"We Embrace Winter Here": Place and Placemaking in Winter Cities

by

Madeleine Stout

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

in

Human Geography

Department of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences
University of Alberta

Abstract

The concept of 'winter cities' speaks to a particular relationship between place and winter. However, winter cities are largely under examined in urban research, particularly Canadian cities. This thesis asks *what type of place is a winter city and what types of placemaking occur in this context?* Using a multi-case study design, this thesis examines three self-described winter cities: Edmonton, Saskatoon, and Winnipeg. Through semi-structured interviews and participant observation, this thesis develops a discursive account of winter city places and placemaking. This thesis is informed by influential theorizations of place by Relph (1976; 2016), Massey (1994), and Cresswell (2009; 2015) and develops linkages with conceptualizations of *weather* place (Vannini et al, 2012).

Winter cities are weather places: the weather has a particularly profound effect on our experience of winter cities, and in turn winter cities have a profound effect on our experience of weather. Historically, the confluence of modernism, suburbanization, and deindustrialization resulted in city planning and infrastructure which was insensitive to local weather conditions. Today, this thesis finds that winter cities are shaped by an imperative to celebrate winter through addressing its challenges and realizing its opportunities. Winter cities are sites of authentic, place-specific celebration via direct engagement with winter weather through outdoor public space, recreation, and festivals.

In this context, placemaking must remain attentive to the specifics of place. While contemporary festivals are often deployed as instruments of neoliberal place branding and marketing exercises, placemaking in winter cities has not prioritized external parties at the expense of community benefits. Specifically, in winter cities, festivals seek to tell authentic stories about place and

culture. They are a site for challenging negative perceptions of winter, locally and more broadly. Winter festivals (and winter cities more generally) navigate the interplay of warm and cold, indoor and outdoor spaces, and light and dark in order to celebrate winter. While these festivals are incorporated into marketing a unique place identity, they are primarily concerned with community celebration.

Preface

This thesis is an original work by Madeleine Stout. The research project, of which this thesis is a part, received research ethics approval from the University of Alberta Research Ethics Board, Project Name "Liveable for Whom? Winterizing the Prairie City", Pro00075257, July 27, 2017.

Acknowledgments

Completing this thesis would not have been possible on my own and is, in many ways, a culmination of the support and guidance I have received throughout my life.

First, I would like to thank my incredible supervisors, Dr. Damian Collins and Dr. Joshua Evans. I have learned so much from this process because of your continuous support and thoughtful feedback. Dr. Evans, thank you for the time you took to find value in my work, even when I struggled to see it myself. Our theoretical and conceptual conversations were invaluable in the development of my ideas. Dr. Collins, thank you for your support and feedback not just over the course of this thesis, but throughout my undergrad as well. It has undoubtedly made me a much stronger writer and researcher and ultimately led me to this project. Thank you to you both for continuing to be present, patient, and supportive supervisors even when COVID turned all our lives upside down.

Thank you to the CLUE members, old and new: Ariel, Alexandra, Bon, Laura, Kenna, and Sophie. Your camaraderie, insights, and support were so appreciated throughout the ups and downs of this process. Thank you to Sophie and Ariel for helping me navigate university bureaucracy and always being generous with your time, thoughts, and encouragement.

Thank you Ariel, Kenna, Meryn, Sophie and Zach for your feedback on my defence presentation.

Mum, Dad, Emma, and Alexandra: thank you for your love and support even when I was at my most stressed and grumpy (especially when I was at my most stressed and grumpy).

Thank you to Meryn for your unwavering belief in me. Thank you to Charlotte for simultaneously inspiring me to be better and always asking how you can help. Thank you to Christopher for unreservedly loving winter with me.

Thank you to Zach for listening to my long rambly phone calls and asking such fantastic questions. Thank you to Liza for reminding me of beautiful things and being so quick to offer

your help no matter the situation. Thank you to you both for sending me 48 Montreal bagels to fuel me through the final weeks.

Thank you to 99 Supermarket for the supply of tofu puffs and roti.
Thank you to Bon, Brittany, and Katrina for listening to me whine and those much needed evenings spent unwinding and eating too many peanut M&Ms. Thank you to Katrina for being the world's most patient roommate and my dearest companion.

List of Tables

1. Introduction

1.1. Winter in the City

Experiences and understandings of winter vary across the globe. Aomori in Northern Japan is often credited with being the snowiest city in the world; residents experience an average snowfall of 669cm per year (Japan Meteorological Agency, n.d.). In contrast, Auckland, New Zealand seldom reaches 0°C but residents still understand the period of May-September as winter, with some having negative and unhealthy winter experiences due to poorly heated and insulated housing stock (Serjeant, 2019). In Canada, winter is often understood as part of a shared national experience and identity, despite a huge range of winter weather conditions.

Reaching a definition for what constitutes a 'winter city' is complicated by this diversity of winter conditions. 'Winter cities' is sometimes used synonymously with 'northern cities'; latitude has used been to define winter cities in the past (Gappert, 1987), but factors like proximity to the sea and prevailing winds (e.g. the gulf stream) can result in wildly different climates across the same latitude (Cui, Allan, and Lin, 2010). This also excludes cities at high altitudes and high southern latitudes that may experience similar winter weather (Davies, 2015).

Winter weather is typically understood to include cold temperatures. What constitutes cold, however, is broad and relative. Pressman (1985a) suggests two categories of winter city climate: those with an average January temperature below zero and those with an average January temperature above zero (although this also reflects presumed northern hemisphere). Winter cities in China are understood to have an average daily air temperature below 0°C for more than three months in a year, along with snow and ice (Leng et al, 2020). Indeed, precipitation is another key but varying feature of winter weather. Some cities see high volumes of snow while others contend with mixed rain-snow and freeze-thaw cycles resulting in icy conditions. Many high latitude winter cities also feature short days and minimal sunlight in winter, with those in the polar circle experiencing polar twilight and polar night: periods of the year where the sun does not rise above the horizon and night may last over 24 hours. Wind can also contribute to varying winter weather, both directly and indirectly due to its impact on broader weather patterns. Cold temperatures, darkness, precipitation, ground conditions (e.g. slush/snow/ice), and wind all contribute to

(diverse) winter experiences (Pressman, 1985a). This diversity of conditions is part of what makes winter experiences extremely place-specific, even within the category of winter cities.

This place-specificity is furthered by how these climatic conditions interact with the built environment. Historically, the interaction of climate with the urban environment has posed challenges to urban life (Stout et al, 2018; Chapman et al, 2019). These challenges have largely stemmed from the detrimental interactions between climate and place-insensitive forms of modernism and urbanization. Within planning and related professions, modernism prioritized standardization and efficiency over vernacular styles and local climatic conditions (Samalavicius, 2017). This had a particular impact on winter cities, in the form of approaches to building and design that were increasingly insensitive to *genius loci* (Pressman, 1996). Places became increasingly indistinguishable from each other: building spacing, street orientation, and housing styles came to be similar from downtown Toronto, Ontario, to Phoenix, Arizona, despite their drastically different climates (Bosselmann, Arens, Dunker, & Wright, 1995). Modernism disregarded the "special local flavour of the north" in favour of sameness (Erskine, 1968, p. 166).

This is not to say modernism ignored the reality of winter entirely. Rather, it sought to "design out" winter, limiting exposure to weather conditions through technological intervention (Stout et al, 2018; Farish and Lackenbauer, 2009). Indoor spaces (e.g. malls, enclosed pedestrian systems) offered "a steady-state, thermally neutral environment (constant temperature and humidity regardless of natural conditions), where 'indoors' and 'outdoors' are no longer connected or related" (Pressman, 1996, p. 522). While winter conditions still impacted choices and behaviour, cities could be navigated without directly experiencing winter conditions, as in Toronto's underground pedestrian system, which is set at 22°C year-round (Zepic, 1987).

Outside, however, these modernist designs exacerbated winter conditions. High-rise towers cast shadows and created wind tunnels, limiting the warmth of outdoor public spaces downtown (Watanabe et al, 2017). Infrastructure like enclosed pedestrian systems was expensive to build and heat and functioned as quasi-public space despite being privately regulated (e.g. opening hours, expulsion of some users). While maximizing sunlight can help minimize heating costs, factors such as the aspect of the sun were not considered (Watanabe et al, 2017; Stout et al, 2018). At street level, the prioritization of automobile traffic flow negatively impacted pedestrian safety and accessibility, both through the direct hazards presented by cars and indirectly through barriers such as roadside snowbanks (Davies, 2015).

Automobile prioritization at the expense of other forms of mobility and the quality of public space is a key feature of the contemporary North American city. In addition to modernism, suburbanization and its associated sprawl, land use separation, and automobile dominance have also exacerbated winter conditions in cities. Decentralization and the ubiquity of private vehicles in northern North American cities has resulted in larger distances between residents and work and essential services (Davies, 2015; Pressman, 1988). This distance reduces the efficiency and desirability of services like public transit (especially in winter) and makes winter-specific operations such as snow clearance more expensive (Pressman, 1988). This can be detrimental to public space in particular, resulting in undesirable suburban public spaces in winter with ice, snow or slush covered sidewalks, windswept culs-de-sac, and outdoor public spaces designed without consideration for winter conditions or activities (Kehm, 1985; Zepic, 1987; Chapman et al, 2019). Davies (2015) elaborated on how the combined forces of modernism and suburbanization interacted to the detriment of winter cities:

> Unfortunately, the traditional practices that adapted settlements to the extremes of their local environment were increasingly ignored from the early twentieth century. Older and tested building practices were replaced with new house designs more suited to temperate environments, based on cheap fossil energy sources and materials brought from considerable distances. In northern lands these modernizing influences, especially under the impact of suburbanization, started to dominate… As a result, many of these settlements were badly adapted to the often severe conditions of winter, making them less sustainable and more placeless, and containing many residents who viewed winter as a season to be endured, rather than welcomed. (p. 278)

Together, these two approaches to city building have not only worsened the negative aspects of winter but have also failed to maximise the beneficial aspects. In many instances, these outcomes were exacerbated by deindustrialization in the 1970s-80s, which saw many northern cities lose much of their economic base, further undermining their appeal (Gappert, 1987; Pressman, 1988).

1.2. The Winter Cities Movement

In response to this confluence of factors, the Winter Cities Movement emerged in the 1980s, seeking to flip the script: specifically, to "reduce winter's negative consequences and… emphasize its positive features and opportunities" (Davies, 2015, p. 278). The movement "is a

design and behavioural approach to improve the quality of life in northern settlements" through addressing both the negative and positive aspects of winter (Davies, 2015, p. 307). Blumenfeld (1985) states that "specific measures to enhance livability in winter can be sought in two directions: increase in the enjoyment of winter's positive aspects, and protection from the negative ones" (p. 47).

Winter is understood to have negative and positive aspects, presenting both challenges and opportunities. Although Pressman (1988, p. 22) emphasized the "fundamental beauty" of winter, it does not have a purely positive connotation, even in the Winter Cities literature (which eschews a simplistic 'winter is good' narrative). The movement does not seek to ignore the very real challenges posed by winter, but nor does it understand winter as simply an obstacle to overcome. It seeks "to ensure that winter is better coped with and celebrated, not just endured" through acknowledging the relationship between the built form and weather and attending to how this relationship impacts experiences of winter cities (Davies, 2015, p. 307).

To realize this goal, much literature on winter cities focuses on creating warmer microclimates in public space through designs which consider sun, wind, and snow. In one of the earliest contributions on climate sensitive design, Erksine (1968) suggests that:

> Houses and towns should open like flowers to the sun of spring and summer but, also like flowers, turn their backs on the shadows and the cold northern winds, offering sun-warmth and wind protection to their terraces, gardens and streets. (p. 167)

To this effect, wind simulations are often used to examine how buildings can be designed to shelter pedestrians from the wind, especially in city centres (see Meng and Setoguchi, 2010; Lee, 2020). Some studies have paired wind and snow simulations to consider how buildings impact snow drifts and how wind can enable natural snow clearing (Wantanabe et al, 2017). Sun shadow analyses are also used, particularly in relation to open public space such as parks and ice rinks, to consider how to maximize sunlight (see Davies 2014; Lee, 2020). Both neighbouring buildings and landscaping choices (e.g., the placement and type of trees planted) can contribute to developing warmer microclimates in these spaces, as well as orienting seating and gathering areas to capture low-angle sun (see McDonald-Yale and Birchall, 2021).

Snow design considerations are often discussed in the context of enabling soft mobility (also called non-motorized transport or active transportation). These design guidelines often consider

safety (e.g., slipping hazards) and snow clearance and storage (including consideration of water and slush during melting) (Chapman et al, 2018). Canopies, arcades, or similar overhead structures can also be used to shelter pedestrians from snow and rain. In the context of bicycling specifically, there are a number of considerations to ensure clear, safe bike lanes. These include leaving space for snow accumulation, choice of paving materials, snow removal techniques (e.g., calcium chloride), and warming bike lanes with the sun or other mechanisms to melt ice and snow (Cai and Pei, 2021).

In addition to pragmatic design considerations, there is also discussion of beauty and a winter aesthetic. The Winter Cities Movement contends that designs should be inspired by local culture and history as well as nature (Erskine, 1968; Pressman, 1996). Given the variation of winter experiences from place to place, authentic designs inspired by local contexts are both more appropriate and reinforce unique place identity. Creative uses of bright and colourful lighting, particularly in key outdoor public spaces, are often cited as an example (Davies, 2015).

Some early winter cities literature commends the extension of indoor spaces for commerce, socialization and movement as a way to protect residents from the cold while supporting key urban economic activities. Infrastructure like climate controlled, grade-separated pedestrian systems were understood as place-sensitive responses and "a partial solution to the problem of winter" (Gappert, 1987, p. 11; see also Pressman, 1989). Since then, however, this approach of sheltering and disconnecting residents from the experiencing weather has been critiqued as insulating people from place. The alternative approach values outdoor, publicly owned space, and envisions the vibrancy and utilization of such space as key to quality of life in winter cities. Rather than focusing on indoor space, this approach views the presence of people outdoors to be intrinsically valuable and seeks to activate outdoor public spaces through the winter months. Winter recreation, as well as seasonally themed events and festivals, are popular ways of encouraging engagement with winter in public space (Pressman, 1987). This emphasis on making use of outdoor public space follows from the value attached to celebrating winter, rather than ignoring it or seeking to neutralize it. Both approaches understand indoor and outdoor space as distinct and separate entities, leaving two options: protect residents with interventions that bring people inside or encourage them to remain outside and engage with winter weather directly.

It is worth noting that not all urban residents have access to warm, safe, indoor spaces. Design interventions in public space and winter festivals will not enable all residents to enjoy winter equally. Age, health, mobility, and access to resources may limit an individual's ability to

appreciate the "beauty intrinsic to winter" (Pressman, 1985a, p. 15). With some exceptions (see Pressman, 1985a; 1985b; 1987; 1988), there is minimal engagement in winter cities literature with social differences. Indeed, despite the "imperative of improving the utilization and vibrancy of outdoor public space," winter cities literature seldom acknowledges the "socially stratified and often conflictual qualities of public space" (Stout et al, 2018, p. 2).

While Davies (2015) contends that "improv[ing] the life of the most vulnerable" is a primary aim of the Winter Cities movement (p. 279), city strategies and policies informed by the movement seek primarily to "ameliorate winter for a universal urban citizen (healthy, able-bodied and with discretionary time and income), creating opportunities for outdoor recreation and associated consumption opportunities," without addressing the fact that for some, "winter can be a life or death matter rather and not just a season lacking in recreational activities" (Stout et al, 2018, pp. 8-9).

1.3. This Research

This research is less concerned with specific physical design interventions. Instead, it seeks to examine winter cities as places. Design is not irrelevant here, as "the physical component of a place can be designed to influence the site-specific microclimate and consequently people's place-related attendance, perceptions and emotions" (Eliasson et al, 2007, p. 83). But rather than consider design changes that may "improve" winter cities as places, this thesis seeks to describe or "place" winter cities in the context of current place theory and placemaking literature. Much of the influential, conceptual work on winter cities (e.g., Pressman) was published in the 1980s and 1990s. As such, "cornerstone" publications in this area are dated and have not engaged with current contexts (Chapman et al, 2018). Additionally, this thesis gives particular attention to medium sized, Canadian prairie cities which have been largely excluded from urban research and are seldom a focus in winter city literature.

This thesis asks *what type of place is a winter city and what types of placemaking occur in this context?* Three cities on the Canadian prairies (Edmonton, Saskatoon and Winnipeg) have been selected as case study sites. In order to answer this question, this thesis address the following objectives:

1. To describe the relationship between place and winter in winter cities
2. To examine placemaking in winter cities

In order to develop this discursive account of winter cities, this thesis begins with a literature review of relevant scholarship on place and placemaking. Chapter 3 outlines case study selection criteria, primary data collection methods, and summarizes how data was analyzed. Chapter 4 provides contextual information on the case study cities, such as climate and population. The results of this research are covered in Chapter 5. It is divided into two main sections: the first features vignette accounts of winter festivals and the second presents main themes from key informant interviews. In Chapter 6, these results are discussed in the context of the literature reviewed in Chapter 3. Finally, Chapter 7 presents a summary of the thesis and concluding remarks.

2. Literature Review

This section reviews the literature on two concepts relevant to this thesis: place and placemaking. The first section examines relevant and influential conceptions of place and the relationship between place and weather. The second section examines the process of placemaking, paying particular attention to the role of festivals.

2.1. Place

Despite the fact the term is accessible and widely used, "common sense uses of the word place belie its conceptual complexity" (Cresswell, 2009, p. 169). "Restless if not contentious," place is a central (perhaps *the* central) concept in geography (Liu and Freestone, 2016, p. 1). Grappling with the definition of place is not merely an exercise in defining an entity, it is an attempt to describe "a way of understanding the world" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 18). Places have "a discursive/symbolic meaning well beyond that of mere location," making them essential tools for deciphering social processes and phenomena (Harvey, 1996, p. 293).

This section provides an overview of influential and relevant theories of place, primarily from Cresswell (2009; 2015), Relph (1976; 2016), and Massey (1994). The literature review outlines an important shift from a rooted and bounded understanding of place to a "progressive sense of place" (Massey, 1994). This shift is directly related to the ways in which modernization and in particular mobility have necessitated a dynamic geographic analysis of society; a static and bounded conception of place is an inadequate framework for examining complex social phenomena. Instead, place is understood as fluid, heterogeneous, and simultaneously being constructed by and constructing society. This review also examines literature specifically on weather and place, drawing extensively on Vannini et al (2012), as examining weather can "help reveal broader social processes around place" and its specific context (Butts and Adams, 2020, p. 1).

Cresswell (2015) describes place as "spaces which people have made meaningful... this is the most straightforward and common definition of place – a meaningful location" (p. 12). This description is consistent with the majority of place literature, which understands place as "investing space with meaning" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 19). Cresswell (2009) breaks this idea of place down further, suggesting that "in any given place we encounter a combination of materiality,

meaning, and practice" (p. 169). *Materiality* refers to the physical elements of a place, including both natural features (e.g., rivers, mountains) and the built environment. *Meaning* captures a broad range of connections to place, ranging from individual and personal connections to shared societal significance. Lastly, "places are practiced. People do things in place. What they do, in part, is responsible for the meanings that a place might have" (Cresswell, 2009, p. 169). Indeed, these elements are not discrete, distinct ingredients for place but rather their complex and even recursive relationships specify place. Cresswell (2009) explains:

> Materiality, meaning, and practice are all linked. The material topography of place is made by people doing things according to the meanings they might wish a place to evoke. Meanings gain a measure of persistence when they are inscribed into the material landscape but are open to contestation by practices that do not conform to the expectations that come with place. Practices often do conform to some sense of what is appropriate in a particular place and are limited by the affordances particular material structures offer. (p. 170)

Cresswell illustrates how the interactions between these elements make up places. Place is not, however, solely the sum of materiality, meaning and practice. While largely understood as socially constructed, place is in turn "primary to the construction of meaning and society" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 50). In reference to the works of Malpas (1999) and Sack (1997), Cresswell (2015) remarks that "society itself is inconceivable without place – that the social (and the cultural) is geographically constructed" (p. 49). Understanding this dialectical relationship between place and society is necessary for examining socio-spatial phenomena, including how hegemony is asserted through place to maintain power and how different axes of identity manifest across places. Place can be understood as "a process where the activities of people and institutions produce and are produced by social structures that are saturated with power. Place is produced through action and action is produced in place through a constant reiterative process" (Cresswell, 2009, p. 175 citing Pred, 1984). Place and society are in an ongoing, complex, mutually constitutive relationship. The relationship between society and place is further complicated by identity being formed across multiple sites: cosmopolitanism entails place identity that is "based on mobility, communication, and a diverse set of allegiances to more than one place" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 81). In response to this complexity, scholars have devoted considerable attention to questions of how modernism and mobility have transformed the society-place relationship leading to, in some instances, placelessness.

2.1.1. Place and Placelessness

2.1.1.1. Authenticity and Place

An authentic relationship with place is "a direct and genuine experience of the entire complex of the identity of places" (Relph, 1976, p. 64). Relph's (1976) understanding of authenticity stems from phenomenology and "comes from a full awareness of places for what they are as products of man's intentions and the meaningful settings for human activities, or from a profound and unselfconscious identity with place" (p. 64). For Relph (1976), authentic relationships are a necessary and constitutive component of place. This is consistent with much of humanistic geography, which has understood individuals and society to be "directly present to the world and in authentic existence a person lives [their] life in full awareness of this basic and inescapable relationship" (Relph, 1976, p. 64). Place in this context is akin to "rootedness" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 71).

Relph (1976) was concerned that this authentic sense of place was being diminished due to the increasing prevalence of place*lessness,* "the casual eradication of distinctive places and the making of standardized landscapes that results from an insensitivity to the significance of place" (Relph, 1976, Preface). Relph developed the idea of placelessness to describe "landscapes [that] lack distinctiveness and have little connection with their geographical contexts" (Relph, 2016, p. 21). He was critical of the absence of distinguishing features and the uniqueness typically associated with places. Placelessness, he argued, was produced by modernist designs which "explicitly rejected everything old, celebrated the future, used universally available materials of metal, glass, and concrete, and were intended to work equally well everywhere" (Relph, 2016, p. 21). Forces such as standardized planning lacking local sensitivity, mass production, and increased mobility contributed to "the weakening of the identity of places to the point where they not only look alike but feel alike and offer the same bland possibilities for experience" (Relph, 1976, p. 90).

Of these forces, Relph makes a particular connection to mobility in the production of inauthentic placelessness. As "a sense of place must be developed authentically through extended association" (Liu and Freestone, 2016, p. 5), mobility at many scales (from moving neighbourhood to changing country to travel and tourism) is a threat to authentic sense of place. An inauthentic sense of place is "essentially no sense of place, for it involves no awareness of the deep and symbolic significance of places and no appreciation of their identities" (Relph, 1976, p. 82). This

disconnection from the meaning of places, as well less time spent engaging in practices in place and decreasing use of place-specific materials have eroded authentic relationships with place. As Cresswell (2015) explains, "Relph connects various forms of increased mobility to what he calls 'mass culture' and mass values which again dilute authentic relations to place" (p. 78).

2.1.1.2. Mobility and Place

Relph was not the only one to consider the impacts of modernism and mobility on the role and relevance of place (see Auge, 1995). However, many subsequent engagements with place have critiqued and challenged the idea that modernity and authenticity are at odds. Harvey (1996) points out that "the issue of authenticity (rootedness) of the experience of place (and nature of place) is, for example, a difficult one. To begin with . . . the problem of authenticity is itself peculiarly modern," contending that authenticity was not conceivable prior to modern industrialization (p. 302). Cresswell (2015) elaborates:

> We live in a world in which the "end of geography" has frequently been heralded. Leaving aside the fact that mobility is every bit as geographical as place, this seems to suggest that place (as well as things such as nation-states and borders) has become less important as the world has become more connected and more mobile. This is not the case. Mobility has always been part of place... places are produced, through mobilities, by their connections to a world beyond. (p. 84)

Massey (1994) was particularly critical of casting place and mobility as mutually exclusive. Responding to the experience of rapid globalization as "transport, communications, and institutional support for global capital... conspired to seemingly make places less important – less unique" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 89), Massey took issue with understanding place "as a static and rooted reaction to a dynamic and mobile world" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 102). Instead, she proposed a "progressive sense of place" that understood the (re)constitutive relationship between mobility and place. Rather than understand place as lessened by globalization, Massey (1994) asked "can't we rethink our sense of place? Is it not possible for a sense of place to be progressive...? A sense of place which is adequate to this era of time-space compression?" (p. 147). She argued that mobility and other technological advancements (e.g., electronic communication) are not threats to place but rather that the movement of people, ideas, and materials resulted in the production of specific places through connections. Cresswell (2009) explains:

Places to Massey are not clearly bounded, rooted in place, or connected to single homogeneous identities but produced through connections to the rest of the world and therefore are more about routes than roots. They are sites of heterogeneous, not homogeneous, identities. (p. 176)

Cresswell summarizes three key components of Massey's argument. First, places are not (necessarily) bounded. Massey criticizes understanding place as bounded, as focusing on borders "tends to negate the multitude of flows that cross boundaries constantly" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 105). Second, "rootedness" and place are not synonymous. Massey challenges understanding of places as "rooted" in history. She does not dismiss this connection altogether but argues that "any place history is always also a history of journeys and connections" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 104). And third: place identities are heterogenous. Massey (1994) argued against the idea that places have "single, unique 'identities'" and suggests instead that "they are full of internal conflicts" (p. 155). Consequently, Massey (1994) maintains that the specificity of places not only endures, but may be bolstered by globalizing forces:

> Globalization (in the economy, or in culture, or in anything else) does not entail simply homogenization. On the contrary, the globalization of social relations is yet another source of (the reproduction of) geographical uneven development, and thus of the uniqueness of place. There is the specificity of place which derives from the fact that each place is the focus of a distinct mixture of wider and more local social relations. (pp. 155–156)

Place-specificity, she explains, is not compromised by globalizing forces, but *intensified* by how the unique mixture of local context and connections to elsewhere have shaped each other. Critically, she noted that the "power-geometry of space time compression" contributes to this specificity through the uneven distribution of mobility:

> For different social groups, and different individuals, are placed in very distinct ways in relation to these flows and interconnections. This point concerns not merely the issue of who moves and who doesn't, although that is an important element of it; it is also about power in relation *to* the flows and the movement. Different social groups have distinct relationships to this anyway differentiated mobility: some people are more in charge of it than others; some initiate flows and movement, others don't; some are more on the

receiving-end of it than others; some are effectively imprisoned by it "(Massey, 1994, p. 149, original emphasis)

Massey explains that power relations in place are more complicated than 'have' and 'have not.' The 'haves' can dictate who else 'has' and 'has not' and to what extent: "mobility, and control over mobility, both reflects and reinforces power" (Massey, 1994, p. 150). This is further to Massey's argument that places are heterogeneous, reflecting a complex distribution of power and the resultant multiplicity of experiences specific to a place. Massey demonstrates that place and its constitutive mobilities are shaped by power relations *and* power is produced and shaped by place.

2.1.1.3. The Paradox of Place

Massey criticizes the idea that modernity and globalization lessen place as presented in Relph's 1976 discussion of placelessness. However, in the 2016 book *Place and Placelessness Revisited*, Relph and others re-examine his 1970s conceptualizations of placelessness. Relph (1976) was responding to how, after the Second World War, modernism created interchangeable "flatscapes," prioritizing uniformity and standardization at the expense of distinctive places" (Relph, 1976, p. 117). Since then, however, "increased mobility, international migrations, and electronic communications… together have turned places everywhere into networked hybrids of distinctiveness and sameness" (Relph, 2016, p. 21). Place and placelessness cannot be understood as discrete and mutually exclusive, argues Relph, but instead as "tangled manifestations" of similarities and differences (Relph, 2016, p. 21). Relph (2016) calls this the "the paradox of place":

> [Place] is always a function both of difference from, and similarities with, other equivalent places. A truly unique place would be incomprehensible, and if all places were the same the very idea of them would be nonsense. To appreciate the distinctive identity of somewhere requires understanding its sameness with elsewhere. This is the paradox of place. Distinctiveness is defined by reference to sameness. (p. 20)

As Relph explains, place not only includes elements of differences and sameness; place is *defined* by the simultaneous existence of these seemingly contradictory components. He uses the term 'hybridity' to describe this simultaneity of place and placelessness, difference and sameness: "almost everywhere is now a peculiar amalgam of place and non-place, layered, a blend, a composite, a synthesis, a gathering, a hybrid of different histories and geographies"

(Relph, 2016, p. 31). Hybridity is not a new phenomenon, but has become increasingly significant since Relph was first writing in the 1970s:

> Local practices have always been modified by knowledge from elsewhere. The difference now is that former limitations to moving people, things, and ideas around, and which once contributed enormously to making and preserving distinctive place identities, have been transcended. Experiences associated with lifetimes rooted in just one or two places were narrow but deep. They have been widely supplanted by experiences of many places visited briefly or lived in for a few months or years, experiences that are broad and comparative yet relatively shallow. Broad experiences inevitably import practices and ideas from elsewhere, integrating them with whatever is locally distinctive. The resulting hybridity of distinctiveness and sameness has become an unavoidable aspect of contemporary everyday place experience. (Relph, 2016, p. 27)

Relph describes the impacts of space-time compression; increased mobility and electronic communications has resulted in a deepening of the hybridity of place. Noting that places have always "borrowed elements" from elsewhere, Relph (2016) cautions that in the early 21st century it is difficult and perhaps fruitless "to distinguish what has local origins from what has been copied or borrowed" (2016, pp. 32-33). Therefore, "I may be eager to understand this place, but this place is not explicitly or even primarily about here. Instead, it is a 'hybrid place,' best characterized by the presence of other places" (Blum, 2002, p. 5, as cited in Relph, 2016).

In the context of hybrid places and increased mobility, distinct place identities have become *more* important in the unfolding "place wars" and prevalence of intercity competition (Harvey, 1996). As Cresswell (2015) explains:

> The dramatic reduction in costs of transport and communication, at least in the developed world, has made objective location (how far a place is from other places) less relevant. This means that the qualitative aspects of place – the quality of life – have increased in importance when a multinational company (for instance) chooses a location. (p. 94)

Aware of this competitive pressure, authorities seek "to differentiate their place from other places and become more competitive… using all the artifices of advertising and image construction that can be mustered" (Harvey, 1996, p. 298). Places sell unique images of themselves, "reviv[ing]

vernacular traditions associated with places as a consumer attraction" (Harvey, 1996, p. 298) in order to emphasize their specificity.

2.1.2 Place and Weather

Something absent from many theorizations of place, including those outlined above, is a conceptualization or even acknowledgement of the relationship between weather and place (Endfeild, 2019). This is in some ways surprising, as "at its most elementary level the weather is itself a feature of place" and, like place, it is "omnipresen[t] in everyday conversation" (Vannini et al, 2012, p. 371; p. 377). However, "weather has occupied a somewhat 'absent-presence' in sociological, economic, anthropological, historical, cultural, and geographical research" (Vannini et al, 2012, p. 362). It is perhaps weather's very ubiquity and inextricably from place that has resulted in a neglect of explicit examination. Weather, however, is of particular relevance to this thesis as "the weather *in* which one stands can be as much responsible for generating a sense and use of place as the ground *on* which one stands" (Pillatt, 2012, p. 578, original emphasis). Weather is also important in conceptualizing place in the context of ongoing climate change. Our connection to climate and local weather "influences the way we experience, remember, commemorate, and indeed celebrate place" (Endfield, 2019, pp. 2-3). It follows "that weather and climate are never an externality, separate from people or place. Rather, weather and climate co-constitute both people and place in embedded, relational, more-than-human ways" (Wright and Tofa, 2021, p. 2).

2.1.2.1. Weather Place

Just as place and society are mutually implicated, so too "we can never think of places without their weather" and vice-versa (Vannini et al, 2012, p. 373). Vannini et al (2012) use the term "weather places" to explicitly acknowledge "both the place dimensions of weather, and the climatic components of place" (p. 373). Here, weather can refer to a range of atmospheric phenomena, and "just about anything is either a part of the weather, or can be made so (i.e., trees... contribute to atmospheric conditions that affect weather... high-winds may blow down trees that, in turn, are part of how weather-related damage is assessed)" (Vannini et al, 2012, p. 364). Weather itself is neither a 'good' or a 'bad' thing inherently; it can be pleasant and enjoyable, "life threatening and cruel," (Butts and Adams, 2020, p. 10), all of the above, and anything in between.

Weather is in a constant state of change, be it the slow shifts of climate, the cyclical progression of the seasons, or a fleeting arrangement of clouds (Brassley, 1998, as cited in Vannini et al,

2012) Somewhat paradoxically, the constancy of weather's changeability specifies place. These "anticipated ephemeral changes enter the realm of familiarity in such depth that they become part of place itself" (Vannini et al, 2012, p. 371). These changes are understood as *movement*, and "our sensual experience of weather cannot be understood outside of the weather's constant movement, and the ways we move along with it" (Vannini et al, 2012, p. 373 citing Satio, 2005). This is an especially salient point in winter cities, where the arrival of winter weather prompts particular sorts of movements, from 'moving indoors' to seasonal migration to warmer places. Through "weaving… routes... from weather place to weather place" (Vannini et al, 2012, p. 377), the weather is part of "the multitude of flows that cross boundaries constantly" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 105). Here, there is a connection with Massey's (1994) conceptualization of a progressive sense of place: "places are not bounded or rooted" but produced through movement, "through connections to the rest of the world and therefore are more about routes than roots" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 176). These movements do not compromise places but deepen place specificity. As Butts and Adam (2020) point out, "a focus on the weather draws attention to the dynamic, locally specific, intangible elements of place created through weather" (p. 12).

Weather "is neither spatially nor temporally enclosed nor independent of us, but rather it envelops us" (Vannini et al, 2012, p. 367 citing Ingold, 2005; Saito, 2005). Consequently, weather is not just something we perceive and experience but also a medium *in* which and *through* which we perceive and experience (Gibson, 1968; Berland, 1993; Ingold, 2000; Vannini et al, 2012; Vaddhanaphuti, 2017; Butts and Adams, 2020). As Vannini et al. (2012) summarize:

> Weather is everyday life because its textures and actions inform our place-based existence in multiple and nuanced ways. Few of our mundane activities remain untouched by weather. The weather shapes our personal and social identities, our lifestyles, our line of work, our places of residence, and our leisure activities. But we are not victims of weather. As reflexive beings, we act toward the weather much like we do toward other people and other inanimate objects—in agentic ways. As the weather moves, we move. (p. 377)

Vannini et al explain the profound connection between weather place and society. Weather mediates between place and our experience of place (Berland, 1994; Butts and Adams, 2020). Indeed, "weather, and our experiences of it, do not exist in a void" (Wright and Tofa, 2021, p. 2). Place and society also impact our experience of weather:

Weather's mediation between our physical and social bodies is itself shaped by a host of technological, social and cultural forces. As these change, so too does our sense of what it means to live on the earth, in a specific place, and in the scientific-technical-environmentally fraught epoch of the present. (Berland, 1994, p. 99)

Berland (1994) describes how social forces are implicated in our experience of weather. We "transform" the weather places in which we live through our experiences and responses to weather (Vannini et al, 2012). Adaptations such as "building refuge from storms—or surfing mighty waves, or coping with what has come to be called seasonal affective disorder" are ways places "engage weather" and are specific to that place (Vannini et al, 2012, p. 364). As such, weather must be considered as a key element of place in the dialectic of place and society. Weather (and nature more broadly) is "simultaneously affected by our actions and profoundly, sometimes irrevocably, shape[s] the possibilities and conditions of our lives" (Berland, 1994, p. 112). We are both influenced by and influencing weather places (Hulme, 2016; Butts and Adams, 2020). This is apparent in how the materiality, meanings, and practices of places are affected by and affect our experience of weather. Each of these is explored in more depth below.

2.1.2.1.1. Materiality

The physical characteristics of place both shape and are shaped by weather. Vannini et al (2012) provide an example: "a storm—like a bridge that is built or a tree that is felled—interacts with the more permanent features of place, marking not only the spatial features but also the temporal dimensions of the human experience of that place" (Vannini et al, 2012, p. 364). Despite seeming perpetual and permanent, topographic elements of places are not fixed. Weather processes (e.g., erosion) "mol[d], modif[y], and transfor[m] the landscape directly. Landscapes are weathered and they are dynamic precisely because of the weather to which they are exposed" (Endfield, 2019, p. 4).

Materiality impacts the experience of weather and indeed the weather itself. "Interventions, adaptations, and changes to the built environment to cope with unusual or damaging weather" are both responses to weather and change the experience of weather in place (Endfield, 2019, p. 4). There exists an entire field of climate-sensitive design considering how best to create urban places that are informed by and responsive to locally prevailing weather. Like the natural

topographic features of a place, the built form is also dynamic and responsive to weather; it is part of the physical *and* temporal dimensions of place.

2.1.2.1.2. Meaning

Weather plays a significant role in the cultural connection to place at individual and collective scales. Relationships with weather are part of experiencing place and create personal and cultural meaning. As Butts and Adams (2020) remark, "weather has a cultural meaning, both individually and collectively, within the community that creates a sense of shared experience and belonging" (p. 11). Meaning can be derived from weather-based, individual and collective cultural practices (more on practices later) such as celebrating the arrival of rain or the winter solstice. As with materiality, this connection is reciprocal. Vannini et al (2012) explain:

> Familiar sensations over time build personal memories and intersect with collective memories and common skills, hence shaping weather-based personal, social, and collective identities, which themselves are then used as resources to make sense of weather and to weather places. (p. 370)

Therefore, relationships with and experience of weather contribute to cultural understandings of weather which in turn inform weather relationships and experiences (Endfield, 2019). These "relationship[s] to weather... bon[d] people to place" (Butts and Adams, 2020, p. 11). Societal understandings of 'good' and 'bad' weather are "conditioned by cultural identity, social practices, economic structures and social status" (Hulme, 2016, p. 60). The collective experience of weather, especially 'extreme weather' (this is of course relative), fosters a shared place-identity. Butts and Adams (2020) found that on a remote Scottish island "the weather is described as an idea which both embodies and informs individual and cultural values; a positive, grounding force which fosters humility and creativity" (p. 7). Further, these values are "enshrined in activities such as story-telling amongst communities which shapes their collective sense of identity" (Butts and Adams, 2020, p. 7). These "weather narratives are integral to people's attachment to place, forming part of their interactions with others, their work, hobbies, community, heritage, the landscape and scenery, and the ability to live independently" (Butts and Adams, 2020, p. 5)

2.1.2.1.3. Practice

Weather "enwraps itself with… the routine practices in particular places" (Hulme, 2016, p. 57). Experiences of weather, including sensory experiences like sights and sounds, contribute to the

specificity of a place (Ingold, 2000). These experiences impact the activities and routines of a place's inhabitants and visitors. As Vannini et al (2012) state:

> The weather occasions activities, provides us with resources, facilitates certain types of actions and discourages others, and prompts us to learn certain kinds of techniques for everyday living. Thus, while the weather has obvious symbolic meanings, its primary manifestations are practical affordances for the performance of our common ways of life. (p. 369)

We respond to weather through practices: "we dress in accordance with it, plan the day by weather forecasts and reports, or simply by looking to the sky or feeling the temperature. We dedicate certain activities to rainy days and others to sunny days" (Vannini et al, 2012, p. 368). As with meaning, these routine practices can be both individual and collective. This is not to say that weather is passively experienced (Wright and Tofa, 2021). It does not act upon us unilaterally:

> This is not a passive surrender to the physical forces of the atmosphere; I am more than a direct function of the weather I experience. I may not be able to change the physical weather in my outdoor atmosphere, but I can change how I imagine the weather and, within limits, how I choose to live with it. This agency manifests in the everyday decisions of my personal and social life. (Hulme, 2016, p. 58)

Our experience of weather is informed by and informs our place-based practices. As Vannini et al (2012) express, we not only act "*in* or *toward*" weather but also "*with*" it (p. 396, original emphasis).

2.1.2.2. Knowing Weather Place

Weather's influence on the materiality, meaning, and practices of places contribute to place specificity: "it is from this relational context of people's engagement with the world... that each place draws its unique significance" (Ingold, 2000, p. 192). This echoes Massey's (1994) conception of a progressive sense of place; weather places do not have "single, unique 'identities'" and can be "full of internal conflicts" (Massey, 1994, p. 155). Weather contributes to the "distinct mixture" of materiality, meanings, practices, and connections that make places unique (Massey, 1994, p. 156). In addition to experiences of weather, knowledge and understanding of weather itself are also contextual:

...weather is made, recorded in place… and the resultant knowledge is indelibly marked by the local and spatial circumstances of its making. Weather knowledge is also transferred, transacted across, and received in different places. The production and reception of this weather knowledge is thus spatially as well as temporally contingent. At the same time, however, weather itself contributes to the making and meaning of place. (Endfield, 2019, p. 3).

Endfeild describes how the production of weather knowledge is a result of specific places and experiences: understandings and knowledge of weather are informed by societal context *and* societal context is informed by understandings and knowledge of weather. Indeed, "places become 'known' and knowable by and through their weather; they are made distinctive from one another into specific 'weather places'" (Endfield, 2019, p. 4, citing Vannini et al, 2012).

As with broader place literature, however, weather place scholarship considers how modernism impacts this approach. Modern meteorology is a globalized and technoscientific approach to understanding weather. Within this discipline, "weather is examined as part of a single, global system, and therefore universal, standardised approaches to measuring, recording and 'knowing' the weather are required" (Wright and Tofa, 2021, p. 5, citing Edwards, 2006). In combination with media reporting, meteorology profoundly shapes our understanding of and engagement with weather (Berland, 1994). However, "technoscience does not stand either monolithic or unchallenged. Though modern meteorology has become a dominant mode among techno-political elites, most citizens around the world still do not read or know their weather (solely) this way" (Wright and Tofa, 2021, p. 6). Indeed, Butts and Adams (2020) describe how their participants "construc[t] their lives to stay connected" to weather, "represent[ing] rebellion against modernity - rejecting the idea of living in an artificial climate (with heating and air conditioning)" (p. 10). There is a growing body of recent geographic research examining "experiential and embodied knowledges and cultures of weather" (Wright and Tofa, 2021, p.8) and demonstrating the "complex and hybrid relationships between place, local ways of knowing and feeling that variously entwine with, support, strategically use and undermine technocratic accounts" (Wright and Tofa, 2021, p. 6).

However, Wright and Tofa (2021) caution that this embodied and experiential approach to weather also has shortcomings. Specifically, they contend that contemporary geographic

accounts often construct weather as *aer nullius*. Similar to *terra nullius* ("a colonial fallacy which was/is used to justify and empower… colonisation"), *aer nullius* is a fiction which "invisibilise[s] extant plural knowledges and sovereign relationships of/with weather" (Wright and Tofa, 2012, p. 2; p. 6). They argue, "the focus on the intimate and embodied" in recent geographic publications on weather "risks overlooking the cultural politics and power dimensions of how weather is known, whose experiences matter and how micro-geographies of weather link to other scales of weather knowledge" (p. 8; see Vannini et al 2012). Wright and Tofa (2021) contend power is mediated through weather:

> Weather is not ever only a personal and embodied experience, though it is always this... Weather is also mediated by, and itself mediates, power relations. The cold weather feels... and is experienced differently by homeless people living rough in a major US city, or by Inuk scholar and activist Sheila Watt-Cloutier as she calls for the right to be cold to support the survivances of Inuit cultures and co-emergent environments (Watt-Cloutier, 2017), and differently by a small-scale farmer with an unseasonal freeze, or a politician in a heated office making climate policy at the behest of oil companies, or by a glacier, a migrating bird, the frozen grass, the building's heating system and the communications and co-becomings between them. (p. 8)

Wright and Tofa illustrate how the multiplicity of experiences and knowledge of weather are shaped by power relations, further demonstrating Massey's (1994) argument that power relations both create a multiplicity of experiences of place and are created by place. Weather, place and society are inextricably linked in a mutually constitutive and reciprocal relationship: "knowing and experiencing weather *is* personal and embodied *and* is made by places and their more-than-human becomings as it makes them in return" (Wright and Tofa, 2021, p. 2, original emphasis).

2.1.3 Conclusion

Despite its exclusion from many influential conceptualizations of place, explicit consideration of weather reinforces and deepens understandings of place. The above review establishes that weather is key to the (re)construction of specific, complex places and part of "the multitude of flows that cross boundaries constantly" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 105). Indeed, "places are not bounded or rooted" but the products of movement between and connections with other places (Cresswell, 2015, p. 176). While there has always been movement between places, there has been some concern that modern mobility and communications have eroded authentic

relationships to place, increasing the prevalence of placelessness. However, it is more productive to consider the ways in which place and placelessness exist simultaneously, in what Relph (1976; 2016) calls the paradox of place. Authentic relationships involve "a direct and genuine experience of the entire complex of the identity of places" (Relph, 1976, p. 64). This authenticity is not impossible due to movement; rather, "the entire complex of the identity" of a place includes the forms of movement that contribute to place identity.

2.2. Placemaking

Within geography, planning, and related disciplines, placemaking is a widely used and seemingly self-explanatory term. However, despite (or perhaps due to) its widespread use and application, the concept of placemaking remains nebulous and loosely defined. As a result of this complexity and adaptability, definitions are not only variable across literatures but contain tensions and contradictions. This section summarizes key themes in the literature with a focus on two key and contradictory understandings: placemaking as a community-based process for improving quality of life and placemaking as a market-driven response by local governments to attract capital. The section goes on to consider festival places and their relationship to placemaking.

2.2.1. Defining Placemaking

The nature of placemaking varies across the literature; the term can refer to theoretical or ideological approaches to urban development, a social practice, or an applied technique or process. Placemaking has even been referred to as "an 'art' and a 'science'" (Fincher, Pardy, and Shaw, 2016, p. 519; see also de Brito and Richards, 2017). At a global symposium on the subject, placemaking was described as a "complex and often ethereal, ambiguous and intangible concept" and it was acknowledged that "there is no real definition or consensus among the academic or practitioners' community" (Stockholm, 2014, p. 1 as cited in Fincher, Pardy and Shaw, 2016. p. 519). In a literature review spanning 25 years of articles on the topic, Dupre (2019) found a "tendency for authors to write about places and their making, while rarely defining places and even less 'place-making'" (p. 107). Even the spelling is not agreed upon: "a review of 62 publications that make use of at least one of the three spellings found 40 of them (64.5%) using 'place-making', 16 (26%) used 'placemaking' and 9 (14.5%) used 'place making'" (Lew, 2017, p. 449). This thesis uses 'placemaking,' but direct quotes maintain the spelling used by the original authors.

The application and meaning of the term 'placemaking' have shifted over time, contributing to the amorphous definition. Where previously a broad and overarching definition was effective, there is now a myriad of discipline-specific understandings of the term (Dupre, 2019). For example, "the way all of us as human beings transform the places in which we find ourselves into places in which we live" (Schneekloth and Shibley, 1995, as cited in Dupre 2019) is a broad but effective explanation. While not rendered inaccurate, sweeping definitions have been replaced by more precise understandings, such as "making sense of a place in the views of the stakeholders' vision, strategies and practices" (Habibah et al., 2013, p. 86).

Placemaking does not refer to a universal or prescribed approach (Germen, 2015). In fact, "as an iterative process, [it] requires complexity to work in different contexts, with different communities, and for different outcomes" (Silbeberg and Lorah, 2013 as cited in Germen, 2015). From across the literature, however, some common themes emerge. In theoretical and geography-based contexts, placemaking has been described as an intentional approach to:

> Turning public spaces into public places; places which engage those who inhabit them, places through which people do not merely pass, but have reason to stop and become involved; places which offer rich experience and a sense of belonging; places in short which have meaning, which evoke pleasure or contemplation, or reflection and, most importantly, an appreciation of cultural and environmental diversity." (Winikoff, 2000, n.p., as cited in Mills, 2005, p. 7)

Winikoff (2000) identifies the key object of interest for placemaking as public space and describes the creation of places through which people move and connect. Given the emphasis on the intentional development of public space, discussion of placemaking is often tied to the work of city governments and city planners. Winikoff also identifies that placemaking encompasses more than the physicality or materiality of place, it also endeavors to develop the meanings and practices associated with place. Placemaking is the intentional construction of place; this process will, "to varying degrees, ...reflect the norms of social and political structures beyond the indigenous and local community" (Lew, 2017, p. 45). Social and cultural dynamics are constitutive components in the process (PPS, 2007; Dupre, 2019). As Hultman and Hall (2012) note, "the argument that place-making is the result of social construction is reliant on an emphasis on how places are constituted by social relations and practices" (p. 549). Thus, placemaking is part of the

place-society dynamic. Rather than a static and discrete noun, placemaking is a verb and a process entangled in the complex dialectical relationship between society and place.

2.2.1.1. Community-Based Placemaking

Placemaking as a community driven process was one of two prominent understandings present in the literature. The Project for Public Spaces (PPS), in particular, emphasizes the role of community participation in placemaking processes. It articulates the qualities of an effective placemaking process as having "community-based participation at its center" and "capitaliz[ing] on a local community's assets, inspiration, and potential ... [resulting] in the creation of quality public spaces that contribute to people's health, happiness, and well being" (PPS, 2007, np).

PPS describes placemaking as a response to criticism of the "rigid" 20th century approaches to planning (PPS, 2007, np.). It cites Jane Jacobs and William H. Whyte as major originators and influencers of the idea, despite not using the term 'placemaking' themselves. Language and rhetoric around designing for people (as opposed to motorized vehicles) are prominent, as well as rejecting "authoritarian centric planning and favour[ing] local, flexible, spontaneous, immediate solutions to problems" (Germen, 2015, p. 15, see also de Brito and Richards, 2017). Silberberg and Lorah, (2013) argue that placemaking "is—and must be—chaotic like all true democratic processes" (as cited in Germen, 2015, p. 15). Indeed, because of the inclusion of residents in decision making, placemaking has been considered more democratic than other approaches to planning (Finkel and Platt, 2019).

In this community-based understanding of placemaking, "the iterative actions and collaborations inherent in the making of places nourish communities and empower people… [placemaking] animates public and private spaces, rejuvenates structures and streetscapes, and brings diverse people together to celebrate, inspire, and be inspired" (Markusen and Nicodemus, 2010 as cited in Germen, 2015, p. 15). Habibah et al (2013) suggest that "place-making is a process of adding value and meaning to the public realm through community-based revitalisation projects rooted in local values, history, culture, and the natural environment" (p. 86). They highlight the connections between placemaking and place, suggesting that placemaking is necessarily based in place and concerned with benefiting those who live there. Richards and Duif (2018) elaborate:

> Placemaking is different from place marketing, which seeks to use marketing tools and a customer-oriented philosophy to sell the city to customers (Eshuis et al. 2014), or to turn

a place into a destination. Placemaking, on the other hand also involves non-market processes and an effort to improve the quality of the lives of all those who use the place. pp. 15-16)

Richards and Duif (2018) clearly distinguish placemaking from marketing places to external parties; placemaking is concerned with residents and quality of life rather than external investors and developers. Community-based placemaking is a process that engages the community to improve quality of life. However, *who* is engaged and *whose* quality of life is improved remains vague. Fincher, Pardy, and Shaw (2016) summarize:

> [Place-making is championed] as a strategy or set of processes for realising social justice, the right to the city, community connectedness and social equity, yet it shrinks its vision to civic matters of making place through public space. What is banished from this treatment of place-making is a critical appraisal of how it is that public space includes and excludes… who is included and who is on the margins or excluded is not ever addressed. The tensions of the old and the new, the existing and the sought after, the cultural and the socio-economic, are cleansed from this sense of ordered community. (p. 520)

Community-driven placemaking may conveniently ignore or otherwise disregard the tensions inherent to public spaces and the power relations acting within communities.

2.2.1.2. Market-Driven Placemaking

In addition to the notion of placemaking as a community-led process, there is a second understanding of placemaking as a state-driven effort to be more competitive in their pursuit of capital. There exists an extensive body of critical literature on the role of placemaking in cities' efforts to attract "footloose capital", the creative class, and tourism (Friedmann, 2010, p. 149; Florida, 2002; Madureira, 2015; see also Dupre, 2019). Indeed, placemaking can serve as a way of branding cities for sale (Friedmann, 2010).

In this context, placemaking homogenizes places and contributes to gentrification, outcomes seemingly antithetical to the community-oriented values articulated above. State-driven placemaking activities "work parallel to the development of gentrification processes and a progressive neoliberalisation of development agendas, pushed forward by loose concepts such as intercity competition" (Madureira, 2015, p. 161). In this respect, placemaking has "become

embedded in neoliberal place management strategies" (Finkel and Platt, 2019, p. 7, citing Fincher, Pardy, & Shaw, 2016; Shaw & Montana, 2016). As many cities respond to the end of their "industrial glory and resultant decline," they seek to "reposition and promote themselves on a global scale in order to create or maintain reputations as desirable destinations to live, work and visit" (Finkel and Platt, 2019, p. 4). Local populations may be displaced in the making of attractive, internationally competitive places (Catungal, Leslie, and Hii, 2009). Friedmann (2007) remarks that "place-making has always been a social process fraught with reluctant obedience to authority, popular resistance and displacement" (p. 272). The pursuit of "global capital for infrastructure, housing, and production" has resulted in states opting to pander to potential investors with such projects as profit-oriented public-private partnerships rather than focus on the wellbeing of their existing inhabitants (Friedman, 2010, p. 150).

2.2.2. Festivals

Festivals are a form of placemaking that can be linked to both community-based and market-driven processes. Festivals are a diverse, international cultural practice (Perry, Ager, and Sitas, 2020); the term covers a wide range of social and cultural events and gatherings. In some cases, festivals are singular events, "but many events also have a regular and rhythmic relationship with places, often being a fixture in the cultural life of a location over decades or even centuries" (de Brito and Richards, 2017, p. 4). They can "imbue the city with life" and "enrich and transform the city in which [they] occur" (Johansson and Kociatkiewicz, 2011, p. 403). In the context of inter-city competition, festivals are also understood as "a useful strategy for the contemporary city to adopt in the attempt to reposition and differentiate itself in an increasingly competitive world" (Quinn, 2005, p. 927).

2.2.2.1. Defining Festivals

Festivals can range from 'authentic,' culturally significant, place-based rituals to imported, manufactured, economic undertakings. Perry, Aher, and Sitas (2020) provide examples:

> Festival is a word that can be used to describe everything from large-scale geopolitical spectacles such as 'The Festival of Britain' or 'Expo 2010 Shanghai China' to traditional feasts, folk customs and special days with religious or social origins, such as Christmas or May Day. Festival can refer to a day of outdoor activities in a single, damp field, or 'Burning Man' where participants build a temporary city in the Nevada desert, as well as

metropolitan events such as the Venice Biennale and the Cannes and Berlin film festivals. (p. 607)

Consistent across the examples is a prominent temporality; while the scale, purpose, and duration of festivals vary, they are all ephemeral. For their duration, ordinary practices give way to festival activities. Specifically, "daily routines and experiences are temporarily suspended" and "playful practice" is encouraged, "offer[ing] creative possibilities... [to] challenge established geographies" (Waitt, 2008, p. 526). There is an extensive social history of "engaging with festivals as creative, oppositional, liberating and spontaneous events through which... everyday life experiences can be enhanced" (Stevens and Shin, 2014, p. 1). Over the course of a festival, the meaning of a space is transformed as its materiality and practices are modified by organizers and attendees (Stevens and Shin, 2014).

In a comprehensive review of festival literature, Getz (2010) highlights that "the core phenomenon is actually the festival experience and meanings attached to it. People create festivals for specific purposes, and one's experience of a festival provides meaning" (p. 19). At their best, "festivals support the redefinition, rediscovery and expansion of local social life and the meanings of place" (Stevens and Shin, 2014, p. 1). In so doing, they "transcend individual experience" and generate significant collective societal and cultural place meanings (Getz, 2010, p. 20). Similarly, Finkel and Platt (2019) characterize festivals as linking "personal geography with collective experiences" (p. 1). Festivals are the site of a confluence of meanings, experiences, and objectives at individual and social scales (de Brito and Richards, 2017). Importantly, these aspects of festivals are intentionally and purposefully created - even in 'authentic,' community-driven events (Getz, 2010). Rather than being "natural occurrences, festivals are social constructions that bear heavy signs of authorship" (Quinn, 2005, p. 937). As such, they express social, economic and political meanings, specific to their place and time (Getz, 2010).

As these expressions of meaning vary, festivals can be understood as "symbolic, contingent and situated set[s] of events and understandings, usually only comprehensible in context" (Perry, Ager, and Sitas, 2020, p. 608). Brownett and Evans (2020) point to "the importance of history, heritage or the traditions of places" in the "construction and imagination" of festivals (p. 3). Festivals are place-based and as such, are critical sites "for expressing collective belonging to a group or a place... creating opportunities for drawing on shared histories, shared cultural practices and ideals" (Quinn, 2005, p. 928). At festivals, as materiality, meanings and practices are

negotiated, "[t]he history, cultural inheritance and social structures, which distinguish one place from another, are revised, rejected or recreated" (Quinn, 2005, p. 928)

While festivals do not exist outside of dominant power relations, they can serve to subvert hegemonic power structures (Quinn, 2005); community festivals "have the potential to be spaces where local identities are (re)negotiated over time and alternate versions of places can be projected" (Finkel and Platt, 2019, p. 7). In suspending 'ordinary' routines and social dynamics, festivals create "opportunities where social difference can be transgressed or (re)negotiated" (Waitt, 2008, p. 527). Community driven festivals can "reimag[ine]" and repurpos[e]" place to "create new (or renewed) physical and emotional connections, which might lead to generating a sense of belonging by changing our perspectives" (Brownett and Evans, 2020, p. 5). Further, this is not necessarily restricted to the time and place of a festival. They can "permeat[e] the neighbourhood, encouraging more intensive and more varied uses of places that already carry memories and meanings for local residents, and opening up community spaces so that new meanings can be brought to them" (Stevens and Shin, 2014, p. 13).

By contrast, Waitt (2008) contends that "contemporary urban festival spaces would appear to reinforce rather than transgress hegemonic norms" (p. 526). Similarly, Stevens and Shin (2014) argue that "the apparently liberated, transgressive atmosphere of festivals often serves and reproduces existing hierarchies of class, race, and gender, and tends to privilege the consumptive gaze overactive engagement" (p. 3). Festivals are not exempt from the tensions and inequalities (e.g., class) that manifest in public spaces and can be "conceptualised as mechanisms to exclude and include certain people from 'public' spaces" (Waitt, 2008, p. 522). Therefore, festival spaces can reinforce and reproduce dominant social structures while also "creat[ing] new possibilities for local resistance" (Waitt, 2008, p. 515)

2.2.2.2. Festivals and Placemaking

Festivals are long standing social and cultural phenomena. "New" to this phenomenon, however, "is the backdrop of the urban politics of neoliberalism, in a context of economic and cultural globalisation" (Waitt, 2008, p. 516). Historically, festivals have been understood as 'organic' or 'authentic' celebrations emerging from agricultural practices, climatic cycles, and/or religious ceremonies. Getz (2010) contends, however, that presently "modern festivals are mostly created and managed with multiple goals, stakeholders and meanings attached to them" (p. 7). In the context of neoliberalism and globalization, local festivals have been "transform[ed]" into "into high

profile spectacles for tourist consumption" (Gotham, 2005, p. 225) and are "intimately linked to the process of place making" (Lau and Yi, 2019, p. 53).

As such, festivals have gained an additional role and importance as a tool for (re)developing a city's image (de Brito and Richards, 2017). As Quinn (2005) explains, "[festivals] are now construed as entrepreneurial displays... attracting significant flows of increasingly mobile capital, people and services" (p. 931). Festivals are "perceived as an easily marketable, aesthetic experience that is contained in time and space" (Johansson and Kociatkiewicz, 2011, p. 402). And indeed, particular importance has been given to aesthetics, as "neoliberal economic wisdom suggested... 'aesthetically' appealing locations (often wrapped in an urbanity that is carnivalesque and festive) were more likely to appeal to footloose investors, shoppers and tourists" (Waitt, 2008, p. 518).

With the shift in cities' objectives and the rise of global tourism, "the predominance of theming and the transformation of urban celebrations into tourist spectacles has assumed increased importance" (Gotham, 2005, p. 242). Festivals have morphed from community-based, place-specific celebrations into commodified, competitive assets that serve as tourist attractions (including as attractions to specific places and/or at specific times to overcome fluctuating tourist numbers throughout the year). Commodified festivals also contribute to larger city-marketing efforts as placemaking tools (Getz, 2010). This shift creates a number of tensions; notably, questions arise around whether festivals are intended for locals residents or tourists, prospective residents (preferably of the 'creative class'), and/or private investors. As Finkel and Platt (2019) explain: "contemporary festivals now often exhibit complex and uneasy tensions between the socio-economic strategies of commercialized neoliberal cities and the cultural needs of diverse communities to gather and celebrate" (p. 1). The commercialization of festivals may further undermine their community functions: in festival spaces "designed to encourage people to spend money, the sense of collective identity can only be illusory or, at best, a public relations exercise" (Waitt, 2008, p. 521-522).

There is also an interesting tension between "authentic" and placeless festivals. While festivals have historically been "locally unique gatherings, indigenously conceived, rich in distinctive content, based on local consumption and organized around localized geographic ties" (Gotham, 2005, p. 242), these qualities come under pressure as festivals are linked to competitive placemaking (Finkel and Platt, 2019). Festivals have come to be mass-produced and tailored for

effectiveness in international competition, and their production has become "formulaic" and "devoid of any real connections with place" (Quinn, 2005, p. 928). While festivals are "woven" into promoting a "unique" place identity as part of the city marketing strategies (Waitt, 2008, p. 520), creating and promoting marketable festivals has ironically contributed to 'sameness' (standardization and homogenization) across festival experiences. Successful formulas are replicated in the competition for attention and entertainment expenditure (de Brito and Richards, 2017). For example, the new ubiquity of 'winter festivals' is:

> spreading carbon copies of commercialized cheer across the United Kingdom and Europe. As opposed to representing the holiday traditions and rituals of local communities, thus rooting festivity in place, many cities are 'parachuting' standardized winter festival components, for example, Christmas markets, Santa's grotto, ticketed musical shows, into city parks and plazas. (Finkel and Platt, 2019, p. 5)

These generic, commercialized festivals are not linked to local place-based traditions, but replicate a limited number of formulas, and contribute to the encroachment of consumption-oriented activities into public spaces (Finkel, 2009; Gotham, 2005).

It is important, however, not to reduce placemaking or festivals to instruments of capital attraction in a globalizing world: "in spite of wider political and economic imperatives, local festivals still have a significant role within ordinary citizens' everyday lives in local settings" (Stevens and Shin, 2014, p. 1). Ideally, the function of contemporary festivals is more extensive than "simply attracting people or attention… they should actively improve the host city or region and make them better places to live, work, visit and invest in" (de Brito and Richards, 2017, p. 2). In order to be successful, contemporary "placemaking has to involve recursive processes in which the event gains strength from the place it is embedded in, and the place gains leverage in local and wider networks through the image and identity building effects of the event" (de Britio and Richards, 2017, p. 6) Today, it is the duality of these seemingly competing interests (place-based vs imported, authentic vs standardized, community-driven vs top-down, etc.) that defines placemaking, including festivals.

2.2.3. Conclusion

Some of the literature fervently argues that festivals have shifted from being authentic, place-based celebrations to become manufactured, copied, placeless events as "[r]aising the city's

international profile and attracting visitors seems to have become the *raison d'etre* of the city festival" (Quinn, 2005, p. 932). This reflects broader trends in placemaking. Placemaking was originally conceived as the intentional construction of place by the local community. More recently, public authorities have implemented top-down placemaking policy in the pursuit of international capital, rather than the interests of residents. In response to this shift, Friedmann (2010) posits that there is a "moral imperative" to shift focus from the competitive capital games of mega-cities and aspirant mega-cities to "the small spaces of the city and their importance... for the people who inhabit them" (p. 150).

Simplifying placemaking and festivals to solely their role in promoting city image, however, is inaccurate. For the purposes of this thesis, placemaking will be understood as a process which "aims to improve the quality of a public place and the lives of its community in tandem" (Silberberg et al., 2013, p. 2 as cited in Ellery et al, 2017, p. 8). Silberg et al (2013) expand on this definition, explaining how the coupling of these aspirations results in a process of placemaking that seeks to:

> build or improve public space, spark public discourse, create beauty and delight, engender civic pride, connect neighborhoods, support community health and safety, grow social justice, catalyze economic development, promote environmental sustainability, and of course nurture an authentic "sense of place." (Silberberg et al., 2013, p. 2 as cited in Ellery et al, 2017, p. 8)

These objectives consider the creation of attractive public space holistically, taking into account more than just the physicality of place to include social, economic, and environmental goals. Taken together, they contribute to "nurturing" authenticity: placemaking which is attentive to the specificity of its place.

3. Methods

This research seeks to examine winter cities as places. It asks w*hat type of place is a winter city and what types of placemaking occur in this context*? To answer this question, a multi-site case study was conducted employing qualitative methods. Case study sites were selected based on their contextual similarity, their feasibility of access for the researcher, and likelihood of "generat[ing] rich information" (Curtis et al., 2000, p. 1003). Multiple cities were selected to validate findings and enable a fulsome and generalizable account of winter cities (Stake, 2013). Generalizable in this context refers to *analytic* generalizability, rather than *statistical* generalizability (Smith, 2018). This thesis seeks to generalize results in the context of the existing concept of winter cities and theories of place. Further, conceptual or theoretical generalizations can be understood as dynamic and fluid, rather than "fixed, immutable, or to be asserted with absolute certainty" (Smith, 2018, p. 141).

Edmonton, Saskatoon, and Winnipeg were selected as case study cities. As Canadian prairie cities, they share similar climates, topographies, and cultural histories. Additionally, all three are self-described winter cities and feature placemaking activities organized around winter, including winter festivals. The selected cities have engaged explicitly with the Winter Cities Movement to varying degrees (these similarities and differences are described further in Chapter 4). Canadian, mid-sized cities have been largely excluded from urban research and are seldom a focus in winter city literature; developing an account of winter cities centered on these cities diversifies and deepens geographic thought on place and placemaking.

3.1 Researcher Context

I have lived in Edmonton (or the surrounding area) my entire life and consequently have extensive personal experience navigating the city in winter. The idea for this research was a response to my experiences and my questions and analysis have unavoidably been informed by this context. As a result of residing in Edmonton, I was able to attend more festivals in Edmonton than either of the other case study cities.

3.2 Data Collection Methods

Data for this thesis were collected through semi-structured interviews with key informants, supplemented by modified participant-observation.

3.2.1. Interviews

Semi-structured interviews with key informants were used to "elicit the participant's experiences, perceptions, thoughts and feelings" (Moser and Korstjens, 2018, p. 12) in regard to winter in case study cities. Interviews were selected as a method "for depth and detailed understanding" (McDowell, 2018, p. 4). Interviews were semi structured, meaning that "core elements of the phenomenon ... [were] explicitly asked about ... while still allowing flexibility for participants to bring their own personality and perspective to the discussion" (Barrett and Twycross, 2018, p. 63). The interview guide was informed by literature on the Winter Cities Movement and included questions about personal and professional experiences of winter in the participant's city, characteristics and objectives of winter festivals, and the development of winter policy (where applicable). I encouraged participants to share whatever details or experiences they thought were important for understanding winter in their city and invited further comments where possible. Interviews were recorded and transcribed in full. Ethical approval for this study was granted by the Research Ethics Board at the University of Alberta, and all interviewees gave written informed consent to participate.

3.2.2. Participant-Observation

Semi-structured interviews were supplemented by modified participant-observation. Drawing on additional methods to provide context and validate interview findings is common practice in social sciences (McDowell, 2018). I visited Saskatoon and Winnipeg to attend major winter festivals and experience their winter weather. I live in Edmonton and attended multiple winter festivals in this city.

Participant observation is typically associated with long-term observation of people's ordinary practices in everyday places (Shah, 2017; Takyi, 2015). However, festivals, by definition, are extraordinary, temporary events which transform places. Consequently, my attendance and engagement with festivals was short. In this context, it is difficult to distinguish between 'participating' and 'observing' as both are accomplished through attending the festival and engaging with its activities (e.g., skating, listening to live music performances). Additionally, festival attendees were not the primary subjects of my research. My approach was largely participant-as-observer (Takyi, 2015); my role as researcher came up in only one conversation with festival attendees (in Winnipeg, when asked why I was visiting the city). Other than a couple of casual conversations, I did not talk with attendees but rather observed the festivals as places.

While this included observing festival-goers, observation was more concerned with design elements, available activities, and sensory experiences than specific behaviours.

Some written notes and voice memos were recorded at festivals using my cell phone. Upon returning home or to my hotel after the festival, I developed more extensive notes using a standard form, noting weather conditions, attendance, availability of food and drink, seating options, sources of heat, activities, cultural representations, and the theme and atmosphere of the festival. As "observing and writing fieldnotes… is more a practice of discovery than an 'objective' form of reporting" (Watson and Till, 2018, p. 10), festival field notes were used to develop first-person vignettes, which serve as very personal accounts of my festival experiences. Attending the festivals provided essential context for interviews with festival organizers and other interview participants, who often referred to a city's festivals during interviews.

3.3. Participant Recruitment

Participant recruitment for key-informant interviews was iterative and reflexive. Initially, I identified and approached city planning staff with connections to winter city projects using city directories and pre-existing professional connections. These participants were selected purposefully, "based on the researchers' judgement about what potential participants will be most informative" (Moser and Korstjens, 2018, p. 10). However, this revealed a very low number of potential participants (two in Edmonton, one in Saskatoon, and none in Winnipeg). Recruitment snowballed (Moser and Korstjens, 2018) through recommendations from city staff in Edmonton and Saskatoon to include other key informants at city-adjacent organizations with winter programming (e.g., Tourism Edmonton, Meewasin Valley Authority) and organizers of local winter festivals.

I made initial contact with potential participants through email, providing some background on the project and a letter of initial contact. Once participants responded with an expression of interest, I sent a consent form and information letter. A date and time was selected based on each participant's availability and, where possible, during my trips to case study cities. While I attempted to arrange one-on-one interviews to ensure confidentiality, on two occasions participants asked a colleague to join the interview. In both cases, this additional participant provided valuable insights and did not appear to compromise the responses of the primary participant. Interviews in Winnipeg and Saskatoon were conducted in person, with the exception

of one phone interview with a Saskatoon participant due to scheduling issues. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, four of the Edmonton interviews were conducted over the phone.

It is worth noting that rather than select participants through a sampling strategy, as much as possible I sought to invite anyone with relevant knowledge to participate. This is reflective of the fact that interviews sought to gain insight from key informants, rather than examine general public knowledge or experiences. The inclusion of key informants across three cities strengthens the generalizability of my results, as they are not based on characteristics of one city. Interviews were conducted on a voluntary basis without reward or incentive.

In total, I conducted interviews with 16 participants across the three cities between February and April 2020. Table 1 provides an overview of the participants, including their location and role, as well as the codes used in subsequent chapters.

Code	Role	City
E1	City Staff	Edmonton
E2	Festival Organizer	Edmonton
E3	Tourism/Business Development Staff	Edmonton
E4	Festival Organizer	Edmonton
E5	Festival Organizer	Edmonton
E6	City Staff	Edmonton
S1	City Staff	Saskatoon
S2	City Staff	Saskatoon
S3	Community Organization Staff	Saskatoon
S4	Festival Organizer	Saskatoon
S5	Festival Organizer	Saskatoon
S6	Festival Organizer	Saskatoon
W1	Festival Organizer	Winnipeg
W2	Tourism/Business Development Staff	Winnipeg
W3	Tourism/Business Development Staff	Winnipeg
W4	Community Organization Staff	Winnipeg

Table 1 - Participant Code, Role, and Location

3.4. Data Analysis

Audio files of the interviews were transcribed in full. The anonymized transcripts were uploaded to NVIVO, a computer software program for qualitative analysis. Using this software, I undertook thematic analysis to "identif[y], analys[e] and repor[t] patterns (themes)" from across the data set (as opposed to within a specific interview) (Braun and Clarke, 2006, p. 79). Key themes were identified on the basis of "captur[ing] something important about the data in relation to the research question" and was "not necessarily dependent on quantifiable measures" (Braun and Clarke, 2006, p. 82). Themes were generated inductively based on the data, informed neither by a pre-existing coding framework nor the interview guide. Given the under-researched nature of my topic, I sought to develop a "rich thematic description," providing insight into important ideas from across the interviews (Braun and Clarke, 2006, p. 83).

In order to "mov[e] the raw text of the interview transcripts to a coherent narrative… in a way that retains analytic rigour" (Ripka, 2021, p. 23), I read through all transcripts line-by-line and began to openly assign initial codes, focused on "identifying distinct concepts and themes for categorization" (Williams and Moser, 2019, p. 48). These codes were descriptive and included constructed and in vivo codes (Cope, 2017). Afterwards, I repeatedly read through transcripts and began grouping initial codes to "refin[e], alig[n], and categoriz[e] the themes" (Williams and Moser, 2019, p. 50). This process was iterative, allowing me to "break apart, relate, and recombine" the initial codes (Watson and Till, 2018, p. 10) while constantly comparing the data in a "cyclical and evolving data loop" (Williams and Moser, 2019, p. 47). Coding procedures were defined, consistent, and rigorous "in order to conform with validity and reliability standards associated with qualitative research" (Williams and Moser, 2019, p. 47).

It is important to note that despite my efforts to develop codes informed by the data, coding is necessarily subjective. My identification of codes is informed by "a subjective sense of a code's accurate representation of the essence of a theme" (Williams and Moser, 2019, p. 49). While I tried not to impose preconceived ideas on the data based on my prior engagement with the literature, "data are not coded in an epistemological vacuum" (Braun and Clarke, 2006, p. 84). My interpretation of the data was also unavoidably informed by living in one of the case study cities and experiencing winter personally, as well as having researched the Winter Cities Movement previously.

4. Context

This chapter provides a brief overview of the population and climate of the three case study cities, as well as a summary of their engagement with the Winter Cities Movement and the festivals I attended for this research.

4.1. Edmonton

4.1.1. Population and Climate

Edmonton is the capital city of the province of Alberta. It is the second largest city in the province with a population of 932,546 (Statistics Canada, 2017a). It boasts an extensive parks system through the centre of the city along the North Saskatchewan River.

Edmonton spends 80 days of the year below freezing (i.e., with a maximum temperature of 0°C or lower). The daily low reaches -20°C or below 25 days of the year. On 3 of these days, the daily low reaches -30°C or lower. On average, the city gets 124cm of snow per year (see Table 2) (Government of Canada, 2020a).

4.1.2. Edmonton and the Winter Cities Movement

Of the three cities in this study, Edmonton has engaged most extensively with the Winter Cities Movement. The City of Edmonton began development of its Winter City Strategy, *For the Love of Winter,* in 2011. Edmonton City Councillor Henderson is credited with helping to champion the project (E1). The strategy was developed with extensive community engagement, and took inspiration from Winnipeg, Quebec, Northern Europe and resources from The Winter Cities Institute. The strategy features four pillars: Winter Life, Winter Design, Winter Economy, and Our Winter Story (City of Edmonton, 2012). The *For the Love of Winter: WinterCity Strategy Implementation Plan* was released in 2013 (City of Edmonton, 2013). The strategy has also produced winter city design guidelines (City of Edmonton, 2016) and a progress and evaluation report (City of Edmonton, 2018).

Edmonton's strategy and design guidelines have received international acclaim and awards (WinterCity Edmonton, n.d., n.p.). Other cities, including Saskatoon, have sought input from Edmonton in the development of their own Winter City strategies. Additionally, Edmonton hosted the Winter Cities Shake-Up conference in 2015 and 2017. Edmonton is a member of the World

Winter Cities Association for Mayors (WWCAM) and hosted the WWACAM conference in 1988 (then called the Northern Intercity Conference) (Winter Cities Shake-Up, 2019).

4.1.3. Festivals

Edmonton features many winter festivals. The first of the year is Deep Freeze: A Byzantine Winter Festival which typically runs during the second weekend of January. I attended the 13th annual festival on January 11th, 2020. The festival occurs on five blocks of 118 Ave and features ice sculptures and sculpting, food vendors, beer tents, hockey, children's activities, live music, and Indigenous programming. It is free to attend and family-friendly.

Flying Canoe Volant is based in Franco-Canadian voyageur history and seeks to "celebrate everything that is great about a long winter's night" (Flying Canoe Volant, n.d., n.p.) in Mill Creek Ravine and Edmonton's French Quarter. The festival has grown from 3,000 attendees at the first festival in 2012 to 60,000 attendees in 2020 (E2). Inspired by La Chasse-galerie, a French settler folktale about a flying canoe (E2), the festival includes canoe races down a local ski hill. The festival also includes light-based art installations and Franco-Canadian and Indigenous programming in the ravine, children's programming throughout the day at a neighbouring school, a local market, an outdoor patio, and indoor and outdoor live music. The festival typically runs at the end of January. The early evening is family oriented. The festival is free to attend.

Silver Skate has existed for over 30 years, making it the longest running winter festival in Edmonton (Silver Skate, 2021). It also has the longest run, spanning 10 days in mid-February with 115,000 attendees (E5). The festival organization was created when the Edmonton Winter Triathlon Group and the Dutch Canadian Club amalgamated (E5). Silver Skate features an international snow carving competition, art displays, sporting events, and the Downtown Defrost: an all-ages dance party with live DJ in a tent on the festival grounds. Silver Skate takes place in Hawrelak Park and incorporates the large, natural skating area. The festival is free, family friendly and includes some food trucks and cultural programming. In conjunction with Silver Skate, the International Festival of Winter Cinema held their annual festival in the park in 2020, showing movies for free on a snow screen.

Winterruption had its first Edmonton festival January 23-26, 2020 as part of a series of music festivals occurring simultaneously in Winnipeg, Saskatoon, Regina, and Swift Current (S5). The

festival primarily features ticketed, 18+ concerts at local, indoor music venues. There was an all-ages, free, outdoor concert in Abbey Glen Park in downtown Edmonton.

4.2. Saskatoon

4.2.1. Population and Climate

Saskatoon is the largest city in Saskatchewan with a population of 246,376 (Statistics Canada, 2017b). The South Saskatchewan River flows through the middle of the city; The Meewasin Trail is a trail and parks system which runs along the river valley.

Saskatoon spends 106 days a year with a maximum temperature of 0°C or lower. On 39 days of the year, the minimum temperature reaches -20°C or lower. On 10 of these days, the minimum temperature reaches -30°C or lower. The city gets 77cm of snow a year (see Table 2) (Government of Canada, 2020b).

4.2.2. Saskatoon and the Winter Cities Movement

While interviews were being conducted, the City of Saskatoon was in the process of developing a Winter City Strategy, after Saskatoon's Mayor and some councillors attended the 2015 Winter Cities Shake-up Conference, hosted by Edmonton (S1). Development started in 2016 with "quick win" funding for winter initiatives such as ice sculpture displays, warming huts borrowed from Winnipeg, and grants to support local organizations offering winter programming and events (City of Saskatoon, 2020). Since this research was undertaken, Saskatoon has released their Winter City Strategy, informed by learnings from these "quick wins," identifying existing strengths, and stakeholder engagement (City of Saskatoon, 2020). Saskatoon also hosted the Winter Cities Shake-up Conference in 2019.

4.2.3. Festivals

I travelled to Saskatoon to attend the Nurtien Winter Shines Festival, "Saskatchewan's premiere winter festival," on February 2nd, 2020 (Nutrien Winter Shines, 2020, n.p.). The festival is free to attend and family-friendly, featuring an ice castle and garden, a local market, children's activities, kick sledding, and fat bike races. The festival started in 2010 (S4). While in Saskatoon, I also participated in public skating in front of the historic Bessborough Hotel downtown and walked along the extensive river-side trail system.

4.3. Winnipeg

4.3.1. Population and Climate

Winnipeg is the capital of Manitoba and its largest city with a population of 705,244 (Statistics Canada, 2017c). Winnipeg was built at the confluence of the Assiniboine River and the Red River. Unlike in the other two cities, the rivers freeze entirely in the winter.

Winnipeg spends 113 days a year with a maximum temperature of 0°C or lower. For 20 days of the year the minimum temperature reaches -20°C or lower, and on 13 of those days reaches -30°C or lower. The city receives 114cm of snow per year (see Table 2) (Government of Canada, 2020c).

4.3.2. Winnipeg and the Winter Cities Movement

Unlike the other two cities in this study, Winnipeg has not had city-driven engagement with the Winter Cities Movement. It does not have a formal strategy or policy. However, Winnipeg did join the WWCAM in 2017 as part of embracing its reputation as "Winterpeg" (W2) and Mayor Bowman continues to be an advocate for winter activities (W3). Despite its lack of formal strategy, both Edmonton and Saskatoon participants cited Winnipeg as influential in the development of their strategies. Winnipeg has incorporated winter into its tourism and business development practices, promoting unique experiences and opportunities only possible because of Winnipeg's winter (W2; W3).

4.3.3. Festivals

I travelled to Winnipeg to attend Festival du Voyageur: a ticketed music festival based on Franco-Canadian history. In addition to live music, the festival features an international snow carving competition, children's activities such as sleigh rides, and some cultural programming. The festival site includes food trucks and heated tents featuring stages, seating, and dancing areas. The festival is family-oriented during the day.

While in Winnipeg, I also went to The Forks, a marketplace and recreational area at the junction of the rivers. There are skating traits throughout the area, along with warming huts as part of an international warming hut competition. In most years, The Forks is a major access point for the river trails and on-river activities. The river trails are skating trails directly on the river with access points throughout Winnipeg, including the central business district and residential

neighbourhoods. On-river activities in the past have included a restaurant. Unfortunately, there was no river trail in 2020 due to high-water levels early in the winter.

City	Population	Days with Max <=0°C	Days with Min <-20°C	Days with Min <-30°C	Snowfall per year (cm)
Edmonton	932,546	80	24	3	124
Saskatoon	246,376	106	39	10	77
Winnipeg	705,244	113	20	13	114

Table 2 - Population, winter temperatures, and snowfall in the case study cities.

5. Results

In this chapter, the results have been organized into two sections: participant observation results and interview results.

5.1. Participant Observation

For this research, I attended at least one festival in each case study city to conduct participant observation. The following section includes vignette accounts of my festival visits, providing an overview of festival activities and my engagement. Written in first-person and the present tense, these vignettes also convey sensory details and festival atmosphere to set the scene for subsequent results and discussion.

5.1.1. Edmonton

5.1.1.1 Deep Freeze: a Byzantine Winter Festival

Time(s) Arrived: January 12, 2020 - 12:20pm
Outdoor temperature/weather conditions: -26°C, sunny
Cost of entry: Free

I am at Deep Freeze in the afternoon of January 12th, on what will prove to be one of the coldest days of winter (there is perhaps some irony in the name there). I've intentionally come at the height of the afternoon, hoping to catch the warmest part of the day. Warmest, on this occasion, means -26°C. It's very bright and sunny, though, and I squint against the sunlight as I walk to where five blocks of 118 Ave have been closed to cars to accommodate the festival. Other festival attendees appear to consist mainly of families with adorably bundled up young children. Overall though, there aren't many people around; I think the cold likely put off potential festival goers.

Since the festival is right on the street, the festival site is long and narrow. There are also food vendors throughout, though many are closed. I wonder if this is because of the cold weather or if I've simply come at the wrong time. I appreciate how the festival has repurposed what is otherwise an arterial roadway, including notably a hockey rink in the middle of the road. There are also fire pits on every block; a lot of them are tall, artistic metal structures, but very few feature any seating space. It's too cold to linger for long, however, until I come across a fire pit surrounded by interpreters dressed as Vikings. They have small chairs to sit on around the fire and sheepskin blankets to wrap around yourself. I welcome the opportunity to get my feet off the cold concrete.

Here, I first encounter some of the challenges of researching in the cold. In addition to chilly toes, my hands get cold immediately if I take off my gloves to write notes or operate my phone. I endeavour to record my mental notes with a voice memo as soon as possible.

I dip into an indoor pavilion and listen to some local fiddle performers. There are musical performances scheduled throughout the day in a big tent with bench seating and some heating; I leave my coat on and my hood up along with other audience members. Just outside the pavilion, there are also some tents and teepees with signs for Indigenous programming like bannock making and story-telling. None of these activities seem to be happening during my visit, however, and I again wonder if I've timed my visit badly or if the weather is limiting festival activities. It would make sense: it is perhaps too cold for vendors, performers, and volunteers to be outside for any length of time.

As I continue to move through the festival, I observe some ice carving and enjoy the ice sculptures throughout the site. The festival is ocean themed with many of the sculptures depicting arctic sea creatures. Across the street, I notice the beer garden composed of an inflatable igloo and some outdoor seating. I try to take pictures, but my phone gets too cold and shuts down. At this point, I decide to wander home to record my notes before I forget and drink something warm.

5.1.1.2. Flying Canoe Volant

Time(s) Arrived: January 31st, 2020 - 10pm
Outdoor temperature/weather conditions: -1°C, calm
Cost of entry: Free

I am very stressed about attending Flying Canoe Volant. It's a busy time of year; I've struggled to find time to attend before leaving for Saskatoon. I arrive quite late, between 10/10:30 pm having biked over very quickly for fear of missing the height of the festivities. I needn't have worried. I can hear the laughter, chatter, and pulsing bass line from the packed La Cite patio before I can see it. People are gathered in groups, sitting around fires or wandering through la Cite's beautifully lit and snowy courtyard, drinks in hand. Festival goers are spilling out into the road, which has been closed to vehicle traffic in favour of kick sledding and overflow revelry.

It's the kind of nightlight I associate with bustling European metropolises, and not something I had ever encountered before in Edmonton. Shots are being served through an ice sculpture. People

are dancing in their toques to music from a live DJ. And truly, the place is packed. With the exciting energy, free admission, and mild weather, it's not hard to see why.

Having established that the party was still going at La Cite, I bike down into the ravine. I was too late for any programming, but I wanted to check out the facilities and lights by the creek. Beautiful, effective, and well-lit signage guides me through the ravine trails. I notice the Indigenous camp among the other programming venues; it stands out from the otherwise Franco-Canadian theme with distinct teepees.

The ravine is very quiet; just a few pedestrians wandering up to La Cite. I appreciate the lights in peace, biking through the ravine slowly. The light installations themselves are marvelous; they are less about the lights themselves and more how the colours reflect and dance on the white ground. This was intentionally designed for dark, long winter nights.

Festival staff and volunteers are just starting to turn the lights off for the night as I finish my bike tour of the ravine. On the way up, I pause and wonder about accessibility challenges in the ravine: the path is uneven and features packed snow and ice. It's also somehow simultaneously slushy from the warm weather. There is a steep incline to get in and out.

I go back to La Cite and into the indoor theatre to see a local band playing. A dramatic shift from the cool, quiet ravine: it's hot, crowded and loud inside. The lighting and decor are extensive and impressive; the theatre itself is professionally run, including multiple technicians. The theme of the event is even more apparent indoors, where the voyageur decor includes a canoe suspended from the ceiling of the theatre. This decor and the festival's name refer to a Quebecois myth I learnt about in school. Having completed French Immersion grade school and being bilingual myself, I enjoy the bilingual elements of the event including service and signage. I overhear snippets of French conversation. I wonder if the presence of French is as intriguing and fun for non-French speakers as well.

I quickly get too hot inside and retreat back to the patio to cool off outside. The party has calmed a little outside, though there are still lots of people. Fewer shots and less dancing but more boozy hot chocolate and groups on the patio around the fireplaces and gas heat lamps. I sit on the patio awhile, writing notes under a heated lamp with a Hudson's Bay blanket across my lap before biking home.

5.1.1.3. Silver Skate

Time(s) Arrived: February 8, 2020 - 7pm; February 13, 2020 - 8pm
Outdoor temperature and weather conditions: -7°C; -6°C
Cost of entry: Free

As I walk into the Hawrelak Park, it is immediately clear where I should head first. I timed my arrival to catch the evening burn of the fire sculpture and already a stream of festival attendees is heading towards the massive wooden dragon, forming a wide circle around the sculpture. The sun has long since set and all the children in attendance seem to have been supplied with glow sticks. They loop and link the luminescent, multi-coloured tubes together to form elaborate necklaces. The audience watch attentively as the dragon is set aflame, collectively gasping as the flames catch on its wide-spread wings. It is especially striking against the backdrop of dark night sky. I watch for some time as the fire crackles up the dragon, lighting up the park. The smell of smoke reminds me of summer campfires, curiously.

After watching the last pieces of the wooden dragon collapse, I head to the lake. To my surprise, I am too late to rent skates. I decided to walk on the lake instead and enjoy shuffling around and watching far more elegant participants loop around the lake. Shiny skate blades flash in the light, making the name 'Silver Skate' seem especially appropriate. The lake is lit brightly by massive flood lights, contrasting the darker, more aesthetic and colourful lights elsewhere on the grounds. I watch kids climbing piles of snow along the edges of the lake, sliding down. Some snow piles are intentionally designated for climbing. Others children have claimed for themselves. I leave the lake and walk past tents for Indigenous programming, a food truck offering poutine and related fare, and a closed cabane a sucre. I make my way to the snow carving competition and walk through, admiring the entries. They are lit in such a way as to maximize the contrast between light and shadow, making their details stand out. There does not seem to be any cohesive theme; the snow sculptures depict a range of scenes from fables to dinosaurs.

I walk over to another corner of the park, the snow making a satisfying grinding sound under-foot. I stumble across the folk trail - a path through the trees with colourful lanterns and more impressive snow sculptures. There is also an art installation from a local artist. I notice the view of the Ice Castles from here - imposing and lit in multi-colour. Technically, the Ice Castles is an adjacent activity but not part of the festival itself, but it adds colour and grandeur to the scene.

I make my way back to a large portable tent housing the Downtown Defrost and am surprised to discover a huge dance party. While licensed and serving alcohol, the event was still all-ages, and children could be spotted sporting noise reduction earmuffs and dancing happily with their parents. The tent was packed with about 100 people dancing along to a live DJ. It's one of the best dance scenes I've ever come across in Edmonton. For the first time that evening, I regret the bulk of my warm clothing. I'll get too hot if I start dancing! I step back out into the night air, and slowly make my way out of the park and home.

I return to Silver Skate on cross country skis to attend the film festival happening simultaneously. I slide up to the full-sized snow screen, lean my skis and poles against a tree, and sit on a bench to watch the projected film. I've brought a blanket, a warm meal, and some hot chocolate which I enjoy while watching. The projector is housed in a tent, which also serves as a warming space for staff and volunteers.

The evening starts with some short films and then we watch a wildlife documentary film about polar bears on Svalbard in Norway: *Queen Without Land.* The movie's message about climate change and the loss of snowy, cold places seems both very real and far away as my toes get cold in the snow. There are not a lot of people in attendance, and few stay as long as I do. When the documentary ends, I pack my blanket and various containers into my bag and ski back across the park.

5.1.2. Saskatoon

5.1.2.1. Winter Shines

Time(s) Arrived: February 10, 2020 - 12pm

Outdoor temperature and weather conditions: -5°C, sunny

Cost of entry: Free

I walk from my downtown hotel to the festival grounds at around 11am to check out the beginning of the final day of the festival. It is warm and sunny and beautiful outside, and I am once again squinting into the prairie sunshine, despite sporting sunglasses. Unfortunately, the first sight to greet me at the festival is the fenced-off ice garden. A dilapidated pagoda shines in the sunshine, partially obscured by repurposed Christmas trees. Part of the Chinese Lunar New Year theme of

the festival, the height points and south facing aspect of the pagoda have largely melted; I notice the exposed structural wiring.

I turn my attention to the market building, immediately adjacent to the closed ice garden. Outside, there is an ice slide for children which is very popular. Colourful ice blocks are scattered around the slide. They remind me strongly of an elementary school class project which involved freezing water coloured with food colouring in empty 1l and 2L milk cartons. Once the water was frozen, we ripped the carton away and used the blocks to build colourful little igloos (or rather, adults used the blocks to build the igloos).

I enter the building and find a small market smelling strongly of coffee. I purchase a coffee from one of the cafe vendors and wander around, noticing the children's programming occurring towards the rear of the building. The clatter of hula hoops and other equipment can be heard throughout the hall. There is a low hubbub of conversation but overall, the event seems sparsely attended.

I return outside; it takes a moment for my eyes to adjust to the bright light. I pause by the outdoor fire pit; the spot offers a decent view of most of the festival site. There is a large, inflatable igloo with giant Jenga and other games inside. I wander around grounds, trying to locate the kick sledding in a neighbouring park but unfortunately failing to do so. I do stumble across a petting zoo behind the market building which seems very popular with families. I enjoy feeling the goats' and ponies' warm, soft noses. At this point, I decide to wait for a little in a neighbouring coffee shop and see if the festival picks up over the course of the afternoon. After about an hour, I re-emerge but find not much has changed, though there are perhaps a few more families. The festival does not have a clearly bounded site, and I wander up a neighbouring street and almost unintentionally leave.

5.1.3. Winnipeg

5.1.3.1. Festival du Voyageur

Time(s) Arrived: February 16, 2020 - 11am; 9pm
Outdoor temperature/weather conditions: -15°C; -12°C; some wind
Cost of entry: $26.25

I arrive at the main gate to Festival du Voyageur after making my way through the historic St. Boniface neighbourhood, just across the Red River from downtown Winnipeg. I don't entirely understand where I am; I can't quite imagine what this area looks like when not fenced off for a major festival. Google Maps tells me it is Whittier Park.

I'm surprised to stumble across a ticket booth. While my initial reading about Festival du Voyageur had made it clear tickets were required, the actual mechanics of this come as a surprise after attending so many large scale, free festivals. I purchase a ticket for the entire day. While in a short line, I watch many warmly bundled families coming out to enjoy the festival in the sunshine.

I proceed through a white door in a white tent marked simply "enter" and am surprised to find a thick layer of cedar chips covering the ground. They are fragrant and soft though somewhat curious to walk on as they are uneven and shift underfoot. I would later learn that they serve many purposes. They help make heated tents feel warmer, keeping festival-goers' feet warm when standing. They also help absorb water melting off boots (or from the ground on warmer days) as well as spilt beer and other drinks. I am initially charmed by their strong, fresh scent but fear they may pose accessibility challenges.

I proceed through the ticket tent - my ticket is scanned, and I am given a hand stamp - and emerge to a massive snow sculpture of an owl in flight. When I return at night, it is vibrantly and dramatically lit in reds, blues and purples which bring the carved details into stark relief. The rest of the grounds function like a courtyard between four large tents and Fort Gibraltar (a re-creation of a historic trading post). Outside, there are a few food trucks featuring the usual fare: popularized French-Canadian offerings (read: poutine) and variations of deep-fried dough (e.g., mini doughnuts and beaver tails). The smell of deep-fried food wafts around the grounds.

The festival site includes impressive snow sculptures worthy of a fine-arts museum. They are entries in an international snow carving competition. There is also a snow and ice monument commissioned from Jamie Black, creator of The REDress Project for Missing and Murdered Indigenous women and girls. It features dresses in the four colours of the medicine wheel frozen in ice panes. It is moving and feels stark amidst laughing children and signs for sleigh rides.

Inside the tents is where most of the programming occurs. Each of the four large tents includes a stage, bars, and more food vendors. I pause to listen to some Acadian fiddlers in the tent with

primarily Francophone programming. I walk past a line up for the cabane a sucre and an Indigenous programming area. I enter a second tent and find it full of families enjoying festival food at picnic tables and a local Winnipeg rapper taking the stage. I peek into Fort Gibraltar, which looks and sounds far more like a restaurant with its soft curtains and clinking cutlery. It is the only truly indoor space at the festival. Older couples are eating here, and the musical stylings are that of a local singer-songwriter on a small stage with her guitar. I leave the festival for the afternoon, planning to return for the evening music.

Upon my return, around 7pm, the feeling of the festival has shifted entirely, from family winter fun to 18+ music-festival-somewhat-incidentally-in-winter. Outside most of the tents, lines have formed as they approach their capacity and IDs are checked at the door. The atmosphere is friendly; a group of young adults strike up a conversation with me in line.

Once inside, I am once again greeted by the lovely smell of the cedar wood chips. The tent I select for the evening features bleachers (rather than the picnic tables seen earlier) and is the largest performing space at the festival. The bleachers, cedar chips, and number of people clad in jeans and plaid do lend a rodeo-feel to the space. Gone are the young families of the day, instead the space is populated by adults ranging from early 20s to 60+.

The tents are kept quite warm - certainly warm enough to shed a few of the many layers necessary to keep you safe standing outside in line. I hear a couple of people complain about this - needing to dress up warm for the lines but then being too hot inside with few options for storing your coat and other winter gear.

The music starts up and I am struck by how good it sounds. I'm particularly impressed by the sound quality considering we're in a tent in a park in February in Winnipeg. The lighting is also what one might expect from a fully equipped performance venue. Between acts, I stand in line to purchase food or drink. While the lines are long, they move quickly. Again, people are friendly and spirits seem high; I chat with another small group. However, as I attempt to make my way to the bathroom, I discover perhaps the only unpleasant part of my experience; using the bathroom involves leaving the heated tent and using an outdoor portable toilet in the cold and dark.

I return to the warm tent for the remainder of the concert and leave the festival once the performance concludes. I walk out of the festival grounds and proceed back through the St. Boniface neighbourhood to my hotel.

5.2. Interview Results

This section summarizes emergent themes from interviews with key informants. Participants were city staff, festival organizers, tourism and business development professionals, and community organization staff. Participants offered their perspectives both in the context of their professional expertise and their personal experiences living in their city. Emergent themes were organized into three categories: Celebration, Place, and Dyads.

5.2.1. Celebration

Celebrating winter is an in vivo theme that emerged from interviews with participants across all cities and professions. This theme refers to the ideas around appreciating and engaging winter and the opportunities it offers. From the perspective of informants, the value of celebrating winter is almost self-evident:

> S5: I think celebrating that we choose to live in a Northern climate is an important part of this whole thing.

> W2: It's cold in winter, but it can also be a great time to enjoy the outdoors and celebrate what we have.

> E2: ...people are getting out and celebrating winter... As we should because it is our longest season!

Participants S5, W2, and E2 express that celebrating winter is important, even imperative. In this context, celebration is understood as the opposite to ignoring or rejecting winter weather (e.g., low temperatures), and goes farther than merely accepting or enduring winter. Celebration is about *embracing* winter for what it offers:

> S4: ...it gets people out, there's the joy of, even when it's cold, the joy of "this isn't gonna stop me, I'm going to get out and enjoy"

W2: ...it's about showcasing the amazing things that our city has to offer, and sort of to shy away from "it's cold so we don't go outside". That is not our city. We embrace winter here.

The participants do not dispute that winter is cold, but rather emphasize that the cold should be embraced through being outdoors. For participants, celebrating winter entails taking advantage of winter's unique outdoor opportunities. These include appreciating its natural beauty and winter recreation (e.g., skating, skiing):

S2: ...like no, this is a beautiful place, blue skies, hoarfrost, light displays, fresh air, you know?

E1: I think opportunity is the first thing I think of [when thinking of winter in Edmonton], it's an opportunity to get outside and play in a different way. We tend to think about recreation in summer terms, so it's an opportunity to think a little differently about recreation.

E2: You look forward to winter because there were different activities that you looked forward to in winter that you don't do in summer.

Participants discussed the seasonal exclusivity of these activities. In addition, they remarked on the relationship children have with winter, typically engaging in more winter-exclusive recreation than adults (including formal activities like winter sports and informal activities such as building snow forts). As a result, childhood memories of winter may be more positive than adult relationships with winter:

S1: I think kids experience winter differently than adults, I'm usually the one standing there being cold wanting to be in a warm car, but she's the one out there being active.

E6: Most kids love winter. They love playing in the snow, and then as adults, as we get older we tend to forget how to do that.

Participants S1 and E6 point out how children are active in winter - playing outside in the snow and cold - in contrast to adults who may just be "standing there being cold" (S1). In addition to

opportunities for beauty and recreation, winter is understood to offer social and economic opportunities:

> E1: there are lots of winter cities around the world, but our winter contexts are very different, and so what is it about Edmonton's winters that are different and what are those assets? ...We do a great job with festivals so there's an economic opportunity, there's a cultural opportunity with the festivals as well. …. we're building a 4-season patio culture, so that's another economic and social opportunity. There's also an opportunity to build and design our city differently. They're built very much like southern cities, but our northern context is very different. So, there is an opportunity to improve how we design and build our city.

Participant E1 raises social and economic opportunities that are exclusive to winter may vary between winter cities. Participants understand winter as a time of unrealized opportunity. Realizing these opportunities, including unique social and economic assets, beauty, and recreation, is a key part of moving towards a more celebratory relationship with winter. In summary, celebration refers to actively embracing winter not in spite of characteristics like low temperature and snow, but *because* of what these characteristics offer in terms of previously unrealized opportunities.

5.2.1.1. Changing Attitudes

Within discussion of celebrating winter is implicit and explicit recognition that celebration is not the prevailing attitude; these opportunities are indeed largely unrealized. Changing attitudes emerged as a key policy goal for cities, especially in Edmonton, where it was identified as a necessary piece for the success of all other winter initiatives:

> E1: People were complaining, pretending it didn't exist, hibernating, and then complaining about their quality of life for half the year, and [a councillor] just saw it as this downward, downward spiral, and we needed to reverse that trend

> E6: ...attitude changing... changing our collective story. So how do we talk about it? How do we think about winter, changing attitudes, right down to "how do we decide how our budget's going to be spent?"... attitude changing is all-encompassing.

S1: The typical view is that Saskatoon in winter is a thing we endure not a thing to celebrate, and we were thinking how can we move the mentality toward a more positive way around winter, where this thing needs applause and needs a badge of honour.

Participants E1 and E6 draw attention to how a negative attitude towards winter has wide reaching effects, from quality of life to budget priorities. Participant S1 points out winter could be a point of pride. Taking pride in winter also emerged in the context of shifting attitudes in tourism. From this perspective, being a cold city was a unique selling-point in the tourism market, even if local residents needed to be convinced of this advantage:

W1: Yeah, I would say that I guess Winnipeg traditionally, with the exception of Festival du Voyageur, has kind of been "it's cold and miserable here in winter" kind of thing, right? But that's changing. That's changing with the support of the tourism agencies and that kind of stuff, people are becoming more proud of being a cold destination and a cold city.

W2: I think Canadians can be a bit self-deprecating about winter, and we can be negative about the cold, and I think that's where it's about ensuring that there's the right message from the tourism boards. I think they have an important place, not just to external visitors, but rallying local citizens to say, "we are fortunate to be able to celebrate and get out and do these winter activities" and it's an advantage and we should celebrate that.... And I think yeah, sometimes that in the tourism world that's what we're up against, is convincing some of our own locals about the advantages of winter and being positive around it.

Both W1 and W2 point out that tourism is not just about external attitudes; local attitudes to winter have historically been negative (with the notable exception of Festival du Voyageur) and are shifting in conjunction with tourism reframing Winnipeg as a winter destination. Realizing winter's previously unrealized opportunities is part of both shifting local attitudes and marketing cities to tourists. The changing attitudes theme refers to conversations about collective attitudes towards winter and the need to shift them from largely negative to something more celebratory.

5.2.2. Place

In responding to questions about Winter Cities, participants discussed their relationship to the city and its unique geography, history, culture, features, and events in conjunction with season specific relationships.

5.2.2.1. River

Each of the case study cities features a river running through the centre of the city (or two, in the case of Winnipeg). Participants from all three cities remarked on their city's relationship with the river and adjacent valley in the context of winter.

In Edmonton, participants referred to activities in the River Valley, a network of parks along the river banks through the city. In particular, recreation such as cross-country skiing and skating in river valley parks was considered a winter asset:

> E3: ...in Edmonton, the river valley is always a huge draw for people, just being in urban parkland, but also being steps away from your hotel is very unique, especially for European visitors, they're used to concrete and buildings and buildings and buildings and not having such a gigantic park going right through the city.

The river valley is not only valuable to residents but offers unique opportunities to tourists. It is also used as a site for festivals; two of Edmonton's most popular winter festivals engage directly with the river valley. The Silver Skate Festival site is in Hawrelak Park, adjacent to the river and part of the river valley parks and trails system. Some of Flying Canoe Volant's activities take place in the "magical environment" (E2) of Mill Creek Ravine, part of the North Saskatchewan River system. These festivals recognize the opportunities offered by the wintery river valley (e.g., skating areas, dark and snowy "canvas" for light installations (E2)).

The North Saskatchewan river, however, does not freeze consistently and cannot be relied upon for transportation or other on-river activities. Participants in Saskatoon remarked that their South Saskatchewan River also does not freeze in the winter due to the Queen Elizabeth Power Station releasing hot water in the river (S1; S2; S3).

> S3: ...but there's the power plant that's upstream, so it throws off extra warm heat, so it definitely has changed the ecology of the river, so not recently, so there's been a lot of different adaptations, and plants and animals that have kind of adapted to the fact that the river doesn't freeze. And people here, honestly most of the time don't notice that it's weird.

Participant S3 observes that while the river flowing through winter is the result of human-activity (rather than climate), residents, plants, and animals are accustomed to it. However, participants in Saskatoon did refer to winter-specific activities in the river valley. Here, discussion of the river is strongly connected to local ecology:

> S3: a lot of things specifically about winter that are really interesting, and the ecology that happens in the winter, and the different adaptations of plants and animals and people to how we actually function in the winter. It's a very long season, so if we try to ignore winter and try to just stay inside and not have any programming, I think we're missing an opportunity for education, but we're also losing a lot of time throughout the year.

With regard to opportunities for education, participant S3 referenced The Meewasin Trail, a trail and parks system along the river valley. It features winter-specific activities and programming:

> S3: ...snowfall tracking, so the snow provides an opportunity to see where and how the animals move throughout the winter, which is interesting, so we just completed a citizen science event where we had a bunch of people come to Beaver Creek, which is one of our sites in the south, and track animals and look at trees specifically in the winter, because when there's no leaves it's a lot easier to see the buds and some of the bark stuff... conservation and education folks do a lot of seasonal programming for the winter

Participant S3 remarks on how winter conditions provide an opportunity to learn about nature in ways that are not as easy or possible in other seasons. Discussion of the river valley in Saskatoon centered around these ecological learning opportunities, though there was some mention of recreational activities such as skiing and skating rinks as part of the Meewasin Trail system.

In Winnipeg, the River Trail was often discussed as one of Winnipeg's defining Winter features and an example of embracing winter. Because it freezes entirely, the river is a site of recreation and even a transportation corridor through the city:

> W4: ...the more interesting skate, the denser neighbourhoods, is going west on the Assiniboine and that's one of the beauties or the most intriguing parts of the River Trail, it connects neighbourhoods that are normally separated by the river and it

makes this great active transportation route that people use to commute and recreate, and people will cut through the forks or get to other downtown places.

Participant W4 speaks to the value of an on-river transportation corridor as it changes the river from a barrier between parts of the city to a connector. The river is also the site of events, including an haute-cuisine pop-up restaurant (Raw Almond) and winter warming hut competitions. These events are a key winter feature in Winnipeg:

> W2: The Forks Market has pop-up saunas,... [the world's] longest skating trail,... our international warming hut competition,... all these elements that give these really out of the box experiences. You might have heard about our pop-up restaurant Raw Almond that was basically a restauranteur a few years ago and an architect decided to put a pop-up restaurant on the river trail.

> W3: We normally… have the world's longest skating trail on the river... we have this amazing river trail, where we have architects from around the world that actually submit design ideas for warming huts, and it's a huge competition every year that takes place.

> W3: I have my winter checklist of things that I wanna do, it's really the things like the Raw Almond, it's, you know, when the Forks will do a DJ that's on the ice with an ice bar and there's fire pits, and you're hanging out on the river in the middle of winter at night, there's a DJ playing, but you're outside. Those are like, amazing experiences. I love that kind of thing; for me that embodies winter.

Participants W2 and W3 express excitement about the opportunities offered by the frozen river in the context of both their work in tourism and business development and their personal experiences living in Winnipeg. Notably, the River Trail and associated activities could not take place the year this research was conducted (Winter 2019/2020) as the river had frozen too high early in the winter, compromising access points. Participant W3 estimated this had not happened since 2001. The route of the River Trail also changes each year based on ice conditions. In previous years, the River Trail has connected Festival du Voyageur with the rest of the City, but the relevant section of the Red River no longer reliably freezes solid, possibly due to the construction of a new bridge.

The Red River also has cultural history as the geographic boundary between the Francophone St. Boniface and Anglophone Winnipeg:

> W1: So, St. Boniface is really the heart of Francophone Manitoba, and so that's where most Francophone folks settled. So, in St. Boniface we always joke about "across the river". And so, Francophones are on this side of the river and on the other side of the river is Winnipeg and Anglophones, and that was more prominent when the cities were separate. So yeah, there's that saying, "across the river" and that means Anglophones, but the festival is fully bilingual.

Participant W1 remarks on the historic role of the river as a boundary between cultural groups. The river theme captures conversation around the case study of cities' relationships to their rivers and river valleys, a shared and important feature in prairie cites.

5.2.2.2. Authenticity

Being "authentic to our context" (E1) was a prominent theme in conversations with city staff, tourism professionals, and festival organizers, though with slightly different applications. City staff spoke to the importance of strategies and policies being context specific and geographically appropriate:

> E1: So 'authentic' was very quickly identified as a guiding principle, and what that means was it had to be based on our context in every way you can think of, and it has to work for Edmontonians first.

Participant E1 describes that authenticity requires both consideration of place-specific context and the prioritization of local residents. It is not adequate for ideas and policies to simply be winter-based, they must recognize the specific winter conditions of the place in which they are being applied. Some winter ideas that may not be applicable to the Canadian prairie context due to geographical differences:

> S3: I do find it hard sometimes when... people from other places are like "winter, winter, winter!" and how easy it is to do things in winter, and you look at their climate and it's -5,

right? So yeah, it would be super easy to do everything in winter and have them walk everywhere, and outdoor patios when it's only -5.

E6: We can't just take an idea from Scandinavia and say "oh, here this is from a winter city, let's just take this and impose it on Edmonton." It might not work because our winters are very different, our snow loads are different, the way our cities are designed and built are different, the culture's different.

Participants S3 and E6 consider different weather conditions between places (temperature, precipitation). Participant E6 also points out that built form and culture contribute to distinct and place-specific winters. This is not only important when considering international experiences of winter; even in the context of the Canadian prairie, winter is place-specific. For example, participants in Edmonton (E3) and Saskatoon (S1; S2) remarked that Winnipeg's popular and iconic river activities were not possible in their cities as the rivers do not freeze.

E3: Winnipeg they have a culinary festival on the river, and you can activate the river, and skate on the river, and their whole forest area is a very cool area to be in the winter, but it's hard to recreate any of that here, just based on the fact that our river doesn't freeze the same… So, you see what works, but it's hard to copy a lot of it.

Participant E3 speaks to how different winter cities present different opportunities. The success of a winter event somewhere does not guarantee its success everywhere. In addition to these topographic and climatic considerations, participants also spoke more generally about winter initiatives being "based in community" (E1). To achieve this both Edmonton and Saskatoon's WinterCity strategies undertook extensive community engagement during plan development:

E1: We decided the first thing, we knew it had to be really based in community. So, we struck up the WinterCity Think Tank, which is a group of community leaders and we launched in January of 2012, the official beginning of the strategy. And lots of community engagement, right, we based our strategy on the consultation… which was based on all the feedback we got, where we basically asked people "what would make you fall in love with winter in Edmonton?"

E6: They did a huge public campaign and what was pretty unique about that campaign was they brought emotion into it. You know, like cities usually, we go to the public and we say "okay, how are we doing with our potholes?" and "how often do you want your garbage collected?" and you know, it's all these kind of mundane things where we ask about classes at the rec centre, or things like that. But with this one they asked, "what would make you fall in love with Edmonton in winter?" So, it brought in emotion which is pretty unusual. They city doesn't usually do that… they talked about "what did you love about winter as a kid?" and so when people thought about winter as a kid, most kids love winter.

S1: The project started out as being kind of a co-city co-community type of project, sort of unique that way I guess, there's been a lot of engagements around what we should be including in the project, what we should be including in the strategy as we move forward, now we're at the point where we've taken all that information, now we're going out to our various stakeholders… We are having a session with them really about: This is what we've heard from everybody in our various community engagement events, and this is what our strategy can look like because we've been really focused on quick wins for the past number of years, but now it's really about let's get something on paper. Let's get a strategy that can really get us going instead of chasing quick wins.

Participants E1 and E6 describe a key piece of Edmonton's extensive community engagement: starting community conversation around what they love about winter. Participant E1 in particular highlights the importance of being "based in community." Participant S1 describes Saskatoon's incorporation and prioritization of community involvement in the development of their WinterCity Strategy; engagement occurred at multiple phases. For city staff participants, authenticity refers to recognition of the specific context of winter in their cities, including physical and social context. Authenticity is key to developing winter strategy and policy; it is understood to ensure appropriateness and efficacy.

In the case of festival organizers, authenticity featured similar consideration of local weather and geographic features but with an added emphasis on cultural and historical connections. This was closely tied to storytelling, especially for the Francophone cultural festivals (discussed further in the following section). Festival organizers spoke to different cultural practices in winter, which could exist in tension with each other:

E2: Okay, it's another perspective where...always as a Franco-Albertan I feel like I'm stuck between a sugar shack and a rodeo, identifying more to that western culture because that's where I'm from. And we don't have maples, we don't have sugar maples. So, me it's always been this imported thing, once again importing this thing from somewhere else, rather than creating our own. So, the sugar shack is recognizing that tradition of our eastern roots, you know, way back when, but adapting that to our urban context.

S5: We're trying to make the programming match up to the communities that we're in and tell stories of who are here now. I don't need to tell another fucking story about hockey in Canada… I'm so tired of tropes and stereotypes in Canada, and people are hanging on like grim death to some of those signifiers, and it's hard, the number one participation sport in Canada 12 years ago became soccer. We are not a hockey country anymore, you know? But the reigns of certain things are held by old white guys, we're still supposed to believe that about ourselves. So, I'd much rather this event, this program, really truly represents what Canada is and what it's become.

Participant E2 speaks to the popularity of the sugar shack or 'cabane a sucre' at western Franco-Canadian events and festivals despite the fact that Alberta francophones have distinct cultural practices from francophones in Quebec and Ontario; sugar shacks use maple syrup from the sugar maple, which grows in eastern Canadian and extends only as far west as the south-eastern corner of Manitoba. For E2, authenticity means reflecting the cultural practices of specific places. Participant S5 speaks to broad Canadian "stereotypes," such as hockey fanaticism, as being out of date and sees authenticity as "truly represent[ing]" current Canadian culture. Festival organizers also remarked on engagement and inclusion of Indigenous community members as key to an authentic festival. Organizers of the Franco-Canadian based festivals in particular remarked on recent efforts to expand beyond settler-colonial French history and include Indigenous programming:

W1: Yeah, so for us this is our 50th anniversary, and we've really self-reflected on how we've done a really great job of representing Francophone culture over our 50 years, and we've kind of left behind representing Indigenous culture, and the reason why it's important to change that is because the fur trade era included a deep kinship and exchanges between Indigenous peoples and voyageurs and the fur trade era included

trading with Indigenous peoples. The birth of the Metis people was relationships between Indigenous people and Francophone people and Anglophones too, so for us it's only natural to have Indigenous cultures stand side by side with Francophone culture if we want to represent the fur trade era. So, for us that seems authentic, it is authentic for us to go in that direction and it's something we're looking to correct.

Participant W1 points out the history of Franco-Canadians is connected to and shaped by Indigenous history and that representing that in the festivities is more "authentic" than only representing Franco-Canadian culture. Participant W2 also ties this authenticity to celebration:

W2: I think locals are very much part of sort of celebrating our winter, and if you look at Festival du Voyageur, though it's meant to celebrate French culture and yes it attracts the core of Francophones, 60% of visitation is from English speaking neighbourhoods in Winnipeg... it's very much a celebration locally of our Francophone, Metis and Indigenous culture and celebrating the fur trade, but it's also a time to celebrate winter and engage our visitors in that story.

While Franco-Canadian and Indigenous culture are the most extensively discussed and represented (Flying Canoe Volant; Festival du Voyageur), Silver Skate "tie[s] in with the Dutch community and their popularity with long skate speed skating" (E3) and Winter Shines 2020 featured Chinese community groups and culture, as the dates of the festival overlapped with Chinese New Year Celebrations.

The theme of authenticity captures discussion around the value placed on place-specific policy and festivals.

5.2.2.2.1 Storytelling

This sub theme refers to discussion of authenticity derived through storytelling and is particularly present in conversation about the Franco-Canadian based festivals:

E2: I think what fundamentally we're getting to is [Flying Canoe Volant] telling an Edmonton story. And I think that is its strength, and we're hearing it from patrons year after year, I feel that I'm a part of this story-- whether you're French, or you're not French or if

you're a new Canadian, you feel like you're partaking in a piece of history and those celebrations

> W1: It's very important because unlike other festivals… [Festival du Voyageur] is anchored in history. There's a real story behind it. Some other festivals are just about music or about whatever, whether it's a jazz fest, or folk fest or whatever it's about music, which is great, but we have a very special place in the community because we tell an authentic story of where a lot of folks from up here came from.

These participants describe the stories their festivals tell: historic and contemporary accounts of cultural connections to place. These authentic, place-based stories make the festivals unique and authentic.

Language around stories and storytelling was also present in discussion of policy and tourism. Tourism Edmonton have been key implementers of objectives from Edmonton's WinterCity Strategy Winter Story pillar (E1). Tourism in Winnipeg and Edmonton discussed the importance of a winter narrative in marketing:

> W2: …we have these incredible assets, and we have to leverage them in order to tell our story better, to apply them to life in Winnipeg better in winter.

> E6: One of the [Winter] Story actions is… is [to] develop winter product tours and packages, and then a winter chapter of the Edmonton brand, and then leveraging marketing campaigns. So, we did that by working with Edmonton Tourism, and they created a winter campaign. The first ever winter campaign for doing outdoor stuff.

Participants W2 and E6 describe an imperative to tell "their" winter story as a way of showcasing their cities and increasing their attractiveness to tourism. These place stories are understood to be an authentic means of marketing the city to external parties.

5.2.2.3. Identity

Participants across cities discussed experiencing winter as part of their cities' identity. This is apparent in statements such as "we are a winter city" (E6; S1; S4; W3) and "we embrace winter

here" (W2). The shared experience of winter weather conditions was sometimes recognized as a unifying cultural experience or a source of pride:

> S6: We kind of want celebrate community and celebrate the fact that we are a hardy bunch and when it gets to be -40 and -50 we can still be prepared

> W2: There's almost a sense of pride that we're in Winnipeg, it's cold in winter, but it can also be a great time to enjoy the outdoors and celebrate what we have.

> W1: The support of the tourism agencies and that kind of stuff, people are becoming more proud of being a cold destination and a cold city.

Participant S6 remarks on celebrating the community's navigation of cold weather. Participants W1 and W2 describe a pride that stems recognizing what their city can offer that other places cannot: opportunities only possible due to the winter weather are worth being proud of. Recognizing these unique opportunities and showcasing them to others is sometimes discussed using language around owning this identity, especially in the context of tourist attraction:

> E3: I think it's interesting how we've reframed what we are as a destination… we're looking at being a winter city and owning that, because that's what we are. Let's own it, and then let's share it with people.

> W2: We kind of own winter here. You might have heard the expression 'Winterpeg', it can have very negative connotations, but I think in the last decade we've taken a lot of pride in winter here in the city, so I think of winter in Winnipeg as fun, sunny, exploring the great outdoors, to gathering with friends in sort of the hottest meeting spots in the city like the Forks, which gets as many visitors in winter as they do in summer.

Participants E3 and W2 both describe reframing perceptions of their cities through owning the reality of winter and compare winter tourism to summer tourism. The storytelling subtheme refers to telling the story of places and their cultural histories.

5.2.2.4. Inter-Place Connections

As part of conversation around place, participants often discussed their city in relation to other places and the movement of people, ideas, and material between places.

5.2.2.4.1. Canadian Connections

Participants discussed influences, ideas, and other connections with other Canadian cities. Edmonton was often cited by participants from Saskatoon and Winnipeg:

> S1: Edmonton for sure, huge, probably the biggest draw of guidance we've looked to in terms of developing this….I'd say Edmonton for sure has been the biggest influence on our strategy, we've modelled it very similarly over what they've done.

> W4: We've been to Edmonton for the winter cities conference a couple years ago, I think Edmonton really got us thinking about lighting.

Participant S1 speaks to the influence of Edmonton's WinterCity Strategy and Participant W4 refers to knowledge sharing at Winter City Shake-up conferences. In addition to the prairie cities, participants occasionally referred to winter practices in Quebec and Ontario (E6). Quebec City (E1), particularly Carnaval de Quebec (E2), was also a source of inspiration, along with Montreal (E1; E5) and the Montreal en Lumiere festival (E2). Ottawa (E5) and the Rideau Canal (W1; W4) were also mentioned, especially in the context of outdoor skating.

These Canadian connections were sometimes connected to broader Canadian identity stemming from shared experiences of winter:

> E5: I love all the seasons... I think it's part of our Canadian genetic makeup.

> E4: A winter event; something that is sort of uniquely Canadian.

> W2: Canada is known for winter.

Participants E5, E4, and W2 speak to a shared and distinct Canadian identity tied to winter and known by other places. This sub theme of Canadian Connections captures the connections between the three case study cities as well as other Canadian cities.

5.2.2.4.2. International Connections

International connections also served as a source of inspiration, as well as a tourism connection. Scandinavian countries (E2; E4; E6) in particular were referred to by participants:

> E1: Go to Scandinavia or someplace, go to Finland or someplace, and that's where you're gonna see most of the world-leading stuff

Participant E1 summarizes general perceptions of Scandinavia as effectively navigating winter; development of Edmonton's Winter City Strategy included a "study tour" in Northern Europe (E1). Edmonton also has a relationship with Dutch airline KLM, bringing European tourists to enjoy Edmonton and skiing in Jasper (E3).

Silver Skate, Festival du Voyageur, Deep Freeze, and the Forks in Winnipeg all feature international ice or snow sculpting competitions and warming hut design competitions. Competitors come from across the world, including countries with warmer climates such as Argentina, Mexico, and Australia. This sub theme of International Connections encompasses participants' references to the movement of winter ideas across international borders.

5.2.2.4.3. Immigration

Participants occasionally referred to "new Canadians" (E2) and how to accommodate and support their engagement with winter and winter festivals:

> S2: We have had 27,000 new Canadians move to Saskatoon in the last 5 years I've heard, and a lot of people come from not winter places... To really feel integrated here, and enjoy living here, you really have to make it an enjoyable, safe, fun experience to be outside. I know the immigrant settlement agencies do a lot of work about how to dress appropriately for the weather... and share clothes that might help people be more comfortable. But it can be an awfully long winter in an apartment and being isolated... We do learn to skate programs, and that [downtown] rink is extremely successful. There's a little wood stove there, it's nice and free!

> S3: Our downtown rink location is super popular with new Canadians, because a lot of them have never skated before or having first experiences with winter, there's a fireplace

inside, it's a whole Canadian kind of get up, so we get a lot of tourists and a lot of new Canadians in there, and again most of our events are all completely free and public access

W4: There's a lot of new Canadians that are coming from areas that don't have ice-skating, and we'll put on these new Canadian skate programs and things like that, and they're very popular. And if you come on the weekend mostly there's a big group of first-time skaters out there that are all using it. And I think if we keep tapping into that, just making it as easy as possible for people to keep going, help people embrace winter and their new life here, I guess.

Participant S2 speaks to the context of immigration in Saskatoon. Participants S3 and S4 both remark on the novelty of winter recreation for new Canadians. All three participants highlight skating, in particular. This sub theme captures the changing discussion around both the challenges winter may pose to "New Canadians" and the importance of winter activities for developing connections to place.

5.2.3. Dyads

Throughout the results, complex relationships emerged between seemingly opposite ideas. These relationships are at times tense: festival organizers describe navigating the challenges of weather being cold enough for winter activities but warm enough for attendee comfort. However, despite these tensions, dyads are also mutually constitutive: winter light installations are only possible due to long, dark nights. These relationships are referred to using the term 'dyads' to capture the complexity of their interplay without implying opposition. Navigating these dyads was a key theme in the accounts of many participants.

5.2.3.1. Warm/Cold

Arguably the most pervasive dyad in the context of winter cities, Warm/Cold captures conversation around navigating cold and warm weather. Participants discussed the importance of keeping warm in the cold as well as the necessity of cold weather for many of the activities and opportunities in winter. Cold winter weather is an inevitable seasonal experience:

S5: When it's -25 everyone still goes to work, still goes to school, so why is it suddenly a drop…I mean, I can't judge them for staying home, but I mean it does seem a little silly. When it's -28 people don't come into work and say oh no I can't, it's too cold.

W2: ...[we] shy away from "it's cold so we don't go outside". That is not our city. We embrace winter here.

Participant S5 describes how in winter cities, life goes on regardless of the cold. Participant W2 ties this attitude to cold with embracing winter. However, embracing cold weather does not mean being cold; it is paired with conversation around how to keep warm. Participants discussed a range of approaches:

E1: Mitigating wind [through design], blocking wind is probably *the* most important thing we can do.

S3: It can be challenging sometimes with students who can't afford or don't have appropriate winter clothing, so we do build that into a lot of our program budgets is to have extra mitts and extra hats and some ski pants laying around, so if they don't have appropriate clothing, we can try to get them outside in some of our stuff.

S6: We have a couple of beverage backpacks that go around giving out free hot chocolate for people who are around.

Participants E1, S3, and S6 describe techniques across different scales for keeping warm, from infrastructure design to hot beverage distribution. Fire is also a common mechanism for staying warm; many festivals feature fire pits (Deep Freeze, Silver Skate, Flying Canoe Volant, Winter Shines, Winterruption). Participants also discussed the importance of keeping moving for warmth:

E2: I'm going outside. I'm wearing my parka and my winter boots and we're dancing. And why do you dance? Well dancing is a way to keep warm.

E5: I've come to learn that unless it's really really fantastic, something really awe-inspiring...it has to be an active activity. Even if it's 0 degrees or -2 degrees, you don't want to be standing. So, there's movement and things to keep them busy, there's a way to keep it going.

W2: I'm an active winter runner... you'll actually warm up when you start running.

Participants E2 and E5 discuss intentionally incorporating movement into festival activities to make them more enjoyable. Participant W2 describes warming up during winter exercise. Festival organizers in particular also discussed the role of heated spaces for keeping warm:

> W1: That is something that is very unique to us and to a winter event I would say, is that things have to be indoors and heated, otherwise people don't show up.

> E5: There's far more challenges in winter than there is for summer. Like I can have people have hypothermia, I can have people get frostbite, so creating and having warming spaces [is important].

Participants W1 and E5 stress that heated space is essential to festival success and safety. The Indoor/Outdoor dyad will be discussed more extensively in the following section, but it is closely connected to keeping warm in cold weather.

On the flip side, while warm weather addresses concerns around individual comfort and safety, it can also compromise festival activities:

> E2: And the same thing when it gets too warm - people are peeling off layers, we love it when it's warm, the sun's shining, but at the same time, all of a sudden, the snow is soft, then it's mushy, then it's freezes, then it becomes ice, so for patrons, it's a real concern, like how can we keep all those trails... safe to navigate.

> S3: We have had to close the rink as well if it's too warm, so it starts to create dips and holes in the ice surface, and it's again another safety issue that we have actually had to close the rink for a few days and wait for it to get cold again and then flood over the holes, so yes winter, it's never exactly the temperature that you need.

> S4: There's often times melting periods which kind of, [I] wouldn't say ruins, but I guess…impacts…trying to think of a positive word, impacts the festival's ability to show the creative side, so the ice and the snow sculptures.

Participant E2 describes the logistical challenges warm weather and freeze-thaw cycles can create. Participants S3 and S4 describe warm weather restricting recreation activities and festival features. Cold weather is understood not only as a challenge to be navigated with mechanisms for keeping warm, but also a necessary component of winter celebration activities like festivals and winter recreation. The Warm/Cold dyad refers to recognition that keeping warm in the cold is a major concern for winter cities, but also that cold weather is essential to winter celebration.

5.2.3.2. Indoor/Outdoor

The Indoor/Outdoor dyad refers to conversations around utilization of indoor and outdoor space, particularly at festivals. This dyad is closely tied to the Warm/Cold dyad; conversation about indoor space is almost always in the context of keeping warm. However, this theme is distinct in capturing some statements around the value of being outside in winter and emphasis on the spaces used. Conversation was focused primarily on outdoor spaces and activities (e.g., skating, skiing), which are understood as ways to celebrate winter. In order to balance celebrating winter through the utilization of outdoor space and the necessity of heated spaces for comfort and safety, participants describe the creation of "in between" spaces (e.g., heated tents at outdoor festivals, heated patios). These spaces play a crucial role in enabling outdoor events and activities. Participants often mention winter-exclusive activities and recreation which necessitate being outside (e.g., skiing, kick sledding, outdoor skating, snow shoeing) as attractive and valuable aspects of winter.

> E2: We created pedways and we were telling people, "get off the street, get inside." and now it's like no, get outside! [Edmonton has a] winter patio strategy, encouraging businesses to open their patio. Why do we shut [patios in the winter?]

> S6: What we wanted to do with [the outdoor portion of the festival] was kind of make something really special and intriguing enough that people came out... we have two tipis, and we have demonstrations from local business owners for fat biking and snow shoeing and other business owners have kick sleds, there's some snowdrift that happens in association with the school... It's lots of fun and it's all about... people having a really good time outside in the middle of winter.

> E3: ...the more outdoor adventure things, snowshoe, skiing, cross-country skiing... fat biking and the ice castles are also very popular.

Participant E2 speaks critically about infrastructure that encourages and enables residents to stay inside, as well as winter patios that enable economic activity throughout the year. Participant W2 describes how being outdoors and enjoying outdoor recreation are ways winter is celebrated. Participant E3 mentions similar recreational activities in the context of attracting prospective tourists.

Being outside does, however, pose a number of challenges for community organizations and festival organizers:

> S3: Planning events in an outdoor environment is hard in the winter, and it can be discouraging sometimes if you plan things and then they have to get cancelled because it's too cold, or it's too windy, so, and it's not as fun to do them inside and some of them you can't.

> S4: You know, that's why it's important to have both indoor and outdoor activities, and have some outdoor activities that aren't dependent on the weather… You can't beat mother nature, and you just have to work around and make things so that there are some things that can be sustained throughout the festival that are not weather-dependent.

Participants S3 and S4 speak to the unpredictability of outdoor activities and S4 suggests that indoor activities are useful in part due to their reliability. While many of the winter festivals are primarily outdoors (excepting Winterruption), festivals also find value in indoor space; Flying Canoe Volant, Deep Freeze, Winterruption, and Winter Shines all utilize heated buildings. However, not all heated spaces are fully enclosed, indoor spaces in permanent structures. Many festivals utilize heated tents (including Deep Freeze, Festival du Voyageur, Winterruption, Silver Skate, and Festival du Voyageur), creating an "in between space": neither fully indoors nor fully outdoors.

> W1: We have canvas tents that are really meant to be put up in summer for weddings and events, and very thin walls, and then we heat them, right?

> E2: Let's be outside but inside this temporary structure, create something that's unique.

Participants W1 and E1 refer to utilizing heated tents for events. In some cases, these "in between" spaces are used to ensure comfort for festival volunteers and performers:

> E4: we kind of look at it that day, it was -12, we had a little bit of a breeze, so it felt about -18, so it was a little bit chilly, but inside the tent it was a lot better, and the artists didn't have a problem, we had heaters set up on stage for the artists.

Participant E4 raises how performer needs may be different from those of festival attendees. Additionally, "in between" spaces are not limited to festivals. Winnipeg's on-river restaurant and outdoor patios across cities in some ways "alter" outdoor space to make it more comfortable.

> E4: We also had a polar patio… they have a little fire there, they've got heating lamps, and it's a big easement of temperature, -10 through -15.

Participant E4 describes a dramatic temperature change on an outdoor patio as a result of small interventions. Participants also referred to warming huts, particularly along trails and skating trails in Saskatoon and Winnipeg (S1; S4; W2; W3; W4). While the Indoor/Outdoor dyad has close ties to discussion around keeping warm, it captures distinct themes around the value of being outside and the creation of "in between" to facilitate winter celebration.

5.2.3.3. Light/Dark

The relationship between light and dark was a common topic in interviews, especially with festival organizers. This dyad refers to the long, dark nights characteristic of northern cities in winter and the possibilities they offer in terms of creative and effective lighting.

> E2: We have darkness. So, it's funny, even on the Winter City Committee I'm saying, "we have to look at darkness, change the mindset of darkness." Darkness is an asset, and how are we using that uniqueness of our winters to our advantage? So, it's like, turn the conversation around.

Participant E2 summarizes effectively the reality of darkness and how attitudes must shift to understand it as an opportunity. All of the winter festivals feature some kind of lighting display, often paired with snow or ice sculptures. These displays are often extremely artistic, and function

as beautiful additions to the festival site. Silver Skate and Flying Canoe Volant feature creatively lit trails. Flying Canoe Volant also includes stand-alone artistic light installations designed to use the "snow [as a] canvas" (E2).

> E2: …this is Edmonton in winter. And the magic of light. And I say we celebrate everything that's great about a long winter's night. Because there's a lot of long winters' nights and it's just, how do we create something that is vibrant and interesting, down in a municipal park at the bottom of a ravine, in the dead of night? I mean, those aren't places you frequent on a normal basis at those times, so I think it creates an intrigue as well. And then the artwork that is exposed is absolutely amazing as well, so it all fits together somehow.

Participant E2 describes the beauty and uniqueness of winter lighting installations. These are only possible (and indeed made more important) by the long, dark nights inherent to winter. In addition to festivals, lighting considerations also appeared in discussions with city staff. Edmonton is developing a lighting strategy (E1); the strategy does not seek to "[re]create daylight" (E6) but rather create something unique and special to winter nights. The Forks in Winnipeg is giving increasing consideration to the lighting of their skating trails to increase usage (W4). Saskatoon has also seen financial investment in light:

> S2: [The City] did inject some funding into the decorative lighting program this year, and then Council injected more money into it which is good cause those are the lighting fixtures that go on poles every season. Trying to bring them more into a winter than a Christmas [theme].

Participant S2 speaks to shifting Saskatoon's decorative lighting away from just Christmas to be used as beautiful city decoration throughout the winter.

A minor but related point is also the dualism of long, dark nights and bright, sunny days. All case study cities experience a high number of sunny days throughout the winter (i.e., with no or minimal cloud cover). Participants commented on the beauty and uniqueness of sunny winter days (in comparison to cities like Vancouver, where winter is more overcast) (E2; E5; S2; W2; W4).

> W3: So, to me it's those types of experiences [that embody winter], the super-cold but super-sunny day, but you're out snowshoeing and the crunch of the snow, those are the things that I love, I love the shift in terms of just the difference in vibe in winter, I love everything about it.

Participant W3 summarizes enjoying cold and sunny winter days and how they are distinct from other weather conditions. All the festivals I attended in daytime featured bright sunlight. The Light/Dark dyad captures these conversations around taking advantage of both winter's dark nights and the creative opportunities for lighting, as well as bright, sunny winter days.

5.3. Conclusion

This section has outlined the data collected through participant observations and interviews with key informants. The dyads of Warm/Cold, Indoor/Outdoor, and Light/Dark appear in both my experience of the festivals (e.g., freezing phone, moving between warm indoor space and cool outdoor space, eye-catching lighting displays) and conversations with participants about winter in their city. Participants also discussed the place-specific nature of winter in their city, from authentic engagement with cultural history, unique topographic features, and the movement of people and ideas that contribute to their city's context. Connecting with these place-specific elements, as well as recognizing and navigating inherent dyads, support the theme of celebrating winter. Participants placed emphasis and value on "embracing" winter through taking advantage of winter opportunities such as snow-based recreation and lighting dark nights. The next chapter discusses these themes in the context of the literature summarized in Chapter 2.

6. Discussion

This section considers the empirical results presented above in the context of the literature presented in Chapter 2. The section is structured based on the two research objectives and subsequently answers the research question.

6.1. Place and Winter

The first objective of this research is *to describe the relationship between place and winter in winter cites.* The concept of 'winter cities' speaks to a particular relationship between place and winter in the representation and building of place-identity. Place and winter are brought together in a way that emphasizes authenticity, including physical and societal components of place. In this regard, understandings of winter weather as a set of challenges and opportunities play a central role, as do understandings of the simultaneous differences and similarities of 'winter cities' with other places. These relationships are described in the following three subsections.

6.1.1. Celebrating Place

Across the Winter Cities Movement literature and the results of this study, celebration is a prominent theme. For participants in this study, celebration is inextricably linked with authenticity as it relates to the specifics of place. This is consistent with Relph's (1976) notion of authenticity; he describes an authentic sense of place as "a direct and genuine *experience* of the *entire complex of the identity of places*" (Relph, 1976, p. 64, emphasis added). Conversations around celebrating winter centre on time spent outdoors, experiencing winter weather directly as well as recognizing the specificity of winter across different places. Celebrating winter *is not* a superficial reframing of winter as 'positive' or 'good'; the participants do not dispute that winter is dark or cold but argue that the cold and dark should be celebrated rather than ignored or avoided. Celebration *is* recognizing the challenges and realizing the opportunities winter presents. This celebration, as described by participants, is necessarily place-based and authentic to the "entire complex" of place as Relph describes. And indeed, participants describe an *imperative* to celebrate winter.

Dominant, modernist design and planning approaches sought to "design out" winter, prioritizing standardization and efficiency over vernacular styles and local climatic conditions (Samalavicius, 2017), compromising "the basic and inescapable relationship" between people and place. Consequently, these practices are understood as "inauthentic" to winter cities by participants. The Winter Cities Movement identified that the interaction of this inauthentic built form with winter

weather led to negative experiences of place. Participants reaffirmed this rejection of climate insensitive design, expressing that adaptations to winter in their city must be "authentic to our context" (E1). City Staff participants remarked that it is not adequate for ideas and policies to be simply winter-based, they must recognize the specific winter conditions of the place to which they are being applied (temperature, precipitation, topography). Authenticity in winter city initiatives is achieved through considering all elements of context, including physical and societal components. Festival organizers, particularly cultural festival organizers, emphasize the importance of celebrating the specific cultural history of their city. This is not to say they understood authenticity as 'rooted' as "any place history is always also a history of journeys and connections" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 104, see also Massey ,1994). The presence of French settler-colonial culture in prairie cities is an illustration of such a place history.

The literature acknowledges the role of festivals as "a vehicle for expressing the close relationship between identity and place" (Quinn, 2005, p. 928). The collective experience of winter festivals facilitate fosters a shared identity, "enshrined in activities such as story-telling amongst communities which shapes their collective sense of identity" (Butts and Adams, 2020, p. 7). In winter cities, the emphasis festivals place on authenticity and storytelling reinforces their role as a "vehicle" for representing and building place-identity. Collective identities in winter cities again stem from the specificity and uniqueness of experiencing winter and its opportunities (see *Identity*). Celebrating winter entails creating opportunities and places for shared experience, fostering a more positive place-identity.

This shared experience is tied to attempts to shift negative attitudes about winter weather to a more celebratory relationship. Participants noted that the residents of winter cities "were complaining, pretending [weather] didn't exist, hibernating, and then complaining about their quality of life for half the year" (E1). Participants from across professions described an imperative to shift negative attitudes towards winter, towards a collective celebration of place. This depends in part on a sense of pride fostered by unique weather experiences. As Butts and Adams (2020) remark, "weather has a cultural meaning, both individually and collectively, within the community that creates a sense of shared experience and belonging" (p. 11).

6.1.2. Winter Weather

Weather is one milieu within which place is produced. The concept of "weather places" explicitly acknowledges "both the place dimensions of weather, and the climatic components of place"

(Vannini et al, 2012, p. 373). "Interventions, adaptations, and changes to the built environment to cope with unusual or damaging weather," such as creating enclosed pedestrian systems or designing buildings to block the wind, are informed by weather experiences and change those experiences (Endfield, 2019, p. 4). The built form is dynamic and responsive to weather; it is part of the physical *and* temporal dimensions of place. In winter cities, the interaction between a built form, be it climate-sensitive or climate insensitive, shapes place relationships. Historically, interactions between weather and place-insensitive forms of modernism and urbanization have caused negative experiences of winter in winter cities (Stout et al, 2018; Chapman et al, 2019). This highlights how the relationship between weather, built form and place "influences the way we experience, remember, commemorate, and indeed celebrate place" (Endfield, 2019, pp. 2-3).

In winter cities, winter weather is understood as a set of challenges *and* opportunities. It is not inherently good or bad. In the literature, the Winter Cities Movement is premised upon addressing both the negative and positive aspects of winter (Davies, W. 2015). Blumenfeld (1985) suggests that "specific measures to enhance livability in winter can be sought in two directions: increase in the enjoyment of winter's positive aspects, and protection from the negative ones" (p. 47). In this study, participants' descriptions of their cities were categorized into a series of dyads that demonstrated the simultaneity of seemingly contradictory elements to different degrees across winter places. Participants noted how winter dark nights create the possibility for creative lighting and they saw seizing that opportunity as a celebration of winter. Cold weather poses a very real challenge and even a threat to health. Participants recognized this: keeping warm is a key goal of city and festival design, from infrastructure that blocks wind to festival activities to keep attendees moving.

As weather is the medium through which place is experienced, one cannot experience place without experiencing weather. Participants valued outdoor activities because they are direct experiences of winter weather; this reflects Butts and Adams' (2020) finding that "constructing" places to stay directly connected with weather "represents rebellion against modernity - rejecting the idea of living in an artificial climate (with heating and air conditioning)" (p. 10). However, participants also described how winter necessitates heated space, sheltered from weather. This can include permanent structures, tents erected for the purposes of a festival, or microclimates in public spaces created through climate sensitive design. Over the course of winter, or indeed an evening spent at a festival, "we move along with [weather]" (Vannini et al, 2012, p. 373 citing Satio, 2005) between these spaces. The Winter Cities Movement understands indoor and outdoor

space as distinct and separate entities, with most recent literature valuing outdoor space above indoor. The results suggest however, that this is a false binary. For example, participants supported interventions that improve the usability of outdoor spaces through alteration of the built environment (i.e., sheltering them from the wind, reducing drifting snow, or increasing the temperature). While technically outdoors, these spaces are modified, sometimes extensively, by design choices. Without exception, festival organizers include sheltered, heated spaces in their festivals either in the form of permanent buildings or tents to facilitate enjoyment of outdoor activities. These amenities are not only understood as beneficial, but necessary to the success and safety of a winter festival.

6.1.3. Place-Specific

All places are specific; winter cities are no exception. They are defined by difference and sameness with other places, including other winter cities. Relph (1976; 2016) described this as the paradox of place: "[Place] is always a function both of difference from, and similarities with, other equivalent places... this is the paradox of place. Distinctiveness is defined by reference to sameness" (2016, p. 20). Further, as mobility within and between places has increased, "almost everywhere is now a peculiar amalgam of place and non-place, layered, a blend, a composite, a synthesis, a gathering, a hybrid of different histories and geographies" (Relph, 2016, p. 31). This relationship is profound and very apparent in winter cities. Indeed, the term itself defines these cities by their weather, simultaneously distinguishing them from some cities and grouping them with others. Weather is indeed a key component in place-specificity for winter cities; "places become 'known' and knowable by and through their weather; they are made distinctive from one another into specific 'weather places'" (Endfield, 2019, p. 4, citing Vannini et al, 2012).

This is not to say winter cities are discrete; they exist in constant conversation with other places (Massey, 1994; Relph, 2016). The Winter Cities Movement has defined itself in relation to the differences between winter cities and warmer, often more southern cities (see Pressman, 1996). Similarly, participants in this research described differences and similarities between their cities and other winter places. Both the Movement and participants point to Scandinavian countries as a source of inspirational ideas about "making winter the best it can be" (E1) due to its similarities (experiencing a snowy, dark winter) and differences (e.g., infrastructure designed for winter) (Davies, 2015). Participants also expressed how Scandinavian understandings and approaches to winter are place-specific: "we can't just take an idea from Scandinavia... it might not work because our winters are very different, our snow loads are different, the way our cities are

designed and built are different, the culture's different" (E6). In addition to unique weather conditions, built form and culture contribute to distinct and place-specific winters. This place-specificity is furthered by how these contexts interact with each other.

Even in the context of the Canadian prairie, winter is place-specific. Participants in this research pointed to other Canadian cities as sources of inspiration; this included other case study cities, as well as cities such as Ottawa and Quebec City. Again, while these cities share some similarities (e.g., snowy, cold winters), participants remarked on the contextual (particularly material and cultural) differences as well. While the case study cities were selected for their similarities as mid-sized Canadian prairie cities, there is a mix of differences and similarities operating across them. Participants cited the other case study cities as influences (see results section *Canadian Connections)*. Saskatoon participants, in particular, referenced Edmonton's WinterCity Strategy as an influential document. Moreover, participants pointed to rivers as an example of topographical differences and similarities: of the case study cities, only Winnipeg's river freezes entirely and consistently. Consequently, despite the shared centrality of a major waterway, Winnipeg's river is associated with practices (e.g., river skating) that are not possible in Edmonton and Saskatoon. The Red River in Winnipeg also has a historical cultural meaning unique to the city as the divide between English-speaking Winnipeg and French-speaking St. Boniface. Indeed, Franco-Canadian cultural history is specific to place and different in Edmonton, Winnipeg, and Quebec despite their shared language (see section *Authenticity*). Contextual cultural differences and similarities can be represented through festivals; E2 describes the popularity of sugar shacks, which are representative of a shared cultural history originating in Quebec but stresses the need Albertan festivals to tell Franco-Albertan stories (e.g., voyageur or bûcheron themed).

As Massey (1994) argues, place-specificity is not a result of boundedness or rootedness, but rather "produced through connections to the rest of the world and therefore are more about routes than roots" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 176). Each place engages with other places, borrowing and sharing ideas in unique ways. The case study cities exchange and adapt ideas, and the specific interaction of these ideas with climate, culture, and built form makes for a unique and specific place context. Here, the variability of weather, part of "the multitude of flows that cross boundaries constantly" (Cresswell, 2015, p. 105), is of particular relevance to the conditions that create specific places. Participants often refer to weather, experiences of weather, and relationships to weather in terms of simultaneous differences and similarities with other places.

6.2. Placemaking in a Winter City

The second objective of this research is *to examine placemaking in winter cities,* specifically the three case study cities. In this regard, I am understanding placemaking as a process which "aims to improve the quality of a public place and the lives of its community in tandem" (Silberberg et al., 2013, p. 2 as cited in Ellery et al, 2017, p. 8). I will discuss this focusing primarily on festivals, which emerged as a primary placemaking activity in the case study cities.

6.2.1. Community vs Competition

The literature identified two key understandings of placemaking: the oft-praised community-driven approach and the broadly criticized state-driven practice. Community-based placemaking "creates socially, economically and environmentally sustainable developments,... [and] enhances an overall sense of place" (Dupre, 2019, p. 115). By contrast, state-driven practices are often more concerned with attracting "footloose capital" (Friedmann, 2010, p. 149), the creative class (Madureira, 2015), and tourism (see Dupre, 2019) than serving the interests of residents. In many cities, these practices are a response to the end of their "industrial glory and resultant decline," which prompts efforts to "reposition and promote themselves on a global scale in order to create or maintain reputations as desirable destinations to live, work and visit" (Finkel and Platt, 2019, p. 4). While the Winter Cities Movement is framed in part as a response to deindustrialization and the subsequent decline in population and attractiveness (Gappert, 1987; Pressman, 1988), it *is primarily* concerned with improving quality of life for residents (Davies, 2015). This emphasis on the local community is reflected in the results of this research.

Habibah et al (2013) suggest that "place-making is a process of adding value and meaning to the public realm through community-based revitalisation projects rooted in local values, history, culture, and the natural environment" (p. 86). In the context of policy, participants explained and emphasized the importance of winter strategies being "based in community" (E1), describing this community-based approach as "authentic." Authenticity is a "guiding principle" in Edmonton's Winter City Strategy (E1; E6): "what that means was it had to be based on our context in every way you can think of, and it has to work for Edmontonians first" (E1). Development of the strategy featured frequent and extensive community engagement (E1; E6). Saskatoon's WinterCity strategy also undertook extensive community engagement during plan development, involving community members from the outset and seeing it as a "co-city co-community type of project" (S1). Development of both strategies prioritized community involvement and featured community

engagement mechanisms across multiple phases of strategy development. While this is still a municipality-driven approach, it does seem largely consistent with the qualities of an effective placemaking process that situates "community-based participation at [the] center" and "capitalizes on a local community's assets, inspiration, and potential ... [resulting] in the creation of quality public spaces that contribute to people's health, happiness, and well being" (PPS, 2007, np). Friedmann's (2010) "moral imperative" to shift focus from the competitive capital games of mega-cities and aspirant mega-cities to "the small spaces of the city and their importance... for the people who inhabit them" (p. 150) seems to have been taken up by winter cities through the Winter City Movement's emphasis on public spaces and design, as well as emphasis on community engagement in the case study cities.

Even in the context of tourism and business development, conversation around winter is centred on community and driven by the idea of celebrating winter, a necessarily place-based approach. Participants described an imperative to "tell [their] winter story" (W2) as a way of showcasing their cities and authentically attracting tourism. Tourism professionals in Winnipeg emphasized that promoting tourism should not be separated from "convincing some of our own locals about the advantages of winter and being positive around it" (W2). Winter cities engage the community to improve quality of life and in doing so, make themselves more competitive.

Placemaking in winter cities seeks to celebrate winter and "improve the quality of the lives of all those who use the place" (Richards and Diuf, 2019, pp. 15-16), be they residents, tourists, or anyone else. Placemaking in the case study cities broadly aligned with the placemaking goals described by Silberberg et al (2013) (as cited in Ellery et al, 2017): winter city strategies and design guidelines seek to *build or improve public space* and through climate-sensitive designs, make them more comfortable and inviting gathering spaces throughout the year. Participants describe the need to shift *public discourse* around winter from negative to celebratory. *Creating beauty and delight* is a key component of celebrating winter and the explicit goal of festival organizers. Participants also described fostering *civic pride* and *connecting* residents through shared experiences of winter. With respect to *catalyzing economic development* participants described how winter placemaking in their city was attractive to tourists and business. While winter cities literature emphasizes *promoting environmental sustainability* (see Wantanabe et al, 2017), this concept was not present in interviews. While *supporting community health and safety* and *growing social justice* are possible through placemaking, including festivals, they did not emerge as major placemaking objectives in winter cities. Finally, celebratory winter placemaking

is understood to *nurture an authentic 'sense of place'* through celebrating the city's unique winter opportunities (Silberberg et al., 2013, p. 2 as cited in Ellery et al, 2017, p. 8).

6.2.2. Festivals

Winter festivals are a primary (if not *the* primary) winter placemaking activity in the case study cities. Much of the literature reviewed was critical of festivals, understanding them as "high profile spectacles for tourist consumption" (Gotham, 2005, p. 225) and "employed by cities mainly for marketing, tourism and other socio-economic benefits" (Finkel and Platt, 2019, p 3). In the context of inter-city competition, festivals have proven to be "a useful strategy for the contemporary city to adopt in the attempt to reposition and differentiate itself in an increasingly competitive world" (Quinn, 2005, p. 927). The literature contends that festivals have been transformed from community-based, place-specific celebrations into commodified, competitive assets which serve both as tourist attractions and contribute to larger city-marketing efforts as placemaking tools (Gotham, 2005; Getz, 2010).

Again, the results from this research suggest this is a false dichotomy. Winter festivals in the case study cities are "locally unique gatherings, indigenously conceived, rich in distinctive content, based on local consumption and organized around localized geographic ties" (Gotham, 2005, p. 242). As Brito and Richards (2017) argue, the function of contemporary festivals is more extensive than "simply attracting people or attention… they should actively improve the host city or region and make them better places to live, work, visit and invest in" (p. 2). Winter festivals in the case study cities appear to serve this diversity of functions. While at festivals "designed to encourage people to spend money, the sense of collective identity can only be illusory or, at best, a public relations exercise" (Waitt, 2008, p. 521-522), the majority of the festivals attended for this research featured free admission and opportunities for consumption were largely limited to local food and beverage providers and occasionally concert tickets (e.g., Winterruption). Participants in tourism and business development cited their city's festivals as major winter tourist attractions but also highlighted the importance of place-specific celebration and local experiences of winter.

This character of winter festivals redirects our attention from their purported instrumentality to their specific functions. Festivals are inherently celebratory (Lau and Yi, 2019) and winter festivals are no exception, taking winter as their object of celebration (and therefore necessarily place). Festivals celebrate winter in part by transforming the materiality of a place for the time of the festival. In the case study cities, this transformation occurred through the installation of lights,

tents, ice sculptures and even skating rinks in city spaces where they otherwise did not exist (often city parks, though Deep Freeze notably repurposes a major road as a pedestrian-only festival site). This transformation of place enables the place-specific meanings (e.g., cultural context) and practices (e.g., recreation) that characterize winter festivals.

Shifting negative attitudes of winter is a fundamental objective of the Winter Cities Movement and Winter City strategies in the case study cities. As sites of celebration, the winter festivals "reimag[ine]" and repurpos[e]" place, "creat[ing] new (or renewed) physical and emotional connections" (Brownett and Evans, 2020, p. 5), which challenge negative perceptions and attitudes of winter. Further, this shift in attitude is not necessarily constrained to the time and place of winter festivals; participants were quick to cite their city's winter festivals as important winter features, promoting winter celebration.

Winter festivals - the Franco-Canadian cultural festivals (Flying Canoe Volant and Festival du Voyageur) in particular - emphasize the place-specificity of their cultural context through storytelling, recalling historical practices in which "the importance of history, heritage or the traditions of places were central to festival construction and imagination" (Brownett and Evans, 2020, p. 3). Winter festivals are authentic because they are based in place; they are built from and with the specific physical and social context of their cities, serving as "arenas...where the history, cultural inheritance and social structures, which distinguish one place from another, are revised, rejected or recreated" (Quinn, 2005, p. 928). Franco-Canadian festivals seek to represent the specifics of their cultural identity through festivals (as distinct from other French-speaking parts so Canada). However, while a minority in majority English-speaking provinces, Franco-Canadian culture is still part of the hegemonic settler-colonialism; in order to be authentic to the entirety of their context, organizers of the Franco-Canadian based festivals in particular remarked on recent efforts to expand beyond settler-colonial French history to include Indigenous programming (E2; W1).

6.2.2.1. Dyads

In order to celebrate winter, festivals in the case study cities must navigate dyads. All of these dyads stem from place-specific characteristics such as climate and latitude (impacting hours of darkness). The winter festivals are fundamentally and purposefully based in place, addressing the challenges and realizing the opportunities presented by these dyads in their cities. In the context of Warm/Cold weather, festival organizers discuss at length how cold weather is

necessary for many festival activities (including recreation and snow/ice carving), but that they also plan festival activities and infrastructure around keeping warm. This was also apparent in my attendance at festivals; I observed closed ice castles melting in the warm sun at Winter Shines and struggled to take field notes when my phone died in the cold at Deep Freeze. I tried to keep moving while attending festivals to stay warm, a tactic festival organizers would later describe in interviews.

Festivals navigated the Indoor/Outdoor dyad by employing a mixture of spaces. Direct engagement with weather is a necessary component of place-specific celebration and organizers valued being outside; outdoor space was integral to festival objectives. Even Winterruption, a largely indoor music festival, included outdoor activities and performances. However, organizers also expressed and addressed the necessity of heated space for the enjoyment and safety of attendees, volunteers, staff, and performers. In some cases, rather than a full retreat indoors, festivals created "in-between" spaces: temporary, heated tents as opposed to permanent, indoor structures. All festivals featured some combination of outdoor spaces (usually used for snow/ice sculptures and recreation activities and featuring colourful lights), indoor space in permanent, heated buildings, and "in between" spaces such as heated tents or other mobile structures created temporarily for the festival. My attendance at festivals was punctuated by movement between these spaces, either seeking particular festival programming, a place to warm up, or at Flying Canoe Volant, a place to cool down.

The Light/Dark dyad is understood as a unique opportunity to create beautiful lighting displays that are not possible in other places or even in the same places at different times of year. Engaging with this dyad does not mean resignation, but rather seeing long, dark nights as an opportunity: "darkness is an asset, and how are we using that uniqueness of our winters to our advantage?" (W2). Flying Canoe Volant, in particular, demonstrates how to navigate this dyad to celebrate winter: lighting installations ranged from beautiful decorative details to striking works of art and a festival activity in their own right.

6.3. Conclusion

Discussion of the results and existing literature reveal a number of resonances and tensions. Participants describe an *imperative* to celebrate winter that is consistent with Relph's (1976) definition of authenticity. While participants emphasize the importance of place-specificity, they do not understand place as *rooted* but rather recognize the complex movements of weather,

people, and ideas as components of place-specificity (Massey, 1994; Vannini et al, 2012). For participants, winter is celebrated by addressing its challenges and realizing its opportunities, which can only be done with attention to place-specific contexts. As such, placemaking in winter cities must also be authentic if it is to enhance public places (Silberberg et al., 2013, as cited in Ellery et al, 2017). Placemaking activities, in particular festivals, navigate a series of dyads, reflecting the unique and authentic context of winter cities. Participants described placemaking practices that were principally concerned with benefiting city residents by providing opportunities to engage with weather which were unique to winter. While the literature identified a tension between authentic, community-driven placemaking and state-led, competition-driven placemaking, placemaking in the case study cities resembled community-based processes while considering attractiveness to tourists and other external parties; there was no inherent tension between local interests and attracting others to visit the case study cities in winter. Winter festivals prioritize authenticity to place.

7. Conclusion

To answer the question *what type of place is a winter city and what types of placemaking occur in this context?*, this thesis has assembled a discursive account of three winter cities and their current context with connections to place theory and placemaking literature. In focusing on mid-sized, Canadian prairie cities, this thesis diversifies geographic thought on place and placemaking beyond global cities. It also extends and expands upon a small but growing literature on weather and place by adding these case studies of winter weather, further developing underexplored conceptual linkages between weather and place.

The first objective of this thesis was *to describe the relationship between place and winter in winter cities.* This thesis engaged with major theorizations of place (Relph, 1976, 2016; Massey, 1994; Cresswell 2009, 2015) as well recent literature on weather and place. As with all places, winter cities are *specific.* Weather, a medium through which we experience place, is of particular importance in this context. Modernist planning practices have historically disconnected winter city residents from weather. Participants in case study cities, however, sought to *celebrate* winter via direct engagement with winter weather through outdoor public space, recreation, and festivals. Winter is understood as posing a suite of challenges and opportunities in place, and participants addressing challenges and realising opportunities to enable authentic relationships between residents, winter, and place. An authentic relationship to place entails "a direct and genuine experience" of its complex and specific identity (Relph, 1976, p. 64). The specifics of winter cities are a result of the complex interplay of weather, historic and current planning approaches, cultural context, and the movement of people, ideas, and weather across places. Winter festivals are both informed by the places they celebrate and contribute to "the history, cultural inheritance and social structures, which distinguish one place from another" (Quinn, 2005, p. 928).

The second objective of this thesis was *to examine placemaking in winter cities.* Placemaking is understood to fall into two categories: community-based and competition-driven. In winter cities, placemaking seeks to celebrate winter and in so doing is necessarily authentic to place. This does not exempt placemaking in winter cities from critique, as "reviv[ing] vernacular traditions associated with places as a consumer attraction" (Harvey, 1996, p. 298) is a common tactic undertaken by cities to emphasize their distinct identity in the pursuit of capital. However, participants from across professions, including tourism and business development, prioritize how winter placemaking improves winter experiences for residents. Through this research, winter

festivals emerged as a prominent placemaking practice in winter cities. Festivals are "a vehicle for expressing the close relationship between identity and place" (Quinn, 2005, p. 928) which offer "creative possibilities... [to] challenge established geographies" (Waitt, 2008, p. 526). Specifically, in winter cities, festivals seek to tell authentic stories about place and culture. They are a site for challenging negative perceptions of winter, locally and more broadly. Winter festivals navigate the interplay of warm and cold, indoor and outdoor spaces, and light and dark in order to celebrate winter.

This thesis has shown that, while weather plays a part in the specificity of all places, it is of particular importance to winter cities. Winter cities are weather places: the weather has a particularly profound effect on our experience of winter cities and places, and in turn winter cities have a profound effect on our experience of weather. A winter city is a place organized around the pursuit of direct and genuine collective experiences formed at the intersection of weather, culture and history. Winter cities have previously been described as "placeless" or inauthentic, with infrastructure and planning practices imported from elsewhere (Davies, 2015; Bosselmann et al, 1995). Yet as Relph (2016) and Massey (1994) have described, all places are a product of their connections to elsewhere. Places are *defined* by the "tangled manifestation" of differences and similarities with elsewhere and "the resulting hybridity of distinctiveness and sameness has become an unavoidable aspect of contemporary everyday place experience." (Relph, 2016, p. 21; p. 27). This is apparent in winter cities, where the legacy of modernist city building persists alongside place-based, celebratory winter festivals. Participants in winter cities described a resistance to ideas that are not attentive to the specifics of their cities. Indeed, they articulated an imperative to *celebrate* winter through addressing its challenges and realizing its opportunities.

Placemaking practices such as festivals play a central role in this regard: they harness and creatively redeploy inherent tensions linked to life in a winter city in an effort to tell an authentic story about place and culture. In this context, placemaking is necessarily authentic as it is attentive to the specifics of place. While the literature on placemaking describes contemporary festivals as instruments of neoliberal place branding and marketing exercises, placemaking in winter cities does not seem to have prioritized external objectives at the expense of community benefits. While winter festivals are "woven" into promoting a "unique" place identity as part of city marketing strategies (Waitt, 2008, p. 520), they are primarily concerned with community celebration. They are not mass-produced festivals "devoid of any real connections with place" (Quinn. 2005, p. 928)

Though not without economic objectives, winter festivals in winter cities represent authentic place connections.

7.1. Research Limitations

While I initially sought to engage critically with Winter City Strategies (see Stout, 2017), at the outset of this research only Edmonton had a Winter City Strategy and supporting documents, meaning there was insufficient material for multiple case-study policy analysis. Therefore, I shifted to developing a *discursive* rather than a *critical* account of winter in Canadian prairie cities. There are two substantive limitations.

First, it must be noted that experiencing winter weather conditions as 'good' or 'bad' is a result of societal context and position (Hulme, 2016). Much of this research implicitly focuses on discussion of recreation for relatively privileged (middle and upper class) consumers. It does not examine how power relations are mediated through weather (Wright and Tofa, 2021; see also Massey 1994) in winter cities; nor does it consider what relationships to winter look like for those experiencing poverty. I was initially interested in exploring the needs of unhoused populations in winter further but came to realize I did not have the community connections to research this topic ethically *with* (rather than *on*) community members, or the ability to apply to results in a meaningful and valuable way (e.g., to influence policy change).

Second, this research does not engage with Indigenous ways of knowing and relationships with weather despite examining settler-colonial cities. Again, while I was interested in considering these perspectives in the context on winter cities literature, I was not in the position to do so ethically and without further participating in the academic tokenization and exploitation of Indigenous communities. Wright and Tofa (2021) ask how geography as a discipline can "write and learn about weather in ways that affirm Indigenous sovereignties" (pp. 13-14), inviting personal reflection on the answer as it is highly specific to where geographers are living and working.

7.2. Opportunities for Further Research

As mentioned, this thesis focused on providing a discursive account. There are a number of critical examinations that would contribute further to understanding of winter cities. As Wright and Tofa (2021) argue, geographic scholarship has constructed weather as *aer nullius*, neglecting to

include "the work of Indigenous thinkers cultures, and world views" (p. 2). There is scope for critical examination of how winter cities also "invisibilise extant plural knowledges and sovereign relationships of/with weather" (Wright and Tofa, 2012, p. 6). My own previous work has highlighted that winter cities may seek to "ameliorate winter for a universal urban citizen (healthy, able-bodied, and with discretionary time and income), by creating opportunities for outdoor recreation and associated consumption" (Stout et al., 2018, p. 9). Yet, knowledges and experiences of winter are surely diverse. Further interrogation of authenticity is an avenue for exploring this diversity in the context of settler-colonial winter cities, for example by examining f authenticity and cultural festivals (e.g., is including Indigenous programming sufficient or do festivals need to further deconstruct their colonial histories?). Additionally, this research focused exclusively on placemaking activities in winter and therefore questions remain about whether the authenticity of placemaking in winter cities extends year-round (e.g., is there a substantive difference between winter and summer placemaking?)

Climate change was not foregrounded in this thesis. It will, however, impact winter city weather and consequently the challenges and opportunities posed by winter. As Chapman et al (2018) remark, "climate change will probably alter the balance between snow and water in winter" (p. 13). The dated nature of the bulk of conceptual work on the Winter Cities movement means it does not include recent knowledge on climate change. In addition to considering the specific impacts on climate change on winter cites and the necessary adaptations, there are also interesting questions around how authentic or celebratory relationships to place impact climate change mitigation and adaptation. For example, Butts and Adams (2020) consider how "uncertain climate does not necessarily destabilize… person-place bonds" on a remote Scottish island. They find that collective relationships to weather bond people to place but that "a high tolerance... is celebrated and revered despite the associated risks. Such a culturally entrenched tolerance could be maladaptive, as people do not recognise the potential dangers they may face with climate change, and may not adapt as required" (p. 10).

7.3. Research Contributions

Winter cities are largely under examined in urban research, particularly Canadian cities. The primary contribution of this thesis is providing a discursive account of place and winter cities, with an emphasis on weather. This thesis connects winter cities with long standing debates around

place in human geography, expanding on Winter Cites Movement literature from the 1980s-90s. It challenges the idea that winter cities are placeless and has developed a narrative of winter cities as distinct, celebratory weather places. Considering influential work on placemaking, this thesis contributes a regionally-specific description and interpretation of winter city placemaking to literature that typically focuses on larger, global centres. In doing so, it provides a new perspective on the tensions between community-driven and competition-driven placemaking, highlighting how these may be resolved in practice.

These contributions are important as winter cities in Canada are distinct from other cities. Their exclusion from much of the geographic literature constitutes a gap in our understanding of urban systems. Winter cities not only occasion place-specific designs: this thesis finds that winter cities are building place identity around the specifics of their weather place through celebration. Winter cities offer something distinct: authentic place experiences. And indeed, other cities cannot simply copy this approach: winter provides opportunities for authentic experiences and celebration that do not exist otherwise. This celebration is not simply a positive attitude towards the inevitably of winter, but a conscious effort to address its challenges and embrace its opportunities. Festivals serve as a primary vehicle for celebration. They are inherently celebratory and engage with a range of place specifics, including weather and cultural history. The emphasis festivals place on authenticity and storytelling reinforces their role as a "vehicle" for representing and building place-identity.

The emphasis on celebration and authenticity has powerfully illustrated that winter cities are not placeless, as implied by early Winter Cities literature and arguably popular opinion. The practice of celebrating winter can be read as a reaction *against* placelessness; it offers distinct, authentic place experiences. This is not to say that winter cities have single and unique identities; they feature internal conflicts, including different attitudes towards weather among residents, and the interplay of warm and cold, indoor and outdoor, light and dark. Nor have they eradicated placelessness. Winter cities feature their own specific, paradoxical combination of difference and sameness, place and placelessness.

References

Augé, M. (1995). *Non-places: introduction to an anthropology of supermodernity*. London: Verso.

Barrett, D., & Twycross, A. (2018). Data collection in qualitative research. *Evidence-Based Nursing, 21*, 63-64.

Berland, J. (1993). Weathering the north: Climate, colonialism, and the mediated body. In V. Blundell, J. Shepherd, & I. Taylor (Eds.), *Relocating cultural studies: Developments in theory and research (pp. 207-225)*. London, England: Routledge.

Berland, J. (1994). On reading "The weather." *Cultural Studies, 8*, 99-114.

Blum, A. (2002). *Hybrid place: The experience of the local and the remote*. Unpublished Masters' Thesis. Ontario: University of Toronto.

Blumenfeld, H. (1985). Problems of winter in the city. In N. Pressman (Ed.), *Reshaping winter cities: Concepts, strategies and trends* (pp. 47–50). University of Waterloo Press.

Bosselmann, P., Arens, E. A., Dunker, K., & Wright, R. (1995). Urban form and climate: Case study, Toronto. *Journal of the American Planning Association, 61(2)*, 226–239.

Brassley, P. (1998). On the unrecognized significance of the ephemeral landscape. *Landscape Research, 23, 119-132*.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology, 3*(2), 77-101.

Brownett, T., & Evans, O. (2020). Finding common ground: The conception of community arts festivals as spaces for placemaking. *Health & place, 61*, 102254.

Butts, D., & Adams, H. (2020). Weather Contracts: Capturing a sense of weather for place-based adaptation to climate change. *Global Environmental Change, 63*, 102052.

Cai, X., & Pei, Y. (2021). Review of the Cycling Network Planning and Design in Chinese Cold-Climate Cities. *IEEE Access, 9*, 25291-25313.

Catungal, J. P., Leslie, D., & Hii, Y. (2009). Geographies of displacement in the creative city: The case of Liberty Village, Toronto. *Urban Studies, 46*(5-6), 1095-1114.

Chapman, D., Nilsson, K. L., Rizzo, A., & Larsson, A. (2019). Winter city urbanism: Enabling all year connectivity for soft mobility. *International journal of environmental research and public health, 16*(10), 1820.

Chapman, D., Nilsson, K., Rizzo, A., & Larsson, A. (2018). Updating winter: The importance of climate-sensitive urban design for winter settlements. *Arctic yearbook*.

City of Edmonton. (2012). *For the love of winter: Strategy for transforming Edmonton into a world-leading winter city.* Edmonton: City of Edmonton.

City of Edmonton. (2013). *For the love of winter: WinterCity strategy implementation plan.* Edmonton: City of Edmonton.

City of Edmonton. (2016). *Winter design guidelines: Transforming Edmonton into a great winter city.* Edmonton: City of Edmonton.

City of Edmonton. (2018). *Keep the snowball rolling: WinterCity strategy evaluation and report.* Edmonton: City of Edmonton.

City of Saskatoon. (2020). *WinterCity YXE: Saskatoon's Winter Strategy.* Saskatoon: City of Saskatoon.

Cope, M. (2017). Transcripts: Coding and analysis. In Richardson, D. (Ed), *International encyclopedia of geography: People, the earth, environment and technology: people, the earth, environment and technology* (Vol. 1). John Wiley & Sons.

Cresswell, T. (2009). Place. *International Encyclopedia of Human Geography,* Vol. 8 (pp. 169-177).

Cresswell, T. (2015). *Place: an introduction.* Second edition. Chichester, West Sussex: Wiley Blackwell Cui, J., Allan, A., & Lin, D. (2010). Analysis of motivations of developing underground pedestrian systems— Decisive effect of weather conditions. *The 11th International WALK21 Conference & 23rd International Workshop of the International Cooperation on Theories and Concepts in Traffic Safety.*

Curtis, S., Gesler, W., Smith, G., & Washburn, S. (2000). Approaches to sampling and case selection in qualitative research: examples in the geography of health. *Social science & medicine, 50*(7-8), 1001-1014.

Davies, K. (2014). *A pilot study for comparing two inner-city Edmonton parks in winter.* Unpublished Masters' Thesis. Kingston, Ontario: Queen's University.

Davies, W. K. (2015). Winter Cities. In W. K. Davies (Ed.), *Theme cities: Solutions for urban problems* (pp. 277–310). Netherlands: Springer.

de Brito, M. P., & Richards, G. (2017). Guest editorial: events and placemaking. *International Journal of Event and Festival Management, 8*(1), 2-7.

Dupre, K. (2019). Trends and gaps in place-making in the context of urban development and tourism: 25 years of literature review. *Journal of Place Management and Development. 12*(1), 102-120.

Edwards, P. N. (2006). Meteorology as infrastructural globalism. *Osiris, 21*(1), 229-250.

Eliasson, I., Knez, I., Westerberg, U., Thorsson, S., & Lindberg, F. (2007). Climate and behaviour in a Nordic city. *Landscape and Urban Planning, 82*(1-2), 72-84.

Ellery, J., Ellery, P., MacKenzie, A., & Friesen, C. (2017). Placemaking: An engaged approach to community well-being. *Journal of Family & Consumer Sciences, 109*(2), 7-13.

Endfield, G. H. (2019). Weather and Elemental Places. *Historical Geography, 47*(1), 1-31.

Erskine, R. (1968). Architecture and town planning in the north. *The Polar Record, 14(89),* 165–171. https://doi.org/10.1017/S003224740005659X

Eshuis, J., Klijn, E.-H., and Braun, E. (2014). Place Marketing and Citizen Participation: Branding as Strategy to Address the Emotional Dimension of Policy Making? *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 80(1): 151–71.

Farish, M., & Lackenbauer, P. W. (2009). High modernism in the Arctic: planning Frobisher Bay and Inuvik. *Journal of Historical Geography, 35*(3), 517-544.

Fincher, R., Pardy, M., & Shaw, K. (2016). Place-making or place-masking? The everyday political economy of "making place". *Planning Theory & Practice,* 17(4), 516-536.

Finkel, R. (2009). A picture of the contemporary combined arts festival landscape. *Cultural Trends, 18*(1), 3-21.

Finkel, R., & Platt, L. (2020). Cultural festivals and the city. *Geography Compass,* 14(9), e12498.

Florida, R. (2002). *The rise of the creative class.* New York, NY.

Friedmann, J. (2007). Reflections on Place and Place-making in the Cities of China. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research,* 31(2), 257-279.

Friedmann, J. (2010). Place and place-making in cities: A global perspective. Planning Theory & Practice, 11(2), 149-165., https://doi.org/10.1080/14649351003759573

Gappert, G. (1987). Introduction: The future of winter cities. In G. Gappert (Ed.), *The future of winter cities* (Vol. 31) (pp. 7–12). Sage Publications.

Germen, M. (2015). Istanbul gezi park resistance movement as public engagement in the making of place. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences,* 184, 13-21.

Getz, D. (2010). The nature and scope of festival studies. *International journal of event management research, 5*(1), 1-47.

Gibson, J. (1968). *The ecological approach to perception.* London: Houghton Mifflin.

Gotham, K. F. (2005). Theorizing urban spectacles. *City, 9*(2), 225-246.

Government of Canada. (2020a). *Canadian Climate Normals 1981-2010 Station Data.* Environment and Climate Change Canada. Retrieved April 10, 2021 from https://climate.weather.gc.ca/climate_normals/results_1981_2010_e.html?searchType=stnName&txtStationName=edmonton&searchMethod=contains&txtCentralLatMin=0&txtCentralLatSec=0&txtCentralLongMin=0&txtCentralLongSec=0&stnID=1867&dispBack=0

Government of Canada. (2020b). *Canadian Climate Normals 1981-2010 Station Data.* Environment and Climate Change Canada. Retrieved April 10, 2021 from https://climate.weather.gc.ca/climate_normals/results_1981_2010_e.html?searchType=stnName&txtStati

onName=saskatoon&searchMethod=contains&txtCentralLatMin=0&txtCentralLatSec=0&txtCentralLongMin=0&txtCentralLongSec=0&stnID=3333&dispBack=0

Government of Canada. (2020c). *Canadian Climate Normals 1981-2010 Station Data.* Environment and Climate Change Canada. Retrieved April 10, 2021 from https://climate.weather.gc.ca/climate_normals/results_1981_2010_e.html?searchType=stnName&txtStationName=win&searchMethod=contains&txtCentralLatMin=0&txtCentralLatSec=0&txtCentralLongMin=0&txtCentralLongSec=0&stnID=3698&dispBack=0

Habibah, A., Mushrifah, I., Hamzah, J. E. A. C., Er, A. C., Buang, A., Toriman, M. E., ... & Zaimah, R. (2013). Place-making of ecotourism in Tasik Chini: From exploratory to the contemporary biosphere reserve. *Asian Social Science, 9*(6), 84.

Harvey, D., (1996). *Justice, Nature and the Geography of Difference.* Oxford: Blackwell.

Hulme, M. (2016). *Weathered: cultures of climate.* Sage.

Hultman, J., & Hall, C. M. (2012). Tourism place-making: Governance of locality in Sweden. *Annals of Tourism Research, 39*(2), 547-570.

Ingold, T. (2000). *The perception of the environment: Essays on livelihood, dwelling and skill.* London, England: Routledge.

Ingold, T. (2005). The eye of the storm: visual perception and the weather. *Visual Studies, 20,* 97-104.

Japan Meteorological Agency. *Japan Meteorological Agency - Past Weather Data.* Retrieved 10 April 2021, from http://www.data.jma.go.jp/obd/stats/etrn/view/nml_sfc_ym.php?prec_no=31&prec_ch=%90%C2%90X%8C%A7&block_no=47575&block_ch=%90%C2%90X&year=&month=&day=&elm=normal&view=

Johansson, M., & Kociatkiewicz, J. (2011). City festivals: creativity and control in staged urban experiences. *European Urban and Regional Studies, 18*(4), 392-405.

Kehm, W. H. (1985). The landscape of the livable winter city. In N. Pressman (Ed.), *Reshaping winter cities: Concepts, strategies and trends* (pp. 51–60). University of Waterloo Press.

Lau, C., & Li, Y. (2019). Analyzing the effects of an urban food festival: A place theory approach. *Annals of Tourism Research, 74,* 43-55.

Lee, C. (2020). *Climate Sensitive Urban Design of Public Open Spaces for Winter Cities: Edmonton, Canada.* Unpublished Masters' Thesis. Korea: Seoul National University.

Leng, H., Li, S., Yan, S., & An, X. (2020). Exploring the relationship between green space in a neighbourhood and cardiovascular health in the winter city of China: A study using a health survey for harbin. *International journal of environmental research and public health, 17*(2), 513.

Lew, A. (2017). Tourism planning and place making: place-making or placemaking?. *Tourism Geographies, 19*(3), 448-466, https://doi.org/10.1080/14616688.2017.1282007

Liu, E. and Freestone, R. (2016). Revisiting Place and Placelessness. In R. Freestone & E. Liu, *Place and Placelessness Revisited* (pp. 1-19). New York: Routledge.

Madureira, A. M. (2015). Physical planning in place-making through design and image building. *Journal of Housing and the Built Environment, 30*(1), 157-172.

Malpas, J. E. (1999). *Place and Experience: A Philosophical Topography.* Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.

Markusen, A., and Nicodemus, A. G. (2010). *Creative Placemaking.* White paper for the National Endowment for the Arts, USA.

Massey, D. (1994). *Space, Place, and Gender.* Cambridge: Polity Press; Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press.

McDonald-Yale, E., & Birchall, S. J. (2021). The built environment in a winter climate: improving university campus design for student wellbeing. *Landscape Research*, 1-15.

McDowell, L. (2010). Interviewing: Fear and liking in the field. In DeLyser, D., Herbert, S., Aitken, S., Crang, M., & McDowell, L. (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of qualitative geography*, 156-171.

Meng, X. W., & Setoguchi, T. (2010). Development of urban design guidelines with wind tunnel simulations for downtown districts in winter cities. *Journal of Asian Architecture and Building Engineering, 9(2)*, 355–362.

Mills, D. (2005). The necessity of art: Claiming our right to be human. In *Just Communities, the Local Government Community Services Association of Australia National Conference.*

Moser, A., & Korstjens, I. (2018). Series: Practical guidance to qualitative research. Part 3: Sampling, data collection and analysis. *European Journal of General Practice, 24*(1), 9-18.

Nutrien Winter Shines. *About – Nutrien Winter Shines.* Retrieved 10 April 2021, from https://www.nutrienwintershines.ca/about-3/

Perry, B., Ager, L., & Sitas, R. (2020). Cultural heritage entanglements: festivals as integrative sites for sustainable urban development. *International Journal of Heritage Studies, 26*(6), 603-618.

Pillatt, T. (2012). Experiencing climate: Finding weather in eighteenth century Cumbria. *Journal of Archaeological Method and Theory, 19*(4), 564-581.

PPS. (2007). What is Placemaking?. Retrieved 1 March 2021, from https://www.pps.org/article/what-is-placemaking

Pred, A. R. (1984). Place as historically contingent process: Structuration and the time-geography of becoming places. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers 74*, 279–297.

Pressman, N. (1985a). Developing livable winter cities. In N. Pressman (Ed.), *Reshaping winter cities: Concepts, strategies and trends* (pp. 27–46). University of Waterloo Press.

Pressman, N. (1985b). Introduction. In N. Pressman (Ed.), *Reshaping winter cities: Concepts, strategies and trends* (pp. 13–17). University of Waterloo Press.

Pressman, N. (1987). The survival of winter cities: Problems and prospects. In G. Gappert (Ed.), *The future of winter cities* (Vol. 31) (pp. 49–70). Sage Publications.

Pressman, N. (1988). Developing climate-responsive winter cities. *Energy and Buildings, 11(1–3)*, 11–22.

Pressman, N. (1989). Harsh living conditions: A research agenda. *Habitat International, 13(2)*, 13–22.

Pressman, N. (1996). Sustainable winter cities: Future directions for planning, policy and design. *Atmospheric Environment, 30(3)*, 521–529. https://doi.org/10.1016/1352-2310(95)00012-7

Quinn, B. (2005). Arts festivals and the city. *Urban studies, 42(5-6)*, 927-943.

Relph, E. (1976). *Place and placelessness.* London: Pion.

Relph, E. (2016). The Paradox of Place and the Evolution of Placelessness. In R. Freestone & E. Liu, *Place and Placelessness Revisited* (pp. 20-34). New York: Routledge.

Richards, G., & Duif, L. (2018). *Small cities with big dreams: Creative placemaking and branding strategies.* Routledge.

Ripka, Z. (2021). *Untitled.* Unpublished Undergraduate Thesis. Quebec: McGill University.

Sack, R. D. (1997). *Homo Geographicus.* Baltimore, Johns Hopkins University Press.

Saito, Y. (2005). The aesthetics of weather. In A. Light & J. Smith (Eds.), *The aesthetics of everyday life (pp. 156-176). New York, NY: Columbia University Press.*

Samalavicius, A. (2017). Introduction - Questioning architectural modernism and the built environment: notes on cultural texts and contexts. In A. Samalavicius (Ed.), *Rethinking modernism and the built environment* (pp. 1-13). Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

Schneekloth, L. and Shibley, R. (1995). *Placemaking: The Art and Practice of Building Communities,* John Wiley & Sons, New York.

Serjeant, E. (2019). *Responding to the Weather Indoors: Practices and Experiences of Tenants in Damp Housing on Waiheke Island.* Unpublished Master's Thesis. New Zealand: University of Auckland.

Shah, A. (2017). Ethnography? Participant observation, a potentially revolutionary praxis. *HAU: Journal of Ethnographic Theory, 7(1)*, 45-59.

Shaw, K., & Montana, G. (2016). Place-making in megaprojects in Melbourne. *Urban Policy and Research, 34(2)*, 166–189.

Silberberg, S., and Lorah, K. (2013). *Places in the Making: How placemaking builds places and communities.* M.I.T Dept. of Urban Studies & Planning white paper.

Silberberg, S., Lorah, K., Disbrow, R., & Naparstek, A. (2013). *Places in the making: How placemaking builds places and communities.* Cambridge, MA: Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

Smith, B. (2018). Generalizability in qualitative research: Misunderstandings, opportunities and recommendations for the sport and exercise sciences. *Qualitative research in sport, exercise and health, 10*(1), 137-149.

Stake, R. E. (2013). *Multiple case study analysis.* Guilford press.

Statistics Canada. (2017a). *Census Profile, 2016 Census - Edmonton, Alberta.* Retrieved 10 April 2021, from https://www12.statcan.gc.ca/census-recensement/2016/dp-pd/prof/details/page.cfm?Lang=E&Geo1=CSD&Code1=4811061&Geo2=CD&Code2=4811&SearchText=edmonton&SearchType=Begins&SearchPR=01&B1=All&TABID=1&type=0

Statistics Canada. (2017b). *Census Profile, 2016 Census - Saskatoon, Saskatchewan.* Retrieved 10 April 2021, from https://www12.statcan.gc.ca/census-recensement/2016/dp-pd/prof/details/page.cfm?Lang=E&Geo1=CSD&Code1=4711066&Geo2=CD&Code2=4711&SearchText=saskatoon&SearchType=Begins&SearchPR=01&B1=All&TABID=1&type=0

Statistics Canada. (2017c). *Census Profile, 2016 Census - Winnipeg, Manitoba.* Retrieved 10 April 2021, from https://www12.statcan.gc.ca/census-recensement/2016/dp-pd/prof/details/page.cfm?Lang=E&Geo1=CSD&Code1=4611040&Geo2=CD&Code2=4611&SearchText=winnipeg&SearchType=Begins&SearchPR=01&B1=All&TABID=1&type=0

Stevens, Q., & Shin, H. (2014). Urban festivals and local social space. *Planning Practice and Research, 29*(1), 1-20.

Stockholm. (2014). *The art and science of place-making.* [Conference Material]. Future of Place 2014, Stockholm, Sweden.

Stockholm. (2014). The art and science of place-making, June 2013.

Stout, M. (2017). *Winterizing Homelessness Policy: A Rights-Based Approach.* [Conference Presentation]. 17th International Medical Geography Symposium, Angers, France.

Stout, M., Collins, D., Stadler, S. L., Soans, R., Sanborn, E., & Summers, R. J. (2018). "Celebrated, not just endured:" Rethinking Winter Cities. *Geography Compass, 12*(8), e12379.

Takyi, E. (2015). The challenge of involvement and detachment in participant observation. *Qualitative Report, 20*(6), 864-872.

Vaddhanaphuti, C. (2017). *Experiencing and Knowing in the Fields: How Do Northern Thai Farmers Make Sense of Weather and Climate-change?.* Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, UK: King's College London.

Vannini, P., Waskul, D., Gottschalk, S., & Ellis-Newstead, T. (2012). Making sense of the weather: Dwelling and weathering on Canada's rain coast. *Space and Culture, 15*(4), 361-380.

Waitt, G. (2008). Urban festivals: Geographies of hype, helplessness and hope. *Geography Compass, 2*(2), 513-537.

Watanabe, N., Setoguchi, T., Maeda, K., Iwakuni, D., Guo, Z., & Tsutsumi, T. (2017). Sustainable block design process for high-rise and high-density districts with snow and wind simulations for winter cities. *Sustainability, 9*(11), 2132.

Watson, A., & Till, K. E. (2010). Ethnography and participant observation. In DeLyser, D., Herbert, S., Aitken, S., Crang, M., & McDowell, L. (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of qualitative geography*, 121-137.

Watt-Cloutier, S. (2017). *The Right to Be Cold*. Canada: Penguin Canada.

Williams, M. (2004). Sustainable place making in waterfront revitalisation: Balancing the interests. *Australian Planner, 41*(2), 30-31.

Williams, M., & Moser, T. (2019). The art of coding and thematic exploration in qualitative research. *International Management Review, 15*(1), 45-55.

Winikoff, T. (2000). *Places not Spaces: Placemaking in Australia*, Sydney: Envirobook Publishing.

Winter Cities Shake-Up. (2019). *About — Winter Cities Shake-Up 2019*. Retrieved 10 April 2021, from http://www.wintercitiesconference.com/about

WinterCity Edmonton. *About – Winter City Edmonton*. Retrieved 10 April 2021, from https://www.wintercityedmonton.ca/about/

Wright, S., & Tofa, M. (2021). Weather geographies: Talking about the weather, considering diverse sovereignties. *Progress in Human Geography, 20(10),* 1-21.

Zepic, X. (1987). Toronto: Policies and strategies for the livable winter city. In G. Gappert (Ed.), *The future of winter cities* (Vol. 31) (pp. 71–93). Sage Publications.

Appendix A - Letter of Initial Contact (e-mail)

Good Afternoon,

My name is Madeleine Stout and I am a graduate student in the Human Geography Program at the University of Alberta, working under the supervision of Dr. Damian Collins and Dr. Joshua Evans. I am reaching out to you as a potential participant for a research project regarding livability and the Winter Cities Movement. This study is funded by the Killam Research Fund.

I am conducting this study in an effort to understand the challenges winter poses to livability in your city and how your city is seeking to address them through policy. The study involves policy analyses and interviews with various professionals in your city who work in relevant fields.

I would like to interview you for this research. Interviews would occur at a time of your convenience in early 2020 and would take no longer than 45 minutes. They would occur in-person, at a location of your choice. Questions would focus on your relevant experience and knowledge of the development of winter policy in your city.

Your participation is entirely voluntary, and you are welcome to withdraw participation at any time. If you agree to participate in the study I will provide you with an informed consent form outlining the details of your participation. If you do choose to be interviewed, all of your personal information will be kept confidential, and you will only be identified in interview transcripts and findings by a generic job title. Please do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions regarding the study.

Thank you for your time. Please let us know if you are willing to be interviewed for this project in the near future.

Sincerely,

Investigator: Madeleine Stout, BA
Graduate Student, Human Geography
Dept. of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences
University of Alberta
Edmonton, AB
mstout@ualberta.ca

Supervisor: Dr. Damian Collins, PhD
& Dr. Joshua Evans, PhD
Human Geography
Dept. of Earth & Atmospheric Sciences
University of Alberta
Edmonton, AB
damian.collins@ualberta.
ca; jdevans@ualberta.ca

The plan for this study has been reviewed for its adherence to ethical guidelines by a Research Ethics Board at the University of Alberta. For questions regarding participant rights and ethical conduct of research, contact the Research Ethics Office at (780) 492-2615. Pro00075257

Appendix B - Information Letter and Consent Form

Study Title: Conceptualizing Livability in Prairie Winter Cities

Investigator: Madeleine Stout, BA
Graduate Student, Human Geography
Dept. of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences
University of Alberta
Edmonton, AB
mstout@ualberta.ca

Supervisors: Dr. Damian Collins, PhD
& Dr. Joshua Evans, PhD
Human Geography
Dept. of Earth & Atmospheric Sciences
University of Alberta
Edmonton, AB
damian.collins@ualberta.ca; jdevans@ualberta.ca

Background: You are being asked to participate in this study because you have professional experience relating to the development of winter-related policies in your city. This research looks at the challenges winter poses to livability and how cities are addressing them.
This study is funded by the Killam Research Fund.

Purpose: This research intends to broaden our understanding of the Winter Cities movement in Canada. This research may inform recommendations for your city's Winter Cities strategy.

The information collected in this study will be used to formulate publications and recommendations that focus on the livability and winter as well as the impacts winter has on vulnerable populations, and the need for cities to acknowledge and address these issues. Results may also be communicated in public discussions, academic lectures, and presentations.

Study Procedures: I am requesting your involvement in this research as a key informant. You are being asked to take part in a semi-structured interview lasting approximately 45 minutes.
The interview will take place at a time convenient to you in early 2020. It will take place in-person at a location of your choice. The interview will be in the form of a conversation about your relevant experiences and knowledge regarding your city's engagement with the Winter Cities movement. With your permission, the interview will be audio-recorded. Following the interview, I will transcribe the conversation onto a digital written document. I intend to interview various professionals with relevant experience, which may include Planners, City Councillors and other city employees. This research is taking place in three cities: Edmonton, Winnipeg, and Saskatoon. I intend to interview approximately 8-10 people from each city.

Benefits: There are no direct personal benefits from participation in this study, such as compensation or incentives. You will be given the opportunity to voice your insight into the development of winter city policy. Through this qualitative study, we aim to contribute to the academic understanding of the specific challenges faced by winter cities as well as how cities are addressing them.

Risks: I do not anticipate that participation in this research will cause you any harm or discomfort. However, interview questions will ask for critical assessments of existing policies regarding winter city policy. To mitigate this risk, your answers will remain confidential and you

will be identified by a generic job title and you will be asked to consent to the title used to identify you. You may withdraw participation at any time if you become uncomfortable or anxious.

Voluntary Participation: As stated above, you are under no obligation to participate in this study, and your participation is completely voluntary. You have the right to withdraw from the study at any time before or during the interview without penalty. You also have the right to decline to answer any interview question or set of questions.
If you would like to withdraw from the study after your interview is finished, you may do so while we are in the data analysis phase, which will be at least two weeks following the interview. To do so, please contact me through email. The digital audio file and the written transcript of your interview will be deleted. After the data analysis phase or two weeks following your interview, whichever occurs last, you will be unable to withdraw from the study as much of the data will be anonymized and used in the research findings.

Confidentiality and Anonymity: Only the researcher (Madeleine Stout) and supervisors (Dr. Damian Collins and Dr, Joshua Evans) will know that you have participated in the study. The transcript of your interviews will be anonymized, which means that it will not contain any personally identifying information. You will be identified in the transcript by your job and you will be asked to consent to the title used to identify you. The digital audio-recording and transcript of your interview will be stored on a password-protected computer in a locked office at the University of Alberta. There will be no cloud storage or external backups of the files. Any printed files will be kept in a securely locked filing cabinet in a locked office at the University of Alberta. Only Madeleine Stout, Dr. Damian Collins, Dr. Joshua Evans, and the Research Ethics Board will have access to these files.

Reported findings may include both paraphrasing and direct quotations from your interview. As discussed above, you will be identified only by a generic description of your professional role, used with your permission, to provide context for your comments.

Study data will be securely stored at the University of Alberta for 5 years following the completion of the study. After 5 years, it will be destroyed through deletion of all files. Research findings will be made available through publication which will be accessible to you.
Further Information: If you have any further questions regarding this study, please contact Madeleine Stout via email (mstout@ualberta.ca).

The plan for this study has been reviewed for its adherence to ethical guidelines by a Research Ethics Board at the University of Alberta. For questions regarding participant rights and ethical conduct of research, contact the Research Ethics Office at (780) 492-2615.

Informed Consent (researcher copy):

I,_____declare that I have read and understand all of the above information in regards to my participation in this research project. I understand my role in this research project and my rights in relation to my participation. I have been told who to contact if I have further questions. I consent to being interviewed as described in this document and understand that my involvement in the interview is entirely voluntary.

_____   _____

Participant name (printed)   Participant signature

_____   _____

Researcher name (printed)   Researcher signature

There will be two copies of this consent form. One copy is to be signed and returned to the researcher and one will be given to the participant for their own records.

Appendix C - Interview Guides

City Employees/Elected officials

WHO ARE YOU?

1. Can you tell me about your role with your organization?
   a. How long have you been working on winter issues?

FRAMING WINTER

1. What first comes to mind when I say winter in your city?
2. Does winter pose challenges to livability (or quality of life) in your city?
   a. How/Why not?

WINTER POLICY

1. I am interested in the development of "winter policy" or "winter city policy" in Canadian prairie cities. Can you trace the history of this policy in your city?
   a. Where did the idea originate?
   b. Who championed it?
   c. What was the community's response?
      i. Supportive? Resistant?
   d. Did key staff or councillors (etc.) travel to learn about the issues and possible responses?
      i. Where?
   e. Did other networks, conferences or inspirational figures influence your policy?
      i. If so, which?
2. Does winter tourism play a role in your policy?
   a. Is it realistic/feasible to attract visitors?
      i.

WINTER EVENTS AND ACTIVITIES

1. Are there events or places that embody winter policy (or principles) in your city?
   a. Can you describe the event or place?
   b. Why do you feel this way?
   c. How does your city perceive this event/place?
   d. What is your own experience as a participant at these events?
   e. Did you learn from similar events in other cities?

ANYTHING ELSE

1. Is there anything else you would like to share with me?

2. Do you think I have an accurate understanding of winter in your city and what it is trying to achieve?

Winter Event & Recreation Organizers

WHO ARE YOU?

1. Can you tell me about your role with your organization?
   a. How long have you been working on winter issues?

THIS EVENT

1. Can you tell me about this event (e.g. its goals/purpose, key features and history)?
2. Why do you think it's valuable or important?
   a. Does it contribute to quality of life in your city?
3. What kind of challenges does this event address?
   a. Was there debate?
   b. How did you arrive at the current approach (activities, location, theme, name, etc.)?
4. What kind of mood or feeling are your trying to evoke? It what ways is that unique to this event or this place?
5. What kind of problems do you encounter?
   a. How do you prepare for the variability of the weather? How do you create an event that could work anywhere in that range?
   b. How does the cold impact your event? Attendance?
6. How does this event tie into other Winter initiatives in your city?

FRAMING WINTER (OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES)

1. More generally, what kinds of opportunities are present in winter in your city?
   a. How do events help people to enjoy/realize these opportunities?
2. What is quality of life like here in the Winter? What is the city's reputation in winter?
   a.
   b. Do events/recreational activities contribute to quality of life and reputation?
3. What are the opportunities that you see with Winter events? Do you think there is increasing understanding of Winter in the city as a time of opportunities?

ANYTHING ELSE

1. Is there anything else you would like to share with me?
2. Do you think I have an accurate understanding of winter in your city and what it is trying to achieve?