Library Councils in Canadian Academic Libraries:

Scanning the Literature

Sean Luyk (University of Alberta)
Eva Revitt (MacEwan University)

Collegial Governance

The structure and processes by which decisions are made:

◎ Complex/contextual
◎ Distinct from management/leadership
◎ Dimensions of authority, power differences
◎ Negotiations, decision-making
◎ Accountability

Tom Wickend

CAUT Council begins on a note of sadness

CAUT reports that Photon D. Zingas of Concordia University, who died September 23 at the Montreal General Hospital. Professor Zingas died from complications arising from three gunshot wounds suffered August 24 when he and four other victims were shot at Concordia University.

He is the fourth professor to die as a direct result of gunshot wounds sustained during the August 24 incident.

Delegates to the 31st CAUT Council met in Ottawa, Sept. 19 and 20. Prior to dealing with regular Council business, the members observed a moment of silence in memory of the three faculty members, Michael Hogben, Matthew Douglas and Aaron Jaan Saber, who were shot at Concordia University on Aug. 24.

Following the discussions, Council passed a resolution instructing the CAUT Executive to prepare a report for Council addressing the question of violence on university campuses. The resolution also requested members of Council to make Concordia University's petition on gun control available on campus. (see more)

Panel on violence

The more general problem of dealing with all forms of violence on campus was also a subject for serious consideration by Council. A panel comprised of Susan Addario, potential safety awareness officer at the University of Toronto, Marlo Edward, a criminal lawyer from Toronto, and Marcelle Blanchette, a legal officer with CAUT, presented various aspects of this pervasive problem. In particular, the panelists discussed how universities and individual faculty might deal with violent and disrupting behaviour, what legal rights individuals have to do not have under the Criminal Code and what faculty associations can do to establish policies and strategies to effectively handle such problems. (additional story pg. 5)

Zinga tribute to Professor Hughes in particular who, as she stated, "died because he was President of the faculty association and was where he was in order to protect the association staff."

Council delegates also unanimously voted to contribute the sum of $5,000 toward the memorial fund set up by Concordia University in memory of the faculty members who lost their lives.

Sarah Shorten Award

The second Sarah Shorten Award was presented during Council to Helen Breslauer, senior research officer at the...

CAUT President Alan Andrews presents the 1992 CAUT Council Sarah Shorten Award to Dr. Helen Breslauer, Senior Research Officer of the Ontario Confederation of University Faculty Associations. (story page 4)

Council report continues page 4

Fourth Concordia professor dies

Concordia: décès d'un quatrième professeur

L'ACPU a la triste nouvelle que le professeur Photon D. Zingas, de l'université Concordia, est décédé le 23 septembre à l'Hôpital général de Montréal. Il avait souffert de nombreuses complications en raison de blessures très graves subies le 24 août au cours de la fusillade à l'université Concordia, où il est décédé.

Le professeur Zingas est le quatrième membre du corps enseignant à succomber aux suites des blessures par revolver subies au cours de l'incident du 24 août.

Agé de 46 ans, le professeur Zingas était associé à l'université depuis 1978, où il était professeur titulaire enseignant à plein temps. Il était également le directeur du département de génie électrique et informatique.

Le Conseil commence ses travaux dans la tristesse

Les délégués à la 31e assemblée du Conseil de direction de l'ACPU se sont réunis les 19 et 20 septembre derniers. Avant de commencer leurs travaux, les membres ont tenu à prendre un instant de silence à la mémoire de trois professeurs, Michael Hogben, Matthew Douglas et Aaron Jaan Saber, qui ont été victimes de la fusillade à l'université Concordia le 24 août.

À la suite des discussions, le Conseil a adopté une proposition en vue de demander au Comité de direction de l'ACPU de préparer un rapport à son intention sur la question de la violence dans les campus universitaires. La proposition demandait également aux membres du Conseil de faire diffuser dans les universités la pétition de Concordia sur le contrôle des armes à feu. (voir suite)

Rapport provenant du GTFDU

Le groupe d'étude indépendant sur la direction des universités (GEIDU) a présenté un projet de rapport provisoire au Conseil. Les membres du groupe, Ernst Benjamin (AAUP), Guy Bourgeault (Montréal) et Ken McGovern...

voir Conseil à la page 4

Tribune sur la violence

Le problème plus général des moyens à prendre pour contrer toutes les formes de violence sur les campus a également retenu sérieusement l'attention du Conseil...

| Bibliothécaires (Page 10) | Landmark decision (Page 8) | Accord Debated (Page 7) |

Politicians Attack Toronto Grad Student

With Jenny Peto received her master's degree from University of Toronto's Ontario Institute for Studies in Education in June 2010, she had no idea she would become the target of political denunciation reminiscent of U.S. Senator Joseph McCarthy at the height of the Cold War.

In December, two members of the Ontario legislature, Tory MPPs Steve Clark and Peter Shurman used question period to denounce Peto. Citing her master's thesis as "shockingly anti-Semitic" and expressing surprise that the University of Toronto would accept it. Clark asked citizenship and immigration minister Eric Hoskins what he was doing "to stop the rising tide of anti-Semitism."

Shurman followed up — describing Peto's thesis as a "hateful and poorly researched paper attacking programs that use the horrors of the Holocaust to reinforce show the dangers of discrimination and racism to Jews" and asking the minister, "Will you today speak up on behalf of Jewish groups who have been so deeply hurt by this piece of garbage and condemn it, not as an academic paper but for the hate it actually is?"

Rather than defending academic freedom, Hoskins responded to Clark that he was "great it disturbed and in fact disgusted when I read the media reports." To Shurman, Hoskins said, "Again, I appreciate the question from the member opposite. I join them in condemning this attack on Ontario's Jewish community."

Media coverage revealed that some of the three had read Peto's thesis entitled The Victimhood of the Powerful: White Jews, Zion...

See POLITICIANS ATTACK Page 60 ▸

Jenny Peto — at the centre of a firestorm over her use of T mnemonic thesis.

Le mot de la présidente
page A3

York professor receives
national award
page A5

CAUT releases guide
to working overseas
page A6

Quebec's tuition
hikes panned
page A7

L'ACPPU fête son
60e anniversaire
page A9

Bookshelf
Hugh Trevor-Roper:
The biography
page A10

Careers/Carrières
page B1

www.CAUTBulletin.ca
www.TravailAcademique.ca

La thèse d'une étudiante critiquée avec virulence

En juin dernier, lorsque Jenny Peto a reçu sa maîtrise de l'Institut d'études pédagogiques de l'Ontario, à l'Université de Toronto, elle était loin de se douter qu'elle serait bientôt la cible d'attaques par des politiciens qui ne sont pas sans rappeler les pratiques du sénateur américain Joseph McCarthy au plus fort de la guerre froide.

En décembre, deux députés progressistes-conservateurs de l'Ontario, Steve Clark et Peter Shurman ont mis à profit la période des questions pour dénoncer sa thèse la jugeant odieuse et antisémite...

Plutôt que de prendre la défense de la liberté académique, M. Hoskins a répondu à M. Clark qu'il avait été très troublé et même dégoûté lorsqu'il a lu que les médias avaient fait état du sujet. À l'endroit de M. Shurman, un remerciement à M. Shurman et un engagement à joindre sa voix à la sienne pour dénoncer cette attaque contre la communauté juive de l'Ontario...

voir LA THÈSE D'UNE ÉTUDIANTE à la page 67 ▸

"All librarians should be members of a Library council which is chaired by the Chief Librarian. The Council should have responsibility for the development of policies and procedures for the operation of the library as a whole and should be responsible to the senate or equivalent body"

Section V, *CAUT/CACUL Guidelines on Academic Status for University Librarians (1976)*.

Furthered our role as an "...integral part of the educational process"

Lillian MacPherson, "Rank or Classification for Librarians?" *CAUT Bulletin* 26/4 (1977): 10

"...those of us wishing to be academic LIBRARIANS and those of us wishing to be ACADEMIC librarians and those of us wishing to be, simply, academic librarians"

Leona Jacobs. "Library Councils in Canadian Academic Libraries: A Summary of Responses." (2008): 15.

"…to have a library staff also reporting, through a Council, directly to Senate as is suggested… would lead to anarchy"

Margaret Beckman, "Library Governance." *CAUT Bulletin* 24/5 (1976): 22.

"

- ◎ 4:1 support staff to librarians
- ◎ Librarians need to be managers and do not have time
- ◎ Librarians required to function as a team in a way that faculty rarely were

Tom Eadie, "Librarians and Collective Bargaining." *CAUT Bulletin* 25/7 (1978): 14.

1977: Library Council Functions

York University

- Deliberate on library policy
- Advise the Director of Libraries
- Legislate committee policies and procedures

Laurentian University

- Make recommendations on the affairs of the library
- Chief Librarian was an ex officio member of who generally accepted Council's recommendations

Vivienne Monty. "Professional Librarians at York." *CAUT Bulletin* 26/4 (1977): 10, Ashley Thompson, "C.A.U.T/C.A.C.U.L. Document at Laurentian." *CAUT Bulletin* 26/4 (1977): 10-11.

"Chief Librarians still maintain great autonomy and Library Councils analogous to Faculty Councils have been slow to develop"

Victor Sim. "Librarians Discuss Advancement Difficulties at Western Conference." *CAUT Bulletin* 26/6 (1979): 6.

1. Library council of all academic librarians on staff consider all matters of academic policy & develop policies to be considered by senate
2. Senate library committee to work more like other senate committees; charged with ensuring proposed academic policies are in line with existing ones
3. Increased presence of rank and file librarians to senate would further embed the library into wider university governance structures

Richard H. Ellis, "Putting Policy in the Stacks: Could a Library Council Be the Answer?" CAUT Bulletin 27/5 (1980): 9-10.

"

"...most Library Councils represent a weak form of collegiality or of governance by rank and file librarians."

Robert Moore, "Library Councils Offer Weak Form of Collegiality, Governance." *CAUT Bulletin* 35/5 (1988): 18.

◎ [Library Councils] should function similarly to faculty councils

◎ Chief librarian occupy the role of a dean

◎ Venue where budget proposals are first discussed & debated

◎ Not merely an advisory body

Canadian Association of University Teachers. *Governance & Accountability: The Report of the Independent Study Group on University Governance*. Ottawa, ON: Canadian Association of University Teachers, 1993.

> "It is not, therefore, surprising that some of them see this attitude as a form of discrimination against women. University libraries should be operated in a fair and constitutional manner, just as faculties ought to be"

Canadian Association of University Teachers. *Governance & Accountability: The Report of the Independent Study Group on University Governance*. Ottawa, ON: Canadian Association of University Teachers, 1993: 49.

> "[if] the library council does not function productively as a collegial governance body within the library, then the librarians should work to change it"

Ruth Sheeran, "An Active Role for Librarians" *CAUT Bulletin* 45/5 (1998).

"

"A failure to distinguish between the two [management and governance] functions can result in problems if the administrators fear that the library council will encroach on their managerial responsibilities"

Canadian Association of University Teachers. "CAUT Librarians' Committee Discussion Paper on Library Councils" (1999; revised 2007).

Jacobs (2008)

2008 Survey revealed:

◎ 13/25 respondents had library councils
◎ More common in flat organizational structure
◎ Majority chaired by UL
◎ Only 5 report to senate

Leona Jacobs. "Library Councils in Canadian Academic Libraries: A Summary of Responses." (2008)

"

"is the idea behind the concept of a library council about the emulation of faculty structures so that they will accept us as academic staff? OR is it about a structure that truly has merit for determining and accomplishing the goals of the library? Can it be both?"

Leona Jacobs. "Library Councils in Canadian Academic Libraries: A Summary of Responses." (2008): 15.

> " "

Institutional theory attempts to explain why organizations in field tend to look and act the same.

J.A. Miles. "*Jossey-Bass business and management reader: Management and organizational theory* " (2012).

"

"…forces one unit in a population to resemble other units that face the same set of environmental conditions"

DiMaggio & Powell. "The iron cage revisited: Institutional isomorphism and collective rationality in organizational fields." *American Sociological Review,* 48 (1983):149.

Three Isomorphic Pressures:

1. **Coercive** isomorphism is the pressure exerted by governments, laws or other organizations

2. **Mimetic** isomorphism is when organizations, model themselves after others perceived more successful

3. **Normative** isomorphism stems from the networks, standards and established practices of professional groups

DiMaggio & Powell. "The iron cage revisited: Institutional isomorphism and collective rationality in organizational fields." *American Sociological Review,* 48 (1983):149.

"

" . . .filtered by a common set of attributes, they will tend to view problems in a similar fashion, see the same policies, procedures and structures as normatively sanctioned and legitimated, and approach decisions in much the same way"

DiMaggio & Powell. "The iron cage revisited: Institutional isomorphism and collective rationality in organizational fields." *American Sociological Review,* 48 (1983):153.

Collegial Governance

Is it effective?

Does it matter?

Effective Collegial Governance

University of Maryland

◎ Lost 20% of its budget

◎ Eliminated 29 programs, 7 departments and 1 college

◎ Capable of bleeding their own ranks for the sake of institutional welfare

Eckel (2000) Case studies of 4 universities

◎ Faculty willing and able to make difficult decision to cut programs for the benefit of the university

Robert Griffith. "Budget cuts and shared governance: An administrator's perspective." *Academe*, 79/6 (1993):15-17.

Peter D. Eckel. "The role of shared governance in institutional hard decisions: Enabler or antagonist?" *Review of Higher Education,* 24/1, (2000):14-40.

BERLINER PHILHARMONIKER

-Have input into how the orchestra is managed
-Vote to select new musicians and chief conductor

Strengthened Governance Processes & Fostering Collegiality:

1. Attract and retain top academic talent
2. Are more important than dissatisfaction with salary
3. Positively correlated with institutional financial performance

"

". . . leadership may sometimes be as significant (if not more significant) for the damage it causes as for the benefits it brings in its wake"

Alan Bryman. "Effective leadership in higher education: a literature review". *Studies in Higher Education*, 32/6 (2008): 707.

"The faculty's role in governance . …is the foundation for academic freedom"

Janet Wallach Scott. "The critical state of shared governance". *Academe* 88/4 (2015): 42.

"

◎ "participation of academic staff in governance structures"
◎ Expression of a diversity of views & opinions
◎ No inappropriate advantage
◎ Ensure inclusiveness

Canadian Association of University Teachers. "Collegiality." (2005).

Thanks!

Any questions?

You can find us at:

revitte@macewan.ca

sean.luyk@ualberta.ca