

44753

National Library
of CanadaBibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Canadian Theses Division

Division des thèses canadiennes

Ottawa, Canada
K1A 0N4**PERMISSION TO MICROFILM — AUTORISATION DE MICROFILMER**

• Please print or type — Écrire en lettres moulées ou dactylographier

Full Name of Author — Nom complet de l'auteur

DAVID FRANCIS HOWELL

Date of Birth — Date de naissance

8 MAY 1946

Country of Birth — Lieu de naissance

CANADA

Permanent Address — Résidence fixe

262 WESTRIDGE ROAD, EDMONTON, ALBERTA,
T5T 1C3

Title of Thesis — Titre de la thèse

The Social Gospel in Canadian Protestantism,
1895 - 1925: Implications for Sport

University — Université

University of Alberta

Degree for which thesis was presented — Grade pour lequel cette thèse fut présentée

Ph D

Year this degree conferred — Année d'obtention de ce grade

1980

Name of Supervisor — Nom du directeur de thèse

Dr. Peter L. Lindsay

Permission is hereby granted to the NATIONAL LIBRARY OF CANADA to microfilm this thesis and to lend or sell copies of the film.

The author reserves other publication rights, and neither the thesis nor extensive extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's written permission.

L'autorisation est par la présente, accordée à la BIBLIOTHÈQUE NATIONALE DU CANADA de microfilmer cette thèse et de prêter ou de vendre des exemplaires du film.

L'auteur se réserve les autres droits de publication; ni la thèse ni de longs extraits de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans l'autorisation écrite de l'auteur.

Date

28 April 1980

Signature

David F. Howell



National Library of Canada
Collections Development Branch

Canadian Theses on
Microfiche Service

Bibliothèque nationale du Canada
Direction du développement des collections

Service des thèses canadiennes
sur microfiche

NOTICE

The quality of this microfiche is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original thesis submitted for microfilming. Every effort has been made to ensure the highest quality of reproduction possible.

If pages are missing, contact the university which granted the degree.

Some pages may have indistinct print especially if the original pages were typed with a poor typewriter ribbon or if the university sent us a poor photocopy.

Previously copyrighted materials (journal articles, published tests, etc.) are not filmed.

Reproduction in full or in part of this film is governed by the Canadian Copyright Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-30. Please read the authorization forms which accompany this thesis.

**THIS DISSERTATION
HAS BEEN MICROFILMED
EXACTLY AS RECEIVED**

AVIS

La qualité de cette microfiche dépend grandement de la qualité de la thèse soumise au microfilmage. Nous avons tout fait pour assurer une qualité supérieure de reproduction.

S'il manque des pages, veuillez communiquer avec l'université qui a conféré le grade.

La qualité d'impression de certaines pages peut laisser à désirer, surtout si les pages originales ont été dactylographiées à l'aide d'un ruban usé ou si l'université nous a fait parvenir une photocopie de mauvaise qualité.

Les documents qui font déjà l'objet d'un droit d'auteur (articles de revue, examens publiés, etc.) ne sont pas microfilmés.

La reproduction, même partielle, de ce microfilm est soumise à la Loi canadienne sur le droit d'auteur, SRC 1970, c. C-30. Veuillez prendre connaissance des formules d'autorisation qui accompagnent cette thèse.

**LA THÈSE A ÉTÉ
MICROFILMÉE TELLE QUE
NOUS L'AVONS REÇUE**

THE UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA

THE SOCIAL GOSPEL IN CANADIAN PROTESTANTISM,

1895 - 1925:

IMPLICATIONS FOR SPORT

by



DAVID FRANCIS HOWELL

A THESIS

SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES AND RESEARCH

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE

OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

DEPARTMENT OF PHYSICAL EDUCATION

EDMONTON, ALBERTA

SPRING 1980

THE UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA
FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES AND RESEARCH

The undersigned certify that they have read, and recommend
to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research, for acceptance, a
thesis entitled The Social Gospel in Canadian Protestantism,
1895 - 1925: Implications for Sport submitted by David Francis
Howell in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree
of Doctor of Philosophy.

Peter Lindsay
.....
Supervisor

A. Scott
.....
J. McLaughlin
.....
[Signature]
.....
[Signature]
.....

Alan MacIntyre
.....
External Examiner

Date 22 April 1980
.....

ABSTRACT

The primary purpose of this study was to examine the attitude of the Canadian protestant churches towards sport during a time of intense social interest, the period of the social gospel, 1895 - 1925. The attitude of the denominations--Anglican, Methodist and Presbyterian--towards sport and physical recreation was substantially influenced, it was found, by the social philosophy of the social gospel. One major result was the establishment of many sport, recreation and social programs within the church directed towards the adolescent members of society. The research problem was studied within the framework of the background history of the denominations, their understanding of the traditional place of sport in society, the ethical significance of sport and the dangers to society of over indulgence in sport and physical recreation. Special emphasis was placed on the social mission of sport and physical recreation as proclaimed by the social gospel. Finally, Sabbatarianism, the strict observance of the Sabbath, was examined within the perspective of the practical philosophy of the social gospel, the secularization of culture, and these influences on Sunday sport and recreation.

PREFACE

In 1965 Van Vliet, in his Physical Education in Canada,¹ expressed the hope that others would be encouraged by his publication so that a proper reflection of the Canadian scene in physical education, athletics and recreation would be forthcoming. Since those early years, before Canadian universities had yet graduated their first PhD in physical education, historians have chosen this field of endeavour in which to write, and a number of ideas have been shown to be important in the evolution of pastimes into modern sports and physical education.²

Several studies have resulted in which historical influences have been identified as important in the evolution of sport and physical education into a modern social phenomenon. Lindsay,³ for example, has captured the vital part played by military men in this process during colonial days, and Morrow⁴ has shown the continuing weight of military ideas a half-century later in the development of school physical education programs. Although stripped of its grand prestige by World War I, as Cosentino⁵ observed, military service still had the power to "cleanse" professional sportsmen and so permit them to have their lost amateur status returned. The pervasive dimensions of technology as a catalyst for change is another influence cited by those seeking explanations for Canadian sport, as shown by Jobling.⁶ Morrow has pointed to the contribution of a number of prominent educators, particularly the Methodist cleric, Egerton Ryerson, while Redmond has shown how ethnic Scots have

contributed in the growth of pastimes to sports and games.⁷ Also the notion of class has received attention especially for the colonial era and explanations for group behaviour in sport have been of recent interest to historians of sport.⁸ Many of these trends were first brought to light in an elementary way through the histories of Canadian sport; many generalized studies have served a considerable import as they have given guidance to future historical studies of the determinants of sport, exercise and physical education.⁹

When a sport appeared, it soon developed a story of its own. Research cannot stop there; it must look beyond the outward form¹⁰ of sport, if a proper reflection of Canadian sport, physical education and recreation, as Van Vliet had wished for, is to be realized.

A contemporary of Van Vliet, well known sport historian, M. L. Howell, co-authored a comprehensive volume entitled Sports and Games in Canadian Life, where they attempted to show sports and games in relation to the social history of the time.¹¹ As Howell and Howell put it, "sports are so close to the top in national consciousness that the churches must take cognizance of them."¹² This study will attempt to show that the protestant denominations at least were well aware of this aspect of social life (and of national consciousness) and further, that the impact of protestant religious and social thought on the evolution of games into modern sports, physical education and recreation has been formative. The attitude of the protestant denominations towards sport and physical recreation during the period of the social gospel, 1895 - 1925, was

carefully examined by those socially minded churchmen seeking affirmative social action. They sought to understand the role of sport and attempted to use it, within the church to assist in accomplishing their social aims. Consequently, a valuable opportunity is presented to study the development of sport during a formative period in its organizational growth. The achievement of greater understanding of the social importance of sport in modern society is this study's ultimate expectation.

The idea that sport and religion (and protestantism in particular) have interacted as social forces is by no means new. A number of such instances are found in primers of sport and physical education in western civilization, sometimes in periods highlighted by extreme points of view. For example, the ancient Greek city states celebrated impassioned festivals of the deities in dances, songs and games.¹³ The Christian ascetism of the middle ages has received notable attention as an influence on sport,¹⁴ as has seventeenth-century puritanism.¹⁵ More recently, the growth of athleticism in England, and its subsequent export to the colonies, was nurtured in the second half of the last century by English public school clerical headmasters, labelled "muscular Christians."¹⁶ Ontario's foremost nineteenth-century educator, Egerton Ryerson, may well have been encouraged by their ideals, accounting for the rerouting of his thinking towards the positive value of sports.¹⁷ It has not been substantiated, however, that muscular Christianity, as suggested by Cosentino, was "very much in vogue and worthy of pursuit"¹⁸ in the last half of the nineteenth century in Canada.

In Canada, sport historiography has not yet related developments in sport to changes in social conditions to include protestant religious attitudes towards sport in the important years at the turn of the century when commercial and professional sport was replacing games and rural pastimes. The vast majority of studies of sport have concentrated on organizational growth, thereby largely ignoring the social forces which shaped the destiny of sport. As shown by the remark concerning muscular Christianity, there is a need to establish the contribution made by the church, delimited here to the three largest protestant denominations, to the evolution of modern sports and physical education.

There are many other indications and tantalizing suggestions encouraging further research. Howell and Howell¹⁹ noted that the church was at the social centre of colonial life, but they supplied no details of this involvement pertaining to sports and games. Cosentino obliquely suggested, in his study of the concept of professionalism in sport in Canada, that there was a moral component to the operant social definition of amateur and professional:

The public image projected by the athlete branded as a 'professional' was that he was a 'cheat' . . . he was also considered a person of low moral character. The term was a description of one's soul.²⁰

The church contributed significantly to the development and maintenance of such popular ideas of the professional in sport.

Jones²¹ found that protestant church organizations were "influential in many aspects of society" during the period 1900 - 1920, and that, in the area of sports, they supplied leadership and

encouragement of physical activity and exercise. The YMCA, considered an important protestant Christian organization by Jones, was singled out as being productive in this area. He noted that the physical departments of the YMCA grew spectacularly after 1890, but credited this growth to "the increased emphasis that sport received by Canadian society during that era."²² Of the denominations, very little was said regarding their particular involvement.

Lappage²³ observed that the influence of "religion" on sport during the 1920s and 1930s was "somewhat paradoxical." On one hand he claimed that Sabbatarianism was a negative influence of the church, while on the other, the churches "promoted a wide variety of physical activities by forming leagues," and the YMCA played a leading role in sport.²⁴ Lappage, however, offered little explanation for this increased pursuit of sport by the church and the YMCA²⁵ although he recognized that there was a de-emphasis of "religion" within YMCA programs from former levels. But about the relationship between religion and sport, no further evidence was given.

The increased interest by protestantism in forms of physical recreation was not due solely to the increased emphasis that sport received in Canadian society. In the period before the social gospel the church had resisted involvement in sport during the 1880s, although aware of its growing popularity. But with the rise of the social gospel, protestantism became more interested in the positive attributes of sport and physical recreation, which led concerned Christian reformers to use the benefits of physical recreation as

a remedy for social ills. An expanding array of Christian social organizations were created whose aim was social regeneration. The role played by protestant religious thought through church social organizations including Sunday schools, social service and welfare agencies, church schools, social clubs and the YMCA in the development of modern sports and physical education has not been explored, although there are suggestions there is need of such study.

This is not a study of the "histories of sport," which usually highlights the evolution of the organization and social impact of sport. This is a study of "sport history" where the social antecedents of the rise of sport, so inextricably linked with social history itself, are to be found. Consequently, the dissertation cannot chronicle the growth of sport; in fact, it cannot even assume that sport ought to be supported as a modern arbitrator of social behaviour, social learning and social custom. Not all social engineers had sport on the drawing board as the next innovative machine for the social regeneration of society.

This study of protestantism and the rise of sport will focus on the period of the social gospel, 1895 - 1925, a period when protestantism attempted to blend its theology with social relevance by aligning itself with the cause of social welfare to seek social action. This process was becoming apparent by the middle 1890s, whereas by 1925, the eclipse of the social gospel as a deliberate rationale for social intervention was underway. But during this period, Christian awareness was stimulated by the social gospel and as a result protestantism became more involved in aspects of physical recreation.

The three major protestant churches, Methodist, Presbyterian and Anglican, and their associated social and recreational organizations served as the main focus because these had the greatest social impact and their archives are most readily available to the modern researcher. Theological polity and ~~dogma~~ were deemed to be important only insofar as they appeared to be necessary for the study since its primary objective was the study of sport and physical education. In the same vein, not all athletic or physical education activities were investigated. Only those activities which were given prominence by the church received major attention, and then only in the context of social planning and social expectation.

Primary sources were used whenever possible including official proceedings of the denominations along with denominational periodical literature; together these ~~best represent not only the~~ official attitude of the church but the most popular clerical and lay expression of that attitude. Relevant Canadian books and articles and church documents from the period, 1895 - 1925, supplement primary source references. Secondary source references include church and social histories in books and periodicals which were outside the period of study.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank the Chairman, Dr. Peter L. Lindsay, and members of the examining committee for their patience and helpful suggestions as the study progressed. Thanks are due as well to Dr. A. Metcalfe for consenting to offer his assistance as external examiner.

The staff of the United Church of Canada and the Anglican General Synod archives in Toronto were vitally helpful in the collection of data, in particular Rev. Ernest Nix.

Finally, the excellent secretarial services of Mark G. Terry Wintringham, were greatly appreciated.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER		PAGE
	PREFACE	v
1	PROTESTANTISM AND THE SOCIAL GOSPEL	1
	Introduction.	1
	Background of the Canadian Churches	5
	Definition of the Social Gospel	13
	The Quest for Social Regeneration	19
	Church Societies.	22
	Ecumenical Cooperation.	34
	Denominational Departments of Moral Reform.	36
	Decline of the Social Gospel.	39
2	THE GYMNASIUM AND SHOWERBATH: THE GOSPEL MESSAGE AND PHYSICAL RECREATION.	44
	The Young Boy Problem	44
	Outside Influences.	55
	Topic Cards	58
	Foreign Books and Publications.	66
	Social Surveys.	74
	The YMCA.	79
	Sports and Games.	104
	Canadian Standard Efficiency Training	138
	Young People's Associations	150
	Physical Education and Christian Nationalism.	160
3	PHYSICAL RECREATION AND PROTESTANT SOCIAL ETHICS.	178
	The Legacy of Individualism	178

CHAPTER	PAGE
Mind, Body, Soul--Character	186
Sport and Social Ethics	209
Sport as Sin.	219
4 SABBATARIANISM.	251
5 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	278

FOOTNOTES	288
BIBLIOGRAPHY.	328

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<u>APAP</u>	<u>Acts and Proceedings of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Canada</u>
<u>CJRT</u>	<u>Canadian Journal of Religious Thought</u>
<u>CJT</u>	<u>Canadian Journal of Theology</u>
<u>CSET</u>	Canadian Standard Efficiency Tests (Training)
<u>DESS</u>	Department of Evangelism and Social Service of the Methodist Church
<u>DTPR</u>	Department of Temperance, Prohibition and Moral Reform of the Methodist Church
<u>JCHS</u>	<u>Journal of the Canadian Church Historical Society</u>
<u>JPGCM</u>	<u>Journal of Proceedings of the General Conference of the Methodist Church</u>
<u>MCMC</u>	<u>Minutes of the Annual Conferences of the Methodist Church</u>

CHAPTER 1

PROTESTANTISM AND THE SOCIAL GOSPEL

Introduction

The history of Christian belief in Canada has been studied by both theological and secular historians who have shown the general importance of religion in Canadian social thought. In fact, until recently, most Canadians belonged to a church, and the importance of the church in forming the pattern of life and thought is an outstanding feature of Canadian social history. As Moir observed:

Religious affiliation overtook place of origin and even political allegiance as the primary badge of personal identity and as the chief source of social contact. Knowing what church a Canadian belonged to furnished until recently the most useful clue to where he stood in his community and where he found his friends. A Canadian belonging to no church was so rare that it was not found necessary to instruct census-takers [on] how to classify them.¹

Protestantism set the moral tone for the protestant population of Canada.

The deep penetration of protestantism into the character of national life resulted not only from religious conviction but from a social program as well, which extended beyond explicitly religious concerns. Traditionally this was manifest through the belief in the capacity of education to encourage a moral existence: education was classed essentially as religious. In addition, the church pursued its social aims of moral guidance, character building and observance of the Sabbath where there was best access, viz., from the pulpit, at Sunday school, through numerous church and Christian social

organizations in which they participated, and through denominational periodicals which comprised a significant portion of home reading.²

But the interest of the churches in purely social issues was a comparatively recent innovation. For example, Methodism had showed little interest in social issues in the nineteenth century, but with the rise of the social gospel in Methodism in the early twentieth century, the church became a leader in social reform. Perhaps the change can be explained as a compensation for fading evangelical fervour, but by the turn of the century, Methodists embraced the social gospel and along with Anglicans and Presbyterians, contributed to the reshaping of modern Canadian social values.³

The social gospel, as this movement in the direction of social consciousness is labelled, was influential in a number of spheres of social action in Canadian protestantism. The rise of the social sciences at a time when urbanization was contributing to produce an urban poor, on one hand, and an increasingly conspicuous urban rich, on the other, tended to direct the social gospel towards issues important to that idiom. The social sciences had a great deal to say about the environment and morality, and their influence is strikingly noticeable in denominational literature about the place of physical recreation in modern society.⁴ Protestant social agencies were well established by World War I. Poverty, bad housing, illiteracy, juvenile delinquency, crime, prostitution and alcoholism were social problems which the social gospel addressed simultaneously through a host of committees, leagues, departments--wings of Christian organizations. The emergence of social action groups within the

church was significantly supported by protestant religious zeal.⁵ All denominations had their boards of Moral and Social Reform; young people's organizations were upgraded and expanded; the YMCA with its strong emphasis on physical recreation also carried the message of the social gospel. These were the vanguard organizations which sought social purity under the influence of the social gospel.

By the 1920s many such agencies, associations and the churches themselves were offering social and physical recreation programs for youth, which a broader social outlook had encouraged. Facilities which were initially developed specifically for the underprivileged gradually became standard equipment in many urban parishes. During this period there was a proliferation of church gymnasiums, swimming pools, basketball courts and dressing rooms,⁶ and as Lappage concluded, the churches were contributing to the prestige of physical recreation as a modern cultural phenomenon.⁷

Although the ability of the churches to mold beliefs and actions was altered substantially with a loosening of social morals following World War I (and with it the eclipse of the social gospel soon followed), the church retained a considerable portion of its customary place at the centre of community life.⁸ By contrast, there is no doubt that social behavior was more rigidly controlled by the suggestions of the churches in the earlier Victorian era, but what the church lacked in its ability to preach following the war, it gained to some degree in its ability to practice through greater involvement in physical culture, recreation and sport. Furthermore, there was a measure of acceptance of these as agents of social

regeneration.

The experience of the colonial churches with any widespread sporting enterprises (other than games) was with the recreational pursuits of the upper class and particularly those of the military. Perennially, organized horseracing was a favourite target for the church, not only because of the gambling it was thought to encourage, but also for the conspicuous lack of social control often exhibited by spectators at these meetings. The early history of horseracing is replete with examples of Christian journalism defaming the sport.

One such example appeared in the Christian Messenger in 1838:

Taken in either a religious or moral view, we cannot picture ourselves a scene more humiliating and debasing than a horse race. The high and low, the vile and the vicious, the gentlemen and the blackleg, jammed together in one tumultuous, noisy crowd, roaring and quarrelling and cursing, or waiting with breathless and senseless anxiety for an event of the most trivial consequence; an event which is of no possible benefit, except to stimulate evil and unruly passions to their utmost or to transfer money from the pocket of one knave or fool or idler to another.

. . . We are not among those who would set our faces against any recreation that is really innocent and lawful, but we can as little conceive how any practical benefit can arise from horseracing and gambling, as we can from dram-selling and drunkenness. To us they both appear frightfully moral evils, and utterly subversive to every law, human or divine.⁹

During colonial times, many of the protestant churches set themselves against the social practice of the community. However, as the denominations became better established and more concerned about their mission, they felt compelled to reassess their position regarding physical recreation, though of horseracing in particular, there was no change of mind. With an increasingly viable social program, the religious and moral conversion of individuals alone, as traditional

protestantism had stressed, was no longer adequate to the modern social need.

The modern view of protestantism towards social problems was the product of an evolutionary trend rather than any revolutionary action. The protestant sects found that there was strength in unity, and were reinforced to pursue the creation of Canadian churches, rather than sects to represent Canadian protestantism as a social force.

Background of the Canadian Churches

During the quarter century or so before the rise of the social gospel in Canadian protestantism, 1895 - 1925, church and sect underwent a series of amalgamations. This period of active institutional consolidation was significant not only because it saw the establishment of Canadian churches, but because it encouraged a spirit of cooperation which became manifestly beneficial to the church during the later period of the social gospel itself.

Silcox, an early Canadian church historian, in viewing this latter trend recognized that the general tendency in the Canadian denominations has been in the direction of integration, despite individual differences in temperament.¹⁰ With the exception of Baptists, his survey of the growth of Anglican, Baptist, Congregational, Methodist and Presbyterian communions showed the reality and practical advantages of close cooperation, not only leading to denominational amalgamation but to interdenominational social programming as well. Besides providing a more effective political voice for the

church, the formation of such ecumenical organizations as the Social Service Council of Canada in 1907, demonstrated the advantages of working together during periods of social progress in order to secure commonly desired social goals.

While this ability to work cooperatively proved significant, of importance too in the background of the Canadian churches is the recognition of the resiliency of historical protestantism in Canadian culture. The period of the social gospel, 1895 - 1925, was also one of wholesale secularization of Canadian life. Under pressures of urbanism and industrialization, the traditional hegemony of the church in Canadian life was severely challenged, and as a result its influence and ability to persuade were diminished. But such eminent church historians as J. W. Grant, have documented the record of its strengths. By the mid 1920s, and notwithstanding a considerable loss of innocence following World War I, the churches retained their customary place in the centre of Canadian life, "despite protests from the right and dissertations on the left."¹¹ In their struggle with economic and cultural problems, the Canadian churches drew from their historical tradition and on occasion broke away from it while channeling energies towards their social ambitions.

The most singular example of this spirit of cooperation came with the formation in Canada of the United Church in 1925. The realization of this unique union of Methodist, Presbyterian and Congregationalist, unparalleled in western protestantism, culminated more than twenty years of negotiations towards unification since the ideal of union was first brought officially forward at the Winnipeg

7

Conference of the Methodist church in 1902.¹² But this process of union had its roots in the previous century. During the last quarter of the nineteenth century, the Canadian denominational Methodist and Presbyterian churches themselves were created through a series of amalgamations, uniting the vast majority of adherents to these traditions.

Presbyterians were the first to seek to make their ecclesiastical jurisdictions coterminous with the boundaries of the new Dominion after Confederation in 1867. Cooperation and political union were encouraged by an increasing sense of common purpose but also by the realities of wanting to evangelize or serve the vast Canadian hinterland. The Canada Presbyterian Church was formed the year of Confederation from the union of the Free and United Presbyterian churches; by 1875 the General Synod of the Presbyterian church was established completing the merger of eight independent Presbyterian churches. In the decade before 1875 Canadian Presbyterianism was almost entirely consolidated.¹³ Perhaps the dominant feature of the Presbyterian church was its conservatism, noticeable in both its church polity and social outlook. But this is not to be construed as indicating a lack of interest on the part of Presbyterians in matters such as social welfare or public affairs. As pointed out by Christie in his study of Presbyterian involvement in social reform, Presbyterians concerned themselves with social problems, although this is not always obvious in their church histories.¹⁴ But at the turn of the century, the church would move even more convincingly towards a social Christianity inspired, as all

protestant churches were, "to a more active part in social problems, by the impetus of the 'Social Gospel.'"¹⁵

Presbyterian conservatism was evident in its austere religious services, church architecture, and generally in its social approach to problems as demonstrated by its tenacious support of Sabbatarianism in later years. Regarding such social subjects as recreation and pleasure, the Presbyterian often "found it difficult, if not impossible, to enjoy himself wholeheartedly . . . [or to believe] that the creation and contemplation of beauty is a legitimate activity."¹⁶ The Scottish background softened the stern Calvinist tradition of Presbyterianism, enabling Presbyterians to be receptive to reasoned arguments, and they too found themselves being lulled by the cool objectivity of the sociological approach inherent in practical Christianity. Despite their rejection of many worldly pleasures, as Grant concluded, their support for current evangelical causes could be assured.¹⁷ They too were moved by the impetus of the social gospel into the arena of practical concern about the physical recreation of Canadians.

Within the Presbyterian church its government or polity was conservative as well. Its form of government was conciliar, meaning that it was governed not by individuals but by councils or courts, often consisting of an equal number of both ordained ministers and laymen.¹⁸ Its conservatism was highlighted by the importance of the Presbytery and the communion in decision making in the Presbyterian church, which became an issue during negotiations for church union in 1925. Through committees, boards, etc., at all levels of

organization, synod, presbytery or parish, discussion of pertinent issues to the church took place, which in turn gave official direction to the church. For example, the Presbyterian Board of Moral and Social Reform first established in 1907 as a department under the Board of Home Missions, was responsible for directing the official attitude towards social concerns of the time--temperance, gambling, Sabbath observance, prostitution, public amusements, etc.¹⁹ The Board of Moral and Social Reform of the Presbyterian church, even more so than similar boards in other denominations, sought to represent not only the vanguard of those within the church seeking modern options for solving the real problem of decreasing church attendance at the turn of the century, but also traditional values within the church.

The decennial census of 1891 showed the relative numerical strength of all denominations just prior to the turn of the century. Presbyterians represented 15.6% of the total population of Canada and Anglicans 13.4%. Methodists were marginally better supported at 17.5%, which together represented 46.5% of the Canadian population with 41.2% being Roman Catholic. The relative strength of this ratio did not alter substantially during the period 1891 to 1931. At that time statistics showed the United Church of Canada representing 19.4% of Canadians, Presbyterians 8.4%, Anglicans 15.8%, or collectively 43.5% as compared to Roman Catholics who totalled 39.5% of population.²⁰

Methodist were the next to pursue the path of union and to form a Canadian Church. While the Presbyterian Church was completing its negotiations for the union of 1874, a major consummation was taking

place to form the Methodist Church in Canada. This arrangement brought together Wesleyan conferences from various parts of Canada, as well as New Connection Methodists, in an effort to improve the ability to effectively minister to the remote, rural hinterland, a concern which the Presbyterian church also experienced.

This process of the union of Methodist churches entered its final stage by 1884. Four previously unrelated bodies remained to be joined: the 1874 Methodist Church in Canada, the Methodist Episcopal Church in Canada, the Primitive Methodist Church in Canada, and the Bible Christian Church. The Methodist church which resulted from the union of these diverse Methodist churches in 1884, adopted a polity including a General Superintendency, where laymen as in the Presbyterian church were given considerable voice on its boards and committees, although there were committees limited to ordained ministry. Laity were represented on committees concerned with social problems. For example, emerging from an earlier sessional committee on sociological questions, the Methodist Department of Temperance, Prohibition and Moral Reform was established in 1902 to give a more active voice to the church as such issues became more important with the broadening of the base of support for greater social Christianity. Reflecting changing social imperatives within Methodism, it was later renamed the Department of Evangelism and Social Service and became an important mediator of church social policy including its posture towards recreation and amusement.

Although there was much in common in church government of the Methodist and Presbyterian churches, there were noticeable

differences in temperament between them. For one thing, Methodists were dedicated evangelicals to a greater extent than were other denominations.²¹ To historians of the church, evangelical Methodism has long been recognized as one of the "determining influences in shaping the national character of English-speaking Canada."²²

Methodism had been nurtured on successive waves of revivalist passion which influenced its temperament and theology. At the turn of the century there was a noticeable calling for, and expectation of an imminent revival, one which would aid its struggle with secular materialism. Characteristic of its evangelical tradition were camp meetings, gospel bands and fiery orations delivered by such well-known Methodist evangelists as Crossley and Hunter. Although the protestant evangelistic ideal placed much emphasis on individual conversion, there was a practical side not to be discounted. For example, the Epworth League movement founded in 1887, which was to become the basis of the youth movement within the church, grew out of the zeal of the gospel band movement and evangelism in general.²³

"Possibly the most forceful charge leveled against the evangelicals," claimed French,

is that the moral constraints attendant upon membership in these denominations imposed restrictions upon the development of Canadian culture. The basic intent of such regulations was to make the Christian consider the implications of his actions, and above all to focus his mind on his eternal, not his temporal destiny.²⁴

The implications of such a religious state of mind implied a form of Puritanism, of the variety popularly held about late Victorian culture in Canada.²⁵

However, the true evangelical was also vitally concerned with the practical world, and never content to be cloistered, preferred instead to proselytize his religion. According to French, the authentic evangelical was characterized "most invariably by his constant awareness of the presence of God in human affairs and by his belief in the reality of human evil. . . . Honesty, sincerity, sobriety, seriousness, a sense of purpose, and the acceptance of responsibility for others were the proper outer attributes of the transformed inner man."²⁶ Consequently, evangelical Methodists took up the cause of the social gospel with a fervour unequalled in other denominations, and the tension between traditional evangelism and practical or social Christianity would, for many Methodists touched by the social gospel, contribute to both the definition and cultural understanding of physical recreation and sport and their place in modern Canadian society.

While Presbyterians possessed a strong interest in moral philosophy, and Methodists favoured practical innovation, Anglicans stressed its classical tradition.²⁷ The priority of the Anglican church in Canada was established by law and it was this particular link between the church of England and the Canadian nation which influenced the perceived need for union. The Anglican church relied for a considerable period of its history on outside financial aid from England which retarded its own internal development of self-reliance. For this reason, Anglicans continued to be more highly influenced by the United Kingdom than were other denominations, although all denominations represented basically a British

cultural viewpoint. Nevertheless, steps were taken in the post-Confederation era to produce a Canadian church. The first Provincial Synod was held in 1861 but not until 1893, after the establishment of the ecclesiastical province of Rupert's Land, would its General Synod represent all of Canada.²⁸

The peculiar relationship between church and state influenced the social outlook of the church as well. One result of being consciously informed about current events in the United Kingdom was that the social consciousness of the Anglican church was immediately British in its orientation. The Canadian Anglican has been described as "very English, conservative and stuffy!"²⁹ which often accurately described the social disposition of Canadian Anglicans with their somewhat colonial approach to Canadian culture. Another result was that the traditional view of British sports and games was carried over almost intact into Canadian Anglicanism.

Definition of the Social Gospel

The literature of Canadian social history has not ignored the existence or the influence of the social gospel in the Canadian experience. The term, social gospel, has been applied by social historians of Canada to a wide range of Christian expression. Perhaps the term has been used too loosely in endeavouring to explain everything from educational change, the growth of social service and youth agencies, to political and labour protests. Richard Allen, a noted historian of the social gospel movement in Canada, in addressing a Regina Conference entitled, The Social Gospel in

Canada, in 1974, stressed the importance of coming to grips with the term, definitionally.

It is possible to use that phrase, the Social Gospel, to refer rather broadly and vaguely to any and all efforts of Christians to express their faith in the social context, and sometimes even to encompass any movement which offers a hope of social regeneration. However, what we are here concerned with is not that broad conception of the Social Gospel, but with that movement of Christian social thought and action which arose in the last decades of the nineteenth century in the context of a society becoming increasingly collectivized under the impulses of industrialism and urbanism.³⁰

In order to understand the social mechanism chosen by the church to sponsor its program for the social regeneration of Canadian society, a review of the literature of the social gospel in Canada becomes imperative.

A brief survey of the important attributes of it in the writings by Allen is a first step towards a working definition. That the term, social gospel, is not tersely defined in historiography of the social gospel in Canada is indicative of the breadth of social problems touched by it. Yet despite the tendency to apply the term loosely, the notion of it is well defined by its most prominent aspects.

"Fundamentally, the social gospel rested on the premise that Christianity was a social religion," stated Allen in Prophecy and Protest.³¹ This idea served to heighten the importance of shifts towards humanism in both secular and religious society in the late nineteenth century. But "still more fundamentally," noted Allen in The Social Passion, "it represented the complex of ideas and hopes which lay at the heart of reform, and it did this regardless of

whether the social gospel was specifically acknowledged or not."³²

But the term itself did not come into prominent use in Canada until after the First War.

Such tenets of social gospel thought, while expressive, are not wholly adequate to defining the term. Better understanding of it can be achieved (or at least its social relevance highlighted) by relating an understanding of its social relevance to a broader, more embracing perspective of protestantism itself. Of first importance in that regard is the evangelism of protestantism, which Allen claimed was one of the most important developments of the nineteenth century to affect the social gospel. Evangelism stressed free will, an imminent God, restrictive personal and social morality and the doctrine of personal perfection, to name some of the most potent.³³

Another prominent Canadian historian, A. R. M. Lower, gave acknowledgement to the idea as well, but in a lighter vein.

Evangelical protestantism, far from putting a man to sleep, keeps him only too wide awake. Not only does it impose the most tremendous of all burdens on him--his own absolute responsibility for his fate, finite and infinite--but it constantly throws at him the challenge that he is his brother's keeper, and it makes him feel that the world's safety and salvation depend not on his rulers or his boss or his priest but on him.³⁴

It brought to bear upon the practicing evangelical (and undoubtedly influenced the non-communicant but to a lesser degree) a feeling of responsibility for society and heightened the urge to respond accordingly or appropriately. The church intuitively understood that its efforts whether directly for the church, or some social benefit, were for the higher good of God and of the nation.

Accompanying the evangelism of protestantism was what Allen labelled the emergence of the protestant churches as a major national culture building agency.³⁵ The evolution of the national Presbyterian and Methodist churches was a crucial and significant step in this process, as was the establishment of the General Synod of the Anglican Church in Canada. Allen warned against over-emphasizing the national component, "so as to annex it primarily to the gospel of nationalism itself."³⁶ Magney, in his study of Methodist nationalism, argued that the most impressive aspect, at least for Canadian Methodism during the social gospel period, was its "overwhelming nationalistic cast;"³⁷ Christian nationalism received renewed attention under the aegis of the social gospel. Nationalistic rhetoric was much more than evangelical fervour. Behind the rhetoric a basic shift from individualism, which the social gospel explicitly and implicitly encouraged was taking place. The habit of expressing reform ambitions in nationalistic terms was by no means exclusive to Methodism but evident as well in the literature of the Presbyterian and Anglican churches. This peculiar adjunct of evangelical protestantism was, not surprisingly, closely linked to efforts by the church in the area of social services and in particular with the role of physical recreation. Christian nationalism was concerned for national well-being and evoked concern for the necessity of national preparedness as a Christian ideal. The social gospel served to heighten the importance of such concerns.

The collation of evangelical protestantism and the "impulses of industrialism and urbanism" merged the individualism of evangelism

with concern for rising social problems, but leaving intact, more than incidentally, many of the traditional moral overtones which had been the basis of personal Christian ethics. However, the social gospel tended to undermine traditional, personal ethics as it encouraged concern for collective action, an important aspect of the definition of the social gospel. Allen supplied additional direction:

The Social Gospel that arose in the latter years of the nineteenth century, however, developed under influences which encouraged a social concept of man [in contrast to earlier conceptions of man and society which were intensely individualistic but without the social appeal] and underlined the social dimensions of the Gospel, so that the solutions that appeared to be most useful were those which had an essentially social character. 38

The result was the development of interest by the church in social Darwinism, popularly expressed as interest in "sociological questions," to use the vernacular of the day. Christie, in his study of Presbyterian views of public affairs and social problems, typically represented the truth of the observation by readily adopting the social gospel as meaning the amelioration of social problems. 39

The movement away from intensely individualistic evangelical religion led the church more towards the study of social behavior, which the social gospel undoubtedly encouraged. Darwinism had a profound influence on the actions and theology of the social gospel. The most influential feature of this was its emphasis on the importance of the environment, and logically, ultimately on the environment as a factor in the formation of character, or social behavior. Adherents to this movement believed that man was influenced not solely by will, but by environment as well, an environment increasingly

shaped by the new demands of industrialization and urbanization of Canada.⁴⁰ The social gospel emphasized the importance, and perhaps the necessity, of cooperation and collective action which was sharpened further by the reality of cut-throat competition evident in certain sectors of secular life. In other words, Christian ethics and natural law were comfortably compatible.⁴¹

This passion for the social gospel tended to lead many of its new apostles to adopt a sociological framework, encouraged by the maturity of sociology as a discipline and its application within the curriculum of protestant theological colleges. A survey of curriculum offerings in protestant colleges of higher learning bears this out. By the time the social gospel was reaching its zenith, 1914 - 1920, most church colleges were receiving a steady diet of sociology, and while in American colleges this may have had its beginnings in the nineteenth century, in Canada it was more a twentieth-century phenomenon.⁴² With the growing competency of Canadian clerics in this field of study, social gospellers carried a social message from sea to sea.⁴³

The popular meaning of the social gospel was thought to be readily understandable, and referred to the social aims and progress of the Christian church. The social gospel movement, then, was a social movement in which the influence of modern thinking and modern analytical methods, represented by social Darwinism and sociological enquiry, raised the general level of social consciousness to compete with the rampant individualism within the protestant tradition. The organic components of evangelism and nationalism fostered a realism

about the social gospel which produced a more practical character of remedy for social ills.⁴⁴ The social gospel was a gospel of reaction to a plethora of social wrongs. In that regard the church enlisted the support of established agencies, adjusted church policy to suit contemporary conditions and as well created new agencies as far as practicable.

The Quest for Social Regeneration

The term "social regeneration" was often used in the vernacular of the period to connote the improved social status of the culture, but implicit in its meaning was the notion that it should always be accomplished not by some mechanical means, but by an improved moral outlook. Time and time again, the protestant church stressed that the fundamental tenet of the church was religion, not social work. The vision and aspiration was of the kingdom of God on earth, and this was the popular cry of the day. This idea was first articulated to a wide readership by an American theologian, Walter Rauschenbusch,⁴⁵ and was readily incorporated as part of the underlying theology of the social gospel.

But it was by no means a new or exclusively American idea. For the Methodist Department of Temperance, Prohibition and Moral Reform, this too was the ideal of the department.

The objective ideal of the Department of Temperance and Moral Reform is the Kingdom of God realized here and now. . . . The Department aims at certain moral reforms, not as ultimate ends, but as incidents along the way and as contributory to this great whole.⁴⁶

Although the social gospel is not regarded by historians primarily as a theological movement, theological arguments cannot be ignored entirely in any discussion of social programs based on a social theology.⁴⁷ The many church social organizations were organized for ecclesiastical purposes and arguments for their creation and sustenance were drawn often from biblical reference. Most church associations, in addition to any social ambitions, were expected to contribute intellectually towards the better understanding of church theology through regular scriptural exercises of one sort or another.

In the quest for the Kingdom of God, for social regeneration, the church directed its attention towards the many church organizations which were a significant point of contact between church and society as a whole. Church related organizations such as Sunday schools, missionary societies, young people's societies, social welfare councils, temperance societies, and student volunteer organizations, reached out broadly to the community and, under the influence of the social gospel, were adapted as agents of the gospel in the quest for social regeneration.

Traditional church organizations generally fell into four broad categories: missionary, devotional, educational and social, with devotional and missionary interests dominating. The latter two--educational and social--became increasingly important as the church attempted to compete with social programs offered by sects or secular agencies.⁴⁸ In practice, though, the religious content was so clearly central to meetings that differences between these divisions tended to become obscure. The church sought to

encompass representation from all age levels, so that at the turn of the century it was commonplace to find, for example, Sunday school classes catering not only to pre-school children but post-school adolescents and even older, mature adults. Methodists were especially keen to ensure that Bible classes reached all age levels. Bible study was a lifelong duty.

But as the new century approached, emphasis within church organizations began to change as a result of the shift of youth away from the church. Young people were seeking more social-oriented activities which the church had failed to provide, and as a result, organizations of a missionary and devotional nature declined by comparison as the church attempted to compete with the secular world. With a growing sense of alarm, reform committee members began to raise this issue of declining youth membership in the hope that a way might be found to reverse the flow. They attempted to capitalize on the increasing emphasis within the church upon social concerns generally, bringing about an even greater emphasis on youth, to the gradual neglect of adult programming. In order to regain lost loyalty to the historical church, all denominations sought to upgrade the delivery of adolescent social programming within the structure of church societies. Not all started the rebuilding process with the same advantages. Some were caught unprepared. Nevertheless, young people's societies which traditionally had received only limited attention as a means of grace, theologically or socially, became the centre of attention in the evangelical drive to arrest the debilitating trend of weakened adolescent membership.

Around this re-emphasis on youth the church also gave greatest expression for the value of physical recreation and sport, and its possible usefulness as a social tool.

Church Societies

By comparison to others, Anglicans lagged behind in the provision of organized social associations, but attempted to regain lost ground with the formation of the Anglican Young People's Association (AYPA) in 1902.⁴⁹ An adopted resolution of the Synod of Huron, 1902, proposed: "That it is desirable to promote the formation of Young People's Associations on a common basis for common ends."⁵⁰ From this resolution the guiding principles were subsequently set forth for this nascent organization. The tenor of social expectation, which such societies were ideally to possess, is shown in its quadrilateral principles: worship, work, fellowship and edification.⁵¹ However, interpretation of this code of ethics was left to the discretion of the individual rector, and this contributed to marked differences in program quality between parishes. This aspect of polity in the Anglican church remained unchanged throughout the period. Midweek programmes were enlarged under it, but program scope generally was left to the individual rector, as was too, the interpretation of which physical activities were to be appropriately pursued.⁵²

After formation of the General Synod in 1894, the basis was laid for subsequent organizational restructuring of youth-oriented agencies. A Sunday School Committee of the General Synod was formed

the year the AYPa resolution was passed. By 1908 a Sunday School Commission was established by the General Synod to guide the AYPa towards maturity, reflecting further interest in young people among Anglicans. In 1918 a more powerful organizational structure, called the General Board of Religious Education (GBRE), was created by the General Synod with a mandate to oversee literary, educational and social activities in all church organizations including the AYPa.⁵³ Church interest in youth was further specialized in the Anglican church with formation of the Council on Young People's Work, with representation from the GBRE and the Dominion AYPa. Under this Council a more systematic program of instruction was established for Anglicans including suggested weekday programs, promotion of conferences on Boys' and Girls' Work, and training for leadership.⁵⁴

The first organizational meeting of the Council on Young People's Work in 1919 set out at the start to establish its credibility by offering a firm policy. First, the Council's priority was to study the needs of youth, then to prepare a comprehensive program for the parish. A survey questionnaire was constructed and sent to 1400 parishes in Canada which would provide a statistical base on which the Council could then act.⁵⁵ However, the mania for sociological enquiry was somewhat less than universal in the Anglican church. Only ten percent of rectors chose to reply. Nevertheless, data gathered from the questionnaire provides a valuable record of the relative numerical strength of individual youth organizations within the church circa 1920. One hundred and forty parishes chose to respond, representing eighteen dioceses and ten thousand young

people over the age of eighteen. Of the most important, numerically, were the AYPAs, Bible classes, and Church of England Men's Clubs.⁵⁶

Traditionally the Brotherhood of St. Andrew had been an important, though small, elite organization, but with formation of the AYPAs in 1902, membership in the Brotherhood declined in favour of the more social form of association. Extrapolated over the entire 1400 parishes, the results of this first attempt to gather social data on the activities of youth within the Anglican church indicated that Anglican youth organizations may have had a membership approaching one hundred thousand. Obviously such youth organizations were fertile ground for the church in its evangelizing efforts aimed at Canadian youth.

Traditionally Presbyterians had put their hopes for youth on the Young People's Society of Christian Endeavour (YPSCE) which stressed Bible study, communion in the church, and fund raising for missionary purposes.⁵⁷ In the decades before the turn of the century, Christian Endeavour had enjoyed a modest, steady growth but with increasing competition from the many secular societies developing at this time, growth was halted and in many cases membership was in decline. The growing inability of the Christian Endeavour style of organization to attract young Presbyterian boys and men contributed in part to the dilemma facing the Presbyterian church. Some suggested that there was little that the church could do.⁵⁸ By 1898 the problem of declining membership, especially male membership, was becoming acute according to R. D. Fraser, convener of the Committee on Young People's Societies. In the Third Annual Report of the

Committee to the General Assembly, Fraser stressed that "unless some city societies solve more effectually the 'young man problem,' they [YPSCE] will soon be simply Young Women's Societies of Christian Endeavor."⁵⁹ Fraser's concerns were backed with statistical evidence showing a decline in membership and a shift of sex ratios towards females.

A period of consolidation followed which saw more emphasis being placed on religious education and social programming but not before one further effort to reassert missionary work within the young people's society. The Committee elaborated on the role it envisioned for missionary work.

In the opinion of your Committee this work of organization should be prosecuted with greater energy. It is very desirable that Presbyterian Unions should be formed, and that these unions concentrate their energies upon some definite or specific work, such as supporting, wholly, or in part, a missionary in the home or foreign field. This would give cohesion to the Societies, direction to their aims, and stimulus to their latent energies. It would moreover, develop a spirit of denominational loyalty, and deepen their interest in the great work of the world's evangelization. It can scarcely be expected that the young people will do their best work unless there is set before them some worthy object toward the advancement of which they can bend their energies. But such an object can be found in a great missionary enterprise.⁶⁰

Within the revised format there was a noticeable shift towards national or home missions, the forerunner of later, more concerted efforts in rural and urban sociology in Canada, but the optimism of the Committee for the revamped format was not warranted. This increased attention to missions fell short of its membership objectives.

This was the age of "societies" and Presbyterians were to

be no exception to the general rule. Presbyterians had created dozens of minor associations in order to carry out the divergent tasks of the church, but with little regard to overlapping function. To address the problem of declining membership, the Committee on Young People's Societies decided first to systematize the naming of those societies which held a common purpose, either missionary, devotional, educational or social. The problem was discussed at the meeting of the 1902 General Assembly and a model constitution was designed to replace the varied societies which existed at the time. The Committee chose the name, The Presbyterian Guild, but this did not prove popular. The objective of the move was "to save our young people from loosely-organized societies, where nothing but a pleasant evening is thought of, and membership carries with it no sense of obligation. There can be no successful work except as responsibility is laid upon the young people, and they feel it."⁶¹

The plan hoped to streamline such divergent organizations as Christian Endeavour, Young People's Societies and Associations, Hospital Bands, Boys' Brigades, Brotherhoods of St. Andrew and Philip, Young People's Mutual Improvement Societies, Literary Societies, and Kings Daughters and Sons.⁶² The plan was not successful because this reorganization did not represent any real realignment in the thinking of the Presbyterian church, and traditional emphasis on service remained substantially unaltered. The move did not complement the widening interest of youth for social programming within the church. The more popular and acceptable generic term, Young People's Society, in the end prevailed.⁶³

Continued reorganizational efforts brought further changes in the structure and function of young people's societies which seemed to be encouraging increased membership. A Special Committee on amalgamation of Committees on Sabbath Schools and Young People's Societies recommended in 1911 that a united Committee be formed to oversee the work of these two previously separate committees.⁶⁴ The Special Committee recognized that more social aspects of life needed to be a meaningful part of the church's program. The First Annual Report of the Committee on Sabbath Schools and Young People's Societies considered the imperative of changing circumstances.

Gradually it was seen that these two sides of life, the impressional and the expressional, could not be arbitrarily separated without serious loss [of educational opportunity and youth membership], and on one hand the Sabbath School began to provide for activities as well as instruction, while on the other hand the Young People's Society was providing for instruction as well as activities.⁶⁵

The church's understanding of the place and role of the adolescent in society was undergoing a metamorphosis. Church societies in general and Presbyterian societies in particular were in a state of transition, a transition which witnessed not only a halt in declining membership but a gradual increase in the number of church societies. This was accomplished notwithstanding a steady decline in the Christian Endeavour form of organization. Out of 1,973 societies reporting to the 1915 General Assembly, a mere 337 (a loss of 38 such societies for the year) were Christian Endeavour, per se. There was also a sharp decline in the revenues given to foreign missions. The focus of the church was being directed towards religious education at home through the provision of weekday activities.⁶⁶

By 1914 reorganizational efforts had been rooted sufficiently that the Presbyterian Brotherhood Organization which admitted only men and boys, could begin to show new signs of life. At the beginning of the War, 228 Brotherhood organizations were operating nationwide, regulated by the Brotherhood Board of the Presbyterian Church.⁶⁷ They continued to emphasize traditional objectives such as Bible study, personal evangelism and missionary work, but also included a Boys' Work Department and an Athletics Department. The Brotherhood was further example to the church and to those who had lost faith in the importance of young people's societies, that a comprehensive attack on the problem of membership in church societies could bear fruitful advantage.

The Methodist denomination developed comparable youth associations to those in the Presbyterian and Anglican churches, and these were closely controlled by the committees of the church. Methodist societies also experienced similar trends as had those in the other denominations and the most vexing was the declining allegiance of young people to the church. At the turn of the century, Epworth League membership statistics, for instance, were showing erratic movement, and sex ratios were altering in favour of females. The church, however, due to its highly centralized form of polity, and its strong evangelical commitment, was quickly able to make concerted efforts to bring the situation in hand. Committees on young people studied the problem thoroughly and their suggested alternative programming met with reasonable success.

The Epworth League, named in honour of the birthplace of Charles and John Wesley, the "founders" of Methodism, was an integral part of the denominational organization of the church. Originally developed in the United States, the League was quickly accepted into Canadian Methodism. "The Epworth League" declared S. D. Clark, a noteworthy scholar of Canadian cultural history, "was designed to close the gap between the Sunday school and the Church as a means of checking the heavy loss of support of young people to more aggressive evangelistic religious bodies or to secular agencies."⁶⁸ The need for such societies was obvious in the hurly-burly atmosphere of Canadian city life. Clark recognized that the rapid growth of the urban community in Canada was having a deleterious effect on young people, and the church through its failure to develop recreational institutions, was losing membership to commercialized forms of recreation.⁶⁹ The needs and expectations of young people were being altered by changing cultural circumstances and in particular that of physical recreation, which Methodism had to take cognizance of, if it were to continue "shaping the national character of English speaking Canada."⁷⁰

While the interest of the Methodist church was also in the direction of missionary work, it was deemed of vital importance that the church should give additional attention to the job of securing and retaining young men to the church. Specific methods which would accomplish this onerous task in light of declining membership were only crudely articulated at the turn of the century. There was a sense of urgency, however, and many in the church were disposed to

use all methods at hand. "Where accommodation can be afforded by churches for physical, intellectual and moral culture," declared the Epworth League report for 1903, "it can be judiciously used as a ground of approach to reach young men, in conjunction with gospel preaching and faithful teaching through other agencies." Admittedly, however, the church was not interested only in membership. "The purpose should be, not so much to attract young men, as to provide under wholesome auspices the association for which they naturally and properly long, and the lack of which sends them to places of bad influence."⁷¹ While the inclination of the church was towards improved missionary aims and goals, young people's societies were tending away from service abroad in proportion to the growing problems associated with Canadian life at home.

Under the heading of "Social Regeneration," the Eleventh General Conference noted "that social service and evangelism are inseparably interwoven with each other. Christ came to the world, not only to save individual men, but also to save the organized, corporate group life of humanity."⁷² Increasingly, this new emphasis on social service and evangelism was becoming institutionalized for the promotion of child welfare, the establishment of community centres, and "many other activities for human betterment, the uplift of citizenship, the development of right relations between man and his brother and between man and his Maker."⁷³ Increasingly this also meant the promotion of Brotherhood evangelical organizations as recommended by the Committee on Evangelism and Social Service to the Conference, which resulted in the production of a "syllabus of

work, courses of study, and in a larger measure to supervise, promote and foster the Brotherhood movement."⁷⁴ Reminiscent of the model constitution of the Presbyterian Guild, Methodist young people's societies moved to save young people from loosely organized societies, and to strengthen the sense of obligation.

This desire to better articulate the needs and responsibilities associated with a greater concern for youth, resulted in changes in the form as well as the function of church societies. Even before World War I, this process of channelling the exuberance of youth more toward social ends was underway. The Department of Temperance and Moral Reform recommended in its Twelfth Annual Report, 1914, that all Brotherhoods within the church should give "every possible emphasis in every possible way to the Declaration of Principles upon Social Questions adopted by the General Conference."⁷⁵ In fact, the rediscovery itself of the Brotherhood movement was a significant part of this process. Just as the Methodist Committee on Evangelism and Social Service had claimed that women's societies were "to a remarkable degree reaching and teaching the woman life of our churches and communities," so too the ambition was that men's organizations might reach a similar plateau, thereby helping to save the organized, corporate life of society.⁷⁶ As witnessed in other denominational societies, there was a gradual movement away from strict ecclesiastical types of youth associations within the Methodist church, and with it the hegemony of the nineteenth-century Epworth League gave way in the twentieth century to the ubiquitous young people's society. In recognition of this process by recommendation of the Eighth General

Conference in 1910, the General Board of Sunday Schools and Epworth Leagues, which had presided over the leagues since their inception, was changed in name to the General Conference Board of Sunday Schools and Young People's Societies.⁷⁷ The importance of the Board was that it had the authority to regulate the constitution of Epworth and young people's societies, and to deal with social issues of the day as they affected Methodist youth.

By 1910 the Committee on Sunday Schools and Young People's Societies had evolved a complex format to keep pace with the increasing complexity of Canadian life. The Sunday School Division was responsible for Sunday schools and provided literature, teacher training, and supervision. The Committee also had the formidable task of general oversight of all young people's societies of the church with aims similar to those in the constitutions of Epworth leagues and Young People's societies. Its executive included most of the usual officers or equivalent including General Secretary, Field Secretaries, Treasurer and the incumbent editor of Sunday school publications. The constitution also provided for a number of departments within each organization including the Department of Spiritual Work, Missionary Department, Literary and Social Department, and Citizenship Department (later changed to the Department of Social Service).⁷⁸ A review of the requirements as laid down by the Committee for the latter two departments shows the deepening concern for social questions--questions which were regularly discussed and debated formally in church societies, and read in the periodical literature of the denomination.

The prime function of the Literary and Social Department was to provide intellectual exercises and entertainment by means of lectures, debates, essays, literary programs, etc., and to promote the social interest of the association by ensuring the welcoming of strangers to the meetings, and by providing, where possible, parlours, reading rooms and "kindred facilities for social enjoyment conducive to the proper development of Christian character."⁷⁹ The Citizenship Department was constituted to provide leadership under five headings: patriotism, municipal politics, temperance and prohibition, moral reform and athletics. In particular concerning athletics, the Citizenship Department sought "to have general charge of out-door sports, gymnasium exercises, etc., when it is deemed desirable to conduct them."⁸⁰ Young people showed keen interest in such departments thereby underscoring the potential that the Committee saw for the furtherance of the Kingdom of God on earth and the potential such departments possessed in defining social regeneration. Several other organizations were affiliated with the Committee on Sunday Schools and Young People's Societies which further broadened the scope of its influence. Boy Scouts, Boys Brigades and "similar organizations for the cultivation of true manliness in boys" came under the scrutiny of the General Board as well.⁸¹ The constitution provided furthermore for District Secretaries of the Committee on Temperance and Moral Reform, another committee which had a significant part in the social role of the church, to be ex officio members of District executives of Young People's Associations.⁸²

Ecumenical Cooperation

If the social objective of the church was to save the corporate social fabric of humanity, it was logical that denominations tending towards unity of government should as a preliminary step cooperate more closely for the common resolution of social problems. The obsessive concern with youth which characterized the period of the social gospel was part of a broader church program to find greater social relevance. For the resolution of common issues such as temperance, Sabbath observance, labour ills, prostitution, education, recreation, etc., cooperative action became imperative. One result saw the establishment of a number of ecumenical boards and committees, some of which rose to national prominence, in particular the Social Service Council of Canada, and a renewed interest in established ones which might offer additional support such as the Lord's Day Alliance of Canada. Such organizations investigated all aspects of social organization though not always with the same purposes in mind. On the issue of physical recreation and the provision of kindergartens and playgrounds for children a consensus might be reached; on the issue of the value of sport and organized activities there was often open disagreement.

These two ecumenical organizations, the Social Service Council and the Lord's Day Alliance, are an interesting study in contrast. The Social Service Council of Canada examined social issues including physical recreation, using a sociological method of inquiry, and at its best represented the liberal theology of

denominationalism. The Lord's Day Alliance, with its stricter interpretation of the use of physical recreation on the Sabbath, represented a more staid, traditional view of social progress. The Alliance was particularly popular among Presbyterians who forged the Alliance from the Presbyterian General Assembly Conference of 1888 which was also attended by delegates from both the Methodist Conference and the Anglican Synod of Toronto. On March 21, 1889 its Canadian constitution was formally adopted.⁸³ Its first field secretary, the stalwart Sabbatarian crusader, Rev. J. G. Shearer, became its most important spokesman, proselytizing the Alliance point of view regularly through its official organ, the Lord's Day Advocate.

Rev. Shearer was a dynamic personality and largely through his personal efforts, a federation of religious denominational departments was achieved which eventually became the Social Service Council of Canada. In 1907 the Moral and Social Reform Council of Canada was established to channel protestant interest in monitoring the social progress of the nation and to further suggest corrective action where applicable, which most often came in the guise of legislative action. All denominations contributed staff to the organization though this national body did not supersede the denominational departments of moral reform but provided only a complementary forum for protestant social thinking. Individual departments remained to continue the specialized efforts in social programming each had built up, to continue to represent denominational opinion, and to exert a formative influence on their respective

churches. Soon after the federation was achieved it became known as the Social Service Council of Canada.

If the role of the Alliance was largely legislative and proscriptive, that of the Council was more legislative and prescriptive. But as important as the Council was, it could in no way replace the individual departments of moral reform. In fact in later years the Council was to prove too cumbersome for the denominations. Individual departments concerned with moral and social reform were at once legislative, proscriptive and prescriptive, but more importantly, they provided leadership in the discussion of social problems including that of the use of leisure, physical recreation and sport--issues involved in social regeneration.

Denominational Departments of Moral Reform

The evangelical Methodists were the first to formally create a separate Department to deal with social issues. Originating from a former Committee on Sociological Questions, in 1902 the Department of Temperance, Prohibition and Moral Reform was created. As the Committee came to investigate the social reality it was to some extent overwhelmed by the complexity it found, but the methods of social regeneration were as important as the results. Despite more frequent calls for action by social gospellers and reformers, the church struggled not to compromise its ideals. In its Twelfth Annual Report, 1914, the Department of Temperance and Moral Reform, on the eve of being renamed the Department of Evangelism and Social Service to better denote its changing social role, wrestled with

this important issue.

The Church distrusts all schemes of social reconstruction that have not the spirit of Jesus at their heart. In the profound conviction, and in the novelty of the situation which a rapid and unprecedented industrial and commercial evolution has placed her today, as well as in the abounding spirit of worldliness, lies the explanation of the Church's present hesitation and perplexity.⁸⁴

From this perplexity the Methodist church via such agencies as the Department of Evangelism and Social Services developed a penchant for enquiry which led to greater social understanding including that of the role of physical recreation as a potential means of social regeneration.

The Presbyterian church followed suit in 1907 with the establishment of a Board of Social Service under the Board of Home Missions.⁸⁵ The social outlook of the Board was soon determined. The following resolution, passed at the meeting of the Board in September 1910, gave a clear indication of what its future interest might be.

Inasmuch as the object of Christianity is to redeem human life in its entirety and in view of conditions existing in society at the present day, the Board feels that active measures should be taken to emphasize the Mission of the Church to the general social and recreative life of the people.⁸⁶

The various subcommittees of the Board set out organizing the many new social programs of the church. The Committee on Political Purity sought support for the Lord's Day Alliance and cooperation with the YMCA; the Literature Committee sought wider distribution of valued books on social themes such as by Rauchenbusch and Addams; the Committee on Modern Moral Problems set out to promote supervised

playgrounds to other councils; and the Committee on Recreation and Amusement set out to prepare a positive church policy on the issues of recreation and amusement.⁸⁷ Boards such as these were to play a pivotal role in the identification of social issues, in the establishment of social policy of the church towards young people's societies, and ultimately in defining the goals for social regeneration itself.

Anglicans established a comparable organizational structure during the Fifth Session of the General Synod in 1908 with the creation of a standing committee on Moral and Social Reform, presumably to represent the Church of England on the Moral and Social Reform Council of Canada. Millman, an Anglican archivist and historian, concluded that the lateness of the movement into this area was because "Anglicans were slow to develop a relevant social ethic and a sensitive social consciousness,"⁸⁸ but further positive steps were taken in 1915 with the development of a permanent council to supersede the Committee, the Council for Social Service. Its duty was in part

to study social problems with a view to the solution of them in harmony with the spirit of the Lord Jesus Christ; to adopt such measures as may seem advisable to promote . . . the conservation of morals, health and life; and generally to promote the formation of a Christian public opinion upon social problems.⁸⁹

The Council through its Bulletin periodically addressed a number of topical subjects during the interval 1919-1925 including "Eugenics" (science dealing with race qualities), "The Institutional Church," "The Social Structure," "Boy Scouts and Other Organizations," and "The Church and Recreation," all of which provided valuable Anglican

opinion on current social themes.

Although Anglicans were slow to take up the banner of the social gospel and were slow to provide for youth, nevertheless during this period the question of the provision by the church of recreation programming became a major point of focus. The church threw its full support behind the Boy Scout movement, and many within the church frowned upon opening the church to other forms of recreation, though they felt at the same time that something more was needed. As far as the AYPA was concerned, the tenor set for youth gatherings ideally placed religion and constructive social intercourse at its centre. "Social evenings should be devised to exemplify the principle of 'fellowship,'" stated the 1922 report of the AYPA, "... a social evening should give opportunity for becoming better acquainted, for introducing strangers, for cultivation of the art of conversation, and for games and amusements."⁹⁰ The tenor of the times produced an increasing demand for the latter at the expense of more genteel forms of social relationships.

Decline of the Social Gospel.

A few years ago, at the close of the war, many were saying that in the future the Church would pay less attention to doctrine and more to practical living and to the activities of social reconstruction. There are many signs that these prophets were wrong. The very insistence of the practical problems have (sic) led men back to endeavor to get a deeper understanding of the Christian faith. For many the practical activities of the Church are taking a secondary place; men are turning away from plans and programmes and are seeking to understand the meaning of their own ideals and aspirations.⁹¹

The editors of the Canadian Journal of Religious Thought in the initial publication of their new periodical in 1924, recognized that a fundamental shift in mood was taking place in Canadian protestantism. The social passion which fed the search for social relevance in the previous decades was coming under attack. For one thing, the church had aligned itself precariously between labour and management, and a series of national and provincial strikes after 1919, precipitated a strong feeling of insecurity for social gossellers, which naturally caused a reassessment of their social objectives.⁹² For another, the tremendous pace at which social programs had been undertaken, especially during the years 1914 - 1920, put a great burden on the church, financially and spiritually. In the words of Grant, "the social gospel was not crushed by blows from without but collapsed under its own weight."⁹³

The collapse was serious indeed, and came in a relatively short span of time. In the space of five years, from 1920 to 1925, the once vital social passion entered a lifeless repose, one characterized by "weariness, reaction and reconsideration."⁹⁴ The decline of the social gospel led to an increasing social pacificism and reconsideration of the place of social objectives within the church and its young people's associations.⁹⁵

The most obvious target, with the shift away from social analysis by the church, was the Social Service Council of Canada. During the period of the social gospel, it had developed a nationwide organization which fostered a program of research and publicity aimed at social analysis and legislative reform. "The Social Service

Council believes that Righteousness can be realized in the complex conditions of modern life only through the application to all human affairs of the principles of the Kingdom of God." Its hopes were equally ambitious. The Council called also for the protection of childhood, for the protection of women in industrial life, for wholesome recreation for all, and for international peace.⁹⁶ But by 1925, and facing decreasing support from the denominations which saw in it an unnecessary duplication of social service effort, its future was much less certain than it had been a short decade earlier. But still more fundamentally, as Allen pointed out,

The social service mystique had worn thin in the church departments. After the heady talk of radical changes and complete social reconstructions [as apparent in the creed of the Social Service Council], it was impossible to return with the old enthusiasm to the now traditional social service programmes.⁹⁷

The Canadian Brotherhood Federation suffered a similar fate. In 1912 brotherhoods of all denominations were united into the Brotherhood Federation of Canada with high evangelical hopes for their ability to reconstruct society. Of the Brotherhood movement in 1914, the Methodist Department of Social Service and Evangelism concluded:

In recent years various efforts have been made to organize the men of the church for the development of their latent powers. . . . There is a greatly increased spiritual fervor . . . as well as a development of a robust physical, social, ethical and spiritual manliness in many of the polyglot peoples . . . whenever they have come under the influence of this movement. The result is a more enlightened citizenship, and therewith more intelligent efforts to correct the social wrongs and misdoings too prevalent everywhere.⁹⁸

By 1921 Brotherhood evangelism was even more convincingly articulated. Methodist annual conferences gave unqualified commendation to the Brotherhood movement to: a) enlist the men of the community in the service of Jesus Christ; b) bring the gospel message to the homes; c) enthrone Christ in the community life, including social, industrial, commercial and political activities, as well as in the conduct of its institutions and the development of its streets, parks and buildings; and d) to inaugurate a ministering to the poor, sick and sinful.⁹⁹ A year later, however, the Department recommended the formation of a federation of Brotherhoods, not in a national body, but "forming a Dominion-wide organization for the men of Methodism."¹⁰⁰ A further split was opening in the evangelical facade of Canadian protestantism.

If the collapse of the Social Service Council and the Canadian Brotherhood Federation represented the decline of social gospel evangelism, it was not so noticeably absent within young people's societies. In fact, Presbyterians flaunted the fact that membership in young people's societies was steadily increasing in the 1920s. Statistics presented during the Fifty-first General Assembly, 1925, proudly presented the historical commitment Presbyterian youth had made to young people's organizations, as shown by increased membership between 1900 and 1924.

YOUNG PEOPLE'S ORGANIZATIONS, 1900 AND 1924

Young People's organization	1900	1924
total	758	4,180
no. of jr. organizations	32	863
no. of older boys	4	1,045
no. of older girls	-	1,196
no. of young people's adult	722	1,076
Total no. in all organizations		<u>94,471</u> 101

On the surface, no significant changes were apparent other than good success in raising the number of youths interested in this form of organization. The vigor of young people's organizations within the church remained one testimonial to the accomplishments of the social gospel. Young people's societies remained a force in the social platform of the church partially because such organizations were helping to solve the "young boy problem." However, on closer examination, in the declining years of the social gospel, a good deal of reconsideration was underway, particularly about the social nature and social role of young people's activities; an important force which had led protestantism towards social action was in retreat.

CHAPTER 2

THE GYMNASIUM AND SHOWERBATH: THE GOSPEL MESSAGE AND PHYSICAL RECREATION

The Young Boy Problem

The process of searching for social relevance by the church had an important impact on its attitude and outlook towards youth. The liberal theology of the social gospel called for a greater recognition of mind and body as well as spirit. As a result, traditional views of the place of recreational and leisure activities in the social matrix were brought into question while the search for the answers to the problems of youth was at its zenith. These problems most often centered around understanding the essential characteristics of youth and the proper use of discretionary time.

It is an overstatement to suggest that concern and occasionally innovation were not a part of the church's traditional involvement with youth. For example, the redoubtable Anglicans planned the George Street Home for Boys in Toronto, which the Evangelical Churchman, a predecessor of the Canadian Churchman, wholeheartedly supported while noting the salient architectural features of this Home.

The bath-room is one of the most important and novel additions to the institution.

The gymnasium is another valuable addition to the Home, and will no doubt be thoroughly appreciated by the "garrison." . . . Gymnastic apparatus of almost every description, dumb bells, Indian Clubs, horizontal and parallel bars, "horses," sliding

seats for rowing practise, etc., all of diminutive proportions, suited to the size and strength of their juvenile users, are being fitted up.¹

Despite this exceptional gymnasium, however, the church was largely ignoring the physical needs of youth.

With the rise of social evangelism during the period 1895 - 1925, a mundane interest in the problems of boyhood became inadequate to meet the emerging new social outlook of the church. Magney noted the changing attitude of the church towards children, their education and discipline, in this period, and remarked that control had been the watchword in their training.² However, the gymnasium and showerbath alone, representing traditional church interest in physical recreation in the period before the social gospel, were not sufficient to meet the challenge of changing circumstances and a general concern for youth would be transformed into the "young boy problem."

The essential difference between this new perspective and traditional interest in adolescent development was much more significant than a matter of degree. In the new but still predominantly paternalistic social milieu of the twentieth century, church agencies, associations, and individuals alike, studied the boy with such diligence that he was transformed into the "young boy problem," a term which was popular during the period. Many liberals and conservatives too came to believe that this was the greatest problem with which the church had to deal, though their solutions might differ considerably.³ Indeed, resolution of the problem would be accomplished at the expense of the "young girl problem" if one was thought

to exist at all,⁴ and to the neglect of adult social programming.⁵ However, it would take a full vigorous effort on the part of those interested in athletics, for example, to overcome the gymnasium and showerbath mentality prevalent in traditional protestantism; such a mentality preferred low organized physical activities and games and a clean-cut appearance to more serious analytical attempts to study and provide for the physical and social needs of young people.

Gymnastics and muscular exercise, fresh air and frequent use of the bath would not answer all the needs of the modern boy. The simplicity of implementation of this view had encouraged its use, as seen in an Ottawa sermon to young men in 1917, entitled, "Drifting: A Sermon to Young Men":

Don't Drift into Habits of Impurity--In all of us are appetites and desires which are innocent enough when kept in their place. . . . Beware of spectacles and pictures, of books and amusements, that excite the lower passions. . . . Abstinence from strong drink, and the excessive use of animal food, plenty of gymnastics and muscular exercise, fresh air and frequent use of the bath, early rising and sufficient hard work, will answer most of the questions which perplex a young man. And better than all of these is the purity and power of Jesus.⁶

Protestants, anxious to learn about proper adolescent development, set out not only to upgrade and expand young people's societies, but also to seriously study youth and youthful activities, and to enlist interdenominational and international cooperation and shared understanding in order to accomplish their mission. The rise of the social gospel in Canadian protestantism with its obsessive concern for youth speeded significantly the realization of these objectives. It searched for the Kingdom of God on earth for the benefit of future generations, which youth represented. In response the evangelical

denominations in turn set out to grapple with the realities of Canadian boyhood.

The Church saw a number of practical concerns which helped give definition to the young boy problem. Two of the most obvious concerns were declining membership of young adolescents in the church and the declining ratio of males to females in young people's organizations. At the turn of the century with declining attendance and an uncertain future for young people's societies, there were some Methodists who would suggest that a strong case be made for action to resolve the young boy problem. Rev. T. E. Egerton Shore, superintendent of the prestigious Fred Victor Mission, Toronto, was one who used the occasion of an Epworth League Rally to underscore his views on the issues surrounding the dilemma of this matter.

At a Conference League Rally held in our city a little over a month ago, the church was packed with 1,800 young people. But they were nearly all young women. Among that crowd . . . there were not 100 young men altogether, and most of them were delicate looking specimens of the genus homo. Where were the young men of vigor and strength? Where were the young men of athletics and sport? . . . Wherever they were, they were not in the church, and they never will be until we go after them, and adapt our methods of work to their conditions and needs.⁷

Shore felt that there were limitations to what the church might reasonably expect to accomplish. "My own opinion is that the Church cannot hope, nor should she desire, to compete with the world along lines of recreation and social enjoyment, for the worldly young man's favour."⁸ While there were restrictions and limitations, he made it clear that the church had a useful role to play in this area for those already in the church. "But the Church ought to make provision for the social needs of young men within her walls if she is

going to save them from satisfying their nature's requirements in places of worldly influence and amid associations of sin."⁹ As this point of view gained momentum within the church, others reinforced it, calling not only for a more systematic approach to the study and provision of services,¹⁰ but also supporting the use of athletics as a means of achieving such goals.¹¹ With the rising optimism of the social gospel, a few concerned clergy and laymen would later come to hope that the church might even compete to a limited extent for the worldly young man's favour through the use of athletics.

Alfred Briggs, barrister son of the Methodist Book Steward, echoed Shore's earlier sentiments at a Toronto conference a few years later. He also sustained Shore's observation that the genesis of a steady interest was being generated within the church for such work, noting that "The Young Men's Movement is upon us."¹¹ Briggs began: "A little over four years ago . . . I had then to deplore the fact that, whilst in every church there could be found a Ladies Aid . . . there was not a church in the city that could boast a Man's Aid." Within a few years circumstances were beginning to change: "Now, through pioneer work in various churches, and the splendid encouragement of the Methodist Young Men's Association, there are no less than seventeen young men's clubs or associations in this city." And as to the methods which accomplished this transformation, Briggs was blunt indeed.

Let us understand this. Let us understand that the spiritual is an occasion, necessarily subservient to the athletic or social or literary. Let us make the necessary sharp distinction in our minds between direct spiritual work and the work of attracting and interesting, though with the former always in view.¹²

This invigorated approach to the boy problem would become more generally acceptable as a means of rescuing young people for the church, though many would find it impossible to make such a sharp distinction between the spiritual and social mission of the church. Nevertheless, still others would undergo a change of spirit in their personal search for practical Christianity and resolution of the young boy problem.

Methodism could no longer ignore the interest in youth. Not only lay Methodists such as Briggs but clerics too, held strong views about the necessity for the church to intervene. Rev. W. T. Brown, Hintonburg, Ontario, spoke loudly at an international Epworth convention in 1905, representing the liberal theology of Methodism towards the young boy problem.

In principle it [the church] is broad enough to include every activity for the redemption of man, and we ought to make it so in practice. I believe every young man ought to belong to the Church; but many whose lives are clean, whose hearts are sound, whose ideals are high, are not in the Church. There are many activities to-day pre-eminently Christian and yet outside the Church. I have all sympathy with the Y.M.C.A. and many other clubs and societies doing much to redeem humanity, but I am inclined to think the existence of these is possible because the Church has failed to do her duty.

I am not able to solve this problem of an enlarged Church life, but I believe in none of these societies is it possible to do the work so well as it could be done in the Christian Church, for nowhere else on earth are foundations laid so widely and so well as in that organization, which more truly than any other represents Christ's kingdom on earth. When we see our duty and do it, we will lay hold on the life of the young in all its branches of activity and give it a home in the Church; in a word, we will relate life to God.¹³

Under the influence of such a practical theology, the denominations

would be encouraged to experiment with a number of plans and programs directed at youth.

By 1910 there was a growing sense of urgency, due on one hand to marginal successes in establishing young people's societies as an improved function of the church, and on the other, to more intimate social analyses including social surveys which demanded greater awareness and concern for youth and youthful activities. This was the feeling of Rev. F. L. Farewell, Associate Secretary of the Toronto Methodist Young Men's Association. He kept abreast of current literature on the young boy, and through the process of analyzing adolescence, felt the greater sense of urgency. He argued that the period of greatest responsiveness to moral and religious ideals occurred in ages twelve through twenty. This being the time of conversion, it was important for the church to act, but it was also the time of "savage" and "semi-criminal" tendencies. Therefore, he concluded, "It is the period of will-training and character-formation, when all the forces at our command should be utilized . . . to control and direct them along the lines that make for the largest life. And so the problem of the boy is urgent."¹⁴ Farewell recommended further that the solution may lie in the education of leaders for work in this department, a notion increasingly proselytized by the YMCA.¹⁵ Methodists were coming to believe that what was most effective might include an ever lengthening list of social activities.

Presbyterians too were led to action by the dilemma of the young boy problem. Between Methodists and Presbyterians there may

have been agreement on the scope of the problem, but on the solution Presbyterians took a more conservative stand. Concerned with the continued drain of youth particularly from Bible class and Christian service organizations, the Presbyterian Record after summarizing testimonials from across Canada verifying the problem, elaborated upon its own remedy for the situation: Good teaching, good fellowship and good works.¹⁶ The wise teacher will

welcome light from any legitimate source, using side lights from secular and current history, from travel, from literature, from archaeology. . . . The Bible class of young men should have a room to itself and it should be made cheerful by curtains, flowers and pictures.¹⁷

Young people's societies were very much an important adjunct of the church itself, though the church was conservative in its social teachings. Good fellowship, the Record stressed, should bring to bear upon the student, a wide range of circumstances, including social gatherings, annual dinners, literary evenings, Sabbath afternoon walks, historical pilgrimages, visits to museums, factories, and other places of interest. "By athletics, too. Even baseball may be a valuable means to an end. There may be good religion in a class football team, even though it be poor football."¹⁸ Good works in the service of the church, it was suggested, might include visiting the sick, praying in public in class sessions or taking teacher Sabbath school training. While such advice might seem appropriate to committed Presbyterians, other denominations viewed it as overly conservative. Its emphasis was clearly in a traditional vein.

As the study of social problems in general became more specialized, discussion of the boy problem in particular became more widespread. Therefore, it is not surprising to find that the 1913 Pre-Assembly Congress of the Presbyterian Church, for example, dealt with the boy problem in a number of contexts. The adolescent figured prominently in the "Problem of the City," "The Rural Problem," and again specifically in relation to "Fundamentals," "The Social Application of the Gospel" and "Training for Service" where Rev. C. A. Myers, an Edmonton cleric, stressed that the young boy problem was the result of the inaction of the church to provide for changing requirements of youth. Moreover, concerning the absence of older boys from Sunday school, he argued: "Let us, however, at once frankly admit that it is not necessary, nor is it due primarily to their perversity or badness, but rather because of our own failure properly to provide for their needs."¹⁹ Evidently there was a growing appreciation of the differential needs of youth in Canadian protestantism as the boy problem came to be debated more widely in the churches.

Anglicans entered the fray late and with some reluctance. But within a short span of years, they too developed an awareness of the social dimensions of the boy problem, and organized a complex set of associations to realize any practical ambitions. At the outset Anglicans were content to view the problems of youth mainly within the framework of the church society, rather than the larger social community. Themes for the various Brotherhood conventions at the turn of the century would indicate, however, that Anglicans

felt many of the same pressures and were therefore headed in the same general direction as were the more evangelical denominations. Anglicans also were experiencing real declines in church attendance and youth participation in church activities. In 1899 the theme for the Brotherhood convention was entitled, "The Spread of Christ's Kingdom Among Young Men [in the Brotherhood]"²⁰ and the following year another popular theme was chosen, "The Basis of National Greatness," meaning of course Christian character. In their enthusiasm, liberal Anglicans pushed their arguments forward, emphasizing for example, the attainment of Christian manhood, to which the Canadian Churchman reacted in order to keep what it thought was a proper balance. "If I might venture on one word of unfavourable criticism," it remarked, "it would be to say that there was too much talk of manliness. The expression 'man to man,' and the words 'men,' 'manly,' 'manliness,' were reiterated with such wearisome frequency."²¹ But there were other words of unfavourable criticism within the Anglican church which were far more severe. The less charitable, though an extremely small number, felt compelled to charge that young people's societies in general were divisive and subversive of the church's authority.²² But the release of decennial census figures brought another reminder that the position of youthful church membership was precarious, and further discussion was provoked as to both the cause and possible cure of the problem. More informed Anglicans were tackling the problem face on, promoting not only religious welfare, but the social and intellectual life of its youth as well, particularly during "that trying period between

confirmation and marriage."²³

The Anglican Sunday School Commission through its official organ, the Bulletin, recognized that a change in emphasis was taking place not only in its Sunday schools but more generally in denominational religious education.

Never before have "the boy" and what is called "the Boy problem" been given so much attention by the leaders in the field of Religious Education and by those institutions which are working in that field. This, in itself, is significant for two reasons:

a) Because it shows that there has been, on the part of some, at least, an awakening to a realization that there is a real need.

b) Because, along with this realization of the problem, there has come an earnest effort to study it and to seek its solution.²⁴

Obviously, a critical step in the resolution of the problem came with the recognition within all denominations that the church had more than a religious mission with the adolescent if it were to counteract the recent gains made by the secular world for the young man's favour. Liberal Methodist clerics such as Rev. Shore articulated their concern that this was not happening frequently enough within the church. For the resolution of the young boy "something more is wanted," Shore concluded,

and that is a recognition on the part of the Church of the social, intellectual and physical nature of young men. . . . It has too long and too strongly emphasized the religion of the sanctuary to the exclusion of the religion of secular and social life.²⁵

Anglicans and Presbyterians too were brought to this realization as well. The social gospel with its social concept of man²⁶ would encourage further introspective analysis of the religion of secular and social life by the denominations.

Outside Influences

As the young boy problem became more widely discussed, there was increasing interest by the denominations in familiarizing themselves with the literature of social relevance generated through periodicals, books, pamphlets and the like, on both sides of the Atlantic. The social gospel was not a unique Canadian experiment, but was part of a larger and more "widespread attempt in Europe and North America to revive and develop Christian social insights and to apply them to the emerging forms of a collective society."²⁷

Anglicans in particular were keen to scrutinize British publications while Presbyterians and Methodists concentrated to a greater extent on American literature for insights into programs being developed there.

While the denominations were attempting to use both American and British literature as sources of reference, they were for the most part applying it to the Canadian circumstance. However, it should be emphasized as Grant pointed out, that the Canadian version of the social gospel had some distinctive features despite outside influences, including the continued "emphasis of earlier campaigns of moral reform, which it supplemented but did not replace."²⁸ The enormous volume of international literature encouraged deeper investigation of the young boy and it served often as a precursor, influencing not only program content within young people's societies but the very shape and structure of the society itself. Very few church or young people's societies were indigenous to Canada. Via the United

States came the Epworth League, Christian Endeavour movement, the Brotherhood of St. Andrew and from Britain the YMCA, Boy Scouts and the Boys Brigade. Though ideas were regularly borrowed from abroad, Canadians took advantage of this broader perspective by adapting it to suit the Canadian temperament. Exposure to such influences as literature, conferences, and speaking tours by American and British clerical and secular reformers, and in particular such quasi-religious associations as the YMCA and the Boy Scouts, had significant impact on both the understanding Canadians had of the young boy problem and the set of solutions adopted to resolve it.

This is not to say that all denominations did not foster a welter of child and adolescent literature of their own, some of which was published interdenominationally especially between Methodist and Presbyterian. But by and large these attempted to inculcate moral teaching through the use of story, parable, and example, and were not at all concerned with systematic analysis of the young boy. This analysis was left to the major adult denominational periodicals. Presbyterians published a paper for senior youth (aged 15-18) entitled, The Pathfinder, and Methodists produced Playmates for junior youth (aged 6-9), and several others were published for intermediate youth (aged 10-14) including Onward (Methodist) and East and West (Presbyterian), the latter being a fine example of the use of positive morality stories using the motif of sports and games.²⁹ Anglicans too had an equivalent literature, much of it published by its General Board of Religious Education, including the Young Soldier and Crusader aimed at the older boy (aged 15-23) and the

Teacher's Assistant, which included the Commission Bulletin, the official organ of the Sunday School Commission of the Church of England in Canada. Much of this youth-oriented literature was founded after the turn of the century, indicating the growing concern the church felt towards the young people of its communion. East and West, for example, was first published in 1902; the Pathfinder, designed for Bible class and young people's societies appeared in 1913³⁰ and the Sunday school publication of the Church of England, Our Empire, was transformed from a British publication by the GBRE into a Canadian periodical in 1916.³¹ The Canadian Epworth Era, which was founded in 1899 as the official organ of the Epworth League and other young people's societies of the Methodist church, was of particular importance to the church as an agent of the gospel and all Methodist youth were encouraged to read it. It changed its name in 1915 to Youth and Service, to suit the spirit of the times. In addition to these there were numerous lesser publications of the denominational Sunday school committees.³² Taken together they represent a significant avenue of the expression of the church towards youth during this period of social innovation.

These specialized publications for youth were additional to the adult publications of the church which generally carried sections for youthful readers. The most important of these, which were the official publications of the church, included the Methodist Christian Guardian, which had absorbed the earlier Methodist Magazine and Review in 1906, the Presbyterian Record, and the Canadian Churchman, both of which had also absorbed earlier publications. These were the adult

literature of the denominations which primarily addressed the young boy problem to its communion readership and it was here that the influences of international literature were most noticeably visible.

Topic Cards

All of this literature in one way or another was geared to assist the Sunday school within each denomination. The traditional church Sunday school was a primary point of contact with the community at large, and with youth in particular, since its establishment as an official arm of the church prior to Confederation.³³ Within the framework of the Sunday school and the young people's societies, which were formed in the post-Confederation period, the importance of youth oriented church publications as a mediator of the young boy problem was enhanced with the adoption of several American schemes to introduce uniform Sunday school curricula, graded lesson plans and uniform topic cards. These were of particular appeal to the Methodists and Presbyterians whose Canadian traditions were closely allied with the United States. In fact, Presbyterians continued to be supplied with International Sunday School Lessons from the United States until the 1920s.³⁴ The introduction of non-biblical material was considered by some to be a new heresy, but the temper of the times supported the greater use of these materials as a forum for social commentary, directed to the young.

The use of topic cards in particular for this purpose in Sunday schools and young people's societies became commonplace by World War I. Before the turn of the century, Methodist and

Presbyterian sessions were adopting this novel idea of regular monthly or weekly topic cards particularly for the study of foreign missions and church polity. The plan of study for 1898 endorsed by the Presbyterian General Assembly was indicative of the early topic schemes offered to young people's societies and Sabbath schools. ³⁵ The year's topics were programmed in advance and included, for example, in February, a discussion of early pioneers in the Home Mission field; the August topic dealt with the church and Baptism; and the December topic featured how young people may help the congregation. ³⁵ There was some concern that such topics should be directed at increasingly younger children, those too young to join adolescent organizations, but who yet might be trained to become involved in church work at a later age. The Committee on Young People's Societies elaborated:

The interest of the children, of say between the ages of ten and fifteen, should be drawn out towards the actual practical work of the Church. . . . The Endeavour and other Young People's Societies take up the practical side of the Christian life. But there is a period before the children are yet old enough for the societies, when, if some means could be employed to elicit their interest in, for example, the missionary work of the Church, they would be prepared for active effort in the societies by-and-by, and, in many cases would be prevented from drifting out of sympathy with the Church and its work, as too many, especially of the boys and younger men, now do. ³⁶

Therefore, topic cards could be used to educate young children and to avert the young boy problem in upcoming years. In practice, however, even within the staid Presbyterian church, the use of these topic cards at the turn of the century was not uniformly applied since it was left to the discretion of the individual presbytery to decide how it should teach morality, although they were officially

encouraged for all. Their use within the YPSCE for example in 1899 totalled 27,705 topic cards and booklets³⁷ but with fluctuating membership even that small number might not be uniformly sustained. As a result, by using the various denominational publications, a wider readership was attained for weekly or monthly topics of discussion which considerably expanded on this American-built plan as a potential method of education and conversion.

Within the next decade membership drives were successful in turning declining enrollments around and good increases were experienced prior to the War. Young people's societies were enjoying a new wave of optimism. To capitalize on this, the church increased its use of topic cards as a form of evangelism to the young and was assisted by the many new youth publications which gave generous space to a discussion of weekly topics. The report of the Board of Sabbath Schools and Young People's Societies for 1914, summed up the new optimism for the use of this method of conversion.

A common Topic Card, however, has been prepared for all these societies and it has been remarkably well received, especially by the Presbyterian Guilds and Christian Endeavour Societies. This unified Topic Card along with the common Standard of Excellence and suggested Order of Service has done very much in helping all the various organizations of young people to feel that they have many things in common and that the Church of which they are a vital part and for which they are to provide the leadership in the very near future is intensely interested in their welfare and their highest success. It has also been possible, on account of having only one Topic Card, to provide much more satisfactory Helps for the regular meetings of the Young People's Societies than ever before. "The Pathfinder," of the Presbyterian Publications, is now giving a full page to the discussion of each topic, with helpful suggestions as to ways in which the programme may be carried out. Carefully prepared articles on each topic are being provided for the "Record" and these also are printed sufficiently in advance to be used in the preparation of the programme for the weekly meetings.

In addition to these the "Presbyterian," Toronto, and the "Presbyterian Witness," Halifax, provide each week very helpful articles on these topics.³⁸

Methodists were urged to do likewise in the adoption and use of topic cards prepared by the Church, especially as they ran parallel with the textbooks provided for Bible study, the study of Church doctrines and polity, and the study of missions.³⁹ At the turn of the century the General Conference was quite concerned that the church give increased attention to securing and retaining the interest of young men and boys in the work of the church.

The use of such topic cards in a regular and systematic way posed a number of advantages for the denominations which chose to use them. First, and most vitally, they were a source of evangelism which could be used as the church saw fit for the promotion of its interests within young people's societies. Second, the discussion of a single topic at specified intervals throughout the year might encourage a broader dialogue between various groups or societies, which came into contact during that period, on topics which were seasonal in nature or which served wider interests such as national concerns. Finally, as indicated by the Presbyterian General Assembly in 1914, due to their uniformity the provision of carefully worded statements giving the church's viewpoint was possible on topics which were timely and which also permitted the optional distribution of a single article in a number of its journals concurrently. However, despite the benefits of publishing from a single press which the denominations took as a preliminary step towards union, Methodist and Presbyterian topic cards were not produced corroboratively, and

each proceeded along lines which it felt best.

With the adoption of the use of topic cards in Canada first by the Presbyterians in 1896⁴⁰ and shortly thereafter by the Methodist church, a significant forum for voicing denominational social concern had been created. The gradual shift towards social themes in the church especially after the creation of such social agencies as the Departments of Moral and Social Reform and the Canadian Council of Social Service, began to show up in the topics selected for weekly discussion within Sunday schools and young people's societies. There was a shift as well towards the study of Home missions with its Canadian perspective to complement the heavy emphasis the church had traditionally placed on foreign missions. The result was an increased awareness of social issues within selected topics relating to, for example, physical recreation, recognizing the heightened interest in matters of mind and body.

Early topic subjects often dealt with physical recreation indirectly and from a personal or biblical viewpoint, to the neglect of a broader social or societal perspective. The 1898 prayer meeting topics and daily reading lists of the YPSCE for May and June of that year are typical examples. The discussion of "Our Bodies" during the week of May 9-15 and "The Use of Time" for the week of June 20-26, steered the young Presbyterian towards the highest use of his summer leisure time, without particular reference to any broader social problem.⁴¹ But after the turn of the century this was to change.

The early years of the new century saw the first few topic subjects dealing with social questions, perhaps influenced by a decision in the United States to introduce non-biblical topics in graded Sunday school courses, which were supplied to Presbyterian Sunday schools in Canada. By 1902 traditional subjects were still being treated including missions, history and polity of the church, but more often the occasional topic on the Sabbath in Canada and the Lord's Day Alliance or on Home Mission work among foreigners.⁴² Gradually, however, social problems became more directly addressed even in relation to biblical topics such as the "Consecration of the Body," the Epworth topic for the week of August 4, 1907.⁴³

By 1912 Methodists and Presbyterians were regularly studying a proper discussion of the place of recreation in relation to religion, acknowledging the fact that recreation and amusement were at last legitimate concerns which might be discussed in an objective and systematic way. The Presbyterian Guild topic for June 1912 was "Recreation," dealing for the most part with athletics, amateur and professional.⁴⁴ The topic for the Epworth Leagues for May 25, 1913, written by Rev. S. T. Tucker, was the "Church and Recreation" and for the benefit of all young leaguers the high purpose of recreation was carefully defined, and its dangers pointed out, from the Christian viewpoint. In this new age of the social gospel, the church strove to find a comfortable position regarding physical recreation. The decree of social gospel philosophy demanded it, as Tucker reiterated: "Whatever makes human life more normal and noble--physically, intellectually and morally, as well as spiritually--in short, whatever

contributes to the progress of a true civilization, promotes the kingdom of God and hastens its coming in the world."⁴⁵ Tucker believed that the church should study more closely the social teaching of Jesus in order to place recreation in its proper relation in human life. For a few social gossellers, at least, the gospel message included a legitimate message concerning physical recreation.

The July Citizenship Topic of the Presbyterian Guild that year encouraged considerable discussion on the theme "Public Amusements." As Rev. John W. Stephen, author of the article, explained, the need for amusement was reinforced by the character of the age. Noting that at present the formative period of Canadian nationhood was one filled with stress and strain, he argued that relaxation and diversion were both fitting and necessary. Turning to particular forms of amusement, he offered a brief overview of the problems associated with athletics, the race-course, the theatre, dancing and card playing, all included in the popular understanding of the word amusement.⁴⁶ The Presbyterian Young People's Society topic for January 1916 examined "Amusement that is Worth While" and its author, Rev. S. Black of Montreal, gave his point of view for the benefit of young Presbyterians. While providing liberal scriptural references, Black exhorted principles which he felt should govern the world of amusements: they should be servants, not masters; they should not injure others; and there must be a balance of body, mind and spirit.⁴⁷ Such topic card programs encouraged denominational discussion at all levels from the older Epworth League to the Junior Young People's Society about the place of physical

recreation in modern society, where the gymnasium was a legitimate part of the church structure.⁴⁸ A common characteristic of all such discussions was the liberal use of quotations showing the presence of American journalism on Canadian understanding of the issues. Interestingly the vast quantity of American adolescent literature was helping to shape Canadian understanding of the young boy problem.

The Anglican church did not adopt this form of evangelism with the same commitment as had the Methodist and Presbyterian churches. Anglican concerns about the best use of discretionary time were given voice through its network of young people's societies, and ably assisted by its periodical literature, but not in any systematic way. The church was less convinced though not totally unaware of it as a social concern. The program of the Toronto Diocesan Conference for 1896, for example, would indicate even at this early date some sensitivity for the issues. Included on the agenda for discussion were such topics as:

- I. Amusements and Recreation in the Christian Life
 - a) Their place generally
 - b) Recreation and Sunday
- III. Social Problems
 - a) The Church's message of the Capitalist
 - b) The Church and Civic and Secular agencies
- V. The Work of the Church
 - a) Church Clubs and Layman's Leagues
 - b) Clergy Houses in Country districts
- VI. The Parish
 - a) Church Social Gatherings: Their Use and Abuse.⁴⁹

The format, however, belies any strong interest in a social gospel at this early date. At this point in time even the more evangelical Methodists most often approached social issues from a personal or

biblical viewpoint. In this instance treatment of conference topics totally reflected this perspective. The speeches showed unfamiliarity with sociological methods such as social surveys and often idealized the purity of youth.⁵⁰ For example, the address on "Church Social Gatherings" delivered by a Mr. Dennistoun, of Peterborough, Ontario, would have no catering to amusement, but stressed the importance of giving youngsters work to do.⁵¹ One constructive result of the Conference, however, was the subsequent establishment of a "Church Club" in Toronto but one with aims compatible with current Anglican thinking. A club whose aims were: a) to prepare for the work of the Synod, b) to encourage esprit d'corps, and c) to stress home and foreign missions, left meager room for thought and discussion about physical recreation.⁵²

Foreign Books and Publications

Quite conveniently, all denominations found topical treatment in foreign literature of social problems of interest to them, and often the topics were treated in more depth than could be found from Canadian sources alone. Presbyterians relied most heavily and at times exclusively on American literature. For example, in Presbyterian denominational periodicals, articles on health and recreation referred to American literature almost exclusively for technical information when such issues were raised in its pages.⁵³ Anglicans drew most heavily on British sources for social guidance. Methodists drew from both traditions, but at the same time relied more heavily on Canadian literature when it was available, than did

the other denominations. In the form of annual questionnaires, the denominations gathered information about the state of the church in Canada. Methodists were particularly inclined to use information gathered in this way as a tool for evangelism and to print the best of it in Methodist periodical publications. Due to an evangelical tradition, coupled with strong feelings of nationalism, Methodists relied more heavily on their own resources, but they too turned abroad for a better explanation and analysis of the young boy problem. Methodists too, culled from American sources and to a lesser extent from British publications. In the United States, Americans were deeply involved in the issues of the young boy problem and any helpful guidance for solving Canadian problems was warmly welcomed. All Canadians understood something of what was happening to the social fabric of American cities dictated by the trend towards urbanism and industrialization. Some felt that, in time, essentially rural Canada would be experiencing the same need as American cities for more provision for physical recreation, and therefore Canadians could benefit from the American experience.

Methodists took the lead in developing reading lists to assist the church in the study of young people "during all the delicate period of adolescence." For the purpose of this study, the Manitoba and Northwest Conference in 1904, suggested American books by Forbush and Coe dealing with the boy problem.⁵⁴ This recommendation of the regional conference was endorsed by the General Conference that year, acknowledging the spreading concern for the problems of youth throughout Methodism. The Conference elaborated on the varied

recommendations concerning the young man and boy problem:

After a wide review of the varied organizations within the Conferences, and also the best known beyond them in Canada and the United States, the strong convictions of each Conference are that:

1. The personality of the leader is all important.
2. Forms and methods should be adapted to circumstances, and boys and young men should not be organized together.
3. With boys the "gang period" can be successfully utilized for their conversion and careful training through adolescence.
4. The natural and proper desire of young men for association and recreation can be met, and their erroneous ideas of the church and religion can be corrected by providing for their physical, intellectual, social and spiritual natures.
5. Clean athletics, indoor games, literary and social evenings and debates, with timely and efficient Bible teaching, all may be made to work together for the highest Christian ends.
6. The right element and the spiritual purpose must dominate, with a liberal mental attitude towards methods in which spontaneity and not uniformity will be the wiser aim.
7. Wherever the need is not already in some way met, the earnest attention of our pastors and churches is directed to the necessity of providing by some method for the real needs of the boys and young men of our congregations, and the large numbers of others who should be. If we seek to help them God will surely show us how, and the Holy Spirit will honor our judicious human agency.⁵⁵

These principal elements as outlined in American literature--the importance of leadership, utilization of the "gang impulse" as it was called, boy-oriented activities, and a prescribed wider use of physical recreation--became the principal tenets on which the social gospel in Canada would in large measure come to believe were necessary for the resolution of the boy problem. Methodist Epworth and young people's societies were reporting increasing numbers in their ranks, and by 1905 claimed 1,776 societies with a total membership of 70,338.⁵⁶ Correspondingly, the potential usefulness of physical recreation to help effect the reconstruction of society increased. Presbyterians developed a manual which outlined for young people

daily readings, a plan of study, consecutive bible study, literary study and included the Model Constitution of the Presbyterian Guild.⁵⁷ In particular the literary department was a comparatively new feature of Presbyterian societies in 1904 and represented the beginnings of an expanded interest in the young boy problem. That year three American books were recommended to young Presbyterian readers: Simpson's The Fact of Christ, Speer's A Young Man's Questions, and Welsh's In Relief of Doubt.⁵⁸

The question was asked of the 1908 Assembly, "Does the congregation manifest any interest in, or take any oversight of the recreative life of the community? If so, how, and with what result?" Many answers were forthcoming to the effect that this was no part of the work of the church. One session lamented that "cards, athletics and the ballroom are the curse of many of the young people" but sagaciously wondered if there ought not to be a logical connection between recreation and the church. The Committee on Church Work and Life responded, citing a report from Bird Tail Reserve, which noted that a "Christian Association had been formed, which controls sports, with the result that games are clean, and cards and dancing have practically disappeared."⁵⁹ Such insights were occurring at a time when the newly created Moral and Social Reform Council of Canada, through its Committee on Literature, was preparing common reading courses in religious education and social science, examining recreation and social reconstruction, and supporting church involvement in physical recreation. More importantly, the literature often suggested social surveys and experimental programs to complement the

rationale.

The Presbyterian General Assembly itself was not idle on this question. In June 1912 a Commission of Religious Education was struck by the General Assembly to make a "scientific survey of the whole field of Religious Education in the Presbyterian Church in Canada, having special-reference to the Sunday Schools and Young People's Societies."⁶¹ The results of its deliberations produced a short list of literary works bearing upon three main phases of the young boy problem: Knowledge of the child in his physical, mental and spiritual education; knowledge of the best study material; and knowledge of the best means of making use of this material.⁶²

Again American publications were conspicuous. Included for recommendation were such volumes as St. John's Child Nature and Child Nurture, Coe's Education in Religion and Morals, Harrison's A Study of Child Nature, and Educational Evangelism by McKinley, and the occasional British publication such as Maccunn's The Making of Character.⁶³

The use of such literature as an evangelical force was encouraged by the church and as a result additional updated lists were subsequently prepared for those who desired to read more widely on the subject of religious education.⁶⁴ The church began to explore the vicissitudes of work with young people under such divergent headings as--Religious Life of the Child, Psychological Studies, Education and Religion, Teaching, Story Telling, Work with Boys and Young Men, Sunday School Architecture, Methods in Sunday School Work, and Methods in Young People's Work. In fact the Commission

sought information from those interested in the young boy problem with such noticeable diligence that one respondent claimed, "The value of the survey in educating the church is quite as great as its value in gathering information."⁶⁵ Although it was understood that many would not find it a useful service,⁶⁶ others would find it of benefit, clerics and laymen alike, since recommended readings included the best books written anywhere on the young boy problem.

Those references cited as most important for the resolution of the boy problem included publications by all the prominent American authors of the day writing in the areas of religious education, sociology, psychology and physical education. For work with men and young boys, Forbush, Foster, Fiske, Hall and Speer were quoted most often. Regarding methods in young people's work such authors as Baker, Butterfield, Chesley, Crews, McDougall and Wells were listed as important sources of reference.⁶⁷ The committee worked in subsequent years to keep the list of helpful references updated and there was no doubt that these were used by clerics interested in resolution of the young boy problem. Names such as Coe, Forbush, Speer--were those which were most often cited in Canadian protestant literature concerned with the problem of the young boy and physical recreation.⁶⁸

The potential religious value of a rigorous social interest in youth, highlighted by Methodist and Presbyterian leadership in this area, gave encouragement to the Church of England. The church was looking more in the same direction and it was watching the evangelical denominations which were first to tackle the problem in

a concerted way. "The Church in Canada has been very slow to move in this direction," stated the Committee on Anglican Young People's Association in 1911, "but the experience and testimony of other communions have taught us its inestimable value," and furthermore it was strongly urged upon the General Synod to take action in this branch of church work.⁶⁹

Anglicans looked to Britain for further guidance. This closer contact with Britain led inevitably to a steady diet of British "muscular Christianity" in Canadian Anglicanism, and its most popular myths were unquestioned. In this tradition, the character-forming potential of sport had been responsible, according to the Canadian Churchman, for English "stoicism and respect for the rules of the great game of life."⁷⁰ But intense interest in British sport encouraged parochialism which tended to undermine the perceived value of Canadian sport, and this may account in part for the church's slowness to provide for youth in this area. For example, in its denominational literature the Anglican church in Canada repeatedly decried Sunday golf as "utterly unchristian and unworthy of intelligent men living in a Christian country."⁷¹ But it is of the British game, played in Britain, that reference was usually made, ignoring completely the existence of the sport in Canada, whereas Presbyterians, by contrasting example, became almost obsessive about the Sunday playing of the game in Canada.⁷²

But British sport was having considerable difficulty itself, as the usefulness of it as a social force helpful to the English church was coming into question. However, the relationship is

significant because the Anglican church drew on the British social gospel with which it was most familiar, and not on American views regarding physical recreation. Despite having high ideals for the value of British sport, Anglicans took a more practical perspective about the place and purpose of sport on this side of the Atlantic. As the Presbyterian and Methodist churches drew heavily on the American social gospel for reinforcement, likewise Anglicans often found themselves reprinting British reform literature and occasionally repeating it as well.

The Lambeth conferences provide examples of how the social expression of the English church served as a regular source of inspiration to Canadian Anglicans. These Conferences of the Bishops of the Anglican communion regularly considered the range of problems affecting modern society--economic, industrial and social, and as a source they were widely quoted in Canada. For example, the Pan-Anglican and Lambeth Conference of 1908 devoted a portion of its interest to "The Church's Care for the Recreation and Social Well-Being of the Young." The Conference findings were of immense interest to the Canadian church, and the concern in England voiced at the Conference condemning sports leagues in England influenced thinking on the similar subject in Canada.⁷³ Other such conferences of the nineteenth century even became the basis of Anglican opinion on "The Social Application of Christian Principles" regarding industrial problems and Christianity in the 1920s.⁷⁴ Predictably, Anglicans reacted to most social issues raised in the British press from opinion about the possible physical deterioration of the Anglo-Saxon

race,⁷⁵ to the introduction of a Sunday Closing Bill in parliament,⁷⁶ and the provision of organized Sunday athletics.⁷⁷

All denominations whether Anglican, Methodist or Presbyterian, regularly took advantage of the immense volume of books, periodicals and conference reports concerning Christian social problems being generated abroad. Although Anglicans looked to Britain for social guidance, because of the pervasiveness of American opinion and experience in North America, they too were being influenced by the preponderance of American data on social programming and the church.

Social Surveys

The great volume of American literature provided the most serious attempts anywhere to study and analyze the young boy. In particular it counselled the use of the social survey in order to determine the needs of the adolescent, opportunities presently available to youth, and to point the direction for future action. In crowded eastern states, this method of inquiry met with applause as the most up-to-date way of dealing with the vicissitudes of the young boy problem in general and with physical recreation in particular. To make their case, exponents of change needed hard data if they were to convince conservative elements within the church that the new role for protestantism should be one which developed a "constructive and positive Church policy on the question of Recreation and Amusement."⁷⁸

Within the denominations, committee discussion of the issue of recreation was often filled with "considerable debate" and to

provide intelligent answers to some of the questions raised, they decided it best to follow the American example. The Methodist and Presbyterian boards of social reform collaborated on a massive, nation-wide survey spanning a period of four years, 1912 - 1916, to gather objective data on social, religious and economic conditions. The Methodist Department of Temperance and Moral Reform put forth the rationale for social surveys which it had itself only recently learned.

The survey is a measurement according to objective standards of social phenomena, in normal or pathological social life. We note certain objective conditions, and by investigation and deduction may point out probable consequent effects. The social survey makes it clear that sociological problems are not "set up" or imagined by a theorist in his study, but exist in reality. Nor does the scientific investigator become despondent upon the revelation of social disorders, but determines the cause, and is in position to devise and apply adequate remedial measures.⁷⁹

In its search for social relevance, the church undertook this type of scientific objectivity--objectivity which had not been a part of the tradition of individualism of the church. One interesting result of the surveys was that a great deal more was learned of what the church really thought about physical recreation and sport.

The survey of selected urban and rural centres in Canada helped the church find a better perspective from which to judge the success or failure of their physical recreation programs. One thing was immediately evident from the survey results: throughout the country there was a strong interest in most communities in athletic sports, and by and large these were enjoyed in every community, with the Maritimes being most deprived.⁸⁰ Urban centres and rural districts shared in this general interest, although sports preferences

varied by region. There was some indication that this enthusiasm was not entirely shared by all clerics, but occasionally the church was enthusiastic. London, Ontario, for example, boasted an inter-denominational Athletic Association supported by a Men's Federation of the local churches. The social aim of the association was to remedy the two most prevalent evils associated with sport in the London area, namely, that sport was left too much to private enterprise, and that too much stress was laid on winning rather than on the old English ideal of playing the game.⁸¹ The ideals of the association were in harmony with similar organizations across the country, if not in specific details. Its ideals engendered a common code of conduct in Church athletics. Its object was "to unite the young men of the churches of London interested in athletics; to foster amongst them the ideals of amateur sport; to provide for them outdoor recreation according to the season, and to hold once a year a Field Day of Track and field events;" membership in a Sunday School or church was essential, of course.⁸² One pernicious activity in particular was singled out for comment in the survey. At the local roller rink, roller skating was encouraging "promiscuous introductions" because of a lack of careful management and oversight of the young skaters.⁸³

The primary value of these surveys to the church was that they served to inform. The survey findings reinforced the fact that in Ontario particularly, but in other parts of the country as well, many communities had a highly developed sports delivery system which was really beyond the ability of the church to substantially alter.

Although some social gossellers believed they could intervene to redirect the destiny of sport, such was not the case. They pointed to isolated examples where the church had successfully intervened. For instance, the St. Catharines' District survey showed that Sunday schools had associated athletic activities, though rural areas generally lacked strong participation in young people's societies, but this was not true of urban centres. In the city of St. Catharines itself, the survey reported the recent introduction of a Boys' Church League, for baseball. Eight churches in all were involved, and the sport according to observers, was played with the utmost sportsmanship over the nearly sixty game season. From this example, the survey committee concluded that "under such conditions the associations and influences of such a league are of untold value in the moulding of a boy's character at this formative period in his life."⁸⁴ However, from the tenor of responses to questions included in the survey process concerning recreation and sports, there was a considerable amount of preaching against sport and amusement, which was not accompanied by any offsetting positive action.⁸⁵ The same could be noted for other centres as well.⁸⁶ To these clerics, sport in the secular world offered little hope for its redemption, if it continued to stress winning and related pecuniary interests. Social surveys revealed the bad as well as the good.

The prevalence of pool rooms was a source of complaint in every survey, for the evils associated with them.⁸⁷ In fact, the very gathering of social statistics on such lurid operations was perceived by the investigating committees as dangerous, as reported

in the Hamilton survey:

The investigators were present just long enough to make the required observations. . . . Magistrate Jelfs has stated that the worst element among the young men of the city congregates in the pool-rooms, and that in some of them robberies are planned.⁸⁸

Several novel though idealistic proposals to put the pastime under a moral aegis were suggested, including a takeover by the local curling club or the young men's club, so that billiards might be played as in the YMCA, under Christian guidance and supervision.

After the success of the national survey prior to World War I, there was some interest in continuing this form of information gathering after the War. The Presbyterian and Westminster outlined its continuing function.

A Canadian Survey Movement will attempt with other protestant churches to survey urban and rural areas across Canada. The time is ripe for the securing of information upon which the Church can base its programme and realize its responsibilities.⁹⁰

While no details of this upcoming survey were given, the church's enthusiasm for this type of data gathering had become an integral part of its attempt to find social relevance. Anglicans, as a separate denomination, did not participate cooperatively or independently in such protracted investigations on which it could base its programs and responsibilities. The church instead undertook a limited survey of its own membership in 1919 - 1920. The move was made under the direction of a newly created Council on Young People's Work subordinate to the GBRE, and an organizational meeting was held in Hamilton on October 29, 1919, to establish the policy of

the new Council. It determined that the priorities should be:

- 1) to study the needs of the Young People of the Church, by making a survey of existing conditions; 2) to prepare, as far as possible, a program of education and training for midweek gatherings of young people, in accordance with these needs; and 3) in the preparation of this program, to relate it to similar programs of education and training provided for other departments.⁹¹

The survey, however, was not much more sophisticated than the annual questionnaires sent out by the Methodist and Presbyterian churches in their annual assessment of the state of the Church. But these were important first steps in raising the issues of mind and body--important first steps which gave the Anglican church a better assessment of the physical recreation needs and desires of its communicants. The results of a second similar survey, carried out in the spring of 1923 under the auspices of the Council for Social Services of the Anglican Church, were widely circulated in its Bulletin, in a number entitled "The Church and Recreation."⁹²

The Anglican Church had at last become more serious in its efforts to win the worldly young boy's favour.

The YMCA

Traditionally, all denominations maintained more than a passing interest in the Christian work being done by the YMCA. The church had witnessed the phenomenal growth of this organization in urban areas and acknowledged too the laurels it had garnered for recreational and canteen work during the war years, both in Canada

and in Europe. The social surveys pointed out also just how important the YMCA had become in the delivery of community recreational services. While much credit and approbation by community and church for the social and physical work of the organization was apparent throughout the surveyed areas, not all denominations shared equally in this enthusiasm.

Methodists and Presbyterians were the first to extend a cordial hand to the YMCA and encourage their members to enjoy the benefits of the physical programs offered under the supervision of the YMCA. That these denominations had early high esteem for this world-wide organization is shown by the comparison of the Brotherhood of Andrew and Philip, a small Presbyterian society, with the virtues of the YMCA. The rhetorical question was asked: How does the Brotherhood differ from the YMCA? The reply attempted to emphasize non-spiritual issues to some extent, showing concern perhaps that in fact this small Brotherhood which grew out of Young Men's Sunday Morning Bible Class in Toronto in 1901, was seen by Presbyterians as a rather dull affair.

Like the Y.M.C.A., the Brotherhood aims at saving the whole man--body, soul and spirit; and like the Y.M.C.A., its organization is so simple and flexible that it can be adapted to any local need; but, unlike the Y.M.C.A., the Brotherhood is under the direct control of the church, and is a practical answer to the "man in the street" that the church does not care for him. The church does care; but she must prove it. This organization gives her a chance to do so.⁹³

However, this Brotherhood in practice exhibited little or no interest in physical recreation, being inclined instead to emphasize service to the church, daily prayer, and a good measure of fraternal

brotherhood.

The YMCA was itself deeply involved in the message of the social gospel, and it was natural that the more evangelical denominations should ally with it for common purposes.⁹⁴ Presbyterians first set out to obtain political cooperation with the YMCA on matters of common political concern, as encouraged by its Board of Moral and Social Reform.⁹⁵ As the need for greater attention to the physical welfare of boys in church programs became more evident to the church, such an extensive international organization could be of obvious benefit. Besides, the YMCA was enjoying popular growth during this period which denominational young people's societies were not, and this led instinctively to a closer scrutiny of the methods adopted by such a successful Christian organization. It did not take the Board of Moral and Social Reform long to ask the question, "Shall we specialize on work for men and boys?"⁹⁶ No other organization knew more on the subject than the YMCA. And in the long term, perhaps no other outside influence would be so strongly felt by the church as that of the YMCA regarding physical recreation.

There were those who insisted that the church itself should take on the responsibility of providing for youth in a fashion similar to the YMCA. "The place for the Y.M.C.A. is in the Church," wrote a contributor to the Era in 1908. "I believe it is high time for the churches to awake to the fact that young people are demanding that the church be more than an auditorium for sermons to tickle the ears of men and women who are content to sit down and listen."

Being careful to point out that "social, educational and amusement inducements must never be permitted to challenge the supremacy of the spiritual," the contributor offered a counter solution to the young boy problem.

The Athletic Club should be subject to the Executive of the League [Epworth]. I am not a sport, and do not play baseball, but I have always permitted myself to be enthused. I do not think, however, that the League meetings are the proper times to deal with these matters. The best young man I have secured was through his games. Good fishermen try different baits.⁹⁷

The difficulty for both church laymen and clerics alike to adjust to the new social role being entertained as a proper direction for the church is obvious in the contributor's lack of comfort in dealing with the topic. The YMCA felt no such encumbrance.

In reality, however, the church was beginning to cooperate more frequently and deliberately with the YMCA in the provision of physical recreation and social services. The 1912 General Assembly of the Presbyterian church cited one example of closer cooperation in the town of Amherst, Nova Scotia. The Assembly noted that a trained YMCA boy's secretary and a women's social service expert were supported by the town in cooperation with local churches and schools, seeking adolescent "physical and mental development. Attention is given to truancy, to delinquency and indeed to everything concerning the welfare of boys and girls during the years when it is most difficult to hold them in connection with Church life."⁹⁶

The YMCA was also active in student organizations on college campuses and both Methodists and Presbyterians saw immeasurable advantages for the student population, as they believed their

devotional and practical exercises did much to foster the spirit of true religion.⁹⁹ Off the campus, these denominations encouraged the organization in its efforts, especially the YMCA Week of Prayer held each fall, which the church duly recognized as "stimulating Christian experience, prayer and personal service."¹⁰⁰ During the war, the YMCA launched its greatest campaign to date, entitled the RED TRIANGLE CAMPAIGN and all denominations were asked officially to fall behind its efforts. A natural juncture was thereby provided for the church to review its functional relationship to the YMCA, in all areas of common concern.

The YMCA proposed to expand its efforts beyond urban areas into rural communities where the church had traditionally held prominence. Methodists and Presbyterians found this new planning approach fundamentally sound. The Presbyterian and Westminster in dealing with the issue of "The Y.M.C.A. and the Church," summed up the salient features of their relationship. First noted was the fact that this organization was sometimes criticized because it reached only a certain class.¹⁰¹ Students and men following commercial occupations were its target population generally to the neglect of manual workers. This was revealed in the social surveys. Concerning the Fort William survey for example, both the YMCA and the CYMA, the Catholic Young Men's Association, were cited as serving only a limited portion of the whole community. The report agreed that the general tendency of these two organizations was towards the upbuilding of young Canadian manhood, but regretted that "similar opportunities are not available for the young new-comers who stand in such great need of them."¹⁰²

Further west in Regina, the observation was again made. The Regina report noted that the YMCA and YWCA offered many "social opportunities to the 'better class' young men and women. The so-called 'working' class young men and women have fewer advantages."¹⁰³ One remedy was suggested, that an AAA (Amateur Athletic Association, perhaps within the church) be formed for men who would not go to the YMCA.¹⁰⁴ In London, Ontario, the YMCA had popularized "gymnasium work" and offered to provide leaders to coach boys in their own churches, a few of which, it was noted, had gymnasiums. Again the proliferation of pool rooms was necessarily mentioned, accompanied by the now commonplace view that the YMCA "shows strikingly how different these amusements may be when under different influence,"¹⁰⁵ and it was observed that "most crime is committed during leisure hours,"¹⁰⁶ highlighting once again the importance of effective church involvement in this area. The elite nature of the YMCA in another Ontario town, St. Catharines, was evident in the lament of the investigation committee concerning the inadequate facilities of the YMCA there, and it also underlined that in fact the church had recognized the hegemony of this organization regarding the Christian provision for the physical side of life. The sobering reality of the findings of empirical study was dispelling the idealism of the social gospel, in contrast to Rev. Shore's searching question a decade earlier, "Ought not every Church have its own YMCA or equivalent?"

It is surprising that a city with a population of over 17,000 should be attempting to serve its young men with a Y.M.C.A. building, which is without a swimming pool, running

track, boxing or wrestling rooms or lecture hall, and with very limited room in every other particular. This proves a serious handicap to the work which the organization would like to do.¹⁰⁷

Perhaps the church was undergoing a change of mind? Certainly the committee believed the YMCA should be the legitimate provider of physical recreation, and they could continue to do it more conveniently than could the church. The committee elaborated:

In this way the Y.M.C.A. would become the recreational centre for all the boys' clubs connected with the churches, as has been so successful in many cities. There is no need of church gymnasiums. One well-equipped gymnasium can take care of all the work.¹⁰⁸

The value of the social survey especially to the Methodist and Presbyterian denominations was that it kept the church abreast of what was happening within the community at large, enabling it to take better advantage of facilities and programs, which were admittedly outside the church but to which the church could give its commendation.

When the YMCA asked for cooperation from the churches for its planned expansion into rural areas, the Presbyterian and Westminster raised the question of protestant support for the scheme. "Will the churches enter ungrudgingly and whole-heartedly into the co-operation proposed?" asked the periodical of its readership. Believing that they should, the journal cited advantages supporting this viewpoint:

1. To regard not merely the religious interests of people, in the narrower sense, but to keep in view the development of the whole personality--physical, mental, spiritual--is recognized as being thoroughly in harmony with the mind and example of Jesus Christ. . . .

2. The men who are carrying on this work under the auspices of the Y.M.C.A. are, with scarcely an exception, not only Christian men, but faithful churchmen. They can be trusted to be loyal to the things for which the Church stands. . . .
3. The Church, owing mainly to her denominational divisions, is not, in the meantime at least, in as good a position as an outside organization, to carry on a work which to be successful must enlist the co-operation of the whole community. . . . And so the alternative, as regards these special activities, is not, in most cases, the Y.M.C.A. or the Church; it is the Y.M.C.A. or nothing.

. . . Let us choose to make it a great instrument for developing in the Canadian nation a strong and clean and Christian manhood.¹⁰⁹

The Presbyterian Church, at least the part in concurrence with the editor of the Presbyterian and Westminster, would believe that the gospel message and physical recreation were not incompatible. In fact, such successful examples of cooperation would lead to much greater cooperation in programming for the physical as well as the spiritual needs of the young. But not everyone within the Presbyterian and Methodist churches gave unqualified support to the YMCA to move wholesale into what had been dominantly the exclusive jurisdiction of the rural church.

The Presbyterian Record found many reasons cited by detractors of the scheme from within the church, but several of these were weak arguments. The YMCA was accused of deviating radically from its original purpose, namely, helping young men. The religious work in the rural community was centered in the rural church and the YMCA scheme would subvert the interest, affection and support of the young from existing churches making the rural minister's work more difficult. The young in rural Canada, it was argued, were the hope of the

church of Christ in the future and the church depended upon the religious life of the young being centered in the rural church. Since the YMCA had not yet developed facilities of its own in these areas, difficulty was anticipated in trying to schedule YMCA activities in existing facilities. Furthermore, the rural community had its own diversions and relaxations as pleasant as those of the city and did not need the YMCA.¹¹⁰ The editor only noted the arguments for and against the extension of YMCA work without giving any firmer idea about the extent to which they were held by the church, stating only that these "are some of the reasons . . . so far as they have appeared."¹¹¹

Officially, however, sanction was being given to support the YMCA. At the Forty-Sixth General Assembly the following year, 1920, the Committee on Coordination unanimously agreed that a standing committee be formed to

act in an advisory capacity in all matters affecting the relationship of the Y.M.C.A. to the Churches and of the Churches to the Y.M.C.A., and that a copy of this resolution be sent to each body represented in this conference for their approval and appointment of delegates.¹¹²

Represented were Baptist, Congregationalist, Anglican, Methodist and Presbyterian churches, and the YMCA. The latter organization was demonstrating a formative influence on the denominations in general and on the young people's societies of the churches in particular. The following year a joint committee on young people's work was established, with a mandate to examine even more rigorously the young boy problem. The idea had been solidifying for some time and involved all protestant denominations. Youth and Service explained:

For some time leaders in work with young men and women all over North America have been carefully examining existing programmes and types of organization for young people. A few months ago a group of Canadian leaders, representing the Young People's Societies of the various denominations, such as the A.Y.P.A., the B.Y.P.A. [Baptist], the Westminster Guild, the Christian Endeavor, and the Epworth League, and also the Sunday School organizations and the Y.M.C.A. and Y.W.C.A., met informally to study the question of a programme for young people that might be used with necessary modifications by all these bodies. Several meetings were held, and some progress was made. In January action was taken to form a permanent joint committee on young people's programme, and it is hoped that this committee will make progress in its important work as rapidly as possible. 113

There were indications, however, that the churches were becoming increasingly concerned about the spiritual nature of the young in the post-war social milieu. For one thing there was no mistaking that the guiding principles set out by the committee were anything but thoroughly religious in emphasis, which fundamentally acknowledged other aspects of the individual but kept the prime purpose of the church to the fore. The main features of the envisioned program included: 1) study--bible, missions, teacher training, community needs, etc.; 2) worship--church services, young people's meetings, private devotion; 3) service--active participation in church and community work; and 4) social life--fellowship and special meetings. 114

The underlying assumption was that in providing fully for their requirements, it was expected that young people would participate in church services, meetings for study, and meetings for training and fellowship. 115

The difficulty in accepting the YMCA was that it was too concerned with the physical to suit the inclination of the denominations who saw their purpose as spiritual. The reasons given by those not supporting the move of the organization into rural areas indicated

that the church was quite concerned with the spiritual welfare of these communities. The YMCA had traditionally laid considerable stress on its physical department, but at this time there was little indication that, within the denominations, this passion for greater care of the body was a dominating influence over the minds of church leaders in young people's work. In the post-war planning period, there appeared to be an increased awareness of the need for spiritual guidance furthered by the decline of the social gospel.

The Anglican church in Canada was also represented on the Standing Committee, but they had shown the least sympathy for the spread of this organization and its "YMCA methods." In fact, Anglicans on occasion would use this closer harmony in spirit between the denominations and the YMCA as a point of attack when passing judgment on them.¹¹⁶ Anglicans were divided on the issue of support and cooperation with the YMCA. The attitude of many Anglicans towards the YMCA might also be representative of the feelings of conservatives in the more evangelical denominations untouched by the social gospel message towards physical recreation.

An editorial on the development of Church Institutes in England provided the editor of the Canadian Churchman in 1903, opportunity to speak on the benefits of such organizations in England, and, in the editor's opinion, their Canadian equivalent, the emerging YMCA.

These institutes aim at promoting the religious, intellectual, social and physical welfare of their members. They organize classes and lectures, provide amusement and recreation, and, by giving access to a gymnasium and baths, provide for the physical well-being of the members. They are in large towns of

great benefit in breaking down a narrow congregationalism, and in bringing the churchmen of the town into closer touch and more frequent intercourse with each other. They are, in short, to churchmen what the Young Men's Christian Association is to the undenominationalist. . . . Excellent as the Y.M.C.A. is in many of its features, and helpful as many a young man may find it in a large city, it has this advantage to a Churchman, that so far as it deals with doctrine and worship it does so from a dissenting, or undenominational standpoint, and not from that of an intelligent and loyal Churchman. To us this is a radical defect, and must tend to make young Churchmen in such an environment less attached to the doctrine, discipline and worship of their own household of faith. The Church of England has marked denominational features and characteristics, and if her young members are thrown in close association with those, who, however sincere, seriously differ from them in religious thought and methods, they cannot but be affected by the atmosphere they breathe and the associates they meet with. In a word, the Young Men's Christian Association is more congenial to the Nonconformist and the Undenominationalist than it can possibly be to the Anglican Churchman, and in the practical working out must be more helpful in building up Nonconformity than in extending the influence of the Church of England.¹¹⁷

The author continued noting the existence of a Church of England Institute in Halifax, suggesting that this type of organization should be built up and receive the patronage of Anglicans. The objectives of another Maritime Institute, at St. John, showed what might be expected of such institutes if they were developed further in Canada. Its purpose was to unite churchmen in promoting: 1) the advancement of religion in accordance with the principles of the Church of England; 2) the encouragement of kindly intercourse among its members; 3) the diffusion of general knowledge in subordination to religion; and 4) the provision of innocent recreation and amusement.¹¹⁸ These ideals were similar to those of the YMCA, but in practice, as one less enthusiastic Anglican noted, the Institutes established on Canadian soil were essentially only reading rooms.¹¹⁹

Anglicans expressed diametrically opposite views concerning the YMCA. Anglicans on one extreme believed the organization was providing needed recreational opportunities without in any way interfering with the integrity of the Church of England. The laying on May 14, 1912, of the cornerstone of a new central YMCA building in Toronto provided such an occasion for support. Lauding the accomplishments of the organization, one Anglican observer later added:

There is a happy unity in the Association activities which obliterates the denominational differences. There has been much talk of Church unity in recent times, but the Y.M.C.A. has been practicing it for nearly seventy years. Loyal to the Church, usurping none of the Church's functions, it binds together the men of all faiths for the service of their fellow man. While it is Christian to the core, it opens its door widely to all. Its buildings and its activities give substance and reality to the good impulses and desires of those who wish to help young men to fight a winning battle, each one with strength as the strength of ten because his heart is pure.¹²⁰

However, there was concern from some Anglican supporters of the YMCA that it might be leading Anglicans away from the church. This concern was evident in the remarks of another contributor to the Canadian Churchman regarding the view that physical recreation was not the mandate of the church and should be left to outside agencies.

It is certainly no part of the duty of the Catholic Church, or of the denominations, commonly called churches, which it contains, or of the congregations or churches which make up such denominations, to provide tennis lawns, gymnasiums, swimming baths or concerts for young people, nor do I suppose that what some of the young people are reported to have said, means that they would leave the Catholic Church as above defined to obtain such things.¹²¹

The social gospel message was not sustained by those who believed that the church had a spiritual function only, to "preach the Gospel, and to teach all to observe the commandments of her Founder."¹²²

This contributor argued that physical recreation was "no part of the duty of the Catholic Church," instead the answer was to "cultivate the closest and most friendly relations with the Y.M.C.A. and the Y.W.C.A., and work with and through them, as far as possible, in connection with amusements and recreations."¹²³ The Canadian Churchman endorsed greater cooperation with the Association particularly as the organization, the editor felt prophetically, would emerge an even greater community force following the War. Traditionally the Church of England had not supported the YMCA, but its physical recreation work was well known to the denomination. "The attitude of the Church of England towards it in the past has not always been entirely sympathetic, although large numbers of its supporters, both among clergy and laymen, are and have been Anglicans." In light of limited recreation programming within the church, the editor felt that the YMCA should be given more encouragement both by Anglicans and those in the other denominations.

By surrounding young men with a Christian atmosphere and at the same time providing them with opportunities for recreation and social intercourse, it is doing a most valuable piece of work, a work that cannot be done as well, and need not be done, by any one denomination by itself.¹²⁴

The commencement of the RED TRIANGLE CAMPAIGN by the YMCA brought out the strongest indictments of the usefulness of the YMCA to the Church of England. After an initial sharp reaction, the issue of a rural YMCA faded but this reaction showed the other extreme side of Anglican opinion and underscored the traditional antagonism between the Church of England and the YMCA. There was no social gospel rhetoric to be found in the words of those opposed to the Association.

There is more spiritual life in the atmosphere surrounding a Baptist, Methodist, Presbyterian, or Holy Roller congregation, where at least definiteness as to the Son of God is sometimes taught, than in the vacuum of so-called Christian fellowship which strives through one hundred and one pleasantries to bring men to a knowledge of the truth. Give a non-religious man the use of a billiard table, a swimming pool, and an active cafeteria, and he will never hope for help from either the doctrines or practices of the Church of England. The rite of admission to the Y.M.C.A. is the payment of the member's fee.¹²⁵

A flurry of counteracting rebuttals followed which indicated the church was changing its position but this could not deny that among the conservative elements in the Anglican church, the physical recreation work of the Association was not viewed positively.

At this time the spirit of social change was by no means dead. Of course, there were those who preferred that the church look after its spiritual commission to the exclusion of all other considerations no matter how worthwhile they might inherently be. Many social gospellers, however, wanted to go beyond mere encouragement of the physical work program within the YMCA and suggested instead direct involvement by the church in this area. Ironically, it was YMCA initiative which found a compromise program more acceptable to evangelical and conservative alike: one which attempted encouragement of a basic recognition of all aspects of life--body, mind and spirit--but which offered some flexibility of interpretation.

The program which evolved was the Canadian Standard Efficiency Tests (CSET), a program encompassing four categories: Intellectual, Physical, Religious or Devotional, and Social (also referred to as Service). In planning the program the YMCA sought advice from an eminent American educational psychologist, Herman H. Horne, who

recommended that a balanced program was essential, and so the YMCA's old fourfold formula was adopted.¹²⁶ The first edition of the tests appeared in October 1912, and while the fourth edition was being prepared, under the direction of the Boys' Work Committee of the National Council of the YMCA, the suggestion came to the committee that if the plan were made progressive and more comprehensive, it might become the accepted program of work for teen-age boys in Canadian Sunday schools.¹²⁷ The denominations responded by appointing a number of prominent secretaries from the various Sunday school commissions to assist in adapting this YMCA program to meet the needs of the churches. These included Rev. R. A. Hiltz, an Anglican, Rev. R. L. Farewell, a Methodist, and Rev. C. A. Myers, a Presbyterian.¹²⁸ Several of the denominations were optimistic from the beginning,¹²⁹ but were advised that the spiritual aspect of the program should not be dominated by any other.¹³⁰ The most liberal of all denominations encouraged CSET for its potential benefits. The immediate value of the tests was that it secured a broadened weekday program within the church; one which continued to be expanded into the post-war reconstruction period. Its virtue was that it provided the church with a regimented format, readily adaptable to suit most parishes, and more importantly, compatible with the protestant mentality concerning physical recreation. Even the social gospel could not erase among its adherents that traditional love of order, implying as Barker had noted, that to the protestant denominations form was as important as content.¹³¹

While there was general acceptance of this program in all denominations during its first years of application, this acceptance was by no means universal. Moreover, its specific use was somewhat restricted if statistical data on potential and actual users is interpreted correctly. Macleod in his study of adolescence and the YMCA during the period of the social gospel, claimed that the program proved hopelessly cumbersome and attracted only 13,421 boys in 1919.¹³² Other statistical evidence indicates that the percentage of youth involved in church organizations based solely on the principles of CSET, namely Tuxis and Trail Rangers, was small.¹³³ Of a survey of boys in Toronto in 1921, only 4.4% of protestant adolescents were members of Tuxis and Trail Rangers. The survey also showed that an incredible 91% of Toronto boys attended Sunday school, a tribute, no doubt, to "Toronto the Good."¹³⁴ This program, however, was but part of a broader one in which the church was actively searching for appropriate social programming in order for it to reach larger proportions of the adolescent group.

During the war years particularly, the campaign to broaden the use of the CSET program gained considerable momentum. The scheme never proved a success at the Sunday school level, but more evangelical denominations did officially encourage its adoption by groups other than Sunday schools. Its name was changed to Canadian Standard Efficiency Training in 1918 to suit the spirit of the times and, with slight amendments to the format, its use was encouraged in all denominational organizations. Several claims for its benefits were made, such as that by the Board of Sabbath Schools and Young People's

Societies to the Presbyterian General Assembly in 1924:

Before the War, Young People's Work was developing normally at a rather modest rate. Immediately on the outbreak of the War, Young Men's Bible Classes and Young People's Societies melted away, in many cases not a single eligible man being left. Even as late as 1917 the decreases reached a total of nearly 200 organizations and nearly 9000 members. Fortunately just before the outbreak of the War a remarkable forward movement began in connection with work among Older Boys and Girls (12 - 18 years of age) which has continued to develop in the C.S.E.T. and C.G.I.T. [girls equivalent program] movements and which has done much to help make possible the marked growth of Young People's Work (18 - 24), during the six year period 1917 - 1922.¹³⁵

The CSET program was credited in the Presbyterian church with significant importance. Growth in PYPA membership increased from 42,000 to 97,000 during the period 1917 to 1922. This represented not only a substantial increase in size of young people's organizations, but these figures included only those organizations reported to be conducting midweek activities.¹³⁶ Methodists, too, approved of the increased use of the scheme. The Eleventh General Conference that year reported considerable optimism for it: "We rejoice in the increased interest being manifested in week-day religious instruction. . . . The C.S.E.T. and C.G.I.T. programmes are most heartily commended for the broad and efficient training which is embodied in them."¹³⁷ The gospel message of the church's greater involvement in social planning and social regeneration had taken root; it remained to be seen if with it came a changed attitude about the higher recognition of the body and the use for physical recreation in Canadian protestantism which the social gospel also encouraged.

In the ranks of Methodism, proselytizing the virtues of the CSET program was more a matter of education than one of conversion.

There seemed to be little open hostility to this YMCA-sponsored program and progress of the organization was reported in its youth periodicals from time to time. A lengthy article appeared in Youth and Service, as an example, giving an overview of its historical development to 1916.

During the last twenty-five years many efforts have been put forth in behalf of 'teen age boys. Boys' Brigades, Boy Scouts, Knights of King Arthur and a score or more of boys' organizations have been promoted and have done much not only to help boys, but also to determine correct methods in boys' work. These experiments have been carried on along two general lines. One in connection with the churches through the denominational and inter-denominational Sunday-school boards and culminating in the appointment of a Commission on the 'Teen Age some years ago. The other in connection with the Y.M.C.A. and culminating in the investigation into boy life made by the Men and Religion Movement.

. . . This Committee [Canadian Standard Efficiency Tests Committee of the YMCA including interdenominational support] has developed the programme until it is now the recognized programme of work for 'teen-age boys in the Protestant churches, Y.M.C.A. and Sunday-school associations of Canada.

We can scarcely overestimate the value of setting up such a national ideal.¹³⁸

The serenity with which liberal Methodism accepted the scheme contrasted with the reaction some Anglicans felt towards it.

Tied up with Anglican opinion of the value of CSET were broader questions dealing with the requirements of the Anglican communion and acceptable outside agencies which could meet the high aspirations of the denomination. Comparison of the YMCA, and its novel program, with the Boy Scouts, the traditional favourite of the Anglican Church for resolving the boy problem, created tension in discussions on the issue.

The reporting of the YMCA-sponsored "Coast to Coast Boys

Work Conference" held in Toronto in the fall of 1916 served to bring out some of the latent issues concerning CSET. The Canadian Churchman observed and reported on most of the details. A number of issues were raised by the article on the conference, which noted the absence of any Anglican leaders in boys work, pointing up the slowness with which Anglicans were becoming involved in CSET compared to other denominations. The Churchman elaborated:

Every denomination had its leader, and expert in boys' work, who could answer questions, and assist in planning for the future work. We few Anglicans who met together [ten percent of the total as reported in a subsequent article] not only missed this very necessary part of assistance, but missed that feeling of unity in this national effort to serve the boys.¹³⁹

The editor followed with a message of endorsement.

Boys' Leaders--We endorse most heartily what was said by one of our correspondents in last week's issue regarding the need of greater interest on the part of the Church in the efforts to develop leaders in boys' work. Considerable was done along this line by the Brotherhood of St. Andrew but, unfortunately, this has been allowed in the main to cease. The Church, through the Sunday School Commission, has the machinery that is needed but here we are handicapped by lack of funds. One result of this, as was pointed out, is that many of our boys lose interest and drift away from the Church. In the past the "Boy Problem" was regarded by many as a hopeless one. We know to-day that it is most hopeful, provided we can get proper leaders. . . . Would it not be wise, though, to extend the same spirit [of philanthropy] to the activities that are striving to lay better foundations for the future of both Church and State? "Better a fence at the top of a cliff than an ambulance at the foot."¹⁴⁰

After the program had been in operation for some time additional support came from those who had had personal experience with it. Such leaders saw the benefit of a midweek program in maintaining the allegiance of the young boy, and as to the program content

itself:

I think the reason why so many church clubs fail is because they are only for social amusement, and not aiming at anything higher. The Canadian Standard Efficiency Tests forms a splendid programme. . . . The meeting is opened with prayer and a Bible discussion for half an hour. Afterwards, they come together for a helpful talk, then some tests are taken, or debates on live topics, after which we play group games. Once a month we have beans, each group having a table by themselves, so they can give their yells, etc., after which an address is given. During the season the fellows play inter-church and inter-group games of hockey, indoor and outdoor baseball. What is the result? Through the grace of God we are holding our fellows and increasing our attendance 15 per cent.¹⁴¹

The CSET program did not limit participation in physical recreation to that prescribed in the tests. Numerous similar articles lauding the advantages of the CSET program appeared for the next few years until interest in this social program dominated all other social editorial interests. Clubs gave examples of their entire year's program under the scheme, in both written and tabular format.¹⁴²

The YMCA CSET program, treated liberally with the blessings of the editor,¹⁴³ was uncharacteristically applauded as a sound program and liberal Anglicans were responding.

Coeval with this sudden interest in the CSET program the YMCA launched its RED TRIANGLE CAMPAIGN and the cracks began to appear in the foundation laid by the church media. One antagonist issued his opinion of the YMCA with a certain invective.

We are asked to believe that this wonderfully organized force, so modern in social spirit, so broad in its activities, is to be necessary to the working of a "successful" church. Success is found in the achievement of ideals. . . . Here the Anglican Church fundamentally differs from the Y.M.C.A. With Christ's promised Presence enshrined in the Word and the Sacraments, the Church presents this Ideal to the world, leaving the results to the Holy Spirit. Whereas the supporters of

the Red Triangle labour nobly in the twilight of good works, marking success by increase of membership.¹⁴⁴

Meanwhile, could the Anglican church be adopting YMCA methods? Full-page advertisements appeared in the Canadian Churchman selling the principle of the CSET program with its ideal format¹⁴⁵ of having a four-fold program offering a broader scope for work with boys. Protagonists of the scheme were encouraged to speak out in its favour. The well-known Canadian cleric, Rev. Dr. J. L. Carroll, spoke highly of the scheme. "The C.S.E.T. is the only efficient method that we have today which gives us the key to leadership for the days to come." Concerning the athletic or physical portion of the program, he concluded: "Our athletic events give us a point of contact with every normal boy. This feature does not predominate, but is only one of many useful incidents. The great ideal we hold up is service--Jesus was the greatest servant of mankind."¹⁴⁶ There were a few discordant opinions coming forward which kept the issue alive.

Sir,--Without hesitation I can, for myself, answer "Superintendent's" question about the C.S.E.T. "The boy,"--the wholesome, red-blooded boy--has no use for it. As a training in priggishness, unwholesome self-consciousness, goody-goodyness, nothing could be more effective. . . . I would not care to have the C.S.E.T. method adopted in my Sunday School, or in any boys' society for which I was personally responsible.

And as to the suggested alternative:

It seems to me that the Church in Canada is missing a grand opportunity in the Boy Scout movement. . . . It appeals to all that is best in the boy and develops his sense of duty, honor, altruism, individual responsibility and usefulness to others and to himself. It is comprehensive and has contact with every interest of a boy's life. As an auxiliary to Church training and Sunday School work, as well as a means of training in good citizenship, there is nothing else as good.¹⁴⁷

Others condemned the program outright. "If any of your readers

imagine that all they have to do to solve for themselves the boy problem is to adopt the C.S.E.T., they had better do a little more thinking."¹⁴⁰

Significantly, "Spectator," the weekly commentator on subjects of public interest and one who was, perhaps, as liberal as his readership, moved cautiously on the issue. Noting that the denominations own Sunday School Commission was lending its weight behind boys' conferences, he sounded his concern that the spiritual aspects of the CSET program were not necessarily beneficial if the boy leaders were themselves not up to "standard efficiency." In his characteristic style, he wondered if the program was just a little too much of a production:

In addition to all this the existence of a top-heavy organization with committee and sub-committee to the third and fourth degree; with managers and secretaries without number, with buttons and badges galore, with reams of letters and stamps to correspond, we seem to be overrun by an imported system that is wholly unsuited to the genius and judgment of our people.¹⁴⁹

His motivation was more to support the Boy Scout movement against derision, than to show any dominant dislike for CSET in which he may have had little personal experience. "Spectator" elaborated on his opinions during the following weeks.

It is apparent that the tests are an essential part of the scheme, not a mere accessory. The leader is expected to "chart" the boys progress or retrogression. We are quite familiar with physical tests--chest expansion, running ability, etc.--and we can soon settle those. Intellectual tests may very easily be applied by an examination on books or nature. Social tests are a little more difficult and undefined, but presumably one can arrive at some general conclusion as to how a boy gets on with his neighbours. . . . The thing, however, that bothers "Spectator," and evidently bothers many thinking people who are keenly interested in boys, is the efficacy and the wisdom of spiritual tests. . . .

In the judgment of "Spectator" no such difficulty as has been pointed out above arises out of the fundamental structure of the Boy Scouts. This organization may seem to emphasize, too fully, the intellectual and physical side of the boy to the neglect of the spiritual, but that would depend entirely upon the Scoutmaster.¹⁵⁰

In their zeal to applaud this new form of control, ambassadors of the CSET movement often unnecessarily degraded the Scouting movement, and there was no quicker way to raise the ire of many Anglicans than to follow that ill-advised course of action. Prudence did prevail, however, as several contributors attempted to act as peacemakers and balance the scales by reason. One such contributor concluded: "In reading the various letters written in commendation of the Canadian Standard Efficiency Tests, it seems to me that the Boy Scout Movement has been criticized unfairly by some and not been given its due praise by others."¹⁵¹ In their desire to find a new course for Anglican youth work, many directly compared these forms of programming. Supporters of CSET criticized the Boy Scouts as not offering a broad enough program:

We have the Lad's Brigade and the Boy Scouts, and, as an assistant Scout Master, I agree that they are splendid things, but do not cover the ground necessary to make a man, both physically and spiritually. They uphold splendid ideals, but they spend most of their energies on the physical side of the boy.¹⁵²

Others criticized the Scouts as well for being too narrow in their approach to boys work. "If the Church Lad's Brigade and the Boy Scouts are doing this same thing for the Canadian Church in a definite and nation-wide manner, I have yet to hear of it. The C.S.E.T. takes time and consecration."¹⁵³ Others would agree.

The Anglican Church has not as yet realized the great issue at stake in not whole-heartedly supporting this work [CSET].

But it is a great pleasure to the Anglican boys already interested in this movement to see church after church adopting it. Many of these churches have tried the Boys' Brigade, the Boy Scouts and other movements, but have found something lacking which they have apparently found in the C.S.E.T. Movement.¹⁵⁴

There were essential differences between these apparently divergent programs, the CSET and the Scout Movement, which would not be reconciled, especially regarding the physical program each engendered.¹⁵⁵

Perhaps it was a minority of Anglicans who supported CSET, but these were split between those who accepted both forms of program and those who were highly favourable to CSET as a substitute for the Boy Scouts.¹⁵⁶ Despite charges of undenominationalism in its methods, and that "Y.M.C.A. methods are not the Church's methods," many were eager to enlist these YMCA methods to help in the resolution of the young boy problem even at the expense of the Boy Scouts. But for the time being antagonism had been created, and those supporting opposing schemes continued their war of words for a while yet.

The CSET program was changed during the period 1914 - 1916, to respond to the wishes of the church for a broadly based program but one which did not undermine the importance of a spiritual life. During the war years, the double billing given the program by the denominations indicated its appropriateness in that time of national mobilization. After the war, however, this YMCA-sponsored program fell into relative obscurity although it later became the basis on which the Tuxis and Trail Rangers training programs were developed. These became the backbone of weekday training within the United Church of Canada until 1953. A Toronto survey in 1921 indicated

that membership in Tuxis and Trail Rangers was half that for either the YMCA or the Boy Scouts, a survey which took into account all protestant denominations and others.¹⁵⁷ But what this survey does not show is the intense concern which was generated around issues relating to the provision of denominational weekday activities; nor do they give any firsthand impression about the provision of physical recreation within the aegis of the church. The growth of a Canadian social gospel raised the level of awareness concerning social issues, broadly speaking, and this process was significantly affected by influences outside the immediate realm of the congregation.

In the end, the experience of efforts on two continents to solve the boy problem came to bear upon the Canadian understanding of the problem and the solutions which were felt necessary for its resolution. Christian social programmers drew upon many avenues of support, international and domestic, in order to study the adolescent and provide a guide to positive action.

Sports and Games

The literature of adolescence was used as a primer by social gossellers in their search for an appropriate social image of physical recreation and sport. They sought in this literature greater understanding of amusement, recreation, and sport, terms which were basic to the social study of physical recreation. But these terms were by no means consistently applied. In fact, they were on occasion used interchangeably, which further complicated the task of developing a social philosophy towards physical recreation and sport.

However, the use of such terms often implied expected or anticipated outcomes from involvement with physical activity--a retrenchment from immoral behavior, better church attendance, greater national patriotism, better sportsmanship or fair play--as well as demonstrating an interest in the social benefits of play, health and athletics. The historic church with its "gymnasium and showerbath" mentality had shown meagre interest in the meaning behind such popular terms. The passion of the social gospel moved to change the tradition of the church.

By far the most ubiquitous term applying to physical recreation was that of amusement. The word carried, however, a moral connotation and for this reason it was especially preferred in Presbyterian literature. In order to measure the morality of such things as their amusements, Presbyterians in keeping with their literary traditions displayed a penchant for rhymes, vignettes and charts which would ostensibly point the way. Whether or not they were effective, they left little doubt of the religious mission amusements were to serve. The Presbyterian Record, characteristically reprinting from another periodical, the Christian Commonwealth, provided such a measure, a seven step test to guide its turn-of-the-century readership.

How to Test Amusements

First--Do they rest and strengthen, or weary and weaken, the body?

Second--Do they strengthen and rest, or weary and weaken, the brain?

Third--Do they make resistance to temptation easier or harder?

Fourth--Do they increase or lessen love for virtue, purity, temperance and justice?

Fifth--Do they give inspiration and quicken enthusiasm, or stupefy the intellectual and harden the moral nature?

Sixth--Do they increase or diminish respect for manhood and womanhood?

Seventh--Do they draw one nearer to, or remove one farther from, the Christ?¹⁵⁸

But these were inadequate attempts to deal either with the young boy problem or the issue of proper amusement. They were more a literary convention than an attempt to seriously study a problem. Such schemes were characteristically more proscriptive than prescriptive, exemplifying rather a negativism towards amusement, resulting from a lack of involvement by the church in that area.

The growing concern of the church was that it become more involved in understanding and defining such terms as amusement, recreation and sport, as the young boy problem began to emerge as a central theme in the social platform of the denominations. The church was needed. As one astute observer commented with reference to the increased carelessness with which young people were coming to regard their religion: "Most young people, when not reminded of religion, think of amusement."¹⁵⁹ Such statements tended to encourage extreme views, promoting either a denunciation of amusement, or, in the case of those interested in promoting "practical Christianity," encouraging the study of it, with a view to becoming involved. Indeed, the upsurge of interest in young people's societies at this time served not only to counteract the tendency of the unconfirmed to fall into "carelessness of living"¹⁶⁰ but served also to counteract what the church too often saw in other societies, namely, that "young people's unions degenerate into mere gatherings

for a poor kind of mutual amusement, often not at all of an uplifting sort."¹⁶¹ With the rise of the young people's society came the need for understanding and definition of this popularly misunderstood term.

As interest in the social gospel quickened, the need for a more informed view of physical recreation emerged. Social gospel panegyric was reaching its heights in the years immediately before World War I and at the same time the church began to probe more earnestly the meaning of such terms as "amusement" and "recreation" for possible benefits for its social program. The Presbyterian Record in its July citizenship topic for 1913 examined "Public Amusements: Their Use and Abuse." The author of the article, Toronto cleric, Rev. J. W. Stephen, considered the definition of amusement.

The legitimacy of amusement in itself cannot be denied. Nature demands relaxation. The bow cannot always remain strung. "Amusement," as the word implies, is plainly a turning away from the Muses--a temporary suspension of the more serious tasks of life.

Encouraged by a recent visit to Toronto by Jacob Riis, the American authority on playgrounds, Stephen continued reinforcing the popular belief that where playgrounds and innocent amusement were provided crime was materially reduced and a healthy law-abiding citizenry was the logical result. Stephen believed that the need for amusement was further reinforced by the character of the age.¹⁶²

The popular understanding of the word "amusement" included such diverse activities as athletics, the race course, the theatre, dancing and card-playing. Examining athletics in particular, Stephen

considered its virtues in history: the Greeks had recognized the important place of the stadium in building a virile manhood; the universities of the day were using athletics in preparing men for the battlefield of life, and writers on Eugenics were finding that "starved nerves create unhealthy appetites resulting in the deterioration of the race."¹⁶³ Athletics undoubtedly produced strong muscles, but also, it was believed, self-control, sound judgment, and chivalrous consideration for others. Its potential for promoting such Christian ideals appeared boundless.

In practice, however, there were problems as athletics did not always take the path of virtue. But undismayed, Stephen continued. "It is not to be inferred, however, that the domain of sports is to be deserted by the Church and left to the enemy. In Bible classes and boys' clubs it should be possible to so inculcate Christian chivalry as to raise the whole standard of athletics in a community."¹⁶⁴ Such was the aspiration of one social gospeller. That this was most likely to happen only under the aegis of the church or properly supervised community associations was emphasized by the Methodist Department of Temperance and Moral Reform of the Methodist Church. Its 1913 report to the General Conference noted: "As an antidote to impure entertainment and brutalizing sport, we would urge our ministers and people to encourage all clean, healthy, recreation pleasure, especially among our young people." The report recommended further that communities should provide social centres where proper recreation under careful supervision may be enjoyed.¹⁶⁵ The cooperative launching of a successful nation-wide social survey

by the Methodist and Presbyterian churches no doubt encouraged the latter view of a wider provision of amusement and recreation.

A further insight into the understanding and use of amusements is collected by Rev. W. R. McIntosh's discussion of "Religion and Amusement," the Presbyterian young people's society topic for the week of July 19, in the following year, 1914. "Religion and amusements have often been regarded as enemies," he began.¹⁶⁶ He believed a confessor of the former did not enter into the latter for fear of allying with the trinity of evils that are opposed to God: the world, the flesh and the devil. But a change had been effected over this somewhat historic view, the result of recent scientific and pedagogical influences. "'Religion' and 'Play,'" McIntosh continued, "instead of standing face to face, fighting each other, are getting back to back in the common fight for the welfare of youth, and are both regarded as essential factors in the making of men and nations."¹⁶⁷ Stressing the play aspect of amusement, as had Stephen, he noted the recent exaltation of play to the rank of a profession, while liberally quoting the American Playground Association. The duty of the church was to encourage wholesome amusement, and furthermore to redeem the world of amusement, to reclaim the play life of the community for God.¹⁶⁸ The social gospel rhetoric flowed rampant:

The dream of the future is that all the kingdoms of this world are to become the Kingdom of our Lord and of His Christ. This means the social as well as the geographic kingdoms. So that those who toil for the making of better men and women, for sounder bodies, better controlled minds, brighter spirits and better disciplined characters, through the control and development of the people's recreations and amusements, will have the right at last to join with God's coworkers in all other departments of social service, in the chorus that never ends.¹⁶⁹

This notion of the importance of the playground in character development was by no means uncommon, but it received a wider audience with acceptance of the social mission of the church. The importance of the playground as one ameliorator of social problems was fundamentally sound, but in their zeal at times, social gospellers asked impossible demands of it as a general catharsis for all ages.¹⁷⁰ MacIntosh, too, asked for an outstanding change of attitude. "Then we have too long and too often overlooked the 'ethical' significance of play and sport. So much is this the case that play should be considered as a form of social service rather than a more or less questionable aside of life."¹⁷¹ There was much truth in restating the traditional hostility of religion and amusement, and perhaps too the social gospel had an impossible mission or at least an impractical message concerning the church's provision of physical recreation.

Conservative protestants found it difficult to accept that the church had a responsibility to provide any social activities let alone the provision of amusements. Concerning "Church Amusements" one Anglican cleric responded to the tendency to liberalize the definition of what was properly church work:

After the question of where the duty rests to provide recreation, comes that of consideration of the importance, need and ability for making such provision.

I have had in my ministry singing classes, health clubs, tennis clubs, socials, entertainments, picnics, etc. I realized after some years that I was neglecting the souls of the people for the sake of their bodily, mental and social improvement. . . . Finally, I concluded spiritual work had to take the first place with me whoever was pleased or displeased, and of late years I have been very sparing in the matter of giving time and energy to amusing and providing amusements for the people.

It seems to me also that the church should be very circumspect as to the nature of its provision along these lines. . . .

Compare James 4 with Colossians 4, and I think one can hardly conclude otherwise than that the Church is rather to pray than to amuse.¹⁷²

Though this view could find supporters from any denomination, many Anglicans were suspicious of amusements within the church.

As Anglicanism came to adopt the social gospel for its own, a more liberal assessment of the place and necessity of amusement became more commonplace in its communion. The Most Rev. G. Thorneloe was invited to give his opinions on amusement in the church, but only on a limited aspect of the term.¹⁷³ He outlined a few principles consistent with the more evangelical denominations. The religion of the church was primarily a religion of joy, not of gloom; the church did not deny amusements but left to the individual conscience which amusements should be pursued. Taking an approach uniting social Darwinism and environmentalism, he believed such a philosophy was in keeping with the "religion of nature" stressing the wholeness of man, one in body, mind and spirit. But there were limitations. "Recreation and amusement are not ends in themselves. They are chiefly aids to work."¹⁷⁴ The latter view, however, is not particularly ascribed to the social gospel, which instead stressed the social imperatives and the social consequences of action, not the view that work was a religious imperative. But in context this view was liberal as well, in contrast to earlier views that encouraged a substitution of work for amusement, an ethic that did not give way easily to a more progressive view.¹⁷⁵

An editorial in the Globe sparked the editor of the Presbyterian and Westminster to give his opinion on how to successfully unite the two apparently divergent topics, work and amusement. While noting that the Canadian youth was absorbed with his athletics, and even admitting that the devotion to sport can be beneficial, he supported the "sport" of gardening, of making "play out of work."

Games and sports have an attraction of their own, especially for the young, that cannot be found elsewhere, and it is probable that certain benefits are to be derived from them that cannot be obtained otherwise. But we are confident that many people would be surprised if they knew how much real pleasure, as well as physical advantage, is to be found in occupations which, upon the surface, may appear to be simply forms of labor. We speak, of course, particularly to those who are not regularly engaged in physical work.

. . . Speaking from some experience we have no hesitation in commending gardening as a substitute for golf or a variation from bowling. . . .

Of the physical benefits of gardening it is impossible to speak too highly. There is great variety in the work, and this is an advantage not only because it introduces the element of change, but because it provides exercise for all the various muscles of the body.¹⁷⁶

Not everyone carried the same interpretation of an invigorated concern for physical recreation within the church, but the editor seemed to be on the right track. Thornloe stressed that the Anglican church could not afford to ignore the elementary truth that there was a legitimate place for amusement within the church, and not solely as a subtle form of work. He also observed that as far as accepting and providing for amusement, the "Church had shown less than her usual wisdom"¹⁷⁷ in the past.

Presbyterians had the strongest views about which amusements were worthy of support. In an attempt to guide youth on this subject,

a Montreal Presbyterian, Rev. B. S. Black wrote "Amusement That Is Worth While" as the Young People's Society topic for the week of January 23, 1916. While noting that physical recreation, relaxation, and amusement had a legitimate place in society, he stressed that amusements must build up morally or they are not worthwhile. The main principles to follow, Black concluded, were: 1) Amusements must be servants, not masters; 2) No Christian had the right to injure others; and 3) Body, mind and spirit must be considered when choosing amusements.¹⁷⁸ The message concerning the servitude of sport or amusement emphasized that when amusements get undue prominence, then the "extravagance and dissipation they create are the signs of national decline and decay."¹⁷⁹ Under such a philosophy the growth of sport as a national cultural institution would be difficult at best. Presbyterians did not counsel combative or bodily contact sports or amusements such as boxing and wrestling, as fit sports for anyone. Black emphasized that amusement must consider all aspects of existence--body, mind and soul. This philosophy did not permit concentration on sport. His comments were directed at professional sport but also applied to over indulgence in amateur sport as well.

Healthy outdoor exercise seemed best to fulfill the needs of Presbyterian youth, and this only as part of a broader program, one which included reading and higher spiritual concerns. Black believed that the acceptability of amusement was determined by the attitude of participants, especially their attitude towards pleasure. "To be always running after pleasure betokens a low type of humanity. Youth should be happy, but serious, too. Continued levity emasculates

the soul. To be ever cackling may befit a goose, but not a man."¹⁸⁰ Obviously Presbyterians had some difficulty in adopting the social gospel concept of the necessity in the scheme of things for legitimate amusement accompanied by a spiritual commitment to ensure that the body was not neglected.

This view contrasts somewhat with the Methodist outlook. The report of the Committee on City Problems of the Methodist Department of Social Service and Evangelism in 1918, saw a much higher place for amusement.

The church must recognize more than ever the legitimate demand for amusement. Play has its part in the life of a normal individual, and in some aspects may be as necessary as to pray. The amusements of the people if properly supervised are a means of education and character development.¹⁸¹

Methodists tended to prefer the term "recreation" to that of "amusement," indicating, perhaps, a closer familiarity with the American gospel of recreation¹⁸² and the desire to use a more modern term, one which carried less connotation of sin.

Concerning the provision of recreation in the Epworth League, Rev. W. H. Stevens gave his views during an annual Epworth conference in 1913. His opening remarks dealt with a definition of the term.

RECREATION is an elastic word of wide significance. Sometimes it means that which entertains. . . . Sometimes it is in the way of diversion. . . .

Again it implies helpful exercise which, while it is free from the consciousness of toil, tends to recreate and stimulate our being. . . . We may accept the term in its broader significance, as comprehending all that pleasantly and restfully engages the attention, and results in richer fullness of life energy.¹⁸³

His definition absorbed the concept of amusement.

Considering the place of sports and games in the recreative life of the Canadian citizen, Stevens had much of value to say to his readership, showing both his knowledge of the literature of recreation and his virile attitude towards the body.

In consideration of a question of this nature one naturally thinks of "Games." Those may be divided into three classes. Games of strength and skill, games of chance and skill, and games of chance pure and simple. For games of mingled strength and skill, such as lacrosse, football, baseball and hockey, provided they are played under proper conditions in an honorable spirit, and not to excess, there is nothing but commendation. They train the hand. They train the eye. They train to quickness of the movement. They train to almost instant balancing [sic] of probabilities. They train to swift and definite decision. Indulged in, in moderation under reasonable surroundings, they tend to make men. The Monks and Ascetics swung to the extreme in viewing the body as an encumbrance, while the materialists have erred more seriously in regarding the body as an instrument of pleasure. The body is God's temporary residence for the human soul. . . . We have in Canada the best outdoor games to be found the world over. They tend to develop that contempt of pain and danger which has ever been the mark of the true hero. Our national games, however, cannot be said to be free from attendant evils. This is sincerely to be regretted. 184

This noble outlook for the place and spirit of sport in Canadian culture developed during a period of social gospel inspiration, perhaps the pinnacle of a pure variety of social gospel, one which would soon be remolded and bastardized by the ensuing World War. Stevens then proposed a resolution which was unanimously passed by the Convention, demonstrating in part, the passion the social gospel engendered for the place of physical recreation as a force for social regeneration.

At the suggestion of Mr. Stevens, the Convention unanimously adopted a resolution setting forth its mind on the matter, as follows:

Taking cognizance of man's social nature and in view of the many social pleasures that solicit the patronage of our members,

this Convention reaffirms its belief that as a rational being man is social, and declares that the gratification of the desire should therefore tend to intelligence, grace and character. We hereby enjoin upon our members that they make the League a social centre and continue to prosecute with determination and vigor a propaganda in favor of a social life in the community that befits the Christian conception, that extols intelligent conversation, studies in sociology and civic life, history and kindred literary pursuits; a social life that scouts extravagance and immodesty in dress, which makes character rather than wealth or social prestige the standard of merit, that finds rest and recreation in those rational activities and enjoyments which violate no law of physical health, foster no criminal passion or propensity and imperils no young life; a social life which, while it lightly and pleasantly engages the attention, will ennoble the soul, will chasten and hallow the nature, will dignify the personality; a social life which iterates and reiterates that men need all their mind and strength for loving God and to do man's work in the world.¹⁸⁵

In short, perfection was sought across the entire range of human activity including mind, body and spirit. Aspirations were running high. What could the Epworth League and kindred other young people's societies offer in reality? What kind of activities did the leagues participate in which would ensure rest and recreation through rational activities and enjoyments violating no law of physical health, and fostering no criminal passion to imperil the young? The search for appropriate working definitions of such terms as amusement and recreation in effect educated the Church to the advantages and drawbacks which might accompany more practical involvement. But the desire to reconstruct and shape society under Christian ideals appeared immutable, and the social gospel provided most importantly a mandate for some to put into practice such high ideals.

During the first decade of the new century the welter of young people's societies had become the hallmark of the church's

serious attempt to stamp the mark of a Christian life upon a youthful society. The church chose all three basic options regarding the provision of recreation and recreational amenities. It developed and encouraged recreation and athletic programs within its organization; it used adopted schemes which would supplement its religious and cultural teaching; and it also encouraged participation in the more Christian social, recreational organizations, such as the YMCA and the Boy Scouts. Enthusiasm for the social gospel coaxed some to attempt the former two options of direct involvement, seeing no need to use outside agencies, such as the YMCA, if the church awakened to the growing recreational demands of Canadian boyhood.

The Presbyterian Pre-Assembly Congress was aware of the impulse modern society had fostered for sports which young people were demanding and finding anywhere they could. A western contributor to the Congress, and a stalwart youth worker, Rev. C. A. Myers, used the obvious prevalence of sport coverage in daily newspapers to make his case about commitment to change.

One question that came up for discussion was whether they were giving enough space to sports, and the unanimous conclusion arrived at was that, if they were to meet the public demand for sports, they must give fifty per cent. more space than at present. And I suppose that newspaper gives just as much space to sports as any other paper in the city. I do not say that fifty per cent. more would not be right; but I do say that the reader determines what kind of paper he is to get.

If the newspaper editors and publishers, from the business point of view, wish to raise the standards of their papers, I appeal to you and to myself and to this great Congress to meet them at least half way.¹⁸⁶

Concerning the provision of recreational and sport opportunity within the young people's societies, the church had to try to be at least

as liberal as the young audience it hoped to serve.

The denominations chose to serve this impulse for a more vigorous social life in a number of ways. The most rational approach was to upgrade social programming within the various young people's societies, which was begun aggressively after the turn of the century. This led to a modest acceptance and promotion of athletic associations within the church. In addition, clubs and associations of a social nature including Boys Brigade and Boy Scouts improved their social programming, but these more supervised programs emphasized substantially less athletics and gymnastics in preference for lower organized activities such as hiking and camping. The camping movement, for example, offered the church the opportunity to have sports and games within the list of activities, but under quite controlled circumstances. Such varied opportunities formed the basic pattern through which the denominations could provide recreation or athletics, and from time to time most of them at least attempted to do so. The CSET program developed by the YMCA, and later cooperatively sponsored by the church, was billed as an ideal program offering a broader mandate than athletics alone. This program did much to expose those not immediately involved in athletic programs either through the church or community to acknowledge the physical side of life. But the aim of the church was always higher than recreation, and not preeminently aimed at the body, but at the spirit. Tension was always present. Conservative churchmen believed that the church was "rather to pray than to amuse," and despite concern, those who could support a more liberal view would grant that

there was a "time to play and a time to pray"¹⁸⁷ and still yet the "practical Christian" of the social gospel might argue that play "may be as necessary as to pray;" all would find the field of sport an opportune place to do battle over the saving of young souls.

During the first half decade of the twentieth century the Anglican church was only slowly giving practical consideration to adopting liberal views on the place of sports and amusements within the church. A number of current schemes were drawing attention, in particular the usefulness of the AYPAs, formed in 1902, and other organizations which could cater to more than just the spiritual nature of the young boy as the institutional churches and church boys clubs had traditionally done. Concerning the latter, its function was clearly, in theory and practice, of little athletic value to young boys and men. Noting that the term "club" intimated a social orientation, one contributor to the Churchman wanted to set the record straight by pointing out that in this country such organizations were not really designed for social purposes. The objectives of church clubs were for the most part, educative and operative rather than social, and their function was to "arrange to discuss at suitable intervals those larger questions of diocesan and inter-diocesan church interests which make for the upbuilding of our great communion."¹⁸⁸ Although based on the principle of providing for the intellectual, social and physical welfare of its membership, church institutes and clubs were narrower in practice.¹⁸⁹

As Anglicans organized their young people's program in 1902, the direction for the new AYPAs was being discussed among Anglican

clergy. The consensus was that if programs were aimed at "simplicity and frugality" and avoided "all appearance of ostentation or extravagance," they could be an efficient handmaiden to the church and warrant the continued support of church officials.¹⁹⁰ And what of the Brotherhood of St. Andrew? This small organization had been in existence for some time, and it certainly did not appear to possess the necessary attributes for plunging headlong into organized athletics. Considerable reading and social service requirements dominated its prescribed activities, and admission to its ranks was restricted. Many found these harsh rules of service so demanding, requiring both community and hospital work for example, that they could not always be lived up to.¹⁹¹ It was the Brotherhood of St. Andrew, however, which led the way, showing that devout Anglicanism and recreation and athletics were not incompatible.

By the turn of the century local Ottawa churches had developed an increasing interest and competency in the sporting pursuits of the area, especially hockey, baseball, track and field, and the local chapter of the Brotherhood hit upon the somewhat novel idea of establishing a common athletic association within the Anglican church to further improve the level of competition among its communion, and to ensure that these various sports remained within the bounds of propriety. Apparently the idea was not totally new, but a city-wide amalgamation for athletic purposes of church athletic organizations had yet to be realized by any denomination in any region. The Anglican Amateur Athletic Association was about to become a reality.

The Canadian Churchman carried the events with a certain interest and optimism as they unfolded. The first notice of intention appeared during the 1906 winter sporting season.

The local Council of the Brotherhood of St. Andrew has formulated a scheme for organizing athletic associations in connection with the Bible classes and Sunday schools of the city. The scheme, it is understood, is in successful operation in Hamilton, and in many cities in the States, and the results have been distinctly gratifying.¹⁹²

Adoption of this scheme in Ottawa would mark a new direction for the Anglican church, if such an idea was wholly acceptable to the local dioceses, whose approval was necessary. The Canadian Churchman was enthusiastic, although the plan was untried and perhaps not generally agreeable. However, specific outcomes were expected if the plan were approved.

Each church that will co-operate will, as far as possible, provide its own quarters with such gymnastic appliances as are practicable, and with games, etc., and by this means it is expected that not only will the boys and young men of each parish become better acquainted with and more interested in one another, and an attraction offered to draw outsiders within the influence of the Church, but a friendship and friendly rivalry will be fostered between the several churches through matches and contests in various lines of sport and athletics.¹⁹³

The reaction of the local area churches to the scheme was favourable and several formed athletic associations for participation in this new organization, the Anglican Amateur Athletic Association (AAAA).

Mr. Frank Beard, first president of the AAAA, and local Ottawa sport enthusiast, summarized the value such an innovative program could offer to Anglican youth, while outlining the aims of the Association.

First, to indicate in all members, and particularly the boys, the vital importance of cleanliness in the truest and highest

sense of the word, as it is felt by all that if our boys are clean in their sports they will, in later years, be clean, upright and honest in whatever path of life they may choose to follow. Second, to inculcate in all members, and each parish in the city of Ottawa, and its immediate vicinity of Athletic Associations composed of boys and young men, such associations to have, as far as possible, having due regard to local conditions, a uniform constitution. Third, to promote a friendly rivalry between the several parochial associations by arranging a series of matches in as many branches of sport as possible, thus creating an esprit de corps amongst the young men and boys of each of the clubs belonging to the several churches, which, I fear, has existed but little, if at all, in the past.¹⁹⁴

Seven churches organized athletic associations and were represented during the first year of operation. The first season's sports included baseball, softball (both senior and junior), cross-country running matches, and hockey. The harrier clubs, for cross-country running, completed their schedule in two stages, spring and fall. By late September the harrier clubs were at last contending for the trophies in this sport. Four runs had been completed in the spring, and again due to its larger congregation and ability to draw players from a larger selection, St. Matthews was leading the senior field (15 and over). However, St. John's, a new addition to the AAAA, was running a close second, which helped to keep interest keen, and All Saints led the junior boys (14 and under).¹⁹⁵

The final runs were completed in October, and there was really no doubt that St. Matthews would capture both junior and senior harrier trophies. Keeping a competitive balance among the various clubs posed a problem for the nascent organization. The Canadian Churchman reported most of the details, which showed that member clubs were not overly concerned about the domination of St. Matthews the first year. "In the end, however, St. Matthews boys

have captured both trophies by good leads. In spite of this the other clubs did not look upon the victors as invincible by any means; on the contrary, more than one of their competitors has already announced that they will have a much harder fight to repeat the trick next year."¹⁹⁶ The first year's harrier hunt had proved an enormous success, with eventually nine parochial clubs participating, thirty-two senior and forty-nine junior members, in a total of eight separate runs, spring and fall.¹⁹⁷

The hockey season followed in January and this most popular sport included three levels of competition, senior, intermediate and junior. Interest in the Athletic Association swelled as the competitions proved to be not only entertaining but reasonably competitive as well, with membership estimated at between four and five hundred participants by the end of that year.¹⁹⁸ The mandate of the Athletic Association did not centre entirely around athletic play but involved an investment in time and energy by the membership and officers, to arrange for constitutional and monetary necessities, regular meetings and social functions to suit the season. Nevertheless, co-ordination of such a city-wide undertaking as the Anglican Amateur Athletic Association of Ottawa required all the usual accoutrements of amateur athletics of the day--rules, badges, banquets, trophies, and team photographs. Each member club proudly held its own independent banquet with toasts and songs showing that the social aim of the Association was quite important to the membership as well. Most activities of either a social or legislative nature were dealt with by committees formed to oversee the duties.

required and to report back to the membership of the particular church or to the association itself. There was a constant bustle of committees to keep this large-association running smoothly.¹⁹⁹

Since a long hockey season required considerable equipment and costly rink time, the problem of physically providing these necessities was left to the ingenuity of the members. A favoured form of fund raising was the public variety or minstrel show. For one such undertaking between sixty and seventy boys from the various member clubs rehearsed for weeks to ensure that the vice-regal patronage which had been graciously extended to the upcoming performance at the local Russell Theatre, would not be disappointed. Such high patronage was not new to the residents of the Ottawa area, nevertheless sale of advance tickets was reported brisk owing to this patronage.²⁰⁰

The performance, enhanced by the presence of the Governor-General, was warmly recorded in the pages of the Canadian Churchman.

The entertainment given in the Russell Theatre last Thursday night under vice-regal patronage, for the purpose of raising funds with which to provide hockey rinks for the boys of the Anglican Amateur Athletic Association was a pronounced success, the "house" being one of the largest that ever gathered in the capital to patronize an amateur performance. . . . The Association netted a satisfactory sum for the excellent object it had in view.²⁰¹

The attendance of the Governor-General was also believed to have contributed strongly to the success of the fund raising drive. The athletic season ended with a moonlight excursion up the Ottawa River some thirty miles by steamer.²⁰² By contrast this was a serene ending to a hectic year.

With the opening success of the Ottawa AAAA, topics such as athletics and recreation were discussed more frequently within the Anglican church. The Ottawa St. George's AYP, for example, devoted one of its regular meetings entirely to the subject of the "Christian and Amusement."²⁰³ Within a few years of the formation of the AYP, the Anglican church showed an encouraging degree of enthusiasm for a broader attack on the young boy problem. As one editorial noted, "Intellectual study and improvement, and even amusement in due proportion to higher ends are not out of keeping with the A.Y.P.A. aims,"²⁰⁴ which indicated a loosening of constraints to allow the organization to be more than a handmaiden to the church. The Brotherhood of St. Andrew, under whose initiatives the AAAA was formed, remained an elite organization, claiming only 270 senior and 65 junior chapters in Canada in 1907 with a total membership of 3000 men and boys.²⁰⁵ Obvious, with 400 participants in hockey alone, AAAA teams were drawing membership not only from the Brotherhood of St. Andrew but also from the Anglican Young People's Association or from the congregation at large.

The die seems to have been cast for the AAAA program during that first year of operation. In subsequent years, activities followed much the same pattern of contests, banquets, concerts and the perennial domination of St. Matthews church in most of the events. The 1909 season was typical, the Canadian Churchman again carrying the salient details, but by this point in time the Anglican Amateur Athletic Association was not as newsworthy, though what reporting there was of its activities was done with lingering enthusiasm. The

redoubtable St. Matthews church association won most of the prizes including both the senior and junior harriers and baseball trophies, and the junior hockey trophy. In keeping with the broader view of the social as well as the athletic intent behind these Anglican leagues, the association ended the year with a concert and play, which was reported to have been costumed, staged, and acted by the athletes.²⁰⁶

The date of the capitulation of the organization remains speculative, but probably this organization went the same route as did so many other athletic associations affiliated with the church. As shown by the national surveys carried out by Methodist and Presbyterian churches cooperatively during the period 1913 - 1916, many of the better league teams were encouraged to join city leagues where higher levels of competitiveness could be enjoyed. From the outset, however, the Association was rather loosely organized with individual church teams withdrawing and reentering during the sporting season either because they were not competitive, or they were unable to continue to field a team. The onset of the First World War, too, may have contributed to the decline in interest for the Association. Certainly this was true of young men's Bible and Sunday schools and young people's societies in the Presbyterian church, where the outbreak of the war was reported to have caused a reduction by some 200 clubs and 9000 members.²⁰⁷ However, the Association seemed to have been in decline before that period and it would be easy to overstate the impact of the war on it.²⁰⁸

The Anglican church may have been slower to provide an organized, structured approach to solving the young boy problem, but the church fell behind the efforts of the Brotherhood and supported the AAAA. In fact, the nascent organization received the endorsement of the Bishop of the Diocese and the Clerical Guild.²⁰⁹ During this period all denominations, Anglican, Methodist and Presbyterian, turned their efforts towards the young boy problem and allowed many athletic associations and church athletic clubs to operate within the church.

In the Toronto area a number of church clubs, for example the Methodist Young Men's Association, were available to young Methodists. This association was organized circa 1900 as Mr. R. W. Eaton, Seventh President of the Association, took the Chair for the 1907 season. While Eaton espoused the view that the ten o'clock Sunday morning class "should be the backbone of the Association's work for the development of Christian manhood,"²¹⁰ in practice there was much more going on to encourage sports and amusements which many believed contributed significantly to Christian manhood as well. The executive of the MYMA social committee encouraged crokinole and carpet-ball as suitable activities for young people, but despite unpredictable weather, hockey was the prime interest of Association members during the winter months.

Another Toronto organization, the Brotherhood of St. Paul, of Annette Street Church, was also keenly interested in hockey. This society organized by Rev. T. E. E. Shore in 1902, was particularly aggressive and its 100 or so members enjoyed the benefits of the

work of its various committees including a Christian manhood committee, a skating rink committee, a social committee, an athletic committee, and a literary and debating committee.²¹¹ The skating rink was their most honoured achievement, thanks particularly to the sustained interest of Rev. Shore. This sense of achievement was evident in the reporting of its brief history.

What was once simply a large hole in the ground, beside the church, has since been levelled and fenced in for use as a skating rink. Though it cost about \$1,000 to accomplish this, yet owing to the relentless efforts of Rev. T. E. E. Shore, a former pastor of the church, the undertaking was pushed through to a successful issue.

Anyone visiting the place now would find an up-to-date skating rink in Toronto Junction, lit by hundreds of incandescent electric lights, making the scene a veritable fairyland, yet, withal operated within the pale of the church and Christian influence--no smoking, no swearing, all wholesome.²¹²

At about the time the Brotherhood was first formed, Shore had stated his conviction about the potential value of a more physically active church program: "What a work for the Church to do--the winning of young men from worldly influence, the equipment of their lives for social service, the development of character, mental, moral and muscular."²¹³ Shore's influence can be seen in the Brotherhood's assessment of the value of such an undertaking to the community and to the future.

The Brotherhood operators of the rink felt they could offer their rink as a practical example of an innovative social philosophy.

One thousand people may be seen upon the ice on a Saturday evening. . . .

"There is another rink a little farther down the street," said Mr. Ewens, "and it is fully twice the size of ours. Yet, strange to say, ours gets the patronage. They have a band every

night, while we are closed on Monday and Wednesday, to maintain quietness during club and prayer-meetings. Ours is often black with people, when theirs is scarcely attended by anyone. I believe it is because our rink is operated under Christian influences." 214

Such beliefs would be capable of carrying the social gospel and physical recreation to even greater heights.

Summer athletics were also part of the Brotherhood's curriculum for developing a Christian manhood. The benefit of such activities was deemed invaluable in directing the boy's attention to the church. With the construction of six courts near the church, tennis became the particular interest during the summer and this new facility was kept extremely busy. 215

The Alpine club of Cobourg Methodist Church, Cobourg, Ontario, had similar social and athletic goals in view when it was formed in the fall of 1914. It was organized for the promotion of comradeship among the boys and young men characterized by a high moral tone. To accomplish this, a large part of the program was devoted to athletic activities.

The club has hockey, baseball and basket-ball teams, which play good, clean games. In 1915 they won the Junior Championship of the Inter-Church Base-ball League of Cobourg. . . . 216

There were other benefits besides the laurels of the field. One was that interest by the boys in the activities of the church was sustained, consequently its weekly Thursday Club meetings were well attended. For their diligence, the members were treated to a social every second month to which ladies could be invited. As a direct result of the success of the club, three other church clubs were

formed. Membership was not restricted to those of the Methodist faith; this more ecumenical approach to church-oriented athletics was being adopted by the denominations to further the work of rescuing young Christian men from worldly contaminations.²¹⁷

One observer of boys' club work had an optimistic viewpoint about the potential benefits to accrue from active promotion of boys' clubs within the Anglican church and by the use of physical recreation in particular.

To summarize: The Boys' Club at the Church can form the link between a boy's religion and his everyday life. It can enlist his interest and service for his Church in his youth. In cases of parental neglect it can be made a great force to keep the boy in better ways, and also show him that somebody is interested in him. It can do its bit towards inculcating a respect for religion and help to remove the friction between the social classes. Its physical work gives it a share in raising the physique, not only of the community, but of Canada, and in raising a generation physically fit, and which would be an asset if ever again the call should come to fight for Right and our Empire.

By the training given by games, well and properly played, that Anglo-Saxon spirit of fair play will be inculcated, and your Church Club may be made a centre of patriotism, true sport, fellowship and Christianity among the boys, who will be men to-morrow.²¹⁸

While some church clubs catering to older men and boys preferred a "good lounge with fireplace, deep easy chairs and billiard tables and an adjoining cafeteria," most preferred more active physical recreation.²¹⁹ The St. Luke's Men's Club, Winnipeg, for example, in 1925 was debating the merits of reentering the various Winnipeg leagues for activities which it was particularly interested in, namely bowling and billiards.²²⁰ The junior boys of the church practiced a gymnastic display for a demonstration before hundreds

of interested parents. Under the direction of the Church Gym Director, Garfield White, sixty boys between the ages of 9 and 13 gave one such impressive demonstration.

Items on the programme included physical training, Chinese maze wonders, pyramids, relay races, buck-the-buck, high jumping for senior and junior boys, horse and mat work, boxing, fencing, pole vaulting, the concluding item being a basketball game between the Gym team and the St. Luke's Wolf Cub team, the score ending in a tie, 4-4.²²¹

Gymnasium work was a popular item with the younger boys.

Similar work was carried on in Calgary's recently built St. Stephen's Memorial Hall, which had been constructed to accommodate social gatherings in the large hall contained in the basement, but which needed a few alterations in order to accommodate active sports such as basketball.

Recently the equipment for basketball has been installed and the iron pillars have padded coverings which were made especially for them when any games are in progress. Here large classes of boys and girls meet bi-weekly for their scout, guide and W.A. activities. . . .

Between the Hall and the Church the A.Y.P.A. are erecting tennis courts, which will be ready for this season's play.²²²

By the mid 1920s tennis lawns adjoined most parishes, and gymnasiums were being erected routinely as part of the church structure, their importance recognized as an element in church work.

The Boys' Brigade was another form of organization at the disposal of the church, but one which it did not find particularly appealing. The reasons for rejecting this form of organization are important because they indicate some of the priorities which the church felt in resolving the young boy problem. This form of boys' association was of British origin and stressed military style

discipline. First established in 1883, and primarily a religious movement, it was never widely acclaimed in this country. At its zenith in 1897, only 88 companies were operating within the Dominion.²²³ By 1907 this number had dropped considerably to approximately twenty companies affiliated with the denominations.

Under the influence of a growing nationalism at the turn of the century, and the subsequent promotion of the Strathcona trust, there was a small movement by some churchmen to revive the fading Boys' Brigade, with its military rubric. However, the move was resisted because the style of organization was believed to be inappropriate for the Canadian mentality. This was despite some good features. Although paramilitaristic, the style of the organization was deeply religious as well and demanding strict rules of service. In the British Brigade more so than in the Canadian, sports played an essential role where it was important to maintain a "right attitude towards athletics," and where recreation was to contribute to the disciplining of character."²²⁴ In Canada athletics was not stressed to the same extent partially due to a general lack of concern for athletics in church life and also to the belief that "in Canada the code of honor in sport is shockingly below standard." The program offered instead a number of practical departments including life-saving and first aid, ones which seemed to complement its militaristic flare. To replace athletics one organizer remarked that for "training in mental alertness, as well as providing an excellent system of light gymnastics without any thought of gymnastic, we took up army signalling."²²⁵ The Brigade stressed many

of the activities found favourable to the Boy Scouts including hiking, swimming and of course the all important uniform, a "recognized value in producing the right spirit of discipline."²²⁶ Moreover, those who supported the Brigade and the Boy Scouts alike, sometimes did so to "secure the value of outdoor sport without the feverish excitement of the cruder games."²²⁷

In the final judgment, the Boys' Brigade fell into obscurity on this continent, while the Boy Scouts rose beyond highest expectations. One reviewer of church recreation summed up the history of the Church Lad's Brigade.

This was simply an adaptation of the old volunteer system, a number of cadet corps. There is no doubt, whatever, that in their time they did quite excellent work. Physical drill, military training and discipline are doubtless good things in their way, and may be turned to excellent account. The old brigades failed in that they were too militaristic, they relied more on discipline and training than on seizing on the peculiar characteristics of boyhood, of which more must be said later. It may be mentioned that the movement never spread much outside of England, and it is doubtful if more than a very few units ever were in existence in Canada, and they are certainly not in existence now. We may, indeed, dismiss the subject at once. Excellent in their day they have somewhat outgrown their usefulness; perhaps, merely the fashion has changed, or perhaps something better has been found.²²⁸

An alternative was suggested, the Boy Scouts, an alternative which on more than one occasion was the choice of thinking clergy in Canada due to their preference for something other than organized athletics.

Accompanying the rise of the young people's society and a more systematic approach to the young boy problem was the camping movement. Religious education was teaching that the boy had physical as well as mental and spiritual faculties requiring attention,

and the summer camp provided church boys' workers with an opportunity to address all three aspects simultaneously and in a controlled setting. The camp movement was interrupted by the war, but eventually all denominations established regional or provincial church camps, and the physical activities planned by the churches for boys during their two week holiday were an important part of its progressive work.

Rev. E. W. Forbes, from Dartmouth, Nova Scotia, was an avid boys' worker. In an address written for the Canadian Epworth Era he outlined briefly two major components of his philosophy towards the young boy problem: the boys' club and the boys' summer camp. The boys' club, designed for the improvement of "minds, manners, morals and muscle," had activities centered around the gymnasium and athletics on Sunday afternoons.²²⁹ Concerning the Boys' Brigade, Forbes had this opinion:

As far as drill organizations are concerned, my only actual experience has been in connection with the Boys' Life Brigade. This secures all the disciplinary benefits of drill without incurring the risk of fostering unduly the military spirit. Squad drill without the use of arms, ambulance and stretcher work, and exercise in the saving of life from fire and water comprise the regular work of the brigade, and to these may be added such features as seem desirable for the promotion of its object, which is the development of strong Christian manhood.²³⁰

The other type of activity Forbes recommended for the development of a strong Christian manhood was the summer camp.

Forbes had been in charge of four such camps established by the YMCA thirteen years earlier, circa 1893; and logically, in keeping with the special emphasis the YMCA placed on physical development, sports and games abounded. The plan was rather a simple one--

find competent leaders and assistants, then "enter into the boys' sports and games, win their friendship, seek to exemplify religion before their boy friends in all their intercourse with them, and generally succeed in winning them to Christ."²³¹ Many games were indulged in: baseball, football and hare-and-hounds formed the staple amusements, and to these were added as required, swimming, rowing, sailing and tug-of-war. The motto of the camp was "Remember Jesus Christ."²³² Camp activities abounded but Forbes' analysis of their social worth was noticeably absent of any social gospel rhetoric at this early date. But with their tenaciously ordered routine, such camps were to become commonplace for the denominations.

One such example was the Anglican church camp at Gamesbridge, Ontario, a property purchased along Lake Simco in 1910. This camp was established, as was the case with all denominational camps, to serve the needs of the various boy's choirs, Sunday school associations, clubs and Brotherhoods of the denomination. Their purpose was clear as shown by the captions addressing the topic of church camps in denominational periodical literature. They were providing a solution to the problem of summer time vacation for youngsters: "Practical christianity in the Summertime."²³³

The routine at such camps was hardly unrestrained: up at six thirty, rising exercises, a quick dip and then off to breakfast. Next, Bible study in the early morning followed by swimming or games for an hour, and again for two hours in late afternoon before supper, or this time was taken up by a boating, walking or driving excursion. Interspersed were the usual inspections, and of course,

no tobacco was allowed at camp, not even by visitors. Lights out was at nine thirty.²³⁴

Rev. J. E. Gibson was captain of the camp and under his direction there were plenty of athletic activities for the young. For boys under twelve the activities included fifty yard dash, wheelbarrow race, standing broad jump, and three-legged race, and the same for boys under fifteen, with the dash being 100 yards. Senior boys could try the challenging 200 yard race. Besides football (probably soccer) and baseball, boxing was encouraged for Anglican youth. In the English tradition, this was seen as a manly activity and a contributor to strong character if held under careful control, although the more evangelical denominations (especially Presbyterian) denounced boxing, because it did not meet the test of moral standards applied to amusements.²³⁶

Supporters of the camping movement and the church's involvement in it sought specific benefits of athletic activity.

Under the ideal leadership [understood to be the church], the true fundamentals of athletic contests and different games are presented. Here for the first time some of the boys are taught what team work and team play means. It is not a direct teaching, but they realized that if their team is to win, they must assist and co-operate with the other fellow. This is one of the important lessons necessary in every parish, and when it is inculcated in the boy at camp, it certainly will make him a better individual in his parish.²³⁷

The higher purposes of such activities were often repeated. There was a place for sports and games within this setting, but the social gospel message, that to play may be as important as to pray, was submerged.

At the 1925 annual Brotherhood of St. Andrew convention held in Winnipeg, A. R. Shea-Butcher, representative of the GBRE Boys' Work Council outlined an Anglican camp policy which showed that in some quarters the social gospel passion was not subsiding. "I have called it the 'New Attitude.' Perhaps I should have said 'The Awakening' of the Church to a realization of the importance of taking a more active interest in the every-day life of her boys."²³⁸ Shea-Butcher understood the reasons which helped to bring about this awakening. Most of those he cited were by now a generation old: the loss of young manhood from the front ranks of the church, especially those aged 14 - 20; the gradual recognition that the contemporary man demands that his religion be a part of his life, and the belief that future generations would desire an even closer harmony; the wider acceptance by the church that it has a social responsibility as well as a gospel to proclaim; and the need for a balanced program in order to produce desired national efficiency. Shea-Butcher recommended the CSET program, supplemented of course by the use of a liberal camp policy.²³⁹

The desire of social gossellers to serve the impulse for a more vigorous social life within the diverse clubs, brotherhoods and athletic associations drew a mixed response from the denominations. The more evangelical churches, the Methodist and Presbyterian, supported the early involvement with structured weekday programming within the church in order to provide a suitable alternative for young boys. While the evangelical commitment dictated more direct involvement, this did not necessarily mean a penchant for sports and

games, particularly within the Presbyterian church which held more stubbornly to its traditional assessment that "there is a tendency at present to devote altogether too much time to amusements on the part of many young people."²⁴⁰ Methodists and Anglicans were more philosophically able to accept a legitimate place for sports and games. Anglicans, in particular, being familiar with British stories of "muscular Christianity," accepted athletic games as a part of normal adolescent development, although they were slow to organize denominational youth programs. Methodist clerics proved a helpful clergy by not only giving spiritual support to Methodist athletic endeavours but also by providing a fair measure of practical initiative as well.

Canadian Standard Efficiency Training

All denominations were instrumental in molding the CSET program first developed by the YMCA and offered to the various provincial Sunday school associations for their consideration. The program was strongly recommended to Presbyterian teachers and boy leaders not only in Sabbath schools, but within young people's societies generally.²⁴¹ The response was modestly favourable. By 1923, 413 CSET programs were reported in operation in Sunday schools alone, excluding those using a partial program.²⁴² If the ideal of the denomination was a balanced program, then the CSET met at least basic requirements.

This program focused on the message in Luke 2:52, that Jesus increased in wisdom and in stature and in favour with God and man.

Thus a four-fold program emerged from this ideal life of Christ which stressed these four essential aspects of life: the intellectual, the physical, the religious, and Christian service. According to Horne, who assisted in developing the format, associating the spiritual with the other aspects of the program (including the physical) was integral to its purpose.

Now each aspect of this four-fold life should be related to God. When so related, it becomes spiritual as Paul clearly teaches regarding the physical side of our nature in Romans 12:1-2. "Present your bodies a living sacrifice, holy acceptable to God, which is your spiritual service." When all sides of human life are thus related to God, we have the spiritual man complete in all his being.²⁴³

Standardized symmetry was believed to be the best remedy for adolescent "quirkiness" and tests and charts were devised in all four quadrants of the plan, to even out unbalanced adolescent development.²⁴⁴

The social ambition behind the rationale for the program was evident in the standard requirements. For the intellectual standard, career plans, sex education, public speaking, home reading, educational lectures, educational trips and collections, observation and woodcraft, outlined the basic topics of concern. The religious standard naturally included church and Sunday school attendance, morning watch or daily Bible study, history of religion, and cultural objectives such as music, poetry, art and natural history. The service standard concentrated on the boy in relation to his community and his country, with a wide variety of objectives ranging from increased membership in church organizations, to the three C's campaign--clean speech, clean sports, clean habits. It aimed at

personal and community service, and required the study of heroes of church service and study of the government of the nation.²⁴⁵ Its appeal to the denominations according to McNeill, in his history of the Presbyterian church, was that it gave a central place to religion and that it "lacked the military emphasis of some rival organizations."²⁴⁶ C. A. Myers of the Presbyterian Sabbath School Board was largely responsible for ensuring that the Presbyterian point of view was considered during the various reviews and editions of the Booklet.

The physical standard was as comprehensive. Its rationale was given careful consideration as well. New Testament 1 Corinthians 6:19-20 was the watchword for this aspect of complete development: "Know ye not that your bodies are the temples of the Holy Spirit? Glorify God, therefore, in your body." This theme was elaborated upon in the sixth edition of the Tests.

The basis of all development is physical. The muscles are the instruments of the intellect, the feelings and the will. Ninety-five per cent. of all interests find physical expression. Seventy-five per cent. of the boy gangs are organized for physical activity. Self-control depends upon the proper interaction of nerves and muscles. Adolescence is the age of nerve and muscle education. Flabby muscled boys become pliant men who only talk. Well-developed boys become men who will say and act and produce results. A strong, healthy body inhibits wrong tendencies. A physical weakling is apt to be selfish. Physical training should, therefore, be encouraged, not alone for the sake of the body which is "to-day grass and to-morrow is cast into the oven," but for the sake of the soul. We must have regard to the body because it is the instrument of the soul.²⁴⁷

Drawing from the literature of adolescence, there was a serious attempt to moralize about the virtues of right behaviour and the physical and social consequences of ignoring these laws. The church

believed that such a program of physical development should have specific goals in mind, goals which might seem as important as the attainment of physical health itself. The text continued.

The ideal for the body is therefore the ideal of "Health," and health can only be attained by conformity to God's laws for the body-- . . . He avoided the extremes both of Asceticism, i.e., neglecting the body, and of Athleticism, i.e., giving the body undue attention as an end in itself--two common ideals; but rather exemplified the ideal of health, or fully developed manhood on the physical side.²⁴⁸

From such a perspective, sports and games would at best be only a part of a broader program of physical recreation.

The C.S.E.T. Manual for Tuxis Boys elaborated on the spiritual necessity for bodily health, but in a more literary style. Concerning the physical program, it began, "It is a fine thing to be interested in all forms of exercise which will result in a ruddy cheek, clear eye and a strong, flexible voice. Athletics and games have an undoubted and important place in furnishing healthful exercise and in providing a wholesome outlet for the full, free energy of youth." Considering the purpose of such games and athletics, and the Christian message of honoring the body, the Manual elaborated further:

Enough has been said to show that we have no right to despise the body. It has its rightful and important place as one of the four phases of our nature. If we set as our final goal the mental and moral gains, which we may achieve through good health and well developed muscles we shall reap a double reward for our efforts.²⁴⁹

The Manual emphasized and promoted the objective that boys should emulate Jesus, and his way of life, one characterized by living in the open air and close to nature.²⁵⁰

The physical program changed very little during the period from 1914 when the Sunday school commissions became involved, until 1925. The prescribed format for the physical standard included eight headings originally: Health Education, Campcraft, Team Games, Group Games, Swimming, Running, Jumping and Throwing, the latter three being grouped under the heading "athletics" in 1922. The structured program operated on five basic principles which gave strength to the format. The first principle was that of grouping, and eight grades or levels were commonly used--Grade 1, for 12 or 13 year olds, up to Grade 8, for 20 years olds. In practice these were further grouped to encourage use of the "spontaneous gang" concept and were prescribed according to specific achievement levels.²⁵¹

The second principle sought to utilize the natural group instinct for self government. "The organized Sunday School class with week-day activities is intended to satisfy this natural demand. The boy will be loyal to only one organization, hence the importance of relating all his activities to the Sunday School Class."²⁵² The third principle was that of masculine Christian leadership. Believing that "character is caught, not taught," this ideal stressed the value of hero-worship during the "dangerous habit-forming period of life."²⁵³

A fourth guide was the principle of progressive development. Each test for the individual grades was progressive in its degree of difficulty or commitment. The hope was that at the end this would give the boy a "Christian view of God and the world which should inspire within him an abiding passion for personal participation in

the work of the Kingdom."²⁵⁴ The last principle supported all-around development. Concerning the specialist, the example of the athlete was a logical choice.

Just as the star athlete who inspires us to develop strong, healthy bodies wields a greater influence if he has a trained mind, a clean character and an unselfish disposition, so the boy who would develop outstanding characteristics in any one of the mental, physical, social or spiritual realms should back it up by a sufficient development in the other three.²⁵⁵

These principles were exemplified in all activities and in discussions regarding the physical standard. There was also a heavy reliance on imported books and pamphlets from American sources, representing the best literature by prominent American physical educators, doctors, educators, and health specialists.

Under the physical standard the first sub-heading, health education, rested on the belief that good health was essential to clean living and clear thinking. During the six month period through which observations were to be made in order to pass this standard, the boy was guided to digest such classics as Hutchinson's Exercise and Health, Muller's My System, Gulick's Efficient Life and Physical Education by Muscular Exercise, Eggleston's Rural Hygiene, and Rational Living by King. The various grades required specific undertakings to meet minimum requirements. Typical examples included such useful activities as attending practical talks on hygiene, the value of bathing, effects of alcohol and tobacco, and the value of a medical examination. The highest grade level, 8, was required to lead a group of boys in health education.²⁵⁶ Prescribed practical requirements necessitated observance of fixed hours for rising and

retiring, drinking specified amounts of water, and daily teeth cleaning, bathing, bowel movements and physical exercise. Health tests were also requirements. Endurance tests in pull ups, rope climbing, cross-country running or paper chases, and one-mile walks would help the mentor, as the boy leader was called, assess whether or not the boy was living a healthful life, if the general requirements of good posture, a medical examination and the correction of remediable physical defects were insufficient.²⁵⁷

Campcraft was important to the program because it was understood that "when boys are 'in God's out-of-doors' with congenial companions, they are very susceptible to spiritual influences. A week or ten days with his little group of boys 'at camp,' will give the earnest Mentor, the finest opportunity to get at the very heart of the boys and inspire them to higher ideals of life and conduct."²⁵⁸

The recommended literature included Thompson-Seton's The Book of Woodcraft, The Boy Scout Manual, Gibson's Camping for Boys, etc., which prepared the young boys to better understand the practical talks which were a part of the regimen and included such items as campcraft, picking a site, suitable foods, tent making, etc.²⁵⁹

Practical requirements ensured this newly learned knowledge was applied.

The Team Games standard exemplified the thinking of the times towards "muscular Christianity" and the importance of team games, when properly handled, in the development of an upright character. The Canadian Standard Efficiency Tests booklet stressed:

The altruistic, or "help the other fellow" spirit is strongly developed through team play. As a boy plays so will he live. Play is God's way of teaching him how to live with others. While even unsupervised play may develop many splendid qualities, it is only when a boy's play is guided by a Christian young man who encourages honesty and uprightness that it becomes one of the greatest of all agencies for character development.²⁶⁰

And its most popular myths, carefully built up over the years, were not to be denied. "Every TUXIS BOY who plays the games of this Program in the right way is helping to win the great 'Waterloo' of his life some day later on."²⁶¹ For reference to the rules, skill and strategy associated with team games, the boy was directed to read Curtis' Play and Recreation in the Open Country, The Official Handbook of the Athletic League of the Y.M.C.A. of Canada, and books on the various team games published by the Spalding Company.²⁶²

The tests for Team Games involved two parts. First was the requirement that all grades attend a lecture on the "Character Building Value of Team Games" and the oldest boys were required to give a talk on this subject. The other requirement was that boys participate in a total of fifteen team games (in at least three sports) on separate days during the year. The preferred choices were baseball, indoor baseball, lacrosse, hockey, playground ball, rugby, soccer (specified as Association football), or cricket,²⁶³ although in practice other popular sports were substituted.²⁶⁴ Young sportsmen who displayed self-control, gentlemanly conduct and good spirit, might qualify for the team games badge.²⁶⁵

Group games for children were believed to possess similar character-forming qualities as team games. They were less organized and were classified as being occasional, unscheduled, spontaneous,

and often without regard for the number of players. Approved references included Bancroft's Games for the Playground, Home, School and Gymnasium, and Chesley's Indoor and Outdoor Games. No less than forty-one games were recommended of which any ten were part of the test in this category under the Physical Standard.²⁶⁶

Swimming was considered essential in the complete physical program of the recruit because knowledge of swimming was believed to give one self poise and a quiet personal assurance, very often the essential ingredients of a gentleman.²⁶⁷ The books recommended for reading included Corsan's At Home in the Water, and the Manual of the Royal Life Saving Society. The tests associated with swimming ranged from grade 1 in which the requirement was to swim 25 yards free style and 25 yards on the back, to Grade 7 which required the performer to swim 225 yards free style and demonstrate three methods of release and rescue with a tow of no less than 20 yards with each method of life-saving.²⁶⁸

Athletics, which was originally considered under separate headings of running, jumping and throwing was thought of in much the same vein as team games, possessing inherent character building qualities. The Tests booklet reiterated this point clearly.

The character building influence of wisely conducted athletics is far reaching. Athletic events are thoroughly democratic. They teach self control, and tend to keep one calm when others are excited and alarmed. They help to establish habits of temperance and develop honor, sincerity, honest effort, skills, endurance, courage, perseverance, self-reliance, and other clean-cut manly attributes and ideals.²⁶⁹

But caution was recommended because these worthy principles were often not put into practice unless conscious efforts were made to

incorporate them.

The Mentor was advised that he should encourage all boys to train for the athletic events so that their performance for official tests was creditable.²⁷⁰ To encourage training, "National Athletic Meets" were organized by the National Boys' Work Board, affiliated with the Religious Education Council of Canada since 1917, which represented the cooperating churches and the YMCA.²⁷¹ Requirements for meet participation were that a registrant must be an initiated member of a registered CSET group and have attended a minimum number of midweek and Sunday school sessions in order to qualify.²⁷² Training for these athletic contests was mandatory for success, and hints for training were not uncommon.²⁷³

The Mentor was advised to challenge every boy to strive for his potential, but the Mentors' Manual suggested that competitions within Tuxis or Trail Rangers be organized on a group basis so that the total score would count and the backward boy could feel he had made a contribution.²⁷⁴ Perhaps to appease the church, the plan downplayed competitiveness and instead stressed health. "An athlete he may never be and, for effective service, need not be, but the genuine interest in all that concern his [Mentor's] athletic boys will win their loyalty and fellowship."²⁷⁵ That the creators of the physical standard were not particularly concerned with athletic excellence is shown by the absence of any recommended literature concerning running or throwing technique. Running events included the 60 yard potato race, outdoor sprints, which were prescribed because of the variation in the size of indoor tracks, standing

broad jump, running high jump and the standing hop, step and jump. The throwing component of the athletic tests included throwing for distance, throwing at a target, and pull ups and putting the shot, which were included specifically for upper body and arm development.²⁷⁶ Most of these running and throwing events were included in the National Athletic contests.

The majority of these events were classed by weight category and standards set for each. The most commonly used weight classifications were: 80 pounds and under, 81-95 pounds, 96-110 pounds, 111-125 pounds, and unlimited above 125 pounds. The category of sprints provides a good example of the level of attainment expected.

WEIGHT	DISTANCE	STANDARD TIME
80 pounds	50 yards	7 2/5 seconds
95 pounds	75 yards	10 2/5 seconds
110 pounds	100 yards	13 2/5 seconds
125 pounds	100 yards	12 2/5 seconds
unlimited	100 yards	11 2/5 seconds

Other components such as pull ups required a minimum performance to meet the standard. For example, in the five weight categories the minimum standards were 3, 4, 6, 8 and 10 pull ups respectively.²⁷⁷ However, an adequate performance on any individual test probably required some practice for the average Sunday school participant, but diligent practice for an above average score.

The CSET program offered the denominations the opportunity to become involved in a structured program suitable for young people's societies in an area of life which they traditionally believed was best left to the discretion of the individual. Although some would

claim that it failed to catch on in Sunday school and proved hopelessly cumbersome, trying to encompass as it did all aspects of adolescent development,²⁷⁸ in many other ways it represented success and a change in attitudes. During the years 1920 and 1921 the program was turned over entirely to the denominational advisory boards and the Religious Educational Council of Canada due to the inability of fund raising drives by the YMCA to support the program financially.²⁷⁹ But at the same time the denominations were strengthening their Sunday school weekday activity programs and later accepted this ready-made boys program as the basis for Trail Rangers (12-14 years) and Tuxis (15-18 years) programs, interdenominational programs which developed under the auspices of the Religious Education Council of Canada.

Despite the fact that in absolute numbers the program reached only a portion of protestant Christian youth, within the churches there was a feeling that it was eminently successful, and the denominations officially espoused no other view than that it should continue to develop as part of the basic Sunday school program. During the period, 1918 - 1921, gains were heralded in the promotion of CSET with upwards of 25,000 Tuxis and Trail Rangers potentially benefitting from this structured program.²⁸⁰

But the CSET program is significant far beyond what these figures might initially suggest. Because it gained official church support, the program challenged the church to become more practically involved with youth and tested its commitment to the social message of the social gospel which gave physical recreation a legitimate

existence within the church. Because it provided a controlled program where the opportunities for boyish behaviour were severely restricted, the program encouraged the church to approve recreational and athletic activities under its direct aegis. Furthermore, through the efforts of many clergy in the various Sunday school, Boys' Work and Social Service Departments, Councils and Boards, CSET provided the church with the earlier opportunity to develop weekday programming. For all its failings CSET still remained one bright hope of the denominations for attracting the worldly boy's favour.

Young People's Associations

Social and recreative activities had been diverted because of the war. Some societies were disbanded, but with a return to a state of normalcy the various executive bodies of young people's organizations once again began to flourish with activity. Things were quickly getting back in order, ~~in~~ the speed with which athletic committees were being reestablished was an indicator. The Toronto Council of the AYPAs was one such organization, representing nearly twenty-five local branches in the Toronto area, ready to begin business as usual. Very soon after the war there were approximately 1000 AYPAs members represented by the Council, and by 1922 more than 2000 members were registered.²⁸¹ Ranks had been doubled in less than four years.

The Anglican General Synod had endorsed the purpose of the AYPAs since its inception in 1902. Approved literature of the AYPAs published after the war reiterated the social ambitions of the

association very clearly. This was not too different from what was envisioned by its creators two decades earlier. The emphasis of the church on the social aspect of its mission was still characterized as cautious.

Social evenings should be devised to exemplify the principle of "fellowship." Refreshments may be desirable, but they are not essential. A social evening should give opportunity for becoming better acquainted, for introducing strangers, for cultivation of the art of conversation, and for games and amusements.²⁸²

Concerning planning for individual sessions, it was recommended that:

The programme (previously planned) should show variety and wholesome entertainment. Remember A.Y.P.A. meetings are not simply to amuse. Let our meetings be bright, but not light. Sociability does not mean frivolity.²⁸³

But in the interim, substantial changes had taken place. In many churches, sport and physical recreation had become a legitimate activity; in others it was tolerated. But by and large the experience of the church in this area of life had been successful: young people's organizations had realigned the interest of many young boys to the church; young people's societies and brotherhoods through social and athletic programs, camping excursions and CSET programs, had shown the church firsthand that they could be conducted in an orderly and edifying manner. But the wartime reconstruction period was well underway and many young people's organizations were anxious to pick up where they had left off.

The first interest of the sports committee of the Council was tennis. A committee to arrange the summer program was appointed by the May, 1920 meeting of the Council to set schedules for all interested branches. Eight branches responded affirmatively to the

call for participants. The events offered included ladies singles, gents singles, ladies doubles, gents doubles, and mixed doubles, but each player was to enter only one event.²⁸⁴ Local rules were adopted as well, which stated that:

All branches entering the League must have an AYPa Tennis Club and all players must be AYPa members. Visiting team to provide balls. Neutral member to act as umpire supplied by visiting team. Each branch entering the league is asked to appoint one member to act on a committee to draw up schedules, arrange umpires, etc. Spaldings Rules to be used. Any branch failing to keep appointment loses by default. The umpire's decision is final.²⁸⁵

Tennis proved so popular that the sports committee had difficulty arranging satisfactory schedules for the sport, as well as attend to its other duties. Perhaps it was because tennis encouraged a mixing of the sexes, but by the following year there were so many participants that a separate tennis committee was required to control all matters relating to interbranch tournaments. The next season's play did not start smoothly because the necessary permits to use city courts were not available on time.²⁸⁶ But after a delayed start, the game of tennis again proved popular with AYPa members.

Sports such as tennis were not supported evenly by the participating branches and this led to a number of the tennis cups being retained permanently, for example, by St. Anne's, after successive wins at this "gentlemanly" game.²⁸⁷ The St. Edmund's AYPa club joined another interchurch league, probably for reasons of better competition and was reported doing well.²⁸⁸ Unbalanced competition seemed to be a problem as well in baseball because St. Anne's had also captured both boys and girls softball trophies.

Circumstances seemed to be reminiscent of the Ottawa AAAA in this regard.

The idea to establish an AYPAs baseball league was first brought before the sports committee in the early spring of 1921. However, initial efforts did not succeed because, the executive claimed, the initiative had begun too late. Again there was direct competition with the established interchurch league operating in the city, and enthusiasts were encouraged to join that league but before the cutoff date of April 15th.²⁸⁹ By the following spring, 1924, a contingent of 22 teams, 11 men and 11 ladies, was actively demonstrating the popularity of this sport and paying \$10 per team per season to support it.²⁹⁰ So popular in fact was baseball that three divisions were needed to organize the schedule.

By the spring of the next season interest was continuing to escalate with upwards of thirty entries to organize and control. The sports committee was hard pressed to keep up with the pace, and finally it was "decided to affiliate with the T.A.S.B. League."²⁹¹ The idea to affiliate with the Toronto Amateur Soft Ball League did not appear to materialize as the committee remained actively involved in the sport. Subsequent problems related more to off the field activities as there were numerous warnings against the use of playing non-paid-up members.²⁹² Noticeably, as the popularity of such sports as baseball and tennis spread, the administrative capabilities of the AYPAs were put to the test.

The sport of baseball also required the AYPAs to brush with the more worldly aspects of sport, for example, gate receipts. The

issue was first raised about the time that the League was considering entering the TASBL. The Committee immediately asked for a ruling on the association's sports rules regarding gate receipts. The topic was discussed with interest. A recommendation emerged, "That the executive recommend to the Local Council that the branches be allowed to make collections at their own discretion." A second one followed immediately thereafter, with the hope of reversing the former recommendation: "That the Local Council recommend to the branches that no collections are to be taken up at their games."²⁹³ This recommendation was defeated.

If the tension created by some sports broke the fragile image that these communicants were totally without worldly concerns, scenes at the many social picnics helped to cement the pieces back together. Picnics were well known for their sociability and they proved all the more popular when complemented by varied recreational and athletic programs. Even on short notice, the sports committee could expect more than seven hundred enthusiastic picnickers if fine weather were in the forecast. The administration of the picnic customarily required that the ladies provide refreshments and the men contribute fifty cents. Games started at three o'clock sharp and the races might include either a Blind Fold Race or a Soda Biscuit Race.²⁹⁴ Other activities included outdoor and indoor baseball, boating, bathing and park amusements too if the picnic were held at the local amusement centre at Grimsby Beach.²⁹⁵

The favourite winter sport, hockey, could easily shatter the myth again. There seemed to be always a large number of willing

participants, and administrative difficulties were compounded by the unpredictability of natural ice and the more aggressive nature of the sport. There had been some concern developing over the previous few years about all three major sports, with problems ranging from purely administrative complaints such as unpaid dues, to the quality of play itself including unbalanced competition and the use of non-members. The fact that the executive of the AYPa had to issue a warning against the stealing of equipment during matches only added to the administrative dilemma. There were financial problems as well. Money was not always available to purchase ice time during warm weather when outdoor rinks were unusable.²⁹⁶ The committee was often in search of a philanthropist.

A special committee was convened in the late fall of 1922 to deal with sports in the AYPa, and its report received clause by clause examination by a committee of the whole. Subsequently, a copy of the report, which contained many helpful suggestions for future managers of sports, was sent to each branch within the AYPa.²⁹⁷ The new year brought notice that the secretary of the athletics committee was resigning after heated debates over how to best organize athletic sports. After announcement of the resignation of the secretary, the sports committee moved and carried a motion announcing, "in view of the unorganized state of the Athletic Committee and the lateness of the hockey season, that the Local Council Hockey League should not be run this year."²⁹⁸ Other more serious moves were to follow. The chairman of the athletic committee was included on the executive as an added precaution in order to

keep them better informed of developments. Additionally, the interim secretary was to send a mailing list of members to the executive with a recommendation that any person taking part in sport must be a paid up member, at least two months before receiving a card giving permission to enter the league.²⁹⁹ The AYPAs executive intended to closely supervise the athletic program to discourage problems before the local diocese put a stop to the problem altogether.

By September, with reminders of winter weather, the call was sent out to discuss once again the question of whether or not the AYPAs could successfully organize its hockey league. It went on the agenda for an October meeting with the recommendation that,

Owing to conditions prevailing in past years [i.e. poor organization and conduct] in regard to Hockey Leagues formed by A.Y.P.A. branches, the Executive recommend that there be no A.Y.P.A. Hockey League formed under the auspices of the Local Council the coming season.³⁰⁰

At the meeting the recommendation carried and although the details behind making such a decision are not clear, it was obvious by the tenor of the meeting that the executive was embarrassed at the continued lack of good hockey organization. Perhaps the committee was not capable of organizing this well patronized sport on a part time basis. Consequently, another special committee was formed to salvage the reputation of the AYPAs and to investigate the possibility of returning hockey to the roster. Stringent rules and regulations to govern hockey were proposed by the chairman of the special committee to make the sport more acceptable, with the issue to be finally settled by the end of October or early November. In the

fall of 1924 the decision was made to abandon it.

Moved by Wood, seconded by Mr. Bond that AYPAs hockey be abandoned this year, but would suggest that any branch that would like to play to become affiliated with some local hockey league--carried. Mr. W. E. Ross (St. Anne's) is willing to act pro tem for those who would like to participate in hockey.³⁰¹

The popularity of hockey was a factor leading to its downfall because the AYPAs proved unable to effectively organize and control so many teams. The athletic program in general was approved, at least in principle, by the majority of the lay executive of the Association and by the Anglican clergy a little further in the background. At the Dominion conference of the AYPAs held at St. Catharines, Ontario, from October 17-19, 1922, Archdeacon McElheran, Winnipeg, responded to the question, "What is the broad outlook of the AYPAs?" His response showed some of the idealism which the social gospel had held out for its youthful, child-centered organizations such as the AYPAs.

Every man in every Church and every woman must be brought into touch with the vital, throbbing life [sic] of this [sic] young people's movement--perfect, that is to say fully developed, full-orbed Christians developed soundly on physical lines, trained thoroughly in intellectual matters and well grounded in spiritual things, knowing Christ and the power of His resurrection, keeping their bodies as temples of the Holy Ghost, yielding their [sic] lives as a willing sacrifice in His glorious service, applying the ideals and principles of their Church's creed to the prosaic programme of their daily life.³⁰²

Sports and games were becoming more commonplace in the daily lives of Canadians and in the programs of young people's societies.

The athletic program of the Local Council had its detractors as well. While Archdeacon McElheran was preparing his eulogy on the potential inherent in the Association, one lay member was publicly presenting the opposite opinion. The controversy arose when one of

the lay members of the Local Council published his views concerning the AYPa in the Canadian Churchman in the early fall of 1921, and wished further to substantiate his views before the executive. These views were that the AYPa was not living up to its motto and was only incidentally considering Christ in its program. He gave his evidence:

1. That the programmes of both branches and Council were not consistent with the motto, as too much time and discussion were given to sports, socials, etc.
2. That the Council was holding forth as a form of Christian service work in which Christ's name was never mentioned [referring to the York Community Club].
3. That at the annual dinner Christ was virtually forgotten. The time was devoted to the discussion of sports, camp, etc. and prayers neither opened nor closed the event.³⁰³

These were charges which touched the very heart of the athletic program of the AYPa and ones too serious to be ignored by the executive. Considering the rift of complaints and uncertainties associated with the running of the major sports, the executive was, however, not in a good position to push the issue too far. They responded out of deference to the successes of their athletic and social programs, saying:

That, as our record is a sufficient answer to all criticisms levelled at the A.Y.P.A., as an inspection of the work of the York Community Club and its accomplishments will prove that it is for Christianity and humanity, as the athletic activities have justified their entrance into the A.Y.P.A., and, as the devoted lives of members who have been brought into the Church through the A.Y.P.A. are testimonials, we the Executive recommend that no controversy be held.³⁰⁴

The issue was left to rest but a less than astute observer might have noticed that, following the charges, subsequent executive meeting minutes faithfully recorded that meetings opened and closed with

prayer, an activity virtually absent before.

The Local Chapter of the AYP A had shown that indeed its constituent members were keenly interested in sports and games of the most usual variety. In particular, tennis, baseball and hockey enjoyed greatest favour and the executive made every effort to organize these for the benefit of the membership, and to ensure that they would be carried out in a manner befitting high Christian standards. There were detractors, but programs were given cautious approval by the church hierarchy provided high ideals could be maintained. But the committees formed to oversee the various activities proved incapable of controlling the members they sought to organize. The outcome was less than expected, the most critical charge being the use of non-member players to boost the roster; and less frequent but highly visible control problems, including stealing. If such problems were to be found under Christian supervision, was this then a harbinger of what could be expected under more worldly circumstances and, from the perspective of the church, less than ideal circumstances in the public sports arena.

In contrast to the regimen of other structured church programs, AYP A athletics demonstrated the uncertainty of the outside world, and thereby, without doubt, reinforced the traditional preference of the church for low organized activities. In these declining years of the social gospel, there was little ambition left in the church to call forth further efforts to organize social activities.

Physical Education and Christian Nationalism

The legacy of the Victorian nineteenth century, concluded Moir, was an "unprecedented mixture of piety and patriotism,"³⁰⁵ forces which were to continue to be felt in Canadian society upon entering into the new era of practical Christianity. Methodism in particular felt most strongly this nationalistic impulse, but the sentiment was far broader than any denomination. All denominations were deeply concerned with it because of their common aims: an efficient work force, a moral citizenry and a visible loyalty, in this case to both church and state. The Presbyterian Record made the point quite clear while dealing with its favourite topic, the Sabbath in Canada: "Alike on grounds of patriotism and religion, which ultimately never contradict, we are convinced that this day has a worth for man. . . ."³⁰⁶ In general the denominations included this nationalism, in the guise of citizenship or service, as a prominent feature of the social program of their leagues, guilds and associations--a program which aimed at more than an understanding of its ideals, but also towards practical achievements.

Suggestions as to how such ideals of citizenship could be put into Christian practice, providing a clearer definition of what good citizenship as an Epworth League member might entail, were cordially presented by the Methodist Church to league members. Practical considerations were outlined in the Canadian Epworth Era, the official organ of the League. The rules were simple: "keep to the practical affairs of everyday life, with its varying needs in

your community, and so make it count in the building of a greater Canada." Six headings seemed adequate to list some good examples for the leaguer: patriotism, municipal politics, temperance and prohibition, moral reform, athletics, and general.³⁰⁷

Under the heading, patriotism, the leaguer might be expected to organize a patriotic glee club or orchestra, study Canadian scenery, draw maps of the local area and its environs, organize a tree-planting or clean-up campaign, study biographies of great Canadians, or plan a banquet for young boys and men with speakers giving enthusiastic, patriotic addresses. For the study of municipal politics, organizing community or play clubs was a suggestion, as well as community surveys, educational classes for foreigners, and mock councils to name but a few. Temperance involved the study of the tobacco and liquor industries and issues relating to the morality of their use. Moral reform issues also included anti-cigarette campaigns, and community hygiene, sanitation, and community health talks, often followed up by questionnaires and interviews. And for athletics the following was suggested:

1. Organize a tennis, baseball, croquet, basketball, hockey or snowshoe club.
2. Plan a community play day, to include every man, woman and child. Have an occasional "paper chase" among the younger people.
3. Physical games in which no apparatus is needed. (Use "Indoor and Outdoor games," by Chesley, 10¢).
4. Varied calisthenic exercises. Plan for occasional League "tramps." Keep the eyes open while the limbs are active. Then talk about what you have seen.
5. A practical talk by a Christian physician on the value of physical training.³⁰⁸

These practical considerations were blended with a good deal of

idealism as well.

The range of interest of the church was greater than sports and games and included more formal or institutionalized forms of physical recreation common during the period, including drill, physical training or physical culture, since these terms were often used interchangeably, and physical education, meaning physical training within the educational setting or militia corps. Moir has pointed out the legacy of piety and patriotism which characterized nineteenth-century protestantism, and traditionally the church had maintained slight interest in institutionalized forms of physical recreation to accomplish its religious and patriotic aims. National fervour was building prior to the First World War, but with it came greater national controversy over production efficiency, health and fitness. This legacy, of piety and patriotism, was epitomized in James L. Hughes, Toronto School Inspector, and a regular contributor to Methodist journalism. "The development of patriotic feeling is one of the definite aims of school work in Toronto schools. On 'Empire Day' . . . the annual parade and review of the drill battalions takes place . . .,"³⁰⁹ he remarked. The church had its equivalent, "Patriotic Sunday," which by 1912 was a regular feature in the denominations, an outgrowth of intensified nationalism prior to the war. The Presbyterian Department of Social Service and Evangelism outlined the growth of this practice for the General Assembly in 1912.

Your Board is pleased to be able to report that Patriotic Sunday, namely, the Sunday nearest to the national birthday, is coming to be observed as an institution of Church life. It has

reason to believe that the preaching of Christian patriotism in one way or another was more general in the Churches and Sabbath Schools of the Church in 1911 than in any previous year, and it hopes that more and more advantage will be taken of this golden opportunity to promote the highest type of citizenship.

Patriotic Sunday falls this year on the 30th of June. Your Board, in co-operation with the Sabbath Schools' Committee, has arranged for the subject of Citizenship to be taken up in all the Sabbath Schools and among the Young People's Societies of the Churches, and the Rev. D. C. MacGregor, Associate Secretary, has prepared, at the request of the Board, a special pamphlet on the subject of "Good Citizenship--its Ideals, its Basic and its Duties."³¹⁰

With the advent of war, this modest growth of national patriotism swelled until it appeared boundless.

Although drill, physical training, and physical education came more to dominate the thinking of the church, especially relating to war and national preparedness, sports and games, per se, were not entirely without national import. The games and sports of youth reflected quite directly on the national character. The Governor-General, Earl Grey, could be found reminding young clerics that this was the case. In an address to a class at Trinity College School, Port Hope, he questioned the affect of poor sportsmanship on the national character. The Canadian Churchman agreed with the Governor-General and added to his comments, "No good can come of coarseness or rudeness in speech or act; and no people can ever be truly great who tolerate the one or the other in home or on the playground, in either the public or private intercourse of life."³¹¹ "Spectator" felt even more strongly that the national consciousness was too important a consideration to be degraded by sports on national holidays.

But Dominion Day was not inaugurated merely that the youth of one country might test their skill on the campus, or their fleetness in chasing one another around the cinder track. We would not, if we could, interfere in any way with the recreation of a people let loose from their toil. . . . [But] let us not perpetuate forever the custom of calling forth men and women from their ordinary duties to participate in some demonstration and send them home again with nothing better to think of than the results of the ball game, or the victor in the horse race.³¹²

In Canadian protestant thinking, patriotism and piety were indeed religiously interconnected. The Anglican church most noticeably held strong views about the sanctity of holidays, secular and religious, which no doubt biased its thinking regarding sports on holidays.

But it was in the more institutional forms of physical recreation, not sports and games, that the church made its most positive contribution. The protestant denominations gave encouragement to more controlled physical forms of patriotism, those more in comfortable harmony with its traditional "gymnasium and showerbath" mentality.

Drill is probably as old as war itself, but as a form of physical recreation known to the church, it was primarily a late nineteenth century innovation, experienced through such organizations as the ineffectual Boys' Brigade movement which spread into Canada in the late 1880s. With a wave of general interest in the militia and the establishment of drill corps in many Canadian urban centres, this type of activity became attached to the church as well, but never in any overwhelming numbers. Especially after 1908 with the establishment of the Strathcona Trust "For the Encouragement of Physical and Military Training in the Public Schools of Canada,"³¹³ a modicum of new interest was built up in the denominations.

The declining popularity of the Boys' Brigade as a social and religious organization affiliated with the church was well recognized, but nevertheless there was an intellectual appreciation of some of the physical and moral benefits associated with it. After all, the denominations were experiencing the end of a generation of decline in Sunday school enrollment and there was much optimistic talk of alternatives which might reverse the trend. For example, the Twenty-First General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church, 1895, raised the Boys' Brigade as an issue concerning the young boy problem and the age-specific decline of boys in the Sunday schools.

It is well known that it does not draw the boys as might be wished [the young boy problem] and therefore we should have liked to know what services have been rendered by the Boys' Brigade in congregations which have adopted it. But we are informed merely that "in some places the boys have been drilled and disciplined by it." Its object seems to be to advance the Kingdom of Christ among boys and to that end stress is laid by its constitution on attendance at the Bible Class but there is nothing to show that it has effected more than an improvement in the manners of its members.³¹⁴

However, the church had some idea of what this form of exercise was supposed to accomplish.

And so it is that drill takes the place of genius, and even often surpasses it. We are all bundles of habits, and drill gets its great value because it has for its background this power of habit.³¹⁵

The establishment of a Boys' Cadet Company was one suggestion from an Anglican priest, McKim, in 1905, as a resolution to the boy problem, an idea which was only germinating but which gained considerable momentum with the beginning of the war. McKim stressed that the idea had several things in its favour which warranted its consideration. The fact that strict discipline was enforced and

regular practice mandatory was seen as its prime positive characteristic. The result would naturally be stronger physical and moral character, always a quality of deep concern to the church.

The boy is physically helped; everybody knows the good effect of military drill upon a growing boy. It is a great thing for a boy to have a strong, vigorous body developed and well under control. The boy is helped morally. Properly conducted, the Cadet Corps is a splendid developer of character.

Noting further that some are opposed to things military, McKim concluded that there should be no concerns since this was not the purpose of the organization,

but rather to graft into the fibre of the boy the true soldier's spirit, the spirit of obedience, of loyalty and of sacrifice, the recognition of responsibility and the shouldering of it. These characteristics make good citizens, but they are not always cultivated in the home. . . . 316

But there was a growing concern about this "militarism" attached to drill, especially as it related to the school system, which one defender, on the eve of the passage of an Order-in-Council establishing an agreement respecting military drill,³¹⁷ called the "bogey of militarism in our schools."³¹⁸ Believing that the average Canadian saw no such objection as an obsessive concern for the fostering unduly of a military spirit, the Canadian Churchman defended its introduction into the schools, suggesting that Anglicans were as concerned as anyone that war should be overcome and that a military spirit for war and a taste for arms must not be encouraged. Discipline did not encourage a taste for war, and a simple system of military drill in the schools had many advantages for improvement of manners of the young, which it contended were not a strong point

among Canadian youth.³¹⁹ When Lord Strathcona established a fund in 1909 for the encouragement of drilling in the schools, the Canadian Churchman called it an act of true patriotism. "Lord Strathcona's munificent gift of \$250,000, the income of which is to be applied towards preparing the youth of Canada to do military duty in defense of their country is one of the best object lessons in true patriotism that we have ever had in Canada."³²⁰

Some Methodists saw the military style of organization as lending itself well to the promotion of missionary work, study, and support of comradeship,³²¹ however, the Methodist Department of Temperance and Moral Reform held its suspicion of anything military connected with church youth programs. In its characteristically patriotic and flamboyant style, the Department reiterated its concerns.

There is no body which is more loyal to the Empire, the Sovereign and the flag, than Methodism. She is ever ready to advance the interests of the nation, both by fighting her moral foes which are within and sucking the very life blood of her noble character and honor and defence in time of actual need. But we would deplore anything whose object was to develop the spirit of militarism and implant in our youth the desire for battlefields, with their carnage, their horrors, and their death.

If the Boy Scout and Cadet movements are intended to develop a better manhood in your youth--stronger physique, keener intellect, nobler character, better as patriots and purer as citizens--we welcome them with the very greatest heartiness, and desire to encourage them in every possible way. What we desire is that Canada shall produce an outstanding quality of British subjects and world citizens who shall render valuable assistance in the uplift of the nation in righteousness, and the transforming of the kingdoms of this world into the Kingdom of God.³²²

Many protestant clergy believed firmly that the church and state should be synonymous in matters of social concern,³²³ but there were

varying opinions about the impact of military drill and its accompanying militarism on the moral and social fibre of the nation. The Department reiterated its stand regarding undue military influences, and of the Boy Scouts and Cadets in particular. "While we welcome most heartily every rightful method of discipline for the growing boys and young men of Canada, we just as deeply deplore any method of discipline whereby they may become tainted by any expectancy of war or the development of a spirit of eagerness to take up arms."³²⁴

The designers of the Federal militia system were moving further afield in order to spread their message of the national value of the cadet militia corps. The Minister of Militia, Col. Sam Hughes, spoke to the March, 1914 Social Service Congress of the Anglican church on the subject of supervised control of the young, at a time when the denominations had yet to fully implement their system of control, the CSET program. Hughes had his remedy for the young boy problem, using, as had so often the church, the time honoured crime statistic as the barometer for the need of social control.

As one instance of the good results of this work none of our cadets have ever come before a police court. You see they learn to spend their recreative hours to advantage and not waste them uselessly or in ways that are a good deal worse than waste. We have done much to make this system thorough, and although we have a good deal more to do, we are steadily progressing. The lessons of discipline are most valuable, and to none more than the young.

Hughes added another measure of the potential success of the cadet program which to this point had not been widely received by the church. Moreover, the social gospel was teaching those who cared

to listen that there was more to recreation than mere discipline.

Hughes continued his address to the Social Service Congress, a body which represented perhaps the vanguard of Anglican social gossellers, using another popular theme, temperance.

One other good point is that it leads these young men to become good athletes. The chairman and myself are both old athletes, and we realize the value of an athletic training. You will be interested in these points from the view that they discourage the use of intoxicating liquor. The athletic games, the strict discipline and effective control could not be carried out with men who used intoxicants too freely.³²⁵

Even within the Anglican communion there was a steady resistance against turning young people's societies, per se, into drill corps. The Canadian Churchman argued that young people's societies should not become recruiting agencies and drill corps,³²⁶ but shortly thereafter had a change of heart. "Halt! About Turn!" was the phrase which for the Canadian Churchman signalled that the church had had enough and would hereafter support the war effort to the limit. The belief was that Canadians were fit for the task. "Well may we give thanks to God for the men of our nation, strong, alert and devoted. We are not a nation of puny weaklings, starved by the crabbed hand of ill Providence, but a race of stalwarts nurtured on the rich harvests of a virgin soil."³²⁷ From that point onward many clerics would temporarily lay aside their concerns for militarism, and others their pacifist preferences, while the concern of war was upon them. Temporarily there was a need for greater national discipline, and drill corps and the CSET program offered the young people's societies the opportunity to "do their bit."

The CSET program was advertised as a challenge to Canadian manhood for leadership in boys work. Developed cooperatively with the National Council of the YMCA, the Protestant Sunday School Boards, and the Provincial Sunday School Associations, the CSET program was applauded by these organizations as a beneficial program for teen-age boys. The plan became a national ideal.

We can scarcely overestimate the value of setting up such a national ideal. The false ideals of life set up in Germany--the ideals of domination and mastership as against the ideals of service--perverted the minds of the youths of Germany and warped them from the ideals of national honor. The world agony to-day is the logical outcome of this pagan ideal released throughout that unfortunate nation yesterday.³²⁸

In the hearts of Canadian youth, it was hoped such a perverted ideal might be replaced by one resembling closely that of the social gospel.

Youth and Service continued, and elaborated.

Even before the war broke out the churches and Young Men's Christian Associations in Canada had united on this ideal for Canadian boys. It is based on all that we know about Jesus and his growth and development during his boyhood years. It recognizes the value of health and strength, and clear reasoning after truth; an appreciation of moral and spiritual beauty and perfection, and all with a view to efficient service for others; the will to serve, not the will to power.³²⁹

Many of the citizenship ideals elaborated throughout the years were incorporated into the CSET program in its Citizenship tests. The Mentor's Manual outlined some pertinent examples for the leader's consideration, including participation in such community welfare schemes as the 1) Playground movement, 2) Big Brother movement, 3) Anti Tuberculosis campaign, 4) Learn to Swim campaign, 5) Safety First campaign, and 6) Baby Welfare campaign.³³⁰ The CSET program, however, was only in its infancy and did not as yet have the following

needed to provide the large numbers of physically trained boys and men who were required in the short run to actively support the war effort.

The usually liberal "Spectator" was busy calling on Anglicans to adopt military training throughout the ranks of church youth organizations, and many others were following the same course independently. Initially there was a recognition that there was in Canadian youth some lack of physical fitness despite the robust rhetoric lauding the virility of Canadian physical manhood nurtured on the harvest of a virgin soil. The solution was to have more physical training irrespective of wartime motivation.

Let us by all means have more physical training with the simpler military movements, which, after all, are only a part of any adequate system of physical drill, and let us at the same time instill in our boys the principles of true patriotism, even, if need be, to the sacrifice of one's life.³³¹

The system which was preferred was physical training similar to that offered within the school system for military cadet training.

The Strathcona Trust set out a number of requirements based principally on an agreement between the Province of Nova Scotia educational authorities and the federal Minister of Militia, approved by Order-in-Council dated August 13, 1908, which required among other things, "all teachers (of both sexes) to obtain certificates of competency to instruct in physical training, and also to encourage male teachers to obtain certificates in advanced physical training, military drill and rifle shooting."³³² The object of the Trust which was subsequently set up was, in keeping with the earlier agreement, and for purposes in harmony with the temperament of most

Canadian clerics.

The principles read in part:

His object being not only to improve the physical and intellectual capabilities of the children, by inculcating habits of alertness, orderliness and prompt obedience, but also to bring up the boys to patriotism, and to a realization that the first duty of a free citizen is to be prepared to defend his country, the intention of the Founder is that, while physical training and elementary drill should be encouraged for all children of both sexes attending public schools, especial importance is to be attached to the teaching of military drill generally to all boys, including rifle shooting for boys capable of using rifles. 333

While the nationalism of the denominations allowed the physical training aspects of the system to prevail, there was an underlying current of disrespect for the military connotation within the system of physical training. At the close of the war, this latent disrespect was to emerge.

The militia training system had as its base many important ingredients with which the denominations could concur. The organization of school cadet corps was similar to those established within the various church Sunday schools and young people's societies. The training itself was embodied in a Syllabus of Training, as adopted by the Executive Council of the Strathcona Trust. It outlined various types of drill--squad, musketry, target, signalling, etc.--with the principles in mind to develop a manly spirit, train the body, and teach the use of weapons. 334 The purposes for developing manly spirit were to help the cadet bear fatigue, privation and danger cheerfully, a requirement of discipline as much as fitness. Drill in close quarters was intended to produce discipline, cohesion and the habits of complete and instant obedience to command. Games were

included in the curriculum, too, for their purported educational value of teamwork and individual prowess. The rhetoric of the National Education Conference, Winnipeg, 1919, did not sharply differ from that of protestant clergy who gave support to the spread of the cadet system during wartime.

That as the aim of this conference is the directing of public opinion to the need of education in character building and citizenship, and as a sound body, a well disciplined mind, individual effort and co-operation are essentials; therefore be it resolved that more stress be laid on physical education. That in addition Cadet training for boys from 12 to 18 years of age be introduced into all our schools--it having been proven that where training has been intelligently given, it has been of inestimable value to the boys, the school and the nation--in the inculcation of such qualities, sentiments and powers as reliability, patriotism, comradeship, self-control, self-reliance, self-direction, initiative and discipline.³³⁵

The Minister of Education for Ontario, H. J. Cody, in dealing with the issue of "Religion and Education" concurred that the general aim of education was to accomplish the same ambitions, but in a different setting. "By Education I mean a sound body, a trained intelligence and a reverent spirit, which in combination will make our youths in due time efficient and God-fearing citizens."³³⁶ Again the church and state were not at odds with the aims behind the cadet system; however, the methods increasingly vexed the social gospel element.

The concern for militarism before the war faded somewhat with the dire necessity to react to the call of war. The small voice of pacifism too had been choked out by the cry to arms even as the war began.³³⁷ However, with the close of hostilities, Methodism in particular represented by its social gospel wing, the Department of Evangelism and Social Service, renewed its campaign, now that it

was no longer unpatriotic to do so, against militarism in the cadet system. The Twenty-Third Annual Report of the Department, 1925, continued the tone set before the war.

In view of the generally recognized fact that the spirit of militarism constitutes a perpetual menace of war and cannot in any way be reconciled with a Christian view of life or of human relationships, and in view of the fact that this spirit, under the guise of patriotism finds expression in many ways and specifically in the system of Cadet training, in vogue in our public schools;

We would therefore express our conviction that the highest patriotism is not dependent upon, nor promoted by any system of military training, but that though ultimate defence of the country depends upon the character of its citizens and their loyalty to Christian ideals; we deplore the arbitrary conditions which make the reception of a grant for physical training conditional upon the adoption of the Cadet System and the supervision of this work by the Military Authorities; we believe that the system of military training in our schools is essentially the same as that which came to such perfection in Prussia and which is so violently denounced, and we would urge upon the Federal Government that the system of Cadet Training should be substituted by some approved system of Physical Training and recreational activity which shall be free from the insidious influences of the present system.³³⁸

But after the war confusion was evident within Methodist ranks about this question as this motion could not find sufficient supporters, and was referred back to the Committee. A now older social gospel did not possess the same spirit it had had during its youth.

Fully-fledged pacifists within the denominations emerged as well and were not lacking courage, particularly the Educational Committee of the Toronto Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, represented by highly active lay women from Toronto area churches. As the social gospel changed in character, the passion for "plans and programs" receded as a consequence, and many former social gossellers turned their enthusiasm towards the pacifist

movement.³³⁹ The Peace and Freedom League, for example, had a definite platform concerning the militia program and physical education in Canadian schools.

The numerous propaganda pamphlets of the League outlined their basic concerns pertaining to drill, physical training and physical education. The extent of the problem, as judged by the League, was the alarming number of cadets in Canada, a country which had publicly renounced war as a national policy.³⁴⁰ Statistics bore out this state of affairs.

Comparison Based on 1926 Statistics

Cadets in Great Britain and North of Ireland	34,156
Cadets in Canada	112,463
Population of Great Britain 1921 Census	42,767,530
Population of Canada 1921 Census	8,788,481

The statistical conclusion was that Canada had three times as many cadets as Britain in absolute numbers and, proportion to population, sixteen times as many; the emotional conclusion was that Canada was too militaristic. Department of Defense statistics only aided their case. Statistics quoted in pacifist literature for 1928 showed that at normal schools and other centres, fifty-five courses of physical training were being offered; moreover, seventy-six percent of the forty-six instructors at these institutions were officers and N.C.O.'s of the permanent militia.³⁴¹ Antimilitarists had three basic objections to this system of training in normal schools.

First, was the objection that physical training was not a substitute of physical education, and the highest ranking Canadian authorities were quoted for support. The denominations had

traditionally lent their support to the playground movement, and a lack of freedom in the military system was a critical point of disagreement.

Doctors and educators both declare that military training is not physical education and cannot be substituted for it. A doctor in charge of the physical examination in one of our universities said recently "The aims of cadet training and physical education are quite different. Physical education begins with life. Its objects are body building, the formation of health habits in the individual and the community, character building by means of play." Professor Lambe, Director of Physical Education at McGill University, further stated to the Ontario Educational Association that to obtain the greatest benefit from exercise or sport the drill element must be replaced by the emphasis on freedom and play.³⁴²

The second objection was that cadet training associated "patriotism with militarism and throws the glamour of pageantry around the essential brutality of war. . . ." This theme was one which was occasionally heard concerning the Boys Brigade. The third objection was that cadet training provided no education for citizenship, an essential ingredient of patriotism from the denominational perspective and one which it attempted to put into service within the many citizenship and service departments of the young people's societies and brotherhoods.³⁴³ The league also claimed that there was support for the movement against the cadet system from labour, the United Farmers, some churches and religious associations and peace societies. In reality it is probable that both conservative and moderate liberal elements within the ranks of denominational clergy supported the cadet corps for its benefits in solving the young boy problem, applauding the apparent changes in manners and deportment, believing as much in the theory of "inevitable progress" applied

not only to social but to educational thinking.³⁴⁴

These objections prompted a number of recommendations which were aimed at rectifying the overemphasis of the military influence. Teacher training courses in physical education were recommended to be open, divorced from all military control. The funds spent on the cadet system were thought to be better spent if applied to furthering physical education under the control of Departments of Education. Furthermore, it was recommended that the tutelage of civilians should be given to civilian institutions, under civilian control. The last recommendation upheld the mandate of the League, "That all teachers be encouraged in the endeavour to make the school the culture ground of a future citizenship prepared loyally to fulfill the pledges of our country."³⁴⁵

In summary, the social gospel, though in decline, maintained its interest in Christian nationalism which found expression in physical education. The social gospel, too, held to its belief that the young boy problem could be solved through practical methods, methods which had at their centre an important place for physical recreation. This view was reinforced through outside influences especially by American literature on the young boy and on boys' work methods which called for greater, more practical church involvement.

The message of the social gospel was that more was required in modern society than the symbolic gymnasium and showerbath to deal with adolescence. This resulted in a broader attack on the young boy problem from within the denominations. Church social reformers studied the meaning of modern sports and games in order

to learn more about this aspect of life which was so popular with Canadian youth. The church was in search of a suitable policy regarding physical recreation and sport, one which would appeal to both youth exuberance and clerical conservatism.

Many social reformers believed that they had found the ideal program in Canadian Standard Efficiency Training. This program, developed collaboratively between the YMCA and the protestant churches, was approved as suitable for Christian adolescents. CSET expanded significantly within the church during the First World War. But while social gospellers accepted CSET as a balanced program, Canadian youth preferred sports and games. Under the influence of the positive social gospel message towards physical recreation and sports, sports programming became an integral part of young people's societies. But the tendency of sport was often not towards the idealism of a balanced life but towards the pursuit of winning. The social gospel fostered the growth of physical recreation and sport within the church but with its decline a formidable force for the continued maintenance of it within the church was lost.

Being careful to point out that "social, educational and amusement inducements must never be permitted to challenge the supremacy of the spiritual," the contributor offered a counter solution to the young boy problem.

The Athletic Club should be subject to the Executive of the League [Epworth]. I am not a sport, and do not play baseball, but I have always permitted myself to be enthused. I do not think, however, that the League meetings are the proper times to deal with these matters. The best young man I have secured was through his games. Good fishermen try different baits.⁹⁷

The difficulty for both church laymen and clerics alike to adjust to the new social role being entertained as a proper direction for the church is obvious in the contributor's lack of comfort in dealing with the topic. The YMCA felt no such encumbrance.

In reality, however, the church was beginning to cooperate more frequently and deliberately with the YMCA in the provision of physical recreation and social services. The 1912 General Assembly of the Presbyterian church cited one example of closer cooperation in the town of Amherst, Nova Scotia. The Assembly noted that a trained YMCA boy's secretary and a women's social service expert were supported by the town in cooperation with local churches and schools, seeking adolescent "physical and mental development. Attention is given to truancy, to delinquency and indeed to everything concerning the welfare of boys and girls during the years when it is most difficult to hold them in connection with Church life."⁹⁶

The YMCA was also active in student organizations on college campuses and both Methodists and Presbyterians saw immeasurable advantages for the student population, as they believed their

devotional and practical exercises did much to foster the spirit of true religion.⁹⁹ Off the campus, these denominations encouraged the organization in its efforts, especially the YMCA Week of Prayer held each fall, which the church duly recognized as "stimulating Christian experience, prayer and personal service."¹⁰⁰ During the war, the YMCA launched its greatest campaign to date, entitled the RED TRIANGLE CAMPAIGN and all denominations were asked officially to fall behind its efforts. A natural juncture was thereby provided for the church to review its functional relationship to the YMCA, in all areas of common concern.

The YMCA proposed to expand its efforts beyond urban areas into rural communities where the church had traditionally held prominence. Methodists and Presbyterians found this new planning approach fundamentally sound. The Presbyterian and Westminster in dealing with the issue of "The Y.M.C.A. and the Church," summed up the salient features of their relationship. First noted was the fact that this organization was sometimes criticized because it reached only a certain class.¹⁰¹ Students and men following commercial occupations were its target population generally to the neglect of manual workers. This was revealed in the social surveys. Concerning the Fort William survey for example, both the YMCA and the CYMA, the Catholic Young Men's Association, were cited as serving only a limited portion of the whole community. The report agreed that the general tendency of these two organizations was towards the upbuilding of young Canadian manhood, but regretted that "similar opportunities are not available for the young new-comers who stand in such great need of them."¹⁰²

Further west in Regina, the observation was again made. The Regina report noted that the YMCA and YWCA offered many "social opportunities to the 'better class' young men and women. The so-called 'working' class young men and women have fewer advantages."¹⁰³ One remedy was suggested, that an AAA (Amateur Athletic Association, perhaps within the church) be formed for men who would not go to the YMCA.¹⁰⁴ In London, Ontario, the YMCA had popularized "gymnasium work" and offered to provide leaders to coach boys in their own churches, a few of which, it was noted, had gymnasiums. Again the proliferation of pool rooms was necessarily mentioned, accompanied by the now commonplace view that the YMCA "shows strikingly how different these amusements may be when under different influence,"¹⁰⁵ and it was observed that "most crime is committed during leisure hours,"¹⁰⁶ highlighting once again the importance of effective church involvement in this area. The elite nature of the YMCA in another Ontario town, St. Catharines, was evident in the lament of the investigation committee concerning the inadequate facilities of the YMCA there, and it also underlined that in fact the church had recognized the hegemony of this organization regarding the Christian provision for the physical side of life. The sobering reality of the findings of empirical study was dispelling the idealism of the social gospel, in contrast to Rev. Shore's searching question a decade earlier, "Ought not every Church have its own YMCA or equivalent?"

It is surprising that a city with a population of over 17,000 should be attempting to serve its young men with a Y.M.C.A. building, which is without a swimming pool, running

track, boxing or wrestling rooms or lecture hall, and with very limited room in every other particular. This proves a serious handicap to the work which the organization would like to do.¹⁰⁷

Perhaps the church was undergoing a change of mind? Certainly the committee believed the YMCA should be the legitimate provider of physical recreation, and they could continue to do it more conveniently than could the church. The committee elaborated:

In this way the Y.M.C.A. would become the recreational centre for all the boys' clubs connected with the churches, as has been so successful in many cities. There is no need of church gymnasiums. One well-equipped gymnasium can take care of all the work.¹⁰⁸

The value of the social survey especially to the Methodist and Presbyterian denominations was that it kept the church abreast of what was happening within the community at large, enabling it to take better advantage of facilities and programs, which were admittedly outside the church but to which the church could give its commendation.

When the YMCA asked for cooperation from the churches for its planned expansion into rural areas, the Presbyterian and Westminster raised the question of protestant support for the scheme. "Will the churches enter ungrudgingly and whole-heartedly into the co-operation proposed?" asked the periodical of its readership. Believing that they should, the journal cited advantages supporting this viewpoint:

1. To regard not merely the religious interests of people, in the narrower sense, but to keep in view the development of the whole personality--physical, mental, spiritual--is recognized as being thoroughly in harmony with the mind and example of Jesus Christ. . . .

2. The men who are carrying on this work under the auspices of the Y.M.C.A. are, with scarcely an exception, not only Christian men, but faithful churchmen. They can be trusted to be loyal to the things for which the Church stands. . . .
3. The Church, owing mainly to her denominational divisions, is not, in the meantime at least, in as good a position as an outside organization, to carry on a work which to be successful must enlist the co-operation of the whole community. . . . And so the alternative, as regards these special activities, is not, in most cases, the Y.M.C.A. or the Church; it is the Y.M.C.A. or nothing.

. . . Let us choose to make it a great instrument for developing in the Canadian nation a strong and clean and Christian manhood.¹⁰⁹

The Presbyterian Church, at least the part in concurrence with the editor of the Presbyterian and Westminster, would believe that the gospel message and physical recreation were not incompatible. In fact, such successful examples of cooperation would lead to much greater cooperation in programming for the physical as well as the spiritual needs of the young. But not everyone within the Presbyterian and Methodist churches gave unqualified support to the YMCA to move wholesale into what had been dominantly the exclusive jurisdiction of the rural church.

The Presbyterian Record found many reasons cited by detractors of the scheme from within the church, but several of these were weak arguments. The YMCA was accused of deviating radically from its original purpose, namely, helping young men. The religious work in the rural community was centered in the rural church and the YMCA scheme would subvert the interest, affection and support of the young from existing churches making the rural minister's work more difficult. The young in rural Canada, it was argued, were the hope of the

church of Christ in the future and the church depended upon the religious life of the young being centered in the rural church. Since the YMCA had not yet developed facilities of its own in these areas, difficulty was anticipated in trying to schedule YMCA activities in existing facilities. Furthermore, the rural community had its own diversions and relaxations as pleasant as those of the city and did not need the YMCA.¹¹⁰ The editor only noted the arguments for and against the extension of YMCA work without giving any firmer idea about the extent to which they were held by the church, stating only that these "are some of the reasons . . . so far as they have appeared."¹¹¹

Officially, however, sanction was being given to support the YMCA. At the Forty-Sixth General Assembly the following year, 1920, the Committee on Coordination unanimously agreed that a standing committee be formed to

act in an advisory capacity in all matters affecting the relationship of the Y.M.C.A. to the Churches and of the Churches to the Y.M.C.A., and that a copy of this resolution be sent to each body represented in this conference for their approval and appointment of delegates.¹¹²

Represented were Baptist, Congregationalist, Anglican, Methodist and Presbyterian churches, and the YMCA. The latter organization was demonstrating a formative influence on the denominations in general and on the young people's societies of the churches in particular. The following year a joint committee on young people's work was established, with a mandate to examine even more rigorously the young boy problem. The idea had been solidifying for some time and involved all protestant denominations. Youth and Service explained:

For some time leaders in work with young men and women all over North America have been carefully examining existing programmes and types of organization for young people. A few months ago a group of Canadian leaders, representing the Young People's Societies of the various denominations, such as the A.Y.P.A., the B.Y.P.A. [Baptist], the Westminster Guild, the Christian Endeavor, and the Epworth League, and also the Sunday School organizations and the Y.M.C.A. and Y.W.C.A., met informally to study the question of a programme for young people that might be used with necessary modifications by all these bodies. Several meetings were held, and some progress was made. In January action was taken to form a permanent joint committee on young people's programme, and it is hoped that this committee will make progress in its important work as rapidly as possible. 113

There were indications, however, that the churches were becoming increasingly concerned about the spiritual nature of the young in the post-war social milieu. For one thing there was no mistaking that the guiding principles set out by the committee were anything but thoroughly religious in emphasis, which fundamentally acknowledged other aspects of the individual but kept the prime purpose of the church to the fore. The main features of the envisioned program included: 1) study--bible, missions, teacher training, community needs, etc.; 2) worship--church services, young people's meetings, private devotion; 3) service--active participation in church and community work; and 4) social life--fellowship and special meetings. 114

The underlying assumption was that in providing fully for their requirements, it was expected that young people would participate in church services, meetings for study, and meetings for training and fellowship. 115

The difficulty in accepting the YMCA was that it was too concerned with the physical to suit the inclination of the denominations who saw their purpose as spiritual. The reasons given by those not supporting the move of the organization into rural areas indicated

that the church was quite concerned with the spiritual welfare of these communities. The YMCA had traditionally laid considerable stress on its physical department, but at this time there was little indication that, within the denominations, this passion for greater care of the body was a dominating influence over the minds of church leaders in young people's work. In the post-war planning period, there appeared to be an increased awareness of the need for spiritual guidance furthered by the decline of the social gospel.

The Anglican church in Canada was also represented on the Standing Committee, but they had shown the least sympathy for the spread of this organization and its "YMCA methods." In fact, Anglicans on occasion would use this closer harmony in spirit between the denominations and the YMCA as a point of attack when passing judgment on them.¹¹⁶ Anglicans were divided on the issue of support and cooperation with the YMCA. The attitude of many Anglicans towards the YMCA might also be representative of the feelings of conservatives in the more evangelical denominations untouched by the social gospel message towards physical recreation.

An editorial on the development of Church Institutes in England provided the editor of the Canadian Churchman in 1903, opportunity to speak on the benefits of such organizations in England, and, in the editor's opinion, their Canadian equivalent, the emerging YMCA.

These institutes aim at promoting the religious, intellectual, social and physical welfare of their members. They organize classes and lectures, provide amusement and recreation, and, by giving access to a gymnasium and baths, provide for the physical well-being of the members. They are in large towns of

great benefit in breaking down a narrow congregationalism, and in bringing the churchmen of the town into closer touch and more frequent intercourse with each other. They are, in short, to churchmen what the Young Men's Christian Association is to the undenominationalist. . . . Excellent as the Y.M.C.A. is in many of its features, and helpful as many a young man may find it in a large city, it has this advantage to a Churchman, that so far as it deals with doctrine and worship it does so from a dissenting, or undenominational standpoint, and not from that of an intelligent and loyal Churchman. To us this is a radical defect, and must tend to make young Churchmen in such an environment less attached to the doctrine, discipline and worship of their own household of faith. The Church of England has marked denominational features and characteristics, and if her young members are thrown in close association with those, who, however sincere, seriously differ from them in religious thought and methods, they cannot but be affected by the atmosphere they breathe and the associates they meet with. In a word, the Young Men's Christian Association is more congenial to the Nonconformist and the Undenominationalist than it can possibly be to the Anglican Churchman, and in the practical working out must be more helpful in building up Nonconformity than in extending the influence of the Church of England.¹¹⁷

The author continued noting the existence of a Church of England Institute in Halifax, suggesting that this type of organization should be built up and receive the patronage of Anglicans. The objectives of another Maritime Institute, at St. John, showed what might be expected of such institutes if they were developed further in Canada. Its purpose was to unite churchmen in promoting: 1) the advancement of religion in accordance with the principles of the Church of England; 2) the encouragement of kindly intercourse among its members; 3) the diffusion of general knowledge in subordination to religion; and 4) the provision of innocent recreation and amusement.¹¹⁸ These ideals were similar to those of the YMCA, but in practice, as one less enthusiastic Anglican noted, the Institutes established on Canadian soil were essentially only reading rooms.¹¹⁹

Anglicans expressed diametrically opposite views concerning the YMCA. Anglicans on one extreme believed the organization was providing needed recreational opportunities without in any way interfering with the integrity of the Church of England. The laying on May 14, 1912, of the cornerstone of a new central YMCA building in Toronto provided such an occasion for support. Lauding the accomplishments of the organization, one Anglican observer later added:

There is a happy unity in the Association activities which obliterates the denominational differences. There has been much talk of Church unity in recent times, but the Y.M.C.A. has been practicing it for nearly seventy years. Loyal to the Church, usurping none of the Church's functions, it binds together the men of all faiths for the service of their fellow man. While it is Christian to the core, it opens its door widely to all. Its buildings and its activities give substance and reality to the good impulses and desires of those who wish to help young men to fight a winning battle, each one with strength as the strength of ten because his heart is pure.¹²⁰

However, there was concern from some Anglican supporters of the YMCA that it might be leading Anglicans away from the church. This concern was evident in the remarks of another contributor to the Canadian Churchman regarding the view that physical recreation was not the mandate of the church and should be left to outside agencies.

It is certainly no part of the duty of the Catholic Church, or of the denominations, commonly called churches, which it contains, or of the congregations or churches which make up such denominations, to provide tennis lawns, gymnasiums, swimming baths or concerts for young people, nor do I suppose that what some of the young people are reported to have said, means that they would leave the Catholic Church as above defined to obtain such things.¹²¹

The social gospel message was not sustained by those who believed that the church had a spiritual function only, to "preach the Gospel, and to teach all to observe the commandments of her Founder."¹²²

This contributor argued that physical recreation was "no part of the duty of the Catholic Church," instead the answer was to "cultivate the closest and most friendly relations with the Y.M.C.A. and the Y.W.C.A., and work with and through them, as far as possible, in connection with amusements and recreations."¹²³ The Canadian Churchman endorsed greater cooperation with the Association particularly as the organization, the editor felt prophetically, would emerge an even greater community force following the War. Traditionally the Church of England had not supported the YMCA, but its physical recreation work was well known to the denomination. "The attitude of the Church of England towards it in the past has not always been entirely sympathetic, although large numbers of its supporters, both among clergy and laymen, are and have been Anglicans." In light of limited recreation programming within the church, the editor felt that the YMCA should be given more encouragement both by Anglicans and those in the other denominations.

By surrounding young men with a Christian atmosphere and at the same time providing them with opportunities for recreation and social intercourse, it is doing a most valuable piece of work, a work that cannot be done as well, and need not be done, by any one denomination by itself.¹²⁴

The commencement of the RED TRIANGLE CAMPAIGN by the YMCA brought out the strongest indictments of the usefulness of the YMCA to the Church of England. After an initial sharp reaction, the issue of a rural YMCA faded but this reaction showed the other extreme side of Anglican opinion and underscored the traditional antagonism between the Church of England and the YMCA. There was no social gospel rhetoric to be found in the words of those opposed to the Association.

There is more spiritual life in the atmosphere surrounding a Baptist, Methodist, Presbyterian, or Holy Roller congregation, where at least definiteness as to the Son of God is sometimes taught, than in the vacuum of so-called Christian fellowship which strives through one hundred and one pleasantries to bring men to a knowledge of the truth. Give a non-religious man the use of a billiard table, a swimming pool, and an active cafeteria, and he will never hope for help from either the doctrines or practices of the Church of England. The rite of admission to the Y.M.C.A. is the payment of the member's fee.¹²⁵

A flurry of counteracting rebuttals followed which indicated the church was changing its position but this could not deny that among the conservative elements in the Anglican church, the physical recreation work of the Association was not viewed positively.

At this time the spirit of social change was by no means dead. Of course, there were those who preferred that the church look after its spiritual commission to the exclusion of all other considerations no matter how worthwhile they might inherently be. Many social gospellers, however, wanted to go beyond mere encouragement of the physical work program within the YMCA and suggested instead direct involvement by the church in this area. Ironically, it was YMCA initiative which found a compromise program more acceptable to evangelical and conservative alike: one which attempted encouragement of a basic recognition of all aspects of life--body, mind and spirit--but which offered some flexibility of interpretation.

The program which evolved was the Canadian Standard Efficiency Tests (CSET), a program encompassing four categories: Intellectual, Physical, Religious or Devotional, and Social (also referred to as Service). In planning the program the YMCA sought advice from an eminent American educational psychologist, Herman H. Horne, who

recommended that a balanced program was essential, and so the YMCA's old fourfold formula was adopted.¹²⁶ The first edition of the tests appeared in October 1912, and while the fourth edition was being prepared, under the direction of the Boys' Work Committee of the National Council of the YMCA, the suggestion came to the committee that if the plan were made progressive and more comprehensive, it might become the accepted program of work for teen-age boys in Canadian Sunday schools.¹²⁷ The denominations responded by appointing a number of prominent secretaries from the various Sunday school commissions to assist in adapting this YMCA program to meet the needs of the churches. These included Rev. R. A. Hiltz, an Anglican, Rev. R. L. Farewell, a Methodist, and Rev. C. A. Myers, a Presbyterian.¹²⁸ Several of the denominations were optimistic from the beginning,¹²⁹ but were advised that the spiritual aspect of the program should not be dominated by any other.¹³⁰ The most liberal of all denominations encouraged CSET for its potential benefits. The immediate value of the tests was that it secured a broadened weekday program within the church; one which continued to be expanded into the post-war reconstruction period. Its virtue was that it provided the church with a regimented format, readily adaptable to suit most parishes, and more importantly, compatible with the protestant mentality concerning physical recreation. Even the social gospel could not erase among its adherents that traditional love of order, implying as Barker had noted, that to the protestant denominations form was as important as content.¹³¹

While there was general acceptance of this program in all denominations during its first years of application, this acceptance was by no means universal. Moreover, its specific use was somewhat restricted if statistical data on potential and actual users is interpreted correctly. Macleod in his study of adolescence and the YMCA during the period of the social gospel, claimed that the program proved hopelessly cumbersome and attracted only 13,421 boys in 1919.¹³² Other statistical evidence indicates that the percentage of youth involved in church organizations based solely on the principles of CSET, namely Tuxis and Trail Rangers, was small.¹³³ Of a survey of boys in Toronto in 1921, only 4.4% of protestant adolescents were members of Tuxis and Trail Rangers. The survey also showed that an incredible 91% of Toronto boys attended Sunday school, a tribute, no doubt, to "Toronto the Good."¹³⁴ This program, however, was but part of a broader one in which the church was actively searching for appropriate social programming in order for it to reach larger proportions of the adolescent group.

During the war years particularly, the campaign to broaden the use of the CSET program gained considerable momentum. The scheme never proved a success at the Sunday school level, but more evangelical denominations did officially encourage its adoption by groups other than Sunday schools. Its name was changed to Canadian Standard Efficiency Training in 1918 to suit the spirit of the times and, with slight amendments to the format, its use was encouraged in all denominational organizations. Several claims for its benefits were made, such as that by the Board of Sabbath Schools and Young People's

Societies to the Presbyterian General Assembly in 1924:

Before the War, Young People's Work was developing normally at a rather modest rate. Immediately on the outbreak of the War, Young Men's Bible Classes and Young People's Societies melted away, in many cases not a single eligible man being left. Even as late as 1917 the decreases reached a total of nearly 200 organizations and nearly 9000 members. Fortunately just before the outbreak of the War a remarkable forward movement began in connection with work among Older Boys and Girls (12 - 18 years of age) which has continued to develop in the C.S.E.T. and C.G.I.T. [girls equivalent program] movements and which has done much to help make possible the marked growth of Young People's Work (18 - 24), during the six year period 1917 - 1922.¹³⁵

The CSET program was credited in the Presbyterian church with significant importance. Growth in PYPA membership increased from 42,000 to 97,000 during the period 1917 to 1922. This represented not only a substantial increase in size of young people's organizations, but these figures included only those organizations reported to be conducting midweek activities.¹³⁶ Methodists, too, approved of the increased use of the scheme. The Eleventh General Conference that year reported considerable optimism for it: "We rejoice in the increased interest being manifested in week-day religious instruction. . . . The C.S.E.T. and C.G.I.T. programmes are most heartily commended for the broad and efficient training which is embodied in them."¹³⁷ The gospel message of the church's greater involvement in social planning and social regeneration had taken root; it remained to be seen if with it came a changed attitude about the higher recognition of the body and the use for physical recreation in Canadian protestantism which the social gospel also encouraged.

In the ranks of Methodism, proselytizing the virtues of the CSET program was more a matter of education than one of conversion.

There seemed to be little open hostility to this YMCA-sponsored program and progress of the organization was reported in its youth periodicals from time to time. A lengthy article appeared in Youth and Service, as an example, giving an overview of its historical development to 1916.

During the last twenty-five years many efforts have been put forth in behalf of 'teen age boys. Boys' Brigades, Boy Scouts, Knights of King Arthur and a score or more of boys' organizations have been promoted and have done much not only to help boys, but also to determine correct methods in boys' work. These experiments have been carried on along two general lines. One in connection with the churches through the denominational and inter-denominational Sunday-school boards and culminating in the appointment of a Commission on the 'Teen Age some years ago. The other in connection with the Y.M.C.A. and culminating in the investigation into boy life made by the Men and Religion Movement.

. . . This Committee [Canadian Standard Efficiency Tests Committee of the YMCA including interdenominational support] has developed the programme until it is now the recognized programme of work for 'teen-age boys in the Protestant churches, Y.M.C.A. and Sunday-school associations of Canada.

We can scarcely overestimate the value of setting up such a national ideal.¹³⁸

The serenity with which liberal Methodism accepted the scheme contrasted with the reaction some Anglicans felt towards it.

Tied up with Anglican opinion of the value of CSET were broader questions dealing with the requirements of the Anglican communion and acceptable outside agencies which could meet the high aspirations of the denomination. Comparison of the YMCA, and its novel program, with the Boy Scouts, the traditional favourite of the Anglican Church for resolving the boy problem, created tension in discussions on the issue.

The reporting of the YMCA-sponsored "Coast to Coast Boys

Work Conference" held in Toronto in the fall of 1916 served to bring out some of the latent issues concerning CSET. The Canadian Churchman observed and reported on most of the details. A number of issues were raised by the article on the conference, which noted the absence of any Anglican leaders in boys work, pointing up the slowness with which Anglicans were becoming involved in CSET compared to other denominations. The Churchman elaborated:

Every denomination had its leader, and expert in boys' work, who could answer questions, and assist in planning for the future work. We few Anglicans who met together [ten percent of the total as reported in a subsequent article] not only missed this very necessary part of assistance, but missed that feeling of unity in this national effort to serve the boys.¹³⁹

The editor followed with a message of endorsement.

Boys' Leaders--We endorse most heartily what was said by one of our correspondents in last week's issue regarding the need of greater interest on the part of the Church in the efforts to develop leaders in boys' work. Considerable was done along this line by the Brotherhood of St. Andrew but, unfortunately, this has been allowed in the main to cease. The Church, through the Sunday School Commission, has the machinery that is needed but here we are handicapped by lack of funds. One result of this, as was pointed out, is that many of our boys lose interest and drift away from the Church. In the past the "Boy Problem" was regarded by many as a hopeless one. We know to-day that it is most hopeful, provided we can get proper leaders. . . . Would it not be wise, though, to extend the same spirit [of philanthropy] to the activities that are striving to lay better foundations for the future of both Church and State? "Better a fence at the top of a cliff than an ambulance at the foot."¹⁴⁰

After the program had been in operation for some time additional support came from those who had had personal experience with it. Such leaders saw the benefit of a midweek program in maintaining the allegiance of the young boy, and as to the program content

itself:

I think the reason why so many church clubs fail is because they are only for social amusement, and not aiming at anything higher. The Canadian Standard Efficiency Tests forms a splendid programme. . . . The meeting is opened with prayer and a Bible discussion for half an hour. Afterwards, they come together for a helpful talk, then some tests are taken, or debates on live topics, after which we play group games. Once a month we have beans, each group having a table by themselves, so they can give their yells, etc., after which an address is given. During the season the fellows play inter-church and inter-group games of hockey, indoor and outdoor baseball. What is the result? Through the grace of God we are holding our fellows and increasing our attendance 15 per cent.¹⁴¹

The CSET program did not limit participation in physical recreation to that prescribed in the tests. Numerous similar articles lauding the advantages of the CSET program appeared for the next few years until interest in this social program dominated all other social editorial interests. Clubs gave examples of their entire year's program under the scheme, in both written and tabular format.¹⁴²

The YMCA CSET program, treated liberally with the blessings of the editor,¹⁴³ was uncharacteristically applauded as a sound program and liberal Anglicans were responding.

Coeval with this sudden interest in the CSET program the YMCA launched its RED TRIANGLE CAMPAIGN and the cracks began to appear in the foundation laid by the church media. One antagonist issued his opinion of the YMCA with a certain invective.

We are asked to believe that this wonderfully organized force, so modern in social spirit, so broad in its activities, is to be necessary to the working of a "successful" church. Success is found in the achievement of ideals. . . . Here the Anglican Church fundamentally differs from the Y.M.C.A. With Christ's promised Presence enshrined in the Word and the Sacraments, the Church presents this Ideal to the world, leaving the results to the Holy Spirit. Whereas the supporters of

the Red Triangle labour nobly in the twilight of good works, marking success by increase of membership.¹⁴⁴

Meanwhile, could the Anglican church be adopting YMCA methods? Full-page advertisements appeared in the Canadian Churchman selling the principle of the CSET program with its ideal format¹⁴⁵ of having a four-fold program offering a broader scope for work with boys. Protagonists of the scheme were encouraged to speak out in its favour. The well-known Canadian cleric, Rev. Dr. J. L. Carroll, spoke highly of the scheme. "The C.S.E.T. is the only efficient method that we have today which gives us the key to leadership for the days to come." Concerning the athletic or physical portion of the program, he concluded: "Our athletic events give us a point of contact with every normal boy. This feature does not predominate, but is only one of many useful incidents. The great ideal we hold up is service--Jesus was the greatest servant of mankind."¹⁴⁶ There were a few discordant opinions coming forward which kept the issue alive.

Sir,--Without hesitation I can, for myself, answer "Superintendent's" question about the C.S.E.T. "The boy,"--the wholesome, red-blooded boy--has no use for it. As a training in priggishness, unwholesome self-consciousness, goody-goodyness, nothing could be more effective. . . . I would not care to have the C.S.E.T. method adopted in my Sunday School, or in any boys' society for which I was personally responsible.

And as to the suggested alternative:

It seems to me that the Church in Canada is missing a grand opportunity in the Boy Scout movement. . . . It appeals to all that is best in the boy and develops his sense of duty, honor, altruism, individual responsibility and usefulness to others and to himself. It is comprehensive and has contact with every interest of a boy's life. As an auxiliary to Church training and Sunday School work, as well as a means of training in good citizenship, there is nothing else as good.¹⁴⁷

Others condemned the program outright. "If any of your readers

imagine that all they have to do to solve for themselves the boy problem is to adopt the C.S.E.T., they had better do a little more thinking."¹⁴⁰

Significantly, "Spectator," the weekly commentator on subjects of public interest and one who was, perhaps, as liberal as his readership, moved cautiously on the issue. Noting that the denominations own Sunday School Commission was lending its weight behind boys' conferences, he sounded his concern that the spiritual aspects of the CSET program were not necessarily beneficial if the boy leaders were themselves not up to "standard efficiency." In his characteristic style, he wondered if the program was just a little too much of a production:

In addition to all this the existence of a top-heavy organization with committee and sub-committee to the third and fourth degree; with managers and secretaries without number, with buttons and badges galore, with reams of letters and stamps to correspond, we seem to be overrun by an imported system that is wholly unsuited to the genius and judgment of our people.¹⁴⁹

His motivation was more to support the Boy Scout movement against derision, than to show any dominant dislike for CSET in which he may have had little personal experience. "Spectator" elaborated on his opinions during the following weeks.

It is apparent that the tests are an essential part of the scheme, not a mere accessory. The leader is expected to "chart" the boys progress or retrogression. We are quite familiar with physical tests--chest expansion, running ability, etc.--and we can soon settle those. Intellectual tests may very easily be applied by an examination on books or nature. Social tests are a little more difficult and undefined, but presumably one can arrive at some general conclusion as to how a boy gets on with his neighbours. . . . The thing, however, that bothers "Spectator," and evidently bothers many thinking people who are keenly interested in boys, is the efficacy and the wisdom of spiritual tests. . . .

In the judgment of "Spectator" no such difficulty as has been pointed out above arises out of the fundamental structure of the Boy Scouts. This organization may seem to emphasize, too fully, the intellectual and physical side of the boy to the neglect of the spiritual, but that would depend entirely upon the Scoutmaster.¹⁵⁰

In their zeal to applaud this new form of control, ambassadors of the CSET movement often unnecessarily degraded the Scouting movement, and there was no quicker way to raise the ire of many Anglicans than to follow that ill-advised course of action. Prudence did prevail, however, as several contributors attempted to act as peacemakers and balance the scales by reason. One such contributor concluded: "In reading the various letters written in commendation of the Canadian Standard Efficiency Tests, it seems to me that the Boy Scout Movement has been criticized unfairly by some and not been given its due praise by others."¹⁵¹ In their desire to find a new course for Anglican youth work, many directly compared these forms of programming. Supporters of CSET criticized the Boy Scouts as not offering a broad enough program:

We have the Lad's Brigade and the Boy Scouts, and, as an assistant Scout Master, I agree that they are splendid things, but do not cover the ground necessary to make a man, both physically and spiritually. They uphold splendid ideals, but they spend most of their energies on the physical side of the boy.¹⁵²

Others criticized the Scouts as well for being too narrow in their approach to boys work. "If the Church Lad's Brigade and the Boy Scouts are doing this same thing for the Canadian Church in a definite and nation-wide manner, I have yet to hear of it. The C.S.E.T. takes time and consecration."¹⁵³ Others would agree.

The Anglican Church has not as yet realized the great issue at stake in not whole-heartedly supporting this work [CSET].

But it is a great pleasure to the Anglican boys already interested in this movement to see church after church adopting it. Many of these churches have tried the Boys' Brigade, the Boy Scouts and other movements, but have found something lacking which they have apparently found in the C.S.E.T. Movement.¹⁵⁴

There were essential differences between these apparently divergent programs, the CSET and the Scout Movement, which would not be reconciled, especially regarding the physical program each engendered.¹⁵⁵

Perhaps it was a minority of Anglicans who supported CSET, but these were split between those who accepted both forms of program and those who were highly favourable to CSET as a substitute for the Boy Scouts.¹⁵⁶ Despite charges of undenominationalism in its methods, and that "Y.M.C.A. methods are not the Church's methods," many were eager to enlist these YMCA methods to help in the resolution of the young boy problem even at the expense of the Boy Scouts. But for the time being antagonism had been created, and those supporting opposing schemes continued their war of words for a while yet.

The CSET program was changed during the period 1914 - 1916, to respond to the wishes of the church for a broadly based program but one which did not undermine the importance of a spiritual life. During the war years, the double billing given the program by the denominations indicated its appropriateness in that time of national mobilization. After the war, however, this YMCA-sponsored program fell into relative obscurity although it later became the basis on which the Tuxis and Trail Rangers training programs were developed. These became the backbone of weekday training within the United Church of Canada until 1953. A Toronto survey in 1921 indicated

that membership in Tuxis and Trail Rangers was half that for either the YMCA or the Boy Scouts, a survey which took into account all protestant denominations and others.¹⁵⁷ But what this survey does not show is the intense concern which was generated around issues relating to the provision of denominational weekday activities; nor do they give any firsthand impression about the provision of physical recreation within the aegis of the church. The growth of a Canadian social gospel raised the level of awareness concerning social issues, broadly speaking, and this process was significantly affected by influences outside the immediate realm of the congregation.

In the end, the experience of efforts on two continents to solve the boy problem came to bear upon the Canadian understanding of the problem and the solutions which were felt necessary for its resolution. Christian social programmers drew upon many avenues of support, international and domestic, in order to study the adolescent and provide a guide to positive action.

Sports and Games

The literature of adolescence was used as a primer by social gossellers in their search for an appropriate social image of physical recreation and sport. They sought in this literature greater understanding of amusement, recreation, and sport, terms which were basic to the social study of physical recreation. But these terms were by no means consistently applied. In fact, they were on occasion used interchangeably, which further complicated the task of developing a social philosophy towards physical recreation and sport.

However, the use of such terms often implied expected or anticipated outcomes from involvement with physical activity--a retrenchment from immoral behavior, better church attendance, greater national patriotism, better sportsmanship or fair play--as well as demonstrating an interest in the social benefits of play, health and athletics. The historic church with its "gymnasium and showerbath" mentality had shown meagre interest in the meaning behind such popular terms. The passion of the social gospel moved to change the tradition of the church.

By far the most ubiquitous term applying to physical recreation was that of amusement. The word carried, however, a moral connotation and for this reason it was especially preferred in Presbyterian literature. In order to measure the morality of such things as their amusements, Presbyterians in keeping with their literary traditions displayed a penchant for rhymes, vignettes and charts which would ostensibly point the way. Whether or not they were effective, they left little doubt of the religious mission amusements were to serve. The Presbyterian Record, characteristically reprinting from another periodical, the Christian Commonwealth, provided such a measure, a seven step test to guide its turn-of-the-century readership.

How to Test Amusements

First--Do they rest and strengthen, or weary and weaken, the body?

Second--Do they strengthen and rest, or weary and weaken, the brain?

Third--Do they make resistance to temptation easier or harder?

Fourth--Do they increase or lessen love for virtue, purity, temperance and justice?

Fifth--Do they give inspiration and quicken enthusiasm, or stupefy the intellectual and harden the moral nature?

Sixth--Do they increase or diminish respect for manhood and womanhood?

Seventh--Do they draw one nearer to, or remove one farther from, the Christ?¹⁵⁸

But these were inadequate attempts to deal either with the young boy problem or the issue of proper amusement. They were more a literary convention than an attempt to seriously study a problem. Such schemes were characteristically more proscriptive than prescriptive, exemplifying rather a negativism towards amusement, resulting from a lack of involvement by the church in that area.

The growing concern of the church was that it become more involved in understanding and defining such terms as amusement, recreation and sport, as the young boy problem began to emerge as a central theme in the social platform of the denominations. The church was needed. As one astute observer commented with reference to the increased carelessness with which young people were coming to regard their religion: "Most young people, when not reminded of religion, think of amusement."¹⁵⁹ Such statements tended to encourage extreme views, promoting either a denunciation of amusement, or, in the case of those interested in promoting "practical Christianity," encouraging the study of it, with a view to becoming involved. Indeed, the upsurge of interest in young people's societies at this time served not only to counteract the tendency of the unconfirmed to fall into "carelessness of living"¹⁶⁰ but served also to counteract what the church too often saw in other societies, namely, that "young people's unions degenerate into mere gatherings

for a poor kind of mutual amusement, often not at all of an uplifting sort."¹⁶¹ With the rise of the young people's society came the need for understanding and definition of this popularly misunderstood term.

As interest in the social gospel quickened, the need for a more informed view of physical recreation emerged. Social gospel panegyric was reaching its heights in the years immediately before World War I and at the same time the church began to probe more earnestly the meaning of such terms as "amusement" and "recreation" for possible benefits for its social program. The Presbyterian Record in its July citizenship topic for 1913 examined "Public Amusements: Their Use and Abuse." The author of the article, Toronto cleric, Rev. J. W. Stephen, considered the definition of amusement.

The legitimacy of amusement in itself cannot be denied. Nature demands relaxation. The bow cannot always remain strung. "Amusement," as the word implies, is plainly a turning away from the Muses--a temporary suspension of the more serious tasks of life.

Encouraged by a recent visit to Toronto by Jacob Riis, the American authority on playgrounds, Stephen continued reinforcing the popular belief that where playgrounds and innocent amusement were provided crime was materially reduced and a healthy law-abiding citizenry was the logical result. Stephen believed that the need for amusement was further reinforced by the character of the age.¹⁶²

The popular understanding of the word "amusement" included such diverse activities as athletics, the race course, the theatre, dancing and card-playing. Examining athletics in particular, Stephen

considered its virtues in history: the Greeks had recognized the important place of the stadium in building a virile manhood; the universities of the day were using athletics in preparing men for the battlefield of life, and writers on Eugenics were finding that "starved nerves create unhealthy appetites resulting in the deterioration of the race."¹⁶³ Athletics undoubtedly produced strong muscles, but also, it was believed, self-control, sound judgment, and chivalrous consideration for others. Its potential for promoting such Christian ideals appeared boundless.

In practice, however, there were problems as athletics did not always take the path of virtue. But undismayed, Stephen continued. "It is not to be inferred, however, that the domain of sports is to be deserted by the Church and left to the enemy. In Bible classes and boys' clubs it should be possible to so inculcate Christian chivalry as to raise the whole standard of athletics in a community."¹⁶⁴ Such was the aspiration of one social gospeller. That this was most likely to happen only under the aegis of the church or properly supervised community associations was emphasized by the Methodist Department of Temperance and Moral Reform of the Methodist Church. Its 1913 report to the General Conference noted: "As an antidote to impure entertainment and brutalizing sport, we would urge our ministers and people to encourage all clean, healthy, recreation pleasure, especially among our young people." The report recommended further that communities should provide social centres where proper recreation under careful supervision may be enjoyed.¹⁶⁵ The cooperative launching of a successful nation-wide social survey

by the Methodist and Presbyterian churches no doubt encouraged the latter view of a wider provision of amusement and recreation.

A further insight into the understanding and use of amusements is collected by Rev. W. R. McIntosh's discussion of "Religion and Amusement," the Presbyterian young people's society topic for the week of July 19, in the following year, 1914. "Religion and amusements have often been regarded as enemies," he began.¹⁶⁶ He believed a confessor of the former did not enter into the latter for fear of allying with the trinity of evils that are opposed to God: the world, the flesh and the devil. But a change had been effected over this somewhat historic view, the result of recent scientific and pedagogical influences. "'Religion' and 'Play,'" McIntosh continued, "instead of standing face to face, fighting each other, are getting back to back in the common fight for the welfare of youth, and are both regarded as essential factors in the making of men and nations."¹⁶⁷ Stressing the play aspect of amusement, as had Stephen, he noted the recent exaltation of play to the rank of a profession, while liberally quoting the American Playground Association. The duty of the church was to encourage wholesome amusement, and furthermore to redeem the world of amusement, to reclaim the play life of the community for God.¹⁶⁸ The social gospel rhetoric flowed rampant:

The dream of the future is that all the kingdoms of this world are to become the Kingdom of our Lord and of His Christ. This means the social as well as the geographic kingdoms. So that those who toil for the making of better men and women, for sounder bodies, better controlled minds, brighter spirits and better disciplined characters, through the control and development of the people's recreations and amusements, will have the right at last to join with God's coworkers in all other departments of social service, in the chorus that never ends.¹⁶⁹

This notion of the importance of the playground in character development was by no means uncommon, but it received a wider audience with acceptance of the social mission of the church. The importance of the playground as one ameliorator of social problems was fundamentally sound, but in their zeal at times, social gospellers asked impossible demands of it as a general catharsis for all ages.¹⁷⁰ MacIntosh, too, asked for an outstanding change of attitude. "Then we have too long and too often overlooked the 'ethical' significance of play and sport. So much is this the case that play should be considered as a form of social service rather than a more or less questionable aside of life."¹⁷¹ There was much truth in restating the traditional hostility of religion and amusement, and perhaps too the social gospel had an impossible mission or at least an impractical message concerning the church's provision of physical recreation.

Conservative protestants found it difficult to accept that the church had a responsibility to provide any social activities let alone the provision of amusements. Concerning "Church Amusements" one Anglican cleric responded to the tendency to liberalize the definition of what was properly church work:

After the question of where the duty rests to provide recreation, comes that of consideration of the importance, need and ability for making such provision.

I have had in my ministry singing classes, health clubs, tennis clubs, socials, entertainments, picnics, etc. I realized after some years that I was neglecting the souls of the people for the sake of their bodily, mental and social improvement. . . . Finally, I concluded spiritual work had to take the first place with me whoever was pleased or displeased, and of late years I have been very sparing in the matter of giving time and energy to amusing and providing amusements for the people.

It seems to me also that the church should be very circumspect as to the nature of its provision along these lines. . . .

Compare James 4 with Colossians 4, and I think one can hardly conclude otherwise than that the Church is rather to pray than to amuse.¹⁷²

Though this view could find supporters from any denomination, many Anglicans were suspicious of amusements within the church.

As Anglicanism came to adopt the social gospel for its own, a more liberal assessment of the place and necessity of amusement became more commonplace in its communion. The Most Rev. G. Thorneloe was invited to give his opinions on amusement in the church, but only on a limited aspect of the term.¹⁷³ He outlined a few principles consistent with the more evangelical denominations. The religion of the church was primarily a religion of joy, not of gloom; the church did not deny amusements but left to the individual conscience which amusements should be pursued. Taking an approach uniting social Darwinism and environmentalism, he believed such a philosophy was in keeping with the "religion of nature" stressing the wholeness of man, one in body, mind and spirit. But there were limitations. "Recreation and amusement are not ends in themselves. They are chiefly aids to work."¹⁷⁴ The latter view, however, is not particularly ascribed to the social gospel, which instead stressed the social imperatives and the social consequences of action, not the view that work was a religious imperative. But in context this view was liberal as well, in contrast to earlier views that encouraged a substitution of work for amusement, an ethic that did not give way easily to a more progressive view.¹⁷⁵

An editorial in the Globe sparked the editor of the Presbyterian and Westminster to give his opinion on how to successfully unite the two apparently divergent topics, work and amusement. While noting that the Canadian youth was absorbed with his athletics, and even admitting that the devotion to sport can be beneficial, he supported the "sport" of gardening, of making "play out of work."

Games and sports have an attraction of their own, especially for the young, that cannot be found elsewhere, and it is probable that certain benefits are to be derived from them that cannot be obtained otherwise. But we are confident that many people would be surprised if they knew how much real pleasure, as well as physical advantage, is to be found in occupations which, upon the surface, may appear to be simply forms of labor. We speak, of course, particularly to those who are not regularly engaged in physical work.

. . . Speaking from some experience we have no hesitation in commending gardening as a substitute for golf or a variation from bowling. . . .

Of the physical benefits of gardening it is impossible to speak too highly. There is great variety in the work, and this is an advantage not only because it introduces the element of change, but because it provides exercise for all the various muscles of the body.¹⁷⁶

Not everyone carried the same interpretation of an invigorated concern for physical recreation within the church, but the editor seemed to be on the right track. Thornloe stressed that the Anglican church could not afford to ignore the elementary truth that there was a legitimate place for amusement within the church, and not solely as a subtle form of work. He also observed that as far as accepting and providing for amusement, the "Church had shown less than her usual wisdom"¹⁷⁷ in the past.

Presbyterians had the strongest views about which amusements were worthy of support. In an attempt to guide youth on this subject,

a Montreal Presbyterian, Rev. B. S. Black wrote "Amusement That Is Worth While" as the Young People's Society topic for the week of January 23, 1916. While noting that physical recreation, relaxation, and amusement had a legitimate place in society, he stressed that amusements must build up morally or they are not worthwhile. The main principles to follow, Black concluded, were: 1) Amusements must be servants, not masters; 2) No Christian had the right to injure others; and 3) Body, mind and spirit must be considered when choosing amusements.¹⁷⁸ The message concerning the servitude of sport or amusement emphasized that when amusements get undue prominence, then the "extravagance and dissipation they create are the signs of national decline and decay."¹⁷⁹ Under such a philosophy the growth of sport as a national cultural institution would be difficult at best. Presbyterians did not counsel combative or bodily contact sports or amusements such as boxing and wrestling, as fit sports for anyone. Black emphasized that amusement must consider all aspects of existence--body, mind and soul. This philosophy did not permit concentration on sport. His comments were directed at professional sport but also applied to over indulgence in amateur sport as well.

Healthy outdoor exercise seemed best to fulfill the needs of Presbyterian youth, and this only as part of a broader program, one which included reading and higher spiritual concerns. Black believed that the acceptability of amusement was determined by the attitude of participants, especially their attitude towards pleasure. "To be always running after pleasure betokens a low type of humanity. Youth should be happy, but serious, too. Continued levity emasculates

the soul. To be ever cackling may befit a goose, but not a man."¹⁸⁰ Obviously Presbyterians had some difficulty in adopting the social gospel concept of the necessity in the scheme of things for legitimate amusement accompanied by a spiritual commitment to ensure that the body was not neglected.

This view contrasts somewhat with the Methodist outlook. The report of the Committee on City Problems of the Methodist Department of Social Service and Evangelism in 1918, saw a much higher place for amusement.

The church must recognize more than ever the legitimate demand for amusement. Play has its part in the life of a normal individual, and in some aspects may be as necessary as to pray. The amusements of the people if properly supervised are a means of education and character development.¹⁸¹

Methodists tended to prefer the term "recreation" to that of "amusement," indicating, perhaps, a closer familiarity with the American gospel of recreation¹⁸² and the desire to use a more modern term, one which carried less connotation of sin.

Concerning the provision of recreation in the Epworth League, Rev. W. H. Stevens gave his views during an annual Epworth conference in 1913. His opening remarks dealt with a definition of the term.

RECREATION is an elastic word of wide significance. Sometimes it means that which entertains. . . . Sometimes it is in the way of diversion. . . .

Again it implies helpful exercise which, while it is free from the consciousness of toil, tends to recreate and stimulate our being. . . . We may accept the term in its broader significance, as comprehending all that pleasantly and restfully engages the attention, and results in richer fullness of life energy.¹⁸³

His definition absorbed the concept of amusement.

Considering the place of sports and games in the recreative life of the Canadian citizen, Stevens had much of value to say to his readership, showing both his knowledge of the literature of recreation and his virile attitude towards the body.

In consideration of a question of this nature one naturally thinks of "Games." Those may be divided into three classes. Games of strength and skill, games of chance and skill, and games of chance pure and simple. For games of mingled strength and skill, such as lacrosse, football, baseball and hockey, provided they are played under proper conditions in an honorable spirit, and not to excess, there is nothing but commendation. They train the hand. They train the eye. They train to quickness of the movement. They train to almost instant balancing [sic] of probabilities. They train to swift and definite decision. Indulged in, in moderation under reasonable surroundings, they tend to make men. The Monks and Ascetics swung to the extreme in viewing the body as an encumbrance, while the materialists have erred more seriously in regarding the body as an instrument of pleasure. The body is God's temporary residence for the human soul. . . . We have in Canada the best outdoor games to be found the world over. They tend to develop that contempt of pain and danger which has ever been the mark of the true hero. Our national games, however, cannot be said to be free from attendant evils. This is sincerely to be regretted. 184

This noble outlook for the place and spirit of sport in Canadian culture developed during a period of social gospel inspiration, perhaps the pinnacle of a pure variety of social gospel, one which would soon be remolded and bastardized by the ensuing World War. Stevens then proposed a resolution which was unanimously passed by the Convention, demonstrating in part, the passion the social gospel engendered for the place of physical recreation as a force for social regeneration.

At the suggestion of Mr. Stevens, the Convention unanimously adopted a resolution setting forth its mind on the matter, as follows:

Taking cognizance of man's social nature and in view of the many social pleasures that solicit the patronage of our members,

this Convention reaffirms its belief that as a rational being man is social, and declares that the gratification of the desire should therefore tend to intelligence, grace and character. We hereby enjoin upon our members that they make the League a social centre and continue to prosecute with determination and vigor a propaganda in favor of a social life in the community that befits the Christian conception, that extols intelligent conversation, studies in sociology and civic life, history and kindred literary pursuits; a social life that scouts extravagance and immodesty in dress, which makes character rather than wealth or social prestige the standard of merit, that finds rest and recreation in those rational activities and enjoyments which violate no law of physical health, foster no criminal passion or propensity and imperils no young life; a social life which, while it lightly and pleasantly engages the attention, will ennoble the soul, will chasten and hallow the nature, will dignify the personality; a social life which iterates and reiterates that men need all their mind and strength for loving God and to do man's work in the world.¹⁸⁵

In short, perfection was sought across the entire range of human activity including mind, body and spirit. Aspirations were running high. What could the Epworth League and kindred other young people's societies offer in reality? What kind of activities did the leagues participate in which would ensure rest and recreation through rational activities and enjoyments violating no law of physical health, and fostering no criminal passion to imperil the young? The search for appropriate working definitions of such terms as amusement and recreation in effect educated the Church to the advantages and drawbacks which might accompany more practical involvement. But the desire to reconstruct and shape society under Christian ideals appeared immutable, and the social gospel provided most importantly a mandate for some to put into practice such high ideals.

During the first decade of the new century the welter of young people's societies had become the hallmark of the church's

serious attempt to stamp the mark of a Christian life upon a youthful society. The church chose all three basic options regarding the provision of recreation and recreational amenities. It developed and encouraged recreation and athletic programs within its organization; it used adopted schemes which would supplement its religious and cultural teaching; and it also encouraged participation in the more Christian social, recreational organizations, such as the YMCA and the Boy Scouts. Enthusiasm for the social gospel coaxed some to attempt the former two options of direct involvement, seeing no need to use outside agencies, such as the YMCA, if the church awakened to the growing recreational demands of Canadian boyhood.

The Presbyterian Pre-Assembly Congress was aware of the impulse modern society had fostered for sports which young people were demanding and finding anywhere they could. A western contributor to the Congress, and a stalwart youth worker, Rev. C. A. Myers, used the obvious prevalence of sport coverage in daily newspapers to make his case about commitment to change.

One question that came up for discussion was whether they were giving enough space to sports, and the unanimous conclusion arrived at was that, if they were to meet the public demand for sports, they must give fifty per cent. more space than at present. And I suppose that newspaper gives just as much space to sports as any other paper in the city. I do not say that fifty per cent. more would not be right; but I do say that the reader determines what kind of paper he is to get.

If the newspaper editors and publishers, from the business point of view, wish to raise the standards of their papers, I appeal to you and to myself and to this great Congress to meet them at least half way.¹⁸⁶

Concerning the provision of recreational and sport opportunity within the young people's societies, the church had to try to be at least

as liberal as the young audience it hoped to serve.

The denominations chose to serve this impulse for a more vigorous social life in a number of ways. The most rational approach was to upgrade social programming within the various young people's societies, which was begun aggressively after the turn of the century. This led to a modest acceptance and promotion of athletic associations within the church. In addition, clubs and associations of a social nature including Boys Brigade and Boy Scouts improved their social programming, but these more supervised programs emphasized substantially less athletics and gymnastics in preference for lower organized activities such as hiking and camping. The camping movement, for example, offered the church the opportunity to have sports and games within the list of activities, but under quite controlled circumstances. Such varied opportunities formed the basic pattern through which the denominations could provide recreation or athletics, and from time to time most of them at least attempted to do so. The CSET program developed by the YMCA, and later cooperatively sponsored by the church, was billed as an ideal program offering a broader mandate than athletics alone. This program did much to expose those not immediately involved in athletic programs either through the church or community to acknowledge the physical side of life. But the aim of the church was always higher than recreation, and not preeminently aimed at the body, but at the spirit. Tension was always present. Conservative churchmen believed that the church was "rather to pray than to amuse," and despite concern, those who could support a more liberal view would grant that

there was a "time to play and a time to pray"¹⁸⁷ and still yet the "practical Christian" of the social gospel might argue that play "may be as necessary as to pray;" all would find the field of sport an opportune place to do battle over the saving of young souls.

During the first half decade of the twentieth century the Anglican church was only slowly giving practical consideration to adopting liberal views on the place of sports and amusements within the church. A number of current schemes were drawing attention, in particular the usefulness of the AYPAs, formed in 1902, and other organizations which could cater to more than just the spiritual nature of the young boy as the institutional churches and church boys clubs had traditionally done. Concerning the latter, its function was clearly, in theory and practice, of little athletic value to young boys and men. Noting that the term "club" intimated a social orientation, one contributor to the Churchman wanted to set the record straight by pointing out that in this country such organizations were not really designed for social purposes. The objectives of church clubs were for the most part, educative and operative rather than social, and their function was to "arrange to discuss at suitable intervals those larger questions of diocesan and inter-diocesan church interests which make for the upbuilding of our great communion."¹⁸⁸ Although based on the principle of providing for the intellectual, social and physical welfare of its membership, church institutes and clubs were narrower in practice.¹⁸⁹

As Anglicans organized their young people's program in 1902, the direction for the new AYPAs was being discussed among Anglican

clergy. The consensus was that if programs were aimed at "simplicity and frugality" and avoided "all appearance of ostentation or extravagance," they could be an efficient handmaiden to the church and warrant the continued support of church officials.¹⁹⁰ And what of the Brotherhood of St. Andrew? This small organization had been in existence for some time, and it certainly did not appear to possess the necessary attributes for plunging headlong into organized athletics. Considerable reading and social service requirements dominated its prescribed activities, and admission to its ranks was restricted. Many found these harsh rules of service so demanding, requiring both community and hospital work for example, that they could not always be lived up to.¹⁹¹ It was the Brotherhood of St. Andrew, however, which led the way, showing that devout Anglicanism and recreation and athletics were not incompatible.

By the turn of the century local Ottawa churches had developed an increasing interest and competency in the sporting pursuits of the area, especially hockey, baseball, track and field, and the local chapter of the Brotherhood hit upon the somewhat novel idea of establishing a common athletic association within the Anglican church to further improve the level of competition among its communion, and to ensure that these various sports remained within the bounds of propriety. Apparently the idea was not totally new, but a city-wide amalgamation for athletic purposes of church athletic organizations had yet to be realized by any denomination in any region. The Anglican Amateur Athletic Association was about to become a reality.

The Canadian Churchman carried the events with a certain interest and optimism as they unfolded. The first notice of intention appeared during the 1906 winter sporting season.

The local Council of the Brotherhood of St. Andrew has formulated a scheme for organizing athletic associations in connection with the Bible classes and Sunday schools of the city. The scheme, it is understood, is in successful operation in Hamilton, and in many cities in the States, and the results have been distinctly gratifying.¹⁹²

Adoption of this scheme in Ottawa would mark a new direction for the Anglican church, if such an idea was wholly acceptable to the local dioceses, whose approval was necessary. The Canadian Churchman was enthusiastic, although the plan was untried and perhaps not generally agreeable. However, specific outcomes were expected if the plan were approved.

Each church that will co-operate will, as far as possible, provide its own quarters with such gymnastic appliances as are practicable, and with games, etc., and by this means it is expected that not only will the boys and young men of each parish become better acquainted with and more interested in one another, and an attraction offered to draw outsiders within the influence of the Church, but a friendship and friendly rivalry will be fostered between the several churches through matches and contests in various lines of sport and athletics.¹⁹³

The reaction of the local area churches to the scheme was favourable and several formed athletic associations for participation in this new organization, the Anglican Amateur Athletic Association (AAAA).

Mr. Frank Beard, first president of the AAAA, and local Ottawa sport enthusiast, summarized the value such an innovative program could offer to Anglican youth, while outlining the aims of the Association.

First, to indicate in all members, and particularly the boys, the vital importance of cleanliness in the truest and highest

sense of the word, as it is felt by all that if our boys are clean in their sports they will, in later years, be clean, upright and honest in whatever path of life they may choose to follow. Second, to inculcate in all members, and each parish in the city of Ottawa, and its immediate vicinity of Athletic Associations composed of boys and young men, such associations to have, as far as possible, having due regard to local conditions, a uniform constitution. Third, to promote a friendly rivalry between the several parochial associations by arranging a series of matches in as many branches of sport as possible, thus creating an esprit de corps amongst the young men and boys of each of the clubs belonging to the several churches, which, I fear, has existed but little, if at all, in the past.¹⁹⁴

Seven churches organized athletic associations and were represented during the first year of operation. The first season's sports included baseball, softball (both senior and junior), cross-country running matches, and hockey. The harrier clubs, for cross-country running, completed their schedule in two stages, spring and fall. By late September the harrier clubs were at last contending for the trophies in this sport. Four runs had been completed in the spring, and again due to its larger congregation and ability to draw players from a larger selection, St. Matthews was leading the senior field (15 and over). However, St. John's, a new addition to the AAAA, was running a close second, which helped to keep interest keen, and All Saints led the junior boys (14 and under).¹⁹⁵

The final runs were completed in October, and there was really no doubt that St. Matthews would capture both junior and senior harrier trophies. Keeping a competitive balance among the various clubs posed a problem for the nascent organization. The Canadian Churchman reported most of the details, which showed that member clubs were not overly concerned about the domination of St. Matthews the first year. "In the end, however, St. Matthews boys

have captured both trophies by good leads. In spite of this the other clubs did not look upon the victors as invincible by any means; on the contrary, more than one of their competitors has already announced that they will have a much harder fight to repeat the trick next year."¹⁹⁶ The first year's harrier hunt had proved an enormous success, with eventually nine parochial clubs participating, thirty-two senior and forty-nine junior members, in a total of eight separate runs, spring and fall.¹⁹⁷

The hockey season followed in January and this most popular sport included three levels of competition, senior, intermediate and junior. Interest in the Athletic Association swelled as the competitions proved to be not only entertaining but reasonably competitive as well, with membership estimated at between four and five hundred participants by the end of that year.¹⁹⁸ The mandate of the Athletic Association did not centre entirely around athletic play but involved an investment in time and energy by the membership and officers, to arrange for constitutional and monetary necessities, regular meetings and social functions to suit the season. Nevertheless, coordination of such a city-wide undertaking as the Anglican Amateur Athletic Association of Ottawa required all the usual accoutrements of amateur athletics of the day--rules, badges, banquets, trophies, and team photographs. Each member club proudly held its own independent banquet with toasts and songs showing that the social aim of the Association was quite important to the membership as well. Most activities of either a social or legislative nature were dealt with by committees formed to oversee the duties

required and to report back to the membership of the particular church or to the association itself. There was a constant bustle of committees to keep this large-association running smoothly.¹⁹⁹

Since a long hockey season required considerable equipment and costly rink time, the problem of physically providing these necessities was left to the ingenuity of the members. A favoured form of fund raising was the public variety or minstrel show. For one such undertaking between sixty and seventy boys from the various member clubs rehearsed for weeks to ensure that the vice-regal patronage which had been graciously extended to the upcoming performance at the local Russell Theatre, would not be disappointed. Such high patronage was not new to the residents of the Ottawa area, nevertheless sale of advance tickets was reported brisk owing to this patronage.²⁰⁰

The performance, enhanced by the presence of the Governor-General, was warmly recorded in the pages of the Canadian Churchman.

The entertainment given in the Russell Theatre last Thursday night under vice-regal patronage, for the purpose of raising funds with which to provide hockey rinks for the boys of the Anglican Amateur Athletic Association was a pronounced success, the "house" being one of the largest that ever gathered in the capital to patronize an amateur performance. . . . The Association netted a satisfactory sum for the excellent object it had in view.²⁰¹

The attendance of the Governor-General was also believed to have contributed strongly to the success of the fund raising drive. The athletic season ended with a moonlight excursion up the Ottawa River some thirty miles by steamer.²⁰² By contrast this was a serene ending to a hectic year.

With the opening success of the Ottawa AAAA, topics such as athletics and recreation were discussed more frequently within the Anglican church. The Ottawa St. George's AYP, for example, devoted one of its regular meetings entirely to the subject of the "Christian and Amusement."²⁰³ Within a few years of the formation of the AYP, the Anglican church showed an encouraging degree of enthusiasm for a broader attack on the young boy problem. As one editorial noted, "Intellectual study and improvement, and even amusement in due proportion to higher ends are not out of keeping with the A.Y.P.A. aims,"²⁰⁴ which indicated a loosening of constraints to allow the organization to be more than a handmaiden to the church. The Brotherhood of St. Andrew, under whose initiatives the AAAA was formed, remained an elite organization, claiming only 270 senior and 65 junior chapters in Canada in 1907 with a total membership of 3000 men and boys.²⁰⁵ Obvious, with 400 participants in hockey alone, AAAA teams were drawing membership not only from the Brotherhood of St. Andrew but also from the Anglican Young People's Association or from the congregation at large.

The die seems to have been cast for the AAAA program during that first year of operation. In subsequent years, activities followed much the same pattern of contests, banquets, concerts and the perennial domination of St. Matthews church in most of the events. The 1909 season was typical, the Canadian Churchman again carrying the salient details, but by this point in time the Anglican Amateur Athletic Association was not as newsworthy, though what reporting there was of its activities was done with lingering enthusiasm. The

redoubtable St. Matthews church association won most of the prizes including both the senior and junior harriers and baseball trophies, and the junior hockey trophy. In keeping with the broader view of the social as well as the athletic intent behind these Anglican leagues, the association ended the year with a concert and play, which was reported to have been costumed, staged, and acted by the athletes.²⁰⁶

The date of the capitulation of the organization remains speculative, but probably this organization went the same route as did so many other athletic associations affiliated with the church. As shown by the national surveys carried out by Methodist and Presbyterian churches cooperatively during the period 1913 - 1916, many of the better league teams were encouraged to join city leagues where higher levels of competitiveness could be enjoyed. From the outset, however, the Association was rather loosely organized with individual church teams withdrawing and reentering during the sporting season either because they were not competitive, or they were unable to continue to field a team. The onset of the First World War, too, may have contributed to the decline in interest for the Association. Certainly this was true of young men's Bible and Sunday schools and young people's societies in the Presbyterian church, where the outbreak of the war was reported to have caused a reduction by some 200 clubs and 9000 members.²⁰⁷ However, the Association seemed to have been in decline before that period and it would be easy to overstate the impact of the war on it.²⁰⁸

The Anglican church may have been slower to provide an organized, structured approach to solving the young boy problem, but the church fell behind the efforts of the Brotherhood and supported the AAAA. In fact, the nascent organization received the endorsement of the Bishop of the Diocese and the Clerical Guild.²⁰⁹ During this period all denominations, Anglican, Methodist and Presbyterian, turned their efforts towards the young boy problem and allowed many athletic associations and church athletic clubs to operate within the church.

In the Toronto area a number of church clubs, for example the Methodist Young Men's Association, were available to young Methodists. This association was organized circa 1900 as Mr. R. W. Eaton, Seventh President of the Association, took the Chair for the 1907 season. While Eaton espoused the view that the ten o'clock Sunday morning class "should be the backbone of the Association's work for the development of Christian manhood,"²¹⁰ in practice there was much more going on to encourage sports and amusements which many believed contributed significantly to Christian manhood as well. The executive of the MYMA social committee encouraged crokinole and carpet-ball as suitable activities for young people, but despite unpredictable weather, hockey was the prime interest of Association members during the winter months.

Another Toronto organization, the Brotherhood of St. Paul, of Annette Street Church, was also keenly interested in hockey. This society organized by Rev. T. E. E. Shore in 1902, was particularly aggressive and its 100 or so members enjoyed the benefits of the

work of its various committees including a Christian manhood committee, a skating rink committee, a social committee, an athletic committee, and a literary and debating committee.²¹¹ The skating rink was their most honoured achievement, thanks particularly to the sustained interest of Rev. Shore. This sense of achievement was evident in the reporting of its brief history.

What was once simply a large hole in the ground, beside the church, has since been levelled and fenced in for use as a skating rink. Though it cost about \$1,000 to accomplish this, yet owing to the relentless efforts of Rev. T. E. E. Shore, a former pastor of the church, the undertaking was pushed through to a successful issue.

Anyone visiting the place now would find an up-to-date skating rink in Toronto Junction, lit by hundreds of incandescent electric lights, making the scene a veritable fairyland, yet, withal operated within the pale of the church and Christian influence--no smoking, no swearing, all wholesome.²¹²

At about the time the Brotherhood was first formed, Shore had stated his conviction about the potential value of a more physically active church program: "What a work for the Church to do--the winning of young men from worldly influence, the equipment of their lives for social service, the development of character, mental, moral and muscular."²¹³ Shore's influence can be seen in the Brotherhood's assessment of the value of such an undertaking to the community and to the future.

The Brotherhood operators of the rink felt they could offer their rink as a practical example of an innovative social philosophy.

One thousand people may be seen upon the ice on a Saturday evening. . . .

"There is another rink a little farther down the street," said Mr. Ewens, "and it is fully twice the size of ours. Yet, strange to say, ours gets the patronage. They have a band every

night, while we are closed on Monday and Wednesday, to maintain quietness during club and prayer-meetings. Ours is often black with people, when theirs is scarcely attended by anyone. I believe it is because our rink is operated under Christian influences." 214

Such beliefs would be capable of carrying the social gospel and physical recreation to even greater heights.

Summer athletics were also part of the Brotherhood's curriculum for developing a Christian manhood. The benefit of such activities was deemed invaluable in directing the boy's attention to the church. With the construction of six courts near the church, tennis became the particular interest during the summer and this new facility was kept extremely busy. 215

The Alpine club of Cobourg Methodist Church, Cobourg, Ontario, had similar social and athletic goals in view when it was formed in the fall of 1914. It was organized for the promotion of comradeship among the boys and young men characterized by a high moral tone. To accomplish this, a large part of the program was devoted to athletic activities.

The club has hockey, baseball and basket-ball teams, which play good, clean games. In 1915 they won the Junior Championship of the Inter-Church Base-ball League of Cobourg. . . . 216

There were other benefits besides the laurels of the field. One was that interest by the boys in the activities of the church was sustained, consequently its weekly Thursday Club meetings were well attended. For their diligence, the members were treated to a social every second month to which ladies could be invited. As a direct result of the success of the club, three other church clubs were

formed. Membership was not restricted to those of the Methodist faith; this more ecumenical approach to church-oriented athletics was being adopted by the denominations to further the work of rescuing young Christian men from worldly contaminations.²¹⁷

One observer of boys' club work had an optimistic viewpoint about the potential benefits to accrue from active promotion of boys' clubs within the Anglican church and by the use of physical recreation in particular.

To summarize: The Boys' Club at the Church can form the link between a boy's religion and his everyday life. It can enlist his interest and service for his Church in his youth. In cases of parental neglect it can be made a great force to keep the boy in better ways, and also show him that somebody is interested in him. It can do its bit towards inculcating a respect for religion and help to remove the friction between the social classes. Its physical work gives it a share in raising the physique, not only of the community, but of Canada, and in raising a generation physically fit, and which would be an asset if ever again the call should come to fight for Right and our Empire.

By the training given by games, well and properly played, that Anglo-Saxon spirit of fair play will be inculcated, and your Church Club may be made a centre of patriotism, true sport, fellowship and Christianity among the boys, who will be men to-morrow.²¹⁸

While some church clubs catering to older men and boys preferred a "good lounge with fireplace, deep easy chairs and billiard tables and an adjoining cafeteria," most preferred more active physical recreation.²¹⁹ The St. Luke's Men's Club, Winnipeg, for example, in 1925 was debating the merits of reentering the various Winnipeg leagues for activities which it was particularly interested in, namely bowling and billiards.²²⁰ The junior boys of the church practiced a gymnastic display for a demonstration before hundreds

of interested parents. Under the direction of the Church Gym Director, Garfield White, sixty boys between the ages of 9 and 13 gave one such impressive demonstration.

Items on the programme included physical training, Chinese maze wonders, pyramids, relay races, buck-the-buck, high jumping for senior and junior boys, horse and mat work, boxing, fencing, pole vaulting, the concluding item being a basketball game between the Gym team and the St. Luke's Wolf Cub team, the score ending in a tie, 4-4.²²¹

Gymnasium work was a popular item with the younger boys.

Similar work was carried on in Calgary's recently built St. Stephen's Memorial Hall, which had been constructed to accommodate social gatherings in the large hall contained in the basement, but which needed a few alterations in order to accommodate active sports such as basketball.

Recently the equipment for basketball has been installed and the iron pillars have padded coverings which were made especially for them when any games are in progress. Here large classes of boys and girls meet bi-weekly for their scout, guide and W.A. activities. . . .

Between the Hall and the Church the A.Y.P.A. are erecting tennis courts, which will be ready for this season's play.²²²

By the mid 1920s tennis lawns adjoined most parishes, and gymnasiums were being erected routinely as part of the church structure, their importance recognized as an element in church work.

The Boys' Brigade was another form of organization at the disposal of the church, but one which it did not find particularly appealing. The reasons for rejecting this form of organization are important because they indicate some of the priorities which the church felt in resolving the young boy problem. This form of boys' association was of British origin and stressed military style

discipline. First established in 1883, and primarily a religious movement, it was never widely acclaimed in this country. At its zenith in 1897, only 88 companies were operating within the Dominion.²²³ By 1907 this number had dropped considerably to approximately twenty companies affiliated with the denominations.

Under the influence of a growing nationalism at the turn of the century, and the subsequent promotion of the Strathcona trust, there was a small movement by some churchmen to revive the fading Boys' Brigade, with its military rubric. However, the move was resisted because the style of organization was believed to be inappropriate for the Canadian mentality. This was despite some good features. Although paramilitaristic, the style of the organization was deeply religious as well and demanding strict rules of service. In the British Brigade more so than in the Canadian, sports played an essential role where it was important to maintain a "right attitude towards athletics," and where recreation was to contribute to the disciplining of character."²²⁴ In Canada athletics was not stressed to the same extent partially due to a general lack of concern for athletics in church life and also to the belief that "in Canada the code of honor in sport is shockingly below standard." The program offered instead a number of practical departments including life-saving and first aid, ones which seemed to complement its militaristic flare. To replace athletics one organizer remarked that for "training in mental alertness, as well as providing an excellent system of light gymnastics without any thought of gymnastic, we took up army signalling."²²⁵ The Brigade stressed many

of the activities found favourable to the Boy Scouts including hiking, swimming and of course the all important uniform, a "recognized value in producing the right spirit of discipline."²²⁶ Moreover, those who supported the Brigade and the Boy Scouts alike, sometimes did so to "secure the value of outdoor sport without the feverish excitement of the cruder games."²²⁷

In the final judgment, the Boys' Brigade fell into obscurity on this continent, while the Boy Scouts rose beyond highest expectations. One reviewer of church recreation summed up the history of the Church Lad's Brigade.

This was simply an adaptation of the old volunteer system, a number of cadet corps. There is no doubt, whatever, that in their time they did quite excellent work. Physical drill, military training and discipline are doubtless good things in their way, and may be turned to excellent account. The old brigades failed in that they were too militaristic, they relied more on discipline and training than on seizing on the peculiar characteristics of boyhood, of which more must be said later. It may be mentioned that the movement never spread much outside of England, and it is doubtful if more than a very few units ever were in existence in Canada, and they are certainly not in existence now. We may, indeed, dismiss the subject at once. Excellent in their day they have somewhat outgrown their usefulness; perhaps, merely the fashion has changed, or perhaps something better has been found.²²⁸

An alternative was suggested, the Boy Scouts, an alternative which on more than one occasion was the choice of thinking clergy in Canada due to their preference for something other than organized athletics.

Accompanying the rise of the young people's society and a more systematic approach to the young boy problem was the camping movement. Religious education was teaching that the boy had physical as well as mental and spiritual faculties requiring attention,

and the summer camp provided church boys' workers with an opportunity to address all three aspects simultaneously and in a controlled setting. The camp movement was interrupted by the war, but eventually all denominations established regional or provincial church camps, and the physical activities planned by the churches for boys during their two week holiday were an important part of its progressive work.

Rev. E. W. Forbes, from Dartmouth, Nova Scotia, was an avid boys' worker. In an address written for the Canadian Epworth Era he outlined briefly two major components of his philosophy towards the young boy problem: the boys' club and the boys' summer camp. The boys' club, designed for the improvement of "minds, manners, morals and muscle," had activities centered around the gymnasium and athletics on Sunday afternoons.²²⁹ Concerning the Boys' Brigade, Forbes had this opinion:

As far as drill organizations are concerned, my only actual experience has been in connection with the Boys' Life Brigade. This secures all the disciplinary benefits of drill without incurring the risk of fostering unduly the military spirit. Squad drill without the use of arms, ambulance and stretcher work, and exercise in the saving of life from fire and water comprise the regular work of the brigade, and to these may be added such features as seem desirable for the promotion of its object, which is the development of strong Christian manhood.²³⁰

The other type of activity Forbes recommended for the development of a strong Christian manhood was the summer camp.

Forbes had been in charge of four such camps established by the YMCA thirteen years earlier, circa 1893; and logically, in keeping with the special emphasis the YMCA placed on physical development, sports and games abounded. The plan was rather a simple one--

find competent leaders and assistants, then "enter into the boys' sports and games, win their friendship, seek to exemplify religion before their boy friends in all their intercourse with them, and generally succeed in winning them to Christ."²³¹ Many games were indulged in: baseball, football and hare-and-hounds formed the staple amusements, and to these were added as required, swimming, rowing, sailing and tug-of-war. The motto of the camp was "Remember Jesus Christ."²³² Camp activities abounded but Forbes' analysis of their social worth was noticeably absent of any social gospel rhetoric at this early date. But with their tenaciously ordered routine, such camps were to become commonplace for the denominations.

One such example was the Anglican church camp at Gamesbridge, Ontario, a property purchased along Lake Simco in 1910. This camp was established, as was the case with all denominational camps, to serve the needs of the various boy's choirs, Sunday school associations, clubs and Brotherhoods of the denomination. Their purpose was clear as shown by the captions addressing the topic of church camps in denominational periodical literature. They were providing a solution to the problem of summer time vacation for youngsters: "Practical christianity in the Summertime."²³³

The routine at such camps was hardly unrestrained: up at six thirty, rising exercises, a quick dip and then off to breakfast. Next, Bible study in the early morning followed by swimming or games for an hour, and again for two hours in late afternoon before supper, or this time was taken up by a boating, walking or driving excursion. Interspersed were the usual inspections, and of course,

no tobacco was allowed at camp, not even by visitors. Lights out was at nine thirty.²³⁴

Rev. J. E. Gibson was captain of the camp and under his direction there were plenty of athletic activities for the young. For boys under twelve the activities included fifty yard dash, wheelbarrow race, standing broad jump, and three-legged race, and the same for boys under fifteen, with the dash being 100 yards. Senior boys could try the challenging 200 yard race. Besides football (probably soccer) and baseball, boxing was encouraged for Anglican youth. In the English tradition, this was seen as a manly activity and a contributor to strong character if held under careful control, although the more evangelical denominations (especially Presbyterian) denounced boxing, because it did not meet the test of moral standards applied to amusements.²³⁶

Supporters of the camping movement and the church's involvement in it sought specific benefits of athletic activity.

Under the ideal leadership [understood to be the church], the true fundamentals of athletic contests and different games are presented. Here for the first time some of the boys are taught what team work and team play means. It is not a direct teaching, but they realized that if their team is to win, they must assist and co-operate with the other fellow. This is one of the important lessons necessary in every parish, and when it is inculcated in the boy at camp, it certainly will make him a better individual in his parish.²³⁷

The higher purposes of such activities were often repeated. There was a place for sports and games within this setting, but the social gospel message, that to play may be as important as to pray, was submerged.

At the 1925 annual Brotherhood of St. Andrew convention held in Winnipeg, A. R. Shea-Butcher, representative of the GBRE Boys' Work Council outlined an Anglican camp policy which showed that in some quarters the social gospel passion was not subsiding. "I have called it the 'New Attitude.' Perhaps I should have said 'The Awakening' of the Church to a realization of the importance of taking a more active interest in the every-day life of her boys."²³⁸ Shea-Butcher understood the reasons which helped to bring about this awakening. Most of those he cited were by now a generation old: the loss of young manhood from the front ranks of the church, especially those aged 14 - 20; the gradual recognition that the contemporary man demands that his religion be a part of his life, and the belief that future generations would desire an even closer harmony; the wider acceptance by the church that it has a social responsibility as well as a gospel to proclaim; and the need for a balanced program in order to produce desired national efficiency. Shea-Butcher recommended the CSET program, supplemented of course by the use of a liberal camp policy.²³⁹

The desire of social gospellers to serve the impulse for a more vigorous social life within the diverse clubs, brotherhoods and athletic associations drew a mixed response from the denominations. The more evangelical churches, the Methodist and Presbyterian, supported the early involvement with structured weekday programming within the church in order to provide a suitable alternative for young boys. While the evangelical commitment dictated more direct involvement, this did not necessarily mean a penchant for sports and

games, particularly within the Presbyterian church which held more stubbornly to its traditional assessment that "there is a tendency at present to devote altogether too much time to amusements on the part of many young people."²⁴⁰ Methodists and Anglicans were more philosophically able to accept a legitimate place for sports and games. Anglicans, in particular, being familiar with British stories of "muscular Christianity," accepted athletic games as a part of normal adolescent development, although they were slow to organize denominational youth programs. Methodist clerics proved a helpful clergy by not only giving spiritual support to Methodist athletic endeavours but also by providing a fair measure of practical initiative as well.

Canadian Standard Efficiency Training

All denominations were instrumental in molding the CSET program first developed by the YMCA and offered to the various provincial Sunday school associations for their consideration. The program was strongly recommended to Presbyterian teachers and boy leaders not only in Sabbath schools, but within young people's societies generally.²⁴¹ The response was modestly favourable. By 1923, 413 CSET programs were reported in operation in Sunday schools alone, excluding those using a partial program.²⁴² If the ideal of the denomination was a balanced program, then the CSET met at least basic requirements.

This program focused on the message in Luke 2:52, that Jesus increased in wisdom and in stature and in favour with God and man.

Thus a four-fold program emerged from this ideal life of Christ which stressed these four essential aspects of life: the intellectual, the physical, the religious, and Christian service. According to Horne, who assisted in developing the format, associating the spiritual with the other aspects of the program (including the physical) was integral to its purpose.

Now each aspect of this four-fold life should be related to God. When so related, it becomes spiritual as Paul clearly teaches regarding the physical side of our nature in Romans 12:1-2. "Present your bodies a living sacrifice, holy acceptable to God, which is your spiritual service." When all sides of human life are thus related to God, we have the spiritual man complete in all his being.²⁴³

Standardized symmetry was believed to be the best remedy for adolescent "quirkiness" and tests and charts were devised in all four quadrants of the plan, to even out unbalanced adolescent development.²⁴⁴

The social ambition behind the rationale for the program was evident in the standard requirements. For the intellectual standard, career plans, sex education, public speaking, home reading, educational lectures, educational trips and collections, observation and woodcraft, outlined the basic topics of concern. The religious standard naturally included church and Sunday school attendance, morning watch or daily Bible study, history of religion, and cultural objectives such as music, poetry, art and natural history. The service standard concentrated on the boy in relation to his community and his country, with a wide variety of objectives ranging from increased membership in church organizations, to the three C's campaign--clean speech, clean sports, clean habits. It aimed at

personal and community service, and required the study of heroes of church service and study of the government of the nation.²⁴⁵ Its appeal to the denominations according to McNeill, in his history of the Presbyterian church, was that it gave a central place to religion and that it "lacked the military emphasis of some rival organizations."²⁴⁶ C. A. Myers of the Presbyterian Sabbath School Board was largely responsible for ensuring that the Presbyterian point of view was considered during the various reviews and editions of the Booklet.

The physical standard was as comprehensive. Its rationale was given careful consideration as well. New Testament 1 Corinthians 6:19-20 was the watchword for this aspect of complete development: "Know ye not that your bodies are the temples of the Holy Spirit? Glorify God, therefore, in your body." This theme was elaborated upon in the sixth edition of the Tests.

The basis of all development is physical. The muscles are the instruments of the intellect, the feelings and the will. Ninety-five per cent. of all interests find physical expression. Seventy-five per cent. of the boy gangs are organized for physical activity. Self-control depends upon the proper interaction of nerves and muscles. Adolescence is the age of nerve and muscle education. Flabby muscled boys become pliant men who only talk. Well-developed boys become men who will say and act and produce results. A strong, healthy body inhibits wrong tendencies. A physical weakling is apt to be selfish. Physical training should, therefore, be encouraged, not alone for the sake of the body which is "to-day grass and to-morrow is cast into the oven," but for the sake of the soul. We must have regard to the body because it is the instrument of the soul.²⁴⁷

Drawing from the literature of adolescence, there was a serious attempt to moralize about the virtues of right behaviour and the physical and social consequences of ignoring these laws. The church

believed that such a program of physical development should have specific goals in mind, goals which might seem as important as the attainment of physical health itself. The text continued.

The ideal for the body is therefore the ideal of "Health," and health can only be attained by conformity to God's laws for the body-- . . . He avoided the extremes both of Asceticism, i.e., neglecting the body, and of Athleticism, i.e., giving the body undue attention as an end in itself--two common ideals; but rather exemplified the ideal of health, or fully developed manhood on the physical side.²⁴⁸

From such a perspective, sports and games would at best be only a part of a broader program of physical recreation.

The C.S.E.T. Manual for Tuxis Boys elaborated on the spiritual necessity for bodily health, but in a more literary style. Concerning the physical program, it began, "It is a fine thing to be interested in all forms of exercise which will result in a ruddy cheek, clear eye and a strong, flexible voice. Athletics and games have an undoubted and important place in furnishing healthful exercise and in providing a wholesome outlet for the full, free energy of youth." Considering the purpose of such games and athletics, and the Christian message of honoring the body, the Manual elaborated further:

Enough has been said to show that we have no right to despise the body. It has its rightful and important place as one of the four phases of our nature. If we set as our final goal the mental and moral gains, which we may achieve through good health and well developed muscles we shall reap a double reward for our efforts.²⁴⁹

The Manual emphasized and promoted the objective that boys should emulate Jesus, and his way of life, one characterized by living in the open air and close to nature.²⁵⁰

The physical program changed very little during the period from 1914 when the Sunday school commissions became involved, until 1925. The prescribed format for the physical standard included eight headings originally: Health Education, Campcraft, Team Games, Group Games, Swimming, Running, Jumping and Throwing, the latter three being grouped under the heading "athletics" in 1922. The structured program operated on five basic principles which gave strength to the format. The first principle was that of grouping, and eight grades or levels were commonly used--Grade 1, for 12 or 13 year olds, up to Grade 8, for 20 years olds. In practice these were further grouped to encourage use of the "spontaneous gang" concept and were prescribed according to specific achievement levels.²⁵¹

The second principle sought to utilize the natural group instinct for self government. "The organized Sunday School class with week-day activities is intended to satisfy this natural demand. The boy will be loyal to only one organization, hence the importance of relating all his activities to the Sunday School Class."²⁵² The third principle was that of masculine Christian leadership. Believing that "character is caught, not taught," this ideal stressed the value of hero-worship during the "dangerous habit-forming period of life."²⁵³

A fourth guide was the principle of progressive development. Each test for the individual grades was progressive in its degree of difficulty or commitment. The hope was that at the end this would give the boy a "Christian view of God and the world which should inspire within him an abiding passion for personal participation in

the work of the Kingdom."²⁵⁴ The last principle supported all-around development. Concerning the specialist, the example of the athlete was a logical choice.

Just as the star athlete who inspires us to develop strong, healthy bodies wields a greater influence if he has a trained mind, a clean character and an unselfish disposition, so the boy who would develop outstanding characteristics in any one of the mental, physical, social or spiritual realms should back it up by a sufficient development in the other three.²⁵⁵

These principles were exemplified in all activities and in discussions regarding the physical standard. There was also a heavy reliance on imported books and pamphlets from American sources, representing the best literature by prominent American physical educators, doctors, educators, and health specialists.

Under the physical standard the first sub-heading, health education, rested on the belief that good health was essential to clean living and clear thinking. During the six month period through which observations were to be made in order to pass this standard, the boy was guided to digest such classics as Hutchinson's Exercise and Health, Muller's My System, Gulick's Efficient Life and Physical Education by Muscular Exercise, Eggleston's Rural Hygiene, and Rational Living by King. The various grades required specific undertakings to meet minimum requirements. Typical examples included such useful activities as attending practical talks on hygiene, the value of bathing, effects of alcohol and tobacco, and the value of a medical examination. The highest grade level, 8, was required to lead a group of boys in health education.²⁵⁶ Prescribed practical requirements necessitated observance of fixed hours for rising and

retiring, drinking specified amounts of water, and daily teeth cleaning, bathing, bowel movements and physical exercise. Health tests were also requirements. Endurance tests in pull ups, rope climbing, cross-country running or paper chases, and one-mile walks would help the mentor, as the boy leader was called, assess whether or not the boy was living a healthful life, if the general requirements of good posture, a medical examination and the correction of remediable physical defects were insufficient.²⁵⁷

Campcraft was important to the program because it was understood that "when boys are 'in God's out-of-doors' with congenial companions, they are very susceptible to spiritual influences. A week or ten days with his little group of boys 'at camp,' will give the earnest Mentor, the finest opportunity to get at the very heart of the boys and inspire them to higher ideals of life and conduct."²⁵⁸

The recommended literature included Thompson-Seton's The Book of Woodcraft, The Boy Scout Manual, Gibson's Camping for Boys, etc., which prepared the young boys to better understand the practical talks which were a part of the regimen and included such items as campcraft, picking a site, suitable foods, tent making, etc.²⁵⁹

Practical requirements ensured this newly learned knowledge was applied.

The Team Games standard exemplified the thinking of the times towards "muscular Christianity" and the importance of team games, when properly handled, in the development of an upright character. The Canadian Standard Efficiency Tests booklet stressed:

The altruistic, or "help the other fellow" spirit is strongly developed through team play. As a boy plays so will he live. Play is God's way of teaching him how to live with others. While even unsupervised play may develop many splendid qualities, it is only when a boy's play is guided by a Christian young man who encourages honesty and uprightness that it becomes one of the greatest of all agencies for character development.²⁶⁰

And its most popular myths, carefully built up over the years, were not to be denied. "Every TUXIS BOY who plays the games of this Program in the right way is helping to win the great 'Waterloo' of his life some day later on."²⁶¹ For reference to the rules, skill and strategy associated with team games, the boy was directed to read Curtis' Play and Recreation in the Open Country, The Official Handbook of the Athletic League of the Y.M.C.A. of Canada, and books on the various team games published by the Spalding Company.²⁶²

The tests for Team Games involved two parts. First was the requirement that all grades attend a lecture on the "Character Building Value of Team Games" and the oldest boys were required to give a talk on this subject. The other requirement was that boys participate in a total of fifteen team games (in at least three sports) on separate days during the year. The preferred choices were baseball, indoor baseball, lacrosse, hockey, playground ball, rugby, soccer (specified as Association football), or cricket,²⁶³ although in practice other popular sports were substituted.²⁶⁴ Young sportsmen who displayed self-control, gentlemanly conduct and good spirit, might qualify for the team games badge.²⁶⁵

Group games for children were believed to possess similar character-forming qualities as team games. They were less organized and were classified as being occasional, unscheduled, spontaneous,

and often without regard for the number of players. Approved references included Bancroft's Games for the Playground, Home, School and Gymnasium, and Chesley's Indoor and Outdoor Games. No less than forty-one games were recommended of which any ten were part of the test in this category under the Physical Standard.²⁶⁶

Swimming was considered essential in the complete physical program of the recruit because knowledge of swimming was believed to give one self poise and a quiet personal assurance, very often the essential ingredients of a gentleman.²⁶⁷ The books recommended for reading included Corsan's At Home in the Water, and the Manual of the Royal Life Saving Society. The tests associated with swimming ranged from grade 1 in which the requirement was to swim 25 yards free style and 25 yards on the back, to Grade 7 which required the performer to swim 225 yards free style and demonstrate three methods of release and rescue with a tow of no less than 20 yards with each method of life-saving.²⁶⁸

Athletics, which was originally considered under separate headings of running, jumping and throwing was thought of in much the same vein as team games, possessing inherent character building qualities. The Tests booklet reiterated this point clearly.

The character building influence of wisely conducted athletics is far reaching. Athletic events are thoroughly democratic. They teach self control, and tend to keep one calm when others are excited and alarmed. They help to establish habits of temperance and develop honor, sincerity, honest effort, skills, endurance, courage, perseverance, self-reliance, and other clean-cut manly attributes and ideals.²⁶⁹

But caution was recommended because these worthy principles were often not put into practice unless conscious efforts were made to

incorporate them.

The Mentor was advised that he should encourage all boys to train for the athletic events so that their performance for official tests was creditable.²⁷⁰ To encourage training, "National Athletic Meets" were organized by the National Boys' Work Board, affiliated with the Religious Education Council of Canada since 1917, which represented the cooperating churches and the YMCA.²⁷¹ Requirements for meet participation were that a registrant must be an initiated member of a registered CSET group and have attended a minimum number of midweek and Sunday school sessions in order to qualify.²⁷² Training for these athletic contests was mandatory for success, and hints for training were not uncommon.²⁷³

The Mentor was advised to challenge every boy to strive for his potential, but the Mentors' Manual suggested that competitions within Tuxis or Trail Rangers be organized on a group basis so that the total score would count and the backward boy could feel he had made a contribution.²⁷⁴ Perhaps to appease the church, the plan downplayed competitiveness and instead stressed health. "An athlete he may never be and, for effective service, need not be, but the genuine interest in all that concern his [Mentor's] athletic boys will win their loyalty and fellowship."²⁷⁵ That the creators of the physical standard were not particularly concerned with athletic excellence is shown by the absence of any recommended literature concerning running or throwing technique. Running events included the 60 yard potato race, outdoor sprints, which were prescribed because of the variation in the size of indoor tracks, standing

broad jump, running high jump and the standing hop, step and jump. The throwing component of the athletic tests included throwing for distance, throwing at a target, and pull ups and putting the shot, which were included specifically for upper body and arm development.²⁷⁶ Most of these running and throwing events were included in the National Athletic contests.

The majority of these events were classed by weight category and standards set for each. The most commonly used weight classifications were: 80 pounds and under, 81-95 pounds, 96-110 pounds, 111-125 pounds, and unlimited above 125 pounds. The category of sprints provides a good example of the level of attainment expected.

WEIGHT	DISTANCE	STANDARD TIME
80 pounds	50 yards	7 2/5 seconds
95 pounds	75 yards	10 2/5 seconds
110 pounds	100 yards	13 2/5 seconds
125 pounds	100 yards	12 2/5 seconds
unlimited	100 yards	11 2/5 seconds

Other components such as pull ups required a minimum performance to meet the standard. For example, in the five weight categories the minimum standards were 3, 4, 6, 8 and 10 pull ups respectively.²⁷⁷ However, an adequate performance on any individual test probably required some practice for the average Sunday school participant, but diligent practice for an above average score.

The CSET program offered the denominations the opportunity to become involved in a structured program suitable for young people's societies in an area of life which they traditionally believed was best left to the discretion of the individual. Although some would

claim that it failed to catch on in Sunday school and proved hopelessly cumbersome, trying to encompass as it did all aspects of adolescent development,²⁷⁸ in many other ways it represented success and a change in attitudes. During the years 1920 and 1921 the program was turned over entirely to the denominational advisory boards and the Religious Educational Council of Canada due to the inability of fund raising drives by the YMCA to support the program financially.²⁷⁹ But at the same time the denominations were strengthening their Sunday school weekday activity programs and later accepted this ready-made boys program as the basis for Trail Rangers (12-14 years) and Tuxis (15-18 years) programs, interdenominational programs which developed under the auspices of the Religious Education Council of Canada.

Despite the fact that in absolute numbers the program reached only a portion of protestant Christian youth, within the churches there was a feeling that it was eminently successful, and the denominations officially espoused no other view than that it should continue to develop as part of the basic Sunday school program. During the period, 1918 - 1921, gains were heralded in the promotion of CSET with upwards of 25,000 Tuxis and Trail Rangers potentially benefitting from this structured program.²⁸⁰

But the CSET program is significant far beyond what these figures might initially suggest. Because it gained official church support, the program challenged the church to become more practically involved with youth and tested its commitment to the social message of the social gospel which gave physical recreation a legitimate

existence within the church. Because it provided a controlled program where the opportunities for boyish behaviour were severely restricted, the program encouraged the church to approve recreational and athletic activities under its direct aegis. Furthermore, through the efforts of many clergy in the various Sunday school, Boys' Work and Social Service Departments, Councils and Boards, CSET provided the church with the earlier opportunity to develop weekday programming. For all its failings CSET still remained one bright hope of the denominations for attracting the worldly boy's favour.

Young People's Associations

Social and recreative activities had been diverted because of the war. Some societies were disbanded, but with a return to a state of normalcy the various executive bodies of young people's organizations once again began to flourish with activity. Things were quickly getting back in order, in the speed with which athletic committees were being reestablished was an indicator. The Toronto Council of the AYPAs was one such organization, representing nearly twenty-five local branches in the Toronto area, ready to begin business as usual. Very soon after the war there were approximately 1000 AYPAs members represented by the Council, and by 1922 more than 2000 members were registered.²⁸¹ Ranks had been doubled in less than four years.

The Anglican General Synod had endorsed the purpose of the AYPAs since its inception in 1902. Approved literature of the AYPAs published after the war reiterated the social ambitions of the

association very clearly. This was not too different from what was envisioned by its creators two decades earlier. The emphasis of the church on the social aspect of its mission was still characterized as cautious.

Social evenings should be devised to exemplify the principle of "fellowship." Refreshments may be desirable, but they are not essential. A social evening should give opportunity for becoming better acquainted, for introducing strangers, for cultivation of the art of conversation, and for games and amusements.²⁸²

Concerning planning for individual sessions, it was recommended that:

The programme (previously planned) should show variety and wholesome entertainment. Remember A.Y.P.A. meetings are not simply to amuse. Let our meetings be bright, but not light. Sociability does not mean frivolity.²⁸³

But in the interim, substantial changes had taken place. In many churches, sport and physical recreation had become a legitimate activity; in others it was tolerated. But by and large the experience of the church in this area of life had been successful: young people's organizations had realigned the interest of many young boys to the church; young people's societies and brotherhoods through social and athletic programs, camping excursions and CSET programs, had shown the church firsthand that they could be conducted in an orderly and edifying manner. But the wartime reconstruction period was well underway and many young people's organizations were anxious to pick up where they had left off.

The first interest of the sports committee of the Council was tennis. A committee to arrange the summer program was appointed by the May, 1920 meeting of the Council to set schedules for all interested branches. Eight branches responded affirmatively to the

call for participants. The events offered included ladies singles, gents singles, ladies doubles, gents doubles, and mixed doubles, but each player was to enter only one event.²⁸⁴ Local rules were adopted as well, which stated that:

All branches entering the League must have an AYPAs Tennis Club and all players must be AYPAs members. Visiting team to provide balls. Neutral member to act as umpire supplied by visiting team. Each branch entering the league is asked to appoint one member to act on a committee to draw up schedules, arrange umpires, etc. Spaldings Rules to be used. Any branch failing to keep appointment loses by default. The umpire's decision is final.²⁸⁵

Tennis proved so popular that the sports committee had difficulty arranging satisfactory schedules for the sport, as well as attend to its other duties. Perhaps it was because tennis encouraged a mixing of the sexes, but by the following year there were so many participants that a separate tennis committee was required to control all matters relating to interbranch tournaments. The next season's play did not start smoothly because the necessary permits to use city courts were not available on time.²⁸⁶ But after a delayed start, the game of tennis again proved popular with AYPAs members.

Sports such as tennis were not supported evenly by the participating branches and this led to a number of the tennis cups being retained permanently, for example, by St. Anne's, after successive wins at this "gentlemanly" game.²⁸⁷ The St. Edmund's AYPAs club joined another interchurch league, probably for reasons of better competition and was reported doing well.²⁸⁸ Unbalanced competition seemed to be a problem as well in baseball because St. Anne's had also captured both boys and girls softball trophies.

Circumstances seemed to be reminiscent of the Ottawa AAAA in this regard.

The idea to establish an AYPAs baseball league was first brought before the sports committee in the early spring of 1921. However, initial efforts did not succeed because, the executive claimed, the initiative had begun too late. Again there was direct competition with the established interchurch league operating in the city, and enthusiasts were encouraged to join that league but before the cutoff date of April 15th.²⁸⁹ By the following spring, 1924, a contingent of 22 teams, 11 men and 11 ladies, was actively demonstrating the popularity of this sport and paying \$10 per team per season to support it.²⁹⁰ So popular in fact was baseball that three divisions were needed to organize the schedule.

By the spring of the next season interest was continuing to escalate with upwards of thirty entries to organize and control. The sports committee was hard pressed to keep up with the pace, and finally it was "decided to affiliate with the T.A.S.B. League."²⁹¹ The idea to affiliate with the Toronto Amateur Soft Ball League did not appear to materialize as the committee remained actively involved in the sport. Subsequent problems related more to off the field activities as there were numerous warnings against the use of playing non-paid-up members.²⁹² Noticeably, as the popularity of such sports as baseball and tennis spread, the administrative capabilities of the AYPAs were put to the test.

The sport of baseball also required the AYPAs to brush with the more worldly aspects of sport, for example, gate receipts. The

issue was first raised about the time that the League was considering entering the TASBL. The Committee immediately asked for a ruling on the association's sports rules regarding gate receipts. The topic was discussed with interest. A recommendation emerged, "That the executive recommend to the Local Council that the branches be allowed to make collections at their own discretion." A second one followed immediately thereafter, with the hope of reversing the former recommendation: "That the Local Council recommend to the branches that no collections are to be taken up at their games."²⁹³ This recommendation was defeated.

If the tension created by some sports broke the fragile image that these communicants were totally without worldly concerns, scenes at the many social picnics helped to cement the pieces back together. Picnics were well known for their sociability and they proved all the more popular when complemented by varied recreational and athletic programs. Even on short notice, the sports committee could expect more than seven hundred enthusiastic picnickers if fine weather were in the forecast. The administration of the picnic customarily required that the ladies provide refreshments and the men contribute fifty cents. Games started at three o'clock sharp and the races might include either a Blind Fold Race or a Soda Biscuit Race.²⁹⁴ Other activities included outdoor and indoor baseball, boating, bathing and park amusements too if the picnic were held at the local amusement centre at Grimsby Beach.²⁹⁵

The favourite winter sport, hockey, could easily shatter the myth again. There seemed to be always a large number of willing

participants, and administrative difficulties were compounded by the unpredictability of natural ice and the more aggressive nature of the sport. There had been some concern developing over the previous few years about all three major sports, with problems ranging from purely administrative complaints such as unpaid dues, to the quality of play itself including unbalanced competition and the use of non-members. The fact that the executive of the AYPa had to issue a warning against the stealing of equipment during matches only added to the administrative dilemma. There were financial problems as well. Money was not always available to purchase ice time during warm weather when outdoor rinks were unusable.²⁹⁶ The committee was often in search of a philanthropist.

A special committee was convened in the late fall of 1922 to deal with sports in the AYPa, and its report received clause by clause examination by a committee of the whole. Subsequently, a copy of the report, which contained many helpful suggestions for future managers of sports, was sent to each branch within the AYPa.²⁹⁷ The new year brought notice that the secretary of the athletics committee was resigning after heated debates over how to best organize athletic sports. After announcement of the resignation of the secretary, the sports committee moved and carried a motion announcing, "in view of the unorganized state of the Athletic Committee and the lateness of the hockey season, that the Local Council Hockey League should not be run this year."²⁹⁸ Other more serious moves were to follow. The chairman of the athletic committee was included on the executive as an added precaution in order to

keep them better informed of developments. Additionally, the interim secretary was to send a mailing list of members to the executive with a recommendation that any person taking part in sport must be a paid up member, at least two months before receiving a card giving permission to enter the league.²⁹⁹ The AYPa executive intended to closely supervise the athletic program to discourage problems before the local diocese put a stop to the problem altogether.

By September, with reminders of winter weather, the call was sent out to discuss once again the question of whether or not the AYPa could successfully organize its hockey league. It went on the agenda for an October meeting with the recommendation that,

Owing to conditions prevailing in past years [i.e. poor organization and conduct] in regard to Hockey Leagues formed by A.Y.P.A. branches, the Executive recommend that there be no A.Y.P.A. Hockey League formed under the auspices of the Local Council the coming season.³⁰⁰

At the meeting the recommendation carried and although the details behind making such a decision are not clear, it was obvious by the tenor of the meeting that the executive was embarrassed at the continued lack of good hockey organization. Perhaps the committee was not capable of organizing this well patronized sport on a part time basis. Consequently, another special committee was formed to salvage the reputation of the AYPa and to investigate the possibility of returning hockey to the roster. Stringent rules and regulations to govern hockey were proposed by the chairman of the special committee to make the sport more acceptable, with the issue to be finally settled by the end of October or early November. In the

fall of 1924 the decision was made to abandon it.

Moved by Wood, seconded by Mr. Bond that AYPAs hockey be abandoned this year, but would suggest that any branch that would like to play to become affiliated with some local hockey league--carried. Mr. W. E. Ross (St. Anne's) is willing to act pro tem for those who would like to participate in hockey.³⁰¹

The popularity of hockey was a factor leading to its downfall because the AYPAs proved unable to effectively organize and control so many teams. The athletic program in general was approved, at least in principle, by the majority of the lay executive of the Association and by the Anglican clergy a little further in the background. At the Dominion conference of the AYPAs held at St. Catharines, Ontario, from October 17-19, 1922, Archdeacon McElheran, Winnipeg, responded to the question, "What is the broad outlook of the AYPAs?" His response showed some of the idealism which the social gospel had held out for its youthful, child-centered organizations such as the AYPAs.

Every man in every Church and every woman must be brought into touch with the vital, throbbing life [sic] of this [sic] young people's movement--perfect, that is to say fully developed, full-orbed Christians developed soundly on physical lines, trained thoroughly in intellectual matters and well grounded in spiritual things, knowing Christ and the power of His resurrection, keeping their bodies as temples of the Holy Ghost, yielding their [sic] lives as a willing sacrifice in His glorious service, applying the ideals and principles of their Church's creed to the prosaic programme of their daily life.³⁰²

Sports and games were becoming more commonplace in the daily lives of Canadians and in the programs of young people's societies.

The athletic program of the Local Council had its detractors as well. While Archdeacon McElheran was preparing his eulogy on the potential inherent in the Association, one lay member was publicly presenting the opposite opinion. The controversy arose when one of

the lay members of the Local Council published his views concerning the AYPA in the Canadian Churchman in the early fall of 1921, and wished further to substantiate his views before the executive. These views were that the AYPA was not living up to its motto and was only incidentally considering Christ in its program. He gave his evidence:

1. That the programmes of both branches and Council were not consistent with the motto, as too much time and discussion were given to sports, socials, etc.
2. That the Council was holding forth as a form of Christian service work in which Christ's name was never mentioned [referring to the York Community Club].
3. That at the annual dinner Christ was virtually forgotten. The time was devoted to the discussion of sports, camp, etc. and prayers neither opened nor closed the event.³⁰³

These were charges which touched the very heart of the athletic program of the AYPA and ones too serious to be ignored by the executive. Considering the rift of complaints and uncertainties associated with the running of the major sports, the executive was, however, not in a good position to push the issue too far. They responded out of deference to the successes of their athletic and social programs, saying:

That, as our record is a sufficient answer to all criticisms levelled at the A.Y.P.A., as an inspection of the work of the York Community Club and its accomplishments will prove that it is for Christianity and humanity, as the athletic activities have justified their entrance into the A.Y.P.A., and, as the devoted lives of members who have been brought into the Church through the A.Y.P.A. are testimonials, we the Executive recommend that no controversy be held.³⁰⁴

The issue was left to rest but a less than astute observer might have noticed that, following the charges, subsequent executive meeting minutes faithfully recorded that meetings opened and closed with

prayer, an activity virtually absent before.

The Local Chapter of the AYP A had shown that indeed its constituent members were keenly interested in sports and games of the most usual variety. In particular, tennis, baseball and hockey enjoyed greatest favour and the executive made every effort to organize these for the benefit of the membership, and to ensure that they would be carried out in a manner befitting high Christian standards. There were detractors, but programs were given cautious approval by the church hierarchy provided high ideals could be maintained. But the committees formed to oversee the various activities proved incapable of controlling the members they sought to organize. The outcome was less than expected, the most critical charge being the use of non-member players to boost the roster; and less frequent but highly visible control problems, including stealing. If such problems were to be found under Christian supervision, was this then a harbinger of what could be expected under more worldly circumstances and, from the perspective of the church, less than ideal circumstances in the public sports arena.

In contrast to the regimen of other structured church programs, AYP A athletics demonstrated the uncertainty of the outside world, and thereby, without doubt, reinforced the traditional preference of the church for low organized activities. In these declining years of the social gospel, there was little ambition left in the church to call forth further efforts to organize social activities.

Physical Education and Christian Nationalism

The legacy of the Victorian nineteenth century, concluded Moir, was an "unprecedented mixture of piety and patriotism,"³⁰⁵ forces which were to continue to be felt in Canadian society upon entering into the new era of practical Christianity. Methodism in particular felt most strongly this nationalistic impulse, but the sentiment was far broader than any denomination. All denominations were deeply concerned with it because of their common aims: an efficient work force, a moral citizenry and a visible loyalty, in this case to both church and state. The Presbyterian Record made the point quite clear while dealing with its favourite topic, the Sabbath in Canada: "Alike on grounds of patriotism and religion, which ultimately never contradict, we are convinced that this day has a worth for man. . . ."³⁰⁶ In general the denominations included this nationalism, in the guise of citizenship or service, as a prominent feature of the social program of their leagues, guilds and associations--a program which aimed at more than an understanding of its ideals, but also towards practical achievements.

Suggestions as to how such ideals of citizenship could be put into Christian practice, providing a clearer definition of what good citizenship as an Epworth League member might entail, were cordially presented by the Methodist Church to league members. Practical considerations were outlined in the Canadian Epworth Era, the official organ of the League. The rules were simple: "keep to the practical affairs of everyday life, with its varying needs in

your community, and so make it count in the building of a greater Canada." Six headings seemed adequate to list some good examples for the leaguer: patriotism, municipal politics, temperance and prohibition, moral reform, athletics, and general.³⁰⁷

Under the heading, patriotism, the leaguer might be expected to organize a patriotic glee club or orchestra, study Canadian scenery, draw maps of the local area and its environs, organize a tree-planting or clean-up campaign, study biographies of great Canadians, or plan a banquet for young boys and men with speakers giving enthusiastic, patriotic addresses. For the study of municipal politics, organizing community or play clubs was a suggestion, as well as community surveys, educational classes for foreigners, and mock councils to name but a few. Temperance involved the study of the tobacco and liquor industries and issues relating to the morality of their use. Moral reform issues also included anti-cigarette campaigns, and community hygiene, sanitation, and community health talks, often followed up by questionnaires and interviews. And for athletics the following was suggested:

1. Organize a tennis, baseball, croquet, basketball, hockey or snowshoe club.
2. Plan a community play day, to include every man, woman and child. Have an occasional "paper chase" among the younger people.
3. Physical games in which no apparatus is needed. (Use "Indoor and Outdoor games," by Chesley, 10¢).
4. Varied calisthenic exercises. Plan for occasional League "tramps." Keep the eyes open while the limbs are active. Then talk about what you have seen.
5. A practical talk by a Christian physician on the value of physical training.³⁰⁸

These practical considerations were blended with a good deal of

idealism as well.

The range of interest of the church was greater than sports and games and included more formal or institutionalized forms of physical recreation common during the period, including drill, physical training or physical culture, since these terms were often used interchangeably, and physical education, meaning physical training within the educational setting or militia corps. Moir has pointed out the legacy of piety and patriotism which characterized nineteenth-century protestantism, and traditionally the church had maintained slight interest in institutionalized forms of physical recreation to accomplish its religious and patriotic aims. National fervour was building prior to the First World War, but with it came greater national controversy over production efficiency, health and fitness. This legacy, of piety and patriotism, was epitomized in James L. Hughes, Toronto School Inspector, and a regular contributor to Methodist journalism. "The development of patriotic feeling is one of the definite aims of school work in Toronto schools. On 'Empire Day' . . . the annual parade and review of the drill battalions takes place . . .,"³⁰⁹ he remarked. The church had its equivalent, "Patriotic Sunday," which by 1912 was a regular feature in the denominations, an outgrowth of intensified nationalism prior to the war. The Presbyterian Department of Social Service and Evangelism outlined the growth of this practice for the General Assembly in 1912.

Your Board is pleased to be able to report that Patriotic Sunday, namely, the Sunday nearest to the national birthday, is coming to be observed as an institution of Church life. It has

reason to believe that the preaching of Christian patriotism in one way or another was more general in the Churches and Sabbath Schools of the Church in 1911 than in any previous year, and it hopes that more and more advantage will be taken of this golden opportunity to promote the highest type of citizenship.

Patriotic Sunday falls this year on the 30th of June. Your Board, in co-operation with the Sabbath Schools' Committee, has arranged for the subject of Citizenship to be taken up in all the Sabbath Schools and among the Young People's Societies of the Churches, and the Rev. D. C. MacGregor, Associate Secretary, has prepared, at the request of the Board, a special pamphlet on the subject of "Good Citizenship--its Ideals, its Basic and its Duties."³¹⁰

With the advent of war, this modest growth of national patriotism swelled until it appeared boundless.

Although drill, physical training, and physical education came more to dominate the thinking of the church, especially relating to war and national preparedness, sports and games, per se, were not entirely without national import. The games and sports of youth reflected quite directly on the national character. The Governor-General, Earl Grey, could be found reminding young clerics that this was the case. In an address to a class at Trinity College School, Port Hope, he questioned the affect of poor sportsmanship on the national character. The Canadian Churchman agreed with the Governor-General and added to his comments, "No good can come of coarseness or rudeness in speech or act; and no people can ever be truly great who tolerate the one or the other in home or on the playground, in either the public or private intercourse of life."³¹¹ "Spectator" felt even more strongly that the national consciousness was too important a consideration to be degraded by sports on national holidays.

But Dominion Day was not inaugurated merely that the youth of one country might test their skill on the campus, or their fleetness in chasing one another around the cinder track. We would not, if we could, interfere in any way with the recreation of a people let loose from their toil. . . . [But] let us not perpetuate forever the custom of calling forth men and women from their ordinary duties to participate in some demonstration and send them home again with nothing better to think of than the results of the ball game, or the victor in the horse race.³¹²

In Canadian protestant thinking, patriotism and piety were indeed religiously interconnected. The Anglican church most noticeably held strong views about the sanctity of holidays, secular and religious, which no doubt biased its thinking regarding sports on holidays.

But it was in the more institutional forms of physical recreation, not sports and games, that the church made its most positive contribution. The protestant denominations gave encouragement to more controlled physical forms of patriotism, those more in comfortable harmony with its traditional "gymnasium and showerbath" mentality.

Drill is probably as old as war itself, but as a form of physical recreation known to the church, it was primarily a late nineteenth century innovation, experienced through such organizations as the ineffectual Boys' Brigade movement which spread into Canada in the late 1880s. With a wave of general interest in the militia and the establishment of drill corps in many Canadian urban centres, this type of activity became attached to the church as well, but never in any overwhelming numbers. Especially after 1908 with the establishment of the Strathcona Trust "For the Encouragement of Physical and Military Training in the Public Schools of Canada,"³¹³ a modicum of new interest was built up in the denominations.

The declining popularity of the Boys' Brigade as a social and religious organization affiliated with the church was well recognized, but nevertheless there was an intellectual appreciation of some of the physical and moral benefits associated with it. After all, the denominations were experiencing the end of a generation of decline in Sunday school enrollment and there was much optimistic talk of alternatives which might reverse the trend. For example, the Twenty-First General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church, 1895, raised the Boys' Brigade as an issue concerning the young boy problem and the age-specific decline of boys in the Sunday schools.

It is well known that it does not draw the boys as might be wished [the young boy problem] and therefore we should have liked to know what services have been rendered by the Boys' Brigade in congregations which have adopted it. But we are informed merely that "in some places the boys have been drilled and disciplined by it." Its object seems to be to advance the Kingdom of Christ among boys and to that end stress is laid by its constitution on attendance at the Bible Class but there is nothing to show that it has effected more than an improvement in the manners of its members.³¹⁴

However, the church had some idea of what this form of exercise was supposed to accomplish.

And so it is that drill takes the place of genius, and even often surpasses it. We are all bundles of habits, and drill gets its great value because it has for its background this power of habit.³¹⁵

The establishment of a Boys' Cadet Company was one suggestion from an Anglican priest, McKim, in 1905, as a resolution to the boy problem, an idea which was only germinating but which gained considerable momentum with the beginning of the war. McKim stressed that the idea had several things in its favour which warranted its consideration. The fact that strict discipline was enforced and

regular practice mandatory was seen as its prime positive characteristic. The result would naturally be stronger physical and moral character, always a quality of deep concern to the church.

The boy is physically helped; everybody knows the good effect of military drill upon a growing boy. It is a great thing for a boy to have a strong, vigorous body developed and well under control. The boy is helped morally. Properly conducted, the Cadet Corps is a splendid developer of character.

Noting further that some are opposed to things military, McKim concluded that there should be no concerns since this was not the purpose of the organization,

but rather to graft into the fibre of the boy the true soldier's spirit, the spirit of obedience, of loyalty and of sacrifice, the recognition of responsibility and the shouldering of it. These characteristics make good citizens, but they are not always cultivated in the home. . . . 316

But there was a growing concern about this "militarism" attached to drill, especially as it related to the school system, which one defender, on the eve of the passage of an Order-in-Council establishing an agreement respecting military drill,³¹⁷ called the "bogey of militarism in our schools."³¹⁸ Believing that the average Canadian saw no such objection as an obsessive concern for the fostering unduly of a military spirit, the Canadian Churchman defended its introduction into the schools, suggesting that Anglicans were as concerned as anyone that war should be overcome and that a military spirit for war and a taste for arms must not be encouraged. Discipline did not encourage a taste for war, and a simple system of military drill in the schools had many advantages for improvement of manners of the young, which it contended were not a strong point

among Canadian youth.³¹⁹ When Lord Strathcona established a fund in 1909 for the encouragement of drilling in the schools, the Canadian Churchman called it an act of true patriotism. "Lord Strathcona's munificent gift of \$250,000, the income of which is to be applied towards preparing the youth of Canada to do military duty in defense of their country is one of the best object lessons in true patriotism that we have ever had in Canada."³²⁰

Some Methodists saw the military style of organization as lending itself well to the promotion of missionary work, study, and support of comradeship,³²¹ however, the Methodist Department of Temperance and Moral Reform held its suspicion of anything military connected with church youth programs. In its characteristically patriotic and flamboyant style, the Department reiterated its concerns.

There is no body which is more loyal to the Empire, the Sovereign and the flag, than Methodism. She is ever ready to advance the interests of the nation, both by fighting her moral foes which are within and sucking the very life blood of her noble character and honor and defence in time of actual need. But we would deplore anything whose object was to develop the spirit of militarism and implant in our youth the desire for battlefields, with their carnage, their horrors, and their death.

If the Boy Scout and Cadet movements are intended to develop a better manhood in your youth--stronger physique, keener intellect, nobler character, better as patriots and purer as citizens--we welcome them with the very greatest heartiness, and desire to encourage them in every possible way. What we desire is that Canada shall produce an outstanding quality of British subjects and world citizens who shall render valuable assistance in the uplift of the nation in righteousness, and the transforming of the kingdoms of this world into the Kingdom of God.³²²

Many protestant clergy believed firmly that the church and state should be synonymous in matters of social concern,³²³ but there were

varying opinions about the impact of military drill and its accompanying militarism on the moral and social fibre of the nation. The Department reiterated its stand regarding undue military influences, and of the Boy Scouts and Cadets in particular. "While we welcome most heartily every rightful method of discipline for the growing boys and young men of Canada, we just as deeply deplore any method of discipline whereby they may become tainted by any expectancy of war or the development of a spirit of eagerness to take up arms."³²⁴

The designers of the Federal militia system were moving further afield in order to spread their message of the national value of the cadet militia corps. The Minister of Militia, Col. Sam Hughes, spoke to the March, 1914 Social Service Congress of the Anglican church on the subject of supervised control of the young, at a time when the denominations had yet to fully implement their system of control, the CSET program. Hughes had his remedy for the young boy problem, using, as had so often the church, the time honoured crime statistic as the barometer for the need of social control.

As one instance of the good results of this work none of our cadets have ever come before a police court. You see they learn to spend their recreative hours to advantage and not waste them uselessly or in ways that are a good deal worse than waste. We have done much to make this system thorough, and although we have a good deal more to do, we are steadily progressing. The lessons of discipline are most valuable, and to none more than the young.

Hughes added another measure of the potential success of the cadet program which to this point had not been widely received by the church. Moreover, the social gospel was teaching those who cared

to listen that there was more to recreation than mere discipline.

Hughes continued his address to the Social Service Congress, a body which represented perhaps the vanguard of Anglican social gospellers, using another popular theme, temperance.

One other good point is that it leads these young men to become good athletes. The chairman and myself are both old athletes, and we realize the value of an athletic training. You will be interested in these points from the view that they discourage the use of intoxicating liquor. The athletic games, the strict discipline and effective control could not be carried out with men who used intoxicants too freely.³²⁵

Even within the Anglican communion there was a steady resistance against turning young people's societies, per se, into drill corps. The Canadian Churchman argued that young people's societies should not become recruiting agencies and drill corps,³²⁶ but shortly thereafter had a change of heart. "Halt! About Turn!" was the phrase which for the Canadian Churchman signalled that the church had had enough and would hereafter support the war effort to the limit. The belief was that Canadians were fit for the task. "Well may we give thanks to God for the men of our nation, strong, alert and devoted. We are not a nation of puny weaklings, starved by the crabbed hand of ill Providence, but a race of stalwarts nurtured on the rich harvests of a virgin soil."³²⁷ From that point onward many clerics would temporarily lay aside their concerns for militarism, and others their pacifist preferences, while the concern of war was upon them. Temporarily there was a need for greater national discipline, and drill corps and the CSET program offered the young people's societies the opportunity to "do their bit."

The CSET program was advertised as a challenge to Canadian manhood for leadership in boys work. Developed cooperatively with the National Council of the YMCA, the Protestant Sunday School Boards, and the Provincial Sunday School Associations, the CSET program was applauded by these organizations as a beneficial program for teen-age boys. The plan became a national ideal.

We can scarcely overestimate the value of setting up such a national ideal. The false ideals of life set up in Germany--the ideals of domination and mastership as against the ideals of service--perverted the minds of the youths of Germany and warped them from the ideals of national honor. The world agony to-day is the logical outcome of this pagan ideal released throughout that unfortunate nation yesterday.³²⁸

In the hearts of Canadian youth, it was hoped such a perverted ideal might be replaced by one resembling closely that of the social gospel. Youth and Service continued, and elaborated.

Even before the war broke out the churches and Young Men's Christian Associations in Canada had united on this ideal for Canadian boys. It is based on all that we know about Jesus and his growth and development during his boyhood years. It recognizes the value of health and strength, and clear reasoning after truth; an appreciation of moral and spiritual beauty and perfection, and all with a view to efficient service for others; the will to serve, not the will to power.³²⁹

Many of the citizenship ideals elaborated throughout the years were incorporated into the CSET program in its Citizenship tests. The Mentor's Manual outlined some pertinent examples for the leader's consideration, including participation in such community welfare schemes as the 1) Playground movement, 2) Big Brother movement, 3) Anti Tuberculosis campaign, 4) Learn to Swim campaign, 5) Safety First campaign, and 6) Baby Welfare campaign.³³⁰ The CSET program, however, was only in its infancy and did not as yet have the following

needed to provide the large numbers of physically trained boys and men who were required in the short run to actively support the war effort.

The usually liberal "Spectator" was busy calling on Anglicans to adopt military training throughout the ranks of church youth organizations, and many others were following the same course independently. Initially there was a recognition that there was in Canadian youth some lack of physical fitness despite the robust rhetoric lauding the virility of Canadian physical manhood nurtured on the harvest of a virgin soil. The solution was to have more physical training irrespective of wartime motivation.

Let us by all means have more physical training with the simpler military movements, which, after all, are only a part of any adequate system of physical drill, and let us at the same time instill in our boys the principles of true patriotism, even, if need be, to the sacrifice of one's life.³³¹

The system which was preferred was physical training similar to that offered within the school system for military cadet training.

The Strathcona Trust set out a number of requirements based principally on an agreement between the Province of Nova Scotia educational authorities and the federal Minister of Militia, approved by Order-in-Council dated August 13, 1908, which required among other things, "all teachers (of both sexes) to obtain certificates of competency to instruct in physical training, and also to encourage male teachers to obtain certificates in advanced physical training, military drill and rifle shooting."³³² The object of the Trust which was subsequently set up was, in keeping with the earlier agreement, and for purposes in harmony with the temperament of most

Canadian clerics.

The principles read in part:

His object being not only to improve the physical and intellectual capabilities of the children, by inculcating habits of alertness, orderliness and prompt obedience, but also to bring up the boys to patriotism, and to a realization that the first duty of a free citizen is to be prepared to defend his country, the intention of the Founder is that, while physical training and elementary drill should be encouraged for all children of both sexes attending public schools, especial importance is to be attached to the teaching of military drill generally to all boys, including rifle shooting for boys capable of using rifles. 333

While the nationalism of the denominations allowed the physical training aspects of the system to prevail, there was an underlying current of disrespect for the military connotation within the system of physical training. At the close of the war, this latent disrespect was to emerge.

The militia training system had as its base many important ingredients with which the denominations could concur. The organization of school cadet corps was similar to those established within the various church Sunday schools and young people's societies. The training itself was embodied in a Syllabus of Training, as adopted by the Executive Council of the Strathcona Trust. It outlined various types of drill--squad, musketry, target, signalling, etc.--with the principles in mind to develop a manly spirit, train the body, and teach the use of weapons. 334 The purposes for developing manly spirit were to help the cadet bear fatigue, privation and danger cheerfully, a requirement of discipline as much as fitness. Drill in close quarters was intended to produce discipline, cohesion and the habits of complete and instant obedience to command. Games were

included in the curriculum, too, for their purported educational value of teamwork and individual prowess. The rhetoric of the National Education Conference, Winnipeg, 1919, did not sharply differ from that of protestant clergy who gave support to the spread of the cadet system during wartime.

That as the aim of this conference is the directing of public opinion to the need of education in character building and citizenship, and as a sound body, a well disciplined mind, individual effort and co-operation are essentials; therefore be it resolved that more stress be laid on physical education. That in addition Cadet training for boys from 12 to 18 years of age be introduced into all our schools--it having been proven that where training has been intelligently given, it has been of inestimable value to the boys, the school and the nation--in the inculcation of such qualities, sentiments and powers as reliability, patriotism, comradeship, self-control, self-reliance, self-direction, initiative and discipline.³³⁵

The Minister of Education for Ontario, H. J. Cody, in dealing with the issue of "Religion and Education" concurred that the general aim of education was to accomplish the same ambitions, but in a different setting. "By Education I mean a sound body, a trained intelligence and a reverent spirit, which in combination will make our youths in due time efficient and God-fearing citizens."³³⁶ Again the church and state were not at odds with the aims behind the cadet system; however, the methods increasingly vexed the social gospel element.

The concern for militarism before the war faded somewhat with the dire necessity to react to the call of war. The small voice of pacifism too had been choked out by the cry to arms even as the war began.³³⁷ However, with the close of hostilities, Methodism in particular represented by its social gospel wing, the Department of Evangelism and Social Service, renewed its campaign, now that it

was no longer unpatriotic to do so, against militarism in the cadet system. The Twenty-Third Annual Report of the Department, 1925, continued the tone set before the war.

In view of the generally recognized fact that the spirit of militarism constitutes a perpetual menace of war and cannot in any way be reconciled with a Christian view of life or of human relationships, and in view of the fact that this spirit, under the guise of patriotism finds expression in many ways and specifically in the system of Cadet training, in vogue in our public schools;

We would therefore express our conviction that the highest patriotism is not dependent upon, nor promoted by any system of military training, but that though ultimate defence of the country depends upon the character of its citizens and their loyalty to Christian ideals; we deplore the arbitrary conditions which make the reception of a grant for physical training conditional upon the adoption of the Cadet System and the supervision of this work by the Military Authorities; we believe that the system of military training in our schools is essentially the same as that which came to such perfection in Prussia and which is so violently denounced, and we would urge upon the Federal Government that the system of Cadet Training should be substituted by some approved system of Physical Training and recreational activity which shall be free from the insidious influences of the present system.³³⁸

But after the war confusion was evident within Methodist ranks about this question as this motion could not find sufficient supporters, and was referred back to the Committee. A now older social gospel did not possess the same spirit it had had during its youth.

Fully-fledged pacifists within the denominations emerged as well and were not lacking courage, particularly the Educational Committee of the Toronto Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, represented by highly active lay women from Toronto area churches. As the social gospel changed in character, the passion for "plans and programs" receded as a consequence, and many former social gossellers turned their enthusiasm towards the pacifist

movement.³³⁹ The Peace and Freedom League, for example, had a definite platform concerning the militia program and physical education in Canadian schools.

The numerous propaganda pamphlets of the League outlined their basic concerns pertaining to drill, physical training and physical education. The extent of the problem, as judged by the League, was the alarming number of cadets in Canada, a country which had publicly renounced war as a national policy.³⁴⁰ Statistics bore out this state of affairs.

Comparison Based on 1926 Statistics

Cadets in Great Britain and North of Ireland		34,156
Cadets in Canada		112,463
Population of Great Britain	1921 Census	42,767,530
Population of Canada	1921 Census	8,788,481

The statistical conclusion was that Canada had three times as many cadets as Britain in absolute numbers and, proportion to population, sixteen times as many; the emotional conclusion was that Canada was too militaristic. Department of Defense statistics only aided their case. Statistics quoted in pacifist literature for 1928 showed that at normal schools and other centres, fifty-five courses of physical training were being offered; moreover, seventy-six percent of the forty-six instructors at these institutions were officers and N.C.O.'s of the permanent militia.³⁴¹ Antimilitarists had three basic objections to this system of training in normal schools.

First, was the objection that physical training was not a substitute of physical education, and the highest ranking Canadian authorities were quoted for support. The denominations had

traditionally lent their support to the playground movement, and a lack of freedom in the military system was a critical point of disagreement.

Doctors and educators both declare that military training is not physical education and cannot be substituted for it. A doctor in charge of the physical examination in one of our universities said recently "The aims of cadet training and physical education are quite different. Physical education begins with life. Its objects are body building, the formation of health habits in the individual and the community, character building by means of play." Professor Lambe, Director of Physical Education at McGill University, further stated to the Ontario Educational Association that to obtain the greatest benefit from exercise or sport the drill element must be replaced by the emphasis on freedom and play.³⁴²

The second objection was that cadet training associated "patriotism with militarism and throws the glamour of pageantry around the essential brutality of war. . . ." This theme was one which was occasionally heard concerning the Boys Brigade. The third objection was that cadet training provided no education for citizenship, an essential ingredient of patriotism from the denominational perspective and one which it attempted to put into service within the many citizenship and service departments of the young people's societies and brotherhoods.³⁴³ The league also claimed that there was support for the movement against the cadet system from labour, the United Farmers, some churches and religious associations and peace societies. In reality it is probable that both conservative and moderate liberal elements within the ranks of denominational clergy supported the cadet corps for its benefits in solving the young boy problem, applauding the apparent changes in manners and deportment, believing as much in the theory of "inevitable progress" applied

not only to social but to educational thinking.³⁴⁴

These objections prompted a number of recommendations which were aimed at rectifying the overemphasis of the military influence. Teacher training courses in physical education were recommended to be open, divorced from all military control. The funds spent on the cadet system were thought to be better spent if applied to furthering physical education under the control of Departments of Education. Furthermore, it was recommended that the tutelage of civilians should be given to civilian institutions, under civilian control. The last recommendation upheld the mandate of the League, "That all teachers be encouraged in the endeavour to make the school the culture ground of a future citizenship prepared loyally to fulfill the pledges of our country."³⁴⁵

In summary, the social gospel, though in decline, maintained its interest in Christian nationalism which found expression in physical education. The social gospel, too, held to its belief that the young boy problem could be solved through practical methods, methods which had at their centre an important place for physical recreation. This view was reinforced through outside influences especially by American literature on the young boy and on boys' work methods which called for greater, more practical church involvement.

The message of the social gospel was that more was required in modern society than the symbolic gymnasium and showerbath to deal with adolescence. This resulted in a broader attack on the young boy problem from within the denominations. Church social reformers studied the meaning of modern sports and games in order

to learn more about this aspect of life which was so popular with Canadian youth. The church was in search of a suitable policy regarding physical recreation and sport, one which would appeal to both youth exuberance and clerical conservatism.

Many social reformers believed that they had found the ideal program in Canadian Standard Efficiency Training. This program, developed collaboratively between the YMCA and the protestant churches, was approved as suitable for Christian adolescents. CSET expanded significantly within the church during the First World War. But while social gospellers accepted CSET as a balanced program, Canadian youth preferred sports and games. Under the influence of the positive social gospel message towards physical recreation and sports, sports programming became an integral part of young people's societies. But the tendency of sport was often not towards the idealism of a balanced life but towards the pursuit of winning. The social gospel fostered the growth of physical recreation and sport within the church but with its decline a formidable force for the continued maintenance of it within the church was lost.