

**University of Alberta**

The Influence of Media Portrayals of Chinese-Canadians on Group Members'  
Ethnic Identity and Self-Esteem

by

Christine Meeha Lee



A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research  
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Education  
in  
Counselling Psychology

Department of Educational Psychology

Edmonton, Alberta  
Fall 2006



Library and  
Archives Canada

Bibliothèque et  
Archives Canada

Published Heritage  
Branch

Direction du  
Patrimoine de l'édition

395 Wellington Street  
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4  
Canada

395, rue Wellington  
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4  
Canada

*Your file* *Votre référence*  
*ISBN: 978-0-494-22195-2*  
*Our file* *Notre référence*  
*ISBN: 978-0-494-22195-2*

**NOTICE:**

The author has granted a non-exclusive license allowing Library and Archives Canada to reproduce, publish, archive, preserve, conserve, communicate to the public by telecommunication or on the Internet, loan, distribute and sell theses worldwide, for commercial or non-commercial purposes, in microform, paper, electronic and/or any other formats.

The author retains copyright ownership and moral rights in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's permission.

**AVIS:**

L'auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque et Archives Canada de reproduire, publier, archiver, sauvegarder, conserver, transmettre au public par télécommunication ou par l'Internet, prêter, distribuer et vendre des thèses partout dans le monde, à des fins commerciales ou autres, sur support microforme, papier, électronique et/ou autres formats.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur et des droits moraux qui protègent cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

---

In compliance with the Canadian Privacy Act some supporting forms may have been removed from this thesis.

Conformément à la loi canadienne sur la protection de la vie privée, quelques formulaires secondaires ont été enlevés de cette thèse.

While these forms may be included in the document page count, their removal does not represent any loss of content from the thesis.

Bien que ces formulaires aient inclus dans la pagination, il n'y aura aucun contenu manquant.

  
**Canada**

## **Abstract**

This study examined whether ethnic stereotypes presented in the media impact the ethnic identity and self-esteem of Chinese-Canadian adults. Participants read an article from a magazine that portrayed Chinese-Canadians according to a positive stereotype (i.e., as a “model minority”) or a negative stereotype (i.e., as Asian gang members). Participants then completed the revised Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure and the Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale. Contrary to the study hypotheses, Independent Sample *t*-tests indicated that Chinese-Canadians exposed to the negative stereotype reported slightly higher levels of self-esteem than Chinese-Canadians exposed to the positive stereotype, and no difference in ethnic identity was found between the two groups. Overall, participants reported strong ethnic identification and current findings suggest that Chinese-Canadians are resilient and successful in developing strong, secure attachments to their ethnic group despite conflicting portrayals of their ethnic group in the media.

## **Acknowledgements**

Much gratitude goes to my supervisor, Dr. Farah Merali. Thank you for your insight, guidance and dedication.

To Dr. Bill Whelton, thank you for being a mentor in counselling and for being part of my examining committee. It is a pleasure to have you present at the start and finish of my Master's program.

To Dr. Maryanne Doherty, thank you for participating on my committee and for sharing your expertise.

To the girls, Rachel, Sheila, Aspen, Mariam, Sylvia, Sandra and Aneesa, thank you for all the memories. I am so fortunate to have had you as classmates, colleagues and cheerleaders. I hope we continue to learn and grow together for many years to come.

And most importantly, heart-filled thanks go to my fiancé Rolf, who has supported, encouraged and loved me unconditionally through it all. Thank you for believing in me... and for bringing home chocolate when I really needed it.

## Table of Contents

I	INTRODUCTION.....	1
	Chinese Representation in Canada.....	2
	The Chinese Culture.....	2
	Language.....	2
	Religion.....	3
	Confucianism.....	3
	Taoism.....	4
	Buddhism.....	4
	Traditional Values and Behaviours.....	4
	Collectivism.....	4
	Hierarchical Social Relationships.....	5
	Filial Piety.....	5
	Saving Face.....	6
	Education.....	6
	Self-Restraint.....	6
	History of Immigration.....	7
	Public Perceptions of Chinese Immigrants.....	9
	The Model Minority.....	9
	The Gang Member.....	11
	The Self-Image of Chinese-Canadians.....	12
	Ethnic Identity in the Media.....	13
	Purpose of the Study.....	14
	Overview of Thesis.....	14
II	LITERATURE REVIEW.....	16
	The Influence of the Mass Media.....	16
	Representation of Minority Groups in the Media.....	17
	Reasons for Using Stereotypes.....	20
	Shaping Public Opinions Towards Ethnic Minorities.....	22
	Stereotypes and In-Group Members: Theories of Potential Impacts.....	24
	Models of Ethnic Identity.....	25
	Self-Esteem Theories.....	25
	Social Identity Theory.....	27
	Stereotype Threat.....	28
	The Relevance of Ethnic Stereotypes for Chinese-Canadians.....	29
	Statement of the Problem.....	30
	Purpose and Study Hypotheses.....	31
III	METHOD.....	33
	Participants.....	33
	Recruitment.....	33
	Description of Participants.....	36
	Study Materials.....	37
	Consent Form.....	38

Magazine Articles.....	38
Article Evaluation Form.....	40
The Revised Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure.....	41
The Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale.....	43
The Suinn-Lew Asian Self-Identity Acculturation Scale.....	43
Demographic Questionnaire.....	45
Debriefing Form.....	46
Procedure.....	46
Ethnic Issues.....	49
Data Coding and Scoring.....	50
IV RESULTS.....	52
Data Screening.....	52
Descriptive Information.....	53
Acculturation Scores.....	53
Ethnic Identity Scores.....	55
Self-Esteem Scores.....	57
Evaluation of Stimulus Articles.....	57
Article on Model Minorities.....	57
Article on Asian Gangs.....	57
Comparison of Stimulus Articles.....	59
Analysis Results.....	60
Comparison of Condition Groups.....	60
The Effect of Stereotypes on Ethnic Identity.....	60
The Effect of Stereotypes on Self-Esteem.....	62
V DISCUSSION.....	64
The Effect of Ethnic Stereotypes on Ethnic Identity.....	64
The Effect of Ethnic Stereotypes on Self-Esteem.....	66
Possible Explanations of Study Findings.....	67
Ruling out Acculturation.....	67
The Model Minority as a Stereotype.....	67
Asian Gangs as Outgroups.....	68
Ethnic Identity as a Moderating Variable.....	70
Study Implications.....	71
Strengths and Limitations of the Study.....	73
Strengths.....	73
Limitations.....	74
Directions for Future Research.....	76
Conclusion.....	79
REFERENCES.....	81
APPENDIX A: Recruitment Poster.....	94
APPENDIX B: Study Description.....	95

APPENDIX C: Consent Form.....	96
APPENDIX D: Positive Stimulus Magazine Article.....	97
APPENDIX E: Negative Stimulus Magazine Article.....	99
APPENDIX F: Article Evaluation Form.....	102
APPENDIX G: Demographic Information Form.....	103
APPENDIX H: Debriefing Form.....	104

## List of Tables

Table 1	Participants' Endorsements on the SL-ASIA's Self-Statement of Identity....	54
Table 2	Participants' Open-ended Response to the MEIM-2's Self-Identified Ethnic Label.....	56
Table 3	Group Comparison of Participants' Magazine Article Evaluations.....	58
Table 4	Comparison of Participants' Demographic Characteristics by Condition Group.....	61



## CHAPTER I

### INTRODUCTION

In the last half century, Canadian society has become increasingly diverse in terms of its cultural and ethnic make-up. Currently, the largest visible minority group in Canada are the Chinese-Canadians (Statistics Canada, 2001). This ethnic group includes people who have ancestors of Chinese heritage and were either born in Canada, or who have immigrated to Canada from China, Hong Kong, Taiwan or Singapore, or other countries such as Vietnam, Malaysia, Thailand, Indonesia, Philippines and Cambodia (Citizenship and Immigration Canada, 2004; Li, 1998). Chinese-Canadians have a unique cultural value system that emphasizes collectivism, group solidarity, and a strong work ethic (Lee, 1996; Sue, 1998; Sue & Sue, 2003). In the public perception, two common stereotypes of Chinese-Canadians exist: the model minority stereotype and the Asian gang stereotype. The former stereotype assumes that all Chinese people are extremely intelligent, hardworking and successful (Sue & Sue; Walkey & Chung, 1990; Yee, 1992), while the latter stereotype suggests that Chinese people are involved in criminal activities that threaten public safety (Chin, 1990; Kleinknecht, 1996). No study has examined how these stereotypes impact group members' self-esteem and ethnic identity. The purpose of the current study is to compare the self-esteem and ethnic identity of Chinese-Canadians exposed to positive and negative media stereotypes of their own cultural group.

This chapter will provide background information on Chinese-Canadians, their reasons for immigration as well as cultural behaviours. The positive and negative

stereotypes of this group will also be further described along with research suggesting Chinese-Canadians' vulnerability to being adversely influenced by external messages.

### Chinese Representation in Canada

According to the 2001 census, almost 1.1 million people, or about 3.7% of Canada's population, indicated that they were of Chinese origin (Statistics Canada, 2001). This is a marked increase from 1991, when Chinese-Canadians made up 2.3% of the Canadian population (Statistics Canada). There are residents of Chinese heritage in every Canadian province and territory, with 47.4% of all Chinese-Canadians living in Ontario, 34.2% living in British Columbia, and 9.9% residing in Alberta (Statistics Canada). The Chinese-Canadian population continues to grow, given that in the last ten consecutive years the Chinese group has been the largest ethnic group to immigrate to Canada, averaging around 20% of all new immigrants (Citizenship and Immigration Canada, 2004).

### The Chinese Culture

#### *Language*

Although the Chinese share a common written language, the Chinese spoken language consists of numerous dialects which are considered to be mutually unintelligible (DeFrancis, 1990). Each dialect is a distinctive form of speech, and within each dialect, there are educational and regional variations. The variance between Chinese dialects is not simply a shift in accents, but rather, can be paralleled to the differences between Spanish and French (DeFrancis).

Chinese was ranked as the third most common mother tongue language in Canada, behind only the country's two official languages, English and French (Statistics

Canada, 2001). Among Chinese-Canadians, 40.5% speak Cantonese, 13.0% speak Mandarin, 0.4% speak Hakka and 46.1% speak other dialects of Chinese, such as Fukinese and Sawtowese (Hong & Ham, 2001; Statistics Canada). Generally, most descendants of Hong Kong and Southern China speak Cantonese, while Mandarin is more common among descendants from Taiwan and Northern China (Thompson, 1995).

### *Religion*

Most Chinese-Canadians are Buddhists, Christians or atheists (Thompson, 1995); however, historically, the main religions among the Chinese have been Confucianism, Buddhism and Taoism. These three philosophies have heavily influenced Asian worldviews and many traditional Chinese values and behaviours are grounded in their commonalities, such as interpersonal harmony, moderation and respect for nature (Hong & Ham, 2001). Each of these religions will be briefly described.

*Confucianism.* Confucianism emphasizes the importance of interdependence and moral behaviour in maintaining a healthy and functional society. According to Confucius, social harmony is dependent on the hierarchical structure of key relationships, namely, those between parent and child, husband and wife, elder sibling and junior sibling, elder friend and junior friend, and leader and subject (Smith, 1991). Key virtues such as inner integrity, righteousness, propriety, loyalty, altruism and human-heartedness also serve to maintain social harmony (Hong & Ham, 2001; Smith). In Confucian teachings, the self is defined in terms of relational contexts, particularly familial relationships (Miller & Yang, 1997). Obedience, devotion, humility, empathy and mutual responsibility are also highly valued (Hong & Ham). Lastly, Confucianism

considers education as a means to achieving a happy and successful life, which thereby reflects respect towards one's parents and teachers (Miller & Yang).

*Taoism.* Taoist teachings promotes a life of *wu wei*, which may be interpreted to mean “doing nothing”, inaction, passivity or simplicity (Hong & Ham, 2001). Taoists prefer to avoid conflicts, and instead, place faith in nature. They believe that there are universal energies that control all the changes within the universe, and that all people and things need a balance between *ying* and *yang*, or the positive and negative and complementary forces within nature (Smith, 1991). For instance, Taoists believe that physical and mental health can be achieved by balancing the *Chi*, which is the energy within one's body. As such, Taoism's emphasis is on living in balance with nature and avoiding conflicts.

*Buddhism.* In Buddhism, the basic tenets are that life is suffering and desire is the cause of suffering (Smith, 1991). Buddhism teaches that people can overcome desire by gaining control over one's mind, and that people should strive for a modest, simple life that is free of aggression or assertiveness (Hong & Ham, 2001). Another Buddhist belief is karma, which is the belief that a soul continues to be reborn after death, and that the soul will either be rewarded or punished based on the previous life (Braun & Nicols, 1997). Thus, followers of Buddhism strive to live a life of generosity, morality and wisdom in order to earn a higher level of rebirth.

#### *Traditional Values and Behaviours*

*Collectivism.* While Western society promotes independence and individualism, the Chinese promote a collectivistic culture that values interdependence and conformity. In the Chinese tradition, individuals are expected to act in the best interests of the group,

particularly the family. Individual needs, independence and autonomy are considered to be signs of selfishness and are greatly discouraged (Sue & Sue, 2003). The Chinese are taught to be considerate of others and to behave according to external moral criteria, rather than internal needs or desires. This collectivistic orientation reflects the Confucian value of interrelatedness and the Buddhist goal of transcending desires.

*Hierarchical social relationships.* In contrast to the dominant Western society's emphasis on equality, social behaviour in Chinese culture is strongly influenced by hierarchical power relationships and respect for authority. Social power and status are designated according to age, gender and occupational roles. For instance, men and elders are given higher status and are expected to be authoritarian decision-makers, while the women and children are expected to be respectful and obedient (Fang & Wark, 1998; Sue & Sue, 2003).

*Filial piety.* Consistent with Confucianism, the family unit is considered the core of Chinese society and as such, filial piety is strongly emphasized. Chinese children are expected to be loyal, gracious and respectful to their elders and are expected to live with their parents until they get married. Even when married, primary allegiance is to the parents, and it is expected that adult children care for their aging parents (Lee, 1996; Sue & Sue, 2003). In traditional Chinese families, elderly parents will live with their married son and wife and will remain involved in their adult child's life, such as deciding their child's education, career and mate selection (Sue & Sue). Extended family members and deceased ancestors are often included in celebrations, rituals and when making significant life decisions, emphasizing the collectivist worldview (Sue & Sue).

*Saving face.* Based on their emphasis on interconnectedness, the Chinese believe that one's own actions are reflective of others. Chinese children are taught to be self-conscious of their behaviours and to avoid shaming and disgracing the family name (Sue & Sue, 2003). For example, in a culture where honour, obligation and hard work are valued, it is believed that the nuclear and extended family will lose respect and status in the community if a family member is disobedient or fails to gain academic or occupational success (Sue, 1998). An individual's duty is to preserve the family reputation, or "save face", and to act to advance their family, not themselves. As a result, Chinese people are often sensitive to shame and how they are judged and evaluated by others (Wang & Ollendick, 2001).

*Education.* One way of bringing honour and respect to the family is by attaining educational and occupational success. Both Confucianism and Buddhism consider education to be characteristic of a virtuous person and an attribute that can help advance others within the family and the community (Hong & Ham, 2001). Furthermore, due to the hierarchical societal structure, those with greater education and prestigious occupations earn greater social power and status.

*Self-restraint.* While Western societies promote emotional expression, in the Chinese culture, only young children are allowed to openly exhibit emotions (Sue, 1998). Older children and adults are expected to display self-restraint, modesty and inhibition, and feelings or thoughts that might disrupt family or social harmony should be kept to themselves (Sue; Lee, Lei & Sue, 2001). Because freely expressing emotions is considered to be a sign of immaturity and personal weakness, many Chinese express emotions indirectly. Instead of holding hands, hugging, or verbally expressing love,

affection is communicated by attending to the physical and material needs of the loved ones (Fang & Wark, 1998). However, in Western society, these subtle, indirect forms of communication may be considered to be signs of passivity or unassertiveness, while emotional self-restraint may be perceived as being too serious (Sue & Sue, 2003).

### History of Immigration

In the late 1800s and early 1900s, many Chinese people left China due to poverty, famine, political rebellions and the poor economy (Lai, 2003; Li, 1998). The first influx of Chinese immigrants to Canada consisted of male labourers from rural China who were recruited during the gold rush in the 1860s and during the construction of the Canadian Pacific Railway in the 1880s. Initially, the Chinese were welcomed in Canada because they were considered to be inexpensive and hard workers. However, once the railway was completed and the labour shortage disappeared, the Chinese were viewed as an economic threat and anti-Chinese sentiments among Canadians grew (Lai). To discourage Chinese immigration to Canada, the Canadian government imposed a \$50 head tax in 1885, which increased to \$100 in 1900, and \$500 in 1903 (Lai).

Due to public outcries against Chinese immigration and fears of the “Yellow Peril”, the Canadian government instituted the Chinese Exclusion Act in 1923, which prevented Chinese people from entering Canada. Although the Chinese made up less than 1% of the national population at that time, the Chinese were the target of institutional racism (Li, 1998). Chinese immigrants were segregated from the rest of society, living in poor, crowded, self-contained areas of cities. These racially defined spaces were coined “Chinatowns” and their needs were often ignored by the municipal and provincial governments (Lai, 2003). Canadian-born Chinese were denied Canadian

citizenship and were barred from practicing law, medicine and other professions during the interwar years. Thus, in the early to mid-twentieth century, Chinese-Canadians were denied many civil rights and experienced legalized discrimination (Li). The discriminatory policies and practices seemed to stem from positive stereotypes about Chinese people as exemplary workers that would threaten the livelihood and employability of the Canadian-born. Clearly, these stereotypes had an adverse impact on Chinese-Canadians' living conditions in this historical period and led to racial segregation in Chinatowns.

During this time, the majority of the Chinese people in Canada were male bachelors. Initially, the discriminatory head tax laws made it difficult for Chinese men to sponsor their wives and children, and then the Exclusion Act deemed it impossible. Without the possibility of bringing or starting a family in Canada, many Chinese immigrants left Canada to return to China. From 1931 to 1951, the population of Chinese people in Canada quickly declined and second-generation Chinese-Canadians were rare (Li, 1998).

The Chinese Exclusion Act was abolished in 1947, but immigration continued to favour Caucasians until 1967, when the immigration act was changed and ethnic origin was no longer an admission criterion (Lai, 2003). The 1967 immigration policy was racially nondiscriminatory and was based on merit, such as education and occupational skill. As a result, a second wave of Chinese immigration occurred during the 1970s and 1980s. With the new immigration policy and the anticipated handover of Hong Kong to mainland China, Canada saw an influx of immigrants from Hong Kong and Taiwan. Compared to the first wave of immigrants who were primarily uneducated men from



rural China, the second wave consisted of men and women who were primarily professionals, investors or entrepreneurs (Lai; Li, 1998). Many new immigrants were educated and wealthy, and tended to settle in middle-class suburban neighbourhoods, rather than poverty-stricken Chinatowns. Nevertheless, there were also new Chinese immigrants from lower socioeconomic backgrounds. By the late 1990s, immigration from Hong Kong and Taiwan declined, while the number of immigrants from mainland China rapidly increased (Citizenship and Immigration Canada, 2004). Presumably, immigrants originating from communist China had different political, economic and educational experiences than earlier immigrants who came from Hong Kong, a former British colony. Thus, in the last 150 years, the profile of new Chinese immigrants entering Canada has changed in terms of lifestyle, education and socio-economic status, but for many, their acceptance into Canadian society continues to be tainted by discrimination based on both positive and negative stereotypes.

#### Public Perceptions of Chinese Immigrants

There are two primary stereotypes of Chinese-Canadians that pervade their public image. One of the stereotypes may be perceived as being positive, while the other is considered to be negative. The following section further describes these two stereotypes,

##### *The Model Minority*

Chinese-Canadians are often perceived as being “model minorities” who achieve academic, occupational and familial success (Sue & Sue, 2003). The Chinese are considered to be diligent, industrious, ambitious, and hard working, thereby allowing them to attain upward social mobility compared to other ethnic minority groups (Walkey & Chung, 1990; Wong, 2006; Yee, 1992). They are described as being smart, studious

and skilled in math and sciences, and are often labeled “superachievers”, “nerds” or “whiz kids” due to their high academic achievements (Kao, 2000). Compared to the average population means, a greater proportion of Chinese-Canadians and Chinese-Americans obtain post-secondary education and tend to earn higher median incomes (Sue & Sue; Wong; Yee). Yet Chinese people whose academic and occupational performance conforms to the model minority stereotype have encountered numerous barriers to advancement in the workplace due to the perception that they may out-perform members of the dominant cultural group (Wong). This trend appears to mirror the historical treatment of Chinese-Canadians.

Although some Chinese-Canadians are high achievers, there is significant variability in academic ability and career achievement among members of this group, as with all cultural groups. For instance, in a study by Toupin and Son (1991) Asian-American college students were matched with non-Asian-American groups on the basis of gender, type of high school attended, SAT scores and parent education. The study found that, on average, Asian-American students had lower GPAs, were more likely to be placed on academic probation and were more likely to withdraw from courses due to medical reasons. Compared to their non-Asian matches, Asian-American students were more likely to have a smaller course-load in a given semester, and were more likely to take over four years to complete their program. Thus, these results contradict the common notion that Asian-Americans are super-achievers in academics. Furthermore, those who do not thrive academically may experience lower self-esteem due to expectations (Sue, 1998).

Another component of the model minority stereotype is the perception of Chinese people being a quiet minority group who do not actively challenge the status quo, but instead work hard to fit into existing societal expectations (Lee, 1996). Unlike other minority groups who advocate for societal changes or depend on government support programs, the Chinese are perceived as being passive, tolerant, self-disciplined and motivated (Kao, 2000; Yee, 1992). Despite prejudice and discrimination, it is believed that the Chinese have been able to attain remarkable accomplishments through effort and determination (Lee). In addition, their strong family ties and low divorce rate are consistent with the family ideals of the dominant culture, further exemplifying their success in Canada (Walkey & Chung, 1996).

#### *The Gang Member*

In contrast to the model minority stereotype, Chinese-Canadians are also viewed as sly and mischievous criminals involved in protection rackets, gambling operations, loansharking, alien smuggling, money laundering, and drug trafficking (Chin, 1990; Kleinknecht, 1996). Street gangs and organized crime have troubled American and Canadian Chinatowns since the 1960s. Although the number of Chinese criminal organizations has drastically increased and their activities are no longer confined to the inner city, the majority of Chinese-Canadians are not involved in gang activities (Chin; Wang, 2000). For the small proportion that are involved in crime, Asian crime activities are diverse and include prostitution rings, money counterfeiting, insurance fraud, commodity fraud, weapon smuggling and human organs smuggling (Wang). Innocent by-standers have been injured or killed during public assaults, and reports of home invasions, kidnappings and extortion also feed into public fears (Kleinknecht; McCurrie,

1999). Asian gangs are perceived by the public to exhibit a higher degree of fearlessness, boldness and ruthlessness compared to other juvenile gangs (Hall, 2001). As such, Chinese immigrants are often perceived as being responsible for vicious criminal acts that threaten public safety and pose a danger to Canadian society.

### The Self-Image of Chinese-Canadians

The Chinese culture values conformity and places importance on status and acceptance within the community (Sue, 1998; Sue & Sue, 2003). The desire to gain social acceptance and “save face” suggests that Chinese-Canadians may be sensitive to how they are perceived by members of the dominant Canadian culture. Some public perceptions of Chinese immigrants seem to be conflicting and positive or negative portrayals of their group may impact Chinese individuals’ attempts to foster a positive sense of self. The model minority and the gang member stereotypes likely impact how Chinese immigrants identify with their cultural group, as well as their personal esteem as group members. The stereotypes confine the Chinese to particular roles or identities and suggest that they will habitually be perceived as “different” from the rest of Canadian society. Chinese-Canadians, as well as other minority ethnic groups, are faced with the challenging task of integrating into the Canadian culture while also retaining their unique cultural values and behaviours. The Multiculturalism Policy of Canada promotes accommodation over assimilation and encourages immigrants to “preserve, enhance and share their cultural heritage” (Fleras & Elliott, 1992, p. 284). Nevertheless, some Chinese-Canadians may feel obligated to downplay their cultural heritage in order to gain social acceptance, a value inherent within the Chinese culture. When they are perceived

positively, it is possible that their cultural identity may be reinforced and that they may experience a positive self-image.

### Ethnic Identity and the Media

Ethnic identity is a person's understanding and acceptance of being a member of an ethnic or cultural group (Phinney, 2003). It includes how a person connects and identifies with one's ethnic group and the feelings attached to that membership. Ethnic identity has been found to be positively correlated with psychological well-being (Beiser & Hou, 2006; Phinney & Kohatsu, 1997). For example, individuals who have not explored the meaning of their ethnicity tend to report feelings of confusion and inadequacy, while individuals who have a secure sense of belonging to their ethnic group have a more positive self-concept and higher self-esteem (Roberts et al., 1999).

In models of ethnic identity, it is believed that a person's ethnic identity is influenced by whether one's ethnic group is viewed favorably or unfavorably by others (Phinney, 2003). The mass media plays a significant role in shaping how a minority group is perceived (Mahtani, 2001). The media often perpetuates social stereotypes and it also helps to define the meanings and images associated with a certain ethnic group (Paek & Shah, 2003). The media's use of stereotypes and sometimes inaccurate portrayals of minority groups sends a message that the dominant culture is not interested in understanding other ethnic groups, and may leave minorities feeling like second-class citizens (Bullock & Jafri, 2000).

Existing research in the area of media impact and immigration has focused on how different media portrayals of cultural group characteristics affect public views of immigrants (Esses, Dovidio, Jackson & Armstrong, 2001; Stephan, Renfro, Esses,

Stephan & Martin, 2005). Findings from these studies suggest that negative images of group characteristics and the group's impact on the host society adversely influence public attitudes towards immigrants (Esses et al.). No study has examined how media portrayals with differing impressions (negative or positive) of immigrant groups affect ingroup members' ethnic identity and self-esteem.

#### Purpose of the Study

The purpose of the present study is to examine whether ethnic stereotypes presented by the media affect the self-esteem and ethnic identity of members of the portrayed group. More specifically, the study will compare the ethnic identity and self-esteem of Chinese-Canadians exposed to either the model minority stereotype or Asian gang stereotype in published magazine articles. The research findings will provide a better understanding of the factors that influence people's identification with their cultural group and will aid in developing counselling interventions to facilitate positive ethnic identification and positive self-image, despite stereotypical external messages.

#### Overview of Thesis

The following chapter, Chapter II, will provide a literature review that describes how public perceptions of immigrants are affected by varying media portrayals. The chapter will also explore existing theories, such as social identity theory and stereotype threat theory, which help explain how the media may impact ingroup members. The literature review will highlight the gaps in existing research and will conclude with a statement of the problem and the study hypotheses. The method chapter, Chapter III, will describe the participant recruitment strategies, the demographic profile of the sample, the stimulus magazine articles used in this study, and the instruments used to assess

participants' ethnic identity, acculturation, and self-esteem. The research procedure will also be discussed. The results chapter, Chapter IV, will describe the participant group in terms of acculturation, ethnic identity, self-esteem and their evaluation of the stimulus articles. The analysis of the results will be outlined and the chapter will conclude with an evaluation of the study hypotheses. The final chapter, the Discussion, will place the study results in the context of existing literature on Chinese-Canadians and discuss the implications for promoting positive ethnic identity development and well-being in light of differing external influences on their sense of self.

## CHAPTER II

### LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter will review the literature concerning the representation of ethnic minorities in the mass media and the prevalence of ethnic stereotyping. The concept of stereotyping will be briefly reviewed and its impact on cognitive processes and public opinions will be discussed. Next, this chapter will review theories that address how stereotypes may affect in-group members and highlight factors found to be related to self-esteem and ethnic identity. This will be followed by a discussion about how ethnic stereotypes may be of particular concern for Chinese-Canadians. The chapter will conclude with a statement of the problem and the research questions and hypotheses framing this study.

#### The Influence of the Mass Media

The mass media is a major resource for receiving and disseminating information and impacts not only what we think about, but also how we think (Croteau & Hoynes, 2000). The media selects what details of information will be included or omitted and through its subjective interpretation of events, the media assigns meaning to the world and shapes our socially-constructed reality (Liu, 2006). The images and messages conveyed through television, newspapers, movies and magazines are incorporated into our schemas of ourselves and of others, and partially define what is considered to be normal, socially desirable and acceptable (Fleras & Kunz, 2001). As such, the media has the ability to create, validate and perpetuate false beliefs about social groups, but also has the power to challenge and dispute such thinking.



The media can have a powerful impact on the public because many consumers rarely recognize or challenge stereotyped or inaccurate portrayals (Li-Vollimer, 2002; Taylor & Stern, 1997). According to the cultivation theory (Gerbner, Gross, Morgan & Signorielli, 1994), messages that are repetitively presented through the media are perceived to reflect reality and are converted into “common sense”. Others argue against the cultivation theory and assert that people are not indoctrinated by the media, but rather, represent an “active audience” that independently interprets information to form their own meanings (Croteau & Hoynes, 2000). For instance, Liu (2006) found that exposure to mainstream newspapers only had a weak effect on subjective social reality and acculturation, while direct interactions with ingroup and outgroup members had a greater impact on creating social meanings. Nevertheless, the mass media’s role in shaping our cultural thought has been well documented (Croteau & Hoynes, 2000; Fleras, 1994; Fleras & Kunz, 2001; Mahtani, 2001). As stated by Bullock and Jafri (2000), “the media plays a significant role in suggesting to the nation who ‘we’ are, who belongs, and who does not. The media not only shapes personal and national identity, but is the lens through which reality is perceived” (p. 35).

#### Representation of Minority Groups in the Media

Since our first-hand experience with various cultural groups is often limited, the information provided through the media influences how we formulate ideas about a cultural group’s physical, psychological, social, cultural and economic characteristics (Graves, 1999). Early research on minorities in the media focused on the exclusion of ethnic minorities in popular media (Barcus, 1983; Dominick & Greenberg, 1970; Doolittle & Pepper, 1975; Kassarjian, 1969). More recent literature reviews reveal that

although Canadian mainstream media has made efforts to include cultural diversity, visible minorities continue to be underrepresented, sometimes leaving members of the absent group feeling invisible, unimportant, inconsequential and powerless (Fleras, 1994; Fleras & Kunz, 2001; Graves, 1999; Mahtani, 2001). While research has shown that the frequency of racial representation in the mass media has increased over the decades, the nature of the portrayals continues to play into cultural stereotypes (Grey, 1995; Matabane & Merritt, 1996; Mastro & Greenberg, 2000).

Li-Vollimer (2002) conducted a content analysis of children's television commercials and found that, compared to the general population make-up, Asians, Hispanics and Aboriginals were underrepresented, while Whites and African-Americans were over-represented. The study also found that ethnic minority characters were type-casted into stereotypical roles. Asian characters were represented most often in advertisements for technological products, African Americans tended to be portrayed as athletes, and 97% of Hispanic characters were in restaurant advertisements. Furthermore, ethnic minorities were more likely to be cast as labourers or service workers, while Caucasians were more likely to be characters with superpowers or with prestigious positions and to receive speaking roles, which is a symbol of social power.

In a study that examined the representation of Asian-Americans during prime-time television commercials, Taylor and Stern (1997) found that Asians were present in over eight percent of the advertisements, which is over double their proportion in the general population. However, despite their higher representation, Asian Americans tended to be placed in minor or background roles more often than Hispanic Americans and African Americans. In addition, the advertisements featuring Asian Americans

appeared to perpetuate the model minority stereotype. Asians characters were more likely to appear in commercials that highlighted work life and seldom reflected them having a social life. When an Asian American was featured with another character, the inter-ethnic relationship was primarily business-based. Asians Americans were featured as co-workers more often than all the other cultural groups in this study. These results suggest that although Asian Americans are frequently presented in the media, they tend to be pigeon-holed into one-dimensional roles.

Similar to television, magazines also tend to rely on ethnic stereotypes. In a content analysis of mainstream news magazines, Paek and Shah (2003) found that Asian Americans were predominantly portrayed as professionals, technicians and business people, particularly in relation to computers. About half of the advertisements featuring Asians were in the workplace, while Blacks and Hispanics were situated in more diverse locations such as the workplace, outdoors and leisure spots. These findings were consistent with previous studies that examined advertisements in differing types of magazines (Taylor, Lee and Stern, 1995; Taylor & Lee, 1994). Overall, research consistently finds that advertisements perpetuate ethnic stereotypes by portraying Asians as highly educated, affluent and hard working, African Americans as social and athletic, and Hispanics as family-oriented and relatively poor (Paek & Shah; Taylor & Stern; Taylor et al.).

Stereotyping of ethnic minorities has been evident in advertisements as well as newspapers and news broadcasts. Although news reports are assumed to be objective and reliable portrayals of events, they tend to attach racial affiliation to societal problems such as crime, drugs and violence (Fleras & Kunz, 2001; Poornanada, 1998; Vergeer,

Lubbers & Scheepers, 2000). Ethnic minorities tend to be characterized as different, problematic, deviant and threatening, with the implication that immigration is problematic (Fleras, 1994; Vergeer et al. 2000). For instance, Gilens (1996) examined stories on poverty in U.S. national news magazines and the photographs that accompanied the stories. The study found that of all the individuals featured in the photographs, 62% were African American, which is more than twice the actual number of African Americans living in poverty. Similarly, a review of Winnipeg's two major newspapers found that articles tended to unnecessarily mention an individual's ethnicity when reporting stories on social problems such as crime (Social Planning Council of Winnipeg, 1996). Bullock and Jafri (2000) also found biased media portrayals of Muslim women in Canada, presenting them as foreigners who are regressive and who have beliefs and values that are incompatible with the dominant culture. Therefore, previous research suggests that the media tends to present one-sided images of immigrants, often perpetuating stereotypes and focusing on how ethnic minorities differ or conflict with the dominant culture.

#### Reasons for Using Stereotypes

The images and messages in the mass media are considered to be an expression of the dominant group's expectations regarding minority members' roles, status and contributions to society (Fleras, 1994). Some argue that the dominant culture tends to portray their own group favorably and minority groups negatively as a way to maintain their power in society (Vergeer et al., 2000). By promoting the perception of ethnic threat, the media promotes the dominant group's "preferred meanings" and legitimizes

and maintains the dominant cultural and social order by placing Whites as the most powerful and privileged (Li-Vollimer, 2002).

However, the media also uses stereotypes because they assist in conveying messages rapidly. Stereotypes are defined as cognitive schemas or cognitive structures that facilitate information processing by categorizing stimuli into social categories (Taylor, 1981). For instance, when a perceiver identifies an individual as belonging to a certain group, the cognitive schemas associated with this group are activated and applied, providing the perceiver with information on which to base attitudes and judgments (Ashmore & Del Boca, 1981). The activation of stereotypes tends to occur unconsciously (Abreu, Ramirez, Kim & Haddy, 2003) and they allow people to make sense of the world quickly and with minimal mental effort. However, stereotypes by their very nature, are rigid, exaggerated and oversimplified beliefs. When stereotypes are used, people tend to apply overgeneralized concepts to the whole group, and therefore, fail to acknowledge individual differences. It is unfair to assume that all members of a group would present certain characteristics and behave in certain ways (Wong & Halgin, 2006). By reducing people to a few simple characteristics, one is likely to make erroneous judgments and evaluations. Stereotypes ignore personal uniqueness and instead pigeon hole people into certain roles and expectations which can fuel prejudice and discrimination. Furthermore, those who are the targets of stereotyping often feel misunderstood and powerless, as assumptions are imposed upon them rather than being able to be self-defined (Mok, 1998).

### Shaping Public Opinions Towards Ethnic Minorities

Research on minority representation in the media has predominantly focused on content analyses, rather than examining the effects of media portrayals. Theorists and researchers agree that the media has an influential role in shaping public attitudes towards immigrants and immigration (Anastasio, Rose & Chapman, 1999; Esses et al., 2001; Pan & Kosicki, 1996; Stephan et al., 2005; Tan, Fujioka & Tan, 2000). Public attitudes have direct effects on ethnic minorities in terms of inter-ethnic interactions as well as indirect effects on public policies such as impacting the support or opposition of immigration legislation and how the nation defines its collective identity. The following section reviews experimental studies that examine the media's role in shaping the public's opinion on immigrants in North America.

Esses and her colleagues conducted a series of studies in which they manipulated the content of an editorial on immigration (Esses, Jackson & Armstrong, 1998; Esses, Jackson, Nolan & Armstrong, 1999; Jackson & Esses, 2000). Undergraduate students at the University of Western Ontario and the University of Manitoba were presented with an editorial describing a fictitious group of immigrants who were finding success within either (a) a neutral job market, or (b) a difficult job market. The latter article made suggestions that immigrants were competing with non-immigrants for similar resources. Even though the article described the immigrant group as hard-working and family-oriented, which are consistent with Canadian values, results show that participants in the second group were more likely to express negative attitudes towards the fictional ethnic group, and were less supportive of their immigration to Canada. The study also found that participants' unfavourable opinions about the fictional group generalized to other

immigrant groups, as participants in the experimental group expressed negative attitudes towards immigrants and immigration to Canada in general. In addition, compared to the control group, they were less likely to support efforts that would help empower immigrants. These findings are consistent with other studies which have found that media portrayals have a direct impact on people's willingness to support public assistance programs for immigrants (Gilens, 1996; Tan et al., 2000).

Similar findings were obtained among American university students who were told they were reading a reprinted newspaper article on a group of immigrants (Stephan et al., 2005). There were four condition groups which varied in their depiction of immigrants from Rwanda. For the control group, only neutral information was presented, whereas the three experimental groups depicted immigrants as posing a financial burden for non-immigrants, a threat to American ideology, or both. Results found that manipulating the content of the newspaper article significantly influenced participants' attitudes towards immigration. In particular, the article that portrayed immigrants to pose both realistic and symbolic threats lead to the expression of the most negative attitudes. These findings were evident among Caucasian participants as well as participants who were ethnic minorities, suggesting that the opinions of immigrants are as susceptible to the media's influence as non-immigrants.

In another study, Cho and colleagues (2006) demonstrated how the media can impact public attitudes towards an ethnic group and immigration policies by manipulating the way information was framed. Participants were provided a news article that described Arabs as either immigrants or citizens, and as extremists or moderates. Results showed that those who read an article describing Arabs as immigrants and

extremists took less time to formulate impressions and were more likely to express lower tolerance towards minorities' freedom of expression, and greater opposition towards immigration and immigrant empowerment. These findings suggest that subtle choices in words can alter the social judgments made about a minority group.

However, while it appears that the media can induce negative attitudes towards immigrants, the media can also be used to promote positive attitudes. Research has found that the media can minimize the illusion of intergroup competition by redefining group membership and emphasizing a common identity. For instance, by presenting editorials that framed immigrants as part of the ingroup rather than an outgroup, study participants were more likely to express more positive attitudes towards immigrants (Esses et al., 2001). Similarly, Graves (1999) found that media programs can be used to foster positive attitudes towards immigrants and can model positive inter-ethnic interactions among children. Thus, it has been shown that the media can positively or negatively impact the public's attitudes towards specific immigrant groups, towards immigrants and immigration in general, and the public's level of support for assistance programs.

#### Stereotypes and In-group Members: Theories of Potential Impacts

Focus group sessions have revealed that many ethnic minorities are concerned about the one-sided portrayals of their ethnic groups in the media (Bullock & Jaffri, 2000; Leung, 2004). For instance, many Chinese-Canadians believed the media's report of SARS in Toronto in 2003 was sensationalized and racialized. As a result of seemingly inaccurate portrayals of their immigrant group, many Chinese-Canadians felt they were subjected to discrimination and alienation and that the portrayals threatened their sense of belonging (Leung). Presently, there are no experimental studies that have examined the



impact of ethnic stereotypes on in-group members. However, there are a number of theories which predict that external messages impact the identity and well-being of target group members, just as they impact public perceptions of immigrants.

### *Models of Ethnic Identity*

Ethnic identity formation is considered to be a dynamic process that involves exploration and self-evaluation (Phinney, 1990). Although there are a number of proposed ethnic identity models (e.g., Atkinson, Morten & Sue, 1993; Cross, 1991; Marcia, 1980; Phinney, 1990, Sue & Sue, 1990), they are similar in suggesting that the opinions and attitudes of the dominant culture influence how minority members view their group membership. For instance, the Racial/Cultural Identity Development Model (Sue & Sue, 1990) outlines five stages that describe how minority people resolve the conflicts between the dominant culture and their ethnic culture, as well as the perceived status of their group within society. Through each stage, an individual's attitudes and behaviours towards oneself, other minorities and the dominant group will depend on the presence of positive and negative messages about each of these social groups. The model proposes that external messages are internalized and that negative messages can induce feelings of inferiority and self-depreciation.

### *Self-Esteem Theories*

If ethnic identity is believed to be vulnerable to external messages, it is also likely that global self-esteem would be vulnerable. Self-esteem is considered to reflect an evaluative and affective component of the self and to be a universal need among humans (Rosenberg, 1981). However, the construct of self-esteem appears to differ in individualistic and collectivistic cultures. Western societies tend to adopt an independent

construal of the self which emphasizes self-reliance and the uniqueness and autonomy of the self (Markus & Kitayama, 1991). For instance, Rosenberg (1979) viewed self-esteem as reflecting the level of congruence between the extant (private) self, the desired self and the presenting self. The desired self is perceived to include the idealized notion of what one ought to be or can be, as well as moral values and norms (Wang & Ollendick, 2001).

In contrast, collectivistic societies adopt an interdependent construal of the self, emphasizing the interconnectedness of people and the role that others play in developing one's self-concept. To maintain interpersonal relationships, collectivistic cultures, including the Chinese culture, emphasize self-effacement in which individuals are encouraged to present themselves as inferior to others (Wang & Ollendick, 2001). According to Confucius thought, self-concept is comprised of the "big" self, or the communal identity, and the "small" self or the individual (Wang & Ollendick).

Regardless of the cultural differences between the conceptualizations of self-esteem, both worldviews believe that external messages will affect how one feels about oneself. In the Western framework, stereotypes can directly affect the desired self by shaping one's beliefs of what a person has the potential to achieve or how a person "ought" to be (Wang & Ollendick, 2001). Similarly, the collectivistic approach to self-esteem is also vulnerable to external messages since the evaluation of one's family and other group members will affect one's own self-appraisal. Individuals with a collectivistic orientation place high value the opinions of others and are concerned with presenting a positive-self image, and therefore are likely to be sensitive to the how they are perceived by others (Wang & Ollendick).

### *Social Identity Theory*

According to social identity theory (Tajfel, 1981; Tajfel & Turner, 1986), positive self-esteem is contingent on social identity. Social identity is considered to be “the part of an individual’s self-concept which derives from his knowledge of his membership of a social group, together with the value and emotional significance attached to that membership” (p. 255, Tajfel, 1981). Social identity theory proposes that group identities are formed through social categorizations and ingroup and outgroup comparisons. To facilitate cognitive processing, humans tend to separate and categorize stimuli based on their similarities and dissimilarities. As such, people are often categorized into social groups based on observable distinctions such as gender, ethnicity, economic status and nationality. However, membership lines can be also drawn based on more permeable categorizations, such as clubs or teams. Because people seek feelings of affirmation, people tend to compare their ingroup with other social groups, and it is the outcome of this comparison which affects self-esteem and their level of identification with their group.

When one group is portrayed more positively compared to another group, social identity theory predicts that members of the higher-status group will view their group more favorably and will feel more connected to their group because their membership provides feelings of affirmation. In addition, members of the more prestigious group will be more likely to exaggerate ingroup and outgroup differences in order to enhance group distinctiveness. As such, membership to a group that is perceived positively would allow members to have a more positive social identity and self-esteem and to perceive their group as more dissimilar than the compared outgroup (Tajfel, 1981).

In contrast, when negative comparisons are made, it is believed that members of the lower status group will attempt to disengage from the group, either physically or psychologically, and attempt to gain membership with the higher status group (Tajfel, 1981). However, people who are categorized based on salient physical characteristics, such as race or ethnicity, may find it difficult to pass as members of the dominant or higher status group. When a group is viewed in an unfavorable light, negative messages may be internalized by members of that group, resulting in a denial of their social membership and lower self-regard. However, some members may react to unfavorable group comparisons by reframing the inferior characteristics or emphasizing the uniqueness of one's own group (Phinney, 1990).

#### *Stereotype Threat*

While social identity theory focuses on the influence of group membership, stereotype threat theory focuses on the impact of negative stereotypes. Proposed by Steele and Aronson (Steele, 1997; Steele & Aronson, 1995), stereotype threat is believed to occur when a person is apprehensive of confirming the negative expectations that other people hold about his or her group. Stereotype threat has been found to affect members of any group that are faced with negative stereotypes, whether it be based on gender, age, ethnicity or sexual orientation (Crozier & Claire, 1998; Levy, 1996; Steele & Aronson, 1995; Spencer, Steele & Quinn, 1999). The theory asserts that negative stereotypes are perceived to be threatening because people consider their group memberships to be self-relevant and self-evaluative. Evidence suggests that individuals who feel more affiliated with their group or the stereotyped domain may experience more pressure to disconfirm the stereotype and may be more likely to be affected by stereotype threat (Aronson et al.,

1999). Furthermore, stereotype threat has been found to have a direct impact on behaviour, such as underperforming on cognitive tasks or avoiding stereotype threat situations (Aronson, et al.; Pinel, 1990). Research suggests that even occasional exposure to stereotypes can elicit stereotype threat, while chronic exposure to negative stereotypes has been found to have long-term effects (Aronson et al.). Having to continually be cautious of confirming such stereotypes can be emotionally and cognitively draining, and it is proposed that chronic exposure to negative images of their group leads to “disidentification” or psychological disengagement, in that members minimize the importance or significance of that group membership as part of their self-concept (Steele, 1997). By redefining the self-concept, disidentification is considered to be a protective reaction and an attempt to sustain a positive self-image. To date, stereotype threat research has focused primarily on negative stereotypes. However, it has also been suggested that the presence of positive stereotypes can induce stereotype threat because individuals may be afraid of failing to confirm the positive stereotype (Cheryan & Bodenhauser, 2000).

#### The Relevance of Ethnic Stereotypes for Chinese-Canadians

Many key features of the Chinese culture suggest that this ethnic group would be vulnerable to the effects of ethnic stereotypes. Their collectivistic orientation means that the self is defined and shaped within a relational network. Therefore, because a person’s self-concept encompasses other members of the family or ethnic group, Chinese people are more sensitive to how other members of their group are evaluated (Wang & Ollendick, 2001). At the same time, Chinese people place great emphasis on “saving face” and gaining social acceptance, and thus, are concerned with how they are perceived

by others. Many Chinese people will assume personal responsibility for maintaining a positive public image of their group. As such, they are likely to be more sensitive to the opinions of others and tend to be more attuned to public attitudes towards their cultural group (Wang & Ollendick). In addition, although the media tends to perpetuate inaccurate ethnic stereotypes, Chinese people are taught to avoid conflict and therefore may be unwilling to challenge popular misconceptions concerning their group, which may have emotional or psychological ramifications. As discussed previously, two popular portrayals of Chinese-Canadians are those of the model minority and the criminal gang member. The model minority stereotype depicts Chinese-Canadians as intelligent, hard-working and ambitious (Sue & Sue, 2003), while the gang member stereotype depicts Chinese-Canadians as ruthless, conniving and troublesome (Hall, 2001). However, it is unclear how these particular stereotypes affect Chinese-Canadians.

#### Statement of the Problem

Chinese-Canadians make up the largest visible minority group in Canada (Statistics Canada, 2001). The Chinese culture differs from the dominant Canadian culture in terms of its values, beliefs and traditions, meaning that Chinese-Canadians are faced with the challenge of integrating seemingly incompatible cultures. To add to their challenge, Chinese-Canadians are presented with conflicting stereotypes of their ethnic group. They are often stereotyped as model minorities who are intelligent, hard working and passive, or as gang members who engage in criminal activities and are a nuisance to society. These stereotypes have been, and continue to be, perpetuated by the mass media (Fleras & Kunz, 2001; Mahtani, 2001). The media plays an influential role in shaping attitudes and beliefs about ethnic groups and immigration in general (Esses et al., 2001).

Ethnic minority groups are often under-represented or mis-represented in the media, and while previous research has focused on how stereotypes affect the dominant culture's view of other ethnic groups, the psychological effects of ethnic stereotypes on minority group members is a relatively unexplored area. Anecdotal accounts suggest that cultural stereotyping by the media leaves ethnic minorities feeling undervalued and disregarded as citizens (Bullock & Jafri, 2000; Leung, 2004), while various theories predict that such messages can impact self-esteem and ethnic identification.

#### Purpose and Study Hypotheses

The purpose of the current study was to examine how the media's use of ethnic stereotypes impacts members of the group being portrayed. Specifically, the study aimed to examine how the ethnic identity and self-esteem of Chinese-Canadian adults is affected by exposure to the model minority stereotype or the Asian gang stereotype in a real magazine article. This study addressed the following questions:

- (1) Does ethnic stereotyping in the media have an effect on Chinese Canadians' ethnic identity?
- (2) Does ethnic stereotyping in the media have an effect on Chinese Canadians' self-esteem?

It was hypothesized that Chinese participants exposed to the model minority stereotype would report stronger ethnic identification and higher self-esteem than those exposed to the Asian gang stereotype, consistent with the predictions of social identity theory and stereotype threat theory. Social identity theory suggests that the way a group is perceived in relation to other groups will affect one's self-evaluation and attachment to the ethnic

group, whereas stereotype threat theory suggests that negative images of one's group promote disengagement from the group or weakened ethnic identity.

The next chapter outlines the study design used to address these research questions. Participant selection and participant demographic characteristics will be described. A description of the stimulus magazine articles and measures will be presented, and will be followed by the study procedures.



## CHAPTER III

### METHOD

The purpose of the current study is to examine whether ethnic stereotypes presented by the media affect the self-esteem and ethnic identity of Chinese-Canadian adults. The present chapter discusses the methodology of the study. First, the criteria for participation in this study and the recruitment process are described. This is followed by a complete description of the study materials and measures, including the magazine articles, measures to assess self-esteem, ethnic identity and acculturation, and the informed consent and debriefing forms. Finally, the procedure of the study is outlined.

#### Participants

##### *Recruitment*

Participants were recruited from the University of Alberta campus, which is located in Edmonton, Alberta. To take part in the study, individuals needed to: (a) be 18 years old or older, (b) have both parents of Chinese heritage, (c) have resided in Canada for a minimum of one year, and (d) feel confident reading and writing in English. The self-esteem, ethnic identity and acculturation measures that were used in this study have been validated among English-speaking Chinese samples. When participants who speak English as a second language make the choice to participate in research that is conducted in English based on their self-appraised English proficiency and literacy, analysis of their survey responses reveal high reliability and validity of the research instruments (Dunnigan, McNall & Mortimer, 1993). As such, prospective participants were informed that this study was being conducted in English, and only those who identified themselves as being comfortable reading and writing in English were invited to participate. Statistics

show that a large proportion of Chinese immigrants entering Canada have a working knowledge of English (Statistics Canada, 2001). Also, given that participants were recruited from the university setting, they would have to pass an English proficiency test to be admitted as students (e.g., TOEFL). The criterion relating to comfort and confidence in reading and writing English was assessed through a 7-point Likert-scale item soliciting their self-evaluation of their English ability (*poor to excellent*). Only participants who rated themselves 5 out of 7 points or higher were included in the data analysis. Overall, existing studies show that immigrants' assessments of their English language skills approximate the judgments of trained ESL assessors (Shaw & Cheung, 2001). The minimum length of residence in Canada of one year was set as a criterion for participation in this study to allow Chinese-Canadians time to adapt once they enter Canada.

There were three approaches to recruiting participants. First, study advertisements were placed in a variety of campus buildings (see Appendix A). Second, the principal investigator contacted campus student organizations that had a high proportion of Chinese students (e.g., Chinese Students Club, Chinese Students and Scholars Association), as well as student groups that may be interested in the research topic (e.g., Undergraduate Psychology Association, Sociology Undergraduate Association, Graduate Students Association). The researcher emailed the student leader of the organization and asked permission to speak at one of their general meetings or for the student leader to send an email to group members. All the student groups that were contacted offered to forward an email to their members, as most of the organizations did not have general member meetings. The third approach was through personal referrals.

Pernice (1994) pointed out that personal contact can facilitate immigrants' involvement in research through snowball sampling among community members. She found that study participants often refer family members or friends to partake in the research process. In this study, participants were told that they were free to invite any family members or friends to contact the researcher if they were interested in being involved in this study.

The research poster and email communicated that Chinese adults were needed to provide their opinions on how their ethnic group is presented in the media. The posters and emails indicated that participants would be paid \$10 for their participation and invited interested individuals to contact the researcher through telephone or email. Individuals who contacted the researcher were given a study description that outlined the purpose and nature of the study, the inclusion criteria, and the dates and times that research sessions were being held (see Appendix B). Prospective participants were told that they would be asked to read a real published magazine article about Chinese-Canadians and then they would be asked to complete some surveys about their opinion of the article, their cultural identity and their feelings about themselves as group members. Individuals who expressed an interest in participating in the study made an appointment to come to the University of Alberta to read the magazine article and complete the questionnaires.

The study description indicated that the study's purpose was to examine how people of Chinese heritage evaluate magazine articles about their own cultural group, and whether attachment to their cultural heritage and feelings about themselves as a Chinese person influence how they view the articles. This description of the study involved a

minor deception in which the independent and dependent variables of this study were reversed to prevent demand characteristics from influencing study results. The study actually assessed whether the type of media portrayal of the Chinese culture affected participants' self-esteem and ethnic identity. Research has found that cultural groups that value conformity and interdependence have a strong tendency to present themselves favourably and to respond to social expectations (Matsumoto, 2000). If participants knew that they were being assigned either a positive or negative media portrayal of their cultural group, they might discover the researcher's expectation of finding a difference in ethnic identity and self-esteem among the condition groups, and could respond accordingly.

#### *Description of Participants*

A total of 108 Chinese adults participated in the study. Fifteen participants were excluded from the final data set because they did not meet the inclusion criteria of being in Canada for at least one year, and having a minimum self-appraised English proficiency of five on a 7-point scale. Of the remaining 93 participants, 44 (47.31%) were born in Canada, 48 (51.61%) were born in Asia (e.g., China, Hong Kong, Malaysia, Vietnam, Brunei, Taiwan, Singapore) and one participant was born in Europe. Among those participants who immigrated to Canada, their length of residence ranged from one to 23 years, with a mean of 7.99 years ( $SD = 6.86$ ). On average, participants were 17.52 years old ( $SD = 10.43$ ) when they came to Canada.

Most of the participants (68.82%,  $n = 64$ ) were Canadian citizens, while 7.53% ( $n = 7$ ) were landed Canadian immigrants, 20.43% ( $n = 19$ ) were in Canada on student visas, and 2.15% ( $n = 2$ ) selected "other". Chinese was the mother tongue for the

majority of the participants (87.10%,  $n = 81$ ), and English was predominantly the second language learned (79.57%,  $n = 74$ ). On a 7-point Likert scale, where higher scores indicated better proficiency, participants rated their proficiency of English to be 6.19 ( $SD = 0.80$ ) on average.

The sample consisted of 54 women (58.06%) and 39 men (41.94%). Participant age ranged from 18 to 51, with a mean age of 24.13 years ( $SD = 5.69$ ). Most participants (76.34%,  $n = 71$ ) reported they were single, 21.51% ( $n = 20$ ) were married, and 2.15% ( $n = 2$ ) were separated or divorced. The sample primarily consisted of post-secondary students (55.91%,  $n = 52$ ). The other participants were non-students who were either unemployed (6.45%,  $n = 6$ ), or were employed part-time (23.66%,  $n = 22$ ) or full-time (13.98%,  $n = 13$ ). In terms of education level, 44.04% ( $n = 41$ ) reported to have had some university or college education, 16.13% ( $n = 15$ ) had completed an undergraduate or college degree, 19.36% ( $n = 18$ ) had some graduate level training, and 12.90% ( $n = 12$ ) had completed a graduate degree. In addition, one participant (1.08%) had trade or technical training and six participants (6.45%) had high school level education.

#### Study Materials

All participants were given a package which included a magazine article and five questionnaires. The questionnaires included an article evaluation form, the Revised Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure (Roberts, Phinney, Masse, Roberts & Romero, 1999), the Rosenberg Self-Esteem scale (Rosenberg, 1989), the Suinn-Lew Asian Self-Identity Acculturation Scale (Suinn, Rikard-Figueroa, Lew & Vigil, 1987) and a demographic questionnaire created by the researcher. These materials and their psychometric properties are described below. The informed consent form that was

signed before partaking in the study is described first, and the debriefing form that participants received upon the conclusion of the study is described last.

#### *Consent Form*

The participant consent form discussed the purpose of the study, the nature of the tasks involved, the time commitment, and issues concerning confidentiality, anonymity and participant rights (see Appendix C). As mentioned previously, the independent and dependent variables of the study were reversed in communicating the purpose of the study to participants to minimize response bias. However, all the study variables were specified in the consent form and all instruments used in the study were accurately explained. As a follow up to the study, participants were provided with a debriefing form that correctly explained the purpose of the study and provided a rationale for the minor deception. The debriefing form will be further described at the end of the study materials section.

#### *Magazine Articles*

To locate magazine articles depicting contrasting stereotypes of the Chinese ethnic group, a literature search of Canadian and American publications was conducted using the Academic Search Premier and the Readers' Guide Abstracts electronic databases. The specific search terms entered into these databases were: Chinese, Chinese-Canadian, Chinese-American, Asian, Asian-Canadian, Asian-American, stereotypes, model minority, achievement, crime, gang, and violence. Out of the articles that came out from these searches, the following criteria were considered in the selection of a positive media portrayal: (a) description of specific positive personal characteristics or behaviours of Chinese people, (b) description of positive impacts on society of group

participation and contributions, and (c) generalizations made about these characteristics and impacts across group members. Factors considered in the selection of a negative media portrayal were: (a) description of specific negative personal characteristics or behaviours of Chinese people, (b) description of negative impacts on society of group participation and contributions, and (c) generalizations made about these characteristics and impacts across group members. Articles that explicitly focused on cultural stereotypes of the Chinese group or that acknowledged the stereotypical way in which the public perceives the group were not considered for this study. The researcher specifically attempted to identify articles that gave a one-sided view of Chinese culture and people without challenging its accuracy or generalization to the group as a whole.

The article that was selected as the “positive” portrayal of the Chinese culture played into the model minority stereotype (see Appendix D). The article written by Butterfield (1987) depicted Chinese individuals as being intelligent, hard working, successful people who contribute positively to society through their educational achievements. It also asserted that discipline, academic achievement and filial piety are common values among Chinese people. Although the article was written for a North American context, a few wording changes were made to the article to imply a Canadian context in hopes of facilitating the participants’ ability to identify with the article.

The contrasting negative article discussed the involvement of Chinese-Canadians in criminal gangs (see Appendix E). The article “Terror in the Streets” implied that Chinese-Canadians were responsible for drug trafficking, running illegal gaming houses and instigating violence in Canada’s major cities (Kaihla & Burke, 1992). The article highlighted the difficulty police have in controlling and capturing these criminal gangs

and how their ruthlessness affects innocent citizens. This article not only portrayed the Chinese group in a negative way, it also implied that Chinese-Canadians are a threat to public safety.

Both articles were re-typed and presented in a similar format. The positive article consisted of 1230 words and 87 lines, and the negative article consisted of 1348 words and 92 lines, so they were fairly comparable in terms of length. Both articles presented a one-sided perspective of Chinese-Canadians and played on cultural stereotypes. While the article on academic achievement suggested that Chinese immigrants contribute to society, the article on criminal gangs implied that Chinese immigrants create societal concerns.

#### *Article Evaluation Form*

The article evaluation form consisted of ten statements to be rated on a 5-point scale, ranging from *strongly agree* to *strongly disagree* (see Appendix F). Of the ten items, three were negatively worded in order to encourage participants to read and consider each item carefully rather than providing blanket responses across all items. The article evaluation form served two purposes. First, it assisted with the minor deception used in the study by making it appear that the focus of the study was to determine how people of Chinese descent evaluate media messages, allowing the true independent variables to remain undisclosed. For example, participants were asked for their overall impression of the article (“The article was interesting”, “I would want to read more about this topic”). Secondly, the evaluation form included questions on the accuracy of the information presented in the article, its generalization to all group members, the way in which the Chinese people and culture were described (positive or



negative), and their impact on society (positive or negative). This served as a built-in pilot study that assessed whether participants viewed the articles to be presenting positive or negative stereotypical impressions of Chinese individuals and their impact on society.

#### *The Revised Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure*

The Revised Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure (MEIM-2, Roberts et al., 1999) assesses a person's sense of belonging and commitment to one's ethnic group, as well as an individual's sense of ethnic pride. The instrument consists of twelve items that are rated on a 4-point Likert scale, ranging from *strongly disagree* to *strongly agree*. The items comprise two subscales. The Affirmation, Belonging and Commitment subscale contains seven items on commitment, pride and positive feelings toward the individual's group. The Ethnic Identity Search subscale is composed of five items that reflect the extent to which individuals explore, learn about and become involved in their ethnic group. Subscale scores are the calculated means of the respective items. The total MEIM-2 score is derived by calculating the mean score from all twelve items. If data are missing from an item, the score is calculated from the remaining items. Total scores can range from 1 to 4, where low scores are indicative of weak ethnic identification and high scores suggest a strong, positive ethnic identity characterized by a greater sense of personal security and commitment to one's ethnic group (Phinney, 1992; Roberts et al.).

In addition to the 12 items that make up the MEIM-2 scores, there are three items that provide descriptive information on the participant's ethnicity and their parents' ethnicity, and one open-ended question for participants to list their ethnic self-identification. The distinction between ethnic self-identification and ethnicity is that "ethnic self-identification" is considered a more subjective self-label, whereas "ethnicity"

is considered to be an objective group membership that is determined by parental ethnic heritage. According to Phinney (1992):

“Self-identification as a member of an ethnic group is a necessary precondition for ethnic identity and should be explicitly assessed in order to avoid confounding ethnic identity with ethnicity” (p. 158)

The ethnic self-identification item reads: “In terms of ethnic group, I consider myself to be \_\_\_\_\_.” The items addressing ethnicity ask the participants to choose the best option to represent their own and their parents’ status in terms of group identification and membership: Chinese, Chinese-Canadian, Asian, Asian-Canadian, Oriental, Oriental-Canadian, Canadian and “other”. These items force participants to choose from the presented options rather than allowing for their own unique ways of identifying themselves.

Asian-American college students were included in the original MEIM normative sample. Cronbach’s alpha for the revised MEIM ranges from 0.81 to 0.89 across ethnic groups (Roberts et al., 1999), suggesting that the instrument has high internal consistency. Among North American born Chinese individuals and Chinese immigrant adolescents, internal consistency was found to be 0.84. Factor analysis results identified the two subscales as tapping into distinct dimensions of ethnic identity (Roberts et al.), providing evidence of the MEIM-2’s construct validity. Furthermore, the discriminant validity of the revised MEIM has been supported by findings of positive correlations between MEIM-2 scores and scores on measures of psychological well-being, and negative correlations with scores on measures of loneliness and depression (Roberts et al.).

### *The Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale*

The Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale (SES; Rosenberg, 1989) is one of the most commonly used tools to measure global self-esteem (Byrne, 1996). The SES is based on a unidimensional construct of self-esteem and it defines self-esteem as an individual's perception of overall self-worth. The SES contains ten statements that are rated on a 4-point Likert scale, ranging from *strongly disagree* to *strongly agree*. Five items are positively worded and five items are negatively worded. Examples of items include "I feel that I have a number of good qualities" and "At times I think I am no good at all" (reverse coded). Item responses are scored from 0 to 3, and the SES score is calculated by summing the item scores. Total scores can range from 0 to 30, where higher scores are indicative of higher self-esteem. The internal consistency coefficient of the SES among Chinese college students was reported as 0.86 (Tsai, Ying & Lee, 2001) and 0.88 among a mixed ethnic group of Asian college students (Lee & Yoo, 2004). The convergent validity of the SES is supported by findings of strong positive correlations between SES scores and scores on other self-esteem measures ( $r = 0.72$  to  $0.79$ ; Byrne, 1996).

### *The Suinn-Lew Asian Self-Identity Acculturation Scale*

The Suinn-Lew Asian Self-Identity Acculturation Scale (SL-ASIA; Suinn, Rikard-Figueroa, Lew & Vigil, 1987) is a widely used acculturation measure. The scale considers acculturation or making cultural changes to be a multidimensional construct which involves cognitive, behavioural and attitudinal components. The SL-ASIA consists of 26 questions on language, identity, friendship choice, attitudes, behaviours and generational background. It was included in this study to provide information about

the Chinese adults' level of participation or integration in the dominant culture, which could affect how they are impacted by media messages coming from the outsider perspective. The SL-ASIA was also utilized in this study to provide descriptive information about participants to allow for an assessment of the comparability of the groups of participants exposed to the positive and negative media portrayals in terms of their acculturation status.

In scoring the SL-ASIA, a total score is derived from calculating the mean score of 21 multiple choice items. Each question has five answer choices and each choice is assigned a value from 1 to 5. Total scores range from 1 (low acculturation/ high Asian identity) to 5 (high acculturation/ high Western identity). A person rating low in acculturation is one who retains his or her ethnic heritage and has not assimilated into Western society. A highly acculturated person is one whose values, behaviours, preferences and attitudes reflect those in dominant Western society. A score of 3 is indicative of biculturalism, in which a person has retained his or her ethnic culture while also adopting some Western values, behaviours, preferences or attitudes.

In addition to the 21 multiple choice items that make up the SL-ASIA score, five additional items have been recently added to provide descriptive information about respondents' acculturation status (Suinn, personal communication, August 2, 2005). Using a 5-point Likert scale, individuals are asked to rate their commitment to Asian values and Western values, and their feelings of belongingness among Asians and Westerners. The last question on the SL-ASIA is a self-statement of identity. Individuals are asked to select the statement they identify with the most. Of the five options, there is one statement indicating low acculturation, three statements on different levels of

biculturalism, and one statement indicating high acculturation. Since these last five items provide descriptive information, they are not included in the SL-ASIA scoring.

Existing research suggests that the SL-ASIA has strong psychometric properties. A review of the literature identifies a high level of internal consistency, with Cronbach's alpha coefficients ranging from 0.83 to 0.91 among university student samples (Ponterotto, Baluch & Carielli, 1998). Among non-student samples, the Cronbach's alpha has been found to be 0.89 (Ownbey & Horridge, 1998). Studies have also supported SL-ASIA's concurrent validity, with SL-ASIA scores being positively correlated with generational level and length of residence in North America (Iwamasa, 1996; Suinn et al., 1987; Suinn, Ahuna & Khoo, 1992). For example, the earlier the age of migration, the greater likelihood of higher acculturation levels (Suinn et al. 1992). Construct validity has also been supported via factor analysis. Five factors were identified: (a) reading/writing/cultural preferences, (b) ethnic interactions, (c) affinity for ethnic identity and pride, (d) generational identity, and (e) food preference (Suinn, Ahuna & Khoo, 1992).

#### *Demographic Questionnaire*

To obtain information about participants' background, a demographic questionnaire was constructed by the researcher (see Appendix G). The demographic form requested information on age, gender, marital status, education and employment status/occupation. Participants were also asked for their country of origin, citizenship status and length of stay in Canada. Information on their first and second language and comfort in reading and writing English was also collected. In terms of English skills,

participants rated their English proficiency on a 7-point Likert scale, ranging from *poor* to *excellent*.

### *Debriefing Form*

The debriefing form correctly stated the purpose of the research and identified the independent and dependent variables of the study (see Appendix H). Participants were also provided the rationale for why the deception was used. The debriefing form communicated that if participants knew what the researcher was looking for, they may have felt encouraged to answer the questionnaires in a certain way. It was explained that the researcher wanted the participants to feel free in expressing their real opinions and feelings, and in order for the study results to turn out, it was important that they did not know how the study was designed. The participants were given the option of contacting the researcher to ask any questions that arose from being in the study or from being aware of its true purpose. In the event that participants experienced any discomfort as a result of their participation, the debriefing form invited participants to contact the researcher for follow-up. They were also provided a list of community agencies that offer culturally-sensitive counselling.

### Procedure

Individuals who were interested in the study contacted the researcher through telephone or email, at which time they were given the study description and were invited to make an appointment. All research sessions were held in the Education Building at the University of Alberta. The majority of the research sessions were held in a small seminar room where tables were arranged so that individuals could not see other participants' stimulus magazine article and responses. The number of participants completing the

study at the same time ranged from one to four. On a few occasions, research sessions were held in a classroom, where there was up to six participants completing the research simultaneously. Participants were interspersed throughout the classroom to ensure their privacy. Data collection sessions were held at various times during the day and evening to accommodate the participants' schedules.

The principal investigator, who is also a Chinese-Canadian, began each research session by verbally explaining the consent form. Immigrant participants tend to find explanations of research studies more meaningful when they are provided verbally from a member of their own culture rather than in written form (Pernice, 1994). When describing the study, the researcher reversed the order of the independent and dependent variables to prevent demand characteristics from influencing study results. Participants were told that the purpose of the study was to learn about how Chinese people evaluate magazine articles that are about their own cultural group, and if how they view the articles depends on their attachment to their cultural heritage and feelings about themselves as a Chinese person. The researcher explained that they would be asked to read a real published magazine article on Chinese-Canadians and then asked to answer some questions about their opinion of the article, about their cultural heritage and identity, and about their feelings about themselves as group members. Participants were informed that the research process would take one hour of their time and they were verbally reassured that participation was voluntary and that their responses would be kept private. Participants were also informed that there were no correct or incorrect responses, since participants who are foreign-born and/or are unfamiliar with social science research may respond in a socially desirable manner (Pernice, 1994). The researcher remained in

the room throughout the duration of the study, and participants were invited to ask the researcher questions at any time.

Once the consent form was read aloud, packages were randomly distributed. Each package contained: (a) a consent form for participants to read and sign, (b) a magazine article, (c) an article evaluation form, (d) the Revised Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure, (e) the Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale, (f) the Suinn-Lew Asian Self-Identity Acculturation Scale, and (g) a demographic form. The titles of the measures were removed and questionnaires were presented in the same order for all participants. As much as possible, materials such as the consent and debriefing forms were presented in simple English in order to facilitate comprehension by foreign-born participants. Upon receiving the package, participants read and signed the consent form, and then read either the positive magazine article (e.g., Chinese as high academic achievers) or the negative magazine article (e.g., Chinese as criminal gang members). Next, participants completed the accompanying measures. Participants were informed that the study would take up to one hour of their time; however, most people completed the study in approximately half an hour.

When they finished the study, participants placed all their materials back in the envelope and brought it to the researcher. At this point, the researcher witnessed (co-signed) the consent form and provided participants with a debriefing form which correctly explained the independent and dependent variables of the study, and provided a rationale for the use of the deception. The debriefing occurred in writing rather than verbally because participants completed the questionnaires at different rates and the researcher needed to remain in the room until the research session was complete.



Participants were encouraged to read the debriefing form and to contact the researcher if they had any questions. Participants were also offered \$10 for their participation. This remuneration was offered for the cost of transportation to and from the university. Individuals who expressed interest in the study results provided their email address so that the researcher could forward a summary of study results upon completion of the study.

### Ethical Issues

There are a number of ethical issues that were taken into account in all phases of this research study, from participant recruitment to study implementation. First, to prevent individuals from feeling obligated to participate due to previous friendships or relationships with the researcher, the researcher only approached University of Alberta student groups and community associations that she did not have any affiliation with. However, people's willingness to participate in the study could also have been influenced by the researcher's own cultural group membership as a Chinese-Canadian. To help ensure that participation was voluntary, when potential participants initially contacted the researcher to inquire about the study, they were given a brief description the purpose and nature of the study and were informed that it was their choice to take part in the study. If an individual inquiring about the study did not reply to the information email or stated that he or she was not interested in taking part, the researcher did not ask any further questions and did not initiate any further contact with the person. Furthermore, at the beginning of the research session, the researcher verbally explained the informed consent form before collecting data and participants were informed that they could withdraw from the study at any time without any questions or problems.

Secondly, any individual who wished to attend a research session after receiving the study description and inclusion criteria was allowed to participate. To reduce possible feelings of rejection, individuals who did not meet inclusion criteria due to English proficiency or length of stay in Canada were not turned away. These individuals were allowed to participate in the study and were offered to receive the summary of study results, even though their data was not included in the analysis.

Thirdly, the portrayals of Chinese-Canadians in the media used in this study may have influenced participant self-evaluations. For example, when reading a negative portrayal, participants may have felt badly about their cultural group membership and may have experienced some distress about how the group is perceived by others. Likewise, in reading the positive portrayal that presents Chinese-Canadians as academically gifted, individuals experiencing academic challenges may have felt that they are not meeting cultural expectations of academic excellence. To address this concern, the debriefing form that was distributed to participants at the end of the research session provided a listing of culturally sensitive and low-cost counselling and support services, so that participants were aware of appropriate resources to deal with any emerging concerns. Lastly, the compensation amount of \$10 was kept small enough that it did not likely serve as an incentive to participate and it was provided in accordance with ethical guidelines.

#### Data Coding and Scoring

Once data was collected, consent forms were separated from the questionnaires and stored separately. A code number was assigned to each participant and only participant codes were used when scoring and analyzing data. The researcher coded and

scored all study data. All research data were kept in a locked filing cabinet in the researcher's study space at the University of Alberta. The next chapter describes the data analysis strategies to answer the research questions and provides details about the study results.

## CHAPTER IV

### RESULTS

The present study examines how the media's use of ethnic stereotypes impacts in-group members' self-esteem and ethnic identity. It is hypothesized that Chinese-Canadian participants who are given a magazine article that presents their ethnic group in a negative way (i.e., as gang members) will report lower self-esteem and a weaker attachment to their ethnic group than participants who receive a magazine article presenting their ethnic group in a positive manner (i.e., as model minorities). The current chapter will provide descriptive information about the participants' levels of acculturation, ethnic identity development and self-esteem, as well as their impressions of the stimulus articles that were used in this study. This will be followed by the results of the statistical analyses that test the study hypotheses.

#### Data Screening

A total of 108 Chinese-Canadians participated in this research study. Once the data was collected, participants whose length of residence was less than one year and whose self-appraised English proficiency was less than five on a 7-point Likert scale were excluded from the data analyses. These criteria were set to allow participants enough time to adjust to Canadian society and to ensure that participants understood the magazine articles and questionnaire items. The following results were based on the responses of the 93 participants who met the inclusion criteria. Forty-seven of these participants were exposed to the positive media portrayal of Chinese-Canadians and 46 participants were exposed to the negative media portrayal.

## Descriptive Information

### *Acculturation Scores*

On the Suinn-Lew Asian Self-Identity Acculturation Scale (SL-ASIA), a score of 1 indicates low acculturation, whereas a score of 5 suggests high levels of acculturation. Participants reported a mean score of 2.77 ( $SD = 0.61$ ), with scores ranging from 1.62 to 3.95. Based on total SL-ASIA scores, the majority of participants (52.69%,  $n = 49$ ) were classified as being bi-cultural, as indicated by scores within the 2.5 and 3.5 range. Thirty-one participants (33.33%) indicated low levels of acculturation or high levels of Asian identification, as indicated by scores below 2.5. A smaller proportion of the sample (13.98%,  $n = 13$ ) were considered to be highly acculturated or Western-identified based on scores above 3.5.

The SL-ASIA includes two additional scores that classify acculturation based on values or behavioural skills that permit “fitting in”. In terms of cultural values, half of the participants (50.54%,  $n = 47$ ) indicated that their beliefs in Asian and Western values were equally strong. About 34% of the participants ( $n = 32$ ) were more committed to Asian values than Western values, whereas 15.05% ( $n=14$ ) identified more closely with Western values. When asked to rate their feelings of belongingness among Asians and Westerners, 47.31% ( $n = 44$ ) perceived themselves to fit in equally well with other Asians and non-Asians. Thirty percent of participants ( $n = 28$ ) felt they fit in better with Asians than non-Asians, 20.43% ( $n = 19$ ) felt they fit in better with non-Asians than Asians, and 2.15% ( $n = 2$ ) indicated that they felt alienated and that they did not fit in with Asians nor non-Asians.

The SL-ASIA also asks respondents to select a self-statement of identity from a list of five. As shown in Table 1, 59.14% ( $n = 55$ ) selected one of the three levels of biculturalism, with 37.63% ( $n = 35$ ) indicating a fully bicultural self-identity. About 32% of participants ( $n = 30$ ) were considered Asian-identified and 8.60% ( $n = 8$ ) selected the Western-identified statement.

Table 1

*Participants' Endorsements on the SL-ASIA's Self-Statement of Identity*

Item	<i>n</i>	%
Asian-Identified I consider myself basically a Chinese person. Even though I live and work in Canada, I still view myself as a Chinese person.	30	32.26
Western-Identified I consider myself basically a Canadian person. Even though I have a Chinese background and characteristics, I still view myself basically as a Canadian.	8	8.60
Bicultural, Asian self-identity I consider myself as a Chinese-Canadian, although deep down I always know I am Chinese.	16	17.20
Bicultural, Western self-identity I consider myself as a Chinese- Canadian, although deep down I view myself as a Canadian first.	4	4.30
Bicultural, bicultural self-identity I consider myself as a Chinese-Canadian. I have both Chinese and Canadian characteristics, and I view myself as a blend of both.	35	37.63

### *Ethnic Identity Scores*

The revised Multi-group Ethnic Identity Measure (MEIM-2) is based on a 4-point Likert scale, where lower scores suggest weak ethnic identification and higher scores suggest strong, positive ethnic identification. Participants' MEIM-2 scores ranged from 1.67 to 4.00, with a mean of 3.17 ( $SD = 0.46$ ). On the Affirmation, Belonging and Commitment subscale, participants obtained a mean score of 3.30 ( $SD = 0.49$ , range = 1.86 – 4.00), suggesting a solid commitment to their ethnic heritage overall. The average score on the Ethnic Identity Search subscale was 2.98 ( $SD = 0.51$ , range = 1.40 – 4.00), indicating that participants had engaged in some exploration of their heritage culture.

The MEIM-2 asks participants to select their parents' ethnicity and self-ethnicity based on a list of eight choices. Participants identified their father's ethnicity to be "Chinese" (73.12%,  $n = 68$ ) or "Chinese-Canadian" (21.51%,  $n = 20$ ) and their mother's ethnicity to be "Chinese" (70.97%,  $n = 66$ ) or "Chinese-Canadian" (24.73%,  $n = 23$ ). Three participants (4.30%) selected "other" for their parents' ethnicity, and provided a more specific ethnic label that identified the country of origin (e.g. Chinese-Vietnamese, Malaysian Chinese, Taiwanese). While the majority of participants viewed their parents to be "Chinese", over half of the sample identified their own ethnicity to be "Chinese-Canadian" (55.91%,  $n = 52$ ). The remaining participants considered themselves to be Chinese (33.3%,  $n = 31$ ), Canadian (3.23%,  $n = 3$ ), Asian (2.15%,  $n = 2$ ), Oriental (1.08%,  $n = 1$ ), Oriental-Canadian (1.08%,  $n = 1$ ), or of an "other" ethnic group (3.23%,  $n = 3$ ), in which they specified their country of origin. In comparison, when participants were provided with an open-ended question regarding their ethnic self-identification, which is considered to be a more subjective self-label, a greater proportion of participants

identified themselves as “Chinese” (64.52%). There were 21.51% ( $n = 20$ ) who identified themselves as “Chinese-Canadians” and 5.38% ( $n = 5$ ) who identified themselves as “Asians”. Again, seven participants (7.56%) wrote more specific ethnic labels with the country or province of origin, as illustrated in Table 2. Overall, their ethnic identification was consistent with their responses on the SL-ASIA, suggesting a pattern of ethnic identity maintenance or biculturalism.

Table 2

*Participants' Open-ended Response to the MEIM-2's Self-Identified Ethnic Label*

Label	$n$	%
Chinese	60	64.52
Chinese-Canadian	20	21.51
Asian	5	5.38
Canadian	1	1.08
British-Chinese-Canadian	1	1.08
Canadian-Chinese from Hong Kong	1	1.08
Chinese-Hong Kongese	1	1.08
Chinese Han	1	1.08
Mainland Chinese	1	1.08
Malaysian Chinese	1	1.08
Teocheu Chinese	1	1.08



### *Self-Esteem Scores*

The Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale provides a score out of 30, in which higher scores are indicative of higher self-esteem. The mean score for the 93 participants was 21.97 ( $SD = 3.69$ ), ranging from 13 to 30. This overall score suggests healthy self-esteem.

### Evaluation of Stimulus Articles

#### *Article on Model Minorities*

The stimulus article evaluation form used a 5-point Likert scale (1 = *strongly disagree* to 5 = *strong agree*) to evaluate the participants' perceptions of the stimulus article. Table 3 presents the data of the ten evaluation items from each condition group. Results show that the article describing Chinese-Canadians as high academic achievers was considered to be a positive portrayal of Chinese-Canadians ( $M = 3.93$ ,  $SD = 0.72$ ) and not a negative portrayal ( $M = 1.96$ ,  $SD = 0.72$ ). Participants perceived the article to provide an accurate and generalizable description of Chinese-Canadians and it was not considered to portray Chinese people as having a negative impact on Canadian society. In addition, those who received the article on model minorities rated the article to be interesting and worthy of being published in a magazine. They also indicated that they would want to read more articles on this topic. Overall, results suggest that the stimulus article presenting the model minority stereotype was perceived by participants to be a positive depiction of Chinese-Canadians.

#### *Article on Asian Gangs*

Participants who read the article on Chinese involvement in criminal activity perceived the article to give a negative impression of Chinese-Canadians ( $M = 4.09$ ,

Table 3

*Group Comparison of Participants' Magazine Article Evaluations*

Evaluation Form Item	<u>Positive</u>		<u>Negative</u>		<i>t</i>	<i>p</i>
	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>		
<b>General Impression</b>						
The article gives a positive impression of Chinese people.	4.04	0.62	1.39	0.54	21.94	.00
In the article, Chinese people are presented in a negative or bad way.	1.85	0.66	4.26	0.83	-15.55	.00
<b>Accuracy</b>						
The way the Chinese people are described in this article is accurate.	3.96	0.72	2.13	0.93	10.55	.00
The article gives information that is true.	3.85	0.75	3.11	0.97	4.13	.00
<b>Generalizability</b>						
The information in this article applies to most Chinese people.	3.49	1.04	1.50	0.91	9.80	.00
<b>Impact on Society</b>						
The article sends a message that Chinese people have a negative impact on Canadian society.	1.74	0.85	3.98	1.09	-11.08	.00
<b>General Evaluation Items</b>						
The author clearly communicated his/her message.	4.04	0.72	4.04	0.76	-.01	1.00
The article was interesting.	4.55	0.58	4.02	0.91	3.37	.00
I would want to read more about this topic.	4.28	0.77	3.67	1.08	3.11	.00
An article like this should not have been published.	1.66	0.96	2.48	1.11	-3.80	.00

$SD = 1.10$ ) and not a positive portrayal ( $M = 1.38, SD = 0.53$ ). As displayed in Table 3, participants viewed the Asian gang article to present Chinese people as a problem for Canadian society and to provide an inaccurate representation of Chinese-Canadians. Compared to participants who received the article on model minorities, those with the Asian gang article were significantly less likely to view the article as being accurate and generalizable to other Chinese people. Furthermore, the article on Asian gangs was considered to be less interesting and less worthy of being published. These results support the use of this article for the negative stereotype condition.

#### *Comparison of Stimulus Articles*

To compare the two stimulus articles, Independent Sample  $t$ -tests were run for each evaluation item. To address the minor difference in sample sizes, Levene's Test of Equality of Variances was used to ensure that the data met the assumption of homogeneity of variance. When this assumption was not met, Levene's corrected  $t$ -statistic was used. Table 3 indicates that the scores from nine out of the ten evaluation items were significantly different between condition groups ( $p < .00$ ). The only item that did not reach significance was the item concerning the author's clarity in communicating, in which participants in both conditions agreed. The statistically significant differences in ratings on the other evaluation items suggest that the stimulus articles were perceived to present contrasting depictions of Chinese-Canadians. Overall, results indicate that the stimulus article presenting the model minority stereotype was perceived to be a positive, more representative depiction of Chinese-Canadians, while the stimulus article on Asian gangs was perceived to be a negative portrayal.

## Analysis Results

### *Comparison of Condition Groups*

Independent Sample *t*-tests were used to compare the two condition groups in terms of acculturation and demographic variables. Results indicated that there were no statistically significant differences between groups. Those exposed to the model minority stereotype reported a mean SL-ASIA score of 2.72 ( $SD = 0.66$ ), while those presented with the Asian gang stereotype had a mean SL-ASIA score of 2.83 ( $SD = 0.57$ ),  $t(91) = -.90, p > .05$ . The mean age of participants in the positive condition was 24.85 ( $SD = 6.41$ ) and the mean age of the participants in the negative condition group was 23.39 ( $SD = 4.80$ ). In addition, the English proficiency ratings from the positive condition group ( $M = 6.17, SD = 0.84$ ) was similar to the negative condition group ( $M = 6.22, SD = 0.76$ ). Table 4 provides additional information on the demographic characteristics of each condition group.

### *The Effect of Stereotypes on Ethnic Identity*

It was hypothesized that participants presented with a negative stereotype of Chinese-Canadians will report lower scores on the MEIM-2 than participants who received a magazine article presenting the model minority stereotype of Chinese-Canadians. Independent Sample *t*-tests were conducted to examine differences in ethnic identity scores between the participants who were provided with the positive or negative stereotyped portrayal. Since the sample sizes were unequal (47 in the positive condition and 46 in the negative condition), Levene's Test of Equality of Variances was used to ensure that the data met the assumption of homogeneity of variance of the *t*-statistic. The

Table 4

*Comparison of Participants' Demographic Characteristics by Condition Group*

	<u>Positive<sup>a</sup></u>		<u>Negative<sup>b</sup></u>	
	<i>n</i>	% of subsample	<i>n</i>	% of subsample
Gender				
Male	18	38.30	21	46.65
Female	29	61.70	25	54.35
Marital Status				
Single	36	76.60	35	76.09
Married	10	21.28	10	21.74
Divorced	1	2.13	1	2.17
Country of birth				
Canada	22	46.81	22	47.83
Other	25	53.19	24	52.17
Citizenship				
Canadian	30	63.83	34	73.91
Landed immigrant	3	6.38	4	8.70
Student visa	12	25.53	7	15.22
Other	1	2.13	1	2.17
First language learned				
English	5	10.64	6	13.04
Chinese	42	89.36	39	84.78
Other	0	--	1	2.17

## Education

Some high school	2	4.26	0	--
Graduated high school	1	2.13	3	6.52
Trade/ technical training	0	--	1	2.17
Some university/ college training	18	38.30	23	50.00
Completed undergraduate degree	8	17.02	7	15.22
Some graduate level training	13	27.70	5	10.87
Completed a graduate degree	5	10.64	7	15.22

---

<sup>a</sup> $n = 47$ . <sup>b</sup> $n = 46$ .

results did not indicate any significant differences in the variance of the positive and negative condition groups.

In contrast to the study hypothesis, there were no significant between-group differences in total MEIM-2 scores,  $t(91) = -0.65, p > .05$ . Participants in the positive stereotype group reported similar levels of ethnic identity ( $M = 3.14, SD = 0.41$ ) as the participants in the negative stereotype group ( $M = 3.17, SD = 0.50$ ). These results indicate that manipulating the type of media exposure did not influence participants' attachment to their ethnic group.

#### *The Effect of Stereotypes on Self-Esteem*

The second study hypothesis stated that participants presented with the negative ethnic stereotype would report lower self-esteem scores than participants exposed to the positive stereotype. To test this hypothesis, data was analyzed using Independent Sample  $t$ -tests. Again, Levene's Test for homogeneity of variances was performed to determine

determine if the variances were sufficiently equivalent to allow comparison between the groups, and the results did not suggest any significant differences in the variance between condition groups.

The Independent Sample *t*-test comparing the total self-esteem score was statistically significant,  $t(91) = -2.27, p < .05$ , indicating that the self-esteem scores for the negative stereotype group ( $M = 22.83, SD = 3.46$ ) were significantly higher than the positive stereotype group ( $M = 21.13, SD = 3.75$ ). These findings are the opposite of what was predicted, suggesting that the media's use of negative ethnic stereotypes appears to slightly enhance the self-esteem scores among in-group members with similar levels of ethnic identity and acculturation levels.

## CHAPTER V

### DISCUSSION

The present study examined how ethnic stereotypes in the media influence Chinese-Canadians' feelings and attitudes towards their ethnicity and their overall self-esteem. This chapter will review the study's main findings within the context of existing theories and research. The implications of study results will also be discussed and will be followed by study strengths and limitations, and directions for future research.

#### The Effect of Ethnic Stereotypes on Ethnic Identity

It was hypothesized that exposure to a negative cultural stereotype would lead to weaker ethnic identity among members of the portrayed group, while a positive ethnic stereotype would enhance ethnic identity. Current findings did not support this hypothesis. Regardless of whether Chinese-Canadians were presented with the model minority stereotype or the Asian gang stereotype, most participants reported secure ethnic identification. Responses on the MEIM-2 and SL-ASIA indicated that participants identified themselves as members of the Chinese group and expressed a strong and positive attachment to their ethnic heritage. This endorsement of their cultural heritage suggests that participants likely perceived the stimulus magazine articles to target their ingroup and to be self-relevant. As such, the two preconditions set for group members to be affected by intergroup comparisons, as described by social identity theory, appear to have been met (Tajfel & Turner, 1986). In addition, results from the article evaluation form confirm that participants considered the model minority stereotype to be a positive depiction of Chinese-Canadians and the gang member stereotype to be a negative depiction. However, there were no significant between-group differences in MEIM-2



scores which appear to be inconsistent with social identity theory's premise that group members will report greater group affiliation and pride when their group is presented favourably, and weaker affiliation when their group is presented unfavourably (Tajfel & Turner). Current findings also appear to conflict with stereotype threat theory (Steele, 1997), which suggests that being exposed to negative stereotypes leads to disidentification or psychological disengagement, in which the self-concept is restructured so that the stereotyped characteristic becomes less important and less central to one's self-definition. It was expected that negative stereotypes would lead participants to desire membership in the non-stereotyped group, resulting in lower ethnic identity scores and a weakened attachment to their heritage culture. Instead, the current study found that ethnic stereotypes had no significant effect on reported levels of ethnic identity. Participants in both condition groups reported that they had explored the meaning of being a Chinese-Canadian and maintained positive attitudes and feelings of pride towards their ethnic membership despite unflattering media portrayals of their culture.

While the present findings are encouraging, they are somewhat surprising. In a qualitative study by Yeh and Huang (1996), Asian American college students identified the dominant culture's standards and beliefs to be strong factors in shaping their ethnic identity, with 38% of respondents reporting that U.S. stereotypes of Asians played influential roles on their ethnic identity development. In comparison, the present study used an experimental design which searched for an empirical link between media stereotypes and Chinese Canadians' views of themselves, and did not uncover such an association.

### The Effect of Ethnic Stereotypes on Self-Esteem

In terms of self-esteem, it was predicted that participants in the gang member stereotype condition would report lower self-esteem scores than those in the model minority stereotype condition. Since ethnic identity is a central component to the self-concept (Phinney, 1990), it was believed that cultural stereotypes would effect global self-esteem in the same manner as they were expected to affect ethnic identity. On average, both condition groups reported healthy levels of self-esteem. However, participants exposed to the negative ethnic stereotype reported slightly higher self-esteem than participants exposed to the positive stereotype. These findings are the reverse of what was predicted. Social psychologists have long theorized that social stigma negatively impacts self-esteem (Crocker & Major, 1989). For instance, Cartwright (1950) wrote,

The Group to which a person belongs serves as primary determiners of his self-esteem. To a considerable extent, personal feelings of worth depend on the social evaluation of the group with which a person is identified. Self-hatred and feelings of worthiness tend to arise from membership in underprivileged or outcast groups (p. 440).

Given that the Chinese culture emphasizes saving face and preserving group image, it appeared logical that a negative portrayal of the Chinese group would hinder self-esteem. Stereotype threat theory asserts that negative stereotypes attack self-evaluations (Steele, 1997) while social identity theory predicts that membership to a less privileged, lower status social group would also negatively impact self-esteem (Tajfel & Turner, 1986). Trandis (1989) found that the Asian self-concept is more dependent on

the judgments and demands of the social environment compared to the North American and European self-concepts, and concluded that individuals of Asian descent are more vulnerable to external influences during the ethnic identification process. In addition, biographical accounts of ethnic minorities have identified persistent negative images in society as contributing to negative feelings about their own group (Phinney, 1990).

#### Possible Explanations of Study Findings

The study results are surprising because they appear to be inconsistent with well-established psychological and social theories. The following section provides a brief discussion of possible explanations for these findings.

##### *Ruling Out Acculturation*

The inclusion of the SL-ASIA allowed the researcher to rule out acculturation as a confounding variable. Both condition groups reported similar levels of acculturation, with the majority of participants identifying themselves as bicultural. As expected, there were more participants who endorsed low levels of acculturation or to be Asian-identified than participants who described being highly acculturated or to be Western-identified.

##### *The Model Minority as a Stereotype*

Interestingly, of the participants exposed to the model minority stereotype, 76.60% agreed or strongly agreed that the portrayal was an “accurate” reflection of Chinese-Canadians, 74.47% believed the information was “true”, and 61.70% believed the information was generalizable to most Chinese-Canadians. This suggests that the study participants held the belief that most Chinese-Canadians are intelligent, disciplined, hard working and high academic achievers, and likely did not perceive the magazine article to convey an unrealistic or overgeneralized portrayal of their group. However, it is

important to note that the study sample consisted of highly educated individuals. Over 92% had some level of university education, with 32% having graduate level training. Respondents may have perceived the model minority stereotype to reflect reality because they likely possessed many of the traits described in the article. If the participants had been less educated or were experiencing academic difficulties, they may have responded differently to the model minority stereotype portrayal based on their non-conformity to the information contained within it. Results may also be attributed to the fact that the religious philosophies grounded in the Chinese culture place high value on hard-work and educational and occupational success, and these values are generally incorporated into Chinese upbringing (Hong & Ham, 2001; Sue & Sue, 2003). Therefore, Chinese-Canadians may be exposed to such cultural expectations on a regular and frequent basis by sources other than the media and as such, may be unresponsive to possible effects of the model minority stereotype. Studies have found that Chinese-American students are well aware of the academic expectations of their cultural group, imposed by parents as well as other students (Burton, Greenberger & Hayward, 2005; Kao, 2000). Therefore, while components of the model minority stereotype are exposed to Chinese-Canadians from childhood, exposure to the gang member stereotypes may not become as prevalent until adolescence or early adulthood.

#### *Asian Gangs as Outgroups*

Given that the sample consisted of highly educated Chinese-Canadians, it is possible that participants did not identify with the negative stereotype of gang members. The negative portrayal described Chinese-Canadians as dishonest, ruthless and corrupt and described happenings that many of the participants likely have not personally

experienced. For instance, 63.04% of participants considered the gang member portrayal to be an inaccurate depiction of Chinese-Canadians and 86.96% reported that the portrayal was not generalizable. Additionally, compared to the positive stimulus article, the negative article made more references to other Asian cultural groups. Literature suggests that ethnic minorities may distance themselves from those stereotypes that are not applicable to them as individuals (Phinney, 1991). Therefore, it is possible that in order to preserve feelings of affirmation, participants may have rationalized that their ethnic group is not homogenous and as such, conceptualized their ethnic group into sub-cultures or considered the article to target other Asian cultures, rather than their own (Crocker & Major, 1989; Phinney). Participants may have narrowed membership lines so that the classification of Chinese-Canadians or Asian-Canadians was divided into sub-groups containing “us” (model minorities) and “them” (gang members). If the participants considered Chinese gang members as outgroup members, the stereotype exposure may not have affected participants’ sense of belonging or induced feelings of inferiority. Rather, because the negative article discussed extreme cases of criminal activities, participants likely felt a little bit better about themselves in comparison.

If this were true, then the current findings would be consistent with social identity theory (Tajfel, 1981). If participants did not perceive themselves to be part of the group that includes Asian gangs (i.e., a lower status group), but rather, viewed themselves to be part of the group that represents successful, hard-working Chinese-Canadians (i.e., a higher status group), then the intergroup comparisons would reflect favourably on their own group and explain the higher scores on the self-esteem measure. Participants in the negative stereotype condition may have differentiated themselves from the “gang

member” group in order to preserve positive distinctiveness and maintain a positive ethnic identity and self-esteem. Meanwhile, participants exposed to the model minority stereotype perhaps compared themselves to a high status group with which they could relate.

Furthermore, if the participants did not consider the negative portrayal to reflect ingroup members, study results would also be consistent with stereotype threat theory. For a negative stereotype to be threatening, it must be self-relevant so that the possibility of conforming to the stereotype is self-threatening (Steele, 1997). Because participants have succeeded academically, they may perceive themselves to have already overcome and disconfirmed the negative gang member stereotype and therefore, it is possible that the stereotype was not considered to be personally threatening.

#### *Ethnic Identity as a Moderating Variable*

Participants in both condition groups reported relatively strong ethnic identities which may have buffered the effects of ethnic stereotyping. Individuals with positive ethnic identity are more confident and comfortable with their group membership and therefore, may be able to reject negativity towards their group (Phinney, 1992). For example, previous research has found that the level of ethnic identity predicted whether Asian Americans had positive or negative feelings towards the model minority stereotype (Oyserman & Saskamoto, 1997). Because of their positive identification as members of the Chinese group, it is possible that participants counteracted the negative stereotype by overcompensating their responses and may have reported higher self-esteem in defense of their cultural membership. Individuals with weaker ethnic identity may be more

susceptible to being influenced by external messages concerning their cultural group as they attempt to understand and accept their ethnicity.

### Study Implications

Previous research in the area of media impact and ethnic minorities has primarily focused on how different media portrayals of cultural groups affect public views of immigrants (Esses et al., 2001). The present study contributes empirical knowledge to the theoretical writings concerning the media's influence on stereotyped minority members' ethnic identity and self-esteem. Current findings suggest that Chinese-Canadians are resilient against the effects of ethnic stereotyping presented in the media. Participants reported positive ethnic identity and healthy self-esteem, regardless of how Chinese-Canadians were portrayed in a magazine article. Furthermore, the majority of participants in this study identified themselves as bi-cultural, which is considered to be the most adaptive identification for immigrants (Phinney et al., 2001).

The report of a strong ethnic identity is encouraging. Ethnic identity is considered to be central to the self-concept among ethnic minorities (Phinney, 1990). Yet, previous studies have found that Asian Americans had the lowest ethnic identity search scores among other minority groups (Phinney & Alipuia, 1990). For example, when compared to Blacks and Hispanics adolescents, Asian-Americans were significantly more likely to express a desire to belong to a different ethnic group if they had a choice (Phinney, 1989). Results from the present study suggest that Chinese-Canadians are successfully developing strong, secure attachments to their ethnic group, despite differing portrayals in the media and society at large. This likely reflects the success of the Canadian multiculturalism policy which fosters ethnocultural retention as opposed to segregation or

assimilation. Since 1971, Canada has strived to encourage immigrants to maintain and develop their own cultural identities without prejudice and discrimination, and to share their culture with other Canadians (Berry, 1984). The adoption of such a policy may explain the differences between current study results and previous studies conducted in the United States, a country which tends to promote assimilation. Nevertheless, a small proportion of the study sample (2%) indicated that they felt alienated by both cultures, indicating that there are individuals who continue to struggle with fitting in and developing and integrating ethnic and national identities. Given that individuals with weak ethnic identity are at greater risk of experiencing difficulties with adjustment (Roberts et al., 1999), there continues to be a need to identify factors that protect and enhance ethnic identity development so that these variables can be promoted and reinforced.

The present study found that many Chinese-Canadian adults are able to develop and sustain secure ethnic identities in the face of rigid stereotypes. However, the rapid response rate and voiced interest from participants implies that this is an area of concern for many Chinese-Canadians. This is also supported by the conversations participants initiated with the researcher about how their group is portrayed in the media. It appears to be important for counsellors to be able to assist Chinese-Canadians in finding strategies to respond to external messages about their group that will be self-affirming and foster their resilience similar to the participants in this study. It is critical for counsellors to explore the ways in which Chinese-Canadians make sense of media portrayals of their group and the personal impacts these portrayals have (Yeh & Huang, 1996). In discussing the Minority Racial/Cultural Identity Development Model, Sue and



Sue (2003) encourage counsellors to help clients examine ways of resolving any cognitive dissonance created by negative portrayals of their group or negative intergroup contact experiences. Counsellors can work with clients to compare and contrast themselves with other ingroup members portrayed in negative media images and to separate and differentiate themselves in order to preserve their feelings of self-worth and positive ethnic identity. The idea of considering Asian gangs as outgroups that are not relevant to oneself seems to be a possible protective strategy against erosion of self-esteem. In cases where the media presents one's group in a positive light, recognizing similarities between oneself and positive group characteristics presented may maintain esteem and ethnic affiliation. In situations where individuals exposed to a positive stereotype do not feel they conform to positive attributes presented (e.g., low achieving Chinese students), counsellors can assist by providing factual information on within group variability. For example, Toupin and Son (1991) found that despite the model minority stereotype, there is great variability in Chinese students' achievement, and this achievement may be affected by issues such as English as a second language, international student status etc.

### Strengths and Limitations of the Study

#### *Strengths*

The methodology of the present study was strengthened by the use of the article evaluation form, which allowed participants' perceptions of the stimulus articles to be assessed in terms of whether they were considered to be positive or negative portrayals of their cultural group. Furthermore, this experimental design initially concealed the true independent variable from participants in order to reduce the possibility of response bias.

This is a particular concern since members of collectivistic cultures tend to provide socially desirable responses (Matsumoto, 2000). In addition, the measures used in this study had strong psychometric properties and have been utilized with Asian populations.

Other strengths of the present study include the random assignment of participants to condition groups and the equivalence of condition groups in terms of demographic variables and level of acculturation. Furthermore, although participants were recruited from the University of Alberta, 44% of participants indicated that they were not currently students, indicating a diverse sample of Chinese-Canadian adults.

### *Limitations*

The study results are constrained by several limitations. First, although a large portion of the study sample consisted of non-university students, over 90% had some level of university education. As such, the study sample consisted of a large number of Chinese individuals who likely identify with the model minority stereotype. However, given that research suggests that Chinese-Canadians have a higher rate of university completion compared to the national average (Yee, 1992), they may have been a representative sample. Nevertheless, the inclusion of Chinese-Canadians who do not fit the model minority stereotype would have been beneficial. Moreover, among those participants who were students, data regarding academic achievement were not collected. It is possible that academic achievement acts as a covariate, in that individuals who are struggling in school may report lower self-esteem and/ or ethnic identity when confronted with media stereotypes reflecting cultural expectations for academic excellence.

Second, this study relied on subjective self-report measures. How individuals present themselves on questionnaires may differ from how they actually feel about

themselves, particularly among members of a collectivistic culture that values self-effacement over self-enhancement. However, by framing the purpose of the study as examining how Chinese-Canadians evaluate media messages instead of stating the true study purpose, and by reassuring anonymity and confidentiality verbally and in writing, it is hoped that participants felt comfortable to respond freely.

Third, the current study did not include a baseline measure of participants' ethnic identity and self-esteem. As such, it is not known whether the condition groups were equivalent in terms of ethnic identity and self-esteem before the experimental manipulation occurred. The inclusion of a baseline would allow the validity of the conclusions to be further assured.

Fourth, the researcher's ethnic membership as a Chinese-Canadian may have affected study results. Participants may have felt obligated to respond in a certain way because of cultural expectations for conformity. However, it appeared that not all participants considered the researcher to be part of their in-group. For instance, one participant stated that because the researcher was born in Canada, she was not "a real Chinese".

Fifth, the study lacked a control group, which could have consisted of a group of Chinese-Canadians presented with a neutral article about their ethnic group. The addition of a control group could help determine the directionality of change between groups (i.e., whether a positive portrayal hinders self-esteem or whether a negative portrayal enhances self-esteem). In attempting to obtain a neutral portrayal of Chinese-Canadians in a real magazine article, the researcher encountered great difficulty, which attests to the prevalence of stereotypes in the media.

### Directions for Future Research

Given that the current study appears to be the first in this topic area, there are a number of possibilities for future research. Further empirical studies are needed to gain a better understanding of what factors foster or hinder the development and maintenance of ethnic identity and self-esteem. Since psychological functioning is positively correlated with ethnic identity (Roberts et al., 1999), it is important that counsellors are aware of contributing factors so that appropriate interventions can be developed when clients do express being negatively affected by ethnic stereotypes.

It would be important to conduct a follow-up study using a mixed method quantitative and qualitative design. For instance, Phase I of the study could involve a replication of the experiment conducted in this study, with the inclusion of baseline measures. Phase II of the research could involve interviews with a random sample of participants in the positive and negative exposure conditions to examine how they felt in response to the magazine article they read, what strategies they used to maintain their esteem and ethnic identity as a Chinese-Canadian when being confronted with the media portrayals and how the identified strategies worked for them. Such a study could shed light on the explanations of this study's results that stem from social identity theory and stereotype threat theory.

Empirical research examining the impact of the model minority stereotype on Chinese-Canadians is scarce, likely because it is viewed as a positive and non-problematic portrayal, even though, by definition, stereotypes are rigid and overgeneralized beliefs. The number of participants who perceived the model minority stereotype to be true suggests that Chinese-Canadians may have internalized this

stereotype and the corresponding expectations and standards. Some researchers argue that the model minority stereotype has negative consequences (Kawa, 2005; Wong & Halgin, 2006; Yee, 1992). For example, positive stereotypes have been found to hinder performance due to concerns about failing to meet the high expectations (Cheryan & Bodenhausen, 2000). It is possible that some Chinese-Canadians may experience undue pressure in trying to live up to this stereotype, and may experience feelings of shame and alienation when they do not live up to this model minority image. Further exploration in the consequences of endorsing the model minority stereotype on group members is warranted, especially in cases where participants' academic achievement does not conform to stereotyped portrayals.

Future research could also examine the impact of the Yellow Peril stereotype. The Yellow Peril portrays Chinese people to be foreign, disease-ridden, sneaky and mysterious (Leung, 2004; Mok, 1998). It compares Chinese people to a plague and precipitated the Chinese Exclusion Act in the 1920s. This stereotype characterizes Chinese people as an economic threat to non-immigrants because they are willing to work hard in what others may perceive to be menial tasks or intolerable conditions. Their industriousness, commitment to group solidarity and economic success are framed as being "too model", to the point that they are threatening (McGowan & Lindgren, 2006). Therefore, the model minority image appears to be a two-sided coin since the same virtues that are associated with the positive image can also be viewed as a negative threat. More Chinese-Canadians may be better able to identify with the Yellow Peril portrayal compared to the Asian gang portrayal, since it targets the values that are inherent to the Chinese culture.

The current sample consisted of adults who have explored the meaning of their ethnicity to some degree and made a commitment to their cultural group. However, college students are more likely to report achieved ethnic identity than high school students (Lee & Chol, 2004; Phinney, 1992). There may be more of an observed effect if a similar study was conducted with adolescents, who are in a developmental period in which identity search and commitment are at crucial stages (Erickson, 1968). As they start to explore the meaning of their ethnicity, it is possible that adolescents are more vulnerable to external messages and how they cope with such influences would be of great interest and value.

In addition, because of the media source, participants may have assumed that the author of the magazine article was a member of the dominant culture. Perhaps how the Chinese group is perceived by the general public is not as important as how they are viewed by other ingroup members. Because of their emphasis on interdependence, the Chinese culture places high value on conforming and maintaining a positive-group image. However, while it is important for Chinese people to maintain their reputation within the Chinese community, it is not known whether Chinese people feel the need to “save face” among non-Chinese individuals. Chinese-Canadians may place more value on the opinions of other in-group members rather than the opinion of the general public. As such, there may be different observed effects if the magazine article was presented as being written by a fellow Chinese-Canadian. A future study could examine whether the ethnicity of the author changes how the media message is perceived by presenting an article written by someone with either a Western or a Chinese surname.

The researcher noted that she was frequently asked about her ethnic membership by participants. Whether this was out of curiosity or whether this affected how participants responded could be further explored by involving experimenters of different ethnic groups. For example, it would be interesting to see if results would differ if the researcher was a Caucasian Canadian or a Chinese-Canadian. Since members of the dominant society often consider Asians to be a homogenous group (Leong & Schneller, 1997), Chinese-Canadians may believe that a Caucasian experimenter would fail to acknowledge their individual differences. As such, it is possible that Chinese-Canadians would consider themselves to be part of the same group that includes the Chinese gang-members in a Caucasian experimenter's mind, which could therefore, increase the perception of stereotype threat.

#### Conclusion

Chinese-Canadians are the largest visible minority group in Canada. Despite the fact that their history in Canada spans over 150 years, Chinese-Canadians continue to be viewed as foreigners and are stereotyped into restricting, one-dimensional roles by the mass media. Two common portrayals of this cultural group are the model minority and the Asian gang member. This study investigated whether these conflicting images impact the ethnic identity and self-esteem of Chinese-Canadian adults. Study results suggest that Chinese-Canadians' have positive ethnic attitudes and a strong attachment to their ethnic group and appear to be resilient to negative depictions of their cultural group. In terms of self-esteem, Chinese-Canadians who were presented the negative media portrayal reported higher self-esteem, suggesting that Chinese-Canadians have developed effective coping strategies to deal with differing stereotypes of their cultural group. It is possible

that participants vary their reference group when making social comparisons, which supports the premise of psychosocial theories such as social identity theory and stereotype threat theory. Further research is needed to identify factors that affect immigrants' abilities to develop a positive ethnic sense of self and variables that buffer self-esteem and ethnic identity from negative messages. It is hoped that with greater knowledge and understanding, mental health workers can help foster a sense of belonging, acceptance and self-worth among all members of our multicultural society, despite varying external portrayals of them.



## References

- Abreu, J., Ramirez, E., Kim, B., & Haddy, C. (2003). Automatic activation of yellow peril Asian American stereotypes: Effects on social impression formation. *The Journal of Social Psychology, 143*(6), 691-706.
- Anastasio, P., Rose, K., & Chapman, J. (1999). Can the media create public opinion?: A social-identity approach. *Current Directions in Psychological Science, 8*(5), 152-155.
- Aronson, J., Lustina, M., Good, C., Keough, K., Steele, C., & Brown, J. (1999). When White men can't do math: Necessary and sufficient factors in stereotype threat. *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology, 35*, 29-46.
- Ashmore, R., & Del Boca, F. (1981). Conceptual approaches to stereotypes and stereotyping. In D. Hamilton (Ed.), *Cognitive processes in stereotyping and intergroup behavior* (pp. 1-36). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Atkinson, D., Morton, G., & Sue, D. (1993). *Counseling American minorities* (4<sup>th</sup> ed.). Dubuque, IA: Brown & Benchmark.
- Barcus, E. (1983). *Images of life on children's television: Sex roles, minorities and families*. New York: Praeger.
- Barry, J. (1984). Multicultural policy in Canada: A social psychological analysis. *Canadian Journal of Behavioural Science, 16*, 353-370.
- Beiser, M., & Hou, F. (2006). Ethnic identity, resettlement stress and depressive affect among Southeast Asian refugees in Canada. *Social Science and Medicine, 63*, 137-150.

- Braun, K., & Nicols, R. (1997). Death and dying in four Asian American cultures: A descriptive study. *Death Studies, 21*, 237-359.
- Bullock, H., & Jafri, J. (2000). Media (mis)representations: Muslim women in the Canadian nation. *Canadian Woman Studies, 20(2)*, 35-40.
- Burton, M., Greenberger, E., & Hayward, C. (2005). Mapping the ethnic landscape: Personal beliefs about own group's and other groups' traits. *Cross-Cultural Research, 39(4)*, 351-379.
- Butterfield, F. (1987). Are Asian-American kids really smarter? *Readers Digest, 130*, 87-90.
- Byrne, B. (1996). Measures of self-concept for adolescents. In *Measuring self-concept across the life span: Issues and instrumentation* (pp. 125-168). Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.
- Cartwright, D. (1950). Emotional dimensions of group life. In M. Raymert (Ed.), *Feelings and emotions* (pp. 439-477). New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Cheryan, S., & Bodenhausen, G. (2000). When positive stereotypes threaten intellectual performance: The psychological hazards of "model minority" status. *Psychological Science, 11(5)*, 399-402.
- Chin, K. (1990). *Chinese subculture and criminality: Non-traditional crime groups in America*. New York: Greenwood Press.
- Cho, J., Gil de Zuniga, H., Shah, D., & McLeod, D. (2006). Cue convergence: Associative effects on social tolerance. *Communication Research, 33(3)*, 136-153.
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada, 2004. Retrieved January 14, 2006 from <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pub/facts2004/permanent>.

- Crocker, J., & Major, B. (1989). Social stigma and self-esteem: The self-protective properties of stigma. *Psychological Review*, *96*(4), 608-630.
- Cross, W. (1991). *Shades of Black: Diversity in African-American identity*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Croteau, D., & Hoynes, W. (2000). *Media society: Industries, images, and audiences* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Thousands Oaks, CA: Pine Forge Press.
- Crozier, J., & Claire, T. (1998). Extending the concept of stereotype threat to social class: The intellectual underperformance of students from low socioeconomic backgrounds. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, *24*, 588-594.
- DeFrancis, J. (1990). *The Chinese language: Fact and fantasy*. Honolulu, Hawaii: University of Hawaii Press.
- Dominick, J., & Greenberg, B. (1970). Three seasons of Blacks on television. *Journal of Advertising Research*, *10*, 21-27.
- Doolittle, J., & Pepper, R. (1975). Children's TV ad content: 1974. *Journal of Broadcasting*, *19*(2), 131-142.
- Dunnigan, T., McNall, M., & Mortimer, J. (1998). The problem of metaphorical non-equivalence in cross-cultural survey research: Comparing the mental health status of Hmong refugee and general population adolescents. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, *24*(3), 344-365.
- Erickson, E. (1968). *Identity: Youth and crisis*. New York: Norton.
- Esses, V., Dovidio, J., Jackson, L., & Armstrong, T. (2001). The immigration dilemma: The role of perceived group competition, ethnic prejudice, and national identity. *Journal of Social Issues*, *57*(3), 389-412.

- Esses, V., Jackson, L., & Armstrong, T. (1998). Intergroup competition and attitudes toward immigrants and immigration: An instrumental model of group conflict. *Journal of Social Issues, 54*, 699-724.
- Esses, V., Jackson, L., Nolan, J., & Armstrong, T. (1999). Economic threat and attitudes toward immigrants. In S. Halli, & L. Driger (Eds.), *Immigrant Canada: Demographic, economic and social challenges* (pp. 212-229). Toronto, Ontario, Canada: University of Toronto Press.
- Fang, S. & Wark, L. (1998). Developing cross-cultural competence with traditional Chinese Americans in family therapy: Background information and the initial therapeutic contact. *Contemporary Family Therapy, 20*(1), 59-77.
- Fleras, A. (1994). Media and minorities in a post-multicultural society: Overview and appraisals. In J. Berry, & J. Laponce (Eds), *Ethnicity and culture in Canada: A research landscape* (pp. 267-292). Toronto, Ontario, Canada: University of Toronto Press Inc.
- Fleras, A., & Elliott, J. (1992). *Multiculturalism in Canada: The challenge of diversity*. Scarborough, Ontario, Canada: Nelson Canada.
- Fleras, A., & Kunz, J. (2001). *Media and minorities: Representing diversity in a multicultural Canada*. Toronto, Ontario, Canada: Thompson Educational Publishing.
- Gerbner, G., Gross, L., Morgan, M., & Signorielli, N. (1994). Growing up with television: The cultivation perspective. In J. Bryant, & D. Zillmann (Eds.). *Media effects: Advances in theory and research* (pp. 17-41). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

- Gilens, M. (1996). Race and poverty in America: Public misperceptions and the American news media. *Public Opinions Quarterly*, 60, 515-541.
- Graves, S. (1999). Television and prejudice reduction: When does television as a vicarious experience make a difference? *Journal of Social Issues*, 55(4), 707-725.
- Grey, H. (1995). *Watching race: Television and the struggle for "blackness."* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Hall, R. (2001). "Model minority" as Eurocentric stereotype: Southeast Asian gangs. *Loyola Journal of Social Sciences*, 15(2), 135-146.
- Hong, G., & Ham, M. (2001). *Psychotherapy and counseling with Asian American clients: A practical guide*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Iwamasa, G. (1996). Acculturation of Asian American students. *Assessment*, 3(1), 99-102.
- Jackson, L., & Esses, V. (2000). Effects of perceived economic competition on people's willingness to help empower immigrants. *Group Processes and Intergroup Relations*, 3, 419-435.
- Kaihla, P., & Burke, D. (1991). Terror in the Streets. *Maclean's*, 104(12), 18-21.
- Kao, G. (2000). Group images and possible selves among adolescents: Linking stereotypes in expectations by race and ethnicity. *Sociological Review*, 15(3), 407-430.
- Kassarjian, H. (1969). The Negro and American advertising, 1946-1965. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 6, 29-39.
- Kawai, Y. (2005). Stereotyping Asian Americans: The dialectic of the model minority and the yellow peril. *Howard Journal of Communication*, 16(2), 109-130.

- Kleinknecht, W. (1996). *The new ethnic mobs: The changing face of organized crime in America*. New York: The Free Press.
- Lai, D. (2003). From downtown slums to suburban malls: Chinese migration and settlement in Canada. In L. Ma, & C. Cartier (Eds.) *The Chinese Diaspora: Space, place, mobility, and identity* (pp.311-336). Boston, MA: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Lee, E. (1996). Asian American families: An overview. In M. McGoldrick, J. Giordano, & J. Pearce (Eds.), *Ethnicity and family therapy* (pp. 227-248). New York: Guildford Press.
- Lee, J., Lei, A., & Sue, S. (2001). The current state of mental health research on Asian American. *Journal of Human Behaviour in the Social Environment*, 3(3-4), 196-206.
- Lee, R., & Yoo, H. (2004). Structure and measurement of ethnic identity of Asian American college students. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 51(2), 263-269.
- Leong, F., & Schneller, G. (1997). White Americans' attitudes towards Asian Americans in social situations: An empirical examination of potential stereotypes, bias and prejudice. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling & Development*, 25(1), 68-79.
- Leung, C. (2004). *Yellow Peril revisited: Impact of SARS on the Chinese and Southeast Asian Canadian communities*. Toronto, Ontario, Canada: The Chinese Canadian National Council.
- Levy, B. (1996). Improving memory in old age through implicit self-stereotyping. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 71, 1092-1107.

- Li, P. (1998). *The Chinese in Canada* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Don Mills, Ontario, Canada: Oxford University press.
- Li-Vollmer, M. (2002). Race representation in child-targeted television commercials. *Mass Communication & Society*, 5(2), 207-228.
- Lin, M., Kwan, V., Cheung, A., & Fiske, S. (2005). Stereotype content model explains prejudice for an envied outgroup: Scale of anti-Asian American stereotypes. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, 31(1), 34-47.
- Liu, S. (2006). An examination of the effects of print media exposure and contact on subjective social reality and acculturation attitudes. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 30, 365-382.
- Mahtani, M. (2001). Representing minorities: Canadian media and minority identities. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 33(3), 99-133.
- Marcia, J. (1980). Identity in adolescence. In J. Adelson (Ed.), *Handbook of adolescent psychology* (pp.159-187). New York: Wiley.
- Markus, H., & Kitayama, S. (1991). Culture and the self: Implications for cognition, emotion, and motivation. *Psychological Review*, 98, 224-253.
- Mastro, D., & Greenberg, B. (2000). The portrayal of racial minorities on prime time television. *Journal of Broadcasting and Electronic Media*, 44(4), 690-703.
- Matabane, P., & Merritt, H. (1996). African Americans on television: Twenty-five years after Kerner. *The Howard Journal of Communication*, 7, 329-337.
- Matsumoto, D. (2000). Evaluating cross-cultural research. In *Culture and psychology: People around the world* (pp. 105-136). Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.

- McCurrie, T. (1999). Asian gangs: A research note. *Journal of Gang Research, 6*(2), 47-51.
- McGrowen, M., & Lindgren, J. (2006). Testing the "model minority myth". *Northwestern University Law Review, 100*(1), 331-377.
- Miller, G., & Yang, J. (1997). Counseling Taiwanese Chinese in America: Training issues for counselors. *Counselor Education & Supervision, 37*(1), 22-35.
- Mok, T. (1998). Getting the message: Media images and stereotypes and their effect on Asian Americans. *Cultural Diversity and Mental Health, 4*(3), 185-202.
- Ornbey, S., & Horridge, P. (1998). The Suinn-Lew Self-Identity Acculturation Scale: Test with a non-student, Asian-American sample. *Social Behavior and Personality, 26*(1), 57-68.
- Oyserman, D., & Sakamoto, I. (1997). Being Asian-American: Identity, cultural constructs, and stereotype perception. *Journal of Applied Behavioral Science, 33*, 435-453.
- Paek, H., & Shah, H. (2003). Racial ideology, model minorities, and the "not-so-silent partner": Stereotyping of Asian Americans in U.S. magazine advertising. *Howard Journal of Communications, 14*(4), 225-243.
- Pan, Z., & Kosicki, G. (1996). Assessing news media influences on the formation of Whites' racial policy preferences. *Communication Research, 23*, 147-178.
- Pernice, R. (1994). Methodological issues in research with refugees and immigrants. *Professional Psychology, Research and Practice, 25*(30), 207-213.
- Phinney, J. (1989). Stages of ethnic identity development in minority group adolescents. *Journal of Early Adolescence, 9*, 34-49.



- Phinney, J. (1990). Ethnic identity in adolescents and adults: Review of research. *Psychological Bulletin, 108*(5), 499-514.
- Phinney, J. (1991). Ethnic identity and self-esteem: A review and integration. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 13*(2), 193-208.
- Phinney, J. (1992). The Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure: A new scale for use with diverse groups. *Journal of Adolescent Research, 7*(2), 156-176.
- Phinney, J. (2003). Ethnic identity and acculturation. In K. Chun, P. Organista, & G. Marin (Eds.), *Acculturation: Advances in theory, measurement, and applied research* (pp.63-82). Washington, D.C.: American Psychological Association.
- Phinney, J., & Alipuria, L. (1990). Ethnic identity in college students from four ethnic groups. *Journal of Adolescence, 13*, 171-183.
- Phinney, J., & Kohatsu (1997). Ethnic and racial identity development and mental health. In J. Schulenberg, J. Maggs, & K. Hurrelman (Eds.), *Health risks and developmental transitions in adolescence* (pp. 420-443). New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Pinel, E. (1999). Stigma consciousness: The psychological legacy of social stereotypes. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 76*(1), 114-128.
- Ponterotto, J., Baluch, S., & Carielli, D. (1998). The Suinn-Lew Asian Self-Identity Acculturation Scale (SL-ASIA): Critique and research recommendations. *Measurement & Evaluation in Counseling & Development, 32* (2), 109-125.
- Poornanada, D. (1998). Coverage of South Asia in two leading U.S. newspapers. *Media Asia, 25*(3), 161-165.

- Roberts, R., Phinney, J., Masse, L., Chen, Y., Roberts, C., & Romero, A. (1999). The structure of ethnic identity of young adolescents from diverse ethnocultural groups. *Journal of Early Adolescence, 19*(3), 301-322.
- Rosenberg, M. (1979). *Conceiving the self*. New York: Basic Books.
- Rosenberg, M. (1989). *Society and the adolescent self-image* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press.
- Smith, H. (1991). *The world's religions*. New York: Harper Collins
- Social Planning Council of Winnipeg (1996). *Media watch: A study of how visible minorities and aboriginal people are portrayed in Winnipeg's two major newspapers*. Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada: Social Planning Council of Winnipeg.
- Spencer, S., Steele, C., & Quinn, D. (1999). Stereotype threat and women's math performance. *Journal of Experimental Psychology, 35*, 4-28.
- Statistics Canada (2001). Retrieved January 6, 2006 from <http://www12.statcan.ca/english/census01/home/index.cfm>
- Steele, C. (1997). A threat in the air: How stereotypes shape intellectual identity and performance. *American Psychologist, 52*(6), 613-629/
- Steele, C., & Aronson, J. (1995). Stereotype threat and the intellectual test performance of African Americans. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 69*(5), 797-811.
- Stephan, W., Renfro, C., Esses, V., Stephan, C., & Martin, T. (2005). The effects of feeling threatening on attitudes toward immigrants. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations, 29*, 1-19.

- Sue, D. (1998). The interplay of sociocultural factors on the psychological development of Asians in America. In D. Atkinson, G. Morten, & D. Sue (Eds), *Counseling American minorities* (pp. 205-213). New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Sue, D.W., & Sue, D. (1990). Racial/cultural identity development. In D.W. Sue & D. Sue, *Counseling the culturally different: Theory and practice* (pp.93-117). New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Sue, D.W., & Sue, D. (2003). *Counseling the culturally diverse: Theory and practice* (4<sup>th</sup> ed.). New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Suinn, R., Rickard-Figueroa, K., Lew, S., & Vigil, P. (1987). The Suinn-Lew Asian Self-Identity Acculturation Scale: An Initial Report. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*, 47(2), 401-407.
- Suinn, R., Ahuna, C., & Khoo, G. (1992). The Suinn-Lew Asian Self-Identity Acculturation Scale: Concurrent and factorial validation. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*, 52(4), 1041-1046.
- Tajfel, H. (1978). *Differentiation between social groups: Studies in the social psychology of intergroup relations*. London: Academic Press.
- Tajfel, H. (1981). *Human groups and social categories: Studies in social psychology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Tajfel, H., & Turner, J. (1986). The social identity theory of intergroup behavior. In S. Worchel & W. Austin (Eds.), *Psychology of intergroup relations* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed., pp.7-24). Chicago: Nelson-Hall.

- Tan, A., Fujioka, Y., & Tan, G. (2000). Television use, stereotypes of African Americans and opinions on affirmative action: An affective model of policy reasoning. *Communication Monographs, 67*, 362-371.
- Taylor, S. (1981). A categorization approach to stereotyping. In D. Hamilton (Ed.), *Cognitive processes in stereotyping and intergroup behavior* (pp. 83-114). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Taylor, C., & Lee, J. (1994). Not in Vogue: Portrayals of Asian Americans in magazine advertising. *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing, 13*(2), 239-245.
- Taylor, C., Lee, J., & Stern, B. (1995). Portrayals of African, Hispanic, and Asian Americans in magazine advertising. *American Behavioral Scientist, 38*(4), 608-621.
- Taylor, C., & Stern, B. (1997). Asian-Americans: Television advertising and the "model minority" stereotype. *Journal of Advertising, 26*(2), 47-61.
- Thompson, P. (1995). *Handbook on Cross-Cultural Counselling*. Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada: Multicultural Association of Nova Scotia.
- Toupin, E., & Son, L. (1991). Preliminary findings on Asian Americans: "The model minority" in a small private east coast college. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 27*(3), 403-417.
- Trandis, H. (1989). The self and social behavior in differing cultural contexts. *Psychological Review, 96*(3), 506-520.
- Tsai, J., Ying, Y., & Lee, P. (2001). Cultural predictors of self-esteem: A study of Chinese American female and male young adults. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology, 7*(3), 284-297.

- Vergeer, M., Lubbers, M., & Scheepers, P. (2000). Exposure to newspapers and attitudes toward ethnic minorities: A longitudinal analysis. *The Howard Journal of Communication, 11*, 127-143.
- Walkey, F. & Chung, R. (1990). An examination of stereotypes of Chinese and Europeans held by some New Zealand secondary school pupils. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 27(1)*, 283-292.
- Wang, J. (2000). Asian gangs: New challenges in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. *Journal of Gang Research, 8(1)*, 51-62.
- Wang, Y., & Ollendick, T. (2001). A cross-cultural and developmental analysis of self-esteem in Chinese and Western children. *Clinical Child and Family Psychology Review, 4(3)*, 253-271.
- Wong, B. (2006). *Canada as a competitor in the global market for immigrants*. Plenary presentation at 8<sup>th</sup> National Metropolis Conference, Vancouver, BC, March 2006.
- Wong, F., & Halgin, R. (2006). The “model minority”: Bane or blessing for Asian Americans? *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 34(1)*, 38-49.
- Yee, A. (1992). Asians as stereotypes and students: Misperceptions that persist. *Educational Psychology Review, 4(1)*, 95-132.
- Yeh, C., & Huang, K. (1996). The collectivistic nature of ethnic identity development among Asian American college students. *Adolescence, 31(123)*, 645-662.

## APPENDIX A: Recruitment Poster

***CHINESE VOLUNTEERS  
NEEDED***

**What do you think about the  
way Chinese people are  
presented by the media???**

**We want to hear your opinion!**

Are you 18 years old or older?  
Are both your parents of Chinese heritage?  
Are you comfortable reading and writing in English?

If you answered yes, you are invited to participate  
in a study that is being conducted through the  
Department of Educational Psychology at  
the University of Alberta.

To find out more about the study, please contact:

**Christine**  
**Phone: 710-0679**  
**Email: [CML5@ualberta.ca](mailto:CML5@ualberta.ca)**

You will be paid \$10 for taking part in the study.

## APPENDIX B: Study Description

Chinese culture and Chinese individuals are coming up more often in North American television, newspapers and magazines. Sometimes information about the Chinese culture and Chinese people are presented in ways that are realistic and true. Other times the media presents information about Chinese culture that may be false, or that may not apply to all Chinese people in Canada. The kind of information that is mentioned by the media about Chinese culture could shape people's impressions of Chinese-Canadians.

In Canada, people differ in terms of how closely they hold onto their cultural heritage and how much they take on Western values and traditions. For my Master's thesis study, I want to find out what people of Chinese heritage think about magazine articles that talk about Chinese-Canadians. Furthermore, I want to see if Chinese people's views of magazine articles about their culture depend on how much they value their cultural heritage and themselves as Chinese-Canadians. The results of the study will help me understand how people of Chinese heritage feel about the way their culture is represented in the media. They will also help me to work to improve the impression people have of Chinese-Canadians.

If you choose to take part in this study, you will be asked to read an article that was published in a real magazine. Then you will be asked some questions about how you think it makes Chinese people look, and whether it creates a good or bad impression of Chinese culture. You will also be asked to fill out some surveys on your feelings about your cultural heritage and about yourself as a Chinese person. The study will only take 1 hour of your time. All the answers that you give will be kept private and you will be offered \$10 for taking part.

To take part in the study, you must:

- 1) be 18 years old or older
- 2) have both parents of Chinese heritage
- 3) feel comfortable reading and understanding English.

If you meet these criteria and would like to make an appointment, please contact me by phone at 710-0679 or by email at [CML5@ualberta.ca](mailto:CML5@ualberta.ca).

Thank you for your time.

Christine

## APPENDIX C: Consent Form

Sometimes TV programs, newspapers and magazines present the Chinese culture in ways that are realistic and true. Other times, the media gives information that may incorrectly describe Chinese people. Christine Lee, a Master's student in the Department of Educational Psychology at the University of Alberta, is doing a research study to learn what people of Chinese heritage think about magazine articles that talk about their culture. People keep their culture to different degrees after coming to Canada and Christine wants to see if Chinese people's views of articles about their cultural group are affected by how much they value their Chinese heritage and themselves as Chinese-Canadians. The results of the study will help Christine understand how people of Chinese heritage feel about the way their culture is represented in the media. It will also help her to work to improve people's impressions of Chinese-Canadians.

If I choose to take part in this study, I understand that I will be asked to read a real published magazine article about Chinese-Canadians. Then I will be asked some questions about how I think it makes Chinese-Canadians look and whether it creates a good or bad impression of the Chinese culture. I will also be asked to fill out some surveys about how much I value my cultural heritage and about myself as a Chinese person. I will read the article and fill out the surveys on my own in a classroom with other people taking part in the study at the same time. Christine will answer any questions I have about the study. The study will only take 1 hour of my time and I will be given \$10 for taking part. I will be given the phone numbers of places that can help me deal with how I am feeling if reading the magazine article upsets me in any way. I understand that it is my choice if I take part in this study or not. If I do participate, I can drop out at any time, without any questions or problems.

I understand that my answers to the surveys will be kept private and nobody will know that they are mine because Christine will take my name off and put a number on them. When the study is finished, all the people who took part in the study will have their information put together as a group. Only the group information will be shared with other researchers in papers about the study or in presentations. If I sign this form, I agree to take part in the study Christine is doing.

If I have any questions or concerns about this study, I know I can phone Christine Lee at 492-5245 or her supervisor, Dr. Noorfarah Merali, Associate Professor, at 492-1158, or the head of her department at the university, Dr. Linda McDonald at 492-2389. This study has gone through the University of Alberta's committee that makes sure that research is done properly and that people who take part in a study are treated well. If I have any concerns about how this study is being done or about my rights as a person taking part in it, I can contact the Faculties of Education and Extension Research Ethics Board at 492-3751.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Name of Participant (print)

\_\_\_\_\_  
Participant's Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
Researcher's Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date



## APPENDIX D: Positive Stimulus Magazine Article

**ARE ASIAN CANADIAN KIDS REALLY SMARTER?**

Published in Reader's Digest Magazine, volume 130

Shi Ling Tam, a 33-year-old computer technician who lives in Toronto, Ontario follows a schedule when she comes home from work. After preparing dinner, she spends two hours helping her ten-year-old son, Alan, with his homework. Alan is not allowed to watch television on weeknights, and if he plays with his G.I. Joe toys when he is supposed to be doing his schoolwork, his mother puts them away. "Helping my son to do well in school is a sacred duty; you want your family to do well," says Tam, who came to Canada in 1986. "I don't believe in letting kids do whatever they want."

Not surprisingly, Alan is near the top of his fifth-grade class, another in the rapidly growing number of academically successful Asian-Canadian students. Last spring, Asian-Canadians were awarded the top five prizes in the Westinghouse Science Talent Search, the most prominent science scholarship award for high school students. Statistics in the United States show that Asian students typically score around 520 out of a possible 800 on the math section of the Scholastic Aptitude Test, 30 points higher than whites.

Although Asian-Canadians make up only 2.1 percent of the population, you wouldn't know that from looking at the nation's best universities. At McGill University they constituted 11 percent of the first year class in the last school year; at UBC it was 18 percent. One quarter of undergraduates at the University of Toronto are also Asian-Canadians.

This extraordinary record has prompted a new series of studies to find out what lies behind their success. A few scholars believe Asians are genetically superior, with higher I.Q. levels. Harvard pediatrician T. Berry Brazelton suggests that Chinese and Japanese babies are very alert, quiet and sensitive at birth, conditions that set them up for faster learning. Most specialists believe the secret is cultural, rooted in traditional values of family and education. Others caution that these academically successful children are offspring of a unique immigrant group, the intellectual and professional elite of their home country.

Whether they favor nature or nurture, the new studies offer challenging insights into the state of the Canadian family and school. Sanford M. Dornbusch, professor of human biology, sociology and education at the University of Toronto, is conducting a study of six Toronto-area high schools. He has found that Asian-Canadians consistently get better grades than do other students, regardless of their parents' level of education or economic status. Indeed, the more English that was spoken in the students' homes—indicating a greater degree of assimilation into Canadian life—the poorer they tended to do in school. "To put it bluntly," says Dornbusch, "Canada may be a melting pot with low standards for its adolescents."

The most provocative findings come in a six-year study headed by University of Victoria psychologist Harold Stevenson, who compared students in kindergarten, first grade and fifth grade in Canada, China and Korea. Taking 240 children at each grade level from each country, Stevenson found significant disparities in performance. "At all levels, the Chinese kids were on top in math," he said. "The kids in Korea started out below the Canadian kindergarten kids in math, but they were better by the first grade."

In explaining these differences, Stevenson discounted the genetic factor. "We didn't find any difference in I.Q.," he said. "But if the differences are already appearing at the age of five in kindergarten, there must be something in the home."

It is here that almost all the studies converge. They find that Asian or Asian-Canadian parents are able to instill in their children a much greater motivation to work hard. In his

Toronto study, Dornbusch found that Asian-Canadians spent an average of 12 hours a week doing homework compared to 8.3 hours for white Canadians and 7.9 hours for black Canadians.

These findings are repeated in virtually all studies. For example, Stevenson's research showed that Canadian first-graders spent an average of 14 minutes a night on homework and disliked it; the Chinese spent 37 minutes, the Korean 77 minutes, and both liked it.

There are more subtle differences. Stevenson observed that Canadian students averaged a third less classroom time in academic activities than did their Asian counterparts, and Canadian teachers used more time giving directions and less time imparting information.

"It's an old-fashioned story—if you work hard, you do well," said Thomas Sowell, an economist at the Hoover Institution at Stanford who grew up in Harlem and has written extensively about race and education. "Asian parents are teaching a lesson that otherwise isn't being taught in North America anymore. Asian kids study harder than do white and black kids and are therefore getting better grades." His conclusion: "Work works."

The question is, then, *why* do Asian-Canadians work so hard? Stevenson feels they work harder largely because they share a greater belief in the efficacy of hard work and the malleability of human nature. "When we asked mothers from three countries what determined success in school," he said, "Chinese mothers gave the strongest rating to the idea that anyone can do well if he studies hard." Korean mothers were in close agreement. By contrast, Canadian mothers were most likely to attribute success to natural talent.

A classic example is Katherine Chen, who graduated from Lowell High School, a prominent public school in Ottawa with admission based on competitive tests, and a student body that is now 65-percent Asian-Canadian. Chen, who enrolled in McGill in the fall, was a straight-A student at Lowell. "In the Chinese family," she said, "education is very important because parents see it as the way to achieve. With that environment, it's natural to study. My friends are that way too. It's not a chore. They know the benefits."

In high school she did three hours of homework every night. Chen did watch some television after dinner, she said, "because my mom makes it a point that I relax. I also go to parties on the weekends." But, like many other Asian-Canadian students, she does not date. The preoccupation with the opposite sex is seen as dangerous and distracting by many Asian parents accustomed to a traditional society where children grow up more slowly.

The importance of family and education are themes that recur with Asian-Canadians. Jason Tang, for instance, arrived in the United States in 1980, after two years in a refugee camp in Malaysia for Vietnamese boat people. All he could say in English was, "How are you? I'm twelve." Tang had not been in a regular school since 1975, when he was a second-grader. His father, a shopkeeper, bought passage on a fishing boat for Tang and his three sisters. The father and mother stayed behind.

With great effort and devotion to his father's wishes, Tang has succeeded. In June, he graduated from high school with nearly a straight-A average and earned a four-year scholarship to the University of Alberta, where he is majoring in electrical engineering. He lives with two of his sisters, both of whom are attending university. They are virtually self-supporting, sharing a small two-bedroom apartment and managing to pay rent out of their earnings from part-time jobs. What has helped Tang's motivation, he said, is an obligation to his faraway parents. "I promised my father to do well and to uphold our family honor. My father spent so much to send me here, and I am determined to repay him."

## APPENDIX E: Negative Stimulus Magazine Article

**TERROR IN THE STREETS**

Published in Maclean's Magazine, volume 104

The group of Chinese-speaking youths seemed harmless in appearance. Two boys no taller than five feet, and apparently no older than 16, sat with four friends in the A Dong restaurant in downtown Toronto on March 3, drinking and taking turns singing from a small stage. At the next table, De Truong, a 28-year-old Chinatown cook, sat with a group of his friends. Then, at about 1:30 a.m., a quarrel erupted between the two tables and quickly led to a shoving match. After the brief scuffle ended, the teenagers left. De Truong remained with five friends. But minutes later, one of the teenagers returned with an older friend. Brandishing a 9-mm semi-automatic pistol and a machine-pistol, they aimed at the heads of their victims and opened fire. They left behind the bullet-riddled bodies of three men and a fourth victim with severe chest wounds. Said De Truong, who dove for cover but was grazed by a bullet: "When I opened my eyes, there were people lying all around, crying. I thought I was dying." The massacre established a grisly new threshold in a surge of Asian violence sweeping the country.

While Chinese criminal syndicates known as Triads have existed in North America for decades, those organizations have lost much of their control of street-level crime in Canada's Chinatowns to a new generation of more ruthless gangs. They are made up largely of recent arrivals from Vietnam and gangsters from mainland China and Hong Kong -- called Dai Huen Jai, or Big Circle Boys in English. Now, the growing number of such gangs has erupted into deadly rivalries. Said Toronto Police Constable Kent Bradbury: "These new Asian criminals are unbelievably ruthless. They're not afraid of pain, and they're not afraid to die. Every day that they're alive is just another day to them."

Their victims, moreover, are often not confined to criminal rivals. According to police, the slain and wounded in the A Dong shooting were unarmed and had no criminal associations. Their mistake was apparently to argue unwittingly with gang members. Meanwhile, the shootings led to expressions of outrage from spokesmen for millions of Asian Canadians. Said Alexis Yam, president of the Toronto Chinese Business Association: "As I understand it, these were ordinary people who were there just to have a good time. It's worse than the gang revenge killings of the past. We are shocked and frightened."

Gang rivalries have resulted in shootouts in Canada's major cities. The gangs are fighting for control of a wide range of lucrative illegal businesses. At the core of the struggles for power is the competition over illegal gaming houses. At night, gamblers, many of them respectable citizens during the day, meet in makeshift casinos in the backs of restaurants and cafes for high-stakes betting in games of Tai Xiu and Paigow. Police say that on some nights, hundreds of thousands of dollars change hands -- with the gaming house taking as much as \$50,000. The large sums of cash also make the gambling dens tempting targets for holdups. In one robbery last year that lasted two hours, Asian gangsters based in California stole \$100,000 in cash and jewelry from a Toronto gaming house. Added Toronto's Detective Michael Hovey: "It's much more profitable to rob a gaming house than a bank, because no one is likely to report a game hit."

Still, a mainstay of most crime networks is robbery in its various forms. Many of the gangs routinely extort protection money from Asian-owned jewelry stores, restaurants and gaming houses. Others use counterfeit credit cards obtained through gang connections in Hong Kong to buy luxury items for resale on the black market. But one of their most sinister practices is what police refer to as "home invasions." It is a method that takes advantage of

the fact that many Asian businessmen keep large amounts of cash in their homes rather than in banks. In those attacks, gang members break into a prosperous target's house, tie up the victim and beat him until he, or a family member, produces valuable items and money. A merchant in Vancouver told *Maclean's* that an associate who owns a Chinatown supermarket lost \$130,000 in a home invasion last year. The man, who was pistol-whipped, did not report the incident or seek hospital treatment for head wounds for fear of retaliation. Said the merchant: "It is very scary. The gangs know who keeps money at home."

Police say that the gangs at the forefront of more sophisticated forms of organized crime are the shadowy networks of Dai Huen Jai. In their most ambitious undertaking, the Dai Huen Jai have turned Canada into a trans-shipment destination for Asian heroin sold to buyers in the United States. Asian heroin now accounts for 80 per cent of the drug currently consumed by an estimated 750,000 U.S. addicts. The gangs ship processed opium from its source in the poppy fields of the so-called Golden Triangle where the borders of Burma, Thailand and Laos meet in Southeast Asia. They pay individual couriers to carry the drug by air through Thailand or Hong Kong to Vancouver and Toronto, where the heroin is normally delivered to a second smuggler for import into the United States.

The traffic is highly profitable. A pound of heroin purchased for less than \$900 in the Golden Triangle can be diluted and sold on the streets of Canada for \$90,000. Last month, the RCMP, U.S. authorities and Toronto police arrested seven people in a Dai Huen Jai network, based in that city, that had smuggled an estimated 1,200 lb. of heroin into North America over 2 years, earning a profit of \$72 million. Police say that the 40-person ring spanned the Golden Triangle, where it was likely supplied by the Thai opium warlord Khun Sa, and New York City, where its agents sold refined heroin directly to final distributors. Meanwhile, investigators claim that the 120 lb. of heroin that the RCMP and customs seized last year in Canada amounted to only a fraction of the total that was shipped through the country.

Members of the Dai Huen Jai traffic in bodies, as well. According to Toronto police intelligence officer Kenneth Yates, gang members provide forged documents and escorts to illegal immigrants from mainland China who want to move to Canada. For their services, they charge a fee of up to \$20,000 per person. Police estimate that alien smuggling rings continue to smuggle at least 50 illegal immigrants into Canada each week, and many of the new arrivals are paying off their debt to the gangs by working in otherwise legitimate Chinatown businesses for as little as \$2 per hour.

Fear of reprisals has made many victims of the gangs afraid to report their crimes to police. Said one Chinese restaurant owner and recent robbery victim in Calgary, who requested anonymity: "Asian criminals are mainly immigrants who grew up accustomed to blood and violent death. They prefer places that cater to Chinese because those people are afraid to go to the police. The victims know police cannot be there all the time -- and they know the gangs can be there 24 hours a day. They can get you."

That apprehension is one reason that police often find it difficult to solve serious crimes, such as gang shootings. Another problem for authorities is the expectation among many recent arrivals from Southeast Asia that Canadian police will be as corrupt as the forces in Hong Kong, Vietnam and China. But under the current reign of terror, some members of the Asian community are calling for more protection from police.

Meanwhile, detectives who investigated the shooting in Toronto's A Dong restaurant remain stunned by its unprovoked violence. Among the most alarming elements of that incident, they say, is the evidence that Asian gangs have armed school-age youngsters with automatic weapons. As well, experts assert that the growing pattern of shootings in public

places is placing Canadians of all backgrounds at risk. For the innocent victims of the carnage at the A Dong, that was a prediction that had already come to late.

## APPENDIX F: Article Evaluation Form

**While thinking about the article you just read, rate each statement on a scale of 1 to 5 by circling the appropriate number.**

1 = strongly disagree, 2 = disagree, 3 = neutral, 4 = agree, 5 = strongly agree

	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
The article was interesting.	1	2	3	4	5
The author clearly communicated his/her message.	1	2	3	4	5
The way the Chinese people are described in this article is accurate.	1	2	3	4	5
The article gives a positive impression of Chinese people.	1	2	3	4	5
The information in this article applies to most Chinese people.	1	2	3	4	5
In the article, Chinese people are presented in negative or bad way.	1	2	3	4	5
The article gives information that is true.	1	2	3	4	5
The article sends a message that Chinese people have a negative impact on Canadian society.	1	2	3	4	5
I would want to read more about this topic.	1	2	3	4	5
An article like this should not have been published.	1	2	3	4	5

## APPENDIX G: Demographic Information Form

Age: \_\_\_\_\_

Gender:  Male  FemaleMarital Status:  Married  Separated/ Divorced  Widowed  Single

Country where you were born:

 Canada  United States  Other: \_\_\_\_\_ (please specify)

How old were you when you came to Canada? \_\_\_\_\_

How long have you lived in Canada? \_\_\_\_\_

Citizenship status:

 Canadian citizen  Landed Canadian immigrant  In Canada on student visa  Other

First language that you learned: \_\_\_\_\_

Second language that you learned: \_\_\_\_\_

Highest level of Education:

- Some high school
- Graduated high school
- Trade/ technical training (e.g. NAIT)
- Some university or college education
- Completed an undergraduate or college degree
- Some graduate level studies (Master's or Doctorate level)
- Completed a graduate degree

Occupation (check all that apply):

- Employed full-time as: \_\_\_\_\_
- Employed part-time as: \_\_\_\_\_
- Currently unemployed
- Student

On a scale from 1 to 7, how would you rate your ability to read and write English?

(compared to people who speak English as a first language)

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Poor						Excellent

You are now finished the study.

Please place your questionnaires into the envelope and return it to the researcher.

**THANK YOU!**

## APPENDIX H: Debriefing Form

**STUDY EXPLANATION**

**Research Project:** Chinese Culture in the Media  
Department of Educational Psychology, University of Alberta

**Researcher:** Christine Lee, Master's student- 492-5245, cml5@ualberta.ca  
**Research Supervisor:** Dr. Noorfarah Merali- 492-1158, noorfarah.merali@ualberta.ca  
**Department Chair:** Dr. Linda McDonald- 492-2389, linda.mcdonald@ualberta.ca

Thank you for taking the time to take part in this study. You may have noticed that in TV programs, newspapers and magazines, Chinese people are sometimes presented as “model minorities”, or people who are smart, hard working and successful. Other times, Chinese people are shown negatively as gang members or illegal immigrants. At the beginning of the study you were told that I wanted to find out if your opinion of the article you were reading is affected by how much you value your cultural group and yourself as a Chinese person. What I actually wanted to learn is whether the type of magazine article you read about the Chinese culture might change how you feel about yourself and your cultural heritage. So, in this study, some people were given a magazine article that had a positive description of Chinese-Canadians, and some people were given an article with a negative description of Chinese people. If magazine articles that make Chinese culture look bad make people feel badly about their own cultural heritage and articles that make Chinese culture look good make people feel good about their culture, then it would be important to find ways to help all Chinese people feel good about their cultural heritage, even though there are different messages coming from the media.

If you had known what I was looking for before you took part in the study, you may have felt like I wanted you to answer the survey questions a certain way. I wanted you to feel free to answer with your real opinions and feelings. For the study results to turn out, it is important that people who take part not know how the study is designed. For this reason, I ask that you *do not share the details of this study with people you know*, because they could be taking part in the study in the future.

If you have any questions or concerns about the study, please feel free to contact Christine or Dr. Merali. If reading the magazine article upset you in any way, you can call any of the numbers below to help you deal with how you are feeling.

Catholic Social Services – 420-1970  
Cornerstone Counselling – 482-6215  
The Family Centre – 424-5580  
Jewish Family Services – 454-1190

***THANK YOU FOR TAKING PART IN THIS STUDY!!!***