and all their respective children, his was a large family who were all "communists from the cradle." The father of this clan was detained in Pisagua during the time of González Videla, "so their struggle has lasted many years."[10]

Paloma's political activities and her marriage to her husband set her anti-communist family against her. She didn't see them for five years even though she worked in her home city after graduation. She and her husband lived instead with another communist family and became involved in the youth group of a construction union and in the Association of the Relatives of Disappeared Detainees. She remembers that "we did a play there with all the stuff about the executed, it was super-beautiful." So, bit-by-bit, Paloma became steadily more committed. Later, back in Arica, Paloma became involved in SERPAJ, an NGO sponsored by the Catholic Church that, through liberation theology, advocated peace and justice. One of the groups organized through SERPAJ was the *Movimiento Contra la Tortura Sebastián Acevedo*.[11] The major activity of this group was to peacefully, bravely, and publicly denounce torture. Due to the nature of the times, this was a difficult and dangerous task. "Everything had to be very clandestine, very silent, with very closed networks... We went to the torture centers, so you couldn't let information get out. Because if you did, the activity would be lost and you could have been detained."

Along the way, Paloma also became involved in the women's movement in Arica, connecting with both CEDEMU, a feminist NGO, and SERPAJ's activities with women. "I began also to be part of the history of women in this country," she says. Still today, she remains involved in one of the few enduring symbols of the strength of the women's movement, *Mujeres de Luto*, an event held each year on September 11 to bring attention to the as yet unpunished human rights abuses of the dictatorship.

188

From spectator to protagonist in a few short years, Paloma describes a schedule that is unbelievably grueling in its demands. In the mornings, she worked as an early childhood educator and "all the rest of my time was to work in this." Paloma suggests that this intense activity during her years of higher education left her with less education than people who did not become involved; others of her age went on to get their masters degrees. Unlike many of her friends, however, she returned to university after the dictatorship, successfully obtaining a bachelor's degree in psychology. In many ways, Paloma feels that she is less adversely affected than others.

> I believe that in relation to other people – Well, yes, it's quite true that we lost dreams. But others lost many things, many more than us. This too, I am clear about.... I don't think that I'm so bad, I mean, in terms of lost dreams, in quotation marks, because at least I had the strength to continue studying, the strength or the possibility. I managed to pay, to work and study, because I didn't have children. But there are people who couldn't, that separated and were left on their own. When I say that they were left on their own I really mean in economic terms. Because, at least, yes I am on my own, [but] I work and I can maintain myself at least to rent the house... But there are people who have nothing. [There are] families that are quite bad, families that had been involved in this.

Paloma speaks with sorrow about the consequences that she sees all around her. For example, the *Madres* (mothers) from Santiago who from their profound pain, she says, now all have cancer, and the next generation of a family whose son was killed, now addicted to drugs. But for her, probably the most profound consequence is the loss of relationships. Some time after the dictatorship ended, she and her husband separated. Devastated and depressed by this, she sought answers in further study and work as a psychologist, finding the feminism that was first introduced to her through CEDEMU to be a useful philosophical framework. After moving from relationship to relationship, Paloma found herself "tired of men." She recently decided to have a child outside of a couple relationship.

Along with the personal trauma of her marital separation, two public events had profound emotional effects on her. The first was in 1987. Connected with the human rights coordinating organization in Arica, Paloma traveled for one month throughout the north with the well-publicized *Madres* from the Santiago Association of the Relatives of Disappeared Detainees, in the "Caravan of Life."

> The idea was to conscientize and to open a curtain and to say, "in this country people are dying, in this country this is happening"... I cried for just about the whole month with those women because... these women lost their children, you know. So to listen to them, you become so

sensitive to the subject... After being out with them, I was sick for about fifteen days because it seemed like I had absorbed [their pain].

Just as this group of women with Paloma arrived in Calama (another northern city), the remains of a large group of people executed early in the dictatorship were found.

> They had looked for them for many years. They said that near Topete in a sector of Calama they had been executed and they were buried there. They knew more or less where. And the women of those men, the mothers, the wives went with shovels, with their hands and they searched the whole sector, it's just a piece of the desert. They searched and searched and one time they found some notebooks of a boy from FER, the Student Revolutionary Front. But we were still in the dictatorship so they surrounded everything and after that everything disappeared. Years went by and at that time that we were there with the *señoras* from the Association, just then they found the remains of those bodies. They had been dynamited on the way to San Pedro [another northern city] but in a place that if you went yourself, you would get lost. And I remember that there were hills like this, hills of – there was hair, teeth, fingers, clothes. And I was sick for about two months.

Paloma recognizes that pain of this magnitude is not easily erased. It has both short and long term physical and psychological effects. Just being witness to the pain caused by such atrocities made her physically ill. Moreover, she says, "I believe that it hasn't resolved, I mean, you adjust to things, you adjust, you learn to adjust... I think that each one adjusts how they can in this situation."

While such painful experiences have undoubtedly affected her, solidarity made deep impressions on Paloma as well. Of her experiences with communist families, Paloma says, "for me, the communists have been like referents of great solidarity" although she herself never became a party militant. When communist comrades knew of a home being raided by the secret police, as happened at the home of her in-laws where she lived with her husband, "there were lots of *compañeros*... Many went so that the family would not be alone and I remember that we were there with the family all night." Likewise, in *Sebastián Acevedo*, "we had a lot of confidence in the group." When asked how her involvement in these social movements influenced her, she replies,

> it changed my life because I think that there, in that social movement, one got to know what solidarity really is, to know what *compañerismo* is... One gets to know friends, I mean they are not friends, they are good *compañeros* – something more profound. Because ... they are the people with whom you share life and death. They are the *compañeros* that one day you had to run and a *compañero* caught your hand and you ran harder.

Twelve years post dictatorship, Paloma dedicates herself to her career as a psychologist and her role as a new mother. Her analysis and approach to the problems of people is drawn from her experiences in the social movements and her conscious attempt to understand the aftermath of the dictatorship. Using a feminist analysis, she wrote her thesis in psychology on the "question of how the dictatorship years influenced the endogenous depression that we women now have in this country." She is concerned about the devastating effects that the dictatorship had on the people of Chile: drug and alcohol addiction, disconnected families, depression, and abuse. She worries too about the disillusionment and depression of the people, especially young women, who fought so hard to gain so little. Yet she also believes that those, like her, that were involved and that could analyze, understand and act upon/against the reality of the dictatorship are "healthier" than those who did not. She laments that so little is done to deal with the emotional effects of those tragic years because not only individuals, but also the whole society, pays the price. Blaming also poverty, she says "antisocial personalities form in the first two years of life... The problem is that the generations of today are coming out very damaged, very, very damaged."

Paloma hopes that her work and study with persons addicted to drugs will make a difference. Based on her own experiences, she also takes her educative role as a mother seriously. "You are left with that learning and that learning you transmit to your children as well," she declares. I asked her once, "what legacy do you leave for your daughter from those years of the struggle?" She responded, it seemed to me, with a description of herself.

> That she always holds her head high, that she is always clear and true to
> her principles. That she speaks the truth. That she fights for herself...
> That she doesn't allow herself to be enslaved to anything. That she
> strengthens herself. That she is strongly independent in what she does.

Thus, Paloma's narrative reveals a variety of consequences of movement participation that range from the wonder of intense solidarity and the strength of personal empowerment to the loss of relationships and the imprinted trauma of bearing witness to horrifying realities. From Paloma's powerful story, we turn now to a synthesis of the diverse consequences identified by *las jóvenes*, the young women who include Paloma in their number.

191

Las Jóvenes: The Lost Generation

> One realizes the complications of wars, the cost of wars. It's true that we had an internal war here. It wasn't a war with another country. So it was more painful because it was with our brothers and sisters. And you realize also that, in a war, everyone loses, nobody wins. Everyone loses dreams, loses life, everyone loses. You lose your identity, your life, your *compañeros*... The women of our degeneration [Paloma laughs at her play on words], our generation have been a very damaged generation. We are the lost generation.

La generación perdida. A lost generation. A generation defined by loss/es. This is the legacy left by seventeen years of a military dictatorship and twelve more of unfulfilled expectations.

The terrorizing military environment unquestionably affected the overall development – social, emotional, intellectual – of *las jóvenes.* The military infiltrated the populace by living in civilian neighbourhoods in large numbers. What's more, "there were informers around every corner. You had to watch your back, you didn't know if your friend was an informer." Fear, suspicion, and "generalized distrust" permeated the environment, reinforced through visible military might: tanks, soldiers, police, dogs, shooting, and black-outs as well as the ever-present anxiety about detentions, torture, disappearance or death of your parents, family, friends or neighbours. One young woman who was born during the dictatorship clearly articulated this childhood reality.

> I grew up in a regimen of fear... I have memories that stand out. Tanks were outside my house, you know, and the military shooting. So even if you don't want to be involved, it frightens you anyway. You are frightened that they will take your parents to prison. You are frightened that a relative of yours has been taken to prison when you see that the military had arrived. And they took your neighbours and you witnessed that and you're praying that they don't touch your parents tomorrow. So all those things are marking you.

Even an innocent walk to school was accompanied by "a state of terror."

> When I was in grade school, I remember well, when I was walking with my sister on the way to school and in the main street here, that is Tucapél, all the people were protesting and the military were doing something to them. And a little kid confronting that situation... I mean, zero protection. And you didn't have another option because you had to go to school because if you didn't go to school, the military would come looking for you at the house. So it was an order that no matter what, everyone had to go to school. So, in the end, you went to school and you faced up to that sensation of danger.

192

Once in the classroom, the child was exposed to an educational curriculum drastically altered to the 'official' line of history. As one woman reported, "the history books that we read were the books made by the right... Chile is a militarized country where the Father of the Country is a military person that is a dictator." Not only is history presented through military eyes, but also the Allende years were erased from Chile's history; "the history books that tell you about 1973 are very few." In order to eradicate any reference to popular or marxist thought, books were burned, libraries destroyed, and teachers and university professors sympathetic to the left were fired, in exile, or disappeared. As all sources of information were strictly controlled (including all mass media), there were no formal sources of alternative discourse.

Especially at the university, studies were disrupted by strikes, demonstrations and other disturbances. Exams were written in a climate of fear. A young person's formal education was further impacted by her choice to be involved in clandestine or prohibited activities. Like Paloma, others also suggested that their studies were delayed, curtailed, or their educational potential not fully realized. Remembering various friends, including one from the Young Communists who won a student election and was promptly expelled from his program, one young woman reflected about some that had "abandoned their studies because they didn't continue studying and others lost their careers... People whose lives, whose studies were not fully realized and now they are, heck, simply workers when they could have had their university profession." According to one woman, many members of the Young Communists (*la Jota*) did not even finish high school.

Another young woman discussed the educational discrimination they faced.

> [In high school], there was a lot of mistreatment when the teachers caught on that you were in political activity, some teachers from the right. They mistreated you with grades, and you had to fight for your grades and you had to fight for your tests. [You said to them,] "show me the tests." I remember one civics teacher who hid the tests from me and he wouldn't give them to me because he knew I was from the left. So there was a certain struggle that you had as a student.

She later added, "hey, on top of that, at that time to be in *la Jota* and to be studying, you had to be brilliant, I mean exemplary. I remember that they always told me to be exemplary, more or less Number One always."

In many ways, the dictatorship changed the route of their potential lives – lives that would have been envisioned for them by their parents and their society. One young

193

woman, reflected upon how her uncle's disappearance and death in Pisagua irrevocably changed her biography.

> One is where one is because they changed your life, I mean, one is always going to ask oneself, "what would have happened to me, to all of us?" Many times I ask that question, "if that hadn't happened in this country in 1973, what destiny would I have had today?"… So, there are important events in your personal life that are very strong. So one says, "what do I do now with my life?" I mean, it is this country and one is in this country and in a certain way, it is reversing your history.

Vastly different from the tragedy of 1973, 1983 was a watershed year throughout the country for the mass mobilization of resistance movements.[12] For a few years previously, the political parties had been quietly re-articulating, human rights groups and survival initiatives organized by women consolidated, and the economic hardships escalated beyond endurance. At this point in their lives, *las jóvenes* (half of whom were 18 and over by this time) began to witness and to become involved in a different reality – one of resistance, of solidarity, and of courage. In many cases, young girls would have seen their mothers, fellow students, and *vecinas* (neighbours) in action. Children played the "cops and protesters" game in a re-enactment of what they witnessed around them. One woman, concerned about her classmates who had nothing to eat, credits the example of her mother "who never opposed me when I brought my friends home to eat, including one occasion when I brought six gals [home]." Another young woman talked about the influence of the women leaders.

> I began to watch the women… I was young and I looked after the children of these women that were working in the whole women's movement. Those women probably didn't realize that we were very much in their hands, and we were learning all that they were doing at that time, as the first step.

In a few cases, the impact was from daughter to mother as in the situation where a mother joined the movement to lessen her anxiety about her children's involvement and in the following example of a young woman's convincing argument to her mother.

> I remember that I talked with my mother. I told her that they were planning a *cacerolazo*. They cut the lights in the streets and everyone went to the street to bang the pots and pans. But she didn't get involved in many things. She was afraid, she was very afraid. So I said to her, "*Mamá*, for how long are we going to put up with this?"… So my mother cut the lights and suddenly, inside the house, I heard an uproar of pots and it was my mother that had gone to the street with a vengeance and she starts to call the neighbour women and she says, "bang the pots for the children, for everyone." And from that moment, she made a commitment to accompany me to the demonstrations. She also made a fuss, spoke out in public, and we went together like that to many things. She got

194

involved and in the process, she gained consciousness. Obviously, the pot had to be thrown away and another day there was no ladle in the house because it was broken. But it was worth it.

Others, like Paloma, went against the family grain. Seven years younger than Paloma, one such woman was not yet in a position to openly defy her parents' political position. So, while her parents assumed she was asleep in her room, she secretly left the house.

> I escaped over the roof for God's sakes! I waited in my house. It was very comical. My father has always liked to sleep so the first one to fall asleep, snoring, was him. Typical mothers are up until the final hour, checking around to see if anything is left undone, like my mother. I waited in my bed... until I felt that my mother was in bed – on top of that, she would read something – with the light out. At my mother's first snores, I took off the covers. I was wearing jeans, t-shirt, socks and had my runners at hand. I fished out my runners and I hung them around my neck. I climbed a railing that's there, a wall in my house that goes from the back of the patio to the street. And from there, like the Circus of the Montinis nowadays, I ran and jumped down, put on my runners, and left.

Although she related this story humourously, she was well aware of the potential consequences of her defiant commitment. "In the end, we all took a risk that something could happen to you, that they could kill you, that they could detain you. And who's going to know if they assume that you are sleeping in your house?"

Young women's involvement was extensive. From the church, human rights, cultural, and women's/feminist activities that Paloma recounted to neighbourhood barricades, graffiti brigades, and campus strikes. In one young woman's opinion, "the young were riskier, bolder." One of the older women says the same of the women. "The women were bolder and braver." So, being women *and* being young, *las jóvenes* were indomitable.

Even younger children, the very young daughters of young mothers, sometimes had an important role to play.[13] In one informal interview, a mother and daughter recalled a time when the mother put pamphlets that were being mimeographed under her five-year-old daughter's pillow just as the military arrived at the house. In two formal interviews with *las viejas*, mothers described hiding documents in their daughter's diapers. In one, the mother swore "upon my mother who's dead" that the idea arose from the two-and-a-half year old herself. But, she added, this was not really surprising given that her daughter was born and raised in the world of protest. She was implicated right from the womb and "raised under the tables." To her mother, this small child

> was like a symbol of seeing that the child didn't obstruct the work of the woman at all. Because, for example, I gave her the breast and a *vieja*

195

burped her, another changed her. And later there were also other
children that were underneath the table, chewing pieces of gum from
who knows where. It was like a symbol of the children, of the children of
the dictatorship.

For *las jóvenes*, the exposure to feminism was simultaneous to their involvement in leftist movements. Second-wave feminism developed in Chile at this time and was a contested discourse within all other oppositional movements. Even the youngest of this group of women had witnessed or experienced sexism in the political parties and labour movements. Many women commonly expressed the idea that women's commitment and exposure to danger was more than equal to men's. Young women made comments such as "there were always more women than men," "the woman was always in front" and "she was like a core of the political movement." Yet, they felt undervalued as women. They recognized that women did not hold positions of power in the same numbers as men, that women did not make the final decisions, that women were "excluded" from the "special work" of men, that women were for "messages," and "making tea" – that, at the bottom, leftist organizations were "*machista*." The women also began to reflect on their experiences in their own families where they saw fathers in charge and brothers with rights, responsibilities, and expectations different from their own.

The feminism emerging in Chile at the time gave the women the language and the discourse to critique the patriarchal structures that they experienced in their lives. *Las jóvenes* developed into womanhood alongside second-wave feminism, from which they gained a clear *perspectiva de género* (gender perspective). "We were part of that important process and we grew with that, we grew with those images." One university student recalled an event organized by women students that put those images into practice, even though they were in direct conflict with the Communist Party directive.

> We took the university one day. They called us to task for being
> inconsistent, that the gender struggle was sort of insignificant beside the
> democratic struggle for the country. And for us, it was the same. I mean,
> if we fought for a democratic space it wasn't only so that the men could
> make the discourse or rise to political posts. We understood democracy as
> a democracy also for us, a democracy of relations, of more democratic
> relations.

Most hold feminism as a solid part of their current philosophical and ideological framework. One young woman confirmed my own impressions.

> The majority of us ended up in feminist groups or tried to learn more
> about feminism. And one way or another, through different routes, we

arrived at feminism. I tell you, the majority. I mean, I don't know even one that hasn't gone this route.

Even those who felt that, at the time, the gender critique was secondary to the other issues recognized the discrimination faced by women within their social and political organizations. In the end, one of the women's most prized learnings from participation in the movements was their consciousness of alternative roles for women within Chilean society.[14] One woman, now in a long term committed relationship, suggested that "today the women of the left have an advantage, that the whole process that we lived permitted us, those of us that have partners, to establish couples in much more egalitarian terms, [to be] much more committed."

Along with these powerful and affirming learnings, however, the younger women have struggled in their lives. Paloma is not alone in the consequences she has experienced in her relationships, for example. The woman citing the advantage above qualified her remark by adding, "it's true that few can take advantage of it because few women today have a partner." Drawing on Sonia Montecino's (1996) analysis of Latin American/Chilean gender identity, Paloma offered one explanation. She said that the women of her generation are "screwed" for having challenged, through the strength of their movement activities and leadership as well as their obligatory entry into the labour market during the dictatorship years, the "prototypical" Chilean woman, i.e., the submissive and selflessly giving Virgin Mary. While the women grew in a sense of their own worth and capabilities, however, the men remained behind, "stuck and stagnant," threatened, and unsure of how to react to this reconstruction of the Chilean woman. "They are no longer the *machos*, I mean we women can go forward and we can do many things." But this came at a price: "It has brought conflicts in our couple relations." Like Paloma, many women of her generation are alone, separated from their husbands, rarely in a stable relationship. The only young woman who was still married to the man she fell in love with during the years of struggle, observed about her friends that "today, without that ideal or fear that united them before, they have separated."

Once the all-consuming commitment to a mutual objective that had absorbed their energy and focus during the dictatorship years was no longer present, little was left to sustain a relationship that had been put aside for so long. "It came to an end, that common theme that united you to your *compañero* – the struggle. Day after day, that was what we did... The dictatorship ended, and all the marriages began to end. We lost many things in relation to the couple because you didn't build anything together."

197

Another woman concluded, "it was an epoch of postponements. Postponing the family, the studies, the children."

For most of *las jóvenes*, there was a definite delay in childbearing. Many, unlike their mothers, have only one or two children, some having them later than the Chilean norm and choosing to have children outside of a committed relationship. "Many people didn't have children either, because to have children was dangerous and to have children was to take away time from your political activity." What effect do these phenomena have in a society that reveres motherhood, so much so that it was evident even in the official discourse of the dictatorship and in the oppositional discourse of the women's movement?[15]

Some women also speculated about the effects of political, systemic violence on their children and families. Just as the Chilean feminists claimed in the 1980s that the dictatorship was an extreme example of a patriarchal society, Paloma hypothesized that the repression they experienced has left an unhealthy, "punishment-oriented society."

> Even now there are repercussions in so many things. I mean, the dictatorship didn't end. I think a lot of time is going to pass for our country to become healthy. In fact, we are the third country in the world with mental illness, I mean with schizophrenia and depression, and the second country in the world in child abuse as well. Yes, these are the latest statistics from three years ago more or less. We are a punishment-oriented society because we had such great repression.

Some women disclosed their experiences with the depression that had prompted Paloma's research topic for her psychology thesis. In the following quotes, the first woman related a severe depression that followed a visit to Pisagua and the second, who has recurring bouts of depression, recalled her first as the dictatorship came to an end.

> I returned from [the anniversary celebrations in] Pisagua and I got sick. My muscles started to hurt and in three days, I couldn't move from here down. It gave me... a psychosomatic depression that, in the end, I was sleeping with anti-depressants for three months, because I wasn't well. I thought I wasn't going to recuperate. After that, I began to get well again thanks to [CEDEMU], thanks to my family, that's only my children. And I believe that, from there, I slowly gave myself permission to live, to live.

> I had a very bad depression during and after the dictatorship because my depression was like a feeling [of being] deceived, cheated... to find that it wasn't what one hoped for... Then came the disappointment of not believing in anything or in anyone. It was like a rejection of this whole system.

Within this generation was destroyed the fabric of the Chilean society. As one young woman vehemently stated, "it destroyed us, it destroyed us as a country, it destroyed us as people." An underground human rights worker during the dictatorship concurred.

> Today, we have the latent cruelty of the dictatorship, what it did to us. It destroyed us completely. It killed our solidarity. It killed our humanity that had been inside every Chilean... This horror that the dictatorship imposed on us began to kill us definitively. And we are still there today.

People everywhere were concerned about today's youth – a generation being raised by a generation of adults/parents raised in the dictatorship. What is the societal effect on parenting and childrearing? What effect does a system based on fear and suspicion have on trust and communication at the micro and macro level in subsequent generations?[16] One young woman referred to the long-term, learned effect. "One is fearful, very fearful because they taught us to have fear. We lived in a regimen of fear." Some further supposed that the dictatorship's impunity sends a message to people today that violence is tolerated and unpunished.[17]

While none admitted to an addiction themselves, almost everyone I met expressed distress about widespread drug and alcohol abuse in their community, especially among the poor. It is commonly believed that an effective tactic of the dictatorship during the years of protest was to introduce drugs into the *poblaciones*. "In Arica, the dictatorship introduced the drugs. This was one of their great triumphs. They distributed them free at the protests. So they were able to distract a large quantity of people."[18] Along with Paloma, a few of the women addressed this problem directly through their work with drug addicts. Probably the most optimistic of the young women I encountered described her work with youth.

> With them, I have to first enter their world, their life, their social system of the family, their contradictions as young people, their necessities as young people, their fears, joys, dreams, if they have any. You have to encourage their dreams, their hopes, for youth that are deprived of that... That's to say that they learn to fight for something, at least for themselves. It doesn't matter if they don't fight for the society – that will come along the way – but that they fight for something, for themselves, that they find flavour and sense in their life. They have a shitty mother, okay, it doesn't matter, she's your mother, you won't get another. But you can give yourself opportunities, you can enable yourself, you can be different, you can make good decisions or bad decisions but they are yours. I like working with young people [but] they don't respond immediately because they are using drugs... It doesn't matter to me if the kid continues doing drugs. I want him to understand why he has to quit doing drugs. I want him to understand why it is bad for him to do drugs but that he has hope for something different. That is what I want.

199

In contrast to her optimism, the younger women tended to be skeptical and cynical. In part, it is related to their experiences within political parties. Like their elder *compañeras,* many of the younger women have since retreated from political parties.[19] With chagrin, several younger women spoke about the lack of "ideological education" that they had expected to obtain through their political party. Although some were taught by the words and example of their parents, these younger women did not have the benefit of the political education enjoyed by their elders and they felt cheated out of this educational opportunity. Instead, the idealism and energy of their youth was channeled into action without a solid ideological base.

> It was the time to fight and go out into the streets but there was no ideological preparation... We students worked in accordance with our necessities... There was no solidness, ideological solidness... And the people that were there, that had to prepare me, didn't.

Furthermore, the grueling schedule of anti-dictatorship activities managed by these young women left no time for reflection.[20] Many of these younger women felt used, manipulated, and betrayed. "It was like they threw us to the mouth of the lions," said one. This sentiment did not appear among the older women. One young woman, expelled from the Young Communists when she openly disagreed with a directive, expressed such feelings.

> I did things with a lot of heart. I believed in what I was doing and we risked our life every time we did a dangerous action... When I realized how things functioned internally, I didn't like them. I felt a bit cheated, manipulated. And when they threw me out, of course I felt very hurt because I had done so many things.

Other women mourned "the giving, the surrendering, the risking everything for everything and, in the end, being left empty" or "doing and doing and doing and then it's like you're left with nothing." The nothingness or emptiness is both personal and social. It includes personal losses as well as disillusionment at the outcome. "I did not fight for this!" wrote one woman in a poem, "Our struggle was in vain... How many youth wasted, how much faith lost, how much sadness and disillusionment." Unlike the older women who were unequivocal in their belief that they would do it all again despite the outcome and costs, the younger women seemed less certain. Some openly speculated, "if I had questioned it, maybe I wouldn't have gone out" or "if I analyze it now, I tell you, I would never do it again."

A critical turning point for the younger women was the death of one of their *compañeros* at a protest very near the end of the dictatorship. This tragic event surfaced in almost

200

every formal and informal discussion with the younger women but rarely (if ever) arose in discussions with the older women. On New Year's Eve 1988, many of the young anti-dictatorship activists from various movements and political parties had gathered around a roadway underpass where they were painting a protest mural and new year's message when the police arrived. Although it was never clear exactly what happened, the outcome was the death of Salvador Cautivo and the detainment of numerous students. The women speculated that there had been a breakdown within their own security. For many, this prompted a critical re-evaluation and the end of their political participation. Echoing others, one young woman pronounced, "my political moment ended in 1989."[21]

In large measure, their cynicism and disillusionment is also related to how the "transition to democracy" has unfolded. One younger woman who was working for the government at the time of the interview was extremely disillusioned.

> And the great leaders in whom you trusted, you realize that today they all negotiate to have that tiny quota of power that they don't want to lose. So, what do I think of all that? That really we were foolish instruments that were well-disposed to give even our skin and that the truth is that these guys that lead the whole democratic process today, the only thing that they wanted was... to take turns in office, nothing more.

While most were no longer engaged actively in political parties or social movements, none of these women had rejected their leftist orientation or social consciousness that developed in their families and/or through their movement involvement. "At the bottom," said one, "I continue being a communist." Most expressed their social commitment through their chosen professions or jobs. Among these women were:

- teachers or early childhood educators who hoped to have a positive influence on the upcoming generation.

- popular educators, counselors or social workers that worked with troubled youth and families, addicts, and abused women.

- community and feminist organizers and activists.

Others through visual, written and performance art, contributed educational messages and social critique. One theatre artist reflected upon what her participation should/could be today, "as a young woman... apart from being a mother and a wife."

> So there is also the possibility to open doors and spaces for yourself and begin to create things...How can I create something? First of all, through what I do, constructing culture, constructing art. For me it is sort of primordial to put something forward, to put forward different visions to the community... Through what I do, which is theatre, I can give that to the people. I can tell them, "Hey, wake up." Maybe tell them that the

201

> people are sleeping. I believe that one can produce movement, one can make the people move… That is the most important thing. I belong now to [a cultural] collective, that is also important to me. It is opening the doors to put something forward to other women.

It was also very common for the younger women to talk about regrouping on a more personal level, within their homes and families and within themselves as well. Young women frequently talked about the personal work that must be done.

> But for that there is a sort of preliminary work because I also have to wake up… It also is a time of preparation, of learning…

> It isn't a question of "hey, let's change the superstructure." Look, I believe that what has to be done is to begin to change the person, to construct a different way of life… You have to construct a new man. No, a new society. The society is constructed through a new man.[22]

Mothers felt similar to Paloma about their maternal role. A young mother with a five-year-old daughter observed, "it is like I am living the process with my daughter." Like most mothers, she hopes to give her daughter a "solid foundation" of ideology, values, ethics, and habits from which to grow. Another woman thought long and hard about having a child before giving birth to her daughter at thirty-one years of age. After describing a letter that she had written to her then two-year-old daughter, she concluded, "there is a legacy that I have to leave her. What I most want to leave her is that she understand not to ever repeat the atrocities that we lived, not here nor in any nearby country, nor in any part of the world."

Despite all the challenges, misgivings, pain, and critique, all the women echoed Paloma's views about solidarity, collective action, and power in mutual commitment. This is the most precious treasure that they salvaged from the catastrophic upheaval of those years. "It was a moment of maximum union. I believe it was like the abundance of what one hopes for in life. I mean, always protecting and looking out for others." *Las viejas* cherished solidarity as well, but for *las jóvenes*, solidarity signified intimate friendships fashioned from "a complicity and a history. We have forged a history in the skin. So that unites us."

Some women appreciated the help of the social organizations such as SERPAJ and CEDEMU in their healing and learning process. "SERPAJ has helped me… to have a fuller vision, more diverse, more integral, more human… So, I believe that it has helped me to be more sane than contaminated." As noted earlier, CEDEMU helped one woman through her depression.

Despite the consequences imposed on them by the dictatorship, most of the women are pragmatic. As Paloma said of the end of the era, "I separated. I cried. I had to reconstruct my life again, I mean, to begin to live again in another form, in another country." (Her reference is to a different Chile.) One young woman's reply to the question of what she did with her pain was "I ate it, I swallowed it, and I pooped it out." (It's apparent that she was the mother of young children.) But, she continued in a more serious vein. "The process of learning is contradictory... I take out the positive but the negative I leave behind."

To complete this section of the stories of *las jóvenes*, I include an excerpt from a poem entitled *"Legado"* (Legacy) written during the research process by one of the participants. Some of the themes covered here are represented in her poem.

Today, at least, I know that I am not alone,
nor crazy, nor on the border of delirium.
Only that I have been isolated, forgotten,
so that they don't notice, and that others like us don't notice,
that we are more than one.
That we are many.
And that little by little, we will again look into each other's faces,
and tell our sorrows.
After that, again to plan the strategies,
again to reconstruct the dreams,
and even though this be only an exercise,
it has always done us good to dream,
and perhaps that will be the best legacy to leave our children.

Learning from *las Jóvenes*

Perhaps the stories of these younger women should now be left untouched in the sated and silent space that hangs in the air after their reading. Their stories impacted me greatly in the field and later, after I left Arica, I thought of them often. I was myself marked by their pain and despair. I felt an urgency to bring these stories to light and to attempt to make sense of them. So I did what intellectuals do – I went to the library. I looked broadly in the literature to find theories that could be applied to this context. In this section, I introduce some of these diverse fragments and speculate on how they might relate to the analytical category covered in this paper. However I issue a warning to the reader: There are no 'answers' to be found here; perhaps only more questions.

Of the positive consequences related to participation in the Latin American women's movement, the findings from this study are congruent with a wealth of other studies and literature. So too, of challenges raised by feminism within political parties and the

203

uneasy relationship between the two.[23] However, a number of other consequences that emerged in this research have not been well studied in social movements.

In this part of the paper, I draw from diverse literatures that may contribute to understanding three such topics. *Las jóvenes* generally retained the critical consciousness that they had cultivated in social movement activism during the dictatorship years. Yet, because this nascent consciousness was not adequately developed into a solid ideology, they were left with an ideological void that made it difficult for them to coalesce around new goals and objectives. These together have implications for their **social and political lives**. The younger women's social movement experience is also profoundly imprinted on their marriage and childbearing biographies as well as their education and work biographies. In other words, they have experienced significant effects on their **personal and interpersonal lives** as well. More significantly, the **emotions and trauma** experienced by *las jóvenes* as result of the contradictory environment of repression and resistance have an ongoing impact on all aspects of their lives.

> In Chile, there are still many "taboo" subjects, unresolved conflicts and open wounds as a result of the 17 years of military government. The current-day behavior of Chileans has been shaped by other times, other experiences that occurred in the nation's history but experiences that are always remembered. (Derechos Chile, 2004a, p. 1).

Consequences on Social and Political Lives

In terms of political consequences/biographies, the political views and sympathies held by *las jóvenes* in the 1980s have endured into the new millennium. While the younger women who participated in my research project had, for the most part, retreated from political parties, they had maintained numerous informal social and political connections – headed by their jobs and career choices, followed by their enduring friendship networks, and rounded off by their participation in organized events such as *Mujeres de Luto*,[24] International Women's Day, and International Day of Women's Health. Even their frustration at the lack of citizen participation, social organizations, and responsive political parties is a testament to their political commitment and concern.

Contradicting the widespread (and media reinforced) image of sixties activists turned "opportunistic yuppie" (McAdam, 1989), empirical studies of U.S. activists have consistently found that former activists retain their ideological stance over time and remain politically involved. While there may have been a "softening" or "moderating" of some extreme positions, activists had basically "held on to their essential beliefs" (Marwell et al., 1987, p. 374), moved more to the left in orientation after their initial

204

activist experiences, tended to remain active in other social movements, and maintained networks and relationships developed during their activist experiences that often reinforced the activist process (McAdam, 1989). Looking at gender differences, McAdam (1992) found that women perceived that their activist experience in an early civil rights activity called Freedom Summer had a greater positive impact on their subsequent political beliefs and commitments than did the men.[25]

Studying feminist activists in the U.S., Whittier (1995) concluded that,

> ... veterans of the 1970s women's movement had been transformed by their experience. They could not simply turn away from their politics and step back into mainstream society... [C]ommitment to social change remains central to their sense of themselves, their peers, and the world as a political place. For core members this commitment has been exceedingly enduring. (p. 80-81) Feminist individuals and groups continue the struggle at the grassroots in workplaces, within other social movements, and in the rhythms of daily life... (p. 21).

Recent research from Chile suggests that while social activists in the Santiago *poblaciones* may have disengaged themselves from the institutionalized political system (such as political party membership and voting) due to cynicism and disillusionment, they are neither apolitical nor de-politicized (Olavarr a, 2003). Echoing my own findings, Olavarr a suggests, "various degrees of class consciousness and critical political awareness are still present among sectors of the *pobladores*.... There is a clear, precise, and acute consciousness of the shift in formal politics, the limitations of the transition, and the decline in participation since 1990 as a consequence" (p. 31-32).

The last point above is a fitting segue into another area of literature I reviewed in relation to these findings – that of the continuity or "persistence" of social movements (Whittier, 1995). In this regard, the persistence of CEDEMU is encouraging. Some of the younger women in this study are or have been directly involved with the struggling but indefatigable feminist NGO. Many of the others have been peripherally involved or affiliated with it in some way through, for example *Mujeres de Luto*, for which CEDEMU plays a leadership role in the organizing coalition.

Taylor's (1989) study of the continuity between the first-wave and the second-wave feminist movements in the United States contradict what she calls the "immaculate conception" view of the sixties social movements. Instead, she suggests that these movements can be "viewed as a resurgent challenge with roots in an earlier cycle of feminist activism" that, in between the resurgence and the roots, existed "a holding process by which movements sustain themselves in nonreceptive political environments

205

and provide continuity from one stage of mobilization to another" (p. 761). Building on Taylor's work, Whittier (1995) investigated the "persistence" of the women's movement into the decidedly anti-feminist climate that followed second-wave feminism in the U.S. She concluded that "both generational politics and the hostile climate of the 1980s affected the course of the women's movement, but neither caused its demise (p. 5)." Rather, through the combination of longtime and incoming feminists, the movement was both sustained and transformed, surviving mostly at the grassroots, within smaller women's organizations, and integrated into personal and political lives.

Another source that supports the notion of continuity is the study of youth movements. In a review of the five "historical generations" of youth movements spanning 200 years, Braungart and Braungart (1993) concluded that youth movements "have been at the forefront of defining, redefining, and extending the concept of citizenship" (p. 170) "in waves during certain periods in modern history… representing combinations of generational and historical forces" (p. 139).[26] They suggest that youth may occasionally assume a "generational mission" to reconstruct social values (p. 170).

Movement continuity and persistence is visible also in Arica through the younger women's knowledge and acknowledgement of the history of women's activism (in Chile generally and in the north specifically) and a recognition of their own connection to these women of the past. Indeed, this unearthing of feminist history was an important part of second-wave feminism in Chile. In Arica, CEDEMU played a large part in educating women about their feminist/activist roots. In their examination of the grassroots Chilean women's movement, Valdés and Weinstein (1993) explicitly develop the historical relationship between the two waves and also establish the continuity between them.

> Once the right to vote was obtained, the particular struggle of women to change their subordinate position in society diminished in its presence and vitality. However, the participation of women in popular mobilizations that pressured for an improved quality of life continued to be important, *"tomas de terreno"* [land takeovers] stands out, where women were the protagonists many times. (p. 48)[27]

Although it is difficult to envision the next wave of the women's movement in Arica, I find Taylor's (1989) concept of abeyance useful in envisioning the possibility of a revival of the movement.

> A movement in abeyance becomes a cadre of activists who create or find a niche for themselves. Such groups may have little impact in their own time and may contribute, however unwillingly, to maintenance of the status quo. But, by providing a legitimating base to challenge the status

206

> quo, such groups can be sources of protest and change... The significance
> of abeyance lies in its linkages between one upsurge in activism and
> another... Abeyance structures perform this linkage function through
> promoting survival of activist networks, sustaining a repertoire of goals
> and tactics, and promoting a collective identity that offers participants a
> sense of mission and moral purpose. (p. 762, italics removed)

Without going into historic details, I suggest that CEDEMU might be just such a structure that holds the women's movement in abeyance in Arica until the historical and political juncture is again ripe for a more vigorous revival of the movement.[28]

Despite holding strong social values, however, the lack of a solid ideology has made it difficult for the women to coalesce around new goals and objectives. Echoing the younger women's lament about their activist years, this same concern about an "ideological void" arose in Olavarr a's study (2003) of present day social activists in Santiago's *poblaciones,* who complain of "no education in political militancy" (p. 22) and "no ideological discussion" (p. 26). Also like *las jóvenes* in Arica, the Santiago activists make comparisons to earlier days (i.e., prior to the dictatorship) when there existed discussion and "education of the cadre" (p. 22). Moyano's (1992) findings from her study on the Argentinean underground suggest similar concerns regarding inadequate "ideological formulations" that ultimately affected the movement's strategy choices. [29]

Consequences on Personal and Interpersonal Lives

There is a growing group of demographic studies that has investigated the "biographical consequences" of participants who were active in social movements in the U.S. during the 1960s.[30] Through these studies, conducted over the past twenty-five years, it is clear that the personal and interpersonal lives of political activists are affected by early activism on a number of dimensions that coincide with my findings. While these studies are flawed in making no connection to either the societal impact of these biographical consequences nor to the current socio-political context in which they are embedded, they are instructive at the micro-level so are summarized here.

First, the young women in my study clearly identified a different marital and childbearing biography than others of their age. Many of the anti-dictatorship activists were single (never married or separated) and tended to have fewer children later in life than others their age. A summary of the available literature suggests that activists are more likely to marry late or not at all, and be unmarried (including separated/divorced) years later, to have less children, later in life, and are more likely to have none at all (Klandermans, 1997; Marwell et al., 1993; McAdam, 1989; Van Dyke et al., 2000).[31]

207

Studies of gender differences have indicated that to a higher degree than men, activist women were more likely to be unmarried than non-activists (although the timing of marriage was not affected) (Van Dyke et al., 2000) and the decreased likelihood of having children seems to hold true for women more so than for men (Marwell et al., 1993; Van Dyke et al., 2000). Cortez D az and Villagra Parra (1999) found that the Arica activists suffered in making decisions about motherhood.[32] McAdam (1989) also notes that, when they married, former activists chose partners who espoused similar political views and social commitments. He further speculates that the high rate of marital separations may have been due to *differences* in political views.

Second, the younger women in this study clearly perceived that the educational and work histories of themselves and their male counterparts were adversely affected by movement participation. Although the available research supports this perception in a general sense, some of the findings are contradictory. For example, participants in Argentinean underground movements "explained the interruption of their studies through their participation in armed struggle" (Moyano, 1992, p. 112). In contrast, in U.S. studies, former activists had achieved significantly higher education than their non-activist counterparts (Marwell et al., 1993). Notwithstanding the apparent contradictions, numerous U.S. studies attest that former activists generally start their careers later, make less money, and work less consistently than non-activists (Klandermans, 1997; Marwell et al., 1993; McAdam, 1989; Van Dyke et al., 2000). However, when gender is considered, the effect appears reversed for women. The authors attribute this to the impact of second-wave feminism in the United States (Van Dyke et al., 2000).

Third, as I also found, there is a general consensus across the U.S. studies that former activists have "concentrated in the teaching or other 'helping professions'" (McAdam, 1989, p. 746). Marwell (1993) found that the most common jobs were law, social work, and teaching. Nearly half of the respondents in McAdam's (1989) study of Freedom Summer participants expressed strong agreement that participation in social movements had affected their choices about work.

In sum, I concur with McAdam's (1989) conclusion that the "work and marital histories [of activists] appear to have been shaped, to a remarkable degree, by their politics" (p. 758).

208

Emotions and Trauma

To say that the experiences shared by *las jóvenes* were emotionally intense would surely be an understatement. Emotions swung from the exhilaration of adventure and invincibility to the compassion of solidarity to the terror of the unknown and the known; from the passion of commitment to the disillusionment of reality. Anger, passion, love, fear, pain, anguish, hope, deception, suspicion... in large doses and at elevated levels.

The emotional aspect of social movement learning is rarely considered. As feminists have long pointed out "patriarchy... has prevented us from making the bridges between our emotional experiences and social conditions which once connected contain the seeds of revolutionary change" (Thompson, 1983, p. 16). The feminist axiom – "the personal is political" – necessarily implies that personal, subjective experience is politically valid knowledge. Jagger (1996) discusses the relationship of emotion to epistemology and Allman (2001) speculates that "consciousness... also involves our subjective, or emotional, responses" (p. 165). Recent social movement theorizing suggests that the "explanatory variables" of the current theories are inaccurate or incomplete without the addition of complex emotional realities (Goodwin et al., 2001; Polletta & Amenta, 2001).[33] Goodwin, Jasper and Polletta (2001) hope to "persuade readers that emotions are important in all phases of political action, by all types of political actors, across a variety of institutional areas" (p. 16).

As a minor contribution towards the study of emotions in social action, I briefly consider a few of the intense emotions expressed by the women in Arica, incorporating some relevant findings from other studies.

Las jóvenes were among "five million [Chilean] women [who] survived with the most profound fear on their shoulders."[34] Managing this fear was essential to survival and to activism. "When protest is extremely risky or dangerous, fear may inhibit collective action (or certain forms of collective action), and so it must be suppressed or at least mitigated, not necessarily in purposive or self-conscious ways, if such action is to occur at all" (Goodwin & Pfaff, 2001, p. 284). The younger women in Arica demonstrated the same fear management mechanisms as those described by Goodwin and Pfaff, such as intimate social networks, communal gatherings, and strong movement identification (2001).

The younger women talked often about deep friendships, connectedness, and solidarity. In a variety of underground organizations, "friendship and political ties were

209

intertwined," observes della Porta (1992a, p. 8). This has been observed in other women's movements as well.

> Personal ties of love and friendship among members were an important cultural ideal. A willingness to shape personal relationships around the cause was, in large measure, what made possible the intense commitment of members. (Taylor, 1989, p. 769)

For Freire (1990), the revolution is "essentially loving in character" (p. 77). He quotes Che Guevara: "... the true revolutionary is guided by strong feelings of love" (p. 78). As can be guessed from the younger women's narratives, movement solidarity is especially important in clandestine or underground movements that depend on secrecy and intense relational ties and that generate high levels of emotion. These can lead to an intense and exclusive collective identity that is increasingly insulated and isolated from other people and perspectives (della Porta, 1992a). DeVries (1996) reasons that this comes "at a cost"(p. 400): the more strongly identified the participant, the deeper the sense of loss and trauma. Thus, to understand the sadness and nostalgia expressed by *las jóvenes* also requires an exploration of grief and grieving.

Conversely, "emotions help to explain not only the origin and spread of social movements but also their decline" (Goodwin et al., 2001, p. 21). Exhaustion, frustration, disappointment – are common (Goodwin et al., 2001). When hard-fought struggles lead nowhere or to only partially fulfilled expectations, movement experience "... can generate negative, profoundly disempowering learning... [I]n struggle, workers can learn defeatism, withdrawal and passivity" (Foley, 1999, p. 142).

Many of the consequences experienced by *las jóvenes* might be described in terms of Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD).[35] We tend to think of PTSD as a psychiatric diagnosis that affects individuals through nightmares or flashbacks and defense mechanisms such as avoiding, numbing, or hypervigilance (van der Kolk & McFarlane, 1996). Yet, deVries (1996) goes further. He argues that a range of "biological, psychological, social, and cultural phenomena" are impacted by trauma (p. 400). Furthermore, when viewed from a cultural perspective, trauma "profoundly alters the basic structure not just of the individual, but of the cultural system as a whole: Society will never be the same again" (p. 401). In many situations, a traumatic event or upheaval is buffered by cultural rituals, support systems, historical context, and shared identities. However, when culture itself has disintegrated, as in the Chilean situation where there was a brutal and systematic erasure of the cultural past, the ramifications are extensive.

210

> When cultural protection and security fail, the individual's problems are proportional to the cultural disintegration. The avenues of vulnerability resulting from trauma follow the routes vacated by culture: Paranoia substitutes for trust; aggression replaces nurturance and support; identity confusion or a negative identity substitutes for a positive identity... Compounding these problems in most areas of the world is that at times of cultural disintegration, the population is often physically depleted and fatigued as well... These psychological and physical consequences will strongly affect their lifestyle and mental state in the future... (p. 408).

Parallels to the Chilean situation are obvious. In order to eradicate any vestiges of Chile's longstanding social democratic tradition, the military government destroyed social organizations, educational materials, and cultural forms. "The dictatorship has outlawed history and so perverted language that Chile's 150 years of democratic tradition are clouded in a fog of unreality" (Villagran, 1988, p. 14). The simplest transgression such as possessing music by Chile's beloved folk singer, Victor Jara, uttering banned words (such as bread or justice), or meeting in groups was severely punished. According to deVries (1996), alternative organizational forms will take the place of the lost culture but are often built upon the base of what came before, for example, the emergence of social forms such as the oppositional women's movement in Arica.

But years of terror coupled with years of grueling and dangerous clandestine struggle took an emotional and physical toll on the women. For the young, added to the effects on identity and lifestyle that have already been addressed, are the more harmful consequences such as depression and drug and alcohol abuse. This came out strongly in the study by Cortez D az and Villagra Parra in Arica (1999). "Many women... realized that their poor health was manifested through the body and symbolized psychological and social damage" (p. 130). In the case of Italian, German and Argentinean underground movements, the societal violence perpetrated by the governments germinated a tolerance for violence that was carried into the underground (della Porta, 1992b; Moyano, 1992; Passerini, 1992). It is not a huge stretch to assume, as does Paloma, that there would be some carry-over into daily life outside the movements as well. Experienced widely in the society, these deleterious consequences contribute to further erosion of the cultural base, making it increasingly difficult to rebuild.

Implications for Adult Education

As I admitted at the outset, there is no coherent theoretical focus to this paper. Rather it is an exploration of potentially useful ideas for understanding the consequences of social movement participation as they apply to learning. It is apparent that this is an under-studied aspect in any discipline. I suggest that further study and theoretical formulations are required in the three areas explored above – personal and interpersonal consequences, social and political consequences, and emotions and trauma. For starters, questions about consequences need to be asked and explicitly investigated.

Viewed through the lens of learning in social movements, the prime objective of this research project, the story of *las jóvenes* might be written as follows.

Las jóvenes were informally and contradictorily educated in the streets. Taught by the **Dictatorship** in the school of **Repression,** *las jóvenes* learned through a curriculum of **terror**, tanks, detentions, disappearance, and torture. Taught by the **Struggle** in the school of **Resistance**, they learned through a curriculum of **solidarity**, participation, people, barricades, and protest. Young women in Arica lived their formative years in this contradictory reality. From these schools and teachers, they learned their world, their citizenship, and their identities. Today, they must maneuver the contradictions as part of daily life with obvious effects on their relationships, their education, their work, their politics, and their world. Due to their sudden jettison into politics, they were not as strongly situated ideologically as the older women. Today, they are neither politically active nor involved in movements. They have retreated to work with youth and personal development as a way to rebuild and recover their lost youth and build the youth of tomorrow. Yet, there is growth. There are enduring ties of solidarity. They are committed to a persistent set of beliefs and values and pockets of activity that hold their movement in abeyance. As Paloma says, "between finding and losing ourselves, the result is still growth."

But what makes this story so compelling for an adult educator? What does an understanding of movement consequences contribute to the overall question of learning in social movements? I contend that such deep, traumatic and long-lived consequences affect the capability and means of learning, unlearning, and relearning the self and the society. I assert that the situation of the younger women in Chilean women's movements is an indisputable argument for the crucial importance of praxis, the action/reflection dialectic needed for social transformation.

212

Furthermore, I propose that learning in the Chilean context, indeed in the world, must be situated within an understanding and critique of the entire global economic, social, and political realities within which contemporary Chile is situated. By linking their material circumstances to the global political and economic situation, the personal is connected to the political in just the ways that their feminist elders proposed to the younger women. Then, personal development and rehabilitation for healing addictions, emotional wounds and violence will contain the critical edge needed for future mobilization. The seeds of a vision for this kind of education were embedded in the narrative of one of *las jóvenes*, now an addictions counsellor.

> From a political vision, I am not there doing a therapeutic community [drug rehab] [where] the kid enters doing drugs and leaves not doing drugs. It isn't a machine that makes products. It is making a person. I don't care if the kid keeps doing drugs. I want him to understand why he has to stop doing drugs... I want him to one day understand that he is being used, used by the system that wants him to be sleeping, diffused, neutralized because he is part of a people that must be neutralized, because that serves capitalism.

Here, the speaker makes the connection to capitalism but does not yet take it a step further to the global. The transnational connection was more prevalent among the older women who impressed me deeply with their cogent and critical analysis of neo-liberalism and how it operates in their everyday material lives. Working together with the older women and with men, younger women must revisit their history – both the glorious and the nefarious – search for the "solid ideology" that eluded them in their days (and nights) of frenetic activism and their years of disillusionment and sadness, and engage in a revolutionary praxis that moves them forward to find anew the just and peaceful path.

I'm sure that it is obvious that I speak not only about these younger women in Chile but of us all. Re-creating our circumstances and ourselves is an educational process. Moreover, it is an educational endeavour that is both active and reflective. One that ought to be taken up by radical adult educators who ourselves are striving and struggling in whatever social spaces we can find or contrive to resist capitalism (in all its changing but by no means inevitable forms) and to collectively create a democratic and socialist world that will meet the needs of all.

Through the process of writing this paper, I came full circle. As I mentioned at the outset, I set out to document the wonderful effects of participating in the women's movement and, instead, became overwhelmed by the detrimental effects. Yet, in reading, re-reading, and writing I also discovered glimmers of hope and optimism

213

hidden between the pages of pain and disillusionment. I began to see the women's own words in new ways. My hope is that, by exposing the painful and harmful consequences experienced by *las jóvenes*, I have created a space to honour and to appreciate the sacrifices they made, not only for themselves but also for all of us. I also hope that by highlighting the positive consequences, especially those most obscured in their pain and disillusionment, I have opened the possibility for the women in Arica, and for all of us, to see our way to the future.

Las jóvenes are not lost, they are a beacon.

Notes

[1] Note: All translations from transcripts and original sources in Spanish are mine.

[2] Drawn from a critical discourse and from the root word *pueblo* (common people), in both Spanish and English the word "popular," and its derivatives, generally connotes something related to the poorer sectors. For example, a *población* is a neighbourhood where *pobladores/as*, poor or common folk, live.

[3] In the U.S., there are a number of demographic-type studies on the impact of political activism on the personal lives of activists, but still comparatively little on gendered effects (Van Dyke et al., 2000) nor anything on the social effects of such consequences. These studies tend to be quantitative, although some are supplemented with document analysis and/or interviews. Most are descriptive rather than explanatory. A number of these studies were conducted on Freedom Summer volunteers. At the height of the civil rights movement, mostly white college students from the northern U.S. volunteered in a black voter registration campaign conducted in the southern states during the summer of 1964.

[4] From the first pilot interview, Sandra (a research collaborator, co-interviewer, and women's movement participant herself) intuitively incorporated probes related to *rescates*. At the time, I had no idea what the word meant but it resonated for the women and helped to uncover the positive consequences of their participation.

[5] I provide more detailed information in the introductory chapter of this dissertation. For a discussion of the military coup and dictatorship era, see for example (Bianchi, 1988; Chavkin, 1985; Loveman, 1988; Rojo & Hassett, 1988). For a discussion regarding neo-liberalism in Chile, see for example (Agacino, 1996; Boron & Torres, 1996; Cademartori, 2003; Drake & Jaksic, 1991; Nef, 2003; Schild, 2000; Silva, 1991). See also Bresnahan (2003) and the rest of the authors in this special edition for a recent discussion of the adverse effects of neo-liberal economics on the democratization process in Chile.

[6] The study of women's movements in Chile and elsewhere in Latin America has generated considerable interest (see for example Alvarez, 1990; Baldez, 2002; Chuchryk, 1989; Gaviola et al., 1994; Jaquette, 1989; Jelin, 1990; Matear, 1997; Schild, 1994; Stephen, 1997; Sternbach et al., 1995; Valdés & Weinstein, 1993; Valenzuela, 1998; Waylen, 1993). How this is manifest in Arica, is addressed in another paper in this dissertation.

214

[7] Interviews were conducted in Spanish with a total of 60 individuals including in-depth individual interviews, group interviews, and supplementary semi-structured interviews with local governmental and non-governmental organizations. All of the women interviewed had been active in social and/or political movements in Arica at some time during the past 30 years. They ranged in age between 25 and 78 (with an almost equal split between those over and under 50) and represented women from all the left/centre parties, the Catholic Church, community kitchens, the University, and the popular neighbourhoods. More detailed information is provided in the introductory chapter of this dissertation.

[8] During the fieldwork, I also conducted several informal interviews with women of various ages whose contributions also added to the analysis. Those from the younger women are occasionally included as examples in this paper.

[9] On September 11, 1973 a brutal coup d'etat commanded by General Augusto Pinochet and a junta of the Chilean armed forces overthrew the democratically elected socialist government of Salvador Allende, commencing what was to be the longest running dictatorship in Latin America (seventeen years). In 1983, an explosion of massive public resistance to the dictatorship across the country erupted. Tens of thousands of people demonstrated in the streets and participated in national strikes despite violent repression and reprisals. Women assumed a particularly prominent role in this resistance. In December 1989, democratic elections were held in Chile that signaled the end of the dictatorship and the beginning of the protracted "transition to democracy."

[10] Gabriel González Videla was the elected president of Chile from 1946 to 1952. A member of the Radical Party, his party came to power in a coalition that included the Communist Party. However, in 1948 he turned against the communists, initially expelling communists from cabinet and then establishing the "Permanent Law of the Defense of Democracy" which made the Communist Party illegal. This commenced a period of persecution and imprisonment of communist leaders for which he established the first concentration camp in Chile at Pisagua, along the coastline between Arica and Iquique. For this brutal reversal, González Videla is known among the communists as "el Traidor" (the Traitor). General Pinochet reinstated the concentration camp at Pisagua in 1973. It was the site of documented executions and torture after the coup.

[11] This group was named after a man who burned himself at the steps of a cathedral in Concepción in 1983 protesting the detention of his son and daughter. Two months later a Catholic priest (Derechos Chile, 2004b) spawned this non-violent human rights group. The group existed elsewhere in the country but, in the north, was most prominent in Arica.

[12] How mass mobilization is manifest in Arica, is addressed in another paper in this dissertation.

[13] Although I did not formally interview any of these youngest women, I wondered about the effect of these events and the part they played on their social-psychological development. Of the two whose *mothers* I formally interviewed, I know that the daughters are committed to justice and equality. One has spent time on study exchanges in Cuba to be a doctor.

[14] Although these learnings appear among some of the older women, as well, it plays out differently because they were introduced to feminism and joined the women's movement at a later stage in their lives.

215

[15] I also wondered what effect the secrets and lies necessary for protection during times of clandestinity might have had on the ability of couples to move forward in an intimate relationship, but this did not specifically emerge as an issue in the interviews.

[16] This is reminiscent of the devastating cultural effect on parenting in North America's First Nations communities after the boarding school years.

[17] Clauses for immunity from prosecution were built into the transition accords (e.g., the Amnesty Law).

[18] I did not attempt to independently verify the widespread belief that the dictatorship introduced drugs into the *poblaciones*, but some of the study participants claimed to be eyewitnesses.

[19] In this instance, I am referring mainly to the Communist Party which had the highest membership by far and which subsequently lost the most members as well.

[20] The consequence of prioritizing action over reflection is explored in another paper in this dissertation.

[21] It is not clear to me why this particular event seemed to destroy the political zeal of these young women. I suspect that, in some ways, it was symbolic in that it tipped the balance of their discontent.

[22] The speaker used the Spanish word *hombre* (man) as a signifier for people. The majority of the other younger women who had been more influenced by feminism would not likely use this.

[23] For positive consequences, see for example the references regarding Latin American women's movements listed above. The challenges of "double militancy" (i.e., participation in both political parties and the feminist movement) are also well covered in these same texts.

[24] For the 30th anniversary of the coup in 2003, 200 women stood in black and in silence on the steps of the cathedral.

[25] Second-wave feminists who cut their activist teeth in the civil rights movement in the U.S. (and the new left), credited the Freedom Summer experience with a prominent antecedent role in highlighting the contradictions between the ideology and practice of progressive social movements, leading eventually to a feminist critique of sexism (McAdam, 1992).

[26] Braungart and Braungart (1993) include Latin America in three of the identified generations of youth movements: In the 1930s and again in the 1980s, the focus was economic crises and political repression. In the 1960s, U.S. imperialism and economic inequities inspired by the Cuban revolution and liberation theology ignited youth protest.

[27] Land takeovers held special significance for the older women in this study, some of whom had taken part in their early married lives.

[28] Franceschet (2003) purports that the women's movement in Chile is re-articulating through networks that are using the government's own discourse (through the women's ministry, SERNAM) to articulate their demands. However, SERNAM did not resonate for the women in Arica. This is covered in another paper in this dissertation.

[29] However, in the Argentinean case, as underground groups became more separated from their political intent, a debate ensued between those that "argued it was time to

regroup and develop adequate ideological formulations" and those that "held that [their] strength had always resided in [their] a-theoretical behavior"(p. 117). This is reminiscent of the polarization between action and reflection that I discuss in another paper in this dissertation.

[30] As noted above, studies on U.S. activists tend to be quantitative and a number were conducted on Freedom Summer volunteers.

[31] Regarding marital status, for example, twenty years after their involvement in Freedom Summer, former participants are less likely to be married than the volunteer applicants who were accepted but that did not show (McAdam, 1989). Marwell et al. (1993) found that former U.S. activists were "approximately twice as likely as members of the general college-educated public to be currently divorced or separated" (p. 184). On the subject of parenthood, for example, at age 40, almost half of sixties activists in a U.S. sample were childless (Marwell et al., 1993).

[32] Cortez D az and Villagra Parra (1999) suggest that the women's hesitation was due to a conflict between choosing a private (maternal) and a public (political) womanhood. Although the older anti-dictatorship activists proved that the conflict could be managed, the costs of this are yet to be studied. These authors found a degree of guilt among the mothers who held both roles (see also Franceschet, 2001; Schild, 1998). It may be that these experiences have influenced the views of the younger women. As maternal motivations have such a huge impact on activism (as I discuss in another paper in this dissertation), I suggest that radicalizing the discourse by explicitly uncovering and validating the public roles of mothers may be necessary so that the two roles are seen, not as conflictual but, as dialectical (as much of the Latin American literature attempts to do).

[33] For example: Social networks necessarily imply affective ties; action is often motivated by injustice frames; collective identity is bounded more by trust, solidarity and affection than by material interests; emotional shifts often accompany cognitive shifts (Goodwin et al., 2001). Especially in high-risk activism with little chance of success, typical analyses of cost-benefit don't apply (Wood, 2001).

[34] The *Agrupación de Familiares de Detenidos Desaparacidos de Chile* published this statistic.

[35] This psychiatric diagnosis could not possibly be explored in any depth here within the confines of a dissertation on learning in social movements. However, some social-psychological aspects provide a window to understand the sequelae experienced by the women.

References

Agacino, Rafael. (1996). El neoliberalismo en Chile: Apertura econónica, competitividad y estrategias empresariales. In Zabrina Peréz A. & Luis Vitale C. (Eds.), *Teoría y Práctica de la Escuela de la Formación Sindical para Mujeres (Chile 1993-1996)* (pp. 15-30). Santiago, Chile: Buntstift.

Allman, Paula. (2001). *Critical education against global capitalism.* Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Alvarez, Sonia E. (1990). *Engendering democracy in Brazil.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

217

Baldez, Lisa. (2002). *Why women protest: Women's movements in Chile.* Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Bianchi, Soledad. (1988). Where to begin to grasp this land? Reflections on culture and authoritarianism in Chile: 1973-1986. In Grinor Rojo & John J. Hassett (Eds.), *Chile: Dictatorship and the struggle for democracy* (pp. 53-74). Gaithersburg, MD: Ediciones Hispamérica.

Boron, Atilio Alberto & Torres, Carlos Alberto. (1996). The impact of neoliberal restructuring on education and poverty in Latin America. *Alberta Journal of Educational Research, 42*(2), 102–114.

Braungart, Richard G. & Braungart, Margaret M. (1993). Historical generations and citizenship: 200 years of youth movements. In Philo C. Wasburn (Ed.), *Research in political sociology* (Vol. 6, pp. 139-174). Greenwich, CT: JAI Press.

Bresnahan, Rosalind. (2003). Introduction: Chile since 1990: The contradictions of neoliberal democratization. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(5), 3-15.

Cademartori, José. (2003). The Chilean neoliberal model enters into crisis. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(5), 79-88.

Chavkin, Samuel. (1985). *Storm over Chile: The Junta under siege.* Westport, CT: Lawrence Hill and Company.

Chuchryk, Patricia M. (1989). Feminist anti-authoritarian politics: The role of women's organizations in the Chilean transition to democracy. In Jane S. Jaquette (Ed.), *The women's movement in Latin America: Feminism and the transition to democracy* (pp. 149-184). Boston: Unwin Hyman.

Cortez D az, Aylen & Villagra Parra, Milka. (1999). *Imaginario y prácticas socio-políticas de las mujeres opositoras a la Dictadura Militar en Chile.*Unpublished manuscript, Arica, Chile.

della Porta, Donatella. (1992a). Introduction: On individual motivations in underground political organizations. *International Social Movement Research, 4,* 3-28.

della Porta, Donatella. (1992b). Political socialization in left wing underground organizations. *International Social Movement Research, 4,* 259-290.

Derechos Chile. (2004a). *Home page,* [Internet]. Derechos Chile. Available: http://www/chip.cl/derechos/dictadura_victimas_3_eng.html [2004, May 21].

Derechos Chile. (2004b). *Under the dictatorship,* [Internet]. Derechos Chile. Available: http://www/chip.cl/derechos/dictadura_eng.html [2004, May 21].

deVries, Marten W. (1996). Trauma in cultural perspective. In Bessel A. van der Kolk, Alexander C. McFarlane, & Lars Weisaeth (Eds.), *Traumatic stress: The effects of ovewhelming experience on mind, body, and society* (pp. 398-413). New York: Guilford Press.

Drake, Paul W. & Jaksic, Iván. (1991). Introduction: Transformation and transition in Chile, 1982-1990. In Paul W. Drake & Iván Jaksic (Eds.), *The struggle for democracy in Chile, 1982-1990* (pp. 1-17). Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press.

Foley, Griff. (1999). *Learning in social action: A contribution to understanding informal education.* London: Zed Books.

Franceschet, Susan. (2001). Women in politics in post-transitional democracies: The Chilean case. *International Feminist Journal of Politics, 3*(2), 207-236.

Franceschet, Susan. (2003). "State feminism" and women's movements: The impact of Chile's Servicio Nacional de Mujer on women's activism. *Latin American Research Review, 38*(1), 9-40.

Freire, Paulo. (1990). *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (Myra Bergman Ramos, Trans.). New York: Continuum.

Gaviola, Edda, Largo, Eliana, & Palestro, Sandra. (1994). *Una historia necessaria: Mujeres en Chile 1973-1990*. Santiago, Chile: Authors.

Goodwin, Jeff, Jasper, James M., & Polletta, Francesca. (2001). Introduction: Why emotions matter. In Jeff Goodwin, James M. Jasper, & Francesca Polletta (Eds.), *Passionate politics: Emotions and social movements* (pp. 1-24). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Goodwin, Jeff & Pfaff, Steven. (2001). Emotion work in high-risk social movements: Mangaging fear in the U.S. and East German Civil Rights Movement. In Jeff Goodwin, James M. Jasper, & Francesca Polletta (Eds.), *Passionate politics: Emotions and social movements* (pp. 282-302). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Jaggar, Alison M. (1996). Love and knowledge: Emotion in feminist epistemology. In Ann Garry & Marilyn Pearsall (Eds.), *Women, knowledge, and reality: Explorations in feminist philosophy* (pp. 166-187). New York: Routledge.

Jaquette, Jane S. (Ed.). (1989). *The women's movement in Latin America: Feminism and the transition to democracy*. Boston: Unwin Hyman.

Jelin, Elizabeth (Ed.). (1990). *Women and social change in Latin America*. London: Zed Books and United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.

Klandermans, Bert. (1997). *The social psychology of protest*. Cambridge, MA: Blackwell.

Loveman, Brian. (1988). Military dictatorship and political opposition in Chile. In Grinor Rojo & John J. Hassett (Eds.), *Chile: Dictatorship and the struggle for democracy* (pp. 17-52). Gaithersburg, MD: Ediciones Hispamérica.

Marwell, Gerald, Aiken, Michael T., & Demerath III, N. J. (1987). The persistence of political attitudes among 1960s civil rights activists. *Public Opinion Quarterly, 51*, 359-375.

Marwell, Gerald, Demerath III, N. J., & Aiken, Michael T. (1993). 1960s civil rights activists turn forty: A generational unit at mid-life. In Philo C. Wasburn (Ed.), *Research in political sociology* (Vol. 6, pp. 175-195). Greenwich, CT: JAI Press.

Matear, Ann. (1997). "*Desde la protesta a la propuesta*": The institutionalization of the women's movement in Chile. In Elizabeth Dore (Ed.), *Gender politics in Latin America: Debates in theory and practice* (pp. 84-100). New York: Monthly Review Press.

McAdam, Doug. (1989). The biographical consequences of activism. *American Sociological Review, 54*, 744-760.

McAdam, Doug. (1992). Gender as a mediator of the activist experience: The case of Freedom Summer. *American Journal of Sociology, 97*(5), 1211-1240.

Montecino, Sonia. (1996). *Madres y Huachos: Alegorías del mestizaje chileno*. Santiago, Chile: Editorial Sudamericana.

Moyano, Maria Jose. (1992). Going underground in Argentina: A look at the founders of a guerilla movement. *International Social Movement Research, 4*, 105-129.

Nef, Jorge. (2003). The Chilean model: Fact and fiction. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(5), 16-40.

Olavarr a, Margot. (2003). Protected neoliberalism: Perverse institutionalization and the crisis of representation in postdictatorship Chile. *Latin American Perspectives, 30*(6), 10-38.

Passerini, Luisa. (1992). Lacerations in the memory: Women in the Italian underground organizations. *International Social Movement Research, 4*, 161-212.

Polletta, Francesca & Amenta, Edwin. (2001). Second that emotion?: Lessons from once-novel concepts in social movement research. In Jeff Goodwin, James M. Jasper, & Francesca Polletta (Eds.), *Passionate politics: Emotions and social movements* (pp. 303-316). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Rojo, Grinor & Hassett, John J. (1988). Introduction. In Grinor Rojo & John J. Hassett (Eds.), *Chile: Dictatorship and the struggle for democracy* (pp. 9-16). Gaithersburg, MD: Ediciones Hispamérica.

Schild, Verónica. (1994). Recasting "popular" movements: Gender and political learning in neighborhood organizations in Chile. *Latin American Perspectives, 21*(2), 59–80.

Schild, Verónica. (1998). Market citizenship and the "new democracies": The ambiguous legacies of the contemporary Chilean women's movements. *Social Politics, 5*(2), 232-249.

Schild, Verónica. (2000). Neo-liberalism's new gendered market citizens: The 'civilizing' dimension of social programmes in Chile. *Citizenship Studies, 4*(3), 275-305.

Silva, Eduardo. (1991). The political economy of Chile's regime transition: From radical to "pragmatic" neo-liberal policies. In Paul W. Drake & Iván Jaksic (Eds.), *The struggle for democracy in Chile, 1982-1990* (pp. 98-127). Lincoln, NB: University of Nebraska Press.

Stephen, Lynn. (1997). *Women and social movements in Latin America: Power from below.* Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.

Sternbach, Nancy Saporta, Navarro-Aranguren, Marysa, Chuchryk, Patricia, & Alvarez, Sonia E. (1995). Feminisms in Latin America: From Bogotá to San Bernardo. In Barbara Laslett, Johanna Brenner, & Yesim Arat (Eds.), *Rethinking the political: Gender, resistance, and the state* (pp. 240-281). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Taylor, Verta. (1989). Social movement continuity: The women's movement in abeyance. *American Sociological Review, 54*(October), 761-775.

Thompson, Jane. (1983). *Learning liberation: Women's response to men's education.* London: Croom Helm.

Valdés, Teresa & Weinstein, Marisa. (1993). *Mujeres que sueñan: Las organizaciones de pobladoras en Chile, 1973-1999.* Santiago, Chile: FLACSO-Chile.

Valenzuela, Mar a Elena. (1998). Women and the democratization process in Chile. In Jane S. Jaquette & Sharon L. Wolchik (Eds.), *Women and democracy* (pp. 47-74). Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University.

van der Kolk, Bessel A. & McFarlane, Alexander C. (1996). The black hole of trauma. In Bessel A. van der Kolk, Alexander C. McFarlane, & Lars Weisaeth (Eds.), *Traumatic stress: The effects of ovewhelming experience on mind, body, and society* (pp. 3-23). New York: Guilford Press.

Van Dyke, Nella, McAdam, Doug, & Wilhelm, Brenda. (2000). Gendered outcomes: Gender differences in the biographical consequences of activism. *Mobilization: An International Journal, 5*(2), 161-177.

Villagran, Fernando. (1988). Me or Chaos. *Report on the Americas, March/April,* 14-20.

Waylen, Georgina. (1993). Women's movements and democratisation in Latin America. *Third World Quarterly, 14*(3), 573-587.

Whittier, Nancy. (1995). *Feminist generations: The persistence of the radical women's movement.* Philedelphia, PA: Temple University Press.

Wood, Elisabeth Jean. (2001). The emotional benefits of insurgency in El Salvador. In Jeff Goodwin, James M. Jasper, & Francesca Polletta (Eds.), *Passionate politics: Emotions and social movements* (pp. 267-281). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

GENERAL DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

Introduction

The papers in this dissertation are each intended to stand alone. Each was written at a different point in my analytical trajectory, so each is different in tone, in analytical sophistication, and in how the puzzle pieces that are the data fit together. But the source of the analytical categories explored in each paper is firmly rooted in the narratives of the women and the analysis that emerged in the field. Each has a direct relationship to and implications for radical adult education. Radical adult education is the educational philosophy/worldview to which I am committed and through which I interrogate learning in social movements. According to Holst (2002), radical adult education is "not explicitly defined in the literature" (p. 4). However, his usage coincides with my understanding of radical adult education as "... adult education theory and practice dedicated to significant social transformation within the left-wing political tradition" (p. 4-5). What's more, Cunningham (1989) reminds us that "adult education has been, and is today, a contributor to social transformation, even if this fact has been largely ignored" (p. 40). Thus, while numerous frameworks could have been used to make sense of the findings in this study, my reading of the data compelled me to engage the particular theoretical framework of marxist historical materialism for sense-making.

This concluding chapter of the dissertation is intended to make the links between the separate papers and to the field of study more explicit. To accomplish this final task, I explore four theoretical "guiding threads" that are woven through all four papers. Within each, I stitch together the main points from each of the papers that explicate the guiding thread. Then I consider future challenges and directions such as applying alternative theoretical frameworks, paying attention to the possibilities in little used data, and addressing gaps in my own interpretive construction of the data.

I begin by reiterating the original research objectives and evaluating my progress in meeting them.

Research Objectives

Several questions guided my research from the outset. Through the fieldwork, analysis, and writing, this dissertation has fulfilled my primary research objectives: To explore the

222

phenomenon of social and political learning in social movements – in all its informal, obscured and partial ways, to explicitly expose the learning dimension of a social movement, and to spotlight the educational processes at work within the movement.

To achieve the research objectives, I also contemplated the following related questions: How did women *learn* their way out of victimization to become oppositional activists against the dictatorship? What were the methods (processes and content) of social and political learning within the social movement? How were knowledge and skills transmitted through social movement participation? What was the relationship of these processes to social change? How are the methods and means of knowledge transmission transformed or sustained as movements wax and wane in different periods? What alternatives for social and political learning might arise when major movements become quiescent in any given period? How is social and political knowledge created, transmitted and transformed across generations? How has the loss of a generation affected the ability of civil society to organize and participate in social movements or in a democratic society at all?

Many of these questions are addressed in one way or another in the work presented here. My most salient findings are coalesced into the guiding threads below. But all remain questions in my mind, questions to ask over and over again in other contexts, in other places where we can learn from the learning in social movements.

Theoretical Guiding Threads

Although the papers are separate entities, certain ideas are recognizably and significantly redundant across the papers. I have called these ideas theoretical guiding threads. They are: critical revolutionary praxis, feminist praxis, imprinting neo-liberalism, and the organic nature of education in social movements. For ease, I refer to the papers as the Arica Story, Consciousness, Praxis, and Consequences papers.

Critical Revolutionary Praxis

Compellingly emanating from the data and woven into every paper is the **crucial significance of a critical revolutionary praxis, the essential, yet elusive, dialectic that privileges neither action nor reflection**. The continual challenge of finding the dialectical equilibrium between the two is revealed in this study. I explore the 'reflection' aspect of the dialectical unit primarily through the concepts of critical

223

consciousness and of ideology, making a distinction between the two. In the Consciousness paper, I review the importance of early learning and the differences between "acquiring" and "taking" critical consciousness (this linguistic distinction is suggested in Spanish but not in English).

Acquiring consciousness is a more passive and structurally determined process that, in this case, establishes the *potential* for a critical revolutionary consciousness. It generally transpires during the early years as we learn values and beliefs from the collective that makes up our social world (including parents). Like Lange (2004), I suggest that more attention be paid to building upon, or in her words, "restor[ing] deeply held beliefs to a conscious place in daily decision-making." This "restorative learning" process can act as a pedagogical entry point for connecting emotions, material circumstances, and the socio-historical context of capitalism. Otherwise, this early consciousness remains hidden and inaccessible to us in a political learning process.

The *taking* of consciousness, on the other hand, suggests a more intentional act of agency. I contend that "taking" consciousness in the ways suggested by the women requires a specific foundational ideology. Through an exploration, in the papers, of the power of its presence and the consequences of its absence, I establish the importance of a foundational ideology through which social action is realized, evaluated, and reconstructed.

While there are many definitions of ideology (see for example Allman, 2001b; Eagleton, 1991), my understanding of the women's meaning is "a system of ideas that is organically necessary to a particular structure" (Allman, 2001b, p. 109).[1] The "structure" posited by these women would most certainly entail a critique of capitalism and a vision of socialism. As I point out in the Praxis paper, the purposive elucidation of this ideology is exactly what was lost in the action-oriented frenzy of the anti-dictatorship mobilizations. The consequences of this absence are woven throughout the papers. I identify the consequences that emerged from the division of the women's movement in the Praxis paper, primarily a privileging of action over reflection that left the women without a clear critique of capitalism or a vision for the future. The particular consequences experienced by the younger women, explicitly explored in the Consequences paper, are a testament to the necessity of a conscientious praxis in social movement activism.

In her 2001 book, Allman establishes consciousness as the "cohesive thread" of her educational project for revolutionary social transformation and argues that adult

224

educators need "to understand how it is constituted and how it can be rendered more critical" (p. 2). I believe that a thoroughgoing study of consciousness provides the essential tools to understand more clearly the conundrum of the personal/social, agency/structure dialectic. The particular mechanisms for acquiring and taking critical consciousness require further study and clarification, as do the mechanisms for teaching these across the life span. Educators find the most direction from Freire (1990) and his followers who explain the principles and processes of critical pedagogy and radical adult education.[2] But what does a truly revolutionary praxis look like and how is it taught in different contexts? Where are the spaces for challenging the dominant ideology in the first world context? How do we create them? What do we need to learn also from the post-structuralist critiques that challenge our ideas of a unifying ideology?

Another potentially promising avenue for further analysis is the work of Russian psychologist, Len Vygotsky, in relation to the social origins and social nature of human consciousness (Duveen, 1997; Ratner, 1991; Wertsch, 1985). His recently translated theories have become increasingly recognized throughout psychology and could provide a valuable extension to the marxist theoretical perspective in my discussion. Applying his concepts to transformative learning theory, as has been initiated by Scott (2003), has the potential to add a more social dimension and radical perspective to transformative learning theory. At this time, however, his theories are interpreted through the field of developmental psychology wherein there is a consensus that his theory "never went beyond the level of interpsychological processes," that is, that he did not, before he died, adequately deal with "the relationship of social institutional factors and human consciousness" (Wertsch, 1985, p. 209). It may be, however, that a sociological reading of his work might yield a different interpretation that could be applied to a radical education project.

Feminist Praxis

Feminist praxis that emerged during the anti-dictatorship struggle is integrated into the subjectivities of these women. In the papers included here, I describe the contested emergence of second-wave feminism in Chile and its impact on the women. Whether or not feminism is a useful signifier for individual women, my findings concur with many other studies that a gendered consciousness emerged as women found voice and strength and carved new identities through the many and varied actions that comprised the women's movement in Chile. I embed examples of this in the Arica Story. In the Consequences paper, I demonstrate the simultaneous trajectory of feminist and socialist

225

learning for the young women in the anti-dictatorship struggle. In the Praxis paper, I tackle the issue of feminism directly. In Arica, it is the epicenter of a controversy that split the women's movement at its inception. In part due to the women's unfamiliarity with feminism and to its challenge to established ways of thinking and being, feminism in Arica was linked with thought, study, and preparation (i.e., reflection) and dissociated from the action-oriented imperative of the majority of the women. Despite this, there were no young women and few older women that were untouched by feminism. While critical consciousness was a *formative* process for most of these women, feminist consciousness was a *trans*formative experience for some.

A foundational tenet of feminism has always been "the personal is political." From this perspective, personal development cannot be forgotten in the scenario presented here. *"Desarollo personal"* (personal development), however, is a two-edged sword. On one hand, a focus on personal development has the potential to personalize, individualize, isolate and de-politicize structural problems such as poverty. This is exactly the approach taken by the current regime in its poverty-alleviation schemes with women. On the other hand, it also has the potential to capture the attention of the younger women who, in some ways, are searching for a way to heal the pain and despair of their post-dictatorship existence.[3] As Galeano (2000) admonishes, "the task ahead – building our country – cannot be accomplished with bricks of shit" (p. 163). From a radical adult education perspective, personal development activities that enhance self-esteem and self-efficacy contribute to the process of developing a critically conscious and emotionally healthy citizen. However,

> it is important to understand these activities not as an end in themselves, but rather as instruments for aiding and strengthening the inclusion (not submersion) of individuals in the collective task of improving and transforming women's lives. Personal development should not be at odds with or move away from the task of transforming material conditions. (Quiroz Martin, 1997, p. 44)

Thus, when the linkages among emotions/trauma, the material circumstances in people's lives, and the neo-liberal project are made explicit, personal development has the potential to be a radical and necessary response to the current impasse and the individual and collective consequences experienced by the women. The kinds of consciousness-raising processes that were accomplished during the dictatorship years could provide a start in this direction.

Understanding feminist praxis in Arica would benefit from additional theorization through a post-structuralist, post-colonial feminist critique. I also skirted around the

226

issue of the intersections between socialism and feminism. In the kind of concerted return to Marx I am advocating here, it is imperative that the analysis be extended to a clearer theoretical and empirical understanding of the compatibilities and contradictions of marxist theory with a feminism that interrogates multiple oppressions and integrates diverse experiences.

Moreover, while I touch on the current state of the women's movement in Arica in the papers, I do not analyze it thoroughly. As I have previously mentioned, the relationship between the grassroots women's movement and the institutionalized women's movement represented by the state (i.e., SERNAM) and NGOs is the subject of considerable debate. My data-gathering process included obtaining documents and conducting interviews with representatives from these groups in Arica. Also, through my extensive exposure to CEDEMU's work, I am familiar with the main issues and processes of the feminist project in Chile today. But I have presented little of these data here. Nevertheless, the information I present about SERNAM in the Arica Story is a useful starting place for an analysis that might extend beyond the current literature based on the capital city. In Arica, the institutionalization of 'their' women's movement has rendered the movement invisible and ineffectual at the grassroots.

One additional aspect that must be considered more explicitly in the study of social movements is the gendered nature of social and political activism. As the women in Arica would attest, "whatever the issue, wherever the battlefield, it is agreed that women are at the center of movements for change" (Garland, 1988, p. xxi). As Garland further points out, "it is difficult to evade the question of why, time and again, it is women who populate movements" (p. xxi). A potentially promising aspect that deserves more theoretical attention is the radical and subversive nature of activism based on a motherhood or maternal frame. As I note in the Arica Story, the feminist/feminine dichotomy shows little promise when tested in the real world. Yet, women's activism is often grounded in their experiences as women and as mothers. "Their perspectives are informed by how the world treats them as citizens and as people" (Garland, 1988, p. xvi). I suggest that Sara Ruddick's (1990) "maternal thinking" may play a useful analytical role in this discussion.

Imprinting Neo-liberalism

Neither critical nor feminist praxis can be considered outside of a most disturbing but not unexpected finding. **Neo-liberalism is clearly imprinted on the subjectivities and**

227

collective identities of Chilean women. Imprinted on a people who, with the election of Salvador Allende thirty-four years ago, celebrated the zenith of a peaceful, democratic path toward socialism, a rare phenomenon in our world's history. Imprinted on a people who were highly politicized and critically conscious citizens. On September 11, 1973, neo-liberalism, the latest capitalist experiment, was imposed through brute force and terror. Neo-liberalism was made material in the women's lives in sudden and inescapable ways.

It is important to candidly consider the consequences of both the trauma of the dictatorship and of participation in the anti-dictatorship movements. In the Consequences paper focusing on the younger women in Arica, I explicitly address personal, interpersonal, social, and political consequences. In that paper, I expose one of the myths of the unified oppositional subject, that of the ageless actor. How women of different generations are differentially involved in and affected by social movement participation is not addressed in the literature. In this vein, a number of other papers might also be written.

First, I have considerable information about the distinct experiences of *las viejas*, the older women's movement participants that could comprise a second Consequences paper. In their stories, we find the positive consequences of their leadership roles, the detrimental consequences on their health and economic situations, and, for some, the more radical effects of feminism. (These themes are touched on in the Arica Story). Among the older women, differentiation along class lines is also more obvious. Another aspect that was only touched upon by the women in Arica is the effect on the children of the mother's involvement in the women's movement. One woman, whose adult daughter left the country after the dictatorship, remembers her crying, "I am leaving because this country has given me nothing for being the daughter of a communist." Feelings of maternal neglect and guilt were raised in another study with these same women (Cortez D az & Villagra Parra, 1999).[4] On the other hand, not enough information about the leadership of the older women has filtered down to the younger women. As maternal motivations have such a huge impact on activism, I suggest that radicalizing the discourse by explicitly uncovering and validating the public roles of mothers may be necessary so that the two roles are seen, not as conflictual but, as dialectical (as much of the Latin American literature attempts to do).

These last two points are appropriate segues to a second area for further study. The time is ripe for research on the youngest generation, those women who are young adults today. These are the women that were innocently and unwittingly involved "under the

228

tables" as well as those vast numbers of youth who are accused of *"no están ni ahí."* The direct translation is "not being anywhere." The meaning is obvious.

I believe that this direct attention to consequences is an important contribution to social movement literature, particularly in situations of high-risk activism such as that experienced by the women in Arica. As I mention in the Consequences paper, there are numerous theories that might help to explain the findings about traumatic consequences, especially from a psychoanalytic, psychiatric, or psychological framework. However, in my view, these are only useful if they consider the structural dimension that contextualizes subjects within a political, economic, and social reality. The psychosocial literature on Post-traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD) that I introduce in the Consequences paper makes a start in that direction (deVries, 1996).

Throughout the papers, I identify some of the mechanisms that subdued the thriving social movements as the country entered the transition period. In the literature, theorists look to political opportunity structures and collective action frames to make sense of this apparent dormancy. However, not enough critical attention is paid to neo-liberalism itself.[5] Not enough attention to the ways it imprints upon the minds and bodies of people, individually and collectively. There are a number of promising theoretical directions that one could go with this guiding thread.

First, I am certain that Michel Foucault's work on subjectivity and power would provide insight into the imprinting of neo-liberalism on the collective subject. In one of my forays through the CEDEMU library, I came across a short article that drew on one of Foucault's conceptions of power – power through the logic of prohibition (Dos Santos, 1997). According to the author, this has three interrelated components: Negate that something exists (the inexistence), prevent it from being named (the unnamable), and say that it can't be done (the illicit). Although this type of power was imposed during the dictatorship (and even today), so too was it (and is it) opposed. As I relate in the Consequences paper, the multiple contradictions inherent in such diametrically opposed realities – repression and resistance – are materially experienced in the women's daily lives.

Second, especially in the Praxis paper, I raise issues related to capitalist ideology and hegemony. A more thorough analysis of the discursive practices that have constructed neo-liberal hegemony in the Chilean context is indicated. In this way, the "case study" of Arica would be inserted into a global framework that considers "transnational power structures." Theories of transnationalism look at the "transnational economic links and

229

cultural asymmetries" and the oppositional discourses and practices within them (Grewal & Kaplan, 1994, p. 3). According to Grewal and Kaplan (1994), this type of framework is imperative for getting beyond the current challenges raised by postmodernism.

> If feminist political practices do not acknowledge transnational cultural flows, feminist movements will fail to understand the material conditions that structure women's lives in diverse locations. If feminist movements cannot understand the dynamic of these material conditions, they will be unable to construct an effective opposition to current economic and cultural hegemonies that are taking new global forms. Without an analysis of transnational scattered hegemonies that reveal themselves in gender relations, feminist movements will remain isolated and prone to reproducing the universalizing gestures of dominant Western cultures... We know that there is an imperative need to address the concerns of women around the world in the historicized particularity of their relationship to multiple patriarchies as well as to international economic hegemonies. (p. 17)

Allman (2001b), too, cautions against the common activist pitfall of focusing on a single issue in a local context (such as what the anti-dictatorship movements did), even when it is recognized as a global issue.

> We need to develop a critical understanding of how all of these and other issues link together in a total structure, a human structure, of oppression welded together by the social relations and objectives of global capitalism. (p. 6)

First through the seventeen years of dictatorship and then through the negotiated transition that followed, the imprinting of neo-liberalism almost destroyed a people. Almost, but not quite.

Although neo-liberalism *is* clearly imprinted on the subjectivities and collective identities of Chilean women, pockets of hope survive.

As I point out in the Consequences paper, critical consciousness has not disappeared, astute and critical analyses of neo-liberalism abound, politics is high on the list of conversation topics, and "abeyance structures" (Taylor, 1989) such as CEDEMU are visible. In the midst of their despair and disillusionment, this hopefulness is not visible to the women in Arica. Reflecting their own words and actions back to them may be an important contribution to the women's movement in Arica. The movement may be dormant but learning is not.

The Organic Nature of Education in Social Movements

Could it be any more obvious that I am describing an *educational* project? Allman (2001b) reasons that "authentic social transformation is never a sudden event. It is a process through which people change not only their circumstances but themselves. Consequently it must be an educational process that involves the simultaneous transformation of educational relations" (p. 1). Throughout the papers, I identify implications for radical adult education that exemplify the *organic* educative and learning dimension of social movements. My guiding thread here, as I overtly state in the Consciousness paper, is: **Radical adult education occurs through the organic presence of adult educators within social movements in a dialectical relationship with organizing.** By organic, I mean that adult educators (whether identified as such or not) are an *inherent* part of social movements and that they are embedded *naturally* within the movement without being contrived (paraphrased from my on-line dictionary's definition of the term).

By tracing the women's life paths as they relate to social movements, I have woven learning and educational experiences throughout the Arica Story. I introduce the implications of an organic approach to education in the Consciousness paper where I invoke parental teaching and the role of the political party for their radical educational potential. But I establish its *centrality* in the Praxis paper where the integral nature of education is demonstrated by both its presence (the multiple ways in which the women learned in the women's movement) and its absence (the consequences of the missing "study" or ideological component). I emphasize the importance of learning to think and to think critically in social movement activism and I explain the role of organic intellectuals working in concert with traditional intellectuals in this process. Through the stories of Paloma and the other younger women in the Consequences paper, I investigate both the positive and the negative effects of social movement learning.

I repeat here Griff Foley's (1999) poignant words that, for me, epitomize the organic nature of which I speak.

> Some of the most powerful learning occurs as people struggle against oppression, as they struggle to make sense of what is happening to them and to work out ways of doing something about it. (p. 1-2)

If this is true and if it is also true that large and small resistances and struggles are always occurring, where does an adult educator fit in? Paulo Freire and his North American counterpart Miles Horton give us some direction.

231

Both agree that even "little pockets of hope and adventurism" can provide the context of education for social change... However, they also agree that these small pockets can no more be created at will than can larger revolutionary situations. In generally quiescent times the challenge for progressive adult educators is not to initiate abstract general educational campaigns so much as to find and foster and serve these "pockets of hope." This, they stress, is "not an intellectual process (but) a process of being involved." (Miles, 1996, p. 277)

"A process of being involved" – precisely what I learned from the women's movement in Arica about how to *be* an adult educator in a social movement.

Summary

In addition to the collective narrative of the women's movement in Arica, several thematic areas emerged from analysis of the field data including consciousness, praxis, and consequences of movement participation. In each of these, I focus on aspects of the research findings that receive the least attention in the social movement literature. Four theoretical "guiding threads" run through all the four papers presented in this dissertation. These are:

Critical revolutionary praxis, the essential yet elusive dialectic that privileges neither action nor reflection, is crucial in the social movement learning process.

Feminist praxis that emerged during the anti-dictatorship struggle is integrated into the subjectivities of the women.

Although neo-liberalism is clearly imprinted on the subjectivities and collective identities of Chilean women, pockets of hope survive.

Radical adult education occurs through the organic presence of adult educators within social movements in a dialectical relationship with organizing.

Epilogue

In some ways, this work is a memory project, a means to bear witness (Mohanty, 1991). In situations where "it is forbidden to remember" (Galeano, 2000, p. 165), we talk and we write, "so that forgetfulness will not win out" (Derechos Chile, 2004, p. 1). In many ways and on many levels, this story demands that we reconnect the emotional to the theoretical. In this work, real lives, not just theoretical constructs, are privileged. In the words of Eduardo Galeano (2000),

232

> perhaps writing is no more than an attempt to save, in times of infamy,
> the voices that will testify to the fact that we were here and this is how we
> were. A way of saving for those we do not yet know, as Espriu had
> wanted, "the name of each thing." How can those who don't know where
> they come from find out where they are going? (p. 161)

For some time now, I have felt that this research would be better presented as a film. Mere words on paper do not do justice to the profound experience of the women portrayed herein. "I think that to recount this, it seems so little," said one woman, "because it is very different to say it in a serene and tranquil way like I'm doing now... For us it was a big thing."

Never did I feel this so strongly as one hot December day in Arica when, walking through a downtown park with our three-year-old Amalia in my arms, Héctor was suddenly overcome by an imperative memory rooted in that very park. The date was International Women's Day, March 8, 1987. As was often the case, the day acted as a catalyst for protest. For Héctor, the day held personal trauma as his brother was severely beaten and he, drawing attention away from his brother, was chased for many blocks with the military in terrorizing pursuit. As he pointed to the patches of ground where this happened and then that happened and he walked me through the streets of the chase, I joined him for those few minutes on a chilling journey that lives within me still – embedded deep within and connecting me, however faintly, by a social umbilical cord to a time, place and people far from my own. Little did I know on that day that the event also emotionally resonated for many of the women I interviewed, even though it was one of many, many days and nights of protest. What is it about this narrative that grabbed me in the guts and connected me to these women? In some ways, this critical event offers a microcosmic view into the topic of this research: the hope and despair of social and political learning in social movements.

In time, I came to realize that these women struggled for all of us. They are another of the many groups of nameless oppositional subjects throughout history – often women and other marginalized peoples – that have relentlessly resisted injustice and oppression. Just as we now commemorate International Women's Day in honour of the 129 women garment workers that perished in a factory fire during a strike in Chicago, this work pays homage to the women of Arica who also put their lives on the line to struggle against injustice. Like the women workers in 1910, these Chilean women experienced in their everyday lives and bodies the ravages of capitalism. In struggling against the dictator, they struggled also against the capitalist system that installed, sanctioned, and then protected him through military might. For this, I/we owe these

233

women an enormous debt that I, in my relative comfort and passivity, will not ever know how to repay.

The physical experience of *walking* through the story with Héctor intensified the ability of my mind's eye to see, smell, hear, and feel an event experienced by others more than a dozen years ago. It is my wish that, through this work, others may capture the experiences shared by the women of Arica as deeply, not only for their own learning, but also to honour and celebrate the experiences of these women and their fellow re/sisters. But ultimately, the express purpose of this kind of work is to bring about social and political change (Mohanty, 1991).

Stay tuned for the film...

Notes

---

[1] Although Allman (2001b) admits that this is the common definition of ideology among Gramscian theorists, she herself suggests a different interpretation of Gramsci's meaning of ideology.

[2] There are numerous texts that address critical pedagogy and radical adult education (see for example Apple, 1999; Collins, 1991; Freire, 1990; 2002; Giroux, 1989; 2001; Hart, 1990; hooks, 2003; Lovett, 1988; Mayo & Thompson, 1995; McLaren & Lankshear, 1994; Shor, 1987; 1987; 1983; Thompson, 1980; Westwood & Thomas, 1991; Youngman, 1986). Regarding radical adult education, Holst (2002) identifies a significant difference in the tone of the literature from the 1980s during the "heyday of radical community education" and that of the 1990s wherein there is a "sense of defeat and need for realism" (p. 96). More recent work by theorists such as Holst (2002) and Allman (2001a; 2001b) challenge this defeatism in the face of the ascendancy of the right.

[3] CINTRAS is an NGO whose objective is to provide medical-psychological assistance to those who were victims of serious human rights violations (especially torture) during the military dictatorship http://www.cintras.tie.cl/quienes_somos1.htm. However, in the small city of Arica, the women have little faith or trust in this resource.

[4] In analyzing the experiences of the younger women whose mothers were active in the movement, there may be some utility in considering the literature from developmental psychology that discusses fear of abandonment vs. over-dependence, over-identification.

[5] Regarding the Chilean women's movement, Verónica Schild (see for example 1995; 1998; Schild, 2000) is the most vocal critic of neo-liberalism.

234

References

Allman, Paula. (2001a). *Critical education against global capitalism*. Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Allman, Paula. (2001b). *Revolutionary social transformation: Democratic hopes, political possibilities, and critical education*. Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Apple, Michael W. (1999). *Power, meaning, and identity: Essays in critical educational studies*. New York: P. Lang.

Collins, Michael. (1991). *Adult education as vocation: A critical role for the adult educator*. New York: Routledge.

Cortez D az, Aylen & Villagra Parra, Milka. (1999). *Imaginario y prácticas socio-políticas de las mujeres opositoras a la Dictadura Militar en Chile*.Unpublished manuscript, Arica, Chile.

Cunningham, Phyllis M. (1989). Making a more significant impact on society. *New Directions in Continuing Education, 44*, 33-45.

Derechos Chile. (2004). *Home page*, [Internet]. Derechos Chile. Available: http://www/chip.cl/derechos/dictadura_victimas_3_eng.html [2004, May 21].

deVries, Marten W. (1996). Trauma in cultural perspective. In Bessel A. van der Kolk, Alexander C. McFarlane, & Lars Weisaeth (Eds.), *Traumatic stress: The effects of ovewhelming experience on mind, body, and society* (pp. 398-413). New York: Guilford Press.

Dos Santos, Lupe. (1997, November 1996 - March 1997). Inexistente, innombrable, il cito: La homofobia. *Cortidiano Mujer, 23*, 40-41.

Duveen, Gerard. (1997). Psychological development as a social process. In Leslie Smith, Julie Dockrell, & Peter Tomlinson (Eds.), *Piaget, Vygotsky and beyond: Future issues for developmental psychology and education* (pp. 67-90). London: Routledge.

Eagleton, Terry. (1991). *Ideology: An introduction*. London: Verso.

Foley, Griff. (1999). *Learning in social action: A contribution to understanding informal education*. London: Zed Books.

Freire, Paulo. (1990). *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (Myra Bergman Ramos, Trans.). New York: Continuum.

Freire, Paulo. (2002). *Education for critical consciousness*. New York: Continuum.

Galeano, Eduardo. (2000). *Days and nights of love and war* (Judith Brister, Trans.). New York: Monthly Review Press.

Garland, A. W. (1988). *Women activists: Challenging the abuse of power*. New York: Feminist Press.

Giroux, Henry A. (1989). *Schooling for democracy: Critical pedagogy in the modern age*. London: Routledge.

Giroux, Henry A. (2001). *Theory and resistance in education: Towards a pedagogy for the opposition* (Revised ed.). Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Grewal, Inderpal & Kaplan, Karen. (1994). Introduction: Transnational feminist practices and questions of postmodernity. In Inderpal Grewal & Karen Kaplan (Eds.), *Scattered hegemonies: Postmodernity and transnational feminist practices* (pp. 1-33). Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Hart, Mechtild U. (1990). Liberation through consciousness raising. In J. Mezirow & Associates (Ed.), *Fostering critical reflection in adulthood* (pp. 47–73). San Fransisco: Jossey Bass.

Holst, John D. (2002). *Social movements, civil society, and radical adult education*. Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

hooks, bell. (2003). *Teaching community: A pedagogy of hope*. New York: Routledge.

Lange, Elizabeth A. (2004). Transformative and restorative learning: A vital dialectic for sustainable societies. *Adult Education Quarterly, 54*(2), 121-139.

Lovett, Tom (Ed.). (1988). *Radical approaches to adult education: A reader*. London: Routledge.

Mayo, Marjorie & Thompson, Jane (Eds.). (1995). *Adult learning, critical intelligence and social change*. London: NIACE.

McLaren, Peter L. & Lankshear, Colin (Eds.). (1994). *Politics of liberation: Paths from Freire*. London: Routledge.

Miles, Angela. (1996). Adult education for global social change: Feminism and women's movement. In Paul Wangoola & Frank Youngman (Eds.), *Towards a transformative political economy of adult education* (pp. 277-292). DeKalb, IL: LEPS Press.

Mohanty, Chandra Talpade. (1991). Cartographies of struggle: Third World women and the politics of feminism. In Chandra Talpade Mohanty, Ann Russo, & Lourdes Torres (Eds.), *Third World women and the politics of feminism* (pp. 1-47). Bloomington, IL: Indiana University Press.

Quiroz Martin, Teresa. (1997). Women, poverty and adult education in Chile. In Shirley Walters (Ed.), *Globalization, adult education and training: Impacts and issues* (pp. 39-46). London: Zed Books.

Ratner, Carl. (1991). *Vygotsky's sociohistorical psychology and its contemporary applications*. New York: Plenum Press.

Ruddick, Sara. (1990). *Maternal thinking: Towards a politics of peace*. New York: Ballantine.

Schild, Verónica. (1995). NGOs, feminist politics and neo-liberal Latin American state formations: Some lessons from Chile. *Canadian Journal of Development Studies, Special Issue*, 123-147.

Schild, Verónica. (1998). Market citizenship and the "new democracies": The ambiguous legacies of the contemporary Chilean women's movements. *Social Politics, 5*(2), 232-249.

Schild, Verónica. (2000). Neo-liberalism's new gendered market citizens: The 'civilizing' dimension of social programmes in Chile. *Citizenship Studies, 4*(3), 275-305.

Scott, Sue M. (2003). The social construction of transformation. *Journal of Transformative Education, 1*(3), 264-284.

Shor, Ira. (1987). *Critical teaching and everyday life*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Shor, Ira & Freire, Paulo. (1987). *A pedagogy for liberation: Dialogues on transforming education*. South Hadley, MA: Bergin & Garvey.

Taylor, Verta. (1989). Social movement continuity: The women's movement in abeyance. *American Sociological Review, 54*(October), 761-775.

Thompson, Jane. (1983). *Learning liberation: Women's response to men's education*. London: Croom Helm.

Thompson, Jane (Ed.). (1980). *Adult education for a change*. London: Hutchinson.

Wertsch, James V. (1985). *Vygotsky and the social formation of mind*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Westwood, Sallie & Thomas, J. E. (Eds.). (1991). *Radical agendas? The politics of adult education*. Leicester: National Institute of Adult Continuing Education.

Youngman, Frank. (1986). *Adult education and socialist pedagogy*. London: Croom Helm.

Appendices 1 – English

These documents were successfully submitted for ethics approval prior to the fieldwork in Chile. Modifications were made in the Spanish versions to meet the realities of the field situation (see Appendices 2 – Spanish).

Appendix 1-A: General Letter of Introduction

> ### *Research Project*
> ### *Learning Power from the Margins:*
> ### *Grassroots Women's Movements in Chile*

December 2001 to June 2002

My name is Donna Chovanec. I am a student in International/Intercultural Education from the University of Alberta in Edmonton, Canada.

The focus of my studies is women's movements. Because of my relationships with Latin Americans in Edmonton, I became very interested in the situation of women in Chile and especially in the grassroots women's movements. In the research on women's movements in Latin America, very little has been written about the experience of women who live outside capital cities. The experience of women in Arica, a small almost isolated city in a militarized zone, offers a different perspective than that of women in Santiago. For this reason, with the help of *Casa De Encuentro de la Mujer* (CEDEMU-Arica), I am doing some research about grassroots women's movements in Arica.

The purpose of this project is to learn about the experiences of women working for change in their neighbourhoods during the different political and historical contexts over the past three decades. I am mostly interested in understanding the learning dimension of participation in social movements: how and what women have learned and how they share this learning with other women.

From this information, I will write a doctoral dissertation to complete my studies at the University of Alberta and I may publish articles or present at conferences, always being attentive to protecting the identity of the women and organizations that participate in the project.

At this time, international organizations are very interested in how social movements and other community-based organizations contribute to healthy democracies and alleviate social problems all over the world. There is particular interest in the role of women in this important work.

For about six months, I will be living in the community and visiting various activities such as workshops, meetings and social events. As well, I will be interviewing some women who live in the community and others who are from official organizations.

If you would like more details about the project, I welcome your questions. A written summary of the project proposal is also available. You may also talk to Berta Moreno Plaza, Director, CEDEMU (phone: 257015, or cedemu@ctcreuna.cl). Or call us if you or your community group is interested in participating in the study.

Donna Chovanec

Phone: [add]
Email: chovanec@ualberta.ca

239

Appendix 1-B: Letter for Interview Participants

Research Project
Learning Power from the Margins: ***Grassroots Women's Movements in Chile***

February to May 2002

Dear Participant:

My name is Donna Chovanec. I am a student from the University of Alberta in Canada. With the help of *Casa De Encuentro de la Mujer* (CEDEMU-Arica), I am doing some research about learning in grassroots women's movements in Arica.

The purpose of this project is to learn about your experiences as a woman working for change in your community. I am mostly interested in understanding: how you have learned to do this work, what you have learned from doing this work, and how you share this learning with other women. From this information, I will write a doctoral dissertation to complete my studies at the University of Alberta and I may publish articles or present at conferences, always being careful to protect your identity.

[add only if research collaborator is interviewing] [Insert name of research collaborator] has been trained by CEDEMU and I to gather this information from you. There will likely be two interview sessions with you, each up to one and a half hours long. The first interview will be an open conversation with you about your experience. In the second interview, I will ask you specific questions to understand better what you told me earlier. I will also check out some ideas that have come from other participants in the study to see if they fit with your experience. With your permission, the interviews will be audiotaped and then typed.

Your name and other information that might identify you will not be included in any written materials or on the audio tapes. Tapes and transcripts will only be seen by me and the typist and will be erased/shredded when the study is finished.

[add only if research collaborator is analyzing data] With your permission, transcripts from the interviews will be reviewed by [add name(s)] who is/are helping me to understand what you and the other participants are saying. Any information that might identify you will be removed from the transcripts.

Even if you agree to participate at this time, you have the right to withdraw or change your mind about any aspect of the research at a later time without any consequences to you.

If you would like more details about the project, I welcome your questions. You may also talk to Berta Moreno Plaza, Director, CEDEMU (phone: 257015, or cedemu@ctcreuna.cl).

Donna Chovanec

Phone: [add]
Email: chovanec@ualberta.ca

240

Appendix 1-C: Letter for Interviews with Staff of Official Organizations

> **Research Project**
>
> *Learning Power from the Margins:*
> *Grassroots Women's Movements in Chile*

February to May 2002

Dear [Insert Name]:

Centro de Estudios de la Mujer is a non-governmental organization working with the women in [insert name] neighbourhoods. [insert some detail about main purpose and current projects]

We are currently providing some support to Donna Chovanec, a student from the University of Alberta in Canada. She is doing some research about learning in grassroots women's movements in Arica. At this time, international organizations are very interested in how social movements and other community-based organizations contribute to healthy democracies and alleviate social problems all over the world. There is particular interest in the role of women in this important work.

The purpose of this project is to learn about the experiences of women working for change in their own neighbourhoods. Sra. Chovanec is mostly interested in understanding: how women have learned to do this work, what they have learned from doing this work, and how they share this learning with other women. From this information, Sra. Chovanec will write a doctoral dissertation to complete her studies at the University of Alberta and I may publish articles or present at conferences, always being careful to protect your identity.

Sra. Chovanec is interested in your views as a member of an official organization that establishes policies and/or programs for these women. She would appreciate an opportunity to meet with you for approximately one and a half hours. With your permission, the interviews will be audiotaped and then typed.

Your name and other information that might identify you will not be included in any written materials or on the audio tapes. Tapes and transcripts will only be seen by Sra. Chovanec and the typist and will be erased/shredded when the study is finished. [if a research collaborator is used for interviews or analysis, adjust wording accordingly]

Even if you agree to participate at this time, you have the right to withdraw at a later point without any consequences to you.

If you would like more details about the project, I welcome your questions. You may also talk to Sra. Chovanec who could also provide you with a copy of the project proposal [add phone number and email address]. Thank-you for your help with this project.

Berta Moreno Plaza, Director

Casa De Encuentro de la Mujer (CEDEMU-Arica)

(phone: 257015, or cedemu@ctcreuna.cl)

Appendix 1-D: Agreement with Transcriber

I, _____, the *Transcriber*, agree to:

1. Keep all the information shared with me confidential by not discussing or sharing the written or electronic information with anyone.

2. Properly secure all information for privacy and safe-keeping. For example, keep electronic files password protected and papers and tapes in a locked cabinet or drawer.

3. Return all discs, papers, tapes and transcripts to Donna Chovanec, the *Researcher*, when I have completed transcribing all the items.

4. Erase all information regarding this research project that may be stored on the hard drive of any computer that I use upon completion of all transcriptions.

5. Return the transcripts in a timely manner.

6. Provide necessary revisions, if there are changes that need to be made to the transcripts, in a timely manner.

I, _____, the *Researcher*, agree to:

1. Compensate the transcriber at a rate of $_____ per hour.

2. Inform the *Transcriber* of any required revisions in a timely manner.

Transcriber

_____   _____   _____
(print name)   (signature)   (date)

Researcher

_____   _____   _____
(print name)   (signature)   (date)

242

Appendix 1-E: Agreement with Research Collaborators (if any)

I, _____, the *Research Collaborator*, agree to:

1. Keep all the information shared with me confidential by not discussing or sharing the written or verbal information with anyone.

2. Turn in all field notes to the Researcher immediately after each interview or observation session.

I, _____, the *Researcher*, agree to:

1. Provide an honourarium to the Research Collaborator in the amount of $_____.

2. Securely store all field notes provided by the Research Collaborator.

Research Collaborator

_____   _____   _____

(print name)   (signature)   (date)

Researcher

_____   _____   _____

(print name)   (signature)   (date)

243

Appendix 1-F: Research Protocol

Project Title: Learning Power from the Margins: Grassroots Women's Movements in Chile

Principle Researcher: Donna M. Chovanec

Research Collaborator: _____

Interviewee (NB: use code only): _____

Interview Date/Time: _____

Interview Location: _____

(A) In the first interview with grassroots participants, women are encouraged to tell stories relative to the broadly worded, open ended topics below. Probes are intended to encourage them to reveal more about the topic, to clarify the researcher's understanding of their experience and to delve further into the main research topic when a lead is provided by the interviewee. Questions for second interviews will be developed as the analysis of the first interviews unfolds.

1. **Demographic information:**

   Age: _____   Education: _____

   Marital status: _____   Number of children: _____

2. **Life as woman in this neighbourhood.**

   Probes: Ask about children, family, community, daily routines, hopes, fears.

3. **Activities in this neighbourhood.**

   Probes: Ask about how, why, when she participates; ask about purpose and processes of the activities. Delve more into activities that work toward change in the community.

4. **Learnings from participating in these activities.**

   Probes: Ask how and why certain aspects were considered "learnings".

5. **How learnings are used.**

   Probes: Ask in what ways she may think, feel or do differently; ask how and to whom the learnings have been shared or passed on; ask how she learned to do this work.

(B) The interview with staff of official organizations is semi-structured. Specific wording is yet to be determined. Questions will likely fall into the following categories.

1. **Description of the organization's work with grassroots women.**

2. **Review of the policies relative to grassroots women.**

3. **Changes in the work and the policies over time.**

4. **Constraints and opportunities relative to working with grassroots women.**

5. **Effects of work and policies on what women do, think, feel (learning dimension).**

244

Appendix 1-G: Overview of Research Project

Project Title: Learning Power from the Margins: Grassroots Women's Movements in Chile

Researcher: Donna M. Chovanec, University of Alberta (Canada)

Justification for the study

The study of social movements has captured the attention of many disciplines in the past decades. Within this literature, there is often implicit acknowledgement that social movements are sites of profound learning within civil society – sites where knowledge itself is contested and constructed, where identities and subjectivities (both individual and collective) are defined and redefined, where citizens are formed, and where oppression is named – ultimately, where people "learn to 'know' differently and to act differently" (Schild, 1994, p. 66).

These activities, so integral to social movements, are clearly educational or social learning processes. "Some of the most powerful learning occurs as people struggle against oppression, as they struggle to make sense of what is happening to them and to work out ways of doing something about it" (Foley, 1999, p. 1-2). However, "learning in such situations is largely informal and often incidental – it is tacit, embedded in action and is often not recognised as learning" (Foley, 1999, p. 66). It is the explicit intent of this study to expose the learning dimension of social movements.

Major research questions

- To explicate the methods (process and content) of social and political learning within a social movement,
- To analyze the transmission of knowledge and skill through social movement participation,
- To investigate the relationship of these processes to an active civil society, a strong democracy, and the alleviation of social problems,
- To determine how the methods and means are transformed or sustained as movements wax and wane,
- To uncover what alternatives exist when movements are quiescent.

The Chilean grassroots women's movement is particularly ideal for a study of this nature: first, because it was a strong and successful force in the transition to democracy and second, because it can be studied through three very different socio-political periods across generations. I propose to critically analyze social and political learning within the grassroots women's movements in the popular neighbourhoods in Arica, a small northern city in Chile. Through this means, I will also introduce a gendered analysis that incorporates multiple marginalities (poverty, isolation and indigenous identities).

Prior research

There has been considerable research on Latin American social movements in the transition to democracy, including a significant amount specific to women's movements. A review of this literature leaves no doubt that Latin American women played important and visible roles in anti-authoritarian movements, including human rights groups, survival organizations and feminist groups. A few have touched upon the learning

245

dimension of these activities. Verónica Schild (1994) particularly focused on the experience of "political learning" of women in the grassroots women's movements of Santiago. Valdés and Weinstein (1993) explicated what is now known as the "feminist curriculum" - a distinctly gendered political analysis embedded into the survival and human rights activities of the period. Sonia Alvarez (Alvarez, 1990) suggests that changing *consciousness* was an important subjective factor in the mobilization of women.

However, the return to democracy has been coupled with neoliberal political and economic policies that, according to critics, has effectively depoliticized and demobilized the grassroots movements, or at minimum, diminished their momentum.

There are notable gaps in recent literature, specifically: decreased attention to grassroots movements in recent years, absence of a perspective from outside the capital city of Santiago, and little attention to multiple marginalities (including indigenous reality).

Methodology

This study is inherently phenomenological. It is an exploration of the phenomenon of social and political learning in social movements – in all it's informal, obscured and partial ways. Ethnography is a suitable adjunct approach for this study because I will be studying a cultural group through the eyes of the people themselves. Furthermore, a feminist approach contributes a gendered analysis. Each of these approaches focuses on the meanings that people attribute to their experiences.

Methods:

Document analysis – mostly during first month in Chile focusing on literature from the region and policies that impact on the mobilization of grassroots women.

Participant observation – affiliation with *Casa de Encuentro de la Mujer*, a community-based women's non-governmental organization in the small city of Arica in the very north of Chile. During the first two months, I will focus on gathering contextual information, developing rapport with participants, consolidating the research approach, and establishing relevant community networks. Later, I will be more directly involved in meetings, workshops, and other events. The activities will be selected based on the purpose of the research and the opportunities available.

In-depth interviews – four months of multiple interviews with grassroots women. In my view, this is the most challenging aspect of this work for a number of reasons: another language, culture and class; attempting to uncover what is not immediately visible (i.e., learning) given the constraints of the first point. Consequently, I will try to engage the assistance of research collaborators both in reviewing transcripts and in conducting interviews.

Supplemental interviews – with staff of state, NGO or other official organizations.

Journals – field journal and reflective journal.

Analysis – concurrent with data collection; drawn from the notion of lived experience used by van Manen (1990) and Spradley's (1980) approach to language/meaning analysis. Feminist analysis contributes a critique of the relations of power embedded in gender, class, ethnic and other relationships of subordination (Mohanty, 1991). I anticipate using Microsoft Word for data management and qualitative analysis in an analytical process that enables me to cluster ideas, themes, concepts and/or interpretive discussions. Technically, it is a similar process to ethnography's domain analysis

246

(Spradley, 1979, 1980) and grounded theory's constant comparative method (Strauss & Corbin, 1990) but also draws on van Manen's (1990) method of building thematic statements.

Trustworthiness – second interviews, member checks, research collaborators, and multiple information sources.

References:

Alvarez, Sonia E. (1990). *Engendering democracy in Brazil.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Foley, Griff. (1999). *Learning in social action: A contribution to understanding informal education.* London: Zed Books.

Mohanty, Chandra Talpade. (1991). Under western eyes: Feminist scholarship and colonial discourses. In Chandra Talpade Mohanty, Ann Russo, & Lourdes Torres (Eds.), *Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism* (pp. 51–80). Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Petras, James & Vieux, Steve. (1994). The transition to authoritarian electoral regimes in Latin America. *Latin American Perspectives, 21*(4), 5-20.

Schild, Verónica. (1994). Recasting "popular" movements: Gender and political learning in neighborhood organizations in Chile. *Latin American Perspectives, 21*(2), 59–80.

Schild, Verónica. (1998). Market citizenship and the "new democracies": The ambiguous legacies of the contemporary Chilean women's movements. *Social Politics, 5*(2), 232-249.

Spradley, James P. (1979). *The ethnographic interview.* New York: Holt, Reinhart & Winston.

Spradley, James P. (1980). *Participant observation.* New York: Holt, Reinhart & Winston.

Strauss, Anselm & Corbin, Juliet. (1990). *Basics of qualitative research: Grounded theory procedures and techniques.* Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Valdés, Teresa & Weinstein, Marisa. (1993). *Mujeres que sueñan: Las organizaciones de pobladoras en Chile, 1973-1999.* Santiago de Chile: FLACSO-Chile.

van Manen, Max. (1990). *Researching lived experience: Human science for an action sensitive pedagogy.* London, ON: Althouse Press.

Wolcott, Harry F. (1999). *Ethnography: A way of seeing.* Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.

Appendices 2 – Spanish

248

Appendix 2-A: General Letter of Introduction

Proyecto de Investigación

El aprendizaje del poder desde los márgenes: *movimientos populares de mujeres en Chile*

Diciembre de 2001 a junio de 2002

Queridas amigas:

Mi nombre es Donna Chovanec. Soy estudiante de la Universidad de Alberta en Edmonton, Canadá, en el área de educación international e intercultural.

Los movimientos de mujeres es el enfoque de mis estudios. Por mis relaciones con personas latinoamericanas, particularmente de Chile, en Edmonton, me interesé en la situación de las mujeres en Chile, especialmente en los movimientos populares de mujeres. En las investigaciones existentes sobre los movimientos de mujeres en América latina, hay poco material escrito sobre las experencias de mujeres fuera de las capitales o ciudades principales de cada país. La experiencia de las mujeres en Arica, una ciudad pequeña, casi aislada, e inserta en una zona altamente militarizada, ofrece una perspectiva diferente a la de las mujeres en Santiago. Por esto, con el apoyo de la *Casa de Encuentro de la Mujer* (CEDEMU-Arica), estoy haciendo una investigación sobre los movimientos populares de las mujeres en Arica.

El propósito de este proyecto es aprender de las experiencias de mujeres que han sido activas en los movimientos de cambio durante los diferentes períodos socio-politicos de las últimas tres décadas. Me interesa principalmente entender cómo se lleva acabo el aprendizaje durante la participación en movimientos sociales, es decir, cómo y qué es lo que las mujeres aprenden y *cómo comparten este conocimiento con otras mujeres.*

Basada en esta información, escribiré una tesis doctoral para completar mis estudios en la Universidad de Alberta y, si puedo, publicaré artículos o expondré en congresos, siempre protegiendo la identidad de las mujeres y organizaciones que participen en el proyecto.

Actualmente, muchas organizaciones internacionales están interesadas en cómo los movimientos sociales y las organizaciones basadas en la comunidad contribuyen a fortalecer las democracias y a la solución de problemas sociales. Hay interés particular en el rol de las mujeres en este importante trabajo.

Por aproximadamente seis meses, viviré en la comunidad y visitaré varias actividades como talleres, reuniones, y eventos sociales. También, con la ayuda de una ayudante de investigación, entrevistaré a algunas mujeres de la comunidad y a otras mujeres de organizaciones oficiales.

Para obtener detalles sobre el proyecto o si tienes interés en participar en el estudio, contáctame al teléfono o correo electrónico que entrego al final. También puedes contactar a Berta Moreno, directora de CEDEMU (fono: 257015, cedemu@ctcreuna.cl). Tengo a disposición un resumen del proyecto para mayor información.

Gracias por darme la oportunidad de hacer mi estudio.

Donna Chovanec

Email: Teléfono: (58) 290232

Corréo electrónico: chovanec@ualberta.ca

249

Appendix 2-B: Letter for Interview Participants

Proyecto de Investigación

El aprendizaje del poder desde los márgenes: movimientos populares de mujeres en Chile

Febrero a junio de 2002

Querida participante:

Gracias por aceptar participar en mi estudio. Como ya sabes, soy estudiante de doctorado en Educación Internacional e Intercultural en la Universidad de Alberta en Canadá. Con el apoyo de la *Casa de Encuentro de la Mujer* (CEDEMU-Arica), estoy haciendo una investigación sobre los movimientos populares de las mujeres en Arica.

El propósito de este estudio es conocer tus experiencias como mujer que ha sido activa en los movimientos de cambio durante los diferentes períodos políticos de las últimas tres decadas. Me interesa principalmente entender cómo aprendiste a desenvolverte en este medio, qué aprendiste de tus experiencias y cómo compartes lo que aprendiste con otras mujeres. Basada en esta información, escribiré una tesis para completar mis estudios y, si puedo, publicaré artículos o expondré en congresos sobre el tema.

Tengo una ayudante de investigación quien me ayudará a realizar las entrevistas, Sandra Bravo de CEDEMU. Sandra tiene la preparación para realizar este tipo de trabajo y yo la he orientado para recoger la informacion pertinente a este estudio. Probablemente habrá dos sesiones de entrevistas contigo, cada una de hasta una hora y media en duración. La primera entrevista será una conversación abierta sobre tus experiencias. En la segunda entrevista, te haremos preguntas específicas para entender mejor lo que nos hayas dicho anteriormente.

Con tu permiso, las entrevistas serán grabadas y transcritas. Tu nombre u otra información que pueda identificarte no será incluida en ninguno de los materiales escritos ni en las grabaciones. La confidencialidad se mantendrá incluso en mis escritos o presentaciones futuras.

Las transcripciones y las grabaciones serán revisadas por mí, la transcriptora y, con tu permiso, los/las ayudantes (Sandra Bravo, Tito González, y otros que te comunicaría con anticipación para que me des tu opinión). Tienes el derecho de vetar a cualquiera de mis ayudantes.

Aunque estés de acuerdo en participar en este momento, tienes el derecho de retirarte o cambiar de opinión sobre tu participación en cualquier momento durante el estudio sin ninguna consecuencia.

Para obtener detalles sobre el proyecto, o para un resumen escrito, contáctame al teléfono o correo electrónico que entrego al pié de la carta. También puedes contactar a Berta Moreno, directora de CEDEMU (fono: 257015, cedemu@ctcreuna.cl).

Gracias nuevamente por darme la oportunidad de conocerte y realizar este estudio.

Donna Chovanec

Teléfono: (58) 290232

Corréo electrónico: chovanec@ualberta.ca

250

Appendix 2-C: Letter for Interviews with Staff of Official Organizations

Proyecto de Investigación

El aprendizaje del poder desde los márgenes: movimientos populares de mujeres en Chile

Diciembre de 2001 a junio de 2002

Queridas amigas:

Mi nombre es Donna Chovanec. Soy estudiante de la Universidad de Alberta en Edmonton, Canadá, en el área de educación international e intercultural. Con el apoyo de la *Casa de Encuentro de la Mujer* (CEDEMU-Arica), estoy haciendo una investigación sobre los movimientos populares de las mujeres en Arica.

Estoy interesada en tu punto de vista como representante de una organización que establece políticas y/u ofrece programas a las mujeres en Arica. Agradecería la oportunidad de entrevistarte por aproximadamente una hora y media.

Actualmente, muchas organizaciones internacionales están interesadas en cómo los movimientos sociales y las organizaciones basadas en la comunidad contribuyen a fortalecer las democracias y a la solución de problemas sociales. Hay interés particular en el rol de las mujeres en este importante trabajo.

El propósito de este proyecto es aprender de las experiencias de mujeres que han sido activas en los movimientos de cambio durante los diferentes períodos socio-politicos de las últimas tres décadas. Me interesa principalmente entender cómo y qué es lo que las mujeres aprenden y cómo comparten este conocimiento con otras mujeres. Basada en esta información, escribiré una tesis doctoral para completar mis estudios en la Universidad de Alberta y, si puedo, publicaré artículos o expondré en congresos.

Con tu permiso, las entrevistas serán grabadas y transcritas. Si prefieres, tu nombre u otra información que pueda identificarte no será incluída en ninguno de los materiales escritos ni en las grabaciones. La confidencialidad se mantendrá incluso en mis escritos o presentaciones futuras.

Aunque estés de acuerdo en participar en este momento, tienes el derecho de retirarte o cambiar de opinión sobre tu participación en cualquier momento durante el estudio sin ninguna consecuencia.

Para obtener detalles sobre el proyecto, o para un resumen escrito, contáctame al teléfono o correo electrónico que entrego al pié de la carta. Tengo a disposición un resumen del proyecto para mayor información.

Gracias por darme la oportunidad de conocerte y realizar este estudio.

Donna Chovanec

Teléfono: (58) 290232

Corréo electrónico: chovanec@ualberta.ca

251

Appendix 2-D: Agreement with Transcriber

Acuerdo con la Transcriptora

Yo,_____, la *Transcriptora*, afirmo que:

1. toda información que reciba, en cualquier forma, ya sea escrita, grabada, electrónica u otra, la mantendré en forma confidencial y no la compartiré con nadie.

2. mantendré la privacidad y la seguridad de toda la infomación que me sea entregada. Por ejemplo, mantendré los archivos electrónicos protegidos con clave secreta de acceso para mayor seguridad y los documentos y casetes bajo llave en un mueble adecuado.

3. devolveré todos los discos, documentos, casetes, transcripciones, etc. a Donna Chovanec, la *Investigadora*, una vez que el trabajo haya concluído o sea solicitado.

4. al final del proyecto, borraré toda la información que yo posea relacionada a este proyecto de investigación que esté archivada en cualquier computadora que haya usado.

5. escribiré y entregaré las transcripciones sin demoras.

6. efectuaré las correciones necesarias cuando la *Investigadora* las requiera.

Yo, **Donna Chovanec**, la *Investigadora*, afirmo que:

1. pagaré a la *Transcriptora* $_____ pesos por hora de grabación real (indicaré el tiempo en cada cinta).

2. solicitaré a la *Transcriptora* las correcciones necesarias de manera oportuna.

Transcriptora:

_____

(nombre)   (firma)   (fecha)

Investigadora"

_____

(nombre)   (firma)   (fecha)

252

Appendix 2-E: Agreement with Research Collaborators

Acuerdo con Ayudantes de Investigación

Yo, _____, la *Ayudante de Investigación*, afirmo que:

7. llevaré acabo a nombre de la *Investigadora* entrevistas, reuniones o sesiones de observación, además de las preparaciones y discusiones con la *Investigadora* relacionadas a dichas actividades, desde febrero a junio, 2002, para el proyecto de investigación llamado *El aprendizaje del poder desde los márgenes: movimientos populares de mujeres en Chile.*

8. participaré en sesiones de análisis con la *Investigadora* relacionadas a este proyecto.

9. toda información que reciba, ya sea hablada, escrita, grabada, electrónica o en cualquier forma, la mantendré confidencial y no la discutiré ni compartiré con nadie ojena a la investigación.

10. entregaré todas las notas a la *Investigadora* después de cada entrevista, reunión o sessión de observación. No guardaré ninguna nota ni datos relacionados con los participantes para mi uso personal.

Yo, **Donna Chovanec**, la *Investigadora*, afirmo que:

3. pagaré a la *Ayudante de Investigación* un honorario de $____ pesos por entrevista, reunión, o sesión de observatión. Este honorario incluye las preparaciones y discusiónes con la *Investigadora* relacionadas a dichas actividades.

4. pagaré a la *Ayudante de Investigación* un honorario de $____ pesos por cada sesión de análisis con la *Investigadora*.

5. mantendré la privacidad y la seguridad de toda la infomación que me sea entregada por la *Ayudante de Investigación*.

Ayudante de Investigación:

_____
(nombre)   (firma)   (fecha)

Investigadora:

_____
(nombre)   (firma)   (fecha)

253

Appendix 2-F: Research Protocol – Individual Interviews (final version)

GUIA de ENTREVISTAS y REUNIONES (MUJERES)

Titulo del proyecto:	El aprendizaje del poder desde los márgenes: movimientos populares de mujeres en Chile
Investigadora principal:	Donna M. Chovanec, Universidad de Alberta (Canadá)
Ayudante de investigación:	Sandra Bravo (CEDEMU-Arica); Tito González

Primera Entrevista

Seudónimo(s) de la(s) participante(s):_____

Fecha/hora de la entrevista:_____

Lugar de la entrevista:_____

1. **Al principio:**

   - hacer introducciónes y dar gracias
   - dar la "Carta para Participantes" a la(s) participante(s)
   - leer y/o revisar los contenidos con la(s) participante(s)
   - contestar preguntas sobre el proyecto (objetivos, métodos, etc.)
   - pedir permiso para grabar/transcribir (el cuarto párrafo de la "Carta para participantes") y anotar la respuesta

     Si ⬚

     No ⬚

   - obtener permiso explícito para involucrar a los ayudantes (el quinto párrafo de la "Carta para participantes") y anotar la respuesta

Si ⬚	anotar si algunos/as de los/las ayudantes son vetados/as
No ⬚	

2. **Datos demográficos** (pedirlos al principio o al final):

   Edad: _____

   Estado civil: _____

   Población: _____

   Nivel de educación: _____

   Ocupación: _____

   Sexo y edades de hijos/as: _____

254

3. **La forma de la entrevista** *(para el conocimiento de la entrevistadora)*:

En la primera entrevista, el rol principal de la entrevistadora es escuchar. El segundo rol es alentar a la participante a contar su historia de vida relacionada a los temas siguientes.

El propósito de las técnicas *siguientes es alentar a las mujeres a revelar más sobre el tema, clarificar lo que ya ha dicho y, cuando la participante mencione algún tema que se relacione con el tema del estudio, aprovechar la oportunidad para profundizar más en este tema.*

En vez de preguntas directas, introducir invitaciónes generales a contar su experiencia relacionada al tema, por ejemplo: "Cuéntanos ...", *o* "Podrías contar más sobre ... ?" *Pedir ejemplos durante toda la entrevista.*[1]

Por grupos, la entrevistadora tiene un rol adicional, lo de manejar el proceso grupal, por ejemplo: asegurarse de la inclusión de todas y poner atención al tiempo.

Mientras explorar los temas siguientes, tener en cuenta los objetivos principales de la investigación, los cuales son:

- Explicar los métodos (procesos y contenido) del aprendizaje social y político dentro de un movimiento social.

- Analizar la transmisión de conocimiento y habilidad a través de la participación en un movimiento social.

- Investigar la conexión entre la participación en movimientos sociales con una sociedad civil activa, con una democracia fuerte, y con la solución de los problemas sociales.

- Determinar como los métodos son transformados o mantenidos en los altibajos de los movimientos.

- Descubrir las alternativas que emergen cuando los movimientos están inactivos.

    En general, los temas principales son **la participación y el aprendizaje** en los movimientos.

4.1 La participación en movimientos de cambio

Objetivos: Determinar la forma y el contexto de su participación en movimientos de cambio, ya sea en su población o en su ciudad, a nivel nacional o internacional, o dentro de los partidos políticos, iglesias, sindicatos, u otras organizaciones y agrupaciones. Lograr información desde aproximadamente 1970 hasta el presente. Sin embargo, dejar la participante empezar en el período de su vida que ella quiera.

---

[1] Como está escrito en el proyecto "Interculturalidad y salud en el área andina (deciembre 2001): «La idea es que las mujeres construyan su discurso libremente. Que ellas seleccionen qué aspectos de su [vida] son los importantes. Las preguntas que se proponen a continuación, soló son una idea de qué aspectos nos interesan a nosotros y que podremos ir introduciendo en la conversación con las entrevistadas de ser necesario.»

255

Técnicas:

En grupos, mujeres responden en forma de la ronda (aprox. 10 minutos cada una).

Como anteriormente, dejar que la participante hable sobre cualquier aspecto del tema que le interese.

Además, cuando se presente la oportunidad, introducir preguntas relacionadas

a su motivación para participar,

a los tipos, el rango, y los propósitos de las actividades,

a las relaciones con otros movimientos,

al rol de las mujeres,

a la comparación entre el pasado y el presente.

Concentrarse más en aspectos relacionados a las mujeres.

También, buscar puntos que estén relacionados al tema de aprendizaje para explorar en o para avanzar al proximo tema.

4.2 El aprendizaje que nace de participar en movimientos

Obejtivos: Este es la escencia del estudio. Es posible que la participante no pueda identificar el aprendizaje claramente o que haya una inter-relación entre los temas.

Técnicas:

Introducir una pregunta general como "¿Qué aprendiste de tus experiencias en los movimientos?"

Pedir ejemplos especificos.

Recopilar ejemplos especificos que la participante haya dado en los temas anteriores, por ejemplo, "Me llamó la atención que repetiste el uso de la palabra ... ¿Qué significa esta palabra para ti?" o "Anteriormente, mencionaste .... ¿Podrias hablar más sobre esto?"

Hacer preguntas para determinar el significado e importancia del aprendizaje exaltado por la participante, por ejemplo: *"¿Por qué me diste este ejemplo? ¿Por qué se te ocurrió este ejemplo?"*

Alentar a la participante a pensar en o analizar cómo el aprendizaje es utilizado. Por ejemplo:

- *cómo aprendió a desenvolverse en el movimiento,*

- *de qué manera influyo en su pensar, sentir o actuar/hacer por participar en este movimiento,*

- *qué tipos de actividades formales realizaba, (por ejemplo, talleres),*

- *a quién y cómo comparte con otras mujeres lo que aprendió.*

Seudónimo(s) de la(s) participante(s):_____

Fecha/hora de la entrevista:_____

Lugar de la entrevista:_____

[Poder introducir estas temas/preguntas en las entrevistas grupales también.]

1. ¿Que falta de la primera entrevista? ¿Que pensó después de la primera entrevista? ¿Reflexiones? ¿Información adicional?

2. Explorar el dolor, las heridas, las secuelas, los costos u otros emociones. ¿Como sana? ¿Qué hace con los dolores, etc.?

3. De qué manera piensa que marcó a las mujeres de su gerneración?¿Comparación a otras generaciones? [Explorar la teoría que las mujeres jóvenes están más marcadas que las otras.]

4. Explorar la visión durante la dictadura. ¿Qué se pensaba para el término de ella? ¿Qué poyecciones había? [Profundizar todas las palabras que emergen, por ejemplo, "¿Qué significa democracia, socialista, etc.".]

5. Explorar la desilusión, la decepción, el engaño después de la dictadura. ¿De qué, por qué?

6. Explorar la visión, los sueños del futuro (personal y social). Explorar las acciones requiridas para realizar esta visión - ¿qué, cómo, quién, cuándo, por qué?

7. Si no habló del aprendizaje anteriormente, hacer la pregunta 4.2 de la primera entrevista. "¿Qué aprendiste de tus experiencias en los movimientos?" "¿A quién y cómo compartes con otras mujeres lo que aprendiste?" "Qué herencia dejas para tus hijos/as?"

8. Explorar el rol del gobierno, SERNAM – que no emergió en ninguna de las primeras entrevistas.

9. Profundizar y/o clarificar información de la transcripción de la primera entrevista.

Al fin de cada entrevista individual o grupal:

* hacer un resumen y dar gracias.

* por primeras entrevistas personales, establecer la forma de contacto para la segunda entrevista (o hacer una cita) y revisar el propósito y el método de la segunda entrevista.

* hacer una pequeña evaluación de la entrevista o grupo, especialmente si es un píloto.

Appendix 2-G: Research Protocol – Final Group Interviews

Titulo del proyecto: El aprendizaje del poder desde los márgenes: movimientos populares de mujeres en Chile

Investigadora principal: Donna M. Chovanec, Universidad de Alberta (Canadá)

Ayudante de investigación: Sandra Bravo (CEDEMU-Arica)

Fecha/hora del grupo:_____

Lugar del grupo:_____

Al principio:

- hacer introducciónes y dar gracias
- dar y leer la "Carta para Participantes" a las participantes y contestar preguntas

Introducción:

- contar la evolución del proyecto hasta la fecha

    o entrevistas personales y grupales (50 mujeres)

    o conducida con temas generales en que las mujeres contaron su experiencias/testimonias de los temas del estudio

    o de allí, surgieron algunas preguntas

- revisar la forma de este, el último grupo

    o mujeres de una variedad enorme de experiencias en movimientos

    o más estructurada para explorar directemente las preguntas que surgieron anteriormente

    o las participantes exploran, profundizan a cada pregunta

    o es importante tener en cuenta que la discusión está grabada y transcribida (hablar con volumen y uno por uno)

Las preguntas

1. Explorar el rol de las mujeres en los movimientos. ¿De que manera piensan que su participación en movimientos ha marcado a las mujeres?

2. Hacer la pregunta 4.2 de la primera entrevista. *"¿Qué aprendiste de tus experiencias en los movimientos?" "¿A quién y cómo compartes con otras mujeres lo que aprendiste?" "Qué herencia dejas para los hijos/hijas/jovenes?"*

3. Explorar la visión durante la dictadura. ¿Qué se pensaba para el término de ella? ¿Qué poyecciones habían? [Profundizar todas las palabras que surgen, por ejemplo, *"¿Qué significa democracia, socialista, etc."*.]

4. Explorar la desilusión, la decepción, el engaño después de la dictadura. ¿Por qué?

5. Explorar la visión, los sueños del futuro (socio-político). Explorar las acciones requiridas para realizar esta visión - ¿qué, cómo, quién, cuándo, por qué?

258

Appendix 2-H: Research Protocol – Organizational Interviews

Titulo del proyecto: El aprendizaje del poder desde los márgenes: movimientos populares de mujeres en Chile

Investigadora: Donna M. Chovanec, Universidad de Alberta (Canadá)

Organización: _____

Nombre(s)/Cargo(s) de la(s) participante(s):

_____

_____

Fecha/hora de la entrevista:_____

Lugar de la entrevista: _____

4. Al principio:

- hacer introducciónes y dar gracias
- dar la "Carta para Organizaciones" a la(s) participante(s)
- leer y/o revisar los contenidos con la(s) participante(s)
- contestar preguntas sobre el proyecto (objetivos, métodos, etc.)
- pedir permiso para grabar/transcribir y anotar la respuesta

    Si   ☐

    No   ☐

- preguntar si la participante prefiere usar seudónimo; anotar el seudónimo y obtener permiso explícito para involucrar a los ayudantes.

Si ☐	anotar si algunos/as de los/las ayudantes son vetados/as
No ☐	

1. Descripción del trabajo con mujeres que realiza esta organización.

   - Historia

   - Propósitos, objetivos

   - Leyes pertinentes

   - Estructura de la organización

   - Nivel del gobierno o relaciones con el gobierno

   - Fuentes de financiamento

   - Redes a las que pertenece

2. Descripción de las políticas o programas relacionados a las mujeres actualmente.

   - Pedir información escrita

3. Cambios a través del tiempo en las políticas o programas relacionados a las mujeres.

4. Restricciones, desafíos y oportunidades con respecto a trabajar con mujeres.

5. La forma en que las políticas y los programas influyen sobre la manera en que las mujeres piensan, sienten o actúan (dimensión del aprendizaje).

   - Basada en evaluaciones, opiniones, observaciones, testimonios

6. Otras preguntas:

   - relaciones con CEDEMU u otras organizaciones de mujeres

   - cómo funcciona MODEMU en el presente

   - el futuro de MODEMU

Appendix 2-I: Overview of Research Project

Resumen del Proyecto de Investigación

Título del proyecto: El aprendizaje del poder desde los márgenes: movimientos populares de mujeres en Chile

Investigadora: Donna M. Chovanec, Universidad de Alberta (Canadá)

Razón del estudio

El estudio de los movimientos sociales ha captado la atención de muchas disciplinas en las décadas pasadas. En esta area existe un entendido implícito de que los movimientos sociales son lugares de importante aprendizaje dentro de la sociedad civil – lugares donde el conocimiento mismo es desafiado y construído, donde las identidades y subjetividades (individuales y colectivas) son definidas y redefinidas, donde los/las ciudadanos/as se forman y donde la opresión es definida – finalmente, donde la gente «aprende 'a saber' y a actuar diferente» (Schild, 1994, p. 66).

Estas actividades integrales de los movimientos sociales son claramente procesos educacionales o de aprendizaje social. «Algunas de los aprendizajes más intensos ocurren cuando la gente lucha contra la opresión, cuando trata de encontrar sentido a la situación en que vive y trata de hacer algo al respecto» (Foley, 1999, p. 66). Es intención explicita de este estudio mostrar la dimensión del aprendizaje dentro de los movimientos sociales.

Objetivos de la investigación

*   Explicar los métodos (procesos y contenido) del aprendizaje social y político dentro de un movimiento social.

*   Analizar la transmisión de conocimiento y habilidad a través de la participación en un movimiento social.

*   Investigar la conexión entre la participación en movimientos sociales con una sociedad civil activa, con una democracia fuerte, y con la solución de los problemas sociales.

*   Determinar como los métodos son transformados o mantenidos en los altibajos de los movimientos.

*   Descubrir las alternativas que emergen cuando los movimientos están inactivos.

El movimiento popular de mujeres en Chile es particularmente ideal para este tipo de estudio. Primero porque fue una fuerza poderosa y exitosa en procurar el término de la dictadura y en el llamado período de transición a la democracia. Segundo, porque puede ser estudiado a través de tres períodos socio-políticos muy diferentes. Propongo analizar críticamente el aprendizaje social y político dentro de los movimientos populares de mujeres en las poblaciones de Arica, una ciudad pequeña del norte de Chile. De esta manera, también introduciré un análisis desde la perspectiva de género que incorpora marginalidades múltiples (pobreza, aislamiento e identidades indígenas).

Investigaciones previas

Han habido investigaciones considerables sobre movimientos sociales en América latina durante transición a la democracia, incluso una cantidad significativa ha sido dedicada a los movimientos de mujeres. Una revisión de esta literatura no deja duda de que las mujeres latinoamericanas jugaron roles importantes y visibles en los movimientos contra

las dictaduras, incluso grupos de derechos humanos, organizaciones de subsistencia y grupos feministas. Algunas excritoras sociales han aludido brevemente a la dimensión de aprendizaje de estas actividades. Verónica Schild (1994) destacó la experiencia de «aprendizaje político» de las mujeres en los movimientos poopulares de mujeres en Santiago. Valdés y Weinstein (1993) explicaron lo que es conocido como el «currículum feminista» - un análisis político desde una perspectiva de género inserto en las actividades de sobreviviencia y de derechos humanos. Sonia Alvarez (1990) sugiere que el cambio de conciencia fue un factor subjetivo importante en la movilización de las mujeres.

Sin embargo, la vuelta a la democracia ha ido unida a políticas económicas y sociales neoliberales que, según los críticos, han despolitizado y desmovilizado efectivamente los movimientos populares, o al menos, su ímpetu.

En Chile hay vacíos notables en la literature reciente, específicamente, la atención a los movimientos populares en los últimos años ha disminuído, también existe una clara ausencia de perspectiva exterior a Santiago, y se da poca atención a marginalidades múltiples (incluyendo a los pueblos indígenas).

Metodología

Las metodologías de este estudio (fenomenología, etnografía y feminista) se enfocan en el significado que la gente atribuye a sus propias experiencias. Además, un enfoque feminista contribuye al análisis desde una perspectiva de género. Estos métodos incluyen:

- análisis de documentos del país,

- observación participante de reuniones, talleres y otros eventos,

- entrevistas acuisiosas con mujeres activas en los movimientos,

- entrevistas suplementales semi-estructuradas con algunos empleados de servicios de estado, ONG y otras organizaciones oficiales.

Referencias

Alvarez, Sonia E. (1990). *Engendering democracy in Brazil.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Foley, Griff. (1999). *Learning in social action: A contribution to understanding informal education.* London: Zed Books.

Mohanty, Chandra Talpade. (1991). Under western eyes: Feminist scholarship and colonial discourses. In Chandra Talpade Mohanty, Ann Russo, & Lourdes Torres (Eds.), *Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism* (pp. 51–80). Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Schild, Verónica. (1994). Recasting "popular" movements: Gender and political learning in neighborhood organizations in Chile. *Latin American Perspectives, 21*(2), 59–80.

Valdés, Teresa & Weinstein, Marisa. (1993). *Mujeres que sueñan: Las organizaciones de pobladoras en Chile, 1973-1999.* Santiago de Chile: FLACSO-Chile.

APPENDIX 3 – WOMEN'S ORGANIZATIONS

CEDEMU

Name:	*Casa de Encuentro de la Mujer*
Translation:	Meeting Place for Women
Type:	NGO (Feminist)
Interviewees:	Berta Morena (Director), Sandra Bravo, Marianella, González, Lorena R os
Website:	http://www.mujerculturaysalud.cl/
Description:	CEDEMU was established in 1983 to combine the struggle for democracy with raising awareness of the social and political marginalization of women. The Centre's programs provide psycho-social assistance and education in Arica, with a focus on abused women and sexual health/reproductive rights. It is currently, working on a project related to indigenous women's health.

CINTRAS

Name:	*El Centro de Salud Mental y Derechos Humanos*
Translation:	Centre for Mental Health and Human Rights
Type:	NGO
Interviewee:	Marcelo R os (therapist, Arica)
Website	http://www.cintras.tie.clm/
Description:	CINTRAS was founded during the dictatorship. The Centre's multidisciplinary clinical team provides medical-psychological assistance to those who were victims of serious human rights violations (especially torture) during the military dictatorship. Through the training of professionals, it also works toward the prevention of torture and the promotion of human rights and democracy. CINTRAS has several offices in Chile.

FOSIS

Name:	*El Fondo de Solidaridad e Inversión Social*
Translation:	Solidarity and Social Investment Fund
Type:	Government (national)
Interviewee:	Not formally interviewed. A staff member was informally interviewed.
Website	http://www.fosis.cl/
Description:	FOSIS was established in 1990 primarily to contribute to the eradication of extreme poverty and unemployment. It reports to the Ministry of Planning and Cooperation. FOSIS provides funding for projects in high-risk communities in five areas: support for economic activity (e.g., micro-enterprises), social development, job certification, promoting participation, and re-insertion into the labour market. The Fund has offices throughout the country.

MEMCH

Name:	*El Movimiento Pro Emancipación de la Mujer Chilena*
Translation:	Movement for the Emancipation of Chilean Women
Type:	NGO (Feminist)
Interviewee:	Rosa Ferrada (Co-director)
Website:	http://www.memch.cl/
Description:	MEMCH was originally formed in 1935 to fight for women's rights, especially suffrage. Once the vote was won in 1969, the organization disappeared. It resurfaced in 1983 to unite women in the struggle against the dictatorship. MEMCH's mission is to promote equal rights and citizenship for women and to strengthen the women's movement in Chile through education in four areas: personal development, social development, labour training, and matriculation. MEMCH is situated in Santiago but has a long-standing connection with Arica.

MODEMU

Name:	*Movimiento por los Derechos de la Mujer*
Translation:	Movement for Women's Rights
Type:	NGO
Interviewee:	Not formally interviewed. Leaders were informally interviewed .
Description:	MODEMU was most active during 1980s in anti-dictatorship mobilizations. As part of the Communist Party, MODEMU works in partnership with other women's , social and political organizations in Arica to promote awareness and action on socio-political issues.

OCMF

Name:	*Oficina Comunal de la Mujer y la Familia*
Translation:	Community Office for Women and the Family
Type:	Government (municipal)
Interviewees:	Edith Rojas (Coordinator), Gloria and Verónica (psychologists)
Website:	None
Description:	Since 1995, this municipal office has provided education and prevention services to women and families in Arica, mainly through women's associations and community organizations. Another focus is providing direct services and prevention in the area of family violence.

PRODEMU

Name:	*Promoción y Desarrollo de la Mujer*
Translation:	Women's Promotion and Development
Type:	Government (national)
Interviewee:	Nellie Arriaran Covarrubias (Program Coordinator, Arica)
Website:	http://www.prodemu.cl/
Description:	PRODEMU was formed in 1990. It is a Foundation headed by the President's wife and funded by the Ministry of the Interior. Its services are primarily directed to women of limited means. The objectives are to improve the quality of women's lives through promoting the autonomy and participation of women, and encouraging personal, family and civic development. PROMEDU has offices throughout the country.

SERNAM

Name:	*Servicio Nacional de la Mujer*
Translation:	National Women's Service
Type:	Government (national)
Interviewee:	Not formally interviewed
Website:	http://www.sernam.cl/
Description:	SERNAM was created through legislation in 1990 to promote equality of opportunities between men and women. SERNAM is responsible for designing, proposing, and evaluating public policies related to equal opportunities in all aspects of life; defending and guaranteeing the full exercise of women's rights; and improving the quality of life for women and for families. Located within the Ministry of Planning and Cooperation, its mission is that all government departments and services within all levels of government consider the interests of women in their planning, proposals, statistics, and actions. Major foci are: economic autonomy; women's rights and participation in decision-making; women's and family well-being. The major policy document that directs this work is the Equal Opportunity Plan.

SERPAJ

Name:	*Servicio Para la Paz y la Justicia*
Translation:	Service for Peace and Justice
Type:	NGO
Interviewees:	Bernardita Araya (Director), and Marlena (Foster Care Program Coordinator)
Website:	http://www.geocities.com/serpaj_cl/serpaj-al.htm
Description:	SERPAJ emerged in various countries in Latin America after 1974. Inspired by the principles of active non-violence of Gandhi, Martin Luther King, and Helder Cámara, the Service advocates justice through the non-violent resolution of conflict. SERPAJ was constituted in ten regions in Chile in 1977. In Chile, it uses a popular education approach with marginalized groups in three program areas: poverty and development, the culture of peace and human rights, and democracy and civil society.

Note: There are considerably more women's organizations and networks in Arica and nationally. The organizations listed here are only those with whom I had direct contact during the course of the fieldwork.